THE

BENGAL LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

PROCEEDINGS.

(Official Report.)

THIRD SESSION.

1921.

VOLUME III.

(Comprising the period from July 4th to July 18th, 1921.

CALCUTTA:
Bengal Secretariat Book Depôt.
1921.

INDEX

TO

THE BENGAL LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL PROCEEDINGS.

(Official Report.)

VOLUME III.—THIRD SESSION.

July 4th to 8th, 11th to 15th and 18th, 1921.

Abwabs and Salami

Cesses or—realised by Court of Wards, 19.

Accommodation for mufassal members, 582.

Act

Bengal Tenancy, 306.

Addy, Babu Amulya Dhone

Buick cars for taxi business, 230.
Chandpur outrage and alleged irregularities of certain officials, 66, 67.
Chandpur inquiry, 462.
Commercial schools, 187, 190.
Industrial Boards, 324.
Meetings and recommendations of the standing committees, 378.
Practice of *phooka* on milch-cows in Calcutta, 298.
Re-excavation of the Saraswati river, 71.
Silted-up Saraswati river, 96, 97.
Tolly's nulla, 70, 71.
Vocational training, 634.

A[illegible], 185, 227, 283, 350, 427, 490, 535, 594, 639, 695.

Advisory Boards, District, 334.

Afzal, Khan Bahadur [illegible] K. M.

Additional staff to meet increased work under Reforms, 648.
Assistant jailors, 297.

Afzal, Khan Bahadur Nawabzada K. M

Commission received by Jail Depot Manager on articles sold to Government, 81.
Expenditure on police launches, 698.
Expense on Government launches or motor boats and their use and loan 230.
Fasting by prisoners in *Ramzan*, 5.
Muhammadan subdivisional officer in Dacca district, 15.
Muhammadans as head warders and warders, 99.
Muhammadans in manufacturing department of jails, 98
Number of river dacoities and the work of the river police, 297.
Pay and prospects of sub-deputy collectors, 15.
Post of the Deputy Registrar of Co-operative Societies, 18.
Qualifications and special claims for the appointment of Sub-Registrar, 293.
Supplementary grants, 5.—Land Revenue, 653.
Vocational training, 630.

Agricultural Department

Expenditure on certain heads by the, 105.
Indianising the, 300.
Practical demonstration of the results obtained by—to raiyats, 371.

Agricultural officers

Tours by the district, 306.

Agricultural School at Rangpur, 5.

Ahmed, Maulvi Azaharuddin

Alleged employment of dismissed Government servant as the Government mukhtear at Pirojpur, 299.
Improvement of communications of Pirojpur town, 31.
Pirojpur municipality, 432.
Primary schools, madrassas and muktabs in Pirojpur, 30.
Withdrawal of resolutions, 535.

Ahmed, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Wasimuddin

Bengal Tenancy Act, 313, 314, 315.
Bengal Tenancy (Amendment) Bill, 167.
Postponement of resolutions, 171, 172.
Publication of Council proceedings in Bengali, 197.
Results of action taken under the Sanitary Drainage Act, 29, 30.

Ahmed, Maulvi Rafi Uddin

Appeals in certain districts, 548
Arrangement for holding charge during recess period of settlement department, 115.
Differentiation in the prefixes of officers' names in certain services, 83
Junior Deputies in charge of subdivisions, 83.
Manufacture of sugar from palm trees, 441.
Memorials by District Board employees and their pay, 82.
Pay of men while officiating in post of Provincial Service, 372.
Postponement of Civil Appeals, 344, 349
Practical demonstration of the results obtained by Agricultural Department to raiyats, 371.
Stoppage of subsidy to Jessore-Jhenida Railway, 548.

Ahmed, Mr. M.

Alleged interference with free voting in by-election for Calcutta South (Muhammadan) seat, 33.

Ahmed, Maulvi Yakuinuddin

Ayurvedic medicine, 605.
Bengal Civil Service (Judicial), 73.
Bengal Tenancy (Amendment) Bill, 158 166.
Board of Education, 570.
Chandpur inquiry, 474.

Ahmed, Maulvi Yakuinuddin

Muhammadan commissioners and voters in Calcutta municipal wards, 443.
Muhammadans and the rate-payers and Commissioners of the Calcutta Corporation, 696.
Scarcity of coal, 243.

Ali, Maulvi A. H. M. Wazir

Allegations against Kanungoes, 6, 7.

Ali, Munshi Ayub

Nomination of candidates from Chittagong for provincial and subordinate civil services and excise service, 299.

Ali, Mr. Syed Erfan

Breach of trust by the trustee to the estate of late Babu Shyama Charan Sarkar of Mamjuani, Nadia, 428.
Communal representatives on the Calcutta municipality, 429.
Muhammadans on the Board of the Calcutta Improvement Trust, 284.
Postponement of resolution, 260.

Ali, Mr. Syed Nasim

Calcutta University, 182.
District Advisory Boards, 337.
Partition of Midnapore, 519.
Postponement of civil appeals, 346.

Anglo-Indians

Percentage of—in the Bengal Civil Service, 14.

Animals

Prevention of cruelty to, 379.

Appeals in certain districts, 548.

Appointments

For depressed classes to certain posts, 697.

Arhamuddin, Maulvi Khandakar

Dredger of the river Lohajang, 191.
Improvement in the pay and prospects of the Subordinate Civil Service, 95.

Assam

Conversation between Mr. K. C. De and Babu Akhil Chandra Dutta regarding —Tea Garden coolies, 288.

Assam tea garden coolies

Concession in railway fares to, 16.

[illegible] jailors, 297.

[illegible] river

Stagnation of, 75.

[illegible]vedic medicine, 596.

[illegible], Khan Bahadur Khwaja Mohamed

Proportion of Muhammadan members in various boards, in municipalities, etc., in Dacca Division, 22.

[illegible]arganj

Basudev Mandir in village Utter Shabazpur in, 120.

Muhammadan Marriage Registrars in—District, 363.

Registration in, 366.

Maghs, 57.

[illegible]rjea, the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath

Alleged expenditure by District Board of Jessore by distributing medals to school-boys in celebration of the Allies victory, 640.

Alleged ill-treatment of a poor female phthisis patient at the Medical College Hospital, Calcutta, 59.

Allotments to District Boards, 251.

Ayurvedic medicine, 608, 611.

Beggary and vagrancy in Calcutta, 88.

Chandpur inquiry, 408.

Cholera and malaria in Faridpur, 353.

Communal representatives on the Calcutta municipality, 429.

Conduct of nurses in female wards of the Calcutta Medical College Hospital, 237.

Control of fairs and *melas*, 595.

Cost of bandage cloth for patients of police cases, 357.

Decline in the population of Murshidabad, 538.

Decrease of population in Murshidabad district, 437.

Demand for making Fakirhat police station a separate electoral unit, 29.

District Boards expenditure on tanks, 436.

Enhancement of chaukidari tax in the Burdwan Division, 26, 27.

Epidemic of cholera due to drought, 354.

Fakirhat as a separate Local Board electorate, 84.

Formation of Union Boards in Rangpur, 280.

Improving the condition of Tollygunj

Banerjea, the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath

Insanitary condition of Serampore khal, 553.

Investigation regarding beri beri and epidemic dropsy in Bengal, 273, 274.

Kala-azar in Tangail, 100.

Kala-azar in Tippera, 80.

Measures to remove the cause of malarial fever in Tangail, 99.

Members of the Calcutta Corporation and safeguard of the interests of the unrepresented communities, 438.

Memorials by District Board employees and their pay, 83.

Muhammadan Commissioners and voters in Calcutta municipal wards, 443.

Muhammadans and the rate-payers and the Commissioners of the Calcutta Corporation, 696.

Muhammadans on the Board of the Calcutta Improvement Trust, 289.

Non-official Chairmen for Local Boards, 369.

Number of patients treated in charitable dispensaries, 546.

Number of candidates admitted into the Calcutta Medical College from each division, 306.

Number of charitable dispensaries in Rangpur, 86.

Number of students from Eastern Bengal admitted into Calcutta Medical College, 305.

Pay of compounders, 548.

Phthisis cases, 23.

Pirojpur municipality, 432.

Privately-owned insanitary tanks, 302.

Proportion of Muhammadan members in various boards, in municipalities, etc., in Dacca Division, 22.

Running of municipal (scavenging) railway in Calcutta, 240.

Results of action taken under the Sanitary Drainage Act, 30.

Saline injection in charitable dispensaries, 100.

Scarcity of drinking water in Murshidabad, 289.

Size, etc. of bullock and buffalo carts, 636.

Steps taken by Jessore District Board for a road in police-station Chaugacha, 87.

Stoppage of filtered water-supply in

Banerjee, the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath

Stoppage of subsidy to Jessore-Jhenida Railway, 548
Supply of drinking water to villages in Bankura, 549
Supplementary grants—
32—Medical, 691
33—Public Health, 692
Supply of pure milk, 81
Teaching staff of the School of Tropical Medicine, 284
Tube-well for Patuakhali water works, 106
Uniform weights and measures, 305
Want of a chemical laboratory in the Campbell Medical School, 52
Water-supply in Calcutta, 112
Water-works scheme for the Comilla municipality, 547

Bankura

Estimated cost of settlement operation, [illegible]
Famine, 291
Supply of drinking water to villages in, 549

"Bangabasi" defamation case

Government expenses on the, 552

Baraset-Basirhat Light Railway, [illegible]

Barton, Mr. H.

Percentage of Anglo-Indians in the Bengal Civil Service, 14

Basu, Babu Jatindra Nath

Accounts and audit report of the Calcutta University, 536
Beggary and vagrancy in Calcutta, 88
Calcutta electric license, 637
Calcutta University, 172, 181
Chandpur inquiry, 398
Cotton growing in Bengal, 119
Ejectment of coolies from Chandpur Railway Station, 36
Epidemic of cholera due to drought, 354
Establishment of a Technical School at Calcutta, 98
Improvement of cattle breeding, 119
Influx of tea-garden coolies into Bengal, 35
Shooting incident at Kalighat Tram Depôt, 78

Basudev Mandir

In village Utter Shahbazpur in Bakarganj, 120

Beadel, Mr. C. F.

Supplementary grants "24—Administration of justice," 669.

Bengal Civil Service

Appointment of members of the—to posts of under or assistant secretaries, [illegible]

Bengal Civil Service (Judicial), 73

Privilege leave—
Of officers of the, 267
To members of the, 61

Bengal Tenancy Act, 306

Bengalis

Training Bengalis into the mercantile marine, 211

Beri-beri

Investigation regarding—and epidropsy in Bengal, 272

Bhowal

Kumar and alleged high-handedness of the officers of Court of Wards, [illegible]
Second Kumar of, [illegible]
Sanyasi, 77

Board of Agriculture, [illegible]

Board of Education, [illegible]

Bose, Mr. S. M.

Cases of Mowaris and Salami realised by Court of Wards, 19, 20
Inclusion of Darjeeling within Reform Scheme, 267
Teachers in primary schools in certain districts of Mymensingh, 50

Bulli bil scheme, [illegible]

Bullock and Buffalo carts

Size etc. of, 637

Burdwan

Assault on tea-garden coolies in the district and unpopularity of the Gurkhas at Chandpur, 34
Public Works Department subdivisional and Zilla School buildings at, 12[illegible]

Burirhat

Government tobacco farm at, 536

Bill

Bengal Children, 151
Bengal Land Registration (Amendment), 157
Bengal Tenancy (Amendment), 15[illegible]

of Muhammadan convicts, 253

ta

[illegible]ry and vagrancy in, 88
[illegible]lishment of a Technical School [illegible]

[illegible] sergeants in, 101
[illegible] expenditure of roads in [illegible] Public Works Department, 104
[illegible] water supply [illegible]

a Corporation

[illegible] of the [illegible] and [illegible] of the [illegible] of the [illegible] represented [illegible] 138
[illegible]

ta Electric License, [illegible]

ta Gazette

[illegible]

ta Improvement Trust

[illegible]

ta Municipal Wards

[illegible] 113

ta Municipality

[illegible]

ta Police Courts

[illegible]

ta University, 172

[illegible]

ell Medical School

[illegible]

ates

[illegible] from [illegible] Excise service, 286

[illegible] of [illegible] forming [illegible] 158
[illegible] subordinate [illegible] district judges and [illegible]

Caste

Introduction of a heading under "Caste" in the form of recording deposition of witnesses in Civil Courts, 287

Cathcart, Mr. M.

Reorganisation of the Police Department, 215

Cattle-Breeding

Improvement of, 119

Chairmen

[illegible]

Chandpur

[illegible] and Government officials' [illegible]
[illegible] from Railway [illegible]
[illegible] alleged irregularities of [illegible]
[illegible] strike and the [illegible] of the subdivisional officer [illegible]
[illegible]

Chaudhuri, Babu Kishori Mohan

[illegible] to District Board, 219
[illegible] 611
[illegible]
[illegible] University, 180
[illegible] 307 [illegible]
[illegible] by the Government of [illegible] the Budget [illegible] 307
[illegible] report on Legislative Council proceedings [illegible] paper [illegible]

Chaudhuri, Babu Kishori Mohan

[illegible] between Rampur Boalia and Godagari [illegible]
[illegible] of Mat[illegible] 523
[illegible] 168
[illegible]
Railway [illegible] with Rampur Boalia, [illegible]
Railway line between [illegible] and [illegible]
Removal of a [illegible] 16
Reorganisation of the Police Department, 222
[illegible] prospects of sub-deputy collectors and sub-registrars, [illegible]

Sheds for passengers in certain railway stations 17
Stagnation of Atrai river, 5
Supplementary grants
5 Land Revenue 651 654
24 Administration of Justice, 664, 668
26 Police 686
32 Medical 692
35 Industries 693
41 Civil Works 694

Chaudhuri, Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali

Accuracy in the rate of commercial product as published in the *Calcutta Gazette* 4
Agricultural School at Rangpur, 5
Audit fees levied from Co-operative Societies 116
Board of Agriculture or Board of the Agricultural Department in Bengal 65
Baraset Basirhat Light Railway 56
Borrowing from Co-operative Societies 242
Commercial Schools 189
Committee's report on railway construction between Dacca and Aricha 77
Concession in railway fares to Assam tea garden coolies 16
Cotton growing in Bengal 119 [illegible]
Demonstration farms 141
Demonstration farms in each thana and circulation of reports etc. in vernacular 365
Development Board 368
Erosion of Noakhali town 288
Establishment of a Technical School at Calcutta 59

Chaudhuri, Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali

Expenditure for the upkeep of experimental farms 115
Expenditure on
Certain heads by the Agricultural Department 105
Department of Industries 431
Working of the Industries and Munitions Department 49
Ferry service on the Ganges between Malda and Murshidabad districts, 40
Ferry toll levied at Ranagram Ghat in Kandi subdivision 543
Government Commercial Institute Calcutta 376
Government tobacco farm at Bu[illegible] 536
Hill journey of-
Director of Agriculture, 360
Mr K McLean officiating Expert 435
Housing arrangements of Indian Anglo-Indians going up to the 92
Improvement of
Cattle-breeding 120
Communication of Pirojpur tow[illegible]
Date sugar 21
Food grains and other agricu[illegible] produce, 122
Indianising the Agricultural [illegible]ment 301
Jute regulating the price of 78
Mahajans in Murshidabad 91
Mainamati Survey School, 582
Manufacture of sugar from palm 442
Mr McGowan for the Deputy Dire[illegible]ship of Agriculture, 80
Measures to check the decrease of [illegible] and bullocks 72
Mechanical apprentices scheme training at Kanchrapara 367
Mileage of railway navigable river roads in district of Bengal 64
Mining education 369
Nomenclature of the Indian European waiting rooms at Pa[illegible]pur Junction of the Eastern B[illegible] Railway 21
Pauskura railway station 171
Post of the Deputy Registrar of operative Societies, 18 19
Practical demonstration of the r[illegible] obtained by Agricultural Departm[illegible] to raiyats 371

Chaudhuri, Hon'ble Khan Bahadur Na[illegible] Saiyid Nawab Ali

Projected Faridpur-Bhanga-Mada[illegible] Railway, 114
Proposal to start a Sericultural S[illegible] in Malda 33
Public Works Department subdivi[illegible] and zilla school buildings at Bur[illegible] 120
Railway between Faridpur and B[illegible] or Jessore 114
Railway communication with R[illegible] Boalia, 8
Railway line between Ishurdi Nachoal 15

Rangpur Cattle Farm, 280
Regulating the price of jute, 78
Repairing expenditure of roads in Calcutta under Public Works Department, 100
Rules regarding reservation of berths in trains, 72
[illegible]
Miss Cleghorn's [illegible] work, 301
[illegible]

Chaudhuri, Maulvi Shah Muhammad

[illegible]

Chaudhuri, Rai Harendranath

[illegible]
Reorganisation of the Police Department, 218
[illegible] Khulna, [illegible]
Settlement Building [illegible]

Chaudhuri, Sir Asutosh

Inclusion of Darjeeling within the Reforms Scheme, 262, 273

Chaudhuri, Babu Tankanath

Accommodation for unpassed members [illegible]
Allotments to District Boards, 218
[illegible]
[illegible] and prospects of men [illegible] Service, [illegible]
[illegible]

Chaugacha

[illegible] District Board [illegible] Chaugacha [illegible]

Chaukidari tax

[illegible] the Burdwan [illegible]

Chittagong

[illegible] service [illegible]

Cholera

[illegible]

Civil Service

[illegible] Bengal [illegible]
[illegible] Branch, 53

Cleghorn, Miss

[illegible]

Coal

[illegible]

Comilla

[illegible] the [illegible]

Commercial Institute

[illegible] Calcutta, 470

Commercial schools, [illegible]

Committee

Effect to the recommendations of the Wordsworth, 78.
Recommendations of ministerial officers salaries committee, 230
Wordsworth and non-representation of school teachers thereon, 85
Meetings and recommendations of the standing, 378

Compounders

Pay of, 547

Coolies

Wages of tea garden, 55

Co-operative Societies

Audit fees levied from, 115
Borrowing from, 241
Post of the Deputy Registrar of, 18

Cotton growing in Bengal, 119, 430

Council Proceedings

Publication of in Bengali, 194

Councillors

Reduction of Executive, 4

Cows

Practice of *phooka* on milch cows in Calcutta, 298

Cows and Bullocks

Measures to check the decrease of, 72

Cultivators

Steps to enlighten on the results of the experimental farms 65

Dacca

Board of Secondary and Intermediate Education 77

Dacca district

Muhammadan sub-divisional officer in 15

Damodar

Progress in flood mitigation works, 74

Darjeeling

Inclusion of within the Reforms Scheme, 202

Das, Babu Bhishmadev

Appointments for depressed classes to certain posts, 697.
Bengal Tenancy Act, 306, 313.
Education of depressed classes, 91.
Failure of crops in the *bil* areas of pargana Tahlhati in Faridpur, 72.
Introduction of heading under "Caste in the form of recording depositions of witnesses in civil Courts, 237.
Offer of houses for Courts and quarters of munsifs at Gopalganj, 61.
Practice of tying offenders with rops on the waist, 233.
Projected Faridpur-Bhanga-Madaripur Railway, 114
Recommendations of ministerial officers salaries committee, 230.
Taking of thumb impression in registration offices, 231.
Water hyacinth committee, 64

Das, Mr. S. R.

Postponement of resolutions, 168

Das Gupta, Babu Nibaran Chandra

Accommodation for mufassal members 583
Bakarganj maghs, 57
Basudev Mandir in village Utter Shahazpur in Bakarganj, 120
Calcutta University, 182
Chandpur inquiry 466
District Advisory Boards, 331, 337, 344
Inclusion of Darjeeling within the Reforms Scheme, 267
Inspecting officers of the Educational Department, 111
Publication of Council proceedings in Bengali, 196
Revenue stamps for Bengal, 256
Vocational training, 632

Date-sugar

Improvement of, 21.

De, Babu Fanindralal

Breach in Singimara Khal embankment in Howrah, 19.
Chandpur inquiry, 469, 470
Condition of Saraswati river, 276
Judicial inquiry into the shooting incident at Kalighat, 4.
Lack of judge at Alipore (24-Parganas to deal with land acquisition cases, 3
Postponement of resolution, 172
Sadhu as Kumar of Bhowal, 351.
Demonstration farms, 441.

pressed classes

Education of, 91

puty Inspector of Schools

Promotion of to the Bengal Educational Service 109

valopment Board, 30

hunker, Shaikh Muhammad

Case of and a head constable and a chaukidar at Rajbari 67

rector of Agriculture

Hill journey of the 300

smissed Government servant

Alleged employment of as the Government muktear at Pirojpur 2[illegible]

spensaries

Number of charitable in Rangpur 86
Number of patients treated in charitable 546
Saline injection in charitable 100

istribution of proceedings of the Legislative Council, 280

strict Boards

Allotments to 249
Expenditure on tanks 135

strict Judge

Application for the post of and the appointment thereof 78

vision Lists

Bengal Tenancy (Amendment) Bill 167
Chandpur inquiry 484
Postponement of civil appeals 349
Privilege leave of officers of the Bengal Civil Service (Judicial) 261
Publication of Council proceedings in Bengali, 205
Revenue stamps for Bengal 259
Supplementary grants
5 Land Revenue, 654
24 Administration of Justice, 665, 678
26 Police 685 687
35 Industries, 692

nald, Mr. J.

Partition of Midnapore 517
Prevention of cruelty to animals 380

Drinking water

Scarcity of in Murshidabad, 289.
Supply of to villages in Bankura, 549

Dutt, Mr. Ajoy Chunder

Chandpur inquiry, 172
Expenditure on certain police cases, 285
Reorganisation of the Police Department 227

Dutt, Rai Bahadur Dr. Haridhan

Ayurvedic medicine, 600
Calcutta electric license, 638
Calcutta Police Courts, 42
Number of serious and petty cases tried by Calcutta Police Courts, 641
Opium godown attached to the Bankshall Street, 88
Police Court buildings in Calcutta, 439
Police sergeants in Calcutta, 101
Prevention of cruelty to animals, 380, 382
Repairing expenditure of roads in Calcutta under Public Works Department, 100
Supplementary grants, 24 Administration of Justice, 661, 665, 672.

Dutta, Babu Annada Charan

Accommodation for mufassal members, 585 587
Calcutta University, 175
Chandpur inquiry 454
Distribution of Legislative Council proceedings 280, 283
Erosion of Noakhali town, 288
Publication of Council proceedings in Bengali 200
Supplementary grants
5 Land Revenue 650 651, 652
24 Administration of Justice, 659, 660 677
25 Jails and Convict Settlements, 679
26 Police 682 685 686
31 Education, 690
32 Medical 692
35 Industries 692 693
41 Civil Works 694, 695

Dutta, Babu Indu Bhushan

Allotments to District Boards 249
Bhowal Kumar and alleged high handedness of the officers of the Court of Wards, 244, 245
Board of Agriculture or a Board of the Agricultural Department in Bengal, 65

Dutta, Babu Indu Bhushan

Calcutta University, 179 ,
Chandpur inquiry, 398, 399, 409
Chandpur outrage and alleged irregularities of certain officials, 67
Expenditure on certain heads by the Agricultural Department, 105
Expenditure on the working of the Industries and Munitions Departments, 49
Improvement of food grains and other agricultural produce, 122
Industrial Boards, 325
Industrial Intelligence Officer and the Department of Statistics, 102
Influx of tea garden coolies into Bengal 36, 37
Kala azar in Tippera, 79
Mamamati Survey School, 580
Mohanganj *hat* incidents 616
Number of candidates admitted into the Calcutta Medical College from each division, 306
Pay of compounders 547
Reorganisation of the Police Department, 214, 215, 220
Scarcity in Khulna 492
Ship building Industry in Bengal 104
Strikes in Eastern Bengal, 245 246
Supplementary grants
5 Land Revenue, 653 655
24 Administration of Justice 660 668 677
25 Jails and Convict Settlements 679
26 Police 688
41 Civil Works, 691, 695
Training Bengalis into mercantile marine, 244

Eastern Bengal Railway

Nomenclature of the Indian and European waiting rooms at Parbatipur Junction of the, 21

Education

Of depressed classes, 91
Inspecting officers of the Department 111
Primary 113

Education Department

Messrs Biss and Dunn on special duty in the, 20

Educational Officers

Confirmation of conditional on passing examination in vernacular

Educational Service

Increase in the pay and prospects men in the, 374
Members of holding specific appointments in Training Colleges teachers and their *locum tenens* 12

Educational Service (Subordinate), 7

Electoral unit

Demand for making Fakirhat police station a separate, 29.

Estate of late Babu Shyama Cha Sarkar of Mamjuani, Nadia, 128

European Schools

Inspector of, 33

Expenditure

On certain heads by the Agricult Department 105
On police launches 608
On the working of the Industries Munitions Departments, 49

Fairs and "melas," 590, 595

Fakirhat

As a separate local board electorate

Fakirhat police station

Demand for making a separate toral unit 29

Famine in Khulna, 118

Faridpur

Appointment of a special Muhammad Sub-Inspector for Muhammadan education at, 98
Cholera and malaria in, 353
Failure of crops in the *bil* areas pargana Tahhati in, 72
Primary schools in, 356
Projected Faridpur-Bhanga-Madar Railway, 119
Scheme for converting middle vernacular school for girls at Faridpur a middle English School, 106.
Technical schools in, 356

Farms

Demonstration

In each thana and circulation of reports etc., in vernacular, 365

Supply of officers for working private 368

Expenditure for the upkeep of experimental, 114

Faroqui, Mr. K. G. M.

Age limit for Indian and Bengal Civil Service (Executive) 30

Indian police officers 89

Salary committee's report 248

Water works scheme for the Comilla Municipality 547

Withdrawal of resolution 528

Ferry Service

On the Ganges between Malda and Murshidabad districts 89

Ferry toll

Levied at Rangamati Ghat in Kandi subdivision 543

Fibre Expert

Hill journeys of Mr. K. McLean 434

Firearms

Licenses for 66

Food-grains

Improvement of and other agricultural produce 122

Scarcity of rice and other, 117

Gambling

Extension of Act to the Mowrah district 110

Ghatak, Rai Sahib Nilmani

Proposal to start a sericultural school in Malda 32

Selection of successor to present Superintendent of Sericulture and certain works of the Department of Sericulture, 63, 64

Ghose, Mr. D. C.

Ayurvedic medicine, 610

Board of Education, 579, 580

Chandpur inquiry, 411

Publication of Council proceedings in Bengali, 204, 204

Ghose, Rai Bahadur Jogendra Chunder

Accommodation for mufassal members, 588

Allotments to District Boards, 246, 252

Ayurvedic medicine, 599

Bengal Children Bill, 155

Board of Education, 551, 556, 557, 564, 578, 579, 580

Borrowing from Co-operative Societies, 241

Calcutta University 126

Chandpur inquiry 125, 174, 179

Expenditure for the upkeep of experimental farms, 114

Inclusion of Darjeeling within the Reforms Scheme 268

Indian cavalry for Bengal, 533

Industrial Boards 326

Mohanganj Fair incidents 618, 619

Motion for adjournment, 694

Partition of Midnapore 523

Postponement of civil appeals 347

Publication of Council proceedings in Bengali 197, 198

Regulating the price of jute, 78

Scarcity in Khulna, 191, 192, 501

Supplementary grants

24 Administration of Justice, 663, 669

25 Jails and Convict Settlements, 681

26 Police 684, 686

Girls

Teachers in primary schools for in certain subdivisions of Mymensingh, 50

Goalundo

Silting up of river Chandana in, 59

Gopalganj

Offer of houses for Courts and quarters of munsifs at Gopalganj, 61

Gordon, Mr. A. D.

Chandpur inquiry, 424

Government Bills, 151

Government launches

Expense on or motor-boats and their use and loan, 296.

Government Service

Appointment of Muhammadans in, 445

Grant

Certification of—under section 72D(2) of the Government of India Act, 149-150.
Made by the Government of India and referred to in the Budget Estimate for 1921-22, 107
Supplementary, 648

Gun-license fees

Revenue derived from, 35

Hand-looms,

Working of—and their products, 445

Haq, Maulvi A. K. Fazl-ul

Appointment of Muhammadans in Government service, 417
Chandpur inquiry, 414-415
Scarcity in Khulna, 487
Withdrawal of resolutions, 168

Haq, Shah Syed Emdadul

Burial of Muhammadan convicts, 253-254.
Prevention of cruelty to animals, 380

High Schools (Boys)

Applications for
Capital grants from, 132
Recurring grants from, 123

High Schools (Girls)

Applications for
Capital grants from, 136
Recurring grants from, 131

Hill journey of the Director of Agriculture, 300

Hills

Heads of Departments going up to the, 417
Housing arrangements of Indians and Anglo-Indians going up to the, 92

Hooghly river

Capsizing of ferry boats in the—between Budge Budge and Naihati, 25

Huq, Maulvi Ekramul

Allotments to District Boards, 250.
Ayurvedic medicine, 607
Bengal Tenancy (Amendment) Bill, 167
Board of Education, 572
Burial of Muhammadan convicts, 253.

Huq, Maulvi Ekramul

Calcutta University, 181.
Decrease of population in Murshidabad district, 436.
District Advisory Boards, 339.
Employment of under-trial prisoners in the Kandi sub-jail, 238.
Inclusion of Darjeeling within the Reforms Scheme, 268.
Industrial Boards, 320.
Mahajans in Murshidabad, 91.
Scarcity in Khulna, 489.
Scarcity of drinking water in Murshidabad, 289
Subdivisional officer of Kandi, 377, 378
Tours by the District Agricultural Officer, 306
Utbandi settlement of land, 11.

Hussain Maulvi Mahammed Madassur

Cadre of Bengal Civil Service, Executive Branch, 53
Non-vesting sub-deputy collectors with first class magisterial powers, 39
Relegation of duties of minor importance to sub-deputy collectors, 38
Resignation tendered by the sub-deputy collectors, 65

Imperial Forest School

Number of Bengal students in the—and the annual expenditure thereon, 69

Improvement of food-grains and other agricultural produce, 122

Indian Cavalry

For Bengal, 528

Industrial Boards, 316

Industries

Department of—and Industrial intelligence officer, 102
Expenditure on the Department of, 430

Industries and Munitions

Expenditure on the working of the—departments, 49

Influx of tea garden coolies into Bengal, 35

Injection saline, in charitable dispensaries 100.

Inspector of European Schools, 33

Inspector of Judicial offices, 90.

Intelligence Branch
Officers of the, 17.

Ishurdi and Nachoul
Railway line between, 11

Jail(s)
Escaped convicts from Rajshahi, 148-149
Muhammadan officers for, 235
Muhammadans in manufactory department of, 58

Jail Depôt
Commission received by Manager on articles sold to Government, 81

Jailors and Jail Superintendents, 62

Janah, Babu Sarat Chandra
Partition of Midnapore, 512

Jangipur
Want of a platform on the Jangipur Road Station, 37

Jessore
Alleged expenditure by the District Board of Jessore by distributing medals to school boys in celebration of the Allies victory, 540
Settlement Buildings at, 69
Steps taken by District Board for a road up to the station Chaugacha, 87.

Jessore-Jhenida Railway
Stoppage of subsidy to, 548

Judge
Lack of at Alipore (24 Parganas) to deal with land acquisition cases, 3

"Juma" Prayer
Suspension of work for, 61

Jute
Regulating the price of, 78

Kala-azar in Tippera, 79

Kalighat
Judicial inquiry into the shooting incident at, 4
Report in connection with the firing at, 59
Shooting incident at—Tram Depôt, 58
Shooting incident in connection with the Tramway strike, 75
Shooting case and leave granted to Deputy Commissioner of Police, 6.

Kanchrapara
Mechanical apprentices, scheme for training—at, 367

Kandi
Distress in certain villages in, 121.
Employment of under-trial prisoners in the sub-jail, 238
Ferry toll levied at Ranagram Ghat in, 544
Subdivisional officer of, 377.

Kanungoes
Allegations against, 6
Pony allowance sanctioned to, 11

Karim Maulvi Abdul
Appointment of a special Muhammadan Sub-Inspector for Muhammadan education at Faridpur, 98
Case of one Shaikh Muhammad Dhunker and a head constable and a chaukidar at Rajbari, 67
Pay of the Subordinate Educational Service, 97
Postponement of resolutions, 169
Primary Education for girls, 68
Primary Schools in Faridpur, 356
Salaries committee's report, 233
Scheme for converting middle vernacular school for girls at Faridpur into a Middle English School, 106
Technical schools in Faridpur, 356

Karim, Maulvi Fazlal
Application for the post of District Judge and the appointment thereof, 78
Appointment of members of the Bengal Civil Service to posts of Under or Assistant Secretaries, 366
Cases disposed by a munsif or sub-judge and forming a criterion of his ability, 138
Compartments of lady passengers in steamers and exemption of certain articles from luggage fares, 23, 24
Considerations while fixing the pay of the ministerial officers, 234
Cost of bandage cloth for patients of police cases, 357
Demonstration farms in each thana and circulation of reports, etc., in vernacular, 365
Inspector of Judicial offices, 60
*Muhammadan Marriage Registrars in the Bakarganj district, 365.

Karim, Maulvi Fazlul

Muhammadan officers for jails, 235.
Members of the Calcutta Corporation and safeguard of the interests of the unrepresented communities, 438
Number of High English Schools working at a deficit owing to the non-co-operation movement, 107.
Passengers' fares and waiting rooms of Steamer Companies 234
Pay of ministerial officers, 235
Registration in Bakarganj and a substitute for the Sub-Registrar at Patuakhali 366
Return of cases by Subordinate Judges to the District Judges, and adverse remarks thereon 137
Salary slips to officiating munsifs, 364
Suspension of work for *Jumma* prayer, 61
Tube-well for Patuakhali water works 106

Kataktara "Aus" paddy seeds

Supply of, through Messrs. Sutton & Sons, 135

Kerr, the Hon'ble Mr. J. H.

Capsizing of ferry boats in the Hooghly between Budge Budge and Naihati 25
Compartments of lady passengers in steamers and exemption of certain articles from luggage fares, 24, 25
Consideration while fixing the pay of the ministerial officers, 235
Expense on Government launches or motor boats and their use and loan 236
Finance Member's statement, 148
Grants made by the Government of India and referred to in the Budget Estimate for 1921-22, 107
Industrial Boards, 327
Industrial Intelligence Officer and the Department of Statistics, 103
Opium godown attached to the Bankshall Street, 88
Passengers' fares and waiting rooms of Steamer Companies, 234
Pay of ministerial officers, 236
Pensioners and enhanced rate of pensions, 147.
Recommendations of ministerial officers' salaries committee, 230
Report of McAlpin Committee, 22.
Report of the ministerial officers salaries committee, 119.

Kerr, the Hon'ble Mr. J. H.

Resolution regarding the financial position of Bengal, 84.
Revenue stamps for Bengal, 256.
Salaries committee's report, 224, 289
Scarcity of coal, 244
Scarcity of rice and other food-grain 117.
Strikes in Eastern Bengal, 245, 246.
Supplementary grants—
27c—Ports and Pilotage, 689
47—Miscellaneous, 699.
Training Bengalis into mercant marine, 244.
Wages of tea garden coolies, 55

Khan, Babu Davendra Lal

Partition of Midnapore, 515
Partition schemes and expenditure thereon, 431

Khan, Maulvi Hamid-ud-din

Burial of Muhammadan convicts, 253

Khan, Mr. Razaur Rahman

Bhowal *Sannyasi*, 77
Ramzan and Muslim convicts, 62
Tea garden coolies at Chandpur, 545

Khulna

Famine in, 118
Scarcity in distress and the measure for relief 243
Scarcity in, 485
Tauzi No 127, partition of, 355

Kurseong

Improvements in the salaries of the staffs of Victoria and Dow Hill Schools 56

Lang, Mr. J.

Scarcity in Khulna, 501, 504.

Langford James, Mr. R. H. L.

Industrial Boards, 321, 322.

Larmour, Mr. F. A.

Chandpur inquiry, 393, 427.
Report of Taxi-cab Committee, 206, 209

Launches

Expenditure on police, 698.

Law Raja Reshee Case

Bengal Tenancy (Amendment) Bill, 167.

gal Remembrancer (Additional)

Abolition of the office of, 51.
Functions attaching to the post of, 79

gislative Council Proceedings

Meagre report of in newspapers, 7

censes for firearms, 66

cal Boards

Non-official Chairmen for, 369

hajang

Dredging of the river, 190, 206

aharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan, the Hon'ble

Allegations against Kanungoes, [illegible]
Arrangement for holding charge during recess period of Settlement Department, 115
Bakarganj maghs, 5[illegible]
Bankura famine, 291
Bengal Land Registration (Amendment) Bill, 1[illegible]
Bengal Tenancy Act, 311, 313, 3[illegible]
Bengal Tenancy (Amendment) Bill, 3[illegible]
Bhowal Kumar and alleged high-handedness of the officers of the Court of Wards, 245
Bhowal [illegible], 77
Bulli *bil* scheme, [illegible]
Breach in Singimara Khal embankment in Howrah, [illegible]
Cesses or Abwabs and Salami realised by Court of Wards, 20
Condition of the Saraswati river, 278, 279
Deputy collectors as Settlement officers, 375
Distress in certain villages in Kandi, 121
Distress in Satkhira sub-division, 243
Dredging of the river Lohajang, 192, 206
Estimated cost of Bankura settlement operation, 85
Failure of crops in the *bil* areas of Pargana Talihati in Faridpur, 73
Famine in Khulna, 118
Improvement of Tolly's Nala, 76
Income derived from the levy of toll in the Bhagirathi river, 54
Number of Bengal students in the Imperial Forest School and the annual expenditure thereon, 69
Padma and Hooghly rivers, 69.

Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan, the Hon'ble

Pony allowance sanctioned to Kanungoes, 42
Price and supply of quinine, 229
Progress in Damodar flood mitigation works, 74
Re-excavation of the Saraswati river, [illegible]
Sadhu as Kumar of Bhowal, 352
Scarcity in Khulna, 243, 497, 506
Settlement Buildings at Jessore, 70
Settlement costs in certain districts, 292
Silted up Saraswati river, 97
Silting up of river Chandana in Goalundo, 60
Stagnation of Atrai river, 5
Supplementary grants [illegible] Land Revenue, 649, 650, 651, 652, 654, 655
Tauzi No. 127, Khulna, partition of, 355
Tolly's nulla, 70, 71
Uthandi settlement of land, 11

Makramali, Munshi

Chandpur inquiry, 475
Government pleader and public prosecutor of Noakhali, 52
Mainamati Survey School, 580

Malaria and cholera in Faridpur, 253

Malarial fever

Measures to remove the cause of in Tangail, 99

Malda

Proposal to start a sericultural school in, 32

Mallik, Babu Surendra Nath

Accommodation for mufassal members, 588
Allotments to District Boards, 248
Ayurvedic medicine, 604, 607
Bangabasi defamation case, Government expenses on the, 372
Board of Education, 557
Calcutta electric license, 638
Calcutta University, 178.
Chandpur inquiry, 383, 410, 415, 424, 473, 475, 478, 482, 483
Condition of the Saraswati river, 277, 279
Improvement of Tolly's nulla, 76
Kalighat shooting incident in connection with the tramway strike, 75.

Mallik, Babu Surendra Nath

Postponement of civil appeals, 748.
Postponement of *resolutions*, 168.
Practice of tying under-trial prisoners with ropes and leading them through public places, 231.
Resolution regarding the financial position of Bengal, 84.
Scarcity in Khulna, 496, 497
Supplementary grants—
24 —Administration of Justice, 662, 671
26 —Police, 684

Marriage Registrars

Muhammadan in the Bakarganj district, 363

McAlpin Committee

Report of, 21

McGowan, Mr.

For the Deputy Directorship of Agriculture, 80

McLean, Mr. K.

Hill journey of—, officiating Fibre Expert, 131

Medical College

Alleged ill-treatment of a poor female phthisis patient at the Medical College Hospital, Calcutta, 59
An indigent female phthisis patient into the, 2
Conduct of nurses in female wards of the Hospital, 237.
Number of candidates admitted into from each division, 305
Number of students from Eastern Bengal admitted into, 304.

"Melas," control of fairs and, 595

Memorials by district board employees and their pay, 82

Midnapore

Partition of, 507.

Mileage

Of railway, navigable rivers and roads in districts of Bengal, 644.

Milk

Supply of pure, 81

Mining Education, 369.

Ministerial officers, 234, 235.

Recommendation of—salaries committee 230.

Ministerial staff

Muhammadans in the, 73.

Mitra, Rai Bahadur Mahendra Chand

Allotments to District Boards, 247
Ayurvedic medicine, 604.
Bengali Children Bill, 156.
Board of Education, 567.
Chandpur inquiry, 170.
Condition of Saraswati river, 275
Control of fairs and *melas*, 596.
Coolie strike and the Subdivisional Officer, Chandpur, 82.
Demonstration farms 368, 141
Development Board, 368
Distress in Satkhira sub-division, 24
Enhancement of chaukidari tax in Burdwan Division, 25.
Fairs and *melas*, 590
Industrial Boards, 323
Investigation regarding beri beri epidemic dropsy in Bengal, 272, 273
Mining Education, 369.
Number of Bengal students in Imperial Forest School and annual expenditure thereon, 69
Padma and Hooghly rivers, 69
Reorganisation of the Police Department 219
Stoppage of filtered water-supply Calcutta, 87
Supplementary grants, 24—Administration of Justice, 674.
Time-scale salaries for the sub-deputy collectors, 82
Tannin manufacture, 440
Vocational education, 88

Mitter, the Hon'ble Mr. P. C.

Accounts and audit reports of Calcutta University, 537.
Appointment of a special Muhammadan Sub-Inspector for Muhammadan education at Faridpur, 98.
Basudev Mandir in village Utter Shibazpur in Bakarganj, 120.
Board of Education, 557, 563, 564, 577, 578, 579.
Breach of trust by the trustee to the estate of late Babu Shyama Charan Sarkar, of Mamjuani, in Nadia. 4
Calcutta University, 177, 185, 186, 3

[Mi]tter, the Hon'ble Mr. P. C.

Confirmation of educational officers conditional on their passing examination in vernacular, 9, 10
Dacca Board of Secondary and Intermediate Education, 78
Education of depressed classes, 91
Fees for registration of under-graduates at the Calcutta University, 71
Improvement in the pay and prospects of the Subordinate Educational Service, 86
Increase in the pay and prospects of men in the educational service, 374
Inspecting officers of the Education Department, 111
Lower and upper primary schools, 28
Members of educational service holding special appointments in Training Colleges for teachers and [illegible], 12, 14
M[illegible] B[illegible] and D[illegible] special [illegible] Education Department, [illegible]
Muhammadan Marriage Registrars in the Bakarganj district, [illegible]
Number of High English Schools working [illegible]
Pay of the Subordinate Educational Service, [illegible]
Pay of men at [illegible] posts of [illegible] Service, [illegible]
P[illegible], [illegible]
Primary [illegible] details [illegible], [illegible]
Primary schools in Faridpur, 356
Promotion of Deputy Inspectors of schools to the Bengal Educational Service, 116
Qualifications of special classes for the appointment of Sub-Registrars, 204
Qualifications of certain professors in the Calcutta University, 239
Registration in Bakarganj and a substitute for the Sub-Registrar at Patuakhali, [illegible]
Report of the committee on the salaries of teachers of subordinate educational service, 8
Report of Wordsworth Committee, 8
Scheme for converting Middle Vernacular Schools for girls at Faridpur into a Middle English School, 106
Subordinate Educational Service, 75
Supplementary grants, 31 - Education, 600

Mitter, the Hon'ble Mr. P. C.

Taking thumb impressions in registration offices, 231
Teachers in primary schools in certain sub-divisions of Mymensingh, 50
Technical schools in Faridpur, 357
Transfer of registration officers, 543
Vocational education, 88
Wordsworth committee and non-representation of school teachers thereon, 85

Mohanganj (Rajshahi)

Hat incidents, 412
House searches and arrests, 451
Reconnaissance at, in connection with escaped jail convicts, 449
Shooting incidents at, 450

Moitra, Dr. Jatindra Nath

Assam tea garden coolies, 228
Chandpur inquiry, 404
Cholera and malaria in Faridpur, 364
Concession in railway fares to Assam tea garden coolies, 16
Postponement of resolutions, 169
Railway between Faridpur and Barisal or Jessore, 114
Rules regarding reservation of berths in trains, [illegible]
Running of municipal conservancy railway in Calcutta, 239
Silting up of river Chandana in Goalundo, 59
Supplementary grants, 5 - Land Revenue, 655
Teaching staff of the School of Tropical Medicine, 284
Trains from Calcutta to Faridpur, 240

Morgan, Mr. G.

Reorganisation of the Police Department, 223

Motor boats

Expense on Government launches or and their use and loan, 236

Muhammadan members

Proportion of, in various boards or municipalities, etc., in Dacca division, 22

Muhammadans

As head warders and warders, 90

Mukharji, Babu Satish Chandra

Ayurvedic medicine, 603
Condition of the Saraswati river, 280
Extension of Gambling Act to the Howrah District, 110
Insanitary condition of Serampore Khal 553

Mukherjee, Babu Nitya Dhon

Ayurvedic medicine, 606, 607
Bengal Tenancy Act, 315
Chandpur inquiry, 459
Publication of Council proceedings in Bengali 200
Supplementary grants
5—Land Revenue, 652
24—Administration of Justice 670

Mukherji, Professor S. C.

Board of Education, 573
Calcutta University 183
Chandpur inquiry 427 452

Mukhopadhaya, Babu Sarat Chandra

Panskura railway station 169
Partition of Midnapore 511

Mullick, Babu Nirode Behary

Calcutta University, 181
Scarcity in Khulna 495

Munsifs

Salary slips to officiating, 304

Murshidabad

Decline in the population of 535, 547
Mahajans in 91
Scarcity of drinking water in 289

Mymensingh

Teachers in primary schools for girls in certain subdivisions of, 50.

Nadia

Breach of trust by the trustee to the estate of late Babu Shyama Charan Sarkar of Mamjuani 428

Nasker, Babu Hem Chandra

Calcutta University
Financial management of the, 352
Qualification of certain professors of the, 239

Noakhali

Erosion of town 288
Government pleader and Public Prosecutor of 52

Nomination

Of candidates from Chittagong to Provincial and Subordinate Civil Services and Excise Service, 299.

Oaths or affirmation

Certain members', 61

Offenders

Practice of tying with rope on the waist, 233

O'Malley, Mr. L. S. S.

Medical College Hospital and an indigent female phthisis patient 2
Metalled road between Rampur Boalia and Godagari 15
K. D. and Skrine canals at Rangpur

Opium godown

Attached to the Bankshall Street 88

Padma and Hooghly rivers, 69

Pal, Rai Bahadur Radha Charan

Accommodation for mufassal members 587, 588
Alleged ill-treatment of a poor female phthisis patient at the Medical College Hospital Calcutta 59
Ayurvedic medicine 611
Board of Education, 571 579
Chandpur inquiry 394 442 479
Dacca Board of Secondary and Intermediate Education, 77
Fairs and markets, 594
Government Commercial Institute Calcutta 370
Medical College Hospital and an indigent female phthisis patient 2
Non-official Chairmen for Local Boards 369
Report in connection with the firing at Kalighat 59
Scarcity in Khulna, 485 501, 506
Supplementary grants—
24—Administration of Justice 666, 674 676
25—Jails and Convict Settlements 680
26—Police, 683, 685
35—Industries 693
41—Civil Works 694
Tea garden coolies at Chandpur, 86.

[illegible]al, Rai Bahadur Radha Charan.

Want of a Chemical Laboratory in the Campbell Medical School 32
Working of hand-looms and their products 145

[illegible]ankeura Railway Station, 169

[illegible]artition schemes and expenditure thereon, 131

[illegible]assengers

Sheds for [illegible] in certain railway stations 17

[illegible]atuakhali

Substitute for the Sub-Registrar of [illegible]
[illegible] for water works 108

[illegible]ension

[illegible]

Phooka

[illegible] in Calcutta [illegible]

[illegible]thisis cases, [illegible]

[illegible]rojpur

[illegible] dismissed Government servants [illegible]
[illegible] 182
[illegible] and muktabs [illegible]
[illegible] of communications of [illegible]

[illegible]lice

[illegible] of bandage [illegible] for patients of [illegible]
[illegible] Calcutta [illegible]
Expenditure on certain cases 256
[illegible] officers [illegible] their charge in certain [illegible] and appointments 86
Calcutta Courts 12
Reorganisation of the Department 200
Sergeants in Calcutta 101

[illegible]y allowance

[illegible] to Kanungoes 41

Prefixes

Differentiation in the [illegible] of officers' names in certain services 83

President

Accommodation for mufassal members, 583 587 588 590
Allotments to District Boards, 246
Ayurvedic medicine 602 608, 611
Bengal Children Bill, 154
Bengal Tenancy Act, 313, 314 315
Bengal Tenancy (Amendment) Bill, 158, 166 167
Board of Education 556 557, 563, 564 567 579 580
Burial of Muhammadan convicts 254
Calcutta electric license 638
Calcutta University 186
Called to order 698
Chandpur inquiry 393, 396 405, 407 409, 410 411, 423, 424, 427, 452, 474 479 482 483 484 485
Chandpur outrage and alleged irregularities of certain officials 67
Control of fairs and melas 595
Declared panel of four chairmen, 1
Distribution of Legislative Council proceedings 281
District Advisory Boards 33, 339 347
Dredging of the river Lohajan 193 206
Ejectment of coolies from Chandpur railway station 3
Employment of under trial prisoners in the Kandi sub-jail, 238
Fairs and melas 594
Inclusion of Darjeeling within the Reforms Scheme 266
Industrial Boards 320
Mohanganj hat incidents 612 613, 614, 618, 627
Motion for adjournment 604
Partition of Midnapore, 517 518 521, 524
Postponement of resolution 168 172 [illegible]
Prevention of cruelty to animals 382, 383
Prorogation 706
Publication of Council proceedings in Bengali 194 197 198 204 205
Reads a letter to the Council regarding the appointment of Mr W C Currie 191
Reorganisation of the Police Department 214 215 221 222 223 226 227
Scarcity in Khulna, 197 207

President

Supplementary grants, 648, 650, 655
22—General Administration, 656.
24—Administration of Justice, 663 667, 668, 674, 676
32—Medical, 691
41—Civil Works, 695

Vocational training, 632, 635

Primary education

For girls, 68

Primary Schools in Faridpur, 356

Proceedings of the Legislative Council

Distribution of, 280

Promotion

Of Deputy Inspector of Schools to the Bengal Educational Service, 109

Prorogation, 700

Provincial Service

Pay of men while officiating in posts of, 372

Quinine

Price and supply of, 229

Rahim, the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-

Abolition of the office of the Additional Legal Remembrancer, 54
Alleged employment of dismissed Government servant as the Government mukhtear at Pirojpur, 290
Appeals in certain districts, 548
Assistant jailors, 298
Bengal Children Bill, 151, 154, 156
Bengal Civil Service (Judicial), 73
Burial of Muhammadan convicts, 254.
Calcutta Police Courts, 43
Commission received by Jail Depôt manager on articles sold to Government, 81
Expenditure on certain police cases, 286
Fasting by prisoners in *Ramzan*, 5
Employment of under trial prisoners in the Kandi sub jail, 238
Functions attaching to the post of the additional Legal Remembrancer, 79.
Government pleader and Public Prosecutor of Noakhali, 53
Grievances of the sub-jail clerks, 61.
Inspector of Judicial offices, 60

Rahim, the Hon'ble Sir Ab-dur-

Introduction of a heading under "Caste" in the form of record of deposition of witnesses in civil courts, 237
Jailors and jail superintendents, 62
Lack of judge at Alipore (24-Parganas) to deal with land acquisition cases
Muhammadan officers for jails, 235
Muhammadans as head warders and warders, 99
Muhammadans in manufactory departments of jails, 98
Offer of houses for courts and quarters of munsifs at Gopalganj, 61
Police Court buildings in Calcutta, 3
Postponement of civil appeals, 348
Privilege leave of officers of the Bengal Civil Service (Judicial), 261
Ramzan and Muslim convicts, 63
Return of cases by subordinate judges to the district judges and advers remarks thereon, 137
Salary slips to officiating munsifs, 367
Shed for witnesses in Rangpur district court, 109
Sub-jail clerks, 55
Supplementary grants
24—Administration of Justice, 658, 660, 663, 664, 665, 667, 670, 677
25—Jails and Convict Settlements, 678, 681
Suspension of work for *Jumu* prayer,

Railway

Between Faridpur and Barisal and Jessore, 114
Committee's report on construction between Dacca and Aricha, 76
Running of municipal cars in Calcutta, 2

Rajbari

Case of one Shaikh Muhammad Dilker and a head constable and chaukidar at, 67

Rajshahi

Escaped convicts from—jail, 448, 44
Escape of prisoners from—jail, 10, 1

Rampur Boalia and Godagari

Metalled road between, 15
Railway communication with, 7, 8

amzan

Fasting by prisoners in, 5
Ramzan " and Muslim Convicts, 62

angpur

Cattle farm, 289
Formation of Union Boards in, 290
K. D. and Skrine canals at, 16
Number of charitable dispensaries in, 86
Stool for witnesses in district courts, 166

auf, Maulvi Shah Abdur

Burial of Muhammadan convicts, 254
Improvement in the pay and prospects of the [illegible], 86
Muhammadans in the ministerial staff, 74
Number of charitable dispensaries at Rangpur, 86
Post [illegible] Deputy Inspector [illegible] to the Bengal Educational Service, 290
Publication of Council proceedings in Bengali, 248
[illegible] Rangpur district, [illegible]
Transfer of registration officers, 513

ay, Babu Bhabendra Chandra

[illegible] the Agricultural Department, 86
Hea[illegible] students going up to the [illegible], 44
H[illegible]
Mr. K. McLean[illegible] Fibre Expert, 144
The Director of Agriculture, 300
Housing arrangements of Indians and Anglo-Indians going up to the hills, 72
Kataktara [illegible] paddy seeds, supply of through Messrs. Sutton & Sons, 135
Mr. McGowan for the Deputy Directorship for Agriculture, 80
Sericulture research, subsidies and Miss Cleghorn's practical work, 301

ay, Babu Surendra Nath

Accommodation for mufassal members, 582, 590
Allotments to District Boards, 249
Ayurvedic medicine, 443
Board of Education, 560
Chandpur inquiry, 409

Ray, Babu Surendra Nath

District Advisory Boards, 338
Inclusion of Darjeeling within the Reforms Scheme, 264, 266
Indian Cavalry for Bengal, 632
K[illegible]ghat shooting case and leave granted to Deputy Commissioner of Police, 6
Mohanganj [illegible] incidents, 625
Officers of the Intelligence Branch, 17
Partition of Midnapore, 621,
Publication of Council proceedings in Bengali, 204
Reduction of Executive Councillors, 4,
Revenue stamps for Bengal, 255, 258,
Supplementary grants
24 Administration of Justice, 657, 66[illegible]
26 Police, 68[illegible]
[illegible] Industries, 693
[illegible] Civil Works, 694, 695
Vocational Training, 631, 632
Withdrawal of resolutions, 168

Ray, Kumar Shib Shekhareswar

Accommodation for mufassal members, 585
Audit fees levied from Co-operative Societies, 11[illegible]
Allotment to District Boards, 246
Bengal Tenancy Act, 309
Bengal Tenancy (Amendment) Bill, 166
Chandpur inquiry, 163
Distribution of Legislative Council proceedings, 281
Escape of prisoners from Rajshahi Jail, 10, 11
Escaped convicts from Rajshahi Jail, 448, 449
Mohanganj [illegible] incidents, 612, 613, 614, 61[illegible], 625, 629
Motion for adjournment, 694
Pony allowance sanctioned to Kanungos, 11
Reorganisation of the Police Department, 217
Reconnaissance at Mohanganj (Rajshahi) in connection with escaped jail convicts, 449
Shooting incidents at Mohanganj (Rajshahi), 450
Supplementary grants
5 Land Revenue, 653, 655
24 Administration of Justice, 660, 677
26 Police, 685, 687
31 Education, 690
35 Industries, 693

Ray Chaudhuri, Babu Brojendra Kishor

Committee's report on railway construction between Dacca and Aricha, 76
Conduct of nurses in female wards of the Calcutta Medical College Hospital, 237
District Board expenditure on tanks 135
Kala azar in Tangail 100
Measures to remove the cause of malarial fever in Tangail 69
Number of patients treated in charitable dispensaries 546
Number of students from Eastern Bengal admitted into the Calcutta Medical College 304
Phthisis cases 23
Privately owned insanitary tanks 302
Saline injection in charitable dispensaries 100
Supply of pure milk 81
Uniform weights and measures 305

Ray Chaudhuri, Mr. Krishna Chandra

Capsizing of ferry boats in the Hooghly between Budge Budge and Naihati 27
Industrial Boards 316 320 322 332
Supplementary grants 24 Administration of Justice 673

Ray Choudhury, Raja Manmatha Nath

Dredging of the river Lohajang, 190 193 206
Vocational Training 628 632

Reforms

Additional staff to meet increased work under, 618

Registration

In Bakarganj 306
Taking of thumb impression in offices 231
Transfer of officers 543

Report

Salaries committee's 233

Resignation

Tendered by the sub-deputy collectors 65

Resolution(s), 168 246 300 329 554

Postponement of, 168 260 315
Regarding the financial position of Bengal, 81
Withdrawal of 268, 172, 315 528 535

Revenue

Derived from gun-license-fees, 35
Stamps for Bengal, 255.

Rice.

Scarcity of—and other food-grains, 1.

River dacoities

Number of, 297.

River police

Work of the 297

Roads

Repairing expenditure of roads in Calcutta under Public Works Department 100

Roy, Babu Jogendra Nath

Reorganisation of the Police Department 227
Scarcity in Khulna 190
Steps to enlighten cultivators on the results of the experimental farms 6
Tauzi No 127 Khulna, partition of, 35

Roy, Babu Nalini Nath

Alleged expenditure by the District Board of Jessore by distributing medals to school boys in celebration of the Allies victory 640
Indian Cavalry for Bengal, 528 535
Licenses for fire arms 69
Lower and upper primary schools 27
Reorganisation of the Police Department 224
Steps taken by Jessore District Board for a road in police-station Chaugachha 87
Vocational Training, 635

Roy, Maharaja Bahadur Kshaunish Chandra

Fairs and *melas*, 593
Partition of Midnapore, 517 521

Roy, Mr. Bijoy Prosad Singh

Progress in Damodar flood mitigation works, 74

Roy, Mr. Tarit Bhusan

Chandpur inquiry 389
Supplementary grants, 24—Administration of Justice, 674

Roy, Rai Bahadur Lalit Mohan Singh

Accuracy in the rates of commercial products as published in the Calcutta Gazette 4
Back pay of sub-deputy and deputy collectors 2
Cotton growing in Bengal 130
Expenditure on the Department of Industries 130
Improvement of date sugar 21
Measures to check the decrease of cows and bullocks 72
Report of the committee on the salaries of subordinate educational service 8
Supplementary grants 24—Administration of Justice [illegible]

Roy, Raja Manilall Singh

Allotments to District Boards 248
Assault [illegible] in the district of Burdwan [illegible] popularity of the [illegible] 31
Ayurvedic [illegible]
Court [illegible]
Public Works Department [illegible] Zilla School buildings at Burdwan [illegible]

Roy Chaudhuri, Babu Sailaja Nath

Demand for [illegible] separate electorate [illegible] 29
F[illegible] separate [illegible]
Grievances of the [illegible]
S[illegible] Khulna [illegible]

Salam, Khan Bahadur Abdus

Publication of Council proceedings in Bengali [illegible]
Salaries Committee's report [illegible] 238

Sanitary Drainage Act

Results of action taken under the [illegible]

Saraswati

Condition of the river 274
Re-excavation of the river 71
Silting up river [illegible]

Sarkar, Babu Jogesh Chandra

Agricultural School at Rangpur 5
Formation of union boards in Rangpur 2[illegible]
Government tobacco farm at Burirhat [illegible]

Sarkar, Babu Jogesh Chandra

K. D. and Skrine canals at Rangpur, 16
Nomenclature of the Indian and European waiting rooms at Parbatipur junction of the Eastern Bengal Railway 21
Rangpur cattle farm 289
Report of McAlpin Committee 22
Report of Wordsworth Committee 8

Sarkar, Babu Rishindra Nath

Allotments to District Boards 250
Bankura famine 291
Bengal Tenancy Act 315
Calcutta University 1[illegible]2
Chandpur affairs and Government official attitude 290
Deputy Collectors as Settlement Officers [illegible]
Distribution of Legislative Council proceedings 281
Effect to the recommendation of the Wordsworth Committee 78
Estimated cost of Bankura settlement operation 85
Improving the condition of Tollygunj and certain other municipalities 81
Publication of Council proceedings in Bengali 295
Settlement costs in certain districts 292
Subordinate Educational Service 7[illegible]
Supply of drinking water to villages in Bankura 249
Water supply in Calcutta 142
Wordsworth committee and non-representation of school teachers thereon 85

Sarkar, Babu Shyama Charan

Breach of trust by the trustee to the estate of late Babu [illegible] of Manipuram Nadia 128

Satkhira

Distress in subdivision 242

School(s)

Lower and upper primary 25
Madrassas Maktabs and Primary in Pirojpur 291
Number of High English working at a deficit owing to the non-co-operation movement 107
Of Tropical Medicine 284
Scheme for converting Middle Vernacular for girls at Faridpur into a Middle English 106
Zilla Buildings at Burdwan 120

Serampore

Insanitary condition of—khal 553

Sericulture

Research subsidies and Miss Cleghorn's practical work 301

Selection of successor to present Superintendent of Sericulture and certain works of the Department of Sericulture, 63

Sericultural school

Proposal to start a— in Malda 32

Settlement

Arrangement for holding charge during recess period of Settlement Department 115

Buildings at Jessore 69

Costs in certain districts 292

Deputy collectors as officers, 375

Ship-building

Industry in Bengal 101

Singimara Khal embankments

Breach in the— in Howrah 19

Sinha, Babu Surendra Narayan

Abolition of the office of the additional Legal Remembrancer 54

Decline in the population of Murshidabad, 537

Distress in certain villages in Kandi 121

Ferry toll levied at Ranagram Ghat in Kandi subdivision 543

Functions attaching to the post of the additional Legal Remembrancer, 59

Income derived from the levy of toll in the Bhagirathi river 53

Report of the ministerial officers' salaries committee, 118

Revenue derived from gun license fees 35

Scarcity of rice and other foodgrains 117

Sub-jail clerks 55

Wages of tea garden coolies 75

Want of a platform on the Jangipur Road Station, 37

Standing Committees

Meetings and recommendations of the 378

Stark, Mr. H. A.

Board of Education, 564.

Chandpur inquiry, 473.

Confirmation of educational officers conditional on their passing examination in vernacular, 8, 9.

Improvements in the salaries of staffs of Victoria and Dow Schools Kurseong, 56

Inspector of European Schools, 33

Members of Educational Service h specific appointments in L... Colleges for teachers and their tenure, 11, 12

Messrs Biss and Dunn on special Education Department 20

Pensioners and enhanced rate of sions 117

Statement

Finance member's 148

Steamer Companies

Passengers' fares and waiting room 234

Steamers

Compartments of lady passenger and exemption of certain articles luggage fares 23

Strikes in Eastern Bengal, 245

Sub-Deputy Collectors

Rank pay of 2

Non-vesting with first class magistrate powers 39

Pay and prospects of 15

Relegation of duties of minor importance to 38

Resignation tendered by the 65

Revised pay and prospects of 28

Time scale salaries for, 82

Sub-divisions

Junior Deputies in charge of, 83

Public Works Department 129

Sub-jail clerks, 55, 61

Subordinate Civil Service

Improvement in the pay and prospects of the, 95

Subordinate Educational Service

Improvement in the pay and prospects of the, 86

Pay of the 97

Report of the committee on salaries 8

Sub-Registrars

Qualifications and special claims for the appointment of, 293
Revised pay and prospects of, 2 5

Sugar

Manufacture of from palm trees, 411

Suhrawardy, Dr. A.

Partition of Midnapore, 524

Suhrawardy, Dr. Hassan

Ayurvedic medicine, 597, 602
Calcutta University, 170
Prevention of bullock and buffalo cart, 637, 636
Prevention of cruelty to animals, 369, 383

Suhrawardy, Mr. Huseyn Shaheed

Ayurvedic medicine, 607
Bankipur inquiry, 470
Dredging of the river Lohajang, 193
Fees for registration of undergraduates of the Calcutta University, 72
Partition of Midnapore, 507, 518, 524, 527
Postponement of resolution, 50
Question of Council procedure in Bengal, 100
Supplementary grants, 21
Administration of Justice, 673, 674

Tangail

[illegible] in, 100
Measures to remove the cause of malarial fever in Tangail, 99

Taxis

Privately owned motor taxis, 302

Tea... manufacture, 110

... No. 127, partition of, 55

... business

... cars, 290

...cab Committee

Report of, 206

Tea garden coolies

Influx of into Bengal, 35

Technical School

Establishment of a in Calcutta, 58
Faridpur, 356

Thumb impression

Taking of in registration offices, 231

Tippera

Kala-azar in, 79

Tobacco farm

Government at Rangpur, 578

Toll

Income derived from the levy of on the Bhagirathi river, 53

Tollygunge

Improving the condition of and certain other municipalities, 81

Tolly's nulla, 76

Improvement of, 76

Trains

From Calcutta to Faridpur, 240
Rules regarding reservation of berths in, 72

Transported convict

Removal of a, 16

Tropical medicine

Teaching staff of the School of, 284

Under-trial prisoners

Employment of in the Khulna sub-jail, 238
Practice of tying with ropes and leading them through public places, 231

University

Fees for registration of undergraduates of the Calcutta, 73

Utbandi settlement of land, 11

Vocational Education, 88

Vocational Training, 628

Voting

Alleged interference with free voting in the election for Calcutta South Muhammadan seat, 33

Wages of tea garden coolies, 519

Waiting rooms

Passengers fares and waiting rooms of Steamer Companies, 234

Water-hyacinth Committee, 64

Water-supply in Calcutta, 412.

Stoppage of filtered in Calcutta, 87

Water-works

Scheme for the Comilla municipality, 547.

Tube-well for Patuakhali, 106.

Watson-Smyth, Mr. R. M.

Industrial Boards, 319, 320

Chandpur inquiry, 113

Reorganisation of the Police Department, 226

Weights and measures (uniform), 305.

Wheeler, the Hon'ble Sir Henry

Accommodation for mufassal members, 584, 590

Additional staff to meet increased work under Reforms, 648

Age-limit for Indian and Bengal Civil Service (Executive), 90

Alleged interference with free voting in by-election for Calcutta South (Muhammadan) seat, 33

Application for the post of District Judge and the appointment thereof, 78

Appointments for depressed classes to certain posts, 697

Appointment of members of the Bengal Civil Service to posts of Under or Assistant Secretaries, 305

Appointment of Muhammadans in Government service, 115

Assam tea garden coolies, 228

Assam tea garden coolies in the district of Burdwan and unpopularity of the Gurkhas at Chandpur, 31

Back pay of sub-deputy and deputy collectors, 2

Bangabasi defamation case, Government expenses on the, 373

Buick cars for taxi business, 230

Cadre of Bengal Civil Service Executive Branch, 53

Case of one Shaikh Muhammad Dhunker and a head constable and a chaukidar at Rajbari, 68

Cases disposed of by a munsif or sub-judge and forming a criterion of his ability, 438

Chandpur affairs and Government officials' attitude, 291

Chandpur inquiry, 389, 415, 423, 424, 470, 479, 483

Wheeler, the Hon'ble Sir Henry

Chandpur outrage and alleged irregularity of certain officials, 66, 67.

Coolie strike and the subdivisional officer, Chandpur, 82.

Differentiation of prefixes of and of names in certain services, 84

Distribution of Legislative Council proceedings, 282

Disqualified Advisory Boards, 339, 340

Ejectment of coolies from Chandpur Railway Station, 37

Escape of prisoners from Rajshahi, 11

Escaped convicts from Rajshahi jail, 149

Expenditure on police launches, etc.

Extension of Gambling Act to Howrah district, 110

Heads of departments going up to hills, 147

House searches and arrests at Magura, 451

Improvement in the—

Pay and prospects of the Subordinate Civil Service, 96

Salaries of the staffs of Victoria, Dow Hill Schools, Kurseong, etc.

Inclusion of Darjeeling within the Reforms Scheme, 269

Indian Cavalry for Bengal, 534

Indian police officers, 89

Influx of tea garden coolies into Bengal, 36

Inspector of European Schools, 33

Judicial inquiry into the shooting incident at Kalighat, 4

Junior Deputies in charge of subdivisions, 83

Kalighat shooting case and rewards granted to Deputy Commissioner of Police, 6

Kalighat shooting incident in connection with the tramways strike, 75

Licenses for fire-arms, 66

Meagre report of Legislative Council proceedings in newspapers, 7

Meetings and accommodations of Standing Committee, 378

Mohanganj *hát* incident, 615, 619

Muhammadan subdivisional officers, Dacca district, 15

Muhammadans in the ministerial, 73.

ller, the Hon'ble Sir Henry

mination of candidates from Chetta ... ng for Provincial and Subordinate Civil Service and Excise Service, 29[illegible]
... vesting sub-deputy collectors with first class magisterial powers, [illegible]
nber of river dacoities and the work of the river police, 207
nber of serious and petty cases tried by Calcutta Police Courts, 64[illegible]
... ers of the Intelligence Branch, 17
... and prospects of sub-deputy collectors, 15
... tition of Midnapore, 519
... tition schemes and expenditure thereon, 131
... centage of Anglo-Indians on the Bengal Civil Service, 14
... ce sergeants in Calcutta, 101
... ctice of ... on milch-cows in Calcutta, 29[illegible]
... ctice of tying
... offenders with rope on the waist, 233
... under-trial prisoners with ropes and leading them through public places, 232
... dication of Council proceedings in Bengali, 1[illegible], 201
... at Mohanganj, Ra... [illegible]
... ation of Executive Councillors, 1
... ... of minor importance ... sub-deputy collectors, 38

Removal of a transported convict, 16, 17

Wheeler, the Hon'ble Sir Henry

Reorganisation of the Police Department, 223
Report in connection with the firing at Kalighat, [illegible]
Report of Taxi Cab Committee, 208
Resignation tendered by the sub-deputy collectors, [illegible]
Revenue derived from gun license fees, [illegible]
Revised pay and prospects of sub-deputy collectors and sub-registrars, 28[illegible]
Shooting incident at Kalighat Tram Depot, [illegible]
Shooting incidents at Mohanganj (Rajshahi), 150
Subdivisional officer of Kandi, 377, 378
Supplementary grants
- 22 General Administration, 656
- 24 Administration of Justice, 672
- 26 Police, 681, 683, 684, 687, 688, 689

Tea garden coolies at Chandpur, 87, 545
Time-scale salaries for sub-deputy collectors, 82

Witness-shed

At Rangpur district court, 109

Wordsworth Committee

And ... representation of school teachers thereon, 85
Effect to the recommendations of the, [illegible]
Report of, [illegible]

B. Press -8-5-1922-4372J-2,006-P. T. R.

GOVERNMENT OF BENGAL.

GOVERNOR OF BENGAL.

His Excellency the Right Hon'ble Lawrence John Lumley Dundas, Earl of Ronaldshay, G.C.I.E.

MEMBERS OF THE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL.

The Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler, K.C.S.I., K.C.I.E., C.S.I., Vice-President, in charge of the following portfolios:

1. Appointment.
2. Political.
3. Police.
4. Ecclesiastical.
5. European Education.

The Hon'ble Sir Bijay Chand Mahtab, K.C.S.I., K.C.I.E., I.O.M., Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan in charge of the following portfolios:

1. Land Revenue.
2. Land Acquisition.
3. Forests.
4. Irrigation.
5. Excluded areas.

The Hon'ble Mr. J. H. Kerr, C.S.I., C.I.E., in charge of the following portfolios:

1. Finance.
2. Separate Revenue.
3. Commerce and reserved Industrial subjects.
4. Marine.

The Hon'ble Sir Abdur-Rahim, Kt., in charge of the following portfolios:

1. Judicial.
2. Jails.
3. Emigration.
4. Immigration.
5. Jurisdiction.

MINISTERS.

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA, Kt., in charge of the following portfolios:—

Local Self-Government and Public Health.

The Hon'ble Mr. PROVASH CHUNDER MITTER, C.I.E., in charge of the following portfolio:—

Education.

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur C.I.E., in charge of the following portfolios:—

Agriculture and Public Works.

GOVERNMENT OF BENGAL.

PRINCIPAL OFFICERS OF THE BENGAL LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

PRESIDENT.

The Hon'ble Nawab Sir SYED SHAMS-UL-HUDA, K.C.I.E.

DEPUTY-PRESIDENT.

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY.

Secretary to the Council—C. TINDALL, C.I.E., I.C.S.

Assistant Secretary to the Council—A. M. HUTCHISON.

Registrar to the Council—J. W. MCKAY.

BENGAL LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL.

ALPHABETICAL LIST OF MEMBERS.

A

ddy, Babu Anukva Dhone. (Bengal National Chamber of Commerce.)
fzal, Khan Bahadur Nawabzada K. M. (Dacca City (Muhammadan).)
hmed, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Wasimuddin. (Pabna (Muhammadan).)
hmed, Maulvi Azaharuddin. (Bakarganj West (Muhammadan).)
hmed, Maulvi Emaduddin. (Rajshahi South (Muhammadan).)
hmed, Maulvi Meshah Uddin. (Faridpur South (Muhammadan).)
hmed, Maulvi Rafi Uddin. (Jessore South (Muhammadan).)
hmed, Maulvi Yakubuddin. (Dinajpur (Muhammadan).)
hmed, Munshi Jafar. (Noakhali (Muhammadan).)
h, Maulvi A. H. M. Wazir. (Bakarganj North (Muhammadan).)
h, Maulvi Syed Muksood. (24-Parganas Municipal North (Muhammadan).)
h, Mr. Syed Ertan. (Nadia (Muhammadan).)
h, Mr. Syed Nasim. (24-Parganas Rural (Muhammadan).)
h, Munshi Amir. (Chittagong (Muhammadan).)
h, Munshi Ayub. (Chittagong (Muhammadan).)
rhamuddin, Maulvi Khandakar. (Mymensingh West (Muhammadan).)
zam, Khan Bahadur Khwaja Mohamed. (Dacca East Rural (Muhammadan).)

B

anerjea, the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath. (Minister, 24-Parganas Municipal North (Muhammadan).)
anerjee, Rai Bahadur Abinash Chandra. (Birbhum (Non-Muhammadan).)
arma, Rai Sahib Panchanan. (Rangpur (Non-Muhammadan).)
arton, Mr. H. (Anglo-Indian.)
asu, Babu Jatindra Nath. (Calcutta North (Non-Muhammadan).)
asu, Rai Bahadur Nalinaksha. (Burdwan (Non-Muhammadan).)
hattacharji, Babu Hem Chandra. (Nominated Non-Official Labouring Classes.)
rla, Babu Ghanesbyam Das. (Nominated Non-Official.)
[redacted] L. (Nominated Official.)
ompas, Mr. C. H. (Nominated Official.)
ose, Mr. S. M. (Mymensingh East (Non-Muhammadan).)

C

ampbell, Mr. J. (Bengal Chamber of Commerce.)
arey, Mr. W. L. (Indian Mining Association.)

Cathcart, Mr. M. [Dacca and Chittagong (European).]
Charmakar, Babu Rasik Chandra. [Noakhali (Non-Muhammadan).]
Chaudhuri, Babu Kishori Mohan. [Rajshahi (Non-Muhammadan).]
Chaudhuri, Babu Tankanath. [Dinajpur (Non-Muhammadan).]
Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Hafizar Rahman. [Bogra (Muhammadan).]
Chaudhuri, Maulvi Shah Muhammad. [Malda *cum* Jalpaiguri (Muhammadan).]
Chaudhuri, Rai Harendranath. [24-Parganas Rural North (Non-Muhammadan).]
Chaudhuri, Sir Ashutosh. [Bogra *cum* Pabna (Non-Muhammadan).]
Chaudhuri, the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali, Khan Bahadur. [Minister, Mymensingh East (Muhammadan).]
Cochran, Mr. A. (Bengal Chamber of Commerce.)
Cohen, Mr. D. J. [Calcutta South Central (Non-Muhammadan).]

D

Das, Babu Bhushmadev (Nominated Non-official—Depressed Classes).
Das, Mr. S. R. [Calcutta North-West (Non-Muhammadan).]
Das, Rai Bahadur Amar Nath (Nominated Official).
Das Gupta, Babu Nibaran Chandra. [Bakarganj North (Non-Muhammadan).]
De, Babu Fanindralal. [Hooghly *cum* Howrah Rural (Non-Muhammadan).]
Dey, Mr. G. G. (Nominated Official.)
Donald, Mr. J. (Nominated Official.)
Doss, Rai Bahadur Pyari Lal. [Dacca City (Non-Muhammadan).]
Dutt, Mr. Ajoy Chunder. [Bankura East (Non-Muhammadan).]
Dutt, Rai Bahadur Dr. Hardhan. [Calcutta North Central (Non-Muhammadan).]
Dutta, Babu Annada Charan. [Chittagong (Non-Muhammadan).]
Dutta, Babu Indu Bhushan. [Tippera (Non-Muhammadan).]

F

Faroqui, K. G. M. [Tippera (Muhammadan).]
Forrester, Mr. J. Campbell. [Presidency and Burdwan (European).]

G

Ghatak, Rai Sahib Nilmani. [Malda (Non-Muhammadan).]
Ghose, Mr. D. C. [24-Parganas Rural South (Non-Muhammadan).]
Ghose, Rai Bahadur Jogendra Chunder. (Calcutta University).
Gordon, Mr. A. D. (Indian Tea Association).
Gupta, Mr. N. B. (Nominated Official).

H

Haq, Maulvi A. K. Fazl-ul. [Khulna (Muhammadan).]
Haq, Shah Syed Emdadul. [Tippera (Muhammadan).]
Hopkyns, Mr. W. S. (Nominated Official.)
Hornell, Mr. W. W. (Nominated Official.)
Huq, Maulvi Ekramul. [Murshidabad (Muhammadan).]
Hussain, Maulvi Md. Madassur. [Burdwan Division North (Muhammadan).]

J

James, Mr. R. H. L. Langford. (Indian Jute Mills Association.)
Jana, Babu Sarat Chandra. [Midnapore South (Non-Muhammadan).]

K

Karim, Maulvi Abdul. [Faridpur North (Muhammadan).]
Karim, Maulvi Fazlal. [Bakarganj South (Muhammadan).]
Kerr, the Hon'ble Mr. J. H. (Member, Executive Council.)
Khan, Maulvi Hamid-ud-din. Rangpur East (Muhammadan).]
Khan, Maulvi Md. Rafique Uddin. [Mymensingh East (Muhammadan).]
Khan, Mr. Razaur Rahman. [Calcutta North (Muhhammadan).]
Khan, Babu Debendra Lal. [Midnapore North (Non-Muhammadan).]
Khan Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Md. Ershad Ali. [Rajshahi North (Muhammadan).]

L

Lang, Mr. J. (Nominated Official.)
Larmour, Mr. F. A. (Calcutta Trades Association.)
Law, Raja Reshee Case. (Bengal National Chamber of Commerce.)
Lees, Mr. D. H. (Nominated Official.)

M

Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan, the Hon'ble. (Member, Executive Council.)
Maitra, Dr. Jatindra Nath. [Faridpur North (Non-Muhammadan).]
Mahmud, Munshi. [Noakhali (Muhammadan).]
Marr, Mr. A. (Nominated Official.)
McKenzie, Mr. D. P. (Indian Jute Mills Association.)
Mitra, Rai Bahadur Mahendra Chandra. [Hooghly Municipal (Non-Muhammadan).]
Mitter, the Hon'ble Mr. Provash Chunder. (Minister, Presidency Landholders.)
Morgan, Mr. G. (Bengal Chamber of Commerce.)

Mukharji, Babu Satish Chandra [Hooghly *cum* Howrah Rural (Non-Muhammadan.)]

Mukherjee, Babu Nitya Dhon. [Howrah Municipalities (Non-Muhammadan.)]

Mukherji, Professor S. C. (Nominated Non-Official—The Indian Christian Community.)

Mukhopadhaya, Babu Sarat Chandra. [Midnapore South (Non-Muhammadan.)]

Mullick, Babu Nirode Behary. [Bakarganj South (Non-Muhammadan.)]

Mullick, Babu Surendra Nath. [Calcutta South (Non-Muhammadan)

N

Nakey, Mirza Muhammad Ali. [24-Parganas Municipal South (Muhammadan).]

Nasker, Babu Hem Chandra [24-Parganas Rural Central (Non-Muhammadan)]

O

O'Kinealy, Lt.-Col. Frederick. (Nominated Official.)

O'Malley, Mr. L. S. S. (Nominated Official)

P

Pahlowan, Maulvi Md Abdul Jubbar [Mymensingh West (Muhammadan).]

Pal, Rai Bahadur Radha Charan [Calcutta East (Non-Muhammadan)]

Payne, Mr C. E. (Nominated Official.)

Poddar, Babu Keshoram (Bengal Marwari Association.)

Pugh, Colonel A. J. [Presidency and Burdwan (European).]

R

Rae, Mr W R [Presidency and Burdwan (European).]

Raheem, Mr. Abdur. (Nominated Non-Official.)

Rahim, the Hon'ble Sir Ad-ur. (Member, Executive Council.)

Raikat, Mr. Prasanna Deb. [Jalpaiguri (Non-Muhammadan).]

Rauf, Maulvi Shah Abdur [Rangpur West (Muhammadan).]

Ray, Babu Bhabendra Chandra. [Jessore North (Non-Muhamm.)]

Ray, Babu Surendra Nath. [Deputy President, 24-Parganas Municipal South (Non-Muhammadan).]

Ray, Kumar Shib Shekhareswar. (Rajshahi Landholders.)

Ray, Rai Bahadur Upendra Lal. (Chittagong Landholders.)

Ray Chaudhuri, Babu Brojendra Kishor. (Dacca Landholders.)

Ray Chaudhuri, Mr Krishna Chandra. (Nominated Non-Official Labouring Classes.)

Ray Choudhury, Raja Manmatha Nath. [Mymensingh West (Non-Muhammadan).]
Rhodes, Mr. C. W. (Bengal Chamber of Commerce.)
Roy, Babu Jogendra Krishna. [Faridpur South (Non-Muhammadan).]
Roy, Babu Jogendra Nath. [Dacca Rural (Non-Muhammadan).]
Roy, Babu Nalini Nath. [Jessore South (Non-Muhammadan).]
Roy, Maharaja Bahadur Kshaunish Chandra. [Nadia (Non-Muhammadan).]
Roy, Mr. J. E. (Bengal Chamber of Commerce.)
Roy, Mr. Tarit Bhusan. (Bengal Mahajan Sabha.)
Roy, Rai Bahadur Lalit Mohan Singh. (Burdwan Landholders.)
Roy, Raja Manilall Singh. [Burdwan (Non-Muhammadan).]
Roy Chaudhuri, Babu Sarada Nath. [Khulna (Non-Muhammadan).]

S

Salam, Khan Bahadur Abdus. [Jessore North (Muhammadan).]
Sarkar, Babu Jogesh Chandra. [Rangpur (Non-Muhammadan).]
Sarkar, Babu Rishindra Nath. [Bankura West (Non-Muhammadan).]
Sinha, Babu Surendra Narayan. [Murshidabad (Non-Muhammadan).]
Stark, Mr. H. A. (Anglo-Indian.)
Suhrawardy, Dr. A. [Dacca West Rural (Muhammadan).]
Suhrawardy, Dr. Hassan. [Hooghly *cum* Howrah Municipal (Muhammadan).]
Suhrawardy, Mr. H. S. [Burdwan Division South (Muhammadan).]
Swan, Mr. J. A. L. (Nominated Official.)

T

Travers, Mr. W. L. [Rajshahi (European).]

W

Watson-Smyth, Mr. R. M. (Bengal Chamber of Commerce.)
Wheeler, the Hon'ble Sir Henry. (Member, Executive Council.)
Wordsworth, Mr. W. C. (Nominated Official.)

THE BENGAL LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL PROCEEDINGS.

(Official Report of the Third Session.)

VOLUME III—No. 1.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Council assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act.

THE Council met in the Council Chamber in the Town Hall, Calcutta, on Monday the 4th July, 1921, at 3 P.M.

Present:

The Hon'ble the President, the Hon'ble the four Members of the Executive Council, two Hon'ble Ministers (the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea was absent owing to illness), and 102 nominated and elected members.

Oaths.

The following members made an oath or affirmation of their allegiance to the Crown:

Mr. W. CURRIE.

Mr. S. M. ALEY.

Mr. BIJOY PROSAD SINGH ROY.

Panel of four Chairmen.

The PRESIDENT (the Hon'ble Nawab Sir Syed Shams-ul-Huda): Gentlemen, in accordance with the provisions of Rule 3 of the Bengal Legislative Council Rules, 1920, I have nominated the following members of Council to form a panel of four Chairmen, viz.:—

Sir Asutosh Chaudhuri,

Mr. R. M. Watson-Smyth,

Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur, and

Maulvi A. K. Fazl-ul Haq.

Unless otherwise arranged, the senior member among them present in the above order will preside over the deliberations of this Council in my absence and in the absence of the Deputy President.

Starred Questions

(to which oral answers were given).

Back-pay of sub-deputy and deputy collectors.

*1. **Rai LALIT MOHAN SINGH ROY Bahadur:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state whether the Government are considering the desirability of granting back-pay to sub-deputy collectors from the 1st of December, 1919, as given to the deputy collectors.

(*b*) If not, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the reason for this differential treatment to the members of the junior but allied service?

MEMBER in charge of APPOINTMENT DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (*a*) The answer is in the negative.

(*b*) It was inevitable that the case of the Subordinate Civil Service should be dealt with subsequent to that of the Bengal Civil Service. The members of the former were never encouraged to hope for an increase, till the case of the latter had been disposed of, and Government do not consider that there is adequate justification for incurring the expenditure involved in the giving of retrospective effect in the manner suggested.

Medical College Hospital and an indigent female phthisis patient.

*11. **Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether it is a fact that an indigent female patient, who was admitted into the Medical College Hospital some time in March last through the efforts of Dr. D. Samanta, M.B., and who was suffering from phthisis and subsequently contracted chicken-pox at the hospital, was summarily discharged from the said hospital while she was ill, in spite of the entreaties of Dr. D. Samanta to keep her in?

(*b*) If the answer be in the affirmative, what steps are being taken by the Government in order to remedy such an undesirable state of things?

(*c*) Further, have the Government taken any notice of the conduct of the nurse and the hospital superintendent in connection with this matter?

SECRETARY, DEPARTMENT of LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT (Mr. L. S. S. O'Malley): (*a*) Inquiry has been made and the facts of the case are reported to be as follows: A maid-servant was admitted to the tuberculosis ward of the Medical College Hospital at the instance of Dr. Samanta and subsequently developed chicken-pox. As infectious cases cannot be kept in the hospital owing to risk of spreading disease Dr. Samanta was informed and asked to remove her. At his suggestion

the authorities of the Campbell Medical Hospital were requested to admit the patient. There being no accommodation available at the time they were unable to do so. Eventually she was taken to the house of Dr Samanta at her own earnest request; she stated that she was his maid-servant and an inmate of his house. She was subsequently admitted to the Campbell Medical Hospital when accommodation was available.

(*b*) Every effort is made to prevent discomfort and suffering to the sick, but difficulty necessarily arise owing to the insufficient accommodation in Calcutta for cases of infectious diseases.

(*c*) No. It was the duty of the Superintendent to prevent the risk of infection among the inmates of the hospital, and the nurse acted under orders.

Lack of Judge at Alipore (24-Parganas) to deal with land acquisition cases.

***111. Babu FANINDRALAL DE:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department aware that for more than six months there is no Judge at Alipore, in the district of the 24 Parganas, vested with powers under the Land Acquisition Act, and the land acquisition cases are not being disposed of, to the great inconvenience of the people?

(*b*) What steps do the Government intend to take in the matter?

(*c*) How many land acquisition references have been made within the last three years in the civil courts of the 24-Parganas and what is the number of such cases disposed of?

(*d*) How many applications for withdrawal of money deposited under section 31 of the Land Acquisition Act of 1894 have been filed before the Land Acquisition Judge of the said district, within one year from date, and how many of these have been disposed of?

MEMBER in charge of JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-Rahim): (*a*) The information before Government is that no special Land Acquisition Judge has sat at Alipore since 1st March, 1921, when the Judge went on leave, and that the current work is being managed in his absence by the District Judge himself.

(*b*) Mr. Chotzner has been appointed as the Land Acquisition Judge.

(*c*) and (*d*) Statements are laid on the table.

Statement referred to in the reply to starred question No. 111 (c) and (d).

Years.	Institutions.	Disposal
(*c*)—		
1918	189	129
1919	328	209
1920	307	228
(*d*)—		
Applications filed in 1920-21		490
Disposed of		490

Starred Questions

(to which oral answers were given).

Back-pay of sub-deputy and deputy collectors.

*1. **Rai LALIT MOHAN SINGH ROY Bahadur:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state whether the Government are considering the desirability of granting back-pay to sub-deputy collectors from the 1st of December, 1919, as given to the deputy collectors.

(*b*) If not, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the reason for this differential treatment to the members of the junior but allied service?

MEMBER in charge of APPOINTMENT DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (*a*) The answer is in the negative.

(*b*) It was inevitable that the case of the Subordinate Civil Service should be dealt with subsequent to that of the Bengal Civil Service. The members of the former were never encouraged to hope for an increase, till the case of the latter had been disposed of; and Government do not consider that there is adequate justification for incurring the expenditure involved in the giving of retrospective effect in the manner suggested.

Medical College Hospital and an indigent female phthisis patient.

*11. **Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether it is a fact that an indigent female patient, who was admitted into the Medical College Hospital some time in March last through the efforts of Dr. D. Samanta, M.B., and who was suffering from phthisis and subsequently contracted chicken-pox at the hospital, was summarily discharged from the said hospital while she was ill, in spite of the entreaties of Dr. D. Samanta to keep her in?

(*b*) If the answer be in the affirmative, what steps are being taken by the Government in order to remedy such an undesirable state of things?

(*c*) Further, have the Government taken any notice of the conduct of the nurse and the hospital superintendent in connection with this matter?

SECRETARY, DEPARTMENT of LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT (Mr. L. S. S. O'Malley): (*a*) Inquiry has been made and the facts of the case are reported to be as follows: A maid-servant was admitted to the tuberculosis ward of the Medical College Hospital at the instance of Dr. Samanta and subsequently developed chicken-pox. As infectious cases cannot be kept in the hospital owing to risk of spreading disease Dr. Samanta was informed and asked to remove her. At his suggestion

the authorities of the Campbell Medical Hospital were requested to admit the patient. There being no accommodation available at the time they were unable to do so. Eventually she was taken to the house of Dr Samanta at her own earnest request; she stated that she was his maid-servant and an inmate of his house She was subsequently admitted to the Campbell Medical Hospital when accommodation was available.

(*b*) Every effort is made to prevent discomfort and suffering to the sick, but difficulty necessarily arise owing to the insufficient accommodation in Calcutta for cases of infectious diseases.

(*c*) No. It was the duty of the Superintendent to prevent the risk of infection among the inmates of the hospital, and the nurse acted underorders.

Lack of Judge at Alipore (24-Parganas) to deal with land acquisition cases.

*111. **Babu FANINDRALAL DE:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department aware that for more than six months there is no Judge at Alipore, in the district of the 24-Parganas, vested with powers under the Land Acquisition Act, and the land acquisition cases are not being disposed of, to the great inconvenience of the people?

(*b*) What steps do the Government intend to take in the matter?

(*c*) How many land acquisition references have been made within the last three years in the civil courts of the 24-Parganas and what is the number of such cases disposed of?

(*d*) How many applications for withdrawal of money deposited under section 31 of the Land Acquisition Act of 1894 have been filed before the Land Acquisition Judge of the said district, within one year from date, and how many of these have been disposed of?

MEMBER in charge of JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-Rahim): (*a*) The information before Government is that no special Land Acquisition Judge has sat at Alipore since 1st March, 1921, when the Judge went on leave, and that the current work is being managed in his absence by the District Judge himself.

(*b*) Mr. Chotzner has been appointed as the Land Acquisition Judge.

(*c*) and (*d*) Statements are laid on the table.

Statement referred to in the reply to starred question No. III (c) and (d).

Years.	Institutions.	Disposal
(*c*)—		
1918	169	129
1919	328	209
1920	307	228
(*d*)—		
Applications filed in 1920-21	...	490
Disposed of	...	490

Accuracy in the rates of commercial products as published in the "Calcutta Gazette."

*IV. **Rai LALIT MOHAN SINGH ROY Bahadur:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state whether the rates of commercial products as collected and published in the *Calcutta Gazette* are accurate?

(*b*) If not, is the Hon'ble the Minister considering the desirability of taking steps to see that they are made as accurate as possible?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of AGRICULTURE and INDUSTRIES (the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur): (*a*) and (*b*) It is presumed that the question refers to the prices of certain commodities, such as coal, iron, etc., as published in the fortnightly return of wholesale prices current of food-grains, etc., in the *Calcutta Gazette*. Government are aware of defects in the statistics of prices of such commodities and the question of improving the method of preparation of the statistics is now under consideration.

Reduction of Executive Councillors.

* V. **Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY:** Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state what action the Government have taken to reduce the number of Members of the Executive Council from 4 to 2 in accordance with the resolution of this Council?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: A copy of the debate on the resolution for the reduction of the number of Members of the Executive Council has been forwarded to the Government of India. For the reason given in the course of the debate this Government were unable to endorse the recommendation.

Report of the judicial inquiry into the shooting incident at Kalighat.

* VI. **Babu FANINDRALAL DE:** Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to state whether the judicial inquiry regarding the shooting incident at Kalighat on the 18th February last, is over and, if so, when the report is expected to be published?

MEMBER in charge of POLICE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): The report of the Additional District Magistrate and the Government resolution on the subject were published in the *Calcutta Gazette* of the 22nd June.

Stagnation of Atrai river.

***VII. Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI:** Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation be pleased to state whether the Government are considering the desirability of instituting an inquiry to ascertain

(i) the state of the river Atrai from the place of its conjunction with the river Jamuna to a place upwards up to the 20th mile, and

(ii) the evil effect of the stagnation of the river upon the villages on both sides of the river up to three miles?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of IRRIGATION (the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan): (i) There is no proposal at present to make such an inquiry.

(ii) The attention of the Local Self-Government Department will be drawn to this, and it must be left to it to arrive at a decision as to whether an inquiry of the kind suggested is needed.

Fasting by prisoners in "Ramzan."

***VIII., Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur:** (a) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Jails) be pleased to state why the Muhammadan prisoners are not allowed to observe their fasting during the holy month of *Ramzan*?

(b) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to say whether the Government are considering the desirability of taking necessary steps to remove all restrictions on the free performance of this religious duty?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of REVENUE JAILS (the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-Rahim): (a) and (b) The member is referred to the answer given to unstarred question No. 47 by Mr. Razaur Rahman Khan.

Agricultural school at Rangpur.

***IX. Babu JOGESH CHANDRA SARKAR:** Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state whether there is any proposal to establish an agricultural school at Rangpur, the agricultural head quarters of the Rajshahi Division, in the near future?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: Government contemplate the establishment of elementary agricultural schools at suitable centres in every division of Bengal and a scheme is being prepared by the Director of Agriculture, but the location of these schools has not yet been considered.

Report of the Kalighat shooting case and leave granted to Deputy Commissioner of Police.

***X. Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to state whether the report of the Additional District Magistrate, 24-Parganas, with reference to the Kalighat Tramway shooting case has been received by Government?

(*b*) If so, when?

(*c*) What action has been taken by Government on the report?

(*d*) Is it a fact that the Deputy Commissioner of Police who was present at the occurrence has been granted leave out of India?

(*e*) Was the leave granted to him on medical grounds or was it ordinary leave?

(*f*) When was the leave application received by Government?

(*g*) If the leave has been granted on medical grounds, was the Deputy Commissioner examined by the Medical Board?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*), (*b*) and (*c*) The report of the Additional District Magistrate and the Government resolution thereon were published in the *Calcutta Gazette* of the 22nd June.

(*d*) Yes. This has already been stated in the answer to question No. 106 at the Council meeting of the 1st April.

(*e*) Leave was granted in the ordinary course and not on medical grounds.

(*f*) As already stated, arrangements to grant leave to Mr. Hannah on relief by Mr. Kidd, who was due to return from leave on the 1st March, were made in January. Mr. Hannah submitted his formal application for leave to the Commissioner of Police on the 20th February. This was received by Government through the Inspector-General of Police and the Accountant-General on the 2nd March.

(*g*) The question does not arise.

Allegations against kanungoes.

***XI. Maulvi A. H. M. WAZIR ALI:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to state how many kanungoes are employed in each division—

(*i*) in civil work;

(*ii*) in settlement work;

(*iii*) in permanent establishment; and

(*iv*) in temporary establishment?

(*b*) How many are employed, and for what period—

(*i*) in their own native districts; and

(*ii*) in their own division?

(c) Is there any truth in the allegation that kanungoes posted in their own district or division are taking advantage of their position in land transactions (in buying and selling) and other matters?

(d) If so, have the Government the names of the kanungoes?

(e) What steps are the Government going to take against them?

(f) If Government have no information, are they considering the desirability of instituting an inquiry into the matter?

MEMBER in charge of the DEPARTMENT of REVENUE (LAND REVENUE) (the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan): (a) and (b) It is impossible to obtain the information in time.

(c), (d), (e) and (f) No such allegation has been brought to the notice of Government. Government, however, will bring the question to the notice of Commissioners of Divisions and of the Director of Land Records.

Meagre report of Legislative Council proceedings in newspapers.

***XII. Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI:** (a) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Legislative Department aware that reports of the proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Council published in the newspapers are very meagre and incomplete?

(b) If so, are the Government considering the advisability of taking steps to see that fuller reports are made by the press representatives?

MEMBER in charge of LEGISLATIVE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (a) and (b) Government are not in a position to compel newspapers to give complete or fuller reports of the proceedings of the Council. The matter is entirely in the hands of the newspapers themselves.

The Legislative Department tries to give facilities to newspaper reporters by furnishing them with copies of Council documents, e.g., lists of Business, Questions and Answers, Bills, etc., and have recently provided a certain proportion of the reporters with seats in the body of the Council Chamber so that they may be in a position to follow the debates better. Government are anxious to help the press in this matter to the best of their ability, but until a proper Council Chamber is built there will probably always be some difficulties.

Railway communication with Rampur Boalia.

***XIII. Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI:** (a) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works aware that much inconvenience is being felt by the Rajshahi public on account of the want of easy communication with the railway from Rampur Boalia to any convenient station in the Eastern Bengal Railway line at Surdah, Charghat, Alamur, etc.?

(b) If so, are the Government considering the desirability of taking steps to see that the daily steamer service are established between Paksey and Lalgola, as was the case before the construction of the Hardinge Bridge between Damukdia and Lalgola?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of PUBLIC WORKS (the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur): (a) Government have no information in this matter.

(b) The member is referred to the answer given to his unstarred question on the same subject, No. 5, at a meeting of the Legislative Council held on the 1st July, 1920.

Report of the committee on the salaries of teachers of subordinate educational service.

*XIV. **Rai LALIT MOHAN SINGH ROY Bahadur:** Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state when the report of the committee appointed to consider the salaries of teachers of subordinate educational service will be out?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of EDUCATION (the Hon'ble Mr. P. C. Mitter): The report * is laid on the library table. The matter is still under consideration, but Government hope to issue orders shortly.

Report of Wordsworth Committee.

*XV. **Babu JOGESH CHANDRA SARKAR:** Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state when the report of the Wordsworth Committee will be laid on the table and when and how far the recommendations of the committee will be given effect to?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: The member is referred to the answer given at this meeting to Rai Lalit Mohan Singh Roy Bahadur in reply to starred question No. XIV.

Confirmation of Educational officers conditional on their passing examination in vernacular.

*XVI. **Mr. H. A. STARK:** Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state

(a) whether the rule has been cancelled which made the confirmation of officers of the Indian Educational Service conditional on their having first passed an examination in one of the vernaculars of the province;

* Not printed in these proceedings.

(iii) which officers of the Indian Educational Service have been confirmed in that service although they have not passed an examination in a vernacular, and the reasons in the case of each for his confirmation without his having satisfied a condition to which he had contracted; and

(iv) which officers of the Indian Educational Service have neither passed an examination in a vernacular nor been confirmed, and whether it is intended to oblige them to pass such examination before they are confirmed?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (a) There is no rule making the confirmation of Indian Educational Service officers conditional on their passing a vernacular examination, but according to the terms of their agreement they are liable to pass a vernacular test within two years of their period of probation. On their failure to pass such examination Government may dispense with their services. It has not hitherto been the policy of Government to inflict the penalty.

(b) Under the terms of their contract no formal order for the confirmation of officers are required to be issued, but unless their services are terminated on the expiration of the probationary term of two years, they continue in the service of Government upon the terms and conditions prescribed in their agreements. The officers named in the annexed statement have thus continued without passing the examination. The late Eastern Bengal and Assam Government made the examination optional for the Principals and Professors of colleges other than training colleges. This explains why a number of officers have received exemption.

(c) A statement is laid on the table. It was decided by Government in 1919 that the rules in connection with the vernacular examination should be strictly enforced in the case of certain officers in whose cases no ground for exemption existed, and Government will take such action as may be necessary and is within their power in the case of officers who fail to pass the test within a time which has been prescribed with special reference to the circumstances of each individual case. Except in the case of officers exempted by the Eastern Bengal and Assam Government under the rules in force in that province, exemption has been very sparingly granted and this policy will be continued in future.

Statement referred to in the reply to starred question No. XVI (c) and (iv) showing the names of the I. E. S. Officers who have not passed the Higher Standard Examination in Bengali.

Names.	Whether exempted or [illegible]	[illegible]
1. Mr. B. Heaton	Exempted	He was not originally recruited for the I. E. S., hence he was under no obligation to pass the test.

	Name of officer	Whether granted exemption or under orders to pass	Grounds of exemption.
2.	Mr. F. C. Turner ...	Exempted	... In consideration of his age and the onerous nature of his duties as Principal, Dacca College.
3.	Mr T. H Richardson ...	Do.	... He was not originally recruited for the I. E. S. and the colloquial examination in Hindustani, which he passed while serving under the Public Works Department, was considered sufficient.
4.	Mr J R Barrow ...	Do.	...In terms of the "Rules" for the examination of officers of Education Department in Eastern Bengal and Assam Principals and Professors of Colleges other than Training Colleges were not obliged to pass the examination
5.	Dr E P Harrison ...	*Under orders to pass*	
6.	Mr R B. Rambotham ...	Exempted	.. The same as in the case of Mr Barrow
7.	Mr T. O. D Dunn ...	*Under orders to pass*	
8.	Mr Evan E Bax ...		
9.	Mr. Egerton Smith ...	Exempted	... The same as in the case of Mr Barrow
10.	Mr C. J. Henderson ...		
11.	Mr A Macdonald ...		
12.	Mr. G H Langley ...	*Under orders to pass*	
13.	Mr A Mercer ...		
14.	Mr. W Saunders ...	...	Has resigned the I. E. S owing to the refusal of Government to exempt him from his obligation to pass the vernacular test.
15.	Miss M. V Irons ...	*Under orders to pass.*	
16.	Miss G M. Wright ...		

Escape of prisoners from Rajshahi Jail.

*XVII. **Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY:** In connection with the escape of prisoners from the Rajshahi Jail and the unfortunate incidents at Mohanganj on the night of the 24th March, 1921, will the

Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to state the amounts of compensation paid to -

(i) the family of the wounded man who succumbed to his injuries;

(ii) other wounded persons,

(iii) the people who were arrested on suspicion, kept confined during the night and subsequently discharged, and

(iv) the villagers whose houses were entered into and searched during the night?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (c) and (e) A sum of Rs 1,700 has been sanctioned for distribution as compensation as follows

	Rs
Widow of Taki (deceased)	1,000
Latar (gun shot wounds)	250
Sital (gun shot wound through jaw	300
Fugal (slight injuries	50
Chamatu (slight injuries	50
Golu (slight injuries)	50
Total	1,700

(a), (b) and (d) Nil

Uthandi settlement of land.

***XVIII. Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ:** (a) Has the attention of the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue been drawn to the many drawbacks in the system of *uthandi* settlement of land?

(b) Are the Government considering the desirability of doing away with the system at an early date or at most by stages?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (a) The settlement operations in Nadia and Jessore districts have shown that there are difficult problems connected with *uthandi* tenancies.

(b) Government are considering these problems.

Members of Educational Service holding specific appointments in Training Colleges for teachers and their "locum tenens."

***XIX. Mr. H. A. STARK:** Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state -

(a) the names of the members of the Indian Educational Service who were originally appointed to that service to hold specific appointments in training colleges for teachers in Bengal;

(*ii*) what positions they have held since their arrival, with dates;

(*iii*) whether, and, if so, when, it is proposed that they shall revert to the special appointments for which they were recruited in training colleges; and

(*iv*) whether in the event of any of their not reverting to training college work, it is proposed to confirm their *locum tenens* in the Indian Educational Service, provided the latter have rendered satisfactory service?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*i*) and (*ii*) A statement is laid on the table.

(*iii*) and (*iv*) Government are not at present in a position to make a definite pronouncement.

Statement referred to in the reply to starred question No. XLV (i) and (ii).

	Name of officer	Appointment held by him	Date
1	Mr. Evan E. Bose ...	(1) Principal Dacca Training College	From 7th November 1909.
		(2) *On special duty* in connection with the development of the Patna Training College ...	From 27th August 1912
		(3) Principal, Dacca Training College	From 9th September 1912
		(4) *On special duty* in the General Department, Government of Bengal, also of the Director of Public Instruction and Calcutta University ...	From 15th October 1916
		(5) Assistant Director of Public Instruction, Bengal (officiating)	From 17th September 1917
		(6) Assistant Director of Public Instruction for Muhammadan Education, Bengal, in addition to Assistant Director of Public Instruction (officiating) ...	From 4th October 1917
		(7) Inspector of Schools, Dacca Division (officiating)	From 11th April 1918.
		(8) Military service	From 1st August 1918
		(9) Principal David Hare Training College (officiating) ...	From 29th January 1919
		(10) Inspector of Schools, Rajshahi Division (substantive) ...	From 16th July 1920.

Name of officer	Position held by him	Date
I.—Mr. Evan E. Biss ...	(11) On deputation in connection with the development of primary education	From 16th July 1920
II.—Mr. J. A. Taylor ...	(1) Vice-Principal, Dacca Training College	From 7th November 1909
	(2) Assistant Director of Public Instruction for Muhammadan Education, Bengal ...	From 21st August 1913.
	(3) Military service	From 4th October 1917
	(4) Assistant Director of Public Instruction for Muhammadan Education, Bengal ...	From 10th February 1919
III.—Mr. W. E. Griffith ...	(1) Was at first recruited outside the Indian Educational Service and was appointed as the Principal, David Hare Training College on an officiating basis .	From 1st July 1908
	(2) Principal, David Hare Training College (substantive) and admitted to the Indian Educational Service	From 20th February 1911
	(3) Inspector of Schools, Burdwan Division (officiating) .	From 30th February 1916
	(4) Inspector of Schools, Dacca Division (officiating) ..	From 30th October 1918
—Mr. M. P. Wes[illegible] .	(1) Professor, David Hare Training College ...	From 30th November 1912
	(2) Vice-Principal, Dacca Training College	From 8th September 1913
	(3) Inspector of Schools, [illegible] Division (officiating)	From [illegible] 1915
	(4) Inspector of Schools, [illegible] Division (officiating)	From 30th March 1916
	(5) Inspector of Schools, [illegible] Division (officiating)	From 1st November 1916
	(6) On special [illegible] of primary education, Bengal .	From 1st November 1917
	(7) Inspector of Schools, Chittagong Division (officiating) ..	From 24th April 1918
	(8) Military service	From 24th August 1918
	(9) Inspector of Schools, Chittagong Division (officiating) ..	From 5th March 1919

Name of officer	Position held by him.	Date.
IV.—Mr. M. P. West	... (10) Inspector of Schools, Presidency Division	From 14th June 1919
	(11) Principal, Dacca Training College	From 13th December 1920.
V.—Mr A Mercer	... (1) Professor, David Hare Training College	From 29th October 1914.
	(2) Inspector of European Schools, Bengal (officiating) ...	From 28th June 1915
	(3) Principal, David Hare Training College (officiating), in addition to Inspector of European Schools (officiating) ...	From 12th November 1915
	(4) Inspector of European Schools, Bengal (officiating) ...	From 5th December 1916

Percentage of Anglo-Indians on the Bengal Civil Service.

***XX. Mr. H. BARTON:** Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state—

(*i*) whether it is a fact that the rejection of the claim of Mr Clifford Noronha, an Anglo-Indian, for appointment to the Bengal Civil Service, was based on the ground that the percentage of such appointments as between Muhammadans and Hindus had to be maintained;

(*ii*) whether the percentage of such appointments is maintained with due regard to the claims of Anglo-Indians,

(*iii*) what is the percentage, respectively, of Muhammadans, Hindus and Anglo-Indians, now in the said service; and

(*iv*) when was an Anglo-Indian last appointed to the service?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*i*) No.

(*ii*) In making such appointments the claims of qualified Anglo-Indians are duly considered.

(*iii*) Europeans 1·2 per cent., Muhammadans, 22·5 per cent.; Hindus and Indian Christians, 74·1 per cent.; Anglo-Indians, 2·2 per cent.

(*iv*) In 1913.

Railway line between Ishurdi and Nachoul.

***XXI. Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI:** Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works be pleased to inquire and ascertain when the construction of the railway line between Ishurdi and Nachoul through Rampur Boalia is likely to be taken up?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: An inquiry has already been made as to when the construction of the projected line is likely to be taken up

Metalled road between Rampur Boalia and Codagari.

***XXII. Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI:** Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to say whether the Government are considering the feasibility of metalling the road between Rampur Boalia and Godagari through the Rajshahi District Board?

Mr. L. S. S. O'MALLEY: The answer is in the negative. The matter is one for the District Board

Pay and prospects of Sub-Deputy Collectors.

***XXIII. Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur:** (a) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state whether they have arrived at any final decision regarding the revision of pay and prospects of Sub-Deputy Collectors?

(b) What consideration has been paid to their representations?

(c) What is the revised scale of their pay?

(d) When will it be given effect to?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (a), (b), (c) and (d). The decisions arrived at by Government regarding the pay of the Subordinate Civil Service will be made public at an early date

Muhammadan Subdivisional Officer in Dacca district.

*** XXIV. Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur:** (a) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state why no Muhammadan Subdivisional Officer has been appointed to the district of Dacca?

(b) Is it a fact that there is a Government order that one of the two Subdivisional Officers at Dacca Sadar should be a Muhammadan?

(c) If the answer to clause (b) be in the affirmative, when will this order be given effect to?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (a) Postings of officers are made in accordance with the needs of the public service from the officers at the time available. It is a matter of accident and not of policy that no Subdivisional Officer now in the Dacca district is a Muhammadan.

(b) and (c) No, but the point will be borne in mind

Concession in railway fares to Assam tea garden coolies.

***XXV. Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA:** Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works be pleased to state whether it is a fact that a concession rate is allowed by the Railway authorities to the coolies proceeding to Assam for work in tea gardens, whereas no such concession is ordinarily allowed to them while returning from the same place?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: The matter is one which is not within the cognizance of the local Government. The member should address himself to the Railway Board.

K. D. and Skrine canals at Rangpur.

***XXVI. Babu JOGESH CHANDRA SARKAR:** Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether provision will be made in the Government budget next year for the improvement of the K. D. and Skrine canals at Rangpur?

Mr. L. S. S. O'MALLEY: The member is referred to paragraph 3 of His Excellency the Governor's reply to the address presented to him at Rangpur by the District Board and Municipality of Rangpur on 7th February, 1921. As there stated the canal scheme cannot be taken up till the project for the reconstruction of the Ghoghat bridge, which is now in progress, has been completed and there has been time to test its results. No provision can therefore be made in the next year's budget for this scheme.

Removal of a transported convict.

***XXVII. Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department be pleased to state whether it is a fact that one Gopendra Lal Ray, a convict in the Pragpur dacoity case, and transported to the Andamans, has been brought back to India, and at first was detained in the Coimbatore Jail and subsequently transferred to the Alipore Jail?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the reasons for his removal?

(*c*) Is he likely to be released under the clemency order?

(*d*) Is it a fact that his conduct during the period of his incarceration was uniformly good?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) The reply is in the affirmative.

(b) The Government of Bengal have no information as to the reasons for the transfer of this prisoner to the Coimbatore Jail. He was subsequently transferred to the Alipore Central Jail on the recommendation of this Government.

(c) The question of his release was considered by the Government of Bengal, but it was not found desirable to grant him this concession.

(d) There are no punishments recorded on his jail ticket, and in the Alipore Central Jail he has been well-behaved.

Sheds for passengers in certain railway stations.

***XXVIII. Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI:** (a) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works aware that much inconvenience is being felt by the passengers especially during the rainy season for want of a shed on the western side of the railway stations Natore, Ishurdi and Pondah?

(b) If so, are the Government considering the desirability of moving the Railway authorities with a view to the removal of the grievance?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (a) and (b) Government are not aware of any such inconvenience, but they will inquire into the matter and if necessary, invite the attention of the Railway authorities to it with a view to removing the grievance, if any.

Officers of the Intelligence Branch.

***XXIX. Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY:** (a) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to state who is now the Deputy Inspector-General of Police in charge of the Intelligence Branch?

(b) Does he hold any other appointment, permanently or temporarily?

(c) Is any other officer holding an appointment in the Intelligence Branch or other department of the Police reserved for officers of the superior police service held jointly? If so, who are these officers?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (a) Mr. J. A. M. J. Goldie.

(b) Yes, he holds the permanent appointment of a Deputy Commissioner in the Calcutta Police.

(c) Mr. R. E. A. Ray, Additional Superintendent of Police, Dacca, holds one of the appointments of Additional Superintendent of Police, Mymensingh, in addition to his own duties.

Post of the Deputy Registrar of Co-operative Societies.

***XXX. Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur:** (*a*) Is Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture Industries aware that there is a strong feeling among the members the Bengal Civil Service, now working in the Co-operative Departme owing to the fact that the post of the Deputy Registrar of Co-operat Societies, Bengal, has been given to a junior member of the Ind Civil Service?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state what qu fication this officer has in the work of the Department?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state when and w Mr M. Thorp's deputation to France for co-operative training v decided upon?

(*d*) Was it settled before he applied for leave to proceed home, was it after a member of the Bengal Civil Service had been appoin to succeed him?

(*e*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state what pay allowance, ordinary or special, Mr M Thorp will be drawing dur his deputation to Europe?

(*f*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to indicate the line policy the Government propose to adopt in filling up the superior appoi ments in the Co-operative Department?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHUI Khan Bahadur: (*a*) No The post of Deputy Registrar of Co-ope tive Societies is, under the orders of the Secretary of State, reserv for members of the Indian Civil Service and included in the cadre that service It is, however, interchangeable with executive list posts.

(*b*) No special qualifications are required for such an appointme Officers who show a special aptitude for co-operative work and take interest in the movement are generally selected Mr C G B Steve was selected to act as Deputy Registrar on the recommendation of t officiating Registrar The Registrar reports that Mr. Stevens has alrea shown a very marked aptitude for the work of the post.

(*c*) and (*d*) When Mr M Thorp joined the Co-operative Depa ment it was understood that after acting as Registrar he would go leave and devote a portion of his leave to the study of co-operative ins tutions in Europe He renewed this proposal when he formally appli for leave last year. Mr Thorp will rejoin the Co-operative Depa ment on the expiry of his leave It was, therefore, decided, in t interests of the Department, that he should take the opportunity afford by his leave to acquaint himself with the working of co-operative ins tutions in Europe.

(c) During the period of his study leave Mr. Thorp will get travelling allowance limited to actual fare *plus* a subsistence allowance of 30s. a day as sanctioned by the Secretary of State in addition to the leave allowances admissible under the Civil Service Regulations.

(*f*) Subject to the orders of the Secretary of State under which the appointments of Registrar and Deputy Registrar are reserved for members of the Indian Civil Service and those of Assistant Registrars are included in the cadre of the Bengal Civil Service (Executive Branch), the policy of Government is to select the officers best fitted for these appointments.

Breach in the Singimara khal embankment in Howrah.

***XXXI. Babu FANINDRALAL DE:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation aware that the breach in the embankment of the Singamara *khal* between Sankrail and Manikpur, in the district of Howrah, has been causing damages to the crops of about twenty villages and great inconvenience to thousands of passers-by?

(*b*) What action, if any, are the Government taking in the matter?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) The Government are aware that the breach in the murdar embankment across Singamara *khal* in the district of Howrah causes occasional flooding, but there is no loss of crops in the area benefited by the Baranda drainage scheme, nor is there any great hardship to passers-by as a result of the flooding.

(*b*) The Government do not propose taking any action which would involve the parties concerned.

Cesses or "abwabs" and "salami" realised by Court of Wards.

***XXXII. Mr. S. M. BOSE:** (*a*) With reference to my question No. 153 of the 1st April last, will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to state whether any, and if so what steps have been taken in connection with the realisation of cesses or *abwabs* by the Court of Wards, referred to in paragraph (*a*) of the said question?

(*b*) Is it the practice in other estates under the management of the Court of Wards to levy such cesses or *abwabs*?

(*c*) Has a general inquiry on the subject been held or is it being held, by the Board of Revenue, as mentioned in the Hon'ble Member's reply to paragraph (*d*) of the above question?

(*d*) Has the Hon'ble the Member issued orders to expedite the above inquiry?

(e) Is it the practice in other estates under the management of the Court of Wards to levy a *salami* from the tenants for permission to dig tanks?

(f) Have the Government come to any decision regarding the advisability of continuing the levy of such *salami*?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN : (a), (b), (c), (d), (e) and (f) The Board has directed a general inquiry to be made in all districts as to how far the realisation of illegal cesses or *abwabs* contemplated in these questions is prevalent in wards' as well as in private estates. The inquiry will necessarily take some time. On its completion necessary orders will be passed by Government.

Messrs. Biss and Dunn on special duty in the Education Department.

***XXXIII. Mr. H. A. STARK:** In continuation of the questions to which answers were given at the meeting of the Legislative Council held on the 1st April, 1921, will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state—

(i) whether it is a fact that Mr. Biss is unacquainted with any vernacular, and that he has passed no examination in Bengali, Hindi, or Urdu,

(ii) when it is likely that Mr. Biss's report on, and scheme of, primary education will be available for examination,

(iii) when will Mr. Biss's deputation in connection with the improvement of primary education in Bengal terminate, and

(iv) what was the purpose for which Mr. T. O. D. Dunn was placed on "special duty" in the office of the Director of Public Instruction from the 1st April to the 1st October, 1921?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (i) Mr. Biss is believed to have sufficient knowledge of Bengali for the purposes of his special work in connection with the expansion and improvement of primary education. The fact that Mr. Biss's work on special duty has been appreciated in many quarters justifies this belief. Mr. Biss has passed no examination in Bengali, Hindi or Urdu.

(ii) The report has been printed and is being circulated for public criticism.

(iii) Mr. Biss's deputation will cease on the 28th February, 1922.

(iv) Mr. T. O. D. Dunn, who had been Assistant Director of Public Instruction in Eastern Bengal and Assam and was conversant with the educational questions which affected the three Eastern Bengal Divisions, was placed, on the modification of the partition, on special duty, in connection with educational work at Dacca, for a period of six months.

with effect from the 1st April, 1912, and was put in charge of the Director of Public Instruction's office staff at Dacca.

Improvement of date-sugar.

*XXXIV. **Rai LALIT MOHAN SINGH ROY Bahadur:** Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state whether any decision has been arrived at as to whether the production of date-sugar in Bengal can be improved and organised on a more efficient basis to turn it into a successful commercial product, able to compete with other sugars, both indigenous and imported?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: The member is referred to the replies given to the questions asked by Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur and Babu Bhupendra Kishor Ray Chaudhuri at the Council meetings of the 22nd January, 1918, and 3rd January, 1919, respectively.

Mr. Annett has been definitely transferred to the United Provinces Government. The work on date-sugar has consequently been in abeyance and work has been concentrated on cane sugar.

On receipt of the report of the Indian Sugar Commission it may be possible to take up the question of date sugar again on such lines as may be recommended in that report.

Nomenclature of the Indian and European waiting-rooms at Parbatipur junction of the Eastern Bengal Railway.

*XXXV. **Babu JOGESH CHANDRA SARKAR:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works aware that the waiting-room for the Indian 1st and 2nd class passengers is marked "Indians," and the waiting-room for the European 1st and 2nd class passengers is marked "Gentlemen" at the Parbatipur Junction of the Eastern Bengal Railway?

(*b*) Will the Government be pleased to ascertain from the above Railway authorities whether they are prepared to make the nomenclature of the Indian waiting-room similar to that of the European?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) The Eastern Bengal Railway administration state that they are making the necessary alterations on the sign-board at the Parbatipur station.

Report of McAlpin Committee.

*XXXVI. **Babu JOGESH CHANDRA SARKAR:** Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state when the report of the McAlpin Committee will be laid on the table.

and also when and how far the recommendations of the Committee will be given effect to?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of FINANCE (the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr): The report of the Salaries Committee with the note of dissent will be laid on the table during the present session. It is hoped that the proposals of Government for the revision of the pay of menials will be submitted to the Legislative Council in the current session. It is expected that the proposals regarding ministerial officers will be submitted to Council in September.

Unstarred Questions
(answers to which were laid on the table).

Proportion of nominated Muhammadan members in various boards, in municipalities and self-governing bodies in Dacca Division.

1. Khan Bahadur KHWAJA MOHAMED AZAM: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to say what is the proportion of nominated Mussalman members in the present union boards, local boards, district boards, municipalities and other self-governing bodies in the Dacca Division?

(*b*) What proportion of vacancies to be filled up by Government nomination is proposed to reserve for the Mussalmans in these local bodies in the Dacca Division?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea): (*a*) A statement is laid on the table.

(*b*) The object of Government in making appointments to local bodies is to correct possible inequalities which may result from the operation of the elective system, to secure the adequate representation of different communities and interests and also, where necessary, to provide for an element of official experience. Circumstances differ in different localities and no hard and fast rule can be laid down as to the proportion of vacancies to which members of any particular community should be appointed by Government. It is therefore not proposed to reserve any fixed proportion for Mussalmans in the Dacca Division.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 1 showing the proportion of nominated Muhammadan members in the self-governing bodies in the Dacca Division to the total number of nominated members in those bodies excluding ex-officio members.

Local bodies	Percentage
District Boards	42·1
Local	65·7
Municipalities	64·5
Union Boards	39·4
Union Committees	77·7

Phthisis cases.

2. Babu BROJENDRA KISHOR RAY CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of local Self-Government be pleased to make a statement showing the number of deaths from phthisis in—

(*i*) Calcutta; and

(*ii*) in each of the different districts of the Presidency

in each of the last five years?

(*b*) What accommodation is there in the hospitals under Government control for phthisis patients?

(*c*) Have the Government any particular home or hospital for phthisis patients at any hill station or elsewhere in the Presidency?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) (*i*) The deaths in Calcutta under the head of "Tubercle" were

1,920 in 1915
1,738 in 1916
1,539 in 1917
1,826 in 1918
1,889 in 1919

(*ii*) The information is not available, as deaths from phthisis are not entered separately in the vital statistics of the districts.

(*b*) There is accommodation of 80 beds for phthisis patients in the district headquarters hospitals under Government control. Tuberculosis wards have been constructed in the Presidency General and Medical College Hospitals containing 48 and 24 beds, respectively, but the former have not been brought into use.

(*c*) No.

Compartments for lady passengers in steamers and exemption of certain articles from luggage fares.

3. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Marine Department be pleased to state the percentage of passenger steamers of the Rivers Steam Navigation and India General Navigation and Railway Companies, Limited in which separate compartments for third class lady passengers have been provided?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that the compartments provided for those ladies in those steamers are the hottest part of the decks being just over the engine-room and behind the first and second class compartments?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of suggesting to the authorities concerned to see that these compartments are removed to the right or left side of the deck?

(*d*) Is it a fact that chaukidars and constables attend the steamer stations of the companies?

(*e*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state whet the companies pay any contribution to Government for the service these police officers and chaukidars? If so, how much?

(*f*) If not, is it in the contemplation of the Government to arra that a contribution should be paid by the companies in this regard?

(*g*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the number stations of the above companies and the number of crimes which ha occurred in those stations for the last three years?

(*h*) Is it a fact that on the Eastern Bengal Railway the bundle rugs, tiffin-baskets and small hand-bags, walking-sticks or umbrellas the case of first and second class passengers, and the *razai* or blank in the case of intermediate and third class passengers, are exempt from weighment as passenger's luggage?

(*i*) Are such exemptions permitted by the above steamer companie

(*j*) If not, are the Government considering the desirability of su gesting to the authorities concerned to see that a uniformity of ru is made by the steamer and railway companies in this matter?

(*k*) Is it also in the contemplation of the Government to suggest th tiffin-baskets and sticks or umbrellas be also exempted from weig ment as passenger's luggage in the case of intermediate and third cl railway and steamer passengers?

MEMBER in charge of MARINE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'b Mr. Kerr): (*a*) The joint steamer companies state that approximatel 43 per cent. of their passenger steamers are provided with screen accommodation for third class female passengers. The remainder o their steamers are either not sufficiently large to permit of separa accommodation being provided, or are plying on services where th necessity for screened accommodation does not exist.

(*b*) The accommodation has in the majority of cases been provide either forward of the funnel, which is not so hot a position as one imme diately aft of the funnel would be, or immediately forward of the ho pital accommodation aft.

(*c*) It is not advisable to remove the position of this accommod tion to the side of the decks, as by so doing the trim of the ship woul be seriously affected.

(*d*) Ghât police are deputed to certain steamer stations to watch th movements of criminals and suspicious characters and also to regulat traffic. They are employed for the protection of the public and no specially in the interest of the steamer companies.

(*e*) No contribution is paid by the steamer companies to Gover ment towards the cost of the ghât police.

(*f*) The answer is in the negative.

(*g*) The steamer companies have 435 steamer stations. No separa record is maintained of crimes committed at steamer stations.

(*h*) Yes.

(*i*) Yes.

(*j*) The question does not arise.

(*k*) Sticks, umbrellas and small tiffin-baskets of intermediate and third class passengers are exempted on the Eastern Bengal Railway. The steamer companies are not prepared to exempt such articles from weighment owing to the amount of space utilized for their accommodation. Cooking utensils for use on the journey are, however, allowed free carriage. Government are not prepared to address the steamer companies on the subject.

Capsizing of ferry boats in the Hooghly between Budge Budge and Naihati.

4. Mr. KRISHNA CHANDRA RAY CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Marine Department be pleased to state the approximate number of persons drowned by the capsizing of ferry boats in the river Hooghly from Budge Budge to Naihati in the years 1918, 1919 and 1920?

(*b*) What precautionary measures, if any, have the Government adopted so far for the protection of human lives in this regard?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (*a*) Eighteen persons are reported to have been drowned by the capsizing of passenger boats in the river Hooghly from Budge Budge to Naihati in the years 1918-1920.

(*b*) As far as the Port Commissioners' steamer-ferry service is concerned police guards are posted on all their ferry landing stages to supervise the embarkation and disembarkation of passengers. The rules regarding the licensing of other passenger boats within the limits of the Port of Calcutta are contained in notification No. 141 Misc. dated 30th November, 1908, a copy of which has been placed in the library.

Enhancement of chaukidari tax in the Burdwan Division.

5. Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of the Local Self-Government aware of the fact that the Divisional Commissioner of Burdwan, at the last Conference of district officers, stated that union boards, under the Bengal Village Self-Government Act, would be permitted to enhance the tax hitherto known as chaukidari tax, of every individual tax-payer to 50 per cent. on the old rate, and that yearly allotments be made by the union boards not only for roads but also for sanitation and education in equal proportion?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the advisability of reconsidering the decision of the Commissioner of the Burdwan Division and of fixing a lower rate of enhancement on the old chaukidari tax?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that certain union boards have imposed taxes on the agricultural income of the people, ignoring the provision in section 40 of the Bengal Village Self-Government Act?

(*d*) Is it in contemplation to impose double taxes on agricultural income, once by the union boards and again by the district boards?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) An extract from the proceedings of the Conference is laid on the table.

(*b*) No orders were issued, but the Conference was asked to consider the desirability of union boards adopting a rough scale for self-taxation and a model budget for expenditure on heads other than rural police. The proposals made were suggestions intended to help the union boards; and the Commissioner explained that the scale suggested would be useful as a guide to union boards which were taking up the work of assessment for the first time and that it would vary according to local conditions and requirements. After his proposals have been discussed by the Conference, the proposed scale of self-taxation and the budget suggested were accepted as model. The power of making the assessment in each union rests with the union board and it is not intended to interfere with their discretion in the matter.

(*c*) The member appears to be under a misapprehension as regards the provisions of the law regulating assessment. Section 38, Village Self-Government Act, lays down that the rate imposed by union boards shall be an assessment according to circumstances and property within the union, and section 39 provides that the assessment shall be made in accordance with the rules prescribed under section 101. Under the rules issued under the section last named, agricultural income is liable to assessment as well as income derived from other sources.

(*d*) Agricultural classes paying cess under the Cess Act are also liable to pay the union rate. The principle is not a new one, as these classes had also to pay the chaukidari tax under sections 11 and 15 of the Chaukidari Act, VI of 1870 (B.C.), and the rates imposed by the Union Committee under section 118C of the Local Self-Government Act.

Extract referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 5 (a).

Desirability of adopting a rough scale for self-taxation by Union Boards and a modal budget for expenditure on heads other than rural police.

The President explained that this subject had been taken up because the District Magistrate of Burdwan came to him one day and suggested that it would be useful if an indication could be given in the matter.

In view of the fact that people were generally averse to self-taxation when left to themselves it would be desirable to adopt a rough scale for such assessment by the Union Boards. Although it would vary according to local conditions and requirements such a scale would serve as a guide to these bodies who would have to take up this work for the first time. The amount now assessed as chaukidari tax would of course continue to be realised, but in addition to this a sum equivalent to half the chaukidari tax might ordinarily be assessed on each house-holder for carrying out the other objects of the Village Self-Government Act. As the poorer house-holders had been exempted from chaukidari assessment this arrangement would not cause any hardship. The average chaukidari tax of each Union amounted to say Rs. 1,200 and the additional tax that would be raised for carrying on the other purposes of the Act would thus be Rs. 600. To this might be added the District

oard grant which would vary perhaps from Rs. 200 to 400 (inclusive of the income om pounds which would be made over to Union Boards). It would be about Rs. 400 each Union in the Hooghly district, but in any district where it might be less the ther people in the Union might be assessed more than half their chaukidari tax up to the maximum of Rs. 81 a year altogether as fixed by section 38 of the illage Self-Government Act. It would hardly be possible for the Union Boards to ake any appreciable headway in any of the numerous spheres of activities on an come much less than Rs. 1,000 in addition to that required for the chaukidari fund.

Assuming then that the Union Board had an income of Rs. 1,000 a year for penditure on heads other than rural police, the following distribution was suggested :—

(1) Sanitation, conservancy and [illegible] Rs. [illegible] per cent.

(2) Water-supply . Rs. 200 or 20 per cent.

(Besides the Local Boards would be spending themselves or preferably through e Union Boards the money they at present devoted to water supply. The sum of s. 200 a year would represent an additional fund at the disposal of the Union oards for carrying out other works of this nature, *e.g.*, reclamation of any existing ank, the sinking of the tube wells, etc.)

(3) Roads [illegible] water-ways Rs. [illegible] per cent.

(This would be supplemented by the money now spent by Local Boards on all im portant village roads which would continue to be so spent either by Local Boards hemselves or preferably through the Union Boards.)

(4) Primary education Rs. [illegible] per cent.

(This would be supplemented by the sum now spent by District Boards either om its own funds or out of the imperial assignments placed at their disposal on Primary Schools which might be made over to Union Boards.)

(5) Medical Relief Dispensaries . Rs. 200 or 20 per cent.

(The President explained that he considered adequate medical relief to be the most important requirement of rural areas.)

(6) [illegible] Rs. 250 or 25 per cent.

Lower and upper primary schools.

6. Babu NALINI NATH ROY: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in harge of the Department of Education be pleased to place on the table a statement showing—

(*i*) the actual number of lower primary and upper primary schools for boys that exist at present in the Sadar and Narail sub divisions of the district of Jessore;

(*ii*) the number of students receiving instruction in such schools;

(*iii*) their percentage out of the total number of boys of school-going age;

(*iv*) how many of such schools are entirely free;

(*v*) how many of them receive help from Government and the District Board;

(*vi*) the amounts of such grants-in-aid;

(*vii*) the number of such schools exclusively for girls;

(*viii*) the number of girls under instruction in those schools;

(*ix*) their percentage out of the total number of girls of school-going age;

(*x*) whether there are any such schools free for girls;

(*xi*) what special consideration such schools, if any, referred to in sub-paragraph (*x*) receive at the hands of Government; and

(*xii*) what steps the Government are adopting to further the cause of elementary education for girls?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*i*) Sadar.—Lower primary, 385; upper primary, 65.

Narail. Lower primary, 243; upper primary, 49.

(*ii*) Sadar. Lower primary, 11,041; upper primary, 2,191.

Narail Lower primary, 7,431; upper primary, 1,894.

(*iii*) Sadar. Lower primary, 37; upper primary, nil.

Narail Lower primary, 34; upper primary, nil.

(*iv*) Sadar. Lower primary, nil; upper primary, nil.

Narail. Lower primary, nil; upper primary, nil.

(*v*) Sadar. Lower primary, receiving aid from the Government, 2, receiving aid from District Board, 363. Upper primary, receiving aid from Government, 4; receiving aid from District Board, 46.

Narail.—Lower primary, receiving aid from Government, 2; receiving aid from District Board, 221. Upper primary, receiving aid from Government, 1; receiving aid from District Board, 38.

(*vi*) Sadar. Lower primary: amount of grant from Government Rs 9,176; amount of grant from District Board, Rs. 6,314. Upper primary: amount of grant from Government, Rs 4,930; amount of grant from District Board, Rs 1,803

Narail Lower primary: amount of grant from Government, Rs 5,966; amount of grant from District Board, Rs 4,904 Upper primary: amount of grant from Government, Rs 7,371; amount of grant from District Board, Rs 1,749

(*vii*) Sadar Lower primary, 45; upper primary, 3

Narail Lower primary, 86; upper primary, 1

(*viii*) Sadar. Lower primary, 904; upper primary, 149.

Narail Lower primary, 2,004; upper primary, 42.

(*ix*) Sadar. Lower primary, 3; upper primary, nil

Narail. Lower primary, 8; upper primary, nil.

(*x*) Sadar. One lower primary school for peasant girls.

Narail. One lower primary school for peasant girls.

(*xi*) These peasant girls' schools, when they were started, received Rs. 20 each for furniture. They get Rs. 13 per month from Government Rs 10 for a Pandit and Rs. 3 for contingencies.

(*xii*) Government seek to develop primary education for girls by means of

(*a*) Panchayati Union schools for girls.—These schools are maintained by District Boards at a cost of Rs. 16 per month Government providing the requisite funds.

(*b*) (*i*) Grants-in-aid to deserving primary schools. Funds are placed annually at the disposal of the two Inspectresses of Schools to provide grants for deserving primary schools.

(*ii*) Increased remuneration to teachers of aided primary schools.—The pay of the whole-time teachers in aided primary schools and maktabs for girls [other than those included under (*c*) above] in District and Municipal Board areas which are conducted as independent institutions unconnected with boys' schools, has been increased by Rs. 2 per mensem over and above what they get from District and Municipal funds.

(*c*) The appointment of a staff of female inspecting officers.

(*d*) Training of female teachers. Government give generous grants to Mission and Brahmo training classes and maintain a Hindu and a Moslem training class. A large number of stipends is given to each of these training classes.

(*e*) It may be added, as regards Jessore Sadar and Narail, that Government contribute annually Rs. 39,532 to the Jessore District Board and Rs. 2,025 to the Jessore Municipality, for the maintenance of primary schools. It is open to these authorities to spend this money on girls' schools, if they think fit.

Demand for making Fakirhat police-station a seperate electoral unit.

7. Babu SAILAJA NATH ROY CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self Government aware that there is a strong popular demand for making Fakirhat police-station, in the district of Khulna, a separate electoral unit for the purpose of local board and district board elections?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state what action, if any, Government contemplate taking in the matter?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) The answer is in the negative.

(*b*) No action appears to be necessary.

Results of action taken under the Sanitary Drainage Act.

***8. Khan Bahadur Maulvi WASIMUDDIN AHMED:** Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self Government be pleased to lay on the table a statement in the following tabular form showing the results of action taken under the Sanitary Drainage Act during the period 1909 to 1919: -

Headings of Tables

(1) Name of the district.

(2) Who took the initiative.

(3) The area brought under operation.

(4) Amount of expenditure incurred.

(5) Who bore the expenditure in the beginning.

(6) How the costs were realised.

(7) Are there many insanitary *bils*, old tanks and other unhealthy places requiring action under that Act.

(8) If so, why no action was hitherto taken under that Act.

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (1) to (6) A statement is laid on the table.

(7) Yes. The Bengal Sanitary Drainage Act has, however, been superseded by the Bengal Agricultural and Sanitary Improvement Act.

(8) Under section 3 of the Bengal Sanitary Drainage Act (VIII of 1895) action can only be taken on an application from the District Board concerned.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 8 (1) to (6) showing the results of action taken under the Sanitary Drainage Act during the period 1909 to 1919.

Name of scheme.	Name of district.	Who took initiative.	Area under operation.	Expenditure incurred up to 31st March 1919.	Who bore expenditure in the beginning.	How cost realised.
1	2	3	4	5	6	7
			Sq. mile.	Rs.		
Magrahat Drainage	24 Parganas	District Board	[illegible]	3,[illegible]68,519	Government	A rate has been assessed under the Bengal Sanitary Drainage Act and [illegible] realised.
Amta ..	Howrah	In these cases the initiative was taken by Government which asked the District Boards concerned to make the necessary application under section 3 of the Bengal Sanitary Drainage Act (VIII of 1895).	12[illegible]	[illegible]2,14[illegible]	Ditto ..	The schemes are in progress.
Arul bil ...	Jessore		53	1,2[illegible],429	Ditto	
Nowi Sunthi	24 Parganas ..		146	1,35,25[illegible]	Ditto ..	
Jaboona	24 Parganas, Jessore and Nadia		362	4,441	Ditto ..	

Primary schools, madrassas and muktabs in Pirojpur.

9. Maulvi AZAHARUDDIN AHMED: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state—

(i) how many aided primary schools, madrassas and muktabs are there under the jurisdiction of the Police-station in the Pirojpur subdivision in the district of Bakarganj;

(ii) how much does each of them get as aid every year;

(*iii*) how many schools are there under the jurisdiction of the Government Khas Mahal and Colonisation Departments and how much does each of them get as aid every year; and

(*iv*) how many schools are under the jurisdiction of Zamindars and how much does each of them get as aid every year?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) (*i*) Number of aided primary schools in the Pirojpur subdivision, 622

(*b*) Number of aided muktabs in the Pirojpur subdivision, 151

(*c*) Number of aided middle madrassas in the Pirojpur subdivision, 3.

(*d*) Number of aided junior madrassas in the Pirojpur subdivision, 1.

(*ii*) Average amount of aid given per year to

(*a*) each primary school, Rs. 30-12

(*b*) each muktab, Rs. 44-8.

(*c*) each middle madrassa, Rs. 500.

(*d*) the junior madrassa, Rs. 600.

(*iii*) (*a*) Number of schools in the khas mahal area, 47.

(*b*) Number of schools in the colonisation area, 2

(*c*) Average amount of aid given to each khas mahal school annually, Rs. 43.

(*d*) Average amount of aid given to each school in colonisation area, Rs. 180.

(*iv*) (*a*) Number of primary schools under the jurisdiction of zamindars in the Pirojpur subdivision, 664.

(*b*) Average amount of aid given per year to each primary school under the jurisdiction of zamindars in the Pirojpur subdivision (from public funds), Rs. 27-8

Improvement of communications of Pirojpur town.

10. Maulvi AZAHARUDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works aware that Pirojpur, the headquarters station of the Pirojpur subdivision of the Bakarganj district, is provided with only one steamer station, which is situated five miles away from the town?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that communications become sometimes impossible owing to the drying up of the only *khal* in the vicinity?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that there are no suitable roads which may be used for cars, cycles, etc.?

(*d*) What steps are the Government taking to improve the communications of the town?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) Yes. During the ebb tide in the dry season, *i.e.*, from November to April, communication by boat between Pirojpur and the steamer

station is impossible. In the rainy season and at flow tide in the dry season communication by boat is possible.

(*c*) and (*d*) There are roads on both sides of the Damodar *khal* between Piroppur and Hularhat. Both the roads are fit for cycling but are not suitable for carts, etc. Owing to the formation of *char* land near Hularhat, the mooring of steamers at that station is difficult and the steamer station has been shifted to Denakhali. The District Board was asked to make a road from Denakhali to Hularhat, but the project has been held in abeyance till next year, as the local people asked the steamer company to transfer the station to Hularhat and the company intimated that the question would be decided during the next rainy season.

Want of a chemical laboratory in the Campbell Medical School.

11. Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether it is a fact that there is no chemical laboratory attached to the Campbell Medical School for the theoretical instruction and practical training of the students thereof?

(*b*) Is it a fact that the Campbell Medical School students are required to attend chemical and laboratory classes at the Medical College?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that no adequate facilities are provided for them at the College?

(*d*) Are the Government aware of a feeling that exists that undue discrimination is shown in favour of the Medical College students to the detriment of the educational interests of the Campbell Medical School students?

(*e*) If the answer to the question above be in the affirmative, what steps do the Government propose to take in order to remove this grievance and to provide the Campbell Medical School with a chemical laboratory of its own?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) and (*b*) The answer is in the affirmative.

(*c*) The facilities provided for them at the Medical College are adequate and differ in no way from those provided for the students of the College.

There is no evidence that such a feeling exists. No undue discrimination is exercised in favour of the Medical College students or to the detriment of the Campbell Medical School students.

(*e*) The question does not arise.

Proposal to start a Sericultural School in Malda.

12. Rai Sahib NILMANI CHATAK: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state whether there is any proposal to start a sericultural school in Malda?

(*b*) If so, when do the Government propose to start such a school?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) and (*b*) There is at present no proposal before Government to start a sericultural school in Malda. Arrangements have however, been made since 1918 for imparting practical training in improved methods of sericulture by a trained teacher to the sons of silk worm rearers attending the primary school at Piasbari in the Malda district. It is reported that the school is doing good work.

Alleged interference with free voting in by-election for Calcutta South (Muhammadan) seat.

13. Maulvi MESBAH UDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department aware that pressure is being put, an undue interference with the franchise of free voting is being exercised by certain sub-inspectors of the Calcutta Police in the present by-election for the Calcutta South Muhammadan seat?

(*b*) If the answer to the foregoing be in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state what steps Government propose to take to prevent such undue interference in the present instance, as well as in the future?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) and (*b*) It is understood that one of the candidates is a relative of a Muhammadan sub-inspector, and the latter, along with one other officer, appear to have canvassed to some extent in connection with the election. Both have been warned.

Inspector of European Schools.

14. Mr. H. A. STARK: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of European Education be pleased to lay on the table a list of the changes in the personnel of the Inspector of European Schools during the last official year?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of taking such steps as may insure some permanency in the tenure of office of the officer appointed to be Inspector of European Schools?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state whether it is proposed to retain the present Inspector of European Schools as such for a reasonable number of years?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of EUROPEAN EDUCATION (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (*a*) (*i*) Mr. A. Mercer, up to 15th June, 1920; (*ii*) Mr. W. F. Papworth (in addition to his own duties as Assistant Master in charge of the Hastings House School), from 16th June, 1920, to 13th July, 1920; (*iii*) Mr. T. S. Sterling, from 14th

July, 1920, up to third week of September, 1920, (*iv*) Mr. E. F. Oaten, from the third week of September, up to the end of December, 1920; (*v*) Mr. W. F. Papworth from the first week of January, 1921.

(*b*) Yes. Recent difficulties were due to the death of the permanent holder of the post, Mr. Maclear, and the illness of Mr. Mercer, but it is the desire of Government that frequent changes in the tenure of this post should be avoided.

(*c*) Yes, but no guarantee can be given.

Assam tea garden coolies in the district of Burdwan and unpopularity of the Gurkhas at Chandpur.

15. Raja MANILOLL SINGH ROY: (*a*) Has the attention of the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department been drawn to the fact that a large number of coolies from the Assam tea gardens have reached the district of Burdwan and neighbourhood, and that there is a fear that they may spread infectious diseases in the district and neighbourhood?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of taking immediate steps to look into the needs, necessities and comforts of these poor coolies and arrange for their safe arrival at their village homes?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that many serious allegations have been made against the Government officials in connection with the desertion of the tea gardens of Assam by the coolies and their detention at Chandpur?

(*d*) Are the Government considering the desirability of appointing a commission, with a majority of non-officials on it, to inquire into the cause of the discontent prevailing among the tea garden coolies and also into the truth of the allegations made against the officials, the garden managers, the police and the Gurkhas, as also the Railway and Steamer Companies?

(*e*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that the Gurkha soldiers have become very unpopular in Chandpur?

(*f*) Is it the intention of Government to refrain further from employing Gurkha soldiers to keep order in Chandpur?

MEMBER in charge of POLITICAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (*a*) and (*b*) All coolies from the tea gardens of Assam who reached the Burdwan district were despatched to their homes.

(*c*) Yes. A reference is invited to the *communiqué* published by this Government on the 7th June.

(*d*) The causes of discontent prevailing among the tea garden coolies were operative in Assam and their investigation is a matter for that local Government. As regards the allegations against officers of this Government, as also the Railway and Steamer Companies, an

quiry was made by me and the results were published with the *mmuniqué* issued on the 7th June. The appointment of a commission make further inquiry is not contemplated.

(*e*) The member evidently refers to the Eastern Frontier Rifles, ho are military police. Various allegations were made against this ce in Chandpur and they are dealt with in the report referred to in so r as they have been brought to the notice of Government.

(*f*) The force of the Eastern Frontier Rifles now at Chandpur were ly retained there so long as it was necessary in the interests of law and der.

Revenue derived from gun-license fees.

16. Babu SURENDRA NARAYAN SINHA: Will the Hon'ble the ember in charge of the Political Department be pleased to state the nount of revenue derived from gun-license fees, and under what head the Budget it is shown, and to what use it is being put?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: The revenue derived from es for licenses under the Arms Act was

Rs. 5,678 in 1917.
Rs. 5,655-12 in 1918.
Rs. 20,115-12 in 1919.

The figures for 1920 are not available. The fees are paid in impressed mps and are included in the receipts shown in the Budget under the ncipal head VII Stamps (A) Non-judicial. They are not devoted any particular purpose, but form part of the general revenues of vernment.

Influx of tea garden coolies into Bengal.

17. Babu JATINDRA NATH BASU: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the lember in charge of the Political Department be pleased to say whether e Government thought it necessary to meet the situation created by the flux in May and June, 1921, of large numbers of indigent coolies and r families into different parts of Bengal from the tea gardens of ssam?

(*b*) Are the Government aware of the public feeling that exists that e continuance of a large floating population of unskilled and indigent rsons in the province is a danger to the health and the economic condi- n of the people of the province?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state why the sending of the stranded coolies out of the province at the cost of the province as discontinued?

(*d*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the measures taken for the relief, repatriation, housing, feeding and medical treatment of the masses of coolies that came into Bengal from Assam in May and June, 1921?

(*e*) Has any attempt been made to ascertain whether the coolies were anxious to go away to their homes, how many had the means to travel and how many were without such means?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) The member is referred to the *communiqué* of the 7th June last, in which Government's attitude was clearly defined.

(*b*) The danger referred to is obvious and Government made sanitary and medical arrangements to meet it.

(*c*) The member is referred to the *communiqué* mentioned above.

(*d*) Prior to June 7th, these have been detailed in the *communiqué*. Subsequent to that date necessary trains and steamers for the repatriation of the coolies were provided from funds supplied by charitable organisations and individuals, Government arranging for food, shelter and any necessary medical attendance on the way. Only those certified fit for the journey were allowed to travel, the sick being detained at Chandpur for treatment under the arrangements described in the *communiqué*.

(*e*) The reports agree that the coolies were not willing to return to the gardens. So far as is known, the majority did not contribute towards the cost of the journey.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: Will the Hon'ble Member be pleased to state what was the approximate number of coolies that were repatriated from Asansol and Naihati at Government expense?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: I could not off-hand give the number. It was the first batch that was repatriated by the Hon'ble Mr Sinha. I fancy that the number was about 600 or 700.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: Will the Hon'ble Member be pleased to state the principle on which a differentiation has been made as regards paying the cost of repatriation of coolies from Asansol and Naihati as compared to those at Chandpur?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: There are various resolutions on the subject tabled for discussion. Perhaps it will be better to wait than to answer the supplementary questions which are of an argumentative nature.

Ejectment of coolies from Chandpur railway station.

18. Babu JATINDRA NATH BASU: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department be pleased to state whether

he Railway Company or the local officials made any arrangements as to he location or accommodation of the coolies, with a view to the proposed ejectment before the attempt with the aid of the military police on the 0th May, 1921, to turn them out of the railway station at Chandpur, and as the accommodation notified to the coolies before the ejectment?

(b) Was any estimate made before the railway station was cleared s to how many sick and emaciated persons and how many women and hildren were in the crowd before the force was used to eject them from he railway station at Chandpur on the 20th May, 1921

(c) Did the coolies that were sought to be ejected from the Chandpur ailway station on the night of the 20th May, 1921, show any aggressive r violent attitude towards the military police?

(d) Did the Government consider it necessary to award compensation o the coolies that were hurt by the military police at Chandpur on the 0th May, 1921?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (a) On the 19th May the Commissioner, in consultation with the Chairman of the municipality, arranged for the coolies to occupy the football field, adjoining the station, and obtained the Agent's permission for the ground to be so used. Arrangements were in hand for putting up huts, but before they were erected the incidents of the 19th and 20th May took place.

(b) Government are not aware that any such estimate was made.

(c) The member is referred to paragraph 4 of my report in the *Gazette* of the 7th June.

(d) No.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: Is the Hon'ble Member aware that there was a great danger of the coolies getting wet in the open football field during the rainy month of May?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: If it rained and there was no shelter that risk no doubt existed.

Babu INDU BHUSAN DUTTA: Will the Hon'ble Member be pleased to state if any inquiry was made as to how many sick persons were left in the station shed after the coolie drive was over? If so, with what result?

The PRESIDENT: I think supplementary questions are not meant for cross-examining the Member in charge after he has answered the questions. I therefore disallow this question.

Want of a platform on the Jangipur Road Station.

19. Babu SURENDRA NARAYAN SINHA: (a) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works be pleased to

say whether the attention of the Government has been drawn to the fact of the great inconveniences which the people in general, and ladies, children, the sick, the infirm and old people in particular, have been experiencing, and are being daily subjected to, in getting into and down from the railway trains at the Jangipur Road Station on the B. A. K. line, for want of a platform since the opening of the line by the East Indian Railway Company?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state what steps, if any, Government propose to take in that direction; and, if so, when?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) The attention of the Government has not been specially drawn to the inconveniences complained of at the Jangipur Road Station on the Barharwa-Azimganj-Katwa line for want of a raised platform at that station; but in April, 1920, a memorial was addressed to His Excellency the Governor inviting his attention to the inconvenience suffered by passengers generally owing to the adoption of rail-level platforms at certain stations on lines worked under the East Indian Railway system.

(*b*) As the question concerns the working and the internal economy of a railway, the administration is quite competent to deal with it. Government will, however, draw the attention of the Agent, East Indian Railway to this matter.

Relegation of duties of minor importance to sub-deputy collectors.

20. Maulvi MAHAMMED MADASSUR HUSSAIN: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to lay on the table any circular or letters that might have been issued within the last two years in which Government expressed their intention to relegate sub-deputy collectors to duties of minor importance?

(*b*) Have the Government given effect to such circular or letters?

(*c*) Will the Government be pleased to state specifically the duties which they consider to be minor and which the sub-deputy collectors will be called upon to perform under the new rules?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) A copy of Government resolution No. 1646 A. D., dated the 21st June, 1920, is laid on the library table.

(*b*) In pursuance of the resolution referred to above, Government has ceased to vest members of the subordinate service with first class powers. Many of them are being employed in circle works.

(*c*) The member is referred to the resolution placed on the library table.

-vesting sub-deputy collectors with first class magisterial powers.

21. Maulvi MAHAMMED MADASSUR HUSSAIN: (*a*) Will the ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased y if it is a fact that sub-deputy collectors are no longer vested with ers of a magistrate of the first class?

(*b*) If so, what is the reason?

(*a*) What is the bar against investing this class of magistrates with class powers?

(*d*) Has any such bar been laid down in the case of honorary istrates?

(*c*) Are the Government aware that the order is considered by the deputy collectors as a source of humiliation and that their general ontent has increased?

(*f*) Is it known to Government that the sub-deputy collectors, in representation, claimed equality with deputy collectors for doing not first class case work, but doing other work which at one time or er, in one place or another, is done by deputy collectors?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) and (*c*) The member is referred to paragraph 2 of the Government lution No. 1646 A. D., of the 21st June, 1920, in which the place of subordinate service in the general administration was defined. In ordance with the policy therein laid down, Government have ceased est members of the subordinate service with first class powers.

(*d*) No.

(*e*) and (*f*) Government have received, from time to time, and have n due consideration to expressions of opinion by members of the ice, regarding its status and its duties, so far as these are consistent h the objects for which the service has been constituted.

ry-service on the Ganges between Malda and Murshidabad districts.

22. Maulvi SHAH MUHAMMAD CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works be ased to state—

(*a*) whether the portion of the river Ganges, between the districts of Malda and Murshidabad, is a Government estate bearing a tauzi number;

(*b*) whether any private party is allowed to ply any ferry-service on this portion of the Ganges, not as a lessee but for his own profit as owner?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to lay on the table a tement of the current year's income from each of the ferries maintained the Government on that portion of the Ganges and state how the ome is credited at the Collectorate?

(*c*) Do the Government spend any portion of the income for the construction and repair of the approaches to those ferries?

(*d*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to lay on the table a statement of the ferries in the district of Malda taken by the Government from private owners since the creation of the District Road Committee under the Cess Act of 1871 up to date and the annual income of each during the current year?

(*e*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state how many ferries in the district of Malda are still Government property, the incomes of which are appropriated as Provincial revenue?

(*f*) How much of this income is spent for the approaches to those Government ferries?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) (*c*) An answer was given to this part of the question at the Council meeting on 1st April last.

(*b*) It is reported that within the Murshidabad district there are 11 ferry services maintained by private agencies, *viz*., the zamindars, who lease them out to the highest bidder. The lessees are the only ones allowed to ply these ferries. The zamindars justify the levy of the rent on the ground that this is not for the main channel of the river, but for the landing ghats which lie within their estates.

(*b*) Government do not possess any ferries on the portion of the Ganges managed by the Magistrates of Malda and Murshidabad.

(*c*) The question does not arise.

(*d*) A statement is laid on the table.

(*e*) Six ferries.

(*f*) As all the ferries under Government management in the district of Malda are on the main roads maintained either by district boards or municipalities no part of the income is spent on the approaches to the ferries.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 22 (d) showing the ferries acquired by Government in the district of Malda and the income derived from each in 1920-21.

No.	Name of ferry.	Annual income	REMARKS.
		Rs.	
1	Alal	1,020	
2.	Bangachi and Bamandanga ...	825	
3	Bamangola	50	
4	Dumuria	826	
5.	Jagadishpore	55	
6.	Khanpore	985	
7.	Goalpara and its subsidiary ...	130	
8	Trimohani	41	

No.	Name of ferry.	Annual income	Remarks
9.	Gobraghat	775	
10.	Debipore	625	
11.	Kushrekha	700	
12.	Araidanga	300	
13.	Mirjatpur	190	
14.	Chatore	415	
15.	Barkole	800	
16.	Budhia	535	
17.	Madia	[illegible]	
18.	Debakipur	195	
19	Balupur	[illegible]	
20.	Sadullapur	[illegible]	
21	Madhughat	[illegible]	
22.	Belwarighat	[illegible]	
23	Ekbarabad	130	
24.	Jaharpur dara . ..	150	
25	Pukhuria	36	
26	Muchia	[illegible]	
27	Kendua dara .. .	[illegible]	
28	Balia Nawabganj	[illegible]	
29	Itakhola	[illegible]	
30	Rajapore Kharbank	[illegible]	
31	Khutaha	[illegible]	
32	Gomastapur	2,500	
33	Makrampur	1,320	
34	Charmirjapore	1,240	
35	Aibo	1,500	
36.	Jhoughatta and Ramna[illegible] ...	2,400	
37	Peer[illegible]	[illegible]	
38.	Nurpore	[illegible]	
39	Old and New Nagharia	200	
40.	Ghoga	13	
41	Tartipur Narainpur	[illegible]	
42	Rajmehal, Nimasarai and Fulbari ...	5,600	
43.	Nawabganj	[illegible]	
44.	Shyampur	[illegible]	
45.	Rangamatia	200	

Pony allowance sanctioned to kanungoes.

23. Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: (a) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to state whether the Government has lately sanctioned a scheme granting a pony allowance to the kanungoes in the Settlement Department?

(b) If so, what is the nature of the scheme and the amount required to give effect to it?

(c) Has this amount been specifically sanctioned in the current year's Budget?

(*d*) Is it a fact that during the last twenty years of settlement operations, no necessity for the payment of such an allowance was felt?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) Sanction has been accorded to the grant with effect from the 1st March, 1921, of a pony allowance of Rs. 20 per mensem to all settlement kanungoes who are required to do field and other touring work and actually keep suitable ponies, subject to a certificate to that effect being given by the Settlement Officers concerned. The grant, however, is liable to be withdrawn or modified if economic conditions improve or if conditions of service are changed.

The amount required to give effect to the scheme is about Rs. 50,000 a year.

(*c*) Provision was made under the head "Travelling allowance" of the budget; the budget was sanctioned.

(*d*) No.

Calcutta Police Courts.

24. Rai Dr. HARIDHAN DUTT Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to place on the table a statement showing, year by year, the total "Receipts" in the Calcutta Police Courts, between 1913 and 1920, under the following heads:—

(*i*) in court fee stamps;
(*ii*) fines;
(*iii*) copying and comparing fees;
(*iv*) other receipts credited to Government.

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing, year by year:—

(*1*) recurring charges on—
- (*i*) salaries of Judicial Officers;
- (*ii*) establishment;
- (*iii*) contingencies; and
- (*iv*) any other item;

(*2*) non-recurring charges—
- (*i*) in the shape of additions and alterations, electric fittings, sanitary plumbing works in the Jorabagan Kyd Street and Bankshall Street Court buildings;
- (*ii*) in the shape of furniture and equipment of the two new courts;
- (*iii*) any other items;

incurred in the Calcutta Police Courts between 1913 and 1920?

(c) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing:—

(i) the ministerial and menial staff in the Calcutta Police Courts and the charges thereon;

(ii) the police establishment attached to the Calcutta Police Courts and the charges thereon;

(iii) the Public Prosecutor and his establishment and the charges thereon, in Calcutta Police Courts (Northern and Southern Division Courts) in the year 1913, 1915, 1917 and 1920?

(d) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing, year by year, the totals of the following cases, in the Calcutta Police Courts, between 1913 and 1920:

(i) the total number of all *cases* ("serious" as well as "petty");

(ii) the total of all "petty" cases;

(iii) the total of all "serious" police cases;

(iv) the total of all private cases which came up for trial after issue of process?

(e) Will the Government be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing, year by year, the total number of

(i) serious and

(ii) petty cases

actually tried out (excluding the cases dismissed, struck off, filed or transferred), by (1) each Stipendiary Presidency Magistrate, and by (2) *all* Honorary Presidency Magistrates, in the Calcutta Police Courts between 1913 and 1920?

(f) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state what sum is received as rent from the large godown which is attached to the Bankshall Street Police Court buildings?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (a) to (e) Statements furnishing the information asked for are laid on the table.

(f) No rent is received.

Statements referred to in the replies to unstarred question No. 24 (a) to (e).

I.

		(a) (i) Court fee stamps	(a) (ii) Fines	(a) (iii) Incoming and outgoing fees	(a) (iv) Other receipts credited to government
		Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
1913	...	16,098	1,69,425	4,418	575
1914	...	18,523	1,62,814	5,964	1
1915	...	17,165	1,45,228	5,052	116
1916	...	18,307	1,44,573	5,60[illegible]	116
1917	...	19,146	2,11,245	2,152	1[illegible]7
1918	...	15,663	2,24,998	5,097	249
1919	...	16,010	2,45,667	5,677	1,061
1920	...	18,796	3,29,475	5,178	5,360

II.

		(b) 1 (i) Salaries of Judicial officers.	(b) 1 (ii) Establishment.	(b) 1 (iii) and (iv) Contingencies and any other item.
		Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
1913	...	62,437	30,659	7,662
1914	...	68,701	34,959	12,237
1915	...	65,736	35,464	15,291
1916	...	37,430	30,227	15,996
1917	..	41,303	28,409	13,228
1918	...	62,328	33,008	14,624
1919	...	60,372	33,099	14,738
1920	...	59,045	41,577	16,603

III.

	KYD STREET.			BANKSHALL STREET.			JORABAGAN COURT.		
	Recurring charges (b) 2 (i).	Non-recurring charges (b) 2 (ii).	Any other item (b) 2 (iii).	(b) 2 (i).	(b) 2 (ii).	(b) 2 (iii).	(b) 2 (i).	(b) 2 (ii).	(b) 2 (iii).
	Rs.	Rs.		Rs.	Rs.		Rs.	Rs.	
1913-14 ...	1,311	11,117	...		..	.	738	27,862	..
1914-15	202	430		2,7[illegible]	57,559		113		
1915-16	526	89	.	[illegible]	41[illegible]		534	409	...
1916-17 ...	2,678	2,499	..	3,858			1,514	5,000	
1917-18	348	401		3,911	155	..	1,099	1,855	.
1918-19	1,311	.		13,861	1,337		[illegible]	574	
1919-20	509	...		[illegible]	1,526		1,325	[illegible]	...

Note.—Expenditure on [illegible] and [illegible] is [illegible] recurring, [illegible] etc. [illegible] recurring. [illegible] expenditure for these are included in contingencies in the reply to (b) 1 (i), (iii) and (iv).

Statements asked for in c (i).

IV.

Designation.				Pay.	Average.	
1913				Rs.	Rs.	A.
1 Registrar	...	...	..	200—10—250	237	8
1 Interpreter	..	...	.	125—5—150	143	12
3 Interpreters	...	...	...	100—5—125	356	4
One personal allowance		...	...	...	25	0
1 Interpreter	...	..	...	75—5—100	93	12
1 Accountant	...	...	...	80—4—100	9[illegible]	[illegible]
2 Record-keeper and Cashier		..	..	60—4—80	150	0
1 1st Clerk, English office		...	...	70—2—80	77	8
2 Clerks	...	..	...	50—2—60	115	0
10 "	...	...	...	40—2—50	475	0
9 "	...	...	...	35—2—45	337	8
1 Clerk	...	...	...	40—0—0	40	0
3 Clerks	...	...	...	30—0—0	90	0
1 Clerk	...	...	...	12—0—0	12	0

Designation				Pay			Average	
1915.				Rs			Rs.	A
1 Registrar	...	...	...	200	5 to	250	237	8
1 Interpreter	...	...	...	125	5	150	143	12
3 Interpreters	...	...	...	100	5	125	350	4
One personal allowance		...	...		...		25	0
1 Interpreter	...	...	...	75	5	100	93	12
1 Accountant	...	...	...	80	4	100	95	0
2 Record-keeper and Cashier		...	...	60	4	80	140	0
1 1st Clerk, English office		...	...	70	2	80	74	8
2 Clerks	...	...	...	50	2	60	110	0
1 Caretaker allowance		...	...		...		20	0
10 Clerks	...	...	...	40	2	50	450	0
8 ,,	...	...	...	30	2	40	300	0
2 ,,	...	...	...	40	0	0	80	0
3 ,,	...	...	...	30	0	0	90	0
1 Peshkar	...	...	...	12	0	0	12	0

Temporary for Northern and Southern Division and 5th Court.

		Rs	Rs	A
For Northern and Southern Division				
2 Head Clerk and Accountant	...	80 0 0	160	0
2 Clerks	..	40 0 0	80	0
6 ,, ...	...	50 0 0	150	0
For 5th Court				
1 Interpreter ...	..	100 0 0	100	0
1 Clerk	...	40 0 0	40	0
1 ,, ...	..	40 0 0	40	0
Menials				
3 Menials	.	10 0 0	30	0
1 Menial	.	9 0 0	9	0
22 Menials	...	8 0 0	176	0
Temporary.				
8 Menials for Northern and Southern Division		8 0 0	64	0
2 Menials for 5th Court ...	...	8 0 0	16	0
		Total ...	1143	4
Temporary				
2 Accountants	...	80 0 0	160	0
2 Clerks	...	40 0 0	80	0
6	..	30 0 0	180	0

	Designation.	Pay.	Average.
	Menials	Rs	Rs A
3	Menials	10—0—0	30 0
1	Menial	9—0—0	9 0
22	Menials	8—0—0	176 0
	Temporary		
9	Menials	8—0—0	72 0
	Total ...		2,977 12

5th Court abolished

1917

1	Registrar	200—10—250	237 8
1	Interpreter	125—5—150	143 12
3	Interpreter	100—5—125	356 4
1	Interpreter	75—5—100	93 12
1	Accountant	80—4—100	95 0
2	Record keeper and Cashier	60—4—80	150 0
1	1st Clerk, English office	70—2—80	77 8
2	Clerks	30—2—60	175 0
1	Caretaker allowance	20—0—0	20 0
10	Clerks	40—2—50	475 0
8	,, ...	30—2—40	300 0
2	,, ...	40—0—0	80 0
3	,, ...	30—0—0	90 0
1	Peon	12—0—0	12 0
	Temporary		
1	Head Clerk and Accountant ...	80—0—0	80 0
1	Clerk	40—0—0	40 0
3	Clerks	30—0—0	90 0

1920

1	Registrar	200—10—250	237 8
1	1st Interpreter	125—5—150	143 12
1	2nd ,, ...	100—5—125	118 12
1	Interpreter	100—5—125	118 12
1	3rd Interpreter	80—4—100	95 0
1	Head Clerk	80—4—100	95 0
1	Caretaker allowance	20—0—0	20 0
1	Cashier	80—4—100	95 0
1	Head Clerk and Accountant ...	60—4—80	75 0
1	Cashier	60—4—80	75 0

Designation.	Pay	Average
1920.	Rs	Rs A
1 Record-keeper	60—4—80	75 0
1 Bench Clerk	60—4—80	75 0
1 Accountant	75—5—100	75 0
4 Clerks	60—4—80	280 0
11 ,, ...	30—2—40	385 0
10 ,, ...	40—3—55	400 0
6 ,, ...	30—2—40	180 0
4 Probationers	15—1—20	60 0
2 Peddars	15—0—20	30 0

Southern Division since abolished

Mounds

1917

3 Mounds	10—0—10	30 0
1 Mound	9—0—10	9 0
18 Mounds	8—0—10	144 0

Temporary Mounds

7 Mounds	8—0—10	56 0

Mounds

1920

7 Mounds	13—0—15	91 0
8 ,, ...	12—0—15	96 0
15 ,, ...	11—0—15	165 0
Total ...		3,110 12

Statement asked for in c (iii).

No. V.

Year	Establishment	Cost per Year
1913 ...	4 Inspectors	39,000
	2 Sub-Inspectors	
	5 Sergeants	
	5 Head-constables	
	40 Constables	
1915 ...	5 Inspectors	51,900
	4 Sub-Inspectors	
	5 Sergeants	
	5 Head-constables	
	59 Constables	

Year	Establishment.	Cost
		Rs.
1917	... 4 Inspectors	46,600
	4 Sub-Inspectors	
	4 Sergeants	
	5 Head-constables	
	53 Constables	
1920	... 4 Inspectors	57,123
	4 Sub-Inspectors	
	4 Sergeants	
	6 Head-constables, Writer and Ordinary	
	45 Constables	

Statement asked for in c (iii).

VI.

Year.	Public Prosecutor's salary with carriage allowance.	Fees paid to Pleaders for assisting Public Prosecutor in conducting Crown cases.	Establishment of Public Prosecutor.	Charges in typing sessions and other briefs by extra typist.	Total.
	Rs. A. P.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs. A.	Rs. A. P.
1913	18,000 0 0	9,26[illegible]	2,136	546 12	30,547 12 0
1915	18,000 0 0	9,630	3,264	509 7	32,[illegible] 7 0
1917	18,600 0 0	17,374	5,264	1,047 0	40,285 0 0
1920	10,299 15 11*	4,892	3,[illegible]	1,[illegible] 3 3†	1[illegible],725 2 11

* Since the retirement of Mr. J. [illegible] Hume on 15th November 1919 the Public Prosecutor was remunerated from that date up to 11th May 1920 by fees, and not by salary.

† The charges for typing sessions briefs by extra typist has been discontinued since the appointment of permanent clerk from 7th January 1921.

Statement asked for in d (i) to (iv).

VII.

Year.	Total number of all [illegible] (cases [illegible] petty.)	Total of all petty cases.	Total of all serious police cases.	Total of all private cases which came for trial after issue of process.
1913 ...	96,713	88,462	4,578	2,033
1914 ...	79,518	70,945	4,269	2,834
1915 ...	75,446	67,164	3,241	3,437
1916 ...	73,691	66,363	3,557	2,183
1917 ...	84,917	75,885	3,364	4,070
1918 ...	71,402	63,796	3,482	2,636
1919 ...	91,710	81,902	4,654	2,329
1920 ..	91,304	81,613	5,284	2,245

Statement asked for in (i) and (ii)

VIII.

Year.	Chief Court		2nd Court		3rd Court		4th Court		5th Court		Special Court	Regis. Court	Bench Court	
	Serious.	Petty.	Serious.	Petty.	Serious.	Petty.	Serious.	Petty.	Serious.	Petty.				
1913 ...	2,489	1,562	1,440	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]		[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]
1914 ...	1,307	37	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]		[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]
1915 ...	1,586	32	4,837	3,387	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]		[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]
1916 ...	1,982	291	2,300	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]		[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]
1917 ...	3,000		3,500		[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]			[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]
1918 ...	1,620	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]		[illegible]		[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]
1919 ...	[illegible]		[illegible]		[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]				[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]
1920 ...	1,220		[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]			[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]

Expenditure on the working of the Industries and Munitions Departments.

25. Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state—

(i) the actual amount of money spent on the Department of Industries, year by year, since its establishment;

(ii) the nature of the work done by this department as distinct from the work done by the Munitions Department, and

(iii) if the work done by the two departments cannot be separately enumerated, what was the total expenditure on the working of the two departments jointly, year by year?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur:—

Year.	Expenditure.
	P.
1917-18 (from 29th October 1917)	41,746
1918-19	87,787
1919-20	1,50,461
1920-21	2,70,415
Total	5,53,409

(ii) In matters relating to the industrial development of the province there was no line of distinction between the work done by the Department of Industries and the Controller of Munitions, Bengal

The latter officer was interested in developing Indian industries, with special reference to the needs created by the war, and the office of the Director of Industries was combined with it and placed under one officer. The nature of the work done by the joint officer, on matters affecting the industries of the province, for the period between October 1917 to December 1919 will be found in the copy of the Administration Report of this Department laid on the library table.

(*iii*) A statement of expenditure of the Munitions Offices in Calcutta is shown below :—

Year	Expenditure.		
	Rs.	A.	P.
1916-17	1,050	10	3
1917-18	1,31,925	9	6
1918-19	3,62,100	0	5
1919-20	2,71,711	0	1
1920-21	1,05,558	15	5
Total	8,72,346	3	8

Teachers in primary schools for girls in certain subdivisions of Mymensingh.

26. Mr. S. M. BOSE: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing separately for each subdivision the number of lower primary and upper primary schools for girls during the years 1914–1920 in the subdivisions of Mymensingh, Netrakona and Kishorganj, the number of pupils, the annual expenditure, and the qualification and sex of the teachers of these schools?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that there is a general demand for women teachers for these schools?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to say what steps the Government intend to take to encourage the employment of women teachers in these schools?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) A statement is laid on the table.

(*b*) Yes.

(*c*) Qualified women teachers are employed where arrangements for their accommodation can be made, provided candidates are forthcoming and committees are prepared to pay their share of the cost in accordance with the Grant-in-aid rules. For various reasons a rapid increase in the number of qualified women teachers cannot be anticipated. The supply being largely limited by social factors, change can only come gradually, but, wherever possible, women teachers are employed in girls' schools.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 26(a).

Name of Subdivision	Number of Lower Primary Schools for Girls						Number of Lower Primary Schools for Boys					
	1914-15	1915-16	1916-17	1917-18	1918-19	1919-20	1914-15	1915-16	1916-17	1917-18	1918-19	1919-20
Sadar ..	1	1	[illegible]	2	[illegible]	[illegible]*	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	391
Kishorganj ..	3	3	3	3	3	3	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	321
Netrakona ..	1	1	1	[illegible]	[illegible]		[illegible]	[illegible]	135	[illegible]	163	159

Name of Subdivision	Number of [illegible]						Number of [illegible]					
Sadar ..	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]
Kishorganj ..	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]
Netrakona ..	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]

Name of Subdivision	Annual [illegible] Primary [illegible]						[illegible]					
Sadar ..	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]
Kishorganj ..	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]
Netrakona ..	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]

Name of Subdivision	Qualification of [illegible] Upper Primary [illegible]						Qualification of [illegible]					
	1914-15	1915-16	1916-17	1917-18	1918-19	1919-20	1914-15	1915-16	1916-17	1917-18	1918-19	1919-20
Sadar ..	In the case of [illegible] qualification varies from Lower Primary Pass to Middle [illegible] Examination [illegible] Pass [illegible]. The female teachers are generally [illegible]. There are, however, some trained mistresses in the Mission schools.											
Kishorganj ..												
Netrakona ..												

* The decrease is due to the conversion of one Upper Primary school into Middle Vernacular status.

NAME OF SUBDIVISION	Total Number of Teachers in Upper Primary Schools for Girls.						Total Number of Teachers in Lower Primary Schools for Girls					
	1914-15.	1915-16.	1916-17.	1917-18.	1918-19.	1919-20.	1914-15.	1915-16.	1916-17.	1917-18.	1918-19.	1919-20.
Sadar	7	7	9	8	8	2*	161	205	236	291	326	402
Kishorganj	4	4	5	5	3	5	226	291	292	294	293	315
Netrakona	3	3	3	3	3	3	96	125	138	156	164	191

NAME OF SUBDIVISION	Number of Female Teachers in Upper Primary School for Girls						Number of Female Teachers in Lower Primary Schools for Girls					
	1914-15.	1915-16.	1916-17.	1917-18.	1918-19.	1919-20.	1914-15.	1915-16.	1916-17.	1917-18.	1918-19.	1919-20.
Sadar	7	7	7	7	6	2*	15	21	23	30	57	67
Kishorganj	1	2	2	2	3	3	43	42	50	61	72	93
Netrakona		1	1	1	4	4	10	14	15	18	21	29

NAME OF SUBDIVISION	Number of Male Teachers in Upper Primary Schools for Girls.						Number of Male Teachers in Lower Primary Schools for Girls					
	1914-15.	1915-16.	1916-17.	1917-18.	1918-19.	1919-20.	1914-15.	1915-16.	1916-17.	1917-18.	1918-19.	1919-20.
Sadar	...	...	2	1	2	1*	146	184	213	261	279	335
Kishorganj	3	1	3	4	...	2	211	249	242	233	220	220
Netrakona	3	4	4	4	1	1	86	111	123	138	143	162

* The decrease is due to the conversion of one Upper Primary School into Middle Vernacular status.

Government pleader and public prosecutor of Noakhali.

27. Munshi MAKRAMALI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to say whether it is a fact that the post of the Government pleader and public prosecutor of Noakhali will shortly fall vacant?

(*b*) If so, are the Government considering the desirability of appointing one person as Government pleader and another as public prosecutor?

(*c*) Are the Government aware that the number of civil and criminal cases has increased to a very large extent?

(d) Is it a fact that Khan Bahadur Maulvi Bazlar Rahim and Babu nkim Chandra Bose, the two former Government pleaders and public secutors of Noakhali, met with sad and untimely deaths on account overwork?

(e) Are the Government considering the desirability of appointing a l lawyer as Government pleader, and also, another as public prosecutor, from among the members of the local Bar?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (a) The post fell vacant on the June and Babu Jasoda Kumar Ghosh, pleader Noakhali, was ointed thereto on probation for a period of one year in Government er No. 1930 J., dated the 27th May, 1921.

(b) No. There is no proposal from the local officers that there uld be two separate law-officers.

(c) No. There has been rather a decrease since 1918.

(d) No.

(e) No.

Cadre of Bengal Civil Service (Executive Branch).

28. **Maulvi MUHAMMAD MADASSUR HUSSAIN:** (a) Will the 'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be ased to say whether it is a fact that it is in the contemplation Government to increase shortly the cadre of the Bengal Civil Service ecutive Branch)?

(b) If so, has any definite scheme been formulated to give effect he proposal?

(c) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state whether the ernment have given effect to the opinion of the Divisional Commissioners and Heads of Departments on the revision of the cadre to at in future the employment of officers of the junior service on s more properly belonging to the major service, as laid down in Government resolution No. 1646 A.D., dated the 21st June, 1920?

(d) If any increase in the strength of the Bengal Civil Service is ted, is it in the contemplation of Government to fill up all such ncies from the ranks of the subordinate service, as claimed by the bers in paragraph 2, page 7 of their memorial?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: The question of the adi s of the present cadre is now under the consideration of Government. Answers to (b), (c) and (d) must await the decision arrived at on.

Income derived from the levy of toll in the Bhagirathi river.

2. **Babu SURENDRA NARAYAN SINHA:** (a) Will the Hon'ble Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation be pleased to state

whether the income derived from the levy of toll fees in the river Bhagirathi is getting less and less every year or not?

(b) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to lay on the table a comparative statement showing the annual income from the above source for the last ten years?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (a) The navigation toll receipts of the river Bhagirathi in charge of the Nadia Rivers Division have declined during the last ten years, as a result of development of railways on both banks.

(b) A statement showing the annual receipts from tolls in the Bhagirathi river for the last ten years is laid on the table.

Statement showing the annual receipts of toll fees in the river Bhagirathi referred to in reply to unstarred question No. 29 (b)

Name of river	1911-12	1912-13	1913-14	1914-15	1915-16	1916-17	1917-18	1918-19	1919-20	1920-21
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Bhagirathi										
Jangipur Toll-station	5,264	4,297	3,488	2,785	2,77[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	1,953	[illegible]
Swarupganj, ditto	[illegible]	6,803	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]
Total	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]

Abolition of the office of the Additional Legal Remembrancer.

30. Babu SURENDRA NARAYAN SINHA: (a) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to say why the same course of action, as has been followed in the case of the Director of Public Information, has not been followed in the case of the abolition of the post of Additional Legal Remembrancer and his staff?

(b) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state whether the Additional Legal Remembrancer and his staff were consulted before taking this step in order to ascertain whether they had anything to say on the matter, as also to judge whether they or any of them were likely to suffer in any way by the sudden abolition of the Department before the stipulated date?

(c) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state whether the Government propose to compensate those who have been put to pecuniary loss in consequence of the abolition of the Department before the time guaranteed by them?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (a) The Director of Information is not an officer under the Judicial Department. In accordance with the vote of the Legislative Council his services were dispensed with

immediately on the conclusion of the period covered by the terms of his agreement with Government.

Retention of the Additional Legal Remembrancer and his staff was permitted by the Government of India, subject to the sanction of the Secretary of State for India which did not arrive before the posts were abolished in accordance with the vote of the Legislative Council. The two cases were therefore different and could not be treated alike.

(b) The Legislative Council refused to vote for the demand for the grant provided in the current year's budget for the Additional Legal Remembrancer and his staff. For this decision the member who has asked this question together with those who voted with him against the demand, are responsible, and it was for them to consider the possible effects of their action before recording their votes. It is not correct to say, as is assumed in the question, that there was any stipulation that the Department should continue for any particular period.

(c) No. The necessary notice of one month was given to the Additional Legal Remembrancer and his staff. It is not correct, as is assumed in the question, that the Department was guaranteed to be continued for any specific period.

Sub-jail clerks.

31. **Babu SURENDRA NARAYAN SINHA:** (a) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Jails) be pleased to state what steps, if any, Government are taking on the several memorials submitted to them by the sub-jail clerks?

(b) Is it a fact that the sub-jail clerks have been working on the same pay since 1909, and that no increment whatever has been granted to them?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (a) The report of the committee appointed to advise Government on the revision of the pay of ministerial officers is now under consideration.

No separate action is being taken on the memorials.

(b) No. They have been in receipt of *ad-interim* allowances.

Wages of tea garden coolies.

32. **Babu SURENDRA NARAYAN SINHA:** Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Commerce be pleased to state whether the Government are taking any steps to fix the daily wages of the coolies working in the tea gardens of Bengal?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of COMMERCE (the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr): The answer is in the negative.

Improvements in the salaries of the staffs of Victoria and Dow Hill Schools, Kurseong.

33. Mr. H. A. STARK: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of European Education be pleased to say whether the Government are considering the desirability of giving effect to the proposed improvements in the salaries of the staffs of Victoria and Dow Hill Schools, Kurseong, and for which special grants have been voted, at least so far as the present teachers are concerned, within the current financial year?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: The answer is in the affirmative: it is hoped that orders will issue shortly

Bulli bil scheme.

34. Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation be pleased to refer to my unstarred question No. 65 for the meeting of the 1st April, 1921, and state whether the Bulli *bil* scheme as prepared will be published for public information after the scrutiny and revision by the department mentioned in reply thereto?

(*b*) Has any representation reached the Government with reference to the said scheme, stating what kind of canal is necessary for and desired by the people of the locality?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) It is not the intention of Government to publish the scheme for public information after it has been revised by the Department

(*b*) A representation from the Sibhati-Sangrampore Union Committee has been received on this subject which will be duly considered by the Department

Baraset-Basirhat Light Railway.

35. Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Have the complaints attracted the notice of the Government—

(*i*) that passengers on the Baraset-Basirhat Light Railway suffer much from want of accommodation;

(*ii*) that trains, especially the night train, run very late on that line, causing much inconvenience to the passengers; and

(*iii*) that the seats and cushions in the first class compartments are in an extremely bad condition?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works be pleased to refer to the answer given on the 1st of April

last to my unstarred question No. 103 and state whether the Government are considering the desirability of drawing the attention of the management of the said light railway to these complaints and of requesting them to take adequate steps to prevent the recurrence of such accidents in the future?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (a) (i), (ii) and (iii) No complaints in regard to the three specific points mentioned in the question have reached Government.

(b) The question of the defective lighting of carriages in the evening trains running on the Baraset Basirhat Light Railway referred to in unstarred question No. 103 put by the member at the meeting of the Legislative Council on the 1st April, 1921, has been taken up with the administration of the railway, and the matter is at present under inquiry with a view to improving the lighting arrangements of the evening trains.

The statistics of accidents will be brought to the notice of the management and they will be requested to take early and adequate steps to reduce the possibility of accidents to a minimum in future.

Bakarganj Maghs.

36. Babu NIBARAN CHANDRA DAS GUPTA: (a) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the Maghs or the Arakanese of the Bakarganj Sundarbans were the pioneers in the work of reclamation of the Bakarganj Sundarbans, since pre-British days?

(b) Is it a fact that they were induced or attracted to settle and [illegible] by being given permanent rights in the lands they reclaimed [illegible] Government *khas mahals* as well as under private talukdars?

(c) Is it a fact that after the passing of Bengal Act II of 1918 those Maghs have been declared to be "aborigines," and have thus been deprived of their rights of free transferability of their holdings and tenures and that restraints have been put upon such rights?

(d) Is it a fact that such rights were recognised and recorded in the course of the last settlement operations?

(e) Are the Government aware that a great deal of feeling of unrest has been created among the Magh population?

(f) Is it a fact that they approached the Bengal Provincial Conference at its last session at Barisal with a view to join the non-co-operation movement in the event of their grievances on this score not being removed?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (a) In the District Gazetteer it is stated that the Maghs

came from Arrakan at the end of the 18th century, reclaimed the Rabnabad islands and then spread over the Sundarbans; also that they are excellent reclaimers of forest, but are somewhat indifferent as permanent raiyats, partly because they have a rooted objection to paying rent.

(*b*) No information to this effect is available.

(*c*) Yes, within the police-stations of Amtoli, Galachipa and Barguna.

(*d*) Raiyati holdings in Government estates were entered as "transferable."

(*e*) No. There is no unrest; the Maghs dislike the restriction provided by Bengal Act, II of 1918, on the transfer of their holdings, though without it, it is reported that they would soon be expropriated.

(*f*) A few Maghs were induced to attend the last Bengal Provincial Conference at Barisal in the expectation of seeing and hearing Mahatma Gandhi, who was alleged to be the incarnation of Buddha. It does not appear that they had any intention of joining the non-co-operation movement.

Shooting incident at Kalighat Tram Depôt.

37. Babu JATINDRA NATH BASU: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to say whether the inquiry into the shooting and killing of a passer-by by a policeman at the Kalighat Tramway Depôt has concluded?

(*b*) If so, when do the Government propose to publish the proceedings and the result of the inquiry?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state whether any action is intended to be taken in the matter of regulating the use of firearms by the police?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) and (*b*) The report of the Additional District Magistrate and the resolution of Government thereon were published in the *Calcutta Gazette* of the 22nd June.

(*c*) No further action is intended as instructions regulating the use of firearms by the police are already in existence. A resume of these instructions is contained in the answer given to unstarred question No. 25 at the Council meeting of the 14th March, 1921.

Establishment of a technical school in Calcutta.

38. Babu JATINDRA NATH BASU: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state what progress has been made in the establishment of a technical school at Calcutta.

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: The site for the school in Corporation Street is now being acquired and it is expected that building operations will shortly commence. The Governing Body for the school has recently been appointed by Government.

Alleged ill-treatment of a poor female phthisis patient at the Medical College Hospital.

39. Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: (a) Has the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government inquired into the grievance of Dr. Samanta, M.L., complaining about the discharge of, and treatment towards, a helpless and poor female patient, who was suffering from phthisis and subsequently contracted chicken-pox at the Medical College Hospital?

(b) Does the Hon'ble the Minister contemplate taking any steps to remedy such an undesirable state of things obtaining in the Calcutta Medical College?

(c) Have the Government taken any notice of the conduct of the nurse and the Hospital Superintendent in connection with this matter?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (a), (b) and (c) [illegible] to his starred question No. II.

Report in connection with the firing at Kalighat.

40. Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: (a) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to state whether they have received any report from the Special Inquiry Officer [illegible] with the firing at Kalighat during the recent tramway [illegible]?

(b) If so, will the Member in charge be pleased to place the same [illegible]?

(c) What steps have Government taken or what steps do they propose to take in regard to this matter?

(d) Is it the intention of Government to publish the report?

(e) Have the Government come to any decision as to whether the shooting was justified?

(f) If not, how have they dealt with the officers concerned?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: Attention is invited to the reply to starred question No. VI.

Silting up of river Chandana in Goalundo.

41. Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA: (a) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation aware that the mouth of

the river Chandana in the subdivision of Goalundo, district Faridpur, is silted up?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state whether there have been any projects, before the Government during the last 25 years to dredge the silted portion so as to make the river navigable?

(*c*) If so, what has been the decision of Government on those projects?

(*d*) If no projects have been submitted, are the Government considering the desirability of drawing up an estimate for dredging operations of the silted portions of the river at an early date?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) It is known that the Chandana river has silted up during the last century.

(*b*) No projects for its silt clearance have been made out during the last 25 years.

(*c*) The question does not arise.

(*d*) Government are unable to make any survey at present owing to the paucity of men in the department and, in consequence, cannot state when the project could be examined for purposes of framing estimates, etc.

Inspector of Judicial Offices.

42. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to state

(*i*) whether the post of Inspector of Judicial Offices shown in page 183 of the quarterly Civil List is a permanent post or a temporary one,

(*ii*) if it be temporary, why is it shown as vacant in the Civil List,

(*iii*) if it be permanent, how long has the vacancy in the post continued; and

(*iv*) when is it likely to be filled up?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of taking the claims of the members of the Bengal Civil Service (Judicial) into consideration at the time of filling up the appointment?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (*a*) (*i*), (*ii*), (*iii*) and (*iv*) The post was created on grounds largely personal to Mr. Watson, who is considered to be an expert in office methods. He went on long leave, with effect from the 25th March, 1918, and the post was left vacant temporarily pending his return from leave, as no suitable officer was available to officiate in his place. Mr. Watson vacated the post permanently on his appointment as Inspector of Office Procedure under the Government of India, with effect from the 1st June, 1920, and the matter is under

correspondence with the Government of India regarding the further retention of the post. This is the reason the post is shown vacant in the Civil List.

(b) Does not arise at present.

Suspension of work for "Juma" prayer.

43. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to state

(a) whether effect is being given to the resolution passed in the last session about suspension of work in courts and offices for ½ hours for *Juma* prayer each Friday, and

(b) if not, from when such effect is proposed to be given and the reason for the delay in giving effect to it?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (a) Yes, a copy of the Government order is laid on the library table. The High Court will be addressed when the printed proceedings of the Legislative Council on this subject are available.

(b) Does not arise.

Grievances of the sub-jail clerks.

44. Babu SAILAJA NATH ROY CHAUDHURI: (a) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Jails) aware of the following alleged grievances of the subordinate clerks, viz., that they are not promoted to the post of assistant jailor though experienced in jail duties and equally qualified?

Are the Government considering the desirability of revising their scale of pay?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (a) and (b) Yes. The points were raised in the memorial which they submitted to Government. Government is considering the report of the committee appointed to advise on the revision of the pay of non-ministerial officers in Bengal.

Offer of houses for courts and quarters of Munsifs at Gopalganj.

45. Babu BHISHMADEV DAS: (a) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to state whether any offer of houses for courts and quarters of Munsifs has been made by the public of Gopalganj?

(b) Is it in the contemplation of the Government to accept the offer?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (a) A memorial was received from Babu Kedareswar Ray and others offering certain houses for the

courts and residences for Munsifs at Gopalganj and they have been asked to submit definite proposals through the District Judge.

(*b*) The member is referred to the answer given to (*b*) of the question asked by him at the meeting of the 1st April, 1921, regarding the removal of the munsifi from Bhanga.

Jailors and jail superintendents.

46. Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Jails) be pleased to state whether, as recommended by the Jail Committee of 1919-20, Government are considering the desirability of appointing wholetime superintendents for large district jails and for central jails (*vide* paragraphs 31, 32 and 33 of the report)?

(*b*) What steps, if any, have been taken by the Government to recruit whole-time superintendents for district jails from the ranks of jailors?

(*c*) In regard to the recommendations contained in paragraph 52 of the report

(*i*) what steps are being taken by the Government to raise the pay and status of jailors,

(*ii*) whether Government are prepared to give immediate effect to the recommendations of the committee, so far as they lay down that "in future all jailors should be gazetted officers. This is important as giving them social and official status entitling them to a seat in a collector's durbar on official occasions and generally placing them in the position which their undoubted responsibilities demand", and

(*iii*) whether the appointment of deputy jailors and the clerical staff is in contemplation, as recommended in paragraphs 42 and 44 of the report?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: The recommendations of the Jail Committee are under the consideration of Government.

"Ramzan" and Muslim convicts.

47. Mr. RAZAUR RAHMAN KHAN: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Jails) be pleased to state what facilities are at present afforded to Muslim convicts in jails to enable them to observe the fast during the month of *Ramzan*?

(*b*) In case no facilities are afforded, are the Government considering it advisable to issue instructions that during the month of *Ramzan* Muslim convicts be allowed facilities to enable them to take their meals in the latter part of the night, in order that they may observe the fast during the day?

(c) Are the Government also considering the desirability of issuing instruction to put lighter tasks on Muslim convicts during the month of *Ramzan*?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (a) Muhammadan prisoners wishing to observe the fast during the month of *Ramzan* are generally allowed to do so and are given two rations at night.

(b) This question does not arise.

(c) The Indian Jail Committee have in their report observed that they could not recommend any relaxation of labour to the prisoners during *Ramzan*, as such a concession in jail would be to put them in a better position than the honest poor outside. Government, however, are considering the question.

Selection of successor to present Superintendent of Sericulture and certain works of the Department of Sericulture.

48. Rai Sahib NILMANI CHATAK: (a) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state whether any selection has been made of the successor to the present Superintendent of Sericulture, Bengal, who is about to retire in view of the suggestions made in the meeting of the Bengal Silk Committee held on the 19th September, 1919?

(b) If so, will the Hon'ble the Minister state the name of the person selected as also his qualifications?

Has the Director of Agriculture, Bengal, made any suggestions as regards the selection, and will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to lay on the table his recommendations?

(c) What are the results obtained from the sericulture researches made by the department? What is the income derived from these, and what has been the expenditure incurred?

(d) Is any one of the sericultural staff given a practical training in the management of the silk-worm seed rearing nurseries in the province?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (a) The suggestions made in the meeting of the Bengal Silk Committee held on the 19th September 1919, relate to the appointment of a Deputy Director of Sericulture, and it is presumed that the question refers to this post. Rai Sahib Aparba Kumar Ghose, Superintendent of Sericulture officiated as Deputy Director of Sericulture from the 1st April, 1921, till his retirement on the 3rd June 1921. The question of appointing a permanent incumbent to the post has been referred through the Government of India to the Secretary of State. In the meantime Mr. Prabhat Chandra Chaudhuri has been appointed to act as Deputy Director.

(*b*) and (*c*) As the matter has been referred to the Secretary of State, this Government are not at present in a position to give any further information on the subject.

(*d*) For the result so far achieved, the number is referred to the report of the Agriculture Department for 1919-20. The amount spent up to March, 1921, on sericultural researches, was Rs. 2,32,549 and the receipts amounted to Rs. 6,549. The total expenditure and receipts of the Sericultural Department amounted to Rs. 12,10,176 and Rs. 3,59,447, respectively.

(*e*) All the officers of the Sericultural Department, except the Superintendent in charge of sericultural research, receive practical training in the management of the seed-rearing nurseries.

Rai Sahib NILMANI CHATAK: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries kindly state whether he has received any information from the Collector of Murshidabad, since these questions were put, about the research made in the Berhampur Central Nursery?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: No.

Water-hyacinth committee.

49. Babu BHISHMADEV DAS: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state when the water-hyacinth committee will be formed?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: The member is referred to resolution No. 2221 Agri., dated the 20th June, 1921, published in Part I, page 1026, of the *Calcutta Gazette* of the 22nd idem.

Privilege leave to members of the Bengal Civil (Judicial) Service.

50. Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to state when they intend to make provision for privilege leave on full pay for members of the Judicial Branch of the Bengal Civil Service?

(*b*) For what period will such leave be allowed?

(*c*) Will the Government be pleased to state whether they are considering the desirability of granting extension to those gazetted officers who are both physically and mentally fit to do their duties?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (*a*) and (*b*) The matter is still under the consideration of the Government of India.

(*c*) The present rule governing the matter is: "Officers other than ministerial, who have attained the age of 55, should ordinarily be

required to retire and should not be retained in service except where unquestionable public grounds exist and there is no doubt as to the physical fitness of the officer," and the Government do not propose to reopen the question.

Steps to enlighten cultivators on the results of the experimental farms.

51. Babu JOGENDRA NATH ROY: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state what steps have been taken by the Government to enlighten the cultivators on the results obtained in the Government experimental farms?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: The member is referred to the replies given to unstarred questions [illegible] and [illegible] and 34 [illegible] asked by Babu Sarat Chandra Chakravarty and Babu Fanindralal De in the Council meetings of 4th August, 1920 and 14th March, 1921, respectively.

Board of Agriculture or a Board of the Agricultural Department in Bengal.

52. Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: (a) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state whether there is a Board of Agriculture or a Board of the Agricultural Department in Bengal?

(b) If the answer to clause (a) be in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what are the functions of the Board and who are its members?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (a) There is a Board of the Agricultural Department in Bengal.

(b) The functions of the Board are to advise Government on matters referred to them for opinion or on any other matters which the President may consider suitable for discussion. The following are its members:

(1) Director of Agriculture, Bengal, *ex officio* President.
(2) The Deputy Directors of Agriculture, Bengal.
(3) The Agricultural Experts in Bengal.
(4) Veterinary Adviser to the Government of Bengal.

Resignation tendered by sub-deputy collectors.

53. Maulvi MUHAMMAD MADASSUR HUSSAIN: (a) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state how many sub-deputy collectors have resigned service during the past three years?

(*b*) What are their names, the period of their service, and the grades they occupied before resignation?

(*c*) Is it a fact that very recently a Muhammadan sub-deputy collector posted at Ghatal, in the district of Midnapore, has tendered his resignation?

(*d*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to lay on the table the letter of resignation, if any, which the officer might have tendered?

(*e*) Has the resignation been accepted?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) Four.

(*b*) (*i*) Manindra Lal Banarji—7 years; sub *pro tem.* 4th grade. (*ii*) Sudhir Kumar Gupta—4 months; probationer. (*iii*) Satish Chandra Gupta—10 years 2 months; 3rd grade. (*iv*) Khalilur Rahaman Khan—5 years 2 months; 4th grade.

(*c*) Yes.

(*d*) Government are not prepared to lay on the table the letter in question. This officer complained of the conditions of service and did not wish to continue in Government employ.

(*e*) Yes.

Licenses for firearms.

54. Babu NALINI NATH ROY: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department kindly state the number of applications for firearms made by the people of Bengal and the number of such licenses issued by the Government, district by district, and year by year, for the last ten years?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: The figures are being obtained and will be laid on the table at a subsequent meeting.

Chandpur outrage and alleged irregularities of certain officials.

55. Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: Has the attention of the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department been drawn to the report of Babu Akhil Chandra Datta on the Chandpur outrage and, if so, will he kindly state—

(*i*) what steps have been taken to ascertain and remove the alleged grievances of the coolies of the tea gardens of Assam, and

(*ii*) what steps have been, or are being, taken on the alleged irregularities of Mr Wares, the District Magistrate, Mr K. C. De, the Commissioner, Chittagong Division, and Mr MacPherson, the alleged representative of the Tea Association?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: Yes.

(*i*) The question of such an investigation is one for the Government of Assam. The Government of Bengal have no information concerning it.

(n) Assuming the question to be an inquiry whether Government have censured or punished the two officers named in respect of the incidents at Chandpur on the 19th and 20th May, the answer is in the negative. Mr. MacPherson is not subject to the orders of this Government.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: Has the attention of the Government been drawn to the description of an interview between Babu Akhil Chandra Datta and Messrs. De and Wates as published in the press?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: The member is repeating the question. We have seen the description of the interview.

The PRESIDENT: I disallow the question.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: Will the Hon'ble Member be pleased to state whether any attempt has been made by Government to find out if the description of the interview is true or not?

The PRESIDENT: The member is again cross-examining. I therefore disallow it.

Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: Will the Hon'ble Member be pleased to say whether any inquiry has been made into the irregularities referred to in that question?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: There have been inquiries made into the incident at Chandpur and full details of the result of the inquiries were given in a recent communiqué published under the authority of this Government.

Case of one Shaikh Muhammad Dhunker and a head constable and a chaukidar at Rajbari.

56. Maulvi ABDUL KARIM: (a) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department aware

(i) that in December 1920, one Shaikh Muhammad Dhunker complained to the Magistrate at Rajbari in the district of Faridpur charging a head constable named Nibaran Chandra Guha and a chaukidar named Raghunath with having entered his house and assaulted him;

(ii) that almost simultaneously the said head constable brought a counter case against the said Shaikh Muhammad Dhunker under section 34 of Act V of 1861;

(iii) that in the former case the chaukidar was found guilty and sentenced to 3 months' rigorous imprisonment by the court, while in the latter case the Dhunker was fined by an Honorary Magistrate named Babu Madhab Chandra Bagchi and

(iv) that thereupon the Dhunker having filed an appeal to the District Magistrate, was acquitted by the latter, who disbelieved the case for the prosecution?

(b) Is the Hon'ble the Member also aware—

(i) that in connection with the above case Shaikh Muhammad Dhunker in his appeal to the District Magistrate charged the Honorary Magistrate with having tampered with the record and changed dates of his orders and asked for an inquiry about the same; and

(ii) that the Magistrate in his judgment on appeal remarked as follows:—"Very serious allegations have been made against the Honorary Magistrate in this case and have been supported by an affidavit. They may or may not be true, but, if true, they render him unfit to hold the position of an Honorary Magistrate. The Subdivisional Officer should personally make an inquiry into these allegations and submit a report by the 10th April"

(c) Are the Government considering the desirability of making an inquiry as to what action has been taken by the Subdivisional Officer in pursuance of the orders of the District Magistrate?

(d) Has any inquiry been made

(i) why the said head constable, Nibaran Chandra Guha, was not tried and dealt with under the law, while his accomplice the chaukidar was punished with imprisonment, and

(ii) whether the said head constable has been departmentally or otherwise punished for having "trumped" up a false case as found by the trying Magistrate?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: Government are not aware of the facts. Information is being obtained and will be furnished at a subsequent meeting.

Primary education for girls.

57. Maulvi ABDUL KARIM: (a) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state what is the monthly average allotment to a primary school for girls from public funds in 1919-20 and 1920-21?

(b) Are the Government considering the desirability of allotting additional funds to the district boards and the municipalities for the improvement of primary education for girls in the current year?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (a) The average direct expenditure from public funds for a girls' primary school in 1919-20 was Rs. 4 a month. The figure for 1920-21 is not yet known.

(*b*) There being no provision in the budget it is not proposed to give any additional funds for the improvement of primary education for girls during the current year.

Number of Bengal students in Imperial Forest School and the annual expenditure thereon.

58. Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA BAHADUR: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to state the number of forestry students yearly sent from Bengal at the cost of the Government for training in the Imperial Forest School, Dehra Dun, the number of students sent last year, and the yearly cost under this head?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: The number of students varies and depends on the requirements of the Forest Department of the Province.

The number of Forest students sent to Dehra Dun Institute and College during 1920 was seven, one for the Provincial Service course and the remaining six for the Ranger's course.

The Provincial Service student is granted a stipend of Rs. 50 per mensem and the Ranger's course students receive Rs. 35 each per mensem, besides travelling allowances.

Opening the silted-up junction of Padma and Hooghly rivers.

59. Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation be pleased to state whether Government intend to take immediate steps for opening the junction of the rivers Padma and Hooghly, which has silted up, forming a *char* of about 2 miles in length, with a view to make this particular portion of the two rivers navigable during all seasons?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: There is no present intention of clearing the entrance of the Bhagirathi river deep enough to afford navigation facilities throughout the season. The proposals of improvement are receiving the attention of the Government, and the recommendations of a Committee appointed to advise on the subject, *vide communiqué* of 17th February, 1917, are being given effect to as funds and staff permit.

Settlement buildings at Jessore.

60. Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to state what was the cost of erecting the settlement buildings at Jessore?

(*b*) What do the Government propose to do with them after the settlement operations are over?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) Rs. 1,46,761.

(*b*) Unless the Settlement Officer's residence is required for an Additional Judge, it will be available for the Collector, who now lives in a private house. The materials of the press shed can be used in another settlement. It has not yet been decided to what use the vernacular office can be put, but the Jessore settlement will require all the buildings for two years more and the buildings may afterwards be used for the Khulna settlement.

Tolly's nala.

61. Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation be pleased to state what steps have been taken for the canalization or other improvement of the Tolly's *nala*, and for the construction of new bridges and the widening of existing bridges over the said *nala*?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: Besides maintenance and periodical silt clearance works, the following steps have been taken in connection with the canalization or other improvement of the Tolly's *nala*, and for the construction of bridges and widening of bridges over the said *nala* during the last 20 years: —

(*a*) Construction of a sluice at Samukpota. Work undertaken. Estimated cost Rs. 1,50,519. Nearly completed and will be in operation during the current rainy season. This project of partial canalization has in view the improvement of the *nala* by flushing arranged by suitable working of sluice.

(*b*) Project of lock and sluice on the Tolly's *nala* at the mouth of the Kaorapukur khal has been sanctioned and work started during 1921-22. Estimated cost Rs. 1,92,619.

(*c*) Project for replacing the Kalighat bridge structure by a new bridge with wider roadway to carry tram cars was sanctioned in 1906 and works carried out. Estimated amount Rs. 50,000.

(*d*) Project for replacing the old bridge with plank roadway at Zeerut, by a wider and stronger bridge structure sanctioned in 1904, and works carried out. Estimated amount Rs. 54,000.

(*e*) Project for replacing the existing Kidderpore bridge by a new bridge with broader roadway and wider span, sanctioned in 1920. Work in progress. Estimated cost Rs. 10,25,324.

Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: May I ask whether any steps have been taken for the widening of the narrow bridges over the Tolly's *nala*—I mean the Tollygunge bridge and the Alipur bridge? There have been complaints by the residents of the locality.

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: The matter has been from time to time receiving the attention of the Irrigation Department but at present there is no proposal to widen these bridges.

Re-excavation of the Saraswati river.

62. Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation be pleased to state whether it is a fact that Babu Rakhal Chandra Ghosal and other leading residents of Bangchipota, Anandanagar and thirteen other villages within the jurisdiction of the Anandanagar and Kholsini union boards of the district of Hooghly, have been submitting representations to the Government since 1912 for the re-excavation of the river Saraswati; and, if so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state why no steps have been taken up to date on the said representations?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: Representations were made by Babu Rakhal Chandra Ghosal and others in 1912 and 1916 for supply of fresh water into the Saraswati river. Such supplies were sent down as soon as the Damodar river water could be drawn into the Kananadi by construction of the sand dam which is put up across the Damodar river annually in the dry season, and the petitioners were informed of the action taken. Lately a representation, dated 25th May, 1921, from Babu Rakhal Chandra Ghosal and others, has been received, which will be duly considered when local officers' reports on the improvement of the khal bed and possibility of an assured supply in the dry season, which have been called for, have been received.

Fees for registration of undergraduates of the Calcutta University.

63. Mr. H. S. SUHRAWARDY: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to say whether it is a fact that the Calcutta University intends to increase the fees for the registration of undergraduates?

(*b*) If so, by how much, and what action, if any, do the Government propose to take in the matter?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) The Calcutta University has applied to this Government for authority to increase the registration fee from Rs. 2 to Rs. 5. The matter is under the consideration of Government.

Rule regarding reservation of berths in trains.

64. Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works be pleased to say whether it is a fact that there is a rule that no berth in any train in Bengal can be reserved without previously purchasing a ticket?

(*b*) If so, is this rule strictly observed in the case of Europeans?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) and (*b*) The local Government have no information and the member is referred to the Railway Board.

Measures to check the decrease of cows and bullocks.

65. Rai LALIT MOHAN SINGH ROY Bahadur: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries aware that milch cows and plough bullocks are decreasing? If so, what remedies are the Government adopting to mitigate the evil?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that some private associations have been formed to solve the cattle problem?

(*c*) Is the Government aware that a representation was made last February by the members of the All-India Cow Conference Association, Calcutta, to His Excellency the Viceroy? If so, is the local Government aware whether the Imperial Government are ready to accept their suggestions?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) No. From Appendix IV to the Cattle Census Report of 1920, it will appear that since 1912 the numbers of milch cows and plough bullocks have increased by 1,007,601 and 141,878, respectively. A copy of the report is placed on the library table.

(*b*) Government are aware that an association calling itself the All-India Cow Conference Association has been formed. They have no information regarding the existence of other associations with similar objects.

(*c*) This Government received a copy of the representation made to the Viceroy by the All-India Cow Conference Association in February last, but are not aware what action, if any, is being taken by the Government of India on the representation.

Failure of crops in the "bil" areas of pargana Talihati in Faridpur.

66. Babu BHISHMADEV DAS: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation be pleased to state what steps Government are taking to prevent the repeated failures of crops in the *bil* areas of pargana Talihati in Faridpur, consequent on the early flooding of the low lands for the last eight or nine years?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: The Government in the Irrigation Department have no information of the early flooding in the *bil* areas of the Faridpur district during the last eight or nine years; hence the reply is in the negative.

Muhammadans in the ministerial staff.

67. Maulvi SHAH ABDUR RAUF: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state whether the circular No. 3386 A., dated Calcutta, the 20th April, 1914, emphasising that one-third of the appointments in the ministerial staff should be given to the Muhammadans is being adhered to?

(*b*) If not, are the Government considering the desirability of taking steps to give the Muhammadans a fair representation in the ministerial staff?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) and (*b*) Government attach great importance to compliance with the circular in question and adhere to it as a statement of the policy to be followed.

Bengal Civil Service (Judicial).

68. Maulvi YAKUINUDDIN AHMED: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to state

(*i*) whether the Government propose to introduce a new system of recruitment for the members of the Bengal Civil Service—Judicial Branch,

(*ii*) if so, when is it likely to be brought into force;

(*iii*) what principle is going to be adopted for recruitment for the Judicial Service;

(*iv*) whether the Government intend to take the case of the Muhammadan candidates into their special consideration;

(*v*) by what system the candidates already enrolled will be recruited;

(*vi*) what would be the age-limit according to the new system, and

(*vii*) what will be the fate of the candidates who have already been enrolled

(*1*) whose age does not exceed that fixed under the new system; and

(*2*) whose age exceeds that fixed under the new system?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (*i*), (*ii*), (*iii*) and (*iv*) No definite statement can be made now as the matter is still under consideration and is the subject of correspondence with the High Court, which under section 7 (*1*) of the Bengal, Agra and Assam Civil Courts

Act has the power to make nominations, and with the Government of India.

(*v*), (*vi*) and (*vii*) The matter will be considered when the new rules on the subject are finally made.

Progress in Damodar flood mitigation works.

69. Babu BIJOY PROSAD SINGH ROY: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation be pleased to state what progress, if any, has been made in the following schemes, or when are they likely to be taken in hand in connection with the Damodar flood mitigation works, since the reply given on the 7th February last to Babu Fanindralal De, viz:—

(*1*) the scheme for making a cut from Muchihana on the Damodar river to the entrance of the Begua channel;

(*2*) the scheme for making a drainage cut from the low-lying lands north-west of Lakra to the Begua channel in place of the silted-up Bachurdha khal;

(*3*) the scheme for excavating the drainage cut from Narendrapore to Kumirkhola onwards to Baxi khal;

(*4*) the scheme for extending the Gispati cut northwards by about two miles to tap a larger spill area;

(*5*) the proposals for drainage cuts from Behulachuck and Tala basins; and

(*6*) the improvement of Arora khal south-west of Khanakul?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: The progress of the schemes mentioned in the question is as below:—

(*1*) Scheme for a cut from Muchihana to the Begua entrance channel.—A preliminary estimate has been prepared by the Executive Engineer, which is being scrutinized by the Superintending Engineer, who is also collecting and examining what the actual flood level was in the locality in previous years to enable him to gauge the effects of the proposed works.

(*2*) Project for a cut from Lakra to the Begua channel in place of the silted-up Bachurdha khal.—Surveys necessary for the preparation of the estimate have been completed.

(*3*) Scheme for a drainage cut from Narendrapore to Kumirkhola onwards to Baxi khal.—Necessary surveys have been completed and preparation of estimate is in hand.

(*4*) Scheme for extending the Gispati cut to tap a larger spill area.—Surveys completed and preparation of estimate is in hand.

(5) Scheme for a drainage cut from Behulachuck to Tala basins.—The local officers are preparing a report on the scheme.

(6) Improvement of the Arora khal.—An estimate has been prepared, but some revision is necessary. The work of revision is in hand.

Subordinate Educational Service.

70. Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to supply a statement giving the following information:—

(i) the names of teachers who have been in the subordinate educational service for 16, 17, 18, 19 and 20 years;

(ii) their present pay, with allowance, if any, in the graded system; and

(iii) the pay they would expect to get if the time-scale system of pay be given effect to?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (i) (ii) A copy of the Subordinate Education Service list is laid on the library table.

(iii) No orders have yet been passed with regard to the adoption of a time-scale. Therefore the question does not arise.

Kalighat shooting incident in connection with tramways strike.

71. Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: (a) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to lay on the table a copy of the report of the Additional District Magistrate of the 24-Parganas on the Kalighat shooting incident in connection with the tramways strike?

(b) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to lay on the table the observations of the District Magistrate, 24-Parganas, and of the Commissioner, Presidency Division, if any, on the said report?

(c) When was the report submitted to the Government?

(d) Has the Government been pleased to pass any orders on the report?

(e) If so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to lay a copy of the same on the table?

(f) Have the Government recorded any opinion as to whether the shooting was in any way justifiable?

(g) How have the Government dealt with the officers concerned if they have been judged to blame?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (a), (d), (e), (f), (g) The report of the Additional District Magistrate and the Government resolution on the subject were published in the *Calcutta Gazette* of the 22nd June. A copy is laid on the library table.

(*b*) and (*c*) The record of the inquiry and the Additional District Magistrate's report were received by Government on the 27th April, through the District Magistrate, 24-Parganas, and the Commissioner of the Presidency Division. Government do not propose to lay on the table a copy of the letters of the District Magistrate and the Commissioner.

Improvement of Tolly's nala.

72. Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation be pleased to state whether any steps are being or are intended to be taken by the Government for improving the present condition of Tolly's *nala*? If so, when?

(*b*) On whom lies the responsibility of improving the same? Is it on the Government, or on the Port Commissioners, or on the Calcutta Corporation?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state what was the amount of the toll collected from boats coming into the said *nala* during the last three years?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) A masonry sluice has been constructed at the Samukpota end of the Tolly's *nala* as an experimental measure and will be operated from the present rainy season. The object in view is to regulate the tides from and to the river Bidyadhari into the Tolly's *nala* and thereby induce a stronger tide from the river Hooghly, which may flush the Tolly's *nala* and scour out the bed and automatically improve it.

(*b*) The Government are responsible for the maintenance of the *nala* which is declared under section 2 of the Bengal Canals Act, V of 1864.

(*c*) The gross toll receipts during the last three years are given below:—

	Rs.
1918-19	85,036
1919-20	66,959
1920-21	62,430

Committee's Report on the railway construction between Dacca and Aricha.

73. Babu BROJENDRA KISHOR RAY CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works be pleased to state whether the Government have received any report

from the Committee which was appointed to consider the question of construction of a railway between Dacca and Aricha?

(*b*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to say whether he Government are considering the desirability of publishing the eport at an early date?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) No.

(*b*) The question does not arise.

Bhowal "sanyasi."

74. Mr. RAZAUR RAHMAN KHAN: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Mem-er in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) aware of he existence of a *sanyasi* at Jaydebpur who alleges himself to be the econd Kumar of the Bhowal Raj, supposed to have died twelve years go?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Member also aware of the conviction of a arge body of influential men of Dacca and other places, as to the identity f the *sanyasi* with the second Kumar; and also of the intense feeling of he tenants of the Bhowal Raj in favour of the claim of the *sanyasi*?

(*c*) In case the answers to clauses (*a*) and (*b*) are in the affirmative, hat steps are the Government taking to clear the situation, and allay he misgiving of the tenants of the Bhowal Raj?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of URDWAN: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) Newspaper reports purporting to this effect have appeared.

(*c*) The matter is one of primary concern to the Board of Revenue hich has instructed the Collector of Dacca to issue the following otice:

Notice is hereby given to all the tenants of the Bhowal estate that the Board of evenue has got conclusive proof that the dead body of the second Kumar of Bhowal as burnt to ashes 12 years ago at Darjeeling. Therefore the *sadhu* who alleges mself to be the second Kumar of Bhowal is an imposter. Any one paying rent or bscription to him will do so at his own risk.

Dacca Board of Secondary and Intermediate Education.

75. Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble e Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state e composition and functions of the Dacca Board of Secondary and Inter-ediate Education?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to explain why the oard was not created by Statute, but was set up by executive orders?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether the oard of Secondary and Intermediate Education for Bengal will be eated by Statute?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) and (*b*) The member's attention is invited to the notifications of this Government in the Education Department, No. 1011 Edn., dated the 7th May, 1921, and No. 1101 Edn., dated the 30th May, 1921.

(*c*) The Government of Bengal are not prepared to make any definite statement about the establishment of a Board of Secondary and Intermediate Education for the Presidency of Bengal as a whole, but the member's attention is drawn to the opening sentence of paragraph 7 of this Government's resolution No. 1011 Edn., dated the 7th May, 1921.

Regulating the price of jute.

76. Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state whether the Government are considering desirability of taking steps to regulate the price of jute in the interests of cultivators?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: The answer is in the negative.

Application for the post of District Judge and the appointment thereof.

77. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state—

(*i*) the number of applications received for the post of District judge advertised as vacant in January last;

(*ii*) the names of the applicants and their respective qualifications, and

(*iii*) the name of the successful candidate?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*i*) 119.

(*ii*) As this information is of a confidential nature, Government are unable to give it.

(*iii*) Mr. Khagendra Chandra Nag.

Effect to the recommendations of the Wordsworth Committee.

78. Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the report of the Wordsworth Committee was submitted to Government in February, 1921?

(*b*) If so, what progress has been made up to this time towards giving effect to the recommendations made therein?

:) Do the Government propose to take any immediate action on recommendations with such modifications as the Hon'ble the Minis- ay think proper?

?) If so, from what date will the scheme be given effect to?

ne Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*), (*c*) and (*d*) The report is still under the consideration of Govern-, but they hope to be able to make a definite pronouncement at an date.

tions attaching to the post of Additional Legal Remembrancer.

. Babu SURENDRA NARAYAN SINHA: In regard to the tion of the post of Additional Legal Remembrancer, will the ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased ate—

(i) who will perform the functions entrusted to the Department and the duties attached to the post;

(ii) how many criminal cases, in spite of the recommendation of the Police Department, were refused sanction by Mr. P. L. Roy during his tenure of office, and

(iii) whether it is a fact that some time ago the Government of India expressed their intention that there should be appointed a competent Indian lawyer to examine into and advise on the big criminal prosecution cases before they are launched by the police, as a safeguard against unnecessary expenditure and harassment?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (*i*) The same agency as used to be employed in this class of case before the creation of the post of the Additional Legal Remembrancer now abolished.

(*ii*) In 31 political and 12 non-political cases the Additional Legal Remembrancer did not advise prosecution and in these cases prosecution was not undertaken.

(*iii*) The Government of India expressed a desire that the best man available should be appointed, provided he had sufficient Indian experience, and not that Indians alone should be appointed in the post.

Kala-azar in Tippera.

80. Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether the Government have any information about the prevalence of *kala-azar* or black fever in the district of Tippera?

(*b*) If the answer to clause (*a*) be in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state—

(*i*) what portions of the district are affected; and

(*ii*) what steps, if any, have been taken or are proposed to be taken in order to combat the disease?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) The answer is in the affirmative. Dr. Sur, Assistant Director of Public Health, employed on *kala-azar* survey, made an inquiry as to the prevalence of the disease in the district of Tippera, and a copy of his report is laid on the library table.

(*b*) (*i*) A reference to Dr. Sur's report will show that the eastern part of the district, which is contiguous to Hill Tippera, is more affected than the western part. Nearly 21 per cent. of the villages inspected at random in the sadar subdivision were found infected, 11 per cent. in Brahmanbaria and 3 per cent. in the Chandpur subdivision.

(*ii*) A copy of Dr. Sur's report has been forwarded to the Chairman of the District Board for such action as may be considered necessary by the Board.

Mr. McGowan for the Deputy Directorship of Agriculture.

81. Babu BHABENDRA CHANDRA RAY: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state what arrangements have been made to fill up the post of Deputy Director of Agriculture for the Burdwan Division, provision for which has been made in the Budget?

(*b*) Is it a fact that endeavours were made to procure the services of Mr. McGowan, of Bihar, and he was allowed to join here in anticipation of sanction?

(*c*) Are the Government aware that Mr. McGowan is a man of unsound physique?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) The Government of India have been moved to obtain the sanction of the Secretary of State to the creation of two more posts of Deputy Directors of Agriculture. One of these posts is intended for the Burdwan Division. The question of filling up these posts will be considered on receipt of the Secretary of State's sanction.

(*b*) The answer to the first part of the question is in the affirmative. As to the latter part Mr. McGowan came to Bengal under a misapprehension, and was directed to proceed to Bihar and report himself to the Director of Agriculture of that province.

(*c*) As Mr. McGowan is serving under the Government of Bihar and Orissa, this Government are unable to give any information on the subject.

Improving the condition of Tollygunge and certain other municipalities.

82. Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to refer to the remarks made in Government resolution No. 2006 L.S.G., dated the 7th April, 1921, about the bad condition of Tollygunge and certain other municipalities, and state what action, if any, has been taken by Government to improve their condition?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: It is presumed that the member refers to paragraph 19 of the resolution, in which reference is made to the unsatisfactory character of the administration of Tollygunge and certain other municipalities. It is for the municipalities concerned to take steps for the improvement of their administration now that Government have drawn attention to the matter.

Commission received by Jail Depôt Manager on articles sold to Government.

83. Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Jails) be pleased to state the reason for allowing the Manager of the Jail Depôt to get commission on the articles sold to the Government in addition to his pay?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge aware that the officers of the manufacturing jails have been deprived of taking commissions?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (*a*) Owing to the difficulty in getting Government Departments to place their orders with the Jail Depôt for jail manufactured articles, a commission on sales to Government was granted as an incentive to the staff of the Depot to do their utmost to push the disposal of goods which might, for want of energy on their part, be allowed to remain in stock and deteriorate.

(*b*) The officers of the manufacturing jails have never been allowed commission, as their duties are not similar to those of the Jail Depôt staff.

Supply of pure milk.

84. Babu BROJENDRA KISHOR RAY CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether in regard to the question of supply of clean and sanitary milk, as referred to in the answer given to my unstarred question No. 148 of the 1st April, 1921, local bodies have been consulted as to the desirability of introducing legislation on the subject?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: The answer is the affirmative.

Papers relating to coolie strike and the conduct at Chandpur.

85. Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA: *Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Dep lay on the table copies of all communications, if a planters of Assam, individually and collectively Government and the Government of Bengal or the Chittagong Division about the coolie situation at t where during May and June, 1921?*

(b) Is it a fact that three Europeans accompanied the Officer of Chandpur when, on the day before the expulsion o from the Chandpur railway station, he caused the coolies to back from jetty flat?

(c) If so, who were they and what was their official busines

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: *(a) Government ar prepared to lay any correspondence on the table.*

(b) Three European gentlemen accompanied Mr. Sinha to the gl

(c) Mr. MacPherson, Mr. Wadsworth and Mr. Sample. They w not present on official business.

Time-scale salaries for sub-deputy collectors.

86. Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: (*a*) Will t Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleas to state when effective steps may be expected to be taken to introduce time-scale of salaries for the sub-deputy collectors?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that delay in the matter causing discontent among the officers concerned?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) The member is referr to the answer given to starred question No. XXIII by Nawabzada K. M Afzal, Khan Bahadur.

(*b*) Government are aware that an early announcement is hoped fo

Memorials by District Board employees and their pay.

87. Maulvi RAFI UDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble th Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be please to state whether memorials addressed to His Excellency the Governo submitted by some of the employees of the Jessore District Board, hav been received?

(*b*) If so, what action has been taken or is being taken by th Government on the same?

[redacted] action has been taken by the individual District Boards [redacted] to the decision of the last conference of the District Board [redacted] on the subject of the increase of pay of their employees?

(c) If no action has yet been taken, are the Government considering the advisability of asking the District Boards to expedite the matter?

The [redacted] Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (a) The answer is in the affirmative.

(b) The memorials are now under the consideration of Government.

(c) It is presumed that the member refers to the resolution, "That the District Boards do revise the scale of pay of their respective staff." [redacted] have no information as to the action taken by District Boards to give effect to this resolution, except that the District Board of Jessore have proposed to increase the pay of their employes.

(d) An inquiry will be made from the District Boards as to the action taken by them.

Junior Deputies in charge of subdivisions.

88. Maulvi RAFI UDDIN AHMED: Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department aware that the posting of the Junior Deputy Magistrates in charge of subdivisions and judicial works, in preference to the experienced senior officers, has caused great discontent amongst the members of the Provincial Executive Service?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: The general position was explained at some length in an answer given on the 7th August, 1917, with particular reference to Sadar Subdivisional Officers, a copy of this reply is placed on the library table. It is difficult to make a general statement as to the weight to be attached to seniority in relation to other considerations; it is, of course, a factor which counts, but other considerations may be relevant also.

Differentiation in the prefixes of officers' names in certain services.

89. Maulvi RAFI UDDIN AHMED: (a) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state whether the prefixes of officers of the Provincial Service, when promoted to listed appointment, are changed from "Babu" or "Maulvi" to "Mr." and *vice versa* when they revert to the Provincial Service?

(b) Is there any difference attached to the prefix "Mr." as against that of "Babu" or "Maulvi"?

(c) If so, what is this difference?

(d) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that the same officer has been known as "Mr." in one part and "Babu" in another part of the same Civil List?

Papers relating to coolie strike and the conduct of the Subdivisional Officer at Chandpur.

85. Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department be pleased to lay on the table copies of all communications, if any, between the tea planters of Assam, individually and collectively, or any other local Government and the Government of Bengal or the local officials of the Chittagong Division about the coolie situation at Chandpur and elsewhere during May and June, 1921?

(*b*) Is it a fact that three Europeans accompanied the Subdivisional Officer of Chandpur when, on the day before the expulsion of the coolies from the Chandpur railway station, he caused the coolies to be driven back from jetty flat?

(*c*) If so, who were they and what was their official business there?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) Government are not prepared to lay any correspondence on the table.

(*b*) Three European gentlemen accompanied Mr. Sinha to the ghat.

(*c*) Mr. MacPherson, Mr. Wadsworth and Mr. Sample. They were not present on official business.

Time-scale salaries for sub-deputy collectors.

86. Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state when effective steps may be expected to be taken to introduce a time-scale of salaries for the sub-deputy collectors?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that delay in the matter is causing discontent among the officers concerned?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) The member is referred to the answer given to starred question No. XXIII by Nawabzada K. M. Afzal, Khan Bahadur.

(*b*) Government are aware that an early announcement is hoped for.

Memorials by District Board employees and their pay.

87. Maulvi RAFI UDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether memorials addressed to His Excellency the Governor, submitted by some of the employees of the Jessore District Board, have been received?

(*b*) If so, what action has been taken or is being taken by the Government on the same?

(*c*) What action has been taken by the individual District Boards i giving effect to the decision of the last conference of the District Board presentatives on the subject of the increase of pay of their employees?

(*d*) If no action has yet been taken, are the Government considering the desirability of asking the District Boards to expedite the matter?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) The answer in the affirmative.

(*b*) The memorials are now under the consideration of Government.

(*c*) It is presumed that the member refers to the resolution, "That ie District Boards do revise the scale of pay of their respective staff." overnment have no information as to the action taken by District Boards give effect to this resolution, except that the District Board of Jessore ve proposed to increase the pay of their employés.

(*d*) An inquiry will be made from the District Boards as to the action ken by them.

Junior Deputies in charge of subdivisions.

88. Maulvi RAFI UDDIN AHMED: Is the Hon'ble the Member charge of the Appointment Department aware that the posting of the inior Deputy Magistrates in charge of subdivisions and judicial works, preference to the experienced senior officers, has caused great dis-ject amongst the members of the Provincial Executive Service?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: The general position was plained at some length in an answer given on the 7th August, 1917, ith particular reference to Sadar Subdivisional Officers; a copy of this ply is placed on the library table. It is difficult to make a general atement as to the weight to be attached to seniority in the relation to her considerations; it is, of course, a factor which counts, but other nsiderations may be relevant also.

Differentiation in the prefixes of officers' names in certain services.

89. Maulvi RAFI UDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the ember in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state hy the prefixes of officers of the Provincial Service, when promoted to listed appointment, are changed from "Babu" or "Maulvi" to Mr" and *vice versa* when they revert to the Provincial Service?

(*b*) Is there any difference attached to the prefix "Mr." as against at of "Babu" or "Maulvi"?

(*c*) If so, what is this difference?

(*d*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that the same officer has been own as "Mr." in one part and "Babu" in another part of the same vil List?

(*e*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state why the names of the members of the Indian Civil Service are mentioned without any prefixes in the gradation list, while those of the listed post holders and the members of the Provincial Service appear with the prefix of "Mr." or "Babu" in the Civil List? Is there any reason for this differentiation?

(*f*) Are the Government considering the desirability of removing all such anomalies in the future?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*), (*b*) and (*c*) The usage referred to is of long standing and had its origin in a request from some of the officers concerned. Apart from the usage as to listed posts, the application of the prefix "Mr" in preference to "Babu" or "Maulvi" is determined by the place of education, style of living, and personal wishes of the individual concerned.

(*d*) Yes: the instance is of an officer holding a listed post and is in accordance with the usage referred to above.

(*e*) This is a matter of established practice to which no particular significance attaches.

(*f*) The present practice has now been followed for some time; in the absence of more definite evidence that the members of the different services concerned wish the matter to be re-examined, no change is contemplated.

Resolution regarding the financial position of Bengal.

90. Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state whether the resolution of this Council passed on the 9th February last regarding the financial position of Bengal has been brought by the Government to the notice of the Government of India; and, if so, with what results?

The Hon'ble Mr. Kerr: The resolution was submitted to the Government of India on the 11th February, and the whole question is now under their consideration.

Fakirhat as a separate local board electorate.

91. Babu SAILAJA NATH ROY CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to say whether the Government are considering the desirability of converting Fakirhat police-station (Khulna) into a separate electorate for the purpose of the election of members to the local board?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: The answer is in the negative.

Wordsworth Committee and non-representation of school teachers thereon.

92. Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state —

(*i*) whether it is a fact that there was no representative of school teachers on the Wordsworth Committee;

(*ii*) whether he is aware that the Government high and normal school teachers, who met in Calcutta in a conference in December, 1920, under the presidency of Mr. R. N. Gilchrist, recorded a sense of disappointment at the constitution of the committee and expressed apprehension that the cause of teachers was likely to suffer?

(*iii*) whether it is true that the Wordsworth Committee have not raised the maximum pay of assistant masters and assistant head masters of Government high schools;

(*iv*) whether it is true that they have recommended in the case of assistant masters a limit at Rs. 150, beyond which none but a selected few can go;

(*v*) whether there is to be any adequate increment in the pay of assistant head masters who are already drawing Rs. 250 *plus* a duty allowance of Rs. 20 if the recommendations of the Wordsworth Committee be given effect to;

(*vi*) whether it is fact that under the grade system an officer in the subordinate educational service drawing a salary of Rs. 150 could get an increment of Rs. 50 in three or four years, sometimes even in two years, while under the proposed time-scale system it would take five years to get an increment of Rs. 50?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*i*), (*ii*), (*iii*), (*iv*) and (*v*) The member is referred to the reply given to starred question No. XIV.

(*vi*) As the new arrangement has not yet been promulgated, comparisons between what an officer may draw under a scheme which has not yet issued with its prospects under existing conditions are without value.

Estimated cost of Bankura settlement operation.

93. Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to state what is the amount estimated as the cost of the Bankura settlement operation?

(*b*) What is the approximate amount estimated to be recovered from the landlords and tenants in the district?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) The original estimate for the survey and settlement

of the district of Bankura, framed in 1914, amounted to Rs. 19,25,913. In 1918, when it was decided to include the whole of the Asansol subdivision of Burdwan in the operations, the estimate was increased to Rs. 25,02,218.

It is not expected that the net amount to be spent on the operations in the Bankura district, taken by itself, will exceed the 1914 estimate.

(*b*) The amount estimated to be recovered from landlords and tenants in the Bankura district, was Rs. 14,55,549. Provided the receipts from stamps and sale of maps and *khatians* do not fall below the estimate, it is hoped that it will be possible to keep the recoveries well within the estimated figure.

Number of charitable dispensaries in Rangpur.

94. Maulvi SHAH ABDUR RAUF: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state the actual number of existing charitable dispensaries in the district of Rangpur?

(*b*) What proportion does it bear to the area and population of the district?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (a) 45.

(*b*) One for every 77 square miles and for every 55,669 persons.

Improvement in the pay and prospects of the Subordinate Educational Service.

95. Maulvi SHAH ABDUR RAUF: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state when the recommendations of the Committee appointed to inquire into the grievances of the Subordinate Educational Service, Bengal, will be submitted, and when the Government is likely to give effect to the recommendations?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: The member is referred to the reply given to starred question No. XIV.

Tea garden coolies at Chandpur.

96. Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department be pleased to state whether Mr. K. C. De, Divisional Commissioner, applied to the Government for Rs. 5,000 in connection with the repatriation of coolies at Chandpur?

(*b*) Is it a fact that this sum was refused by the Government?

(*d*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the names of officers who were present when the coolies were alleged to be assaulted the Gurkhas?

(*e*) Is there any truth in the statement that the alleged assault u the coolies was committed for the purpose of 'creating an impression' the people?

(*f*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state how many coo were repatriated by the local officials at Chandpur?

(*g*) By whose orders was repatriation stopped?

(*h*) Was it done with the consent or on the advice of the local offici

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) A request was made Mr Andrews for a donation from Government of Rs 5,000 towards scheme for repatriating the coolies This proposal had the suppor Mr De

(*b*) Yes

(*c*) and (*d*) The member is referred to the *communiqué* of the June

(*e*) No

(*f*), (*g*) and (*h*) The member is referred to the *communiqué* of the June

Steps taken by Jessore district board for a road in police-station Chaugacha.

97. Babu NALINI NATH ROY: Will the Hon'ble the Ministe charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to s what steps, if any, are being taken by the Jessore district board on prayers of the villagers of Brahmankandi and adjoining villages for a r in thana Chaugacha in the district of Jessore?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: The Chairm of the district board reports that the petition of the villagers has b sent to Babu Debendra Prosad Ghosh, a member of the district bo for report

Stoppage of filtered water supply in Calcutta.

98. Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: Will Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Gov ment be pleased to lay on the table all communications relating to suspension of the filtered water-supply after 7 A.M. in the town of Calc on Sunday, the 5th June?

Vocational education.

99. Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state what progress has been made in regard to the scheme for vocational education, and when practical effect is given to the same?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: Notes on various aspect of the problem of vocational education have been drawn up and these have been placed before the Standing Committee for Education. When the Standing Committee's views have been considered, Government will attempt to put some practical proposals before the public. Meanwhile, at the instance of the Dacca Board of Intermediate and Secondary Education, Government is attempting to initiate in the new Dacca Intermediate Colleges some experiments in the matter of vocational courses.

Beggary and vagrancy in Calcutta.

100. Babu JATINDRA NATH BASU: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether the Government contemplate taking any legislative or administrative measures regarding vagrancy and public begging in Calcutta? If so, when?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: The report of the Committee appointed by Government last year to inquire into the question is under consideration and it has not yet been decided what action to take on it.

Opium godown attached to the Bankshall Street.

101. Rai Dr. HARIDHAN DUTT Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state whether the "opium godown" which is attached to the Bankshall Street Police Court building is still used for the storing of opium?

(*b*) If so, whether the whole of the building is so used, or a portion thereof?

(*c*) Is it a fact that Messrs. Cox & Co. pay a rent of Rs. 550 to Government for occupying a portion of the "opium godown" in Strand Road?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (*a*) The new Opium Range at No. 14, Strand Road, Calcutta, which is situated on the west of the Bankshall Street Police Court building, is at present used for storing opium.

(*b*) The building is at present used solely for the storage of opium, office accommodation and peons' quarters. There is some vacant space available, and a proposal to use this as a forms godown is under consideration.

(*c*) The building occupied by Messrs. Cox's Shipping Agency is to the south of the Opium Range and has been leased by the firm from the Committee of the Sailors' Home.

Indian Police officers—their charge in certain districts and appointment.

102. Mr. K. C. M. FAROQUI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state whether any Indian police officer was ever placed in permanent charge of any of the following districts:—

(*1*) 24-Parganas;
(*2*) Howrah;
(*3*) Tippera;
(*4*) Chittagong;
(*5*) Midnapore,
(*6*) Dacca,
(*7*) Mymensingh;
(*8*) Darjeeling;
(*9*) Bakarganj; and
(*10*) Rajshahi?

(*b*) If not, why not?

(*c*) Is it a fact that there are two assistants to the Inspector-General of Police and that no Indian has ever been appointed to these posts?

(*d*) Do the Government contemplate appointing Indian officers to these posts?

(*e*) If not, why not?

(*f*) Do the Government contemplate appointing an Indian officer in place of the late Khan Bahadur Khoorshed, Assistant to the Deputy Inspector-General of Police, Criminal Investigation Department?

(*g*) Are the Government considering the desirability of selecting three out of the seven posts of Deputy Inspector-General of Police, and three out of the seven posts of Deputy Commissioner of the Calcutta Police from among the Indian officers of the Police Department?

(*h*) If not, why not?

(*i*) Is it a fact that no Indian officer has yet been appointed to hold the office of Superintendent of Railway and River Police?

(*j*) If the answer to clause (*i*) be in the affirmative, are the Government considering the desirability of appointing some Indian officers to these posts?

(*k*) If not, why not?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) An Indian Superintendent of Police held charge of the district of Mymensingh for 1½ years in

1902—04. No other Indian police officer has held charge in any of the districts mentioned.

(*b*) Up to the present, in most cases the juniority in the service of Indian members of the Imperial police has weighed against their being put into heavy charges demanding ripe experience of district work.

(*c*) Yes.

(*d*) Not at present.

(*e*) These appointments are made after due consideration of seniority and merit and those who have been selected are those who have been thought to have the best qualifications.

(*f*) An Indian officer is filling this post temporarily at present. The question of the permanent incumbent is under consideration.

(*g*) and (*h*) The answer is in the negative for the reason is given reply to (*e*) above.

(*i*), (*j*) and (*k*) No; there has been one such appointment in the Railway, and one (temporarily) in the River Police. Subject to the state of the cadre those officers are chosen who are considered to have the best qualifications and most aptitude for this class of work.

Age-limit for Indian and Bengal Civil Service (Executive).

103. Mr. K. C. M. FAROQUI: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department aware that in regard to the age-limit for candidates for the open competitive examination for the Indian Civil Service held in London, the date for determining the maximum age-limit is fixed on the 1st August, *i.e.*, on the first of the month in which the examination is held?

(*b*) Is it a fact that the date for determining the maximum age-limit for the Bengal Civil Service (Executive) is fixed on the 31st December of the year in which the appointment is made?

(*c*) Is it a fact that appointments to the Executive Branch of the Bengal Civil Service are generally made in November each year?

(*d*) Are the Government considering the desirability of fixing the date for determining the maximum age-limit at an earlier part of the year, preferable on the 1st of the month in which applications are received from the candidates, as in the case for the I.C.S. Examination?

(*e*) If the answer to clause (*d*) be in the affirmative is it the intention of Government to introduce this rule from the current year?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) Yes.

(*c*) Yes.

(*d*) and (*e*) The question of the age-limit of candidates for the Bengal Civil Service is now under the consideration of Government.

"Mahajans" in Murshidabad.

104. Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries aware of the fact that *mahajans* are much in evidence in most of the villages of the district of Murshidabad?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister also aware of the fact that one of the causes of the decrease in the population of the district is the ever-increasing indebtedness of the tenantry?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state the number of villages in the district of Murshidabad and the number of co-operative societies so far formed there?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) The Government have no reason to doubt that *mahajans* are much in evidence in the villages of the district of Murshidabad.

(*b*) The Government have no information to this effect.

(*c*) There are 248 societies in Murshidabad district. The number of villages in the district is 1,878.

Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ: Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether Government intends to take steps to increase the number of societies in the district of Murshidabad?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: Government is willing to increase the number of societies provided funds are forthcoming.

Education of depressed classes.

105. Babu BHISHMADEV DAS: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state what steps Government are taking for spreading education among the depressed classes?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: Government are at present incurring the following recurring expenditure for spreading education among the depressed classes:

	Rs
(1) Maintenance of primary schools for Mugh boys in the Chittagong district ...	737
(2) Grant to the Secretary, Depressed Classes Society	3,000
(3) Grant for Santhal Education	24,000
(4) Grant for education of Dai girls ..	5,400
(5) Grant for education of fishermen's children, Dacca	500

	Rs.
(6) Grant to colonisation areas in Bakarganj and 24-Parganas	2,004
(7) Grant to tea-garden schools	3,876
(8) Grant for education of factory children ...	6,480
(9) Grant to the training school for Mugh *gurus* at Chandraghona, Chittagong	360
(10) Payment of scholarships for aborigines ...	100
Total ...	46,457

Besides these recurring grants, Government have sanctioned this year as a special case a grant of Rs. 3,000 for maintenance and Rs. 2,000 for capital expenditure for the schools started by the Society for the improvement of depressed classes in addition to what has been stated in (2) on pre-page.

Housing arrangements of Indians and Anglo-Indians going up with the Government to the hills.

106. Babu BHABENDRA CHANDRA RAY: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister-in charge of the Department of Public Works be pleased to state how many ministerial officers (*a*) Indians, (*b*) Anglo-Indians, and (*c*) Europeans proceeded to Darjeeling with the Government during the first trip, and what arrangements were made for their housing there?

(*b*) Is there any truth in the statement that in the matter of accommodation a great deal of differential treatment is accorded to the Indians and Anglo-Indians?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state how much cubic feet of accommodation is provided to an Indian Assistant in the Meadow Bank and how much for an Anglo-Indian in Thorn Cottage?

(*d*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state the salaries of each of these assistants occupying Meadow Bank and Thorn Cottage, respectively?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Twenty-four Indians were housed in Meadow Bank, 10 in the Old Cutcherry and 3 in Little Thorn Cottage. Five Anglo-Indians were housed in Thorn Cottage. No Europeans went to Darjeeling.

(*b*) The area of accommodation allotted to Anglo-Indians in Thorn Cottage is greater than that allotted to Indians in Meadow Bank and the Old Cutcherry partly because the number of Indians who go to Darjeeling is greatly in excess of the Anglo Indians, and the orthodox sections of Hindu, among them would presumably not have preferred to to share a building with other communities, and partly because the number of Anglo-Indians has been much reduced this year. So the space available for each has been increased out of proportion.

(*c*) and (*d*) Two statements giving the required information are placed on the table.

In view of present altered conditions, the question of redistributing the accommodation in the four houses available in a reasonable proportion, was taken up for consideration in May last, and it is hoped that a satisfactory arrangement will shortly be made.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 106 (c) and (d).

STATEMENT I.

Meadow Bank.

[illegible]	Sq. ft. area excluding bath room.	Name of occupant.	Rent.	Sq. ft. area per person.	Remarks.
			Rs. A. P.		
	246	Babu Priya Nath Sa[illegible] ...	2[illegible] 0 0	82	
		" S. N. Chakraverty ...	2[illegible] 0 0	82	
		" Sarat Chandra Bose	2[illegible] 0 0	82	
	250	" B. B. Chatterjee ...	120 0 0	2[illegible]	
	246.5	Stocked with furniture ...	...	...	These two rooms are damp and dark and are not usually occupied.
17	171	Vacant.			
25	116	Babu Praphulla Kumar Gupta.	2[illegible] 0 0	1[illegible]	
27	232	" Prafulla Kumar Mullick	1[illegible] 0 0	77.3	
		" Krishna Kishore Das	150 0 0	77.3	
		" Tara Kinkar Ghose	270 8 0	77.3	
28	278	" Hari Gopal Dutta	350 0 0	139	
		" Gyanendra Lal Chatterjee.	89 0 0	139	

No. of room.	Sq. ft. area (excluding bath-room)	Name of occupant.	Pay drawn	Sq. ft. area per man.	REMARKS.
			Rs. A P		
29	187	Babu Jatendra Nath Ghose	175 0 0	93·5	
		,, Provash Chandra Basu	60 0 0	93·5	
30	179	,, Satish Chandra Banerjee	175 0 0	93·5	
		,, A K Chakravarty	71 0 0	89·5	
31	242	,, Sunil Chandra Banerjee	287 8 0	80·6	
		,, Satyendra Nath Roy	160 6 9	80·6	
		,, Sailendra Nath Das	50 0 0	80·6	
32	199	,, Ashutosh Coomar	345 0 0	199	
33	150	,, Raman Chandra Biswas	300 0 0 100 0 0	150	
36	167	,, Monindra Nath Basu	56 0 0	167	
41	177	,, Abu Bhusan Chatterjee	260 0 0	177	
44	170·5	,, J N Sen ...	230 0 0	170·5	
45	170·5	,, Bhupendra Nath Chatterjee	100 0 0 150 9 0	170·5	
50	170·5	,, Anukul Chandra Mullick	400 0 0	170·5	

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 106 (c) and (d).

STATEMENT II.

Thorn Cottage.

No. of room	Sq. ft. area excluding bath rooms	Name of occupants	Pay drawn	Sq. ft. area per man	REMARKS.
			Rs. A. P.		
1	135	Office of Inspector General of Police			
2	242				
3	247	Mr. O. H. D[illegible]	200 0 0	247	
4	[illegible]	Mr. B. G. Keymer ...	...	[illegible]	Pay rent
5	234				
6	[illegible]	Mr. [illegible] A. Brown	150 0 0 72 0 0	[illegible]	
7	[illegible]	Vacant			
8†	[illegible]				
9	201	Mr. H. [illegible] ...	[illegible] 0 0	965	† From No. 8 upwards are all family quarters
10	460				
11	245				
12	153	Mr. C. A. Shavier ...	345 0 0 65 0 0	594	
13	195				
15	532	Mr. J. R. Belletty ...	550 0 0	879	
16	347				
18	295	Mr. J. [illegible] Cozen‡ ...	...	642	‡ Pay rent
19	347				

Improvement in the pay and prospects of the Subordinate Civil Service.

107. Maulvi KHANDAKAR ARHAMUDDIN: (a) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to say whether it is a fact that the Old Bengal Council at its sitting at Dacca in 1919 accepted a resolution to improve the pay and prospects of the Subordinate Civil Service?

(*b*) Is it a fact that in the following year Government published a scheme to give effect to the same resolution and invited the opinion of the public as well as the officers concerned?

(*c*) Is it a fact that the scheme was considered by the public as well as the members concerned to be inadequate and disappointing in view of the higher cost of living and that the members concerned submitted a scheme praying for a scale of pay from Rs. 200 to Rs. 600 with a biennial increment of Rs. 30?

(*d*) Is it a fact that other provincial Governments have sanctioned the same scale for the same service?

(*e*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to lay on the table all correspondence between this Government and the Imperial Government on the matter?

(*f*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to say when it is proposed to publish the final scheme?

(*g*) Is it the intention of Government to give retrospective effect to the scheme from December, 1919, as in the case of other provincial services? If not, why not?

(*h*) Is it a fact that the amalgamation of the two services (Provincial and Subordinate) has been estimated to cost Government less than the scheme suggested above?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) Yes; a resolution to this effect was carried in 1919 in Calcutta.

(*b*) Yes; *vide* Resolution No. 1646 A. D., dated the 21st June, 1920.

(*c*) Government received various expressions of opinion at that time regarding the future of the Subordinate Civil Service. Some of these, including a representation from the members of the service, were to the effect that Government's proposals were inadequate.

(*d*) Government are not in possession of definite information on this point.

(*e*) Government are not prepared to lay on the table the correspondence of the local Government with the Imperial Government.

(*f*) and (*g*) The decisions of Government with regard to the pay of the Subordinate Civil Service will be made public at an early date.

(*h*) No calculations of the nature indicated have been made.

Silted-up Saraswati river.

108. Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: (*a*) Has the attention of the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation been drawn to the condition of the river Saraswati in the district of Hooghly which has practically silted up?

(*b*) Are the Government aware that the state of the river is causing an outbreak of malarial fever, cholera and other diseases, and the consequent depopulation of Saptagram and other villages along the said river?

(c) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state what steps have been taken, or are being taken, for the reclamation of the said river?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA Bahadur of Burdwan: (a) Yes.

(b) The deterioration of the health in the villages on the silted-up Saraswati river is partly due to the silting up of the river.

(c) A length of about 5 miles in the lower reaches of the river from Andul has been improved by silt clearance lately. It would be possible to flush a portion of the lower reaches of the river when the Damodar Canal is constructed and a supply of water will be available for the purpose. A report on the feasibility or otherwise of improving the upper reaches of the river from Tibeni, has been called for from the local officers lately.

Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: May I ask whether it is a fact that the village of Saptagram in the district of Hooghly which was once the most important centre of trade in Hooghly has now been converted into jungle owing to a silting-up of the river Saraswati?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA Bahadur of Burdwan: Yes, it is a fact.

Pay of the Subordinate Educational Service.

109. Maulvi ABDUL KARIM: (a) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state when the Subordinate Educational Service was first formed with Rs. 50 as the lowest grade?

(b) What are the recommendations of the Wordsworth Committee for the reorganisation of the Subordinate Education Service?

(c) How many representatives were there on the Wordsworth Committee from the offices of the Subordinate Educational Service?

(d) Was there on the Wordsworth Committee any representative of the teachers of Government high schools?

(e) What is the present average salary of a member of the Subordinate Educational Service, and what would be his average salary immediately after the reorganisation is given effect to?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (a) The Subordinate Educational Service was first formed with effect from 1st October, 1898. The pay of the lowest grade of the Subordinate Educational Service has been at the rate of Rs. 50 a month ever since the inception of that service.

(b), (c) and (d) The member is referred to the reply given to starred question No. XIV.

(e) The present average salary of a member of the Subordinate Educational Service is Rs. 862. This figure is calculated on the grading of the service as it stood in January, 1921. The last part of this question does not arise.

Appointment of a special Muhammadan sub-inspector for Muhammadan education at Faridpur.

110. Maulvi ABDUL KARIM: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to say whether it is a fact that there is a special sub-inspector for Muhammadan education in each of the districts in the Dacca Division, except at Faridpur?

(*b*) If so, are the Government considering the desirability of appointing one special sub-inspector for Muhammadan education for Faridpur?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) The scheme for employing special Muhammadan sub-inspectors in certain districts is an experimental one. The necessity for employing such an officer in the Faridpur district will be examined.

Muhammadans in Manufactory Department of Jails.

111. Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Jails) be pleased to state

(*a*) the number of officers employed in the Manufactory Department of each of the Central Jails, Juvenile Jails and Jail Department and the number of Muhammadans employed therein, and

(*b*) the total number of vacancies in the said department during the last five years and the total number of Muhammadans appointed to fill these vacancies?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (*a*) (*i*) and (*ii*) A statement giving the information is laid on the table.

Statement referred to in the reply to question No. 111 (a) (i) and (ii).

Name of jail	Number of officers in the Manufactory Department	Number of Muhammadans	Total number of vacancies during last 5 years	Number of Muhammadans taken
Presidency	13 (including 3 European posts)	2	2	1
Alipore Central (Press and Forms Department)	103	26	15	4 (one vacancy not filled up).
Dacca Central ...	8	5	2	2
Midnapore ,, ...	4	1	2	1
Rajshahi ,, ...	3	2	2	1
Juvenile	7	Nil	2	Nil
Darjeeling	1	1	Nil	Nil

Muhammadans as head warders and warders.

112. Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble e Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Jails) be pleased lay on the table a statement showing—

(*i*) the number of permanent head warders and warders in each circle of the Province, and how many of them are Muhammadans; and

(*ii*) the number of vacancies in the grade of head warders and warder during the last two years and the number of Muhammadans appointed to fill such vacancies?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (*i*) and (*ii*) A statement giving e information is laid on the table

Statement referred to in the replies to unstarred question No. 112 (i) and (ii).

Name of circle	Number of permanent Head Warders and Warders	Number of Muhammadans	Number of vacancies in last 2 years	Muhammadans appointed
[illegible]	498	75	111	19
[illegible]	297	47	52	7
[illegible]	230	13	11	Nil
[illegible]	132	16	11	3
[illegible]	79	27	43	4
[illegible]	108	5	14	3

Measures to remove the cause of malarial fever in Tangail.

113. Babu BROJENDRA KISHOR RAY CHAUDHURI: With ference to the opinion of the Director of Public Health as expressed in swer to my unstarred question No. 30 of the 1st April, 1921, regarding prevalence of malarial fever in Tangail, will the Hon'ble the nister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased state what steps the Government are taking for removing the cause it?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: The Irrigation partment of this Government is being asked to make an inquiry regard- the silting up of the river Lohajang and the remedial measures ticable.

Kala-azar in Tangail.

114. Babu BROJENDRA KISHOR RAY CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Is th Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Goveri ment aware that *kala-azar*, which has been prevalent in Tangail fo several years past, has recently assumed frightful proportions?

(*b*) What remedial measures have been taken by the Government?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of sending ou itinerant dispensaries or qualified doctors for administering antimoni injection?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*), (*b*) and (The member is referred to the answer to clauses (*a*) and (*b*) of unstarre question No. 13 asked by Rai Dr. Haridhan Dutt Bahadur at the meeti of the 14th March, 1921. The attention of the District Board has al been drawn to the desirability of starting a laboratory for the micro copic examination of blood in suspected cases of the disease. They ha been informed that the Director of Public Health, Bengal, would be al to depute a trained sub-assistant surgeon to take charge of the labor tory, and they have been asked whether they are prepared to start and, if so, whether they would be able to finance it or could do so wi assistance from Government.

Saline injection in charitable dispensaries.

115. Babu BROJENDRA KISHOR RAY CHAUDHURI: (*a*) W the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Se Government be pleased to state whether all the charitable dispensaries the presidency, particularly those in the rural areas, have necessary app ances for administering saline injection in cholera cases?

(*b*) If not, what system of treatment is followed in cholera cases hospitals and dispensaries wanting those appliances?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) The mem is referred to the answer given to unstarred question No. 130 asked Babu Sailaja Nath Roy Chaudhuri at the meeting of the Legislat Council held on the 1st April, 1921.

(*b*) Cases are treated symptomatically and prophylactically general principles.

Repairing expenditure of roads in Calcutta under Public Works Department.

116. Rai Dr. HARIDHAN DUTT Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works be pleased state

(*i*) the names of roads within the municipal area of Calcutta wh are under the control of the Public Works Department;

(*ii*) the annual expenditure incurred by the Public Works Department on the upkeep of these roads during the last five years; and

(*iii*) when each of these roads was last repaired and when it is proposed to take them up for thorough repairs again?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*i*) (*1*) Belvedere Road from Zeerut Bridge to Belvedere. (*2*) Thackeray Road. (*3*) Road alongside Calcutta Club to Porabazar and (*4*) Canal West Road.

(*ii*) On (*1*) and (*4*), cannot be stated, as accounts for expenditure on these roads are grouped together with that on other roads. (*2*) Last five years' average, Rs. 247. (*3*) Last five years' average, Rs. 137.

(*iii*) (*a*) (*1*) 1920-21. (*2*) 1917-18. (*3*) 1915-16. (*4*) Done in sections every year.

(*b*) (*1*) 1922-23. (*2*) 1921-22. (*3*) 1922-23. (*4*) Done in sections every year.

Police sergeants in Calcutta.

117. Rai Dr. HARIDHAN DUTT Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to supply the following information:

(*1*) what is the total number of police sergeants employed in Calcutta, and how many of them are employed exclusively in traffic regulation, and what is the number employed for guard duty or in special work in connection with the maintenance of order, etc., in courts, railway stations and other public places;

(*2*) what are the scale of salaries, house and other allowances attached to these posts? If the posts are graded, then the scale and the number of posts in each grade;

(*3*) what is the method of recruitment for these posts;

(*4*) what are the qualifications required, and what are the provisions for training of the recruits as well as the usual period of probation;

(*5*) in special cases are the sergeants ever promoted to the post of Sub-Inspector, Inspector, Superintendent, Assistant Commissioner etc., and

(*6*) if so, what is the total number who have been so promoted during the last twelve years?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*1*) The sanctioned number of sergeants is now 154, six posts of sergeant having been abolished last month. The 160 sergeants were allotted to the following duties:—

52 Traffic.
24 Patrol.
5 Courts.
[illegible]

Kala-azar in Tangail.

114. Babu BROJENDRA KISHOR RAY CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government aware that *kala-azar*, which has been prevalent in Tangail for several years past, has recently assumed frightful proportions?

(*b*) What remedial measures have been taken by the Government?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of sending out itinerant dispensaries or qualified doctors for administering antimonial injection?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*), (*b*) and (*c*) The member is referred to the answer to clauses (*a*) and (*b*) of unstarred question No. 13 asked by Rai Dr. Haridhan Dutt Bahadur at the meeting of the 14th March, 1921. The attention of the District Board has also been drawn to the desirability of starting a laboratory for the microscopic examination of blood in suspected cases of the disease. They have been informed that the Director of Public Health, Bengal, would be able to depute a trained sub-assistant surgeon to take charge of the laboratory, and they have been asked whether they are prepared to start it, and, if so, whether they would be able to finance it or could do so with assistance from Government.

Saline injection in charitable dispensaries.

115. Babu BROJENDRA KISHOR RAY CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether all the charitable dispensaries in the presidency, particularly those in the rural areas, have necessary appliances for administering saline injection in cholera cases?

(*b*) If not, what system of treatment is followed in cholera cases in hospitals and dispensaries wanting those appliances?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) The member is referred to the answer given to unstarred question No. 130 asked by Babu Sailaja Nath Roy Chaudhuri at the meeting of the Legislative Council held on the 1st April, 1921.

(*b*) Cases are treated symptomatically and prophylactically on general principles.

Repairing expenditure of roads in Calcutta under Public Works Department.

116. Rai Dr. HARIDHAN DUTT Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works be pleased to state

(*a*) the names of roads within the municipal area of Calcutta which are under the control of the Public Works Department;

(*iii*) the annual expenditure incurred by the Public Works Department on the upkeep of these roads during the last five years; and

(*iii*) when each of these roads was last repaired and when it is proposed to take them up for thorough repairs again?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*i*) (*1*) Belvedere Road from Zeerut Bridge to Belvedere. (*2*) Thackeray Road. (*3*) Road alongside Calcutta Club to Poralbazar land. (*4*) Canal West Road

(*ii*) On (*1*) and (*4*), cannot be stated, as accounts for expenditure on these roads are grouped together with that on other roads. (*2*) Last five years' average, Rs. 247. (*3*) Last five years' average, Rs. 137.

(*iii*) (*a*) (1) 1920-21. (*2*) 1917-18. (*3*) 1915-16. (*4*) Done in sections every year.

(*b*) (*1*) 1922-23. (*2*) 1921-22. (*3*) 1922-23. (*4*) Done in sections every year.

Police sergeants in Calcutta.

117. Rai Dr. HARIDHAN DUTT Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to supply the following information:—

(*1*) what is the total number of police sergeants employed in Calcutta, and how many of them are employed exclusively in traffic regulation, and what is the number employed for guard duty or in special work in connection with the maintenance of order, etc., in courts, railway stations and other public places;

(*2*) what are the scale of salaries, house and other allowances attached to these posts? If the posts are graded, then the scale and the number of posts in each grade;

(*3*) what is the method of recruitment for these posts;

(*4*) what are the qualifications required, and what are the provisions for training of the recruits as well as the usual period of probation;

(*5*) in special cases are the sergeants ever promoted to the post of Sub-Inspector, Inspector, Superintendent, Assistant Commissioner etc., and

(*6*) if so, what is the total number who have been so promoted during the last twelve years?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*1*) The sanctioned number of sergeants is now 154, six posts of sergeant having been abolished last month. The 160 sergeants were allotted to the following duties:—

52 Traffic.
24 Patrol.
5 Courts.
19 Government guards.

19 Escort and miscellaneous duties.
8 Public Vehicles Department.
6 Armed police.
13 Port police.
14 Reserve.

160

(2) Pay is Rs. 150—5/2—200. Conveyance allowance of Rs. 20 a month is granted if a bicycle is kept. Three sergeant-majors attached to the armed police also get a duty allowance of Rs. 20 each a month. Patrol sergeants posted to sub-sections are housed in the sub-section premises; for other sergeants, who are married but who cannot be provided with Government quarters, houses are hired. Single sergeants, when not attached to any sub-section, are quartered in the sergeants' barracks at Lall Bazar.

(3) Vacancies are usually filled up by ex-soldiers and army reservists of British regiments, but during the last few years some Anglo-Indians have been enlisted, ex-army men not being available owing to the war A copy of the printed notice supplied to applicants is placed on the library table.

(4) In case of ex-army men, the qualifications include a second class army school certificate, together with a "very good character" written in their army discharge papers. In the case of Anglo-Indians, men who have studied up to the standard of the Junior Cambridge examination are considered to be sufficiently qualified for the post of sergeant. They are trained at headquarters in the following subjects:—

(1) drill;
(2) motor and traffic rules and regulations;
(3) such rules and Acts as are likely to be of use to them in their daily duties as police officers;
(4) first aid to the injured.

The usual period of probation is six months, it extends up to two years in the case of sergeants recruited from the army.

(5) Yes.

(6) Forty-five sergeants have been promoted to the higher ranks during the last 12 years.

Industrial Intelligence Officer and the Department of Industries.

118. Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: (a) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Commerce be pleased to state—

(i) when;
(ii) on what terms;

(*iii*) at whose initiative;

(*iv*) for what duties;

(*v*) for what period;

as the post of the Industrial Intelligence Officer created in the Department of Industries;

(*vi*) whether the Industrial Intelligence Officer is directly under the Director of Industries;

(*vii*) apart from matters in connection with strikes, what duties, if any, has this officer been performing; and

(*viii*) what industrial information has this officer collected and supplied to the public during his tenure of office?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state whether it is a fact that—

(*i*) the Deputy Director of Industries was for several years in charge of a large Government factory employing a considerable number of labour hands, and

(*ii*) whether he has acquired experience of labour conditions of Bengal?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of directing that the Deputy Director of Industries should perform the work of collecting information regarding labour, its conditions and the problems connected with it?

(*d*) Are the Government considering the desirability of constituting a branch of the Department of Industries for the purpose of collecting industrial information, including an industrial survey of Bengal, by the appointment of a special local staff under the direct control of the Director of Industries at a total annual cost not exceeding the annual salary of the Industrial Intelligence Officer?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (*a*), (*i*) and (*ii*) The Industrial Intelligence Officer was appointed on 1st July, 1920, for one year, on a pay of Rs. 1,500 per mensem *plus* a motor car allowance of Rs. 100 or 150 per mensem accordingly as the officer keeps a two-seater or four-seater motor car. Proposals for a further temporary continuation of the post are under consideration.

(*iii*) The post of Industrial Intelligence Officer was recommended by the Industrial Commission and was created at the request of the Government of Bengal.

(*iv*) The Industrial Intelligence Officer's duties are to inquire and report on industrial questions generally and labour unrest in particular.

(*v*) See reply to (*ii*) above.

(*vi*) Yes.

(*vii*) His work, apart from strikes, consists of—

(*1*) the disposal of petty industrial inquiries;

(*2*) investigations regarding the cost of living of industrial workers;

(*3*) the writing of a special chapter on the major industries in the ensuing census reports;

(4) the Secretaryship to the Taxicab Committee (January to March, 1920);

(*5*) the Secretaryship to the Industrial Unrest Committee (April to May, 1921);

(*6*) the collecting of information regarding trade unions and other industrial associations of a similar nature.

(*viii*) He assisted, as stated above, in the department's work of answering individual industrial inquiries (not on labour subjects). Throughout, on the labour side, he has been an agent for supplying the Governments of India and Bengal with information regarding strikes. Part of this information has been passed on to the public through the Legislative Assembly, the Legislative Council and the Home Parliament and part through the Journal of Industries and Labour, published by the Government of India. A reference is also invited to the report of the recent Committee on Industrial Unrest.

(*b*) (*i*) The Deputy Director of Industries was for 11 years on the staff of the Director of Ordnance Factories, who controls eight large factories in India. During the last two years of this period he was employed as Works Manager the Gun and Shell Factory, Cossipore

(*ii*) The Deputy Director acquired considerable experience of labour conditions in Bengal during the period of his service in the Ordnance Factories.

(*c*) The Deputy Director has to give advice in regard to the larger question of industrial and factory development, for which at present there is no other expert on the Director's staff, and has therefore not the time to perform the duties of the Industrial Intelligence Officer. As regards labour information, the attention of the member is drawn to paragraph 19 of the Report of the Committee on Industrial Unrest. The proposals contained therein will probably add considerably to the work of this officer.

(*d*) The question of the appointment of a whole-time Industrial Intelligence Officer is under consideration.

Ship-building Industry in Bengal.

119. Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state what steps, if any, have been taken or are proposed to be taken by the Government to foster the industry of ship-building in Bengal?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that there is an indigenous dustry for building wooden ships in Chittagong?

(*c*) Is it the intention of Government to foster and develop this dustry there?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, han Bahadur: (*a*) (*b*) To improve the sailing power, seaworthiness d safety of the wooden ships built in Chittagong, which generally suffer om bad design, unsuitable material and inferior workmanship and to ourage the development of the industry on proper scientific lines, a m of Rs 500 was placed at the disposal of the Engineer and Ship rveyor, Chittagong last year, for the construction of model ships of im-oved design. These models have been constructed and are kept for the spection and instruction of the local ship-builders at the office of the ip Surveyor, who explains to them their construction.

(2) The application of internal combustion motor attachments for the opulsion of country-made boats has also been taken up, and particulars experimental installation in a blowha, made by Messrs John King d Company, are now under consideration with a view to the possibility demonstration among the river fishermen

(3) Proposals to establish an educational institution at Chittagong, here instruction on ship-building suitable for Indian conditions can be v n, also at some centre, possibly Chittagong, a depôt where instruction the application, maintenance and running of internal combustion en-nes applied to the propulsion of country craft can be given with suitable mon stration, are under the consideration of the Department of Indus-ies

(*b*) Yes

(*c*) Yes.

Expenditure on certain heads by the Agricultural Department.

120. Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: Will the Hon'ble the inister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be eased to lay on the table a statement showing the amount spent by the gricultural Department under each of the following heads during the st five years, viz :

(1) establishment;

(2) travelling allowances;

(3) experiments; and

(4) distribution of seeds and of manure?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, han Bahadur: A statement showing the approximate amount spent ring the last five years is laid on the table

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 120.

YEAR.	Establishment.	Travelling allowance.	Experiments (including experimental farms and agricultural experiments).	Distribution of seeds and manures (including other demonstration).
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
1916-17	2,25,946	66,790	1,93,129	31,220
1917-18	2,23,878	69,386	2,20,984	20,309
1918-19	2,51,011	91,031	2,70,423	47,931
1919-20	2,82,249	1,17,888	4,19,903	40,000
1920-21	3,83,710	1,28,180	3,54,860	47,000

Scheme for converting middle vernacular school for girls at Faridpur into a middle English school.

121. Maulvi ABDUL KARIM: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to say whether there is any scheme for converting the middle vernacular school for girls at Faridpur into a middle English school?

(*b*) If so, when will this be done?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) Effect to the scheme will be given from January next year.

Tube-well for Patuakhali water-works.

122. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state when the work of the experimental tube-well for the Patuakhali water-works will be commenced?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: The cost of sinking the experimental well was originally estimated at Rs. 10,000 and Government sanctioned a grant of this amount. The contractor who offered to sink it for Rs. 10,000 has now increased his tender to Rs. 20,000 on account of the rise in cost of tubes, etc. The question of doing the work departmentally is being considered, and it is not at present possible to say on what date it will be begun.

Number of high English schools working at a deficit owing to the non-co-operation movement.

123. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state—

(a) the number of aided and unaided high English schools which cannot meet their monthly expenses from their usual income on account of the non-co-operation movement;

(b) what steps are the Government taking to enable those schools to continue to impart education to those boys who are willing to proceed with their studies?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (a) The information is not available, nor could it be collected without a special inquiry being instituted, seeing that the Education Department has no information about the financial condition of unaided high English schools and that the great majority of the high English schools of the Presidency are unaided.

(b) Representations have been received from the Inspectors of Schools of the Dacca Rajshahi and Chittagong Divisions, and the Director of Public Instruction has placed Rs 10,000 at the disposal of each Inspector for the purpose of saving good schools threatened by the non-co-operation movement.

Grants made by Government of India and referred to in the Budget estimate for 1921-22.

124. Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing

(a) what are the specific purposes for which the several ear-marked grants referred to in the budget estimate for 1921-22 were made by the Government of India, and, when were these grants made,

(b) what are the amounts of such original grants;

(c) what expenditure has already been incurred on what specific purposes out of these grants up to the 31st March, 1921;

(d) what are the unspent balances on these heads by the end of March, 1921, and what are the specific purposes for which such unspent balances are proposed to be utilised or reserved in 1921-22, showing the items in detail on each head of expenditure; and

(e) on what calculations the closing balances under those ear-marked heads were arrived at in the current year's budget?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (*a*), (*b*) and (*c*) A statement is laid on the table.

(*d*) A statement is laid on the table. For further details the member is referred to the speech of the Finance Secretary to the Government of Bengal, delivered on the 4th of March in this Council.

(*e*) The balances have been worked out by deducting from the total grants received the amounts reported by the Heads of Departments as actually spent on the objects for which the grants were made.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 124 showing unspent balances of earmarked grants.

	Amount received up to 1919-20	Amount received in 1920-21	Total amount received up to 1920-21.	Amount spent up to 1919-20.	Estimated amount spent in 1920-21	Estimated total expenditure up to the 31st March 1921.	Estimated unspent balances on the 31st March 1921
	Rs.	Rs	Rs	Rs	Rs	Rs	Rs
(A) Non-recurring Educational grants.	15,184	38	15,222	9,510	2,043	11,553	3,669
(B) Recurring Educational grants	23,992	4,181	28,173	16,976	3,595	20,571	7,602
(C) Grant for Technical Education	10	375	385	...	365	365	20
(D) Grant for Agricultural Education	255	102	357	157	55	212	145
(E) Sanitation grants	11,355	950	12,305	4,972	747	5,719	6,586
Total ...	50,796	5,646	56,442	31,555	6,805	38,360	18,082

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 124 showing the purposes for which the unspent balances are proposed to be utilised in 1921-22.

Education.

	Rs
(*a*) Grant to Dacca University	9,00,000
(*b*) Provision for works in progress in connection with the Dacca University buildings	2,00,000
(*c*) Provision for the Dacca Intermediate Board ..	40,000

	Rs.
(*d*) Construction of bungalows for Civil officers, Dacca, taken over by the Dacca University	1,44,000
(*e*) Provision for new buildings for the Education Department in the Public Works Department Budget ...	3,11,000
(*f*) Provision for works in progress of Education buildings in the Public Works Department Budget ...	6,84,000
(*g*) Recurring expenditure provided in the budget out of Imperial grants	41,81,000
Total ...	64,60,000

Technical Education.

(*h*) Provision made in the budget for Technical Education debitable to Imperial grants	20,000

Agricultural Education.

(*i*) Provision for the Comilla Agricultural School ...	20,000
(*j*) Provision for the Dacca Agricultural School ...	2,000

Sanitation.

(*k*) Provision for sanitation debitable to Imperial grants ...	15,88,000

Shed for witnesses in Rangpur District Court.

125. Maulvi SHAH ABDUR RAUF: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department aware that there is no witness shed in the courts of the district of Rangpur, and that the public are greatly inconvenienced thereby?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of taking steps to remove the inconvenience?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (*a*) and (*b*) The information before Government is that there is already a witness shed attached to the civil court and that a witness shed for the criminal court will soon be constructed. The estimate has been sanctioned and the materials have been collected.

Promotion of Deputy Inspectors of Schools to the Bengal Educational Service.

126. Maulvi SHAH ABDUR RAUF: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to say whether it is a fact that a class of officers in the Subordinate Educational

Service, Bengal, *viz.*, the Head Masters of High English Schools, has been promoted to the Bengal Educational Service with suitable pay and prospects, while the case of the Deputy Inspectors of Schools has not been taken up?

(*b*) Is it in the contemplation of the Government to promote the Deputy Inspectors of Schools to the Bengal Educational Service with the same pay and prospects as have been given to the Head Masters?

(*c*) Is there any foundation in the rumour that the Professors of the Dacca College, who have not been provided with posts in the Dacca University, will be placed in charge of the inspection work of the district as Bengal Educational Service men, over the heads of the existing chief inspecting officers of the district.

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) and (*b*) The Head Masterships of Government high schools are posts included in the Bengal Educational Service. The question of including the posts of District Deputy Inspectors of Schools in that service is now under the consideration of Government.

(*c*) There are no "Chief inspecting officers" of the district. One officer who was holding a B. E. S. post attached to Dacca College but whose services have not been lent to Dacca University has been appointed to an Assistant Inspectorship of Schools.

Extension of the Gambling Act to the Howrah district.

127. Babu SATISH CHANDRA MUKHARJI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department be pleased to say whether the Gambling Act has been extended to the Howrah district as a whole?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that extensive gambling is prevalent in parts of the interior of the Howrah district, and that many young men are being ruined thereby?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of extending the provisions of the Gambling Act to the whole of the district of Howrah, if this has not already been done?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) The Bengal Gamblin Act (II of 1867) has not been extended to the whole of the district o Howrah. It is in force only in certain places in the district.

(*b*) In 1919, the local officers reported the prevalence of gambling i many places in the district and recommended the extension of th Gambling Act.

(*c*) The policy of Government has been to extend the Act only t places which are within a reasonable distance of established courts whe

ases could be tried, and not to enforce it in wide areas or in outlying illages where its working could not be effectively supervised or conrolled. For that reason Government were not prepared to sanction a urther extension of the Act in Howrah district. The matter has been xamined again recently, but Government see no reason to doubt the oundness of the policy indicated above.

Inspecting officers of the Education Department.

128. Babu NIBARAN CHANDRA DAS GUPTA: (*a*) Will the lon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be leased to state the number of inspecting officers of the department and lso the number of the institutions they have to inspect?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether the overnment are considering the desirability of taking steps to reduce the he number of inspecting officers, and to utilise the savings so effected r increasing the number of teachers for primary and secondary schools, nd also for making the emoluments of such teachers sufficiently respectble and attractive?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state the steps that re being taken to train up a sufficiently large number of primary school achers, to meet the ever-increasing demands for such teachers?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) Two statements are laid on the able

(*b*) and (*c*) The answer would depend on the lines that may be ultiately adopted for the expansion of primary education. Mr. Biss' report as just been printed and the Government propose to invite suggestions om the public on that report and then lay down their policy. Pending e delimitation of that policy the Government do not propose to express ny opinion as to their future intentions.

There are about 110 *guru*-training schools and special training classes r the training of primary school teachers. The accommodation in ese schools is limited and the annual outturn from these amounts to 50 only.

It was accordingly decided to replace these schools by an improved pe of institutions providing increased accommodation and working nder an efficient trained staff. Twenty-one such schools have already en started. The proposed annual outturn of teachers under this scheme as 3,200.

In his recent report on the expansion and improvement of primary ducation, Mr. Biss has criticised the scheme to which reference has st been made and has suggested an alternative arrangement. This, gether with Mr. Biss' other proposals, is now before the public.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 128 (a).

STATEMENT I.

Strength of the Inspecting Agency.

Divisions	Inspectors and 2nd Inspectors.	Assistant Inspectors	Deputy Inspectors	Sub-Inspectors.	Assistant Sub-Inspectors.	Assistant Inspectresses.	Inspectresses.	Inspector of European Schools.
Burdwan ...	3	5	21	73	14	2	}	}
Presidency (excluding Calcutta)	3	4	11	14	3	2	} 1	
Calcutta ...	1	...	2	3	...	1	}	} 1
Dacca ...	3	4	18	66	1	3	}	
Chittagong ...	2	3	9	38	2	1	} 1	
Rajshahi ...	2	3	14	44	1	2	}	}
Total ...	14	19	75	268	21	12	2	1

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 128 (a) showing the number of institutions which Inspecting Officers have to inspect.

STATEMENT II.

Serial No.	Division.	Number of institutions
1	Burdwan	10,859
2	Presidency (excluding Calcutta)	8,026
3	Calcutta	677
4	Dacca	14,996
5	Chittagong	8,709
6	Rajshahi	10,569
7	Total	53,836
8	Inspector of European Schools, Bengal	78
	GRAND TOTAL	53,914

Primary education.

128. Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state—

(*i*) how many primary schools exist in each of the districts of Bengal;

(*ii*) how many of these, in each district, are subsidised by the municipalities and how many by the district board;

(*iii*) how many of these again in each district do not get any aid either from the municipalities or from the district board;

(*iv*) what amount each municipality or district board contribute to such schools within their jurisdiction;

(*v*) what amount the Government contribute to each municipality or district board towards the maintenance of such schools within their jurisdiction;

(*vi*) what amounts again are realised as school-fees from such schools;

(*vii*) what is the number of boys and girls attending such schools within and outside the municipal areas in each district;

(*viii*) what is the number of boys and girls of school-going age who are going without such education;

(*ix*) how many more such schools would be necessary in each district to give such education to all such boys and girls;

(*x*) what would be the probable additional cost for establishment and maintenance of such additional schools;

(*xi*) what steps have Government taken or are going to take for the extension of primary education for all such boys and girls who require such education; and

(*xii*) what proportions of the additional cost the Government would be prepared to bear to meet the problem of extension of primary education throughout the province?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*i*) to (*x*) A reference is invited to the statement laid on the library table. With special reference to question (*x*), it may be noted that Mr. Biss' report contains proposals which if accepted and an estimate based on these, would give us different figures. A reference is suggested to Mr. West's estimates which are mentioned and discussed in Chapter IX of Mr. Biss' report.

(*xi*) An inquiry has just been completed and a full report on the whole subject prepared. This has been published in English and will be published in Bengali for public consideration. Government are formulating their views on the report and hope shortly to be in a position to announce a definite policy of a forward character. In the meanwhile experiments are being tried in several places with a view to the establishment of a public system of primary schools.

(*xii*) This matter will be decided in connection with the whole question. In the meantime Government are prepared to consider favourably any proposals from local bodies that show an adequate degree of self-help on their part.

Projected Faridpur-Bhanga-Madaripur Railway.

130. Babu BHISHMADEV DAS: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works be pleased to state what progress has been made in the project of the Faridpur-Bhanga-Madaripur Railway?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: In May, 1920, the Railway Board sanctioned a traffic reconnaissance survey for a broad gauge line between Faridpur and Barisal *viâ* Bhanga.

The local Government have no further information in this matter.

Railway between Faridpur and Barisal or Jessore.

131. Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works kindly state whether there have been any projects before Government for constructing a railway connecting the district of Faridpur with the district of Barisal or Jessore, in recent years?

(*b*) If so, what has been the final decision of the Government on these projects?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) and (*b*) In the year 1919 a project for a broad gauge line to connect Faridpur with Jessore was laid before the local Government for consideration, by the Railway Board. The reasons for abandoning the project, for the present, have been given in a press *communiqué* issued by the Government on the 3rd March, 1920, to which the attention of the member is invited.

In regard to a railway connection between Faridpur and Barisal, the Railway Board sanctioned in May, 1920, a traffic reconnaissance survey for a broad gauge line *viâ* Bhanga.

The local Government have no further information in this matter.

Expenditure for the upkeep of experimental farms.

132. Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state what amount of money has been spent during the last three years on the upkeep of the experimental farms and how

much of that money has been realised by the sale of the produce of the said farms?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to say whether the Government are considering the desirability of inquiring into the causes of the loss, if any, with a view to reducing it consistently with the demand of a scientific investigation?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the necessity of establishing one or two agricultural farms on business lines to demonstrate that agriculture on advanced modern methods can be carried on at a profit?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) The member is referred to the reply to question No. 112(*d*) asked by Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur at the Council meeting of the 1st April, 1921, for information relating to the years 1918-19 and 1919-20. The receipts and expenditure for 1920 amount to Rs. 52,508 and Rs. 2,30,137-9-5 respectively.

(*b*) These farms are purely experimental, but expenses are kept down as much as possible consistently with maintaining the efficiency of scientific investigation, which is necessarily costly and not directly profitable.

(*c*) Yes. This matter is receiving consideration.

Arrangement for holding charge during recess period of Settlement Department.

133. Maulvi RAFI UDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to state the reasons why during the absence on leave of the settlement officers their assistants, while being allowed to hold charge of their posts, are not shown as officiating for them?

(*b*) If there is no necessity for officiating men during the recess period, are the Government considering the desirability of reverting all settlement officers to the general department during that period?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) The appointment of of settlement officer is ordinarily filled by an officer who would otherwise be entitled to an appointment as Magistrate-Collector. A junior officer of the Indian Civil Service or of the Bengal Civil Service cannot therefore officiate as settlement officer.

(*b*) It is necessary that some officer should be in charge of the routine duties of the settlement officer when he is absent on leave.

Audit fees levied from co-operative societies.

134. Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and

(*xii*) This matter will be decided in connection with the whole question. In the meantime Government are prepared to consider favourably any proposals from local bodies that show an adequate degree of self-help on their part.

Projected Faridpur-Bhanga-Madaripur Railway.

130. Babu BHISHMADEV DAS: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works be pleased to state what progress has been made in the project of the Faridpur-Bhanga-Madaripur Railway?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: In May, 1920, the Railway Board sanctioned a traffic reconnaissance survey for a broad gauge line between Faridpur and Barisal *vid* Bhanga.

The local Government have no further information in this matter.

Railway between Faridpur and Barisal or Jessore.

131. Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works kindly state whether there have been any projects before Government for constructing a railway connecting the district of Faridpur with the district of Barisal or Jessore, in recent years?

(*b*) If so, what has been the final decision of the Government on these projects?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) and (*b*) In the year 1919 a project for a broad gauge line to connect Faridpur with Jessore was laid before the local Government for consideration, by the Railway Board. The reasons for abandoning the project, for the present, have been given in a press *communiqué* issued by the Government on the 3rd March, 1920, to which the attention of the member is invited.

In regard to a railway connection between Faridpur and Barisal, the Railway Board sanctioned in May, 1920, a traffic reconnaissance survey for a broad gauge line *vid* Bhanga.

The local Government have no further information in this matter.

Expenditure for the upkeep of experimental farms.

132. Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state what amount of money has been spent during the last three years on the upkeep of the experimental farms and how

much of that money has been realised by the sale of the produce of the said farms?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to say whether the Government are considering the desirability of inquiring into the causes of the loss, if any, with a view to reducing it consistently with the demand of a scientific investigation?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the necessity of establishing one or two agricultural farms on business lines to demonstrate that agriculture on advanced modern methods can be carried on at a profit?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) The member is referred to the reply to question No. 112(*d*) asked by Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur at the Council meeting of the 1st April, 1921, for information relating to the years 1918-19 and 1919-20. The receipts and expenditure for 1920 amount to Rs. 52,508 and Rs. 2,30,137-9-5 respectively.

(*b*) These farms are purely experimental, but expenses are kept down as much as possible, consistently with maintaining the efficiency of scientific investigation, which is necessarily costly and not directly profitable.

(*c*) Yes. This matter is receiving consideration.

Arrangement for holding charge during recess period of Settlement Department.

133. Maulvi RAFI UDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to state the reasons why during the absence on leave of the settlement officers their assistants, while being allowed to hold charge of their posts, are not shown as officiating for them?

(*b*) If there is no necessity for officiating men during the recess period, are the Government considering the desirability of reverting all settlement officers to the general department during that period?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) The appointment of of settlement officer is ordinarily filled by an officer who would otherwise be entitled to an appointment as Magistrate-Collector. A junior officer of the Indian Civil Service or of the Bengal Civil Service cannot therefore officiate as settlement officer.

(*b*) It is necessary that some officer should be in charge of the routine duties of the settlement officer when he is absent on leave.

Audit fees levied from co-operative societies.

134. Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and

ndustries be pleased to state whether the audit fees levied from the o-operative societies are accounted for on the receipts side of the urrent Budget estimate?

(*b*) If so, what is the amount of such receipts?

(*c*) What is the amount of salaries and allowances paid to the uditors during the last two financial years; and what amount has been redited to the Government during the period, as audit fees levied from he co-operative societies?

(*d*) What is the principle on which audit fees are levied from the co-operative societies?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB .ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) The receipts on account of audit fees levied from co-operative societies are included in the estimate under the head "Fees for Government audits" in the XXXV Miscellaneous Budget for 1921-22.

(*b*) The estimated receipts for fees for audit of co-operative societies for 1921-22 are Rs. 56,000.

(*c*) A statement is laid on the table.

(*d*) The principle is laid down in notification No. 1379T. R., dated the 22nd September, 1917, a copy of which is laid on the library table.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 134 (c) showing the receipts on account of audit fees levied from co-operative societies and the expenditure incurred on account of pay and allowances of auditors and their peons during the years 1919-20 and 1920-21.

Year	Receipts from audit fees	Expenditure on account of—			Remarks
		Pay and allowances of auditors.	Pay of peons.	Travelling allowance of peons and auditors	
1	2	3	4	5	6
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	
1919-20 ...	45,758	26,156	3,360	16,800	The figures in column 5 are approximate. No separate account of travelling allowance of auditors and their peons is kept
1920-21 ...	51,571	34,030	4,560	23,900	

Scarcity of rice and other food-grains.

135. Babu SURENDRA NARAYAN SINHA: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Commerce be pleased to state what steps, if any, Government are going to adopt to cope with the situation arising out of the apprehended scarcity of rice and other food-grains caused by export in certain districts of Bengal?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: Government are not aware of any apprehended scarcity of rice or other food-grains due to export in any district of Bengal.

Pensioners and enhanced rate of pensions.

136. Mr. H. A. STARK: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state

(*i*) how many persons drawing superannuation *civil* pensions from the Bengal Government were on the 31st March, 1921, in receipt of pensions enhanced under resolution No. 1085 E. A., dated Delhi, the 15th November, 1919, by the Government of India in the Financial Department;

(*ii*) how many persons drawing superannuation *civil* pensions from the Government of Bengal were on the 31st March, 1921, in receipt of pensions enhanced under resolution of the Government of India in the Financial Department, No. 55 C. S. B., dated the 14th January, 1921;

(*iii*) how many persons drawing superannuation *civil* pensions from the Government of Bengal on the 31st March, 1921, were excluded from the operation of the resolutions cited in (*i*) and (*ii*) above;

(*iv*) what was the total amount paid to each of the above groups of pensioners in April, 1921, for March, 1921?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (*i*) The number is 71.

(*ii*) The number is 139. But this figure is not complete as there is still a considerable number of cases under inquiry.

(*iii*) (*a*) The number is 34.

(*b*) The number is 2,026. The remark above applies to this figure also.

(*iv*) (*a*) The total amount of pensions paid is Rs. 31,541-1-11.

(*b*) The total amount of pensions paid is Rs. 3,814-2. The figures under (*b*) will be further enhanced when the cases under inquiry are settled and the full effect of the increase appears in the accounts.

Famine in Khulna.

137. Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue), aware that there has been severe scarcity and acute distress in most of the villages in thanas Paikgacha, Kaliganj, Asasuni, Shyamnagar and Magura in the district of Khulna?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state what steps, if any, the Government propose to take to mitigate the hardship and distress?

(*c*) Has the attention of the Government been drawn to the appeal over the signature of Sir P. C. Roy published in the newspapers?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) (*b*) and (*c*) The member is referred to the *communiqué* recently published, which gives the answers to his questions.

Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: As regards the steps Government is said to have taken to mitigate the distress in Khulna, as published in the *communiqué* will the Government be pleased to state what amount has actually been granted?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: If the member had read the *communiqué* with a little more care he would have found his question already answered there. The *communiqué* distinctly states the amount sanctioned to mitigate the distress in Khulna.

Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the exact amount?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: Rs. 32,000, and Rs. 1,000 for the purchase of cloth.

Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state whether the latter amount is sufficient for the purpose for which it is intended?

The PRESIDENT: The question is in the nature of a request for an expression of opinion. I disallow it.

Report of the Ministerial Officers' Salary Committee.

138. Babu SURENDRA NARAYAN SINHA: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state—

(*i*) whether the Commissioners appointed to consider the question of salary of the ministerial officers have submitted their report;

(*ii*) whether the report is unanimous;

(*iii*) when the report will be published for the general information of the public; and

(*iv*) what is the lowest scale of salary they have recommended and what scale the Government propose to accept?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (*i*) Yes.

(*ii*) No.

(*iii*) The report will be laid on the table during the present session.

(*iv*) It is not clear to what class of employees the member refers. If it is to ministerial officers, the minimum salary proposed by the Committee for such, on confirmation, is Rs. 40 per mensem. Government's proposals are at present under consideration.

Cotton growing in Bengal.

139. Babu JATINDRA NATH BASU: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state what steps have been taken to promote the growth of cotton in the province, especially since January last?

(*b*) Have the Government any statistics by which they can say, as a matter of fact, what are the classes of cotton that by experience have been found to be capable of being grown profitably?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether the Government are considering the desirability of publishing in a popular form in the vernacular the information available to them in the matter?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) and (*b*) The member is referred to the reply given to question No. 33 asked by Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta at the Council meeting of the 7th February, 1921. A bulletin on the history of cotton experiments in Bengal has since been published and instructions have been issued to Agricultural Officers to encourage growing of cotton, as single bushes or hedges on raised land close to the homesteads of the cultivators. Cotton seed has also been supplied where wanted.

Tree cotton, such as Bourbon, or long staple varieties, such as Cambodia, Dharwar or Puri, may possibly give satisfactory results when grown under the above conditions.

(*c*) Steps are being taken to issue a vernacular edition of the bulletin published in English recently.

Improvement of cattle breeding.

140. Babu JATINDRA NATH BASU: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be

pleased to state what steps, if any, have been taken especially since January last to improve the breed and number of cattle in the province?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: It has been decided at the conference of the Department of Agriculture and Industries held in April last that a cattle-breeding section should be established in every district, combined with the district farms, as funds and local conditions permit. A scheme is being worked out in consultation with the officers of the Agricultural Department, and a start will be made by utilizing the cross-bred bulls which will shortly be available at the Rangpur Cattle Farm.

"Basudeva Mandir" in village Utter Shabazpur in Bakarganj.

141. Babu NIBARAN CHANDRA DAS GUPTA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state whether he is aware of the fact that the ancient temple, popularly known as "Basudeva Mandir," in village Utter Shabazpur, within the jurisdiction of thana Mehendiganj, in the district of Bakarganj, is in a state of disrepair and neglect?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of bringing the temple under the operation of the Ancient Monuments Preservation Act, and to take steps for its preservation and repair?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) No.

(*b*) The Superintendent, Archaeological Survey, Eastern Circle, will visit the place shortly and submit a report on the advisability of bringing the temple under the operations of the Ancient Monuments Preservation Act and taking steps for its preservation.

Public Works Department subdivisions and Zilla School buildings at Burdwan.

142. Raja MANILOLL SINGH ROY: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works be pleased to state

(*i*) how many subdivisional officers, Public Works Department, are posted to the district of Burdwan;

(*ii*) in what other districts of Bengal are there more than one subdivisional officer;

(*iii*) what was the establishment cost of the Government when the whole work was entrusted to the district board of Burdwan and what is the cost now; and

(*iv*) what are the special reasons for establishing so many subdivisions, Public Works Department, at Burdwan?

(*b*) Is it a fact that the money sanctioned for the construction by the Public Works Department of the Zilla School and attached buildings at Burdwan was allowed to lapse last year?

(*c*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state reasons for it?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) (*i*) Three.

(*ii*) (*1*) 24-Parganas, (*2*) Jalpaiguri, (*3*) Darjeeling, (*4*) Rajshahi, (*5*) Dacca, (*6*) Mymensingh, (*7*) Faridpur, (*8*) Midnapore.

(*iii*) Rupees 9,743 was the average cost of establishment for five years when Public Works Department work was entrusted to the District Board. This represents 15 per cent. of the expenditure on works and repairs. The present cost of establishment, taking an average of the past five years, is Rs. 25,169, which works out to 12 per cent. on the cost of works and repairs executed by the establishment maintained by Government.

(*iv*) (*1*) Increased work.

(*2*) Efficient supervision and execution of the large amount of work administratively sanctioned in December, 1919.

A temporary construction subdivision was formed to cope with works amounting to Rs. 7,54,000 and the continuance of this subdivision for two years from December, 1919, was sanctioned. The question of continuing or abolishing this subdivision will be examined in December, 1921.

(*b*) The allotment for the Zilla School for 1920-21 was Rs. 76,000 and the expenditure was Rs. 74,727.

(*c*) The question does not arise in view of the reply to (*b*).

Distress in certain villages in Kandi.

143. Babu SURENDRA NARAYAN SINHA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation be pleased to state whether the Government are aware that the people of the villages of Hatisala, Sundarpur, Belgram, Phupra, Tagra, Satitara, Ballavpur, Jajan and other adjoining villages have been suffering from much trouble, hardship and damage from the effects of flood?

(*b*) If so, what measures, if any, are the Government taking to relieve the people of these villages situated in the subdivision of Kandi in the district of Murshidabad?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) The Government are aware that some damage to crops and hardship to the people of villages Hatisala, Sundarpur, etc., in Kandi subdivision, is entailed as a result of flooding from the spill

of the Mourakhi river, mainly through breaches in the zamindari embankments, which are not maintained properly.

(*b*) Government do not propose to take any action as the work of repairing the breaches should devolve on the zamindars concerned.

Improvement of food-grains and other agricultural produce.

144. Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state what practical steps, if any, and with what results, have been taken by the Agricultural Department, for the improvement of food-grains and other agricultural produce of Bengal (except the introduction of *Kakya Bombai* jute and *Indrasail* paddy) during the last five years?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: The member is referred to the annual reports of this Department for those years. It will be observed that a considerable amount of valuable work, which has already led to definite results, has been done on the following among other crops in addition to *Kakya Bombai* jute and *Indrasail* paddy:—

(*1*) *aus* paddy;

(*2*) potatoes;

(*3*) sugarcane;

(*4*) ground-nuts; and

(*5*) tobacco

Supplementary statements with reference to the answers given by Mr. Hornell to unstarred question No 66. (b) asked by Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta at the meeting of the Bengal Legislative Council held on the 14th March, 1921.

Applications for recurring grants from high schools (for boys), 1920-21.

Serial No.	Names of Schools.	Amount of grant applied for.	How disposed of.
	Presidency Division	Rs.	
1	Town Sripur ...	100	The application is recommended by the District Magistrate, but for want of funds no grant has been sanctioned
2	Narail Subdivisional ...	150	Ditto ditto.
3	Alamdanga	200	Ditto ditto
4	Sarangabad	125	For want of funds the District Magistrate has not been consulted
5	Scottish Churches College	500	An application in the proper form has been called for
6	Jun, b Badhal ...	150 (about)	The District Magistrate is not in favour of giving a grant unless it is amalgamated with the Bandra High English School
7	Dhanola Union ...	100	Grant sanctioned
8	Goalmuth	100	The District Magistrate has not been consulted for want of funds.
9	Memnagar ...	100	Recommended by the District Magistrate, but no funds are available
10	St Paul's Aided ...	50 (addl.)	The Secretary has been requested to submit an application showing the necessary particulars
11	St John's Aided ...	175 ,,	The application is under consideration, but there are no funds
12	Gulliatia	180	Grant sanctioned
13	Salar Edward Aided ...	120 (addl.)	Sanctioned Rs 20 a month only for the present for want of funds

Serial No	Names of Schools.	Amount of grant applied for.	How disposed of.
	Presidency Division—*concld.*	Rs.	
14	Sijgram Aided ...	120 (addl.)	Sanctioned Rs. 50 a month only for the present for want of funds.
15	Arbelia Aided ...	Amount not stated	The grant is not sanctioned for want of funds.
16	Nalta Aided ...	55 (addl.)	Sanctioned Rs. 40 a month only for want of funds
17	Krishnath Collegiate (Aided)	Amount not stated	Not sanctioned for want of funds.
18	Kagram Aided ...	69 (addl.)	Ditto ditto.
19	Pargram Kasba ...	100 ,,	Sanctioned Rs. 15 a month only for want of funds
20	Beldanga Aided ...	100 ,,	Not sanctioned for want of funds
21	Jagabandhu Institution ...	150 ,,	Ditto ditto
22	Chakdah Aided ...	20 ,,	Ditto ditto
23	Mahespur Aided ...	15 ,,	Ditto ditto
24	Baruipur Aided ...	Amount not stated	Ditto ditto
25	Hatuganj Aided ...	65 (addl.)	Ditto ditto
26	Rajbpur Aided ...	45 ,,	Sanctioned Rs. 20 a month only for want of funds
27	Gosain Durgapur ...	45 ,,	Not sanctioned for want of funds
28	Baharu Aided ...	70 ,,	Ditto ditto
29	Narail Victoria Collegiate	50 ,,	Ditto ditto
30	Bongaon Aided ...	40 ,,	Ditto ditto
31	Dumpol Aided ...	30 ,,	Ditto ditto
32	Khagra L. M. S ...	135 ,,	Sanctioned.
33	Meherpur Aided ...	150 ,,	Not sanctioned for want of funds
34	Sridhar Bansadhar Aided	50 ,,	Ditto ditto
35	Shikarpur Aided ...	50 ,,	Ditto ditto.

Serial No.	Names of schools	Amount of grant applied for	How disposed of.
	Burdwan Division.	Rs.	
36	Purbasthali ...	100	Rs 50 sanctioned
37	Asansol, E I Ry ...	475	Sanctioned
38	Ilsbergarh	100	Rs. 65 sanctioned
39	Patuli	50	Rs 30 sanctioned
40	Ikra	400	Grant refused as the school authorities did not comply with the rules
41	Okersa	155	Sanctioned
42	Rayna	60	Ditto.
43	Balli	50	Ditto
44	Bhuta	75	This is an application for an increased grant, which was not entertained
45	Ranigunj	200	Sanctioned
46	Ramgopalpur ...	100	Under correspondence
47	Nasegram	108	Rs 68 sanctioned
48	Rampurhat Union ...	150	Under correspondence
49	Bolpur	200	Rs 134 sanctioned.
50	Nalhati	160	Rs 100 sanctioned
51	Rampurhat	200	Rs 125 sanctioned
52	Suri E. M. Institution ...	125	Sanctioned
53	Hetampore Raj ...	200	Under correspondence
54	Vishnupur	175	Rs 149 sanctioned
55	Bankura Hindu ...	175	Rs 150 sanctioned
56	Kotalpur	135	Rs 105 sanctioned
57	Ku Nakole	75	Rs 50 sanctioned
58	Rajgram	125	Not entertained
59	Kuchkuchia	175	Rs 166 sanctioned
60	Sonamukhi	140	Rs 80 sanctioned

Serial No	Names of schools.	Amount of grant applied for.	How disposed of
	Burdwan Division—*contd*	Rs.	
61	Garbeta	229	Rs 85 sanctioned
62	Pingla	156	Under correspondence
63	Contai	457	Rs 150 sanctioned
64	Do Model ...	150	No grant was sanctioned as the conditions laid down in the rules were not complied with
65	Kharagpur	1,100	Rs. 771 sanctioned
66	Chandrakona ...	100	Sanctioned
67	Jara	115	Rs 50 sanctioned
68	Tamluk	200	Rs 105 sanctioned
69	Ghatal	150	Rs 140 sanctioned
70	Irphala	162	Rs 70 sanctioned
71	Midnapore Collegiate ...	700	Rs 654 sanctioned.
72	Chinsura U F C ...	200	Sanctioned
73	Serampore Collegiate ...	350	Rs 300 sanctioned
74	Konnagar	190	Rs 113 sanctioned
75	Kaikala	80	Under correspondence
76	Bhandarhati ...	130	Rs 90 sanctioned
77	Chatra N. L. Institution ...	147	Rs 140 sanctioned
78	Rajbalhat	125	Application not entertained
79	Arambagh	159	Sanctioned
80	Bhastara	100	Rs 60 sanctioned
81	Somra	75	Sanctioned
82	Bagati	80	Rs 70 sanctioned
83	Balagarh	100	Rs 75 sanctioned
84	Uluberia	150	Under correspondence
85	Garbhowanipur ...	150	Rs 130 sanctioned

Serial No	Names of schools	Amount of grant applied for	How disposed of
	Burdwan Division—*concld*	Rs	
86	Bally R T	250	Rs 130 sanctioned
87	Majn	150	Rs 135 sanctioned
88	Jagatballavpur ...	125	Rs 75 sanctioned
89	Chaltakhali	150	Rs 70 sanctioned
90	Baluti	150	Rs 105 sanctioned
91	Mogkalyan	1 1	Sanctioned
92	Narit	60	Rs 40 sanctioned
93	Jiapardih	150	Rs 75 sanctioned
94	Jhunkra	100	Rs 50 sanctioned
95	Rashpur	100	Under correspondence
96	Panitras	01	Ditto
97	Amta ...	145	Rs 96 sanctioned
	Dacca Division		
98	Mirpur Siddhanta ...	151	Not sanctioned
99	Sonakanda B M Institution	200	Rs 100 sanctioned
100	Ahabed Islamia ..	75 (addl.)	Rs 40 sanctioned
101	Rupsra R K R M ...	200	Not sanctioned
102	Parkpara Union Institution	100	Sanctioned
103	Kahgaon R K N ...	25 (addl.)	Not sanctioned
104	Chandipasa	150	Ditto
105	Ghosgaon	150	Ditto
106	Jatra	150	Rs 100 sanctioned
107	Kamhari R N ...	100	Not sanctioned
108	Tangail B B ..	150 (addl.)	Rs 100 sanctioned
109	Nettrakona Islamia ...	100	Sanctioned
110	Kendua Sprg Institution	50(addl.)	Rs 30 sanctioned

Serial No	Names of Schools	Amount of grant applied for	How disposed of.
	DACCA DIVISION—*concld.*	Rs	
111	Purbadhala	100	Not sanctioned
112	Kishoreganj Azimuddin ...	150	Rs 100 sanctioned
113	Bansrasi	200	Not sanctioned
114	Pangsa	200	Rs 100 sanctioned
115	Chikandi	150	Rs 100 sanctioned
116	Gopalganj M N Institution	90 (addl.)	Not sanctioned
117	Kalia R R.	A suitable amount	Ditto.
118	Netrakona Dutta ...	75 (addl.)	Rs. 65 sanctioned
119	Chhoygaon	200	Not sanctioned
120	Kadamtala George ...	150	Rs 100 sanctioned
121	Bacanadi	250	Rs. 100 sanctioned
122	Daulatkhan	250	Not sanctioned
	CHITTAGONG DIVISION		
123	Khulpara	200	The grant could not be sanctioned for want of funds.
124	Singergaon	100	Ditto ditto
125	Kedarkhil	100	Ditto ditto.
126	Chittagong	220	Rs 150 sanctioned
127	Hatya Union ...	150	The grant could not be sanctioned for want of funds
128	R K. Jubilee ...	50 (addl.)	Ditto ditto
129	Chandpur H. J. ...	225	Ditto ditto.
130	Feni	200	Ditto ditto
131	Brahmanbaria Annada ...	150	Ditto ditto
132	Ditto George ...	100	Ditto ditto.
133	Fatikchari	75	Ditto ditto.

Serial No.	Names of Schools	Amount of grant applied for	How disposed of.
	Chittagong Division —*concld.*	Rs.	
134	Comilla Yusuf ...	200	The grant could not be sanctioned for want of funds
135	Noakhali Jubilee ...	100	Ditto ditto
136	Umatara	200	Ditto ditto
137	Satkawa	150	Ditto ditto
138	Anwara	200	Ditto ditto
139	Barama	100	Ditto ditto.
140	Nabinagore ..	150	Ditto ditto
141	Sarail	150	Ditto ditto.
142	Muradnagore ...	100	Ditto ditto
143	Comilla Victoria ...	150	Ditto ditto
144	Cheora	100	Ditto ditto
145	Sonaimuri ..	200	Ditto ditto
146	Pana Meah	100	Ditto ditto
147	Chogadharya ..	100	Ditto ditto
148	Begumgaon	200	Ditto ditto
149	Sandwip Cargill ...	100	Ditto ditto
150	Lakshipur	100	Ditto ditto
151	Rahatali . .	150	Ditto ditto
152	Sitakund	100	Ditto ditto.
153	Hathazari	100	Ditto ditto
154	Mohamuni ...	75	Ditto ditto
155	Noapara ...	200	Ditto ditto
156	Shakpara	200	Ditto ditto
	Rajshahi Division		
157	Naogaon K. D ...	225	Rs. 200 sanctioned.
158	Balurghat	250	Sanctioned

Serial No.	Names of Schools	Amount of grant applied for	How disposed of
	Rajshahi Division —*contd.*	Rs.	
159	Thakurgaon	300	The Secretary has been asked to apply in the prescribed form.
160	Debiganj	200	To be sanctioned in 1921-22.
161	Gaibandha	175	Sanctioned.
162	Ditto Islamia ...	175	Rs. 140 sanctioned
163	Chak Atultra ...	150	The Subdivisional Officer speaks against the school.
164	Nilphamari	340	Sanctioned.
165	Saidpur	200	Ditto.
166	Mahimaganj ..	50	Ditto.
167	Sherpur	200	Rs. 175 sanctioned
168	Sonatola	175	Sanctioned.
169	Talora	75	Rs. 60 sanctioned.
170	Naokhola	50	Sanctioned
171	Kalai	150	Rs. 100 sanctioned
172	Sukhanpukur ...	200	Rs. 75 sanctioned
173	Khanjanpur	150	Sanctioned.
174	Shibal Pakrashi ...	200	Not sanctioned
175	Serajganj B. L. ...	325	Sanctioned.
176	Shahazadpur ...	220	Rs. 200 sanctioned
177	Porjona	175	Sanctioned.
178	Ullapore	175	Ditto
179	F. P. Institution, Jalpaiguri	200	Not sanctioned
180	Pabna R. M. Academy ...	100	Sanctioned
181	Chowbari Islamia ...	150 (addl.)	Not sanctioned as the school does not deserve it.
182	Siliguri	200	Sanctioned

Serial No.	Names of Schools.	Amount of grant applied for	How disposed of.
	Rajshahi Division—*concld*	Rs.	
183	Rajarampur ...	150	The question of grant will be decided after visiting the school.
184	Daulatpur	75	Ditto ditto.
185	Gobindaganj ...	150	The school authorities have been asked to supply all information required under the rules
186	Dinajpur ...	300	The Secretary of the school has been informed that no grant can be sanctioned before the question is discussed with the committee
187	Kagail	200	No grant could be sanctioned
188	Alipur Duar ...	200	The case could not be disposed of as the application was not properly drawn up
189	Kshitimohan Institution	138	The Subdivisional Officer reports that the school is in a very bad condition
190	Cooch Behar ...	200	No grant could be sanctioned as the school was an unrecognised one
191	[illegible] ...	150	The grant was not recommended by the District Magistrate
192	Sadullapur	150	The application has been sent to the District Magistrate for opinion

Applications for recurring grants from high schools (for girls), 1920-21.

	Presidency Division	Rs	
1	Brahmo Girls ...	150 (addl.)	The application was returned with a reply that no funds were available.
	Rajshahi Division		
2	Darjeeling Maharani ...	250 (addl.)	Rs 150 sanctioned.

Applications for capital grants from high schools (for boys), 1920-21.

Serial No.	Names of Schools	Amount of grant applied for.	How disposed of.
	PRESIDENCY DIVISION.	Rs	
1	Chakdah Aided (building)	8,000	The estimated cost of the project is Rs 8,000. The school authorities have been asked to state whether they are willing to contribute two-thirds of the cost from private sources.
2	Amtola	1,000	The case cannot be considered unless the school is recognised.
3	Rangdia Aided ...	8,000	Under correspondence with the Director of Public Health.
4	Meheshtola Aided ...	5,000	Under correspondence with the Secretary of the school.
5	Basirhat Aided ...	16,310	Ditto ditto.
6	Gulbatia Aided (building)	30,000	Ditto ditto.
7	Ranaghat Aided (furniture)	150	Not sanctioned for want of funds.
8	Salar Edward Aided (land acquisition).	400	Under correspondence with the Secretary of the school.
9	Ranaghat Aided (play ground)	4,500	Not sanctioned for want of funds.
10	Khagra L. M. S. Aided ...	2,183	Held up for want of funds. To be considered in 1921-22.
11	Chakdah Aided (furniture)	350	Not sanctioned for want of funds.
12	Bahirdia Aided ...	173	Ditto ditto.
13	Harinarayanpur Aided ...	136	Sanctioned.
14	Mazilpur Aided ...	500	Not sanctioned for want of funds.
15	Jagabandhu Institution ...	300	Sanctioned.
16	Barnipur Aided ...	Amount not stated.	Not sanctioned for want of funds.
17	Salar Edward Aided (furniture)	100	Sanctioned.

Serial No.	Names of Schools.	Amount of grant applied for.	How disposed of.
	Presidency Division —*concld*	Rs	
18	Goalmuth	500	Not sanctioned for the failure of the school authorities to comply with the rules
19	Gulbatia Aided (furniture)	300	Not sanctioned for want of funds
20	Town Sripur	250	Sanctioned
21	Nalta Aided ...	150	Not sanctioned for want of funds.
22	Gulbatia Aided (play ground)	300	Under correspondence
23	Sri Vishudhyananda Saraswati Vidyalaya	Amount not stated	Ditto
24	Raruli R. K. R. K. Harish Chandra Institution	8,675	Additional grant. Held up for want of funds. To be considered in 1921-22
25	Chandanga .. .	16,000	Under correspondence
26	Memnagar . .	13,324	Ditto
27	Kagram ..	2,248	Ditto
	Burdwan Division		
28	Putsuri .. .	7,000	Under correspondence
29	Daulat (compound wall)	266	Sanctioned
30	Darmat Hostel (building)	Amount not stated	Not entertained
31	Oversa	165	Rs. 100 sanctioned
32	Asansol	2,317	Under correspondence
33	Rampurhat Union	500	Not entertained
34	Suri B. M. Institution ..	2,500	Rs. 1,500 sanctioned
35	Kuchiakole .. .	38,000	Not entertained
36	Palashdanga .	100	Sanctioned.
37	Bankura Hindu ...	10,000	Under correspondence
38	Kotalpur	1,567	Ditto
39	Contai	2,474	Not entertained

Serial No	NAMES OF SCHOOLS	Amount of grant applied for.	How disposed of.
	BURDWAN DIVISION —*concld*	Rs	
40	Chandrakona ...	7,000	Not entertained
41	Arambagh	2,500	Under correspondence
42	Bhandarhati ...	100	Not entertained
43	Bhustara	100	Ditto.
44	Kaikala	Amount not stated.	Under correspondence
45	Rajbalhat	5,000	Ditto
46	Bagati	500	Rs 400 sanctioned
47	Janai	200	Under correspondence
48	Hooba Mondalai (play ground).	318	Sanctioned
49	Hooba Mondalai (class rooms)	Balance of the grant of Rs 500	Rs 100 sanctioned
50	Goptipara	Ditto	Rs 50 sanctioned
51	Serampore Union ...	Ditto	Rs 100 sanctioned.
52	Ditto ...	500	Sanctioned.
53	Chinsura U. F. C ...	4,417	Under correspondence
54	Anata	100	Ditto
55	Bagnan	Amount not stated	Ditto
	DACCA DIVISION	Rs	
56	Netrakona Datta ...	500	Not sanctioned.
57	Idilpur	400	Sanctioned.
58	Lousingh	250	Ditto
59	Bajitpur Edward ...	266	Ditto.
60	Barlbo Tara Institution ...	400	Ditto.
61	Baranadi	4,000	Not sanctioned.

Serial No	Names of Schools	Amount of grant applied for.	How disposed of
	Chittagong Division.	Rs	
62	Fatehabad ...	1,000	Rs 500 sanctioned
63	Rameudra ...	2,500	Grant could not be sanctioned for want of funds
64	Feni	1,522	Under consideration
65	Do	750	Ditto
66	Hathazari ...	500	Sanctioned
67	Anwara	500	Under correspondence.
68	Lorwarganj	500	Rs 435 sanctioned
69	Brahmanbaria Ananda ...	5,000	The grant could not be sanctioned for want of funds
70	Brahmanbaria George ...	500	A nominal grant will be made in 1921-22 to help also land acquisition proceedings
71	Baburhat ...	500	The grant could not be sanctioned for want of funds.
72	Iswaripathsala Comilla	100	Sanctioned.
73	Brahmanbaria Ananda ...	714	Rs. 100 sanctioned.
74	Baburhat ...	230	Rs 75 sanctioned
75	Chittagong ...	150	Rs 100 sanctioned
76	Chittagong Municipal	100	Rs 85 sanctioned
77	Fatikhari ...	50	Sanctioned
78	Hathazari ...	270	Rs 100 sanctioned
79	Noapara ...	250	Rs 75 sanctioned
80	Patya Bolatali ...	200	Rs 100 sanctioned
81	Satkania ...	150	Rs 80 sanctioned
82	Anwara	115	Rs. 75 sanctioned
	Rajshahi Division.		
83	Sadpur ...	500	Sanctioned
84	Dubiganj	100	Ditto
85	Kurigram ...	250	Ditto

J]

Serial No.	Name of schools	Amount of grant applied for.	How disposed of.
	Rajshahi Division—*concld.*	Rs.	
86	Chowbari	500	Not sanctioned for want of sufficient details
87	Sherpur	300	Rs. 285 sanctioned.
88	Gadamdiha Islamia ...	500	Sanctioned
89	Nilphamari	500	There was no estimate along with the letter and it was received too late to take any action
90	Potapa	500	As the work was taken up without the previous sanction of the Department, no consideration was made
91	Naharia .. .	500	Not sanctioned for want of sufficient details.
92	Sibgunj	23,000	The case is being matured
93	Radhanagore Mazumdar Academy	9,000	Ditto
94	Akurmoni	5,000	Rs 4,000 sanctioned

Applications for capital grant for high schools (for girls), 1920-21.

	Presidency Division	Rs	
1	Diocesan Collegiate ...	10,000	The application was returned with the intimation that funds were not available.
2	Victoria Institution ...	1,00,000	The application was refused as neither land nor money were available
3	Brahmo Girls,		
	(a) Land acquisition	32,200	Held up for want of funds The school authorities were told that Rs 500 only were available
	(b) New building ...	40,000	The school authorities were informed that funds were not available.
	(c) Motor buses ...	17,000	The case is pending for want of funds
	(d) Furniture ...	2,000	Ditto . ditto.
4	Gokhale Memorial ...	1,00,000	The school authorities have been asked to prepare the case.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 11 (5) asked by Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray at the meeting of the 1st April, 1921.

Name and nature of constituency	Names of candidates	Amount of election expenses
		Rs. a. p.
Calcutta North (Non-Muhammadan), Urban	Babu Jatindra Nath Bose	512 14 0
Calcutta North West (Non-Muhammadan), Urban	Mr. Satish Ranjan Das	3,874 12 0
	Kumar Rajendra Narain Roy	2,959 1 9
Calcutta East (Non-Muhammadan), Urban	Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur	1,934 15 6
	Lt.-Col. S. P. Sarbadhikari	1339 11 6
Calcutta North Central (Non-Muhammadan), Urban	Dr. Haridhone Dutt Roy Bahadur	595 1 3
	Mr. D. N. Dutt	18 8 0
Calcutta South Central (Non-Muhammadan) Urban	Babu Aswini Kumar Banerji	243 6 0
	Capt. Jitendra Nath Banerji	241 14 0
	Mr. D. J. Cohen	243 14 0
	Dr. G. Sarkar	489 14 0
Calcutta South (Non-Muhammadan) Urban	Babu Surendra Nath Mallik	655 7 0
	Charu Chandra Biswas	3 3 0
Hooghly Municipal (Non-Muhammadan), Urban	Rai Mahendra Ch. Mitra Bahadur	403 6 0
	Mahendra Ch. Lahiri Bahadur	84 11 9
Howrah Municipal (Non-Muhammadan) Urban	Babu Nityadhan Mukherji	2 6 0
24 Parganas Municipal North (Non-Muhammadan) Urban	Sir Surendra Nath Banerji, Kt.	116 5 6
24 Parganas Municipal South (Non-Muhammadan) Urban	Rai Jatindra Nath Chaudhuri	5,095 1 0
	Babu Surendra Nath Roy	5,723 14 6
Dacca City (Non-Muhammadan) Urban	Rai Peary Lal Das Bahadur	87 10 0
	Babu Dhirendra Chandra Roy	27 12 6
	Sarat Chandra Chakravarti	1 0 0
	Debendra Kumar *alias* Debendra Nath Das	Nil
	Akhoy Kumar Basak	Nil
	Nakendu Nath Basak	Nil

Serial No.	Name of schools	Amount of grant applied for.	How disposed of.
	Rajshahi Division—*concld.*	Rs.	
86	Chowbari	500	Not sanctioned for want of sufficient details
87	Sherpur	300	Rs. 285 sanctioned
88	Garbandha Islamia ...	500	Sanctioned
89	Nilphamari	500	There was no estimate along with the letter and it was received too late to take any action
90	Potapa	500	As the work was taken up without the previous sanction of the Department, no consideration was made
91	Nacharia ...	500	Not sanctioned for want of sufficient details.
92	Sohgora	24,000	The case is being matured
93	Radhanagore Mazumdar Academy	9,000	Ditto
94	Akkurmoni	5,000	Rs. 4,000 sanctioned

Applications for capital grant for high schools (for girls), 1920-21.

	Presidency Division	Rs	
1	Diocesan Collegiate ...	10,000	The application was returned with the intimation that funds were not available
2	Victoria Institution ...	1,00,000	The application was refused as neither land nor money were available
3	Brahmo Girls,		
	(a) Land acquisition	32,200	Held up for want of funds. The school authorities were told that Rs. 500 only were available
	(b) New building ...	40,000	The school authorities were informed that funds were not available.
	(c) Motor buses ...	17,000	The case is pending for want of funds
	(d) Furniture ...	2,000	Ditto . ditto.
4	Gokhale Memorial ...	1,00,000	The school authorities have been asked to prepare the case.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 11 (5) asked by Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray at the meeting of the 1st April, 1921.

Name and nature of constituency	Names of candidates	Amount of election expenses
		Rs. a. p.
Calcutta North (Non Muhammadan), Urban	Babu Jatindra Nath Bose	512 14 0
Calcutta North West (Non Muhammadan), Urban ...	Mr. Satish Ranjan Das ...	1,874 12 0
	Kumar Rajendra Narain Roy ...	2,959 1 9
Calcutta East (Non Muhammadan), Urban	Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur	1,933 15 6
	Lt.-Col. S. P. Sarbadhikari ...	1,439 11 6
Calcutta North Central (Non Muhammadan) Urban ...	Dr. Haridhone Dutt Rai Bahadur	595 1 3
	Mr. D. N. Dutt	18 8 0
Calcutta South Central (Non Muhammadan) Urban ...	Babu Aswini Kumar Banerji	243 6 0
	Capt. Jitendra Nath Basu ...	241 13 0
	Mr. D. J. Cohen ...	243 14 0
	Lt. G. Sarkar ...	489 14 0
Calcutta South (Non Muhammadan) Urban ...	Babu Surendra Nath Mallik ...	657 7 0
	,, Charu Chandra Biswas	1 3 0
Hooghly Municipal (Non Muhammadan), Urban	Rai Mahendra Ch. Mitra Bahadur	403 6 0
	Mahendra Ch. Lahiri Bahadur	84 11 9
Howrah Municipal (Non Muhammadan) Urban	Babu Satya Jiban Mukherji	2 6 0
24 Parganas Municipal North (Non Muhammadan) Urban	Sir Surendra Nath Banerji Kt.	116 5 6
24 Parganas Municipal South (Non Muhammadan) Urban ...	Rai Jatindra Nath Chaudhuri ...	5,625 1 0
	Babu Surendra Nath Roy ...	3,723 14 6
Dacca City (Non Muhammadan) Urban	Rai Peary Lal Das Bahadur ...	87 10 0
	Babu Dhirendra Chandra Roy ...	27 12 6
	,, Sarat Chandra Chakravarti	1 0 0
	Debendra Kumar *alias* Debendra Nath Das ...	Nil
	Akhoy Kumar Basak ...	Nil
	,, Nakendu Nath Basak ...	Nil

Name and nature of constituency	Names of candidates	Amount of election expenses.
		Rs A P
Burdwan (Non-Muhammadan), Rural	Rai Nalmaksha Basu Bahadur ...	306 15 3
	Babu Lata Bihari Bose ...	271 14 0
	,, Amulya Chandra Mitra ...	8 2 6
	Raja Mani Lal Singh Roy ...	201 0 0
	Babu Hemendra Nath Sen ...	1,136 14 0
Bubhum (Non-Muhammadan), Rural	Raja Satya Niranjan Chakravarti	5,637 7 7½
	,, Mahendra Narayan Chaudhuri	538 9 3
	Rai Abinash Ch Bandopadhaya Bahadur	3,534 9 3
	Babu Nalin Chandra Bandopadhaya	9 0 0
	,, Nirmal Shib Bandopadhaya	44 7 0
	,, Debraj Mukhopadhaya ...	Not furnished
	,, Charu Chandra Singha ...	Ditto.
	,, Binoy Krishna Mukhopadhaya	3,770 3 3
	Lala Mrityunjoy Lal ...	128 3 0
	Rai Rajata Bhusan Mukhopadhaya Bahadur ...	Nil
Bankura West (Non Muhammadan), Rural	Mr A C Dutt	15 0 0
	Babu Rishindra Nath Sarkar ...	650 4 9
	,, S L Dutt	36 2 9
	,, Jagabandhu Singh Chaudhuri	129 10 3
	,, Radyanath Mukharji ...	Not furnished.
	,, Bibhuti Bhusan Ghose ...	Ditto
Bankura East (Non Muhammadan), Rural	Mr A. C Dutt	701 8 6
	Babu Rishindra Nath Sarkar ...	154 14 6
	,, Bholanath Bhattacharya ...	72 0 0
	,, Gagan Bihari Ghose ...	23 14 6
Midnapore North (Non Muhammadan), Rural	Raja Narendra Lal Khan ...	2,918 8 6
	Babu Radha Nath Pati ...	65 5 0
Midnapore South (Non-Muhammadan), Rural	Babu Sarat Chandra Jana ...	141 7 6
	,, Sarat Chandra Mukhopadhaya ...	54 3 9
	,, Pulin Behari Saboo ...	1 2 0
	,, Bidhu Bhusan Hait ...	0 8 0
	,, Abanti Kumar Maiti ...	86 9 0

Name and nature of constituency	Names of candidates	Amount of election expenses		
		Rs	A	P.
Midnapore South (Non-Muhammadan), Rural	Babu Asoka Chandra Dutt ...	835	13	0
	,, Narendra Nath Bose ...	65	10	3
	,, Bipin Bihari Sanyal ...	439	4	6
	,, Manmatha Nath Bose ...	442	6	3
	,, Sital Prosad Ghose ...	36	0	0
	,, Hriday Nath Majhi ...	Nil		
	,, Mukunda Kishore Chakravarti	5	4	0
	,, Debendra Nath Adak ...	0	8	0
	,, Prabhat Chandra Dube ...	10	0	0
	,, Baranashi Banarji ...	14	0	0
	Rai Mahanta Radhasyam Das Adhikari ...	Not furnished		
Hooghly *cum*-Howrah (Non-Muhammadan), Rural	Babu Fanindra Lal De ...	2,075	0	0
	,, Satish Chandra Mukherji ...	247	3	0
	,, Girija Prasanna Roy ...	364	0	0
	,, Hari Prasanna Sarkar ...	218	15	9
24 Parganas Rural Central (Non-Muhammadan) Rural	Mr Dhirendra Chandra Ghose ...	Nil		
	Babu Sashi Sekhar Bose ...	Nil		
	,, Bhabasundhu Sarkar ...	514	6	6
	,, Hem Chandra Sarkar ...	1,898	12	9
24 Parganas Rural South (Non-Muhammadan) Rural ...	Babu Harendra Krishna Deb Sarkar	76	13	9
	,, Sashi Sekhar Bose ...	836	8	6
	Mr Dhirendra Chandra Ghose ...	1,716	1	3
24 Parganas Rural North (Non-Muhammadan) Rural ...	Babu Sarat Chandra Bose ...	2,846	13	0
	Rai Harendra Nath Chaudhuri ...	4,255	5	6
	Babu Satyendra Nath Bose ...	16,550	6	9
Nadia (Non-Muhammadan) Rural ...	Maharaja Khamish Ch Roy Bahadur ...	3,232	8	8
	Mr Jnanendra Nath Roy ...	7,119	12	0
Murshidabad (Non-Muhammadan) Rural	Babu Surendra Narayan Sinha ...	3,275	12	0
	,, Ramani Mohan Sen ...	685	0	6
	,, Atul Kumar Chatarji ...	412	0	0
	,, Jnanendra Nath Chaudhuri	450	8	9
	,, Kali Krishna Banarji ...	Not furnished		

Name and nature of constituency	Names of candidates	Amount of election expenses		
		Rs.	A	P.
Jessore South (Non-Muhammadan), Rural	Rai Jadu Nath Mazumdar Bahadur	374	2	9
	Babu Nabin Nath Roy ...	6,896	3	9
Jessore North (Non Muhammadan), Rural	Babu Bhalendra Chandra Roy ...	298	6	6
Khulna (Non Muhammadan), Rural	Babu Sailaja Nath Ray Chaudhuri	14,983	3	9
	,, Mukunda Bihari Mallik ...	1,116	8	0
	Rai Amrita Lal Raha Bahadur ...	337	3	6
	Babu Bankim Chandra Sen ...	194	15	9
Dacca Rural (Non Muhammadan) Rural	Babu Priya Nath Sen ...	998	10	9
	,, Jogendra Nath Roy ...	8,212	6	0
	Rai P N Basu Chaudhuri ...	69	2	0
	Babu Prahlakha Nath Ghose ...	461	9	0
	Surat Chandra Chatravarti	9	9	0
Mymensingh West (Non Muhammadan) Rural	Raja Manmatha Nath Ray Chaudhuri	2,290	0	6
Mymensingh East (Non Muhammadan) Rural	Babu Harihar Chakravarti	Not furnished		
	,, Gopal Chandra Das ...	2,297	11	0
	,, Gobendra Chandra Dey Roy	578	7	9
	Mr Sudhangshu Mohan Bose ...	4,156	7	9
	Babu Rajendra Kumar Sastri ...	Not furnished		
	,, Surendra Nath Sen ...	519	8	3
Faridpur North (Non Muhammadan), Rural	Dr Jatindra Nath Maitra, M.B. ...	290	3	3
	Babu Kshettra Gopal Sarkar ..	117	6	0
	Rai Radhika Mohan Labiri Bahadur	1,813	4	6
	Babu Pratap Rishi *alias* Pratap Ch Ruhidas ...	Not furnished		
Faridpur South (Non Muhammadan), Rural	Babu Krishna Das Roy ...	580	5	6
	,, Kshirod Chandra Sen ...	126	1	0
	,, Bhuban Mohan Saha ...	63	12	3
	,, Mathura Nath Maitra ...	114	14	0
	,, Jogendra Krishna Roy ...	6,610	9	0
	,, Bhuwadeb Das ...	329	2	0

Name and nature of constituency	Names of candidates	Amount of election expenses		
		Rs	a	p
Bakarganj North (Non Muhammadan), Rural	Babu Nibaran Ch Das Gupta ...	1,435	7	9
	Mr R N. Roy	249	12	6
	Babu Dhirendra Ch. Ray Chaudhuri ...	110	2	3
	Babu Bireswar Sur	226	13	0
	,, Mono Mohan Saha ...	134	10	6
	Mr T R Goswami ...	59	5	0
	Babu Bipin Bihari Das Gupta ..	Nil		
Bakarganj South (Non Muhammadan), Rural	Babu Neresh Bihari Mallik ...	443	4	6
	Rai Satyendra Nath Ray Chaudhuri Bahadur ...	1,270	0	9
	Mr. R. N. Roy	4,126	4	3
Chittagong (Non Muhammadan), Rural	Babu Annada Charan Dutta ...	744	6	3
	Kamini Kumar Das ...	257	0	6
	,, Aparna Charan Pathak	259	12	0
Tippera (Non Mohammedan) Rural	Mr Indu Bhusan Dutt	60	12	6
Noakhali (Non Muhammadan) Rural	Babu Jashoda Kumar Ghosh	384	15	5
	Rasik Chandra Charmakar	74	4	0
Rajshahi (Non Mohammedan) Rural	Babu Kishori Mohan Choudhuri	567	2	0
	,, Surendra Narayan Bhava	42	13	0
	,, Kshitish Chandra Tagore	194	6	9
Dinajpur (Non Muhammadan), Rural	Babu Tanka Nath Chaudhuri ...	474	14	6
	,, Kedar Nath Sen ...	1	4	0
Rangpur (Non Muhammadan) Rural	Rai Sahib Panchanan Barma ...	140	13	9
	Babu Jogesh Chandra Sarkar ...	436	10	0
	Rai Sarat Ch. Chatarje Bahadur	102	7	0
	Babu Basanta Kumar Ghosh ...	131	14	0
	,, Surendra Ch Ray Chaudhuri	807	4	0
Bogra cum Pabna (Non Muhammadan) Rural ..	Sir Ashutosh Chaudhuri, Kt ...	6,151	8	6
	Rai Dinanath Biswas Bahadur ...	996	13	6
	Babu Sitanath Adhikari ...	111	5	0
	,, Suresh Ch. Pakrashi ...	339	0	6
Malda (Non Muhammadan), Rural ...	Rai Sahib Nihmani Ghatak ...	114	4	6
	Babu Ramesh Chandra Bagchi ...	249	9	9
Jalpaiguri (Non Muhammadan) Rural	Babu Prasanna Deb Raikut ...	1,431	8	0
	,, Jyotish Chandra Sanyal ...	750	0	0
	,, Madho Sudan Roy ...	280	0	0

Name and nature of constituency	Names of candidates	Amount of election expenses. Rs A P
Calcutta North (Muhammadan), Urban	Dr. A Suhrawardy ...	26 0 0
	Mr. J. R Zahid Suhrawardy ...	Nil
	Prince Afsal ul Mulk Mirza Muhammad Akram Hossain Bahadur	4 7 0
	Syed Erfan Ali	Nil.
	Maulvi Abdul Aziz Allabux ...	Nil.
Calcutta South (Muhammadan), Urban	Mr J R Zahid Suhrawardy ...	154 12 0
	Khan Bahadur Abdus Salam ...	239 2 0
	Prince Afsal ul-Mulk Mirza Muhammad Akram Hossain Bahadur	5 993 4 0
	Dr. A Suhrawardy ...	41 8 0
	Syed Nasim Ali	4 14 0
	Syed Erfan Ali	Nil.
	Maulvi Abdul Halim ...	Nil
Hooghly *cum* Howrah Municipal (Muhammadan), Urban	Prince Akram Hossain	Nil.
	Mr Abdul Rahim ...	2 8 0
	Dr H Suhrawardy ...	450 13 0
	Syed Erfan Ali	Nil
	Maulvi Zellar Rahim ...	0 4 9
	,, Mowdud Rahman	45 0 0
Barrackpur Municipal (Muhammadan), Urban	Syed Muksood Ali	118 4 0
	,, Erfan Ali	Nil
	,, Mowdud Rahman ...	Nil
	Khan Sahib Maulvi Abdur Rahim	Nil.
	Prince Akram Hossain ...	Nil
	Abdul Ganny Mallik ...	Nil.
24 Parganas Municipal (Muhammadan) Urban	Mr Zahid Suhrawardy ...	18 0 0
	Prince Akram Hossain ...	7 15 0
	Lutfur Rahman	7 8 0
Dacca City (Muhammadan), Urban	Nawabzada K. Mahomed Afzal ...	28 0 0
Burdwan Division North (Muhammadan), Urban	Maulvi Muhammad Madassar Hossain	171 0 0
	Mr H. S. Suhrawardy ...	Nil
	Syed Muhammad Abdulla ...	Nil
	Mr Zohadur Rahim ...	39 13 0
	Ghaudhuri Muhammad Isa ...	32 5 0
	Molla Shamsul Bari ...	Not furnished.

Name and nature of constituency	Names of candidates	Amount of election expenses
		Rs A P
Burdwan Division South (Muhammadan), Urban	Mr H S Suhrawardy ...	293 0 0
	Prince Akram Hossain ...	Nil.
	Dr A Suhrawardy ...	Nil.
	Mr Zahid Suhrawardy ...	Nil
	Syed Ertaz Ali ...	Nil.
	,, Nasim Ali ...	33 0 0
	Mr Zamoor Ahmed ...	175 4 7
	,, Mowdur Rahman ...	Nil
24 Parganas (Muhammadan) Rural	Prince Afsar-ul Mulk Mirza Muhammad Akram Hossain Bahadur	15 0 0
	Mr H S Suhrawardy ...	Nil
	Maulvi Md Wajed Ali ...	Not furnished
	Mr Zahid Suhrawardy ...	Nil
	Syed Nasim Ali	171 14 9
	Maulvi Shamsul Haque ...	5 [illegible] 0
Nadia (Muhammadan) Rural	Mr Syed Ertaz Ali ...	390 10 6
	Munshi Syed Abdul Jabbar ...	10 14 0
	Maulvi Syed Abdul Quddus Rumi ...	398 13 6
	,, Rezaul Hoq ...	111 13 0
	Mr Zahid Suhrawardy ...	Nil
Murshidabad (Muhammadan) Rural	Maulvi Ekramul Haq ...	101 0 3
	Syed Sadeq Reza ...	756 2 0
	Chaudhuri Md Mazharul Haq ...	Not furnished
Jessore South (Muhammadan) Rural	Maulvi Rahuddin Ahmed ...	101 14 0
	Dr A Suhrawardy ...	4 0 0
	Mr. Zahid Suhrawardy ...	Nil.
	Kazi Amanatulla ...	2 11 6
Jessore North (Muhammadan) Rural	Maulvi Hurmotolla ...	28 0 0
	Khan Bahadur Maulvi Azahar Salam	1,257 2 0
Khulna (Muhammadan) Rural	Maulvi Basiruddin ...	3 2 0
	Prince Akram Hossain ...	596 12 0
	Mr Zamil Suhrawardy ...	538 6 0
Dacca West (Muhammadan) Rural	Dr. A. Suhrawardy ...	165 1 0
Dacca East (Muhammadan) Rural	Khan Bahadur K Mahomed Azam	421 14 0
	Maulvi Fazlur Rahim ...	163 14 6

Name and nature of constituency	Names of candidates	Amount of election expenses
		Rs. A. P.
Mymensingh West (Muhammadan) Rural	Yakub Ali Khan	... Not furnished.
	Khandakar Athamuddin	... 174 4 9
	Amin Ali Talukdar	... Not furnished.
	Md. Abdul Gaffur Mia	... 618 9 0
	,, Abdul Jabbar Palwan	... 1,201 0 6
	Nawab Syed Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur, C.I.E.	... ... 1,605 5 9
	Syed Muhammad Hossain	... 194 7 3
	,, Rashidazzaman Chaudhuri	Not furnished.
	Dr. A. Suhrawardy	... 3 0 0
Mymensingh East (Muhammadan), Rural	Nawab Syed Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur, C.I.E.	... 3,584 8 3
	Maulvi Rafiquddin Khan	... 437 8 3
	,, Tale Hossain	... 130 8 0
	Syed Erfan Ali ...	... 0 3 6
	Dewan Abdul Alim	... Not furnished.
	Dr. A. Suhrawardy	... 3 0 0
Faridpur North (Muhammadan), Rural	Maulvi Abdul Kasim	... 10 0 0
Faridpur South (Muhammadan), Rural	Munshi Massamuddin Bhuia	... Not furnished
	Maulvi Mostahuddin Ahmed	... 2,406 11 6
	Rahmat Jan Chaudhuri	... 125 12 0
	Molla Md. Abdur Rahman	... Not furnished.
	Mr. Z. R. Suhrawardy	... Nil
Bakarganj North (Muhammadan), Rural	Maulvi A. H. M. Wazu Ali	... 59 1 3
Bakarganj West (Muhammadan) Rural	Maulvi Azaharuddin Ahmed	... 978 3 6
	,, Hashemati Khan	... 101 8 3
	,, Mahafezuddin Ahmed	... 647 10 0
	Chaudhuri Md. Ismail Khan	... Nil.
	Maulvi A. H. M. Wazir Ali	... Nil.
	,, Syed Abdul Kader	... 253 12 6
	,, Muhammad Ashraff	... Nil.
	Dr. A. Suhrawardy	... Nil
Bakarganj South (Muhammadan), Rural	Maulvi Fazlal Karim	... 37 5 0
	Chaudhuri Md. Ismail Khan	... Nil.

Name and nature of constituency.	Names of candidates	Amount of election expenses
		Rs. A. P.
Chittagong (Muhammadan), Rural	Maulvi Syed Maqbul Hossain ...	4 0 0
	Mr. M. A. Azim ...	55 0 0
	Munshi Ayubah ...	65 0 0
	,, Ammadi ...	70 0 0
	Md. Nasim Serang ...	Not furnished
Tippera (Muhammadan), Rural	Maulvi Shah Sayed Ezadul Haq	180 1 3
	,, Kazi Golam Mahiuddin Faroqui	243 14 6
	,, Mahatezuddin Ahmed ...	23 0 0
	Munshi Nabi	51 0 0
	Maulvi Syed Abdul Jabbar ...	Not furnished
	,, Nurul Haq Chaudhuri ...	Ditto.
Noakhali (Muhammadan) Rural	Munshi Mokaramali ...	69 13 0
	,, Jafar Ahmed ...	69 1 0
	Maulvi Nurul Haq Chaudhuri ...	150 8 0
	Mojumdar Haidar Chaudhuri	667 8 0
	,, Ali Haidar Chaudhuri ...	17 1 9
	Munshi Yakubali ...	Nil
	,, Yusufali ...	Nil
Rajshahi South (Muhammadan) Rural	Maulvi Emadeddin Ahmed ...	201 14 0
	Hazi Lal Mohammad Sardar ...	174 1 6
	Muhammad Akkel ...	12 10 9
Rajshahi North (Muhammadan) Rural	Qazi Yusuf Ali	32 0 0
	Khan Bahadur Maulvi Muhammad Ersad Ali Khan Chaudhuri	516 7 3
Dinajpur (Muhammadan), Rural	Maulvi Yaqumuddin Ahmed ...	9 14 0
Rangpur West (Muhammadan) Rural	Maulvi Shah Abdur Rauf ...	175 13 0
	,, Mohammed Asaf Khan ...	Nil
	Syed Abdul Fattah ...	98 0 0
Rangpur East (Muhammadan), Rural	Maulvi Hamiduddin Khan ...	395 6 0
	Khan Sahib Abdul Majid	193 14 0
Bogra (Muhammadan) Rural ...	The Hon'ble Nawab Syed Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur, C.I.E. ...	207 13 6
	Khan Bahadur Maulvi Hafizur Rahaman Chaudhuri ...	537 8 6
	Munshi Hajiuddin Tarafdar ...	65 4 0
	,, Ramjan Fakir ...	Nil.

Name and nature of constituency.	Names of candidates	Amount of election expenses
		Rs. A. P.
Pabna (Muhammadan), Rural ...	Khan Bahadur Maulvi Wasimuddin Ahmed ...	6 14 6
	Maulvi Muhammad Abdul Majid	0 1 6
Malda-*cum*-Jalpaiguri (Muhammadan), Rural	Mr. K. Ahmed	1,965 13 0
	Maulvi Fazlul Karim ...	2,402 0 3
	Shaikh Sultan Khalifa ...	Not furnished.
	Munshi Kamruddin Ahmed ...	Ditto.
Presidency and Burdwan (European)	Mr W R Rae	2,290 8 0
	„ C O. Remfry ...	366 12 0
	Col A T Pugh	3,378 9 0
	Rev. H Anderson	1,414 8 0
	Mr M M Crawford ...	1,458 13 0
	„ J Campbell Forrester ...	1,288 11 3
	Dr Adrian Caddy	1,213 11 3
	Mr W. H Phelps	57 8 0
Dacca and Chittagong (European) ...	Mr Malcolm Cathcart ..	Nil.
Rajshahi (European)	Mr W. L. Travers ..	50 10 0
Anglo Indian	Mr H. Barton	915 3 3
	„ H A Stark	611 13 9
	„ H W B Moreno ...	40 0 0
Burdwan Landholders ...	Rai Lalit Mohan Singh Ray Bahadur	1,927 0 6
	Babu Siva Naram Mukharji ...	Not furnished.
Presidency Landholders ...	The Hon'ble Mr. P C Mitter, C.I.E	529 2 6
Dacca Landholders ...	Babu Brajendra Kishore Ray Chaudhuri	890 8 6
Chittagong Landholders .	Rai Upendra Lal Roy Bahadur ...	179 1 6
Rajshahi Landholders	Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray	5,077 3 6
	Babu Tanka Nath Chaudhuri ..	6,670 10 9
Calcutta University	Rai Bahadur Jogendra Chandra Ghose	1,124 7 6
	Babu Surendra Chandra Sen ...	273 12 6
	Sir Nilratan Sirkar, Kt. ..	3,635 10 9
Bengal Chamber of Commerce ...	Mr R. M Watson Smyth ..	Nil.
	„ T Campbell	Nil.
	„ J. E. Roy	Nil.
	„ C. W Rhodes, C.B.E ...	Nil.
	„ George Morgan ...	Nil.
	„ A. Cochran, C.B.E. ...	Nil.

Name and nature of constituency	Names of candidates.	Amount of election expenses Rs A P.
Indian Jute Mills Association ...	Mr R H L. Langford James ...	Nil.
	„ B. A White	Nil
Indian Tea Association ...	Mr A D. Gordon	Nil
Indian Mining Association ...	Mr. W. L. Carey	Nil.
Calcutta Trades Association ..	Mr. F A Larmour ..	Nil
Bengal National Chamber of Commerce	Raja Keeshee Case Law ..	125 6 0
	Babu Annulya Dhon Addy .	1,687 2 3
	„ Madhob Gobinda Roy ...	Not furnished
	„ Nanda Lal Roy ...	Ditto.
Bengal Marwari Association ...	Babu Keshoram Poddar	Nil
Bengal Mahajan Sabha ...	Mr Tarit Bhusan Roy .	11 5 0

The Finance Member's Statement.

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: Sir, in accordance with the provisions of section 92 of the Bengal Legislative Business Rules, I beg to lay on the table a statement showing the action taken by the Local Government and by His Excellency the Governor under section 72 D (2) of the Government of India Act since the last meeting. The first items covered by the orders of His Excellency are those relating to the Midnapore partition scheme and the acquisition of land for the Lal Bazar Police Headquarters. His Excellency explained to the Council last April what he proposed to do regarding these matters and I need not say anything about them now. For closing up the work of the Mymensingh partition scheme His Excellency has under section 72 D (2) (*b*) certified a sum of Rs. 2,00,000. For expenditure on the Chittagong Port, for five months, His Excellency has certified an amount of Rs. 16,000 as an emergent measure. The Government of India informed us last April, after the Budget had been passed, that they had decided not to make Chittagong a major port and consequently the Local Government will be responsible for the expenditure on the Chittagong Port. In order to provide funds to keep the Port establishment going, His Excellency has certified this sum of Rs. 16,000. A supplementary demand for the balance required will be placed before the Council next week.

For the sum required for the Paper-Book Department of the High Court, His Excellency has certified Rs. 53,000 under instructions from the Government of India. As the Council are aware, this matter has been under correspondence with the Government of India and they have directed us to restore sufficient provision to enable the extra staff required for the Paper-Book department to be employed for six months pending afurther examination of the question.

There is another small item of Rs. 14,000 for an amount decreed on account of the acquisition of premises No. 113, Upper Circular Road, for the Calcutta Police. It was necessary to certify the sum immediately so as to prevent interest charges running up.

List of certificates given by His Excellency either restoring grants or authorising emergent expenditure to be placed in the Council meeting on 4th July, 1921.

Description.	Under section 72D (2) (a).	Under section 72D (2) (*b*)
	Rs.	Rs.
(1) For works in connection with the Midnapore partition scheme	.....	1,62,000

Description.	Under Section 72D (2) (a)	Under section 72D (2) (b).
	Rs.	Rs.
(2) For works in connection with Mymensingh partition scheme.	.....	2,00,000
(3) For works in connection with Midnapore partition scheme	5,53,000	.....
(4) Acquisition of land for the Lal Bazar Police Headquarters	2,83,000	.....
(5) For expenditure in the Chittagong Post for five months	.....	16,000
(6) For the Paper Book Department of the High Court	53,000	.....
(7) For payment of the amount decreed on account of the acquisition of premises No. 113, Upper Circular Road for the Calcutta Police	...	11,113

PARTITION OF MIDNAPORE

Under proviso (b) to section 72D (2) of the Government of India Act I hereby authorise as a case of emergency the expenditure of Rs. 1,62,000 which is necessary for the payment on account of works establishment and of bills for work done in connection with the partition of the district of Midnapore

RONALDSHAY

Governor of Bengal

The 24th April 1921

PARTITION OF MYMENSINGH

Under proviso (b) to section 72D (2) of the Government of India Act I hereby authorise as a case of emergency the expenditure of Rs. 2,00,000, which is necessary for the payment of the charges which have been or will have to be incurred in closing down in the most economical manner the works now in progress in connection with the partition of the district of Mymensingh

RONALDSHAY,

Governor of Bengal

The 25th April 1921

PARTITION OF MIDNAPORE

I hereby certify that the expenditure provided for by the demand of Rs. 5,53,000 for the construction of buildings in connection with the partition of the Midnapore district, under the head "41 Civil Works Public Works Department" is essential to the discharge of my responsibility for the subject

RONALDSHAY,

Governor of Bengal.

The 8th May 1921.

QUARTERS FOR MARRIED SERGEANTS, CALCUTTA POLICE.

I hereby certify that the expenditure provided for by the demand of Rs 2,83,000 for the acquisition of land for the construction of quarters for the married sergeants of the Calcutta Police, under the head "41—Civil Works—P.W.D.," is essential to the discharge of my responsibility for the subject.

RONALDSHAY,
Governor of Bengal.

The 8th May 1921

PAYMENT OF CHARGES OF PORT OFFICER, CHITTAGONG PORT.

Under proviso (*b*) to section 72D (2) of the Government of India Act, I hereby authorise as a case of emergency the expenditure of Rs 16,000 which is necessary for the payment of the establishment and contingent charges of the Port Officer of the Chittagong Port

RONALDSHAY,
Governor of Bengal

The 9th May 1921

PAPER-BOOK DEPARTMENT

Whereas I have been directed by the Government of India to provide a sum of Rs 1,30,000 for the Paper Book Department of the High Court under head "24 A Administration of Justice" and whereas the Bengal Legislative Council has refused its assent to a demand for a grant for this purpose and whereas I have been directed by the Government of India to restore sufficient provision to enable the extra staff required independently of the Paper-Book Department to be met for one year as well as the extra cost involved in the Paper Book Department for 6 months I hereby certify under proviso (*a*) to section 72D (2) of the Government of India Act, that the expenditure of Rs 12,000 and of Rs. 41,000 for the above purpose respectively, amounting altogether to the sum of Rs 53,000 is essential for the discharge of my responsibility for the subject

RONALDSHAY,
Governor of Bengal

The 26th May 1921

POLICE STATION AT No 113, UPPER CIRCULAR ROAD

Whereas the High Court of Calcutta has decreed an additional payment of Rs 14,143 for the acquisition of premises No 113, Upper Circular Road, for the establishment of a Police Station in the town of Calcutta, I hereby authorise, under proviso (*b*) to section 72D of the Government of India Act, the expenditure of this sum as being necessary for the carrying on of the Police Department.

RONALDSHAY,
Governor of Bengal.

The 30th May 1921.

Government Bills.

The Bengal Children Bill, 1921.

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: Sir, I introduce this Bill to make further provision for the custody, trial and punishment of youthful offenders and for the protection of children and young persons, as is stated in the preamble. The Bill is at present intended to be confined to the town of Calcutta It was considered that we should wait till further experience is obtained of the operations of this Bill and until more institutions are available to give effect to its provisions, before applying the Bill to the other parts of the Presidency. So the power is reserved to extend the operation of the Bill to other parts of Bengal by a notification. It may also have been noted that the application of this Bill has been confined to boys and does not extend to girls It was considered that public opinion here was too sensitive on all questions relating to girls and it was thought prudent not to extend the Bill to girls for the present There would be also a greater difficulty as regards the training of the girls We are at present making a fairly big experiment in respect of boys and it was thought advisable that the training of girls may be deferred for the present

This measure is intended to replace the Reformatory Schools Act That Act was rather limited in its operations as the members of this House may know It dealt only with youthful offenders, this Bill, on the other hand intends to provide for cases of unprotected children who have not committed any crime but who, owing to their unprotected condition are likely to drift into crime unless they are taken charge of by the State This is a considerable extension and I think the members of this House will agree that if we could work the provisions of this Bill in this connection it may be of considerable use to the community As everybody is aware there is a very large number of unprotected children children who are not looked after properly by any one who roam about in the streets of Calcutta with the result that, unless they are taken in hand and properly educated and trained, they would inevitably turn out criminals That is one aspect of the Bill and in that respect it is very much in advance of the Reformatory Act.

The Bill makes a distinction between children under 12 years of age and young persons between 12 and 16. It makes separate provisions for them and it takes care, as will be noted, to have the children under 12 separately treated and in a different way from young persons who have been convicted of an offence.

The Bill again provides for a number of institutions where children and young persons can be educated and trained

It also provides for the establishment of separate courts and where it is not possible to have separate courts, to provide for separate trials

and for orders under the Act being passed by courts sitting in separate rooms. The idea is that children should be kept away as far as possible from contact with confirmed criminals. They ought not to be made to feel that they are being dealt with as criminals.

In another respect there is a difference between the provisions of this Bill and the Reformatory Schools Act. This Bill enhances the age of the persons who may be dealt with, from 15 to 16. I have no doubt that this will be considered to be an improvement. There is only one section of the Reformatory Schools Act which has been retained, viz., section 15. That section reserves power in the Governor General in Council to permit the detention of youthful offenders of one province in the Reformatory Schools of another province. That is due to the fact that some provinces have not got Reformatory Schools, including Bengal. The boys dealt with under the Act here are now sent to the Hazaribagh Reformatory School.

The Bill is based mainly on the Madras Act of 1920, which again is based on the English Children Act of 1908. The English Children Act is a comprehensive measure and deals with many matters which do not require to be considered in Bengal. But most of the provisions of our Bill are to be found in the English as well as the Madras Act.

The Bill has been under the consideration of the Government for a long time but owing to the war and its after effects it could not be brought before the Council, as it was felt that financial stringency would not permit us to found the necessary institutions. Financial difficulties have unfortunately continued long after the war and even at the present moment we have not got over them, but it has been thought that we should not postpone this measure any longer and that we must make an attempt to find the necessary funds to give effect to it.

I shall now briefly summarise the main features of the Bill. First of all as I have already stated it deals not only with youthful offenders but also with children under 12 years of age. Power is taken to deal with children under 12 who are found begging in the streets or are wandering about either having no parents or guardians or whose guardians are given to drunken or criminal habits, and with boys who are found in the company of thieves and criminals. Such boys can be brought before a Magistrate or the Juvenile Court and can be sent to an industrial school to be detained there till his sixteenth year. It provides that no children under 12 years of age shall be sentenced to imprisonment or transportation or capital sentence, a provision which does not find a place in the Reformatory Schools Act. It is taken from the English Children Act of 1908. The Indian Penal Code lays down, as regards children below 7 years of age, that nothing done by them is to be considered an offence and that if a child of the age between 7 or 12 is found to be of sufficient maturity and understanding to understand the nature and consequence of his act he will be dealt with in the ordinary way by the Court. This Bill proposes to modify that provision in

so far as it lays down that no court shall have power to sentence a child under 12 years to imprisonment. As regards youthful offenders it gives the court power to discharge such offenders after admonishing him or to make him over to the custody of his guardian or some other proper person. If the Court does not think that the child ought to be made over to the custody of his guardian or any body else or if there be no such guardian or person available to take charge of the child then in that case the court is given power either to pass a sentence allowed by the law or in lieu of such a sentence to send him to a Reformatory School. As regards boys of 12 or 13 years of age it gives power to the Magistrates to send such an offender to an industrial school. It provides for a number of schools being certified by the Government to receive children dealt with under the Act. The Bill also provides for auxiliary homes being established. It enables the court further to order that youthful offenders may be placed out on license with trustworthy persons of respectability.

The Bill proposes that no youthful offender or child is to be detained beyond the age of 18 years and as regards boys under 12, they are not to be detained in an industrial school after they have attained 16 years of age.

The Bill authorises the Court to levy, in proper cases, a contribution for the maintenance of children dealt with under the Bill from their parents or guardians liable under the law to maintain them, if they are able to do so.

The power to carry out the provisions of the Act is conferred on Juvenile Courts, Magistrates of certain class, Sessions Judges and the High Court. As regards the management of the institutions contemplated in the Bill namely, industrial schools and reformatory schools, it provides that they are to be managed by a Superintendent and a Committee of Visitors, and the certified schools are to be managed by persons approved by the local Government. Provision is also made for the inspection of these institutions by a Chief Inspector assisted by Inspectors and Assistant Inspectors and also for their medical inspection.

As regards the clauses which empower Courts to make orders sending children to certified schools or making them over in certain cases to private persons or placing them out on license, the Bill lays down that the religious persuasion of the child or youthful offender must be taken into consideration, so that whenever possible a child of a particular persuasion may be sent to an institution of that particular persuasion or may be placed in the custody of persons professing the same religion.

These are the main provisions of the Bill and the local Government have been given adequate power to make appropriate rules for carrying out the provisions of the Act.

Sir, I submit to the Council that this is a very useful and beneficial measure, and if sufficient institutions are found for the reception and training of these helpless children or young persons, it will be a great improvement on the existing state of things. The Courts under the present law are compelled in many instances to send persons of immature age to prison with the result that they turn out worse offenders afterwards.

In concluding I want to mention that we have consulted the High Court as regards the provisions of this Bill, and the High Court have given their cordial support to them. The Bill has also been circulated to different public bodies in Calcutta, but I do not think we have yet received their opinions.

I now move that the Bill——

The PRESIDENT: I think you are now moving the third motion.

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: With these words I beg to introduce the Bill.

The motion that the Bill be introduced was then put and agreed to.

The Secretary then read the title of the Bill.

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: I now beg to move, Sir, that the Bill be referred to a Select Committee consisting of the Hon'ble Mr P. C. Mitter, Mr. Hopkyns, Mr Gupta, Mr Wordsworth, Babu Annada Charan Dutta, Dr. Hassan Suhrawardy, Mr Syed Nasim Ali, Maulvi A. K Fazl-ul Haq, Mr. Stark, Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur and myself, with instructions to submit their report in time for its presentation at the meeting of the Council to be held in August, 1921.

Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: It is a matter for congratulation that the reformed Government has taken the earliest opportunity to introduce the Children Bill. That in view of the revaluation of the social values, the changed theory of punishment and the revised ideas of the duties of society towards the children, new provisions for the custody, trial and punishment of youthful offenders and the protection of children and young persons have become necessary—there is no doubt about it It is a pity only that the Bill does not propose to go the whole way. It is no doubt modelled on the English Act of 1908, but while it copies some of the provisions of the English Act much too closely, some very important provisions of the said Act have been given the most silent go-by. Thus it will be seen that only four sections of Part II of the English Act have been considered worthy of being adopted. What does it show? This shows that the authors of the present Bill do not propose to attach so much importance to the protection of children and young persons or to the provisions against offences towards them as to the "potential criminals,"

their custody and detention, trial and punishment. If for instance "exposing children to the risk of burning" has to be provided against, why "punishment for cruelty to children and young persons" and "allowing children or young persons to be in brothels" should be omitted? Why again section 119 (penalty on giving intoxicating liquor to children) and section 121 (provision as to the safety of children at entertainments) have been left out? As the reasons for such omissions are not fully apparent, I propose that more attention should be paid to those provisions of the English Act which give protection to the children and young persons, with a view to see if more pickings can usefully be made.

As to want of clarity: we have simply to look to the definitions. The ostensible object of the Act is to substitute "educational treatment" for "penal measures." But there is nothing in the definitions of reformatory and industrial schools to show that they will be institutions for industrial training. The definitions proposed in the Bill have nothing in common with those in the English Act. This shows that the present Bill in spite of its stated objects to provide "educational treatment" is content with mere barren verbiage. No positive programme of educational treatment and cure of potential criminals appears in the Bill. Yet that is the desideratum which, if satisfied, will bring the Bill into a line with modern ideas.

Apart from these liberal touches are required here and there and our only hope is that in the Select Committee the corners will be rounded, defects remedied and shortcomings removed and that the final shape in which it will emerge from the Select Committee will fully realise the beneficent objects of the Bill.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: I have a few words to speak on this Bill. This is a measure of great importance and difficulty. Fortunately for us, philosophers, philanthropists and jurists of Europe and America have given long and anxious thought on the matter, and we have got the Acts of those countries before us for our guidance. Biology and early history of primitive man have proved that man originally was not a very moral person. Our predatory instincts inherited from our ancestors had to be repressed with punishments of death and mutilation. Crimes were generally severely punished. Nanda Kumar was hanged in Calcutta for forgery. Now charity and good sense have prevailed and men are more lenient to their fellow-being. Prisons were not places fit for human beings. John Howard and other philanthropists have made them at last fit for men to live. Men were harshly treated till recent times. Boys were just as harshly treated. But the law has been changed in Europe and America for the protection of boys. Boys require protection more than punishment, and we should be guided by those Acts of modern civilised countries. I am sorry to find that this Bill, while purporting to follow the English Act, has substituted "16 years" for "12

years" in the definition of children. The framers have further substituted "boys" for "persons" in the English Act. Girls here require more protection than in any other country, and I hope that the Select Committee will put in girls as objects to get the benefits of this Act. Further the English Act protects young people from the pawnbroker and makes the pawn-brokers taking advantage of them criminally punishable. I do not see why this has been omitted from this Bill. Sir, these are some of the defects and omissions in the Bill which have struck me, and I am sure I shall hear the reasons for them in the Select Committee. I now mention these before you as worthy of consideration.

Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: I beg to welcome this measure. This has been drafted on the principles which have been laid down in the English Act. I may say at the very outset that the rules to be framed under the Act are not open to public gaze and criticism before the Bill is sanctioned. These rules, I contend, are to be passed by the Legislature and not by the Executive Government. I raised this point in the old Council, but my view was not accepted. I venture to repeat my observation in this Reformed Council.

Dealing with the question of punishment, is it not proper that this should find a place in the Act? I contend that the procedure to be adopted with regard to the way in which the matter should be viewed ought to be enunciated in the Act itself. I submit that this principle which is enunciated in the Bill is open to serious objection.

Coming down, Sir, to the several clauses of the Bill, I find that there are some omissions. I refer specially to section 16 of the English Act. It is quite natural that the whole matter cannot be discussed in detail now, and the members of the Select Committee will be in a better position to go through them. We notice that the word "arrest" has been put in. I do not like that idea. If a boy begs, or goes away from school, I do not like this idea that he should be arrested. The ideas which are enunciated in this Bill are new ideas for which every Bengali ought to be thankful. I submit that persuasion, and not compulsion, ought to be the procedure. Conciliation ought to be the policy. Now I find in one of the sections of the Bill that the police have been given authority in certain matters. I think that ought to be omitted, and persons other than the police might be employed. There are other matters which are matters of detail, and as we shall have the opportunity to deal with them when the Bill comes to the Council for consideration, I do not discuss them now.

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: All the suggestions that have been made will be duly considered in the Select Committee.

The motion was then put and agreed to.

The Bengal Land Registration (Amendment) Bill.

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: I beg to introduce the Bill further to amend the Land Registration Act, 1876.

It is a fairly simple Bill and we hope to get it passed in the August-September session. The Ministerial Officers' Salaries Committee of 1905-06 urged the desirability of restricting the multiplication of separate accounts which not only necessitate a larger establishment in *tauzi* and certificate offices, but also cause a considerable increase of work in every Department of the Collectorate. Reports of local officers show that more than one-third of the cost of the *tauzi* establishment is due to the existence of separate accounts.

It is undesirable to provide for a check on the opening of separate accounts as any limitation would adversely affect petty co-proprietors and leave them at the mercy of their more well-to-do co-sharers. The administration of separate accounts should not however be a burden on the general tax-payer. Statistics recently collected by the Board of Revenue show that the average annual receipts from the uniform fee of Rs. 2, the fee at present in force, amount to less than one-fifth of the cost of the collection of each separate account. In fact, the capitalised cost of the collection of each separate account works out on the average at Rs. 10 in excess of both the cost of actually opening the separate account and of the normal expenditure incurred in the collection of land revenue. The greater part of the cost incurred by the State in administering separate accounts must, therefore, as the law stands, be borne by the general public. It is therefore proposed to impose by law a fee which would recoup Government the cost of the extra establishment necessitated by the administration of separate accounts.

It was originally proposed that an additional fee per instalment of land revenue payable should be imposed. On consulting the principal landholders' associations of the province, an objection was raised that this would be hard on small co-sharers, who would have to pay a fee depending not on the amount of their contribution to the land revenue but on that of the parent estate. To meet this objection, it is proposed in the Bill to provide for the levy of a scale of fees varying from Rs. 4 to Rs. 20, proportionate not to the number of instalments but to the amount of land revenue payable by the applicant. The fixed fee of Rs. 2 would remain so as to cover the cost of actually opening the separate account. These are all the remarks I have to make at this stage.

The motion was then put and agreed to.

The Secretary then read the title of the Bill.

The Bengal Tenancy (Amendment) Bill.

Maulvi YAKUINUDDIN AHMED moved "for leave to introduce the Bill to further amend the Bengal Tenancy Act of 1885."

When, in February last, the Council was inaugurated, His Excellency the Governor of Bengal spoke: "Prior to this the members of the Legislative Council have been nominated thereto or elected by strictly circumscribed electorates. With such elections the mass of the people have had no concern. And the total number of electorates of all classes who have had any share in returning members to the Legislative Council of the past has not exceeded 12,000. As compared with this, the persons entitled to return members to the Legislative Council which meets for the first time to-day——

The PRESIDENT: You must confine your remarks to the merits of the Bill. You are not entitled to enlarge on the changes in the constitution of the Council. That is irrelevant.

Maulvi YAKUINUDDIN AHMED: It is only as an introduction——

The PRESIDENT: That is not an introduction to the Bill. You can speak on the principles of the Bill and the reasons why you want to introduce it.

Maulvi YAKUINUDDIN AHMED: I am coming to it.

The PRESIDENT: Well please come to it at once.

Maulvi YAKUINUDDIN AHMED: These are the hopeful words of His Excellency and we find now that out of 139 members, 74 ——

The PRESIDENT: I have already ruled you out of order as regards that point and you should not go on repeating it. You must come to the matter of your Bill.

Maulvi YAKUINUDDIN AHMED: There are zamindars among the elected members who have come to the Council with the votes of their tenantry and their loyalty and fidelity——

The PRESIDENT: I am afraid you have not come to the Bill yet. You are remarking on the constitution of this Council. I ask you again to come to the merits of your Bill.

Maulvi YAKUINUDDIN AHMED: This amendment of the Bengal Tenancy Act which propose to give to the raiyats of Bengal the right to cut down trees planted by them or their ancestors, the right to transfer and bequeath occupancy rights or homestead held over 12 years, the payment of *nazar* to the zamindars when mutating their names, which proposes to protect the raiyats from unnecessary increment of rent is the truest test whether the raiyat's representatives who

are sitting in this Council will remember their pledge to their constituents. Raiyat Sabhas and non-co-operators have already warned the raiyats of the value of the franchise they have got, and it would be a matter of crying shame to such of their representatives as play false with their interests when substantial and long deferred rights are going to be given to them.

When I propose to amend the Bengal Tenancy Act of 1885, I beg to place before you a short history of the law between the landlord and tenants, for which I am indebted to the perspicuous history written by the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr, one of the Executive Councillors sitting here to-day. Mr. Kerr says—

The Bengal Tenancy Act, though not professing to be an exhaustive code of law of landlord and tenant is nevertheless a complete and self-contained enactment so far as the most important agrarian relations are concerned. It is unfortunate, though perhaps inevitable, that the discussions of recent years have been mainly with the working of the Act in details and this has tended to obscure the main principles. Perhaps the best account of the aims and objects of the framers of the Bengal Tenancy Act is to be found in the speech of the Viceroy when the Bill was first introduced in Council in 1883.

Lord Ripon said

We have endeavoured to make a settlement which, while it will not deprive the landlords of any of their accumulated advantages, will restore to the raiyats some thing of the position which they occupied at the time of the permanent settlement and which we believe to be urgently needed in the words of that settlement for the protection and welfare of the talukdars raiyats and other cultivators of the soil whose interests we then undertook to guard and have to our shame too long neglected.

Again his successor Lord Dufferin in 1885, in putting the motion of this Bill that the Bill should be passed said he believed that "it is a translation and reproduction in the language of the present day of the spirit and essence of Lord Cornwallis' settlement that it is in harmony with his intentions that it carried out his ideas, that it is calculated to ensure the results he aimed at, and that it is conceived in the same beneficent and generous spirit which actuated the original framers of the Regulation of 1793."

Paragraph 3 of section 7 of Regulation of 1793 says—

The Governor General in Council trusts that the proprietors of land sensible of the benefits conferred upon them by the public assessment being fixed for ever will exert themselves in the cultivation of their lands under the certainty that they will enjoy exclusively the fruits of their own management and industry and that no demand will ever be made upon them or on their heirs or successors by the present or any future Government for an augmentation of the public assessments in consequence of the improvement of their respective estates to conduct themselves with good faith and moderation towards their dependent talukdars and raiyats and a strict observance of these duties is now more than ever incumbent upon them in return for the benefit which they will themselves derive from orders now issued and upon the strictest adherence to the principles in the persons whom they appoint to collect rents from them.

Section 8, paragraph 2 of the above Regulation points out—

First, it being the duty of the ruling power to protect all classes of people and more particularly those who from their situation are most helpless and the Governor General in Council will, whenever he may deem it proper, enact such regulations as he may think necessary for the protection and welfare of the dependent talukdars, raiyats and other cultivators of the soil and no zamindar, independent talukdar or other actual proprietor of land shall be entitled on this account to make any objection to the discharge of the fixed assessment which they have respectively agreed to pay.

Then the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr says—

It may further be remarked that all important legislative measures from Act X of 1859 down to the last amendment of 1907 have dealt with the two objects which were mentioned by Lord Cornwallis' instructions in 1786, namely, the protection of the raiyats and the security of the landlords in the realization of their just demands.

Act X of 1859 is entitled an "Act to amend the Law relating to the recovery of rent" and this was originally its main object. It introduced for the first time definite provisions regarding suits for arrears of rent and the execution of decrees for arrears of rent. But during the passage of the Bill through the Council important additions were made with the result that the Act as passed contained a more or less exact definition of the different classes of raiyats and of the rights which it was thought expedient to confer on them. The Act contained further important provisions for the protection of the raiyats.

In 1879 a strong Rent Commission was appointed with instructions to propose a digest of the existing statute and case law relating to landlord and tenant and to draw up a consolidated Bill. Then as a result of the labours of the aforesaid Commission the Bengal Tenancy Act VIII of 1885 was passed. But vested interest was as strong as ever and though the framers of the Act had the distinct intention of giving to the raiyats rights as in any other immoveable property they had to throw them away to be shattered on the rocks of custom, usage or customary right. The right of transfer of occupancy holdings was ushered in through the backdoors of section 178 and Illustration I to section 183 of Act VIII of 1885. The same procedure was adopted with regard to the bequest of occupancy rights in section 26 and section 178, sub-section (2), clause (*d*). It says—

Nothing in any contract made between a landlord and tenant after the passing of this Act (VIII of 1885) shall take away the right of a raiyat to transfer or bequeath in accordance with local usages.

The right of the raiyat to sublet has been protected by section 178 of the Bengal Tenancy Act. The right of cutting down trees was also given by section 23 and section 178, sub-section (3), clause (*b*). Thus all the rights that are proposed to be given by this Bill had been given to the occupancy raiyats by the framers of Act VIII of 1885, 36 years ago, but with some unexplained reason, custom, usage and customary right were mentioned as the means to an end. Chief Jus-

se Legislature might have been unwilling to rouse active hostility of ne landlords by making an express provision authorising transfer of ccupancy holdings. Since Act X of 1859 was passed the occupancy ryats have been selling their lands as any other immoveable property. , Weekly Reporter, Act X, page 5. Over and above the right of lling their lands in 6, Weekly Reporter, Act X, page 10, Nayamutulla *rsus* Gobinda Chandra Dutta, it was held that a raiyat with a right f occupancy might sell his lands, might erect a *pucca* house on his land nd do what he liked with it so long as he did no injury to the mindar's detriment. In 24, Weekly Reporter, Act X, page 330, it as held that the raiyat had a right to the possession of trees on his nd. Coming to more recent times a Full Bench decision of five udges presided over by the Chief Justice Jenkins (Doya Moyee *versus* ntadamohan Chowdhury) held

the purchaser of a portion of an occupancy right has a good title gainst the transferor. The person whose title is undoubted has put him in possession. Therefore his possession is derived lawfully. Being in possession the question is whether a trespasser can oust him. It makes no difference if the trespasser happens to be the landlord. The landlord has acquired no title. At the end of the judgment of the Full Bench it was stated that series of decisions involved two of the subsidiary points that related to the transferability of occupancy holdings apart from local usage. It will be convenient to state our conclusion in general terms. This conclusion rests largely on a recognition of the paramount importance of upholding decisions on which dealings with property have been extensively based. These decisions probably mark a departure from earlier judicial pronouncements and the opinion of those who have studied the question in the past but the law however is not logic but experience and the modern departure probably due to a change in economic conditions which has brought into prominence problems that did not previously call for solution.

Their Lordships of the Full Bench of the High Court by way of conclusion observed

We would only add that the uncertainty as to the transferability of holdings has been one of the most powerful sources of litigation and it is urgently necessary that should be set at rest by legislation.

This was expressed in 1895 and we come to the Reformed Council after a quarter of a century to fulfil the directions of the highest tribunal in the land. We would belie our franchise, intelligence and duration if we cannot after the lapse of a considerable number of years at least the difference between landlord and tenant.

In Calcutta Weekly Notes, Vol. 14, page 952, Justice Mukerjee delivered judgment which gave the tenants rights to the trees planted by them or their ancestors. Justice Mukerjee says "Neither the Hindu law nor the Mohammadan law recognised any law of fixtures." If we look to the ancient Hindu law we find the following texts in the Institute of Narada, Chapter VI, verses 20-21, Sacred Books of the East, Vol. 33, page 143—

Verse 20. If a man has built a house on the ground of a stranger and lives in it paying rent for it, he may take with him when he leaves the house, the thatch, the timber, the bricks and other building materials.

Verse 21.—But if he has been residing on the ground of a stranger without paying rent and against that man's wish he shall by no means take with him on leaving it the thatch and timber.

These texts are quoted as authoritative by Jagannath in his Digest of Hindu Law (Colebrook), Book III, Chapter 2, paragraph 99, Vol. II, page 398, who quotes another text of Narada which explains the reasons for the rule—" . . . the grass, wood and bricks which are thus removed belong to him who leaves the ground, provided he paid rent for the spot and not otherwise."

When we turn to Muhammadan law, we find the following passage in the Hidayah:- " If a person hire unoccupied land for the purpose of building or planting, it is lawful since these are purposes to which land is applied. Afterwards, however, upon the term of the lease expiring, it is incumbent on the lessee to remove the building or trees and to restore the land to the lessor in such a state as may leave him no claim upon it." " We must consequently hold," Justice Mukerjee says, " that in the case before us the tenant did not exceed his rights when he cut down jack-fruit trees which had been planted in his holding by one of his ancestors " ' '

Thus if my Hindu and Muhammadan colleagues in the Council who have come here as representatives of the raiyats of this Province, strictly follow the dictates of their religion they would support the cutting of trees planted by the raiyat or his ancestors Hence the provision in the Bill that a raiyat be entitled to cut down trees on his holding of which he and his ancestors have been in possession for 12 years is supported by Hindu and Muhammadan law and by the decision of the highest court in the province, and I hope the Council will pass the provision, and I hope I would get support from the Government members and of the Europeans and Anglo-Indians, when the original Act X of 1859, in pursuance of the intention of Lord Cornwallis indications in Regulation I of 1793, gave to the occupancy raiyats and holders of homestead for more than 12 years, rights of transfer and bequest in the same manner and to the same extent as any other immovable property. I have endeavoured to show that there is sufficient and clear indication of the intention to give such rights even in the Bengal Tenancy Act, VIII of 1885, and now, after a series of decisions of the High Court, the Council, I hope, will support the Bill to confer such rights on the occupancy raiyats in clear and unmistakeable terms.

After Act VIII of 1885, the first amendment was made by Act III (B. C. of 1898), which does not touch transferability of occupancy rights.

Then the second amendment of the Act was made by Act I (B. C. of 1903), which merely dealt with the provisions relating to the transfer of permanent tenures.

Then the third amendment was by Act I (B. C. of 1907), which deals with the preparation of a record-of-rights and settlement of fair and equitable rents.

The amendment Act, 1907, was confined to Bengal proper and its provisions had to be re-enacted as Act I of 1908 of Eastern Bengal and Assam with such alterations as were considered suitable to local conditions.

Then the Orissa Tenancy Bill was introduced by the Hon'ble Mr. Slack in 1911 (22nd July), and the Bill was finally passed by the Bengal Council on the 27th March, 1912. But the assent of the Governor General in Council being withheld, as the new province of Bihar was going to be constituted soon, the Orissa Tenancy Bill was finally introduced in the Bihar Legislative Council in 1913 and was passed.

In both these amendments of the Bengal Tenancy Act, VIII of 1885, which were passed both in Bengal and Bihar, there were express provisions with regard to transfer of occupancy rights and hence this Council will be forced to hold that the transfer and bequest of occupancy rights should not be deferred from the raiyats of Bengal any longer.

There may be objections from the side of zamindars that they are the proprietors of the soil. But during the Hindu and Muhammadan times the king was the paramount lord and the cultivators were the proprietors of the soil and they paid one-sixth of the produce to the king as rent. According to Manu "The king is entitled to have a share in the produce to the extent of one eighth, one-sixth, or one-twelfth as the nature of the soil and the labour necessary to cultivate it vary (Manu, Chapter VIII, Slok 1, Verse 130, Sir William Jones' translation of Manu." Cultivators' proprietory right can be deduced from the text "Sages pronounce cultivated land to be the property of him who cut away the wood or who cleared and tilled it." (Manu, Chap. IX, Slok 1, Verse 44).

It is the general principle that obtains in the Muhammadan law too and is recognised in Germany, Java and Russia and, indeed, in most countries. It has been said, with considerable force, that as the king's share of grain was limited to one-sixth or at most one-fourth, there must have been another proprietor for the remaining five-sixth, or three-fourth, and such proprietors undoubtedly were the cultivators of the soil who are styled as raiyats in the Bengal Tenancy Act. The zamindars have come between the king and the cultivators. At the time the zamindars' rents were fixed permanently, the zamindars were enjoined to deal with their talukdars, raiyats and other cultivators of the soil with consideration. "One stock argument advanced is that the occupancy raiyats will be reduced to the status of day-labourers by being sold out of their holdings. But there are thousand and one instances that occupancy raiyats, by their labour and good management, have risen to be the purchasers of the rights of their landlords. No legislation can restrict the manner of enjoying property in a progressive society. If the Council wants that the occupancy raiyats would for ever remain an ignorant, primitive people, then alone they can restrict the transfer of occupancy holdings lest the raiyats play into the hands of their *mahajans* and lose their occupancy rights. Every one who has any intimacy with the country knows

very well that transferability would be regarded as a boon by the occupancy raiyats and they are not afraid that their genus will be replaced by that of the *mahajans* and thus they will be reduced to the status of tenants at-will or day-labourers.

Statistics made before 1885 show the number of transfers of occupancy rights in Bengal. In 1881-82 there were 40,899 transfers; in 1882-83, 48,362; in 1883-84, 55,905; and at present the transfers approximately amount to 250,000 annually. In the course of the debate in the Imperial Council, the Lieutenant-Governor said—"In our first proposal to the Government of India, two years ago (1883), we recommended adoption of the right of transfer throughout Bengal;" and the aforementioned statistics show that the number of transfers increased from 40,899 in 1881, to 55,905 in 1883, and now it has risen to 250,000.

Several members have suggested that the Bengal Tenancy Act be so amended as to secure fixity of rent for ever. I leave it to the Council to consider if they are going to fix the rent of the settled or occupancy raiyats. Let them consider at what rate they are going to fix the rent of the raiyats; whether the abolition of the *uthandi* system be advantageous or giving the occupancy raiyats various rights to invoke the Penal Code at every step in transactions between the raiyat and his landlord.

Another hon'ble member suggested the formation of a committee to consider and report what amendments are needed in the Bengal Tenancy Act. Hon'ble members are fully aware that "hope deferred maketh the heart sick." The formation of a committee and the submission of a report will involve lapse of years. While you are going to give the raiyats rights of transfer, the tenants are being ousted from their lands and reduced to penniless beggars. So the sooner the Council give them the right the better it is for the raiyats. Swift and sure ought to be the remedy which was proposed in 1885, but was deferred, at the instance of vested interests, by the wealth and intelligence of the land; and now under the ægis of the Reformed Council not a single day should be lost in giving them the most necessary and the long deferred rights. So I appeal to the members of the Council not to throw out this modest Bill if they have really the raiyats' welfare at heart; to set to work at once to propose further amendments and incorporate them in the present Bill and thus pass it into law.

Now in order to recognise the transfer the raiyats shall have to pay a *nazar*. From time immemorial the zamindars have been recovering *nazar* whenever a transfer of occupancy rights takes place in his zamindari. The rate has been fixed in this Bill at two annas per rupee of the consideration money. I leave it to the Council to decide what would be the *nazar*.

Now I come to the provision to eliminate clause 6 from section 52 of the Bengal Tenancy Act. Clauses 5 and 6 were introduced as amendments

to benefit the zamindars in enhancing the rents of a raiyat on the ground that he held lands in excess of that originally let out to him. Hon'ble members of the Council know full well that lands were not in demand only a few years ago. The railways and steamers have opened the interior of the country to merchants and traders and great demand for the crops produced by the lands has considerably increased their value. Hence there being no greater demand for the lands the zamindars came to cast about in their minds how they could increase the rents. When the lands were given originally to the raiyats the zamindars were only too glad to find raiyats for cultivating them, and so they gave the lands without any measurement only specifying their boundaries and only an approximate area was guessed at to fix the rent; moreover the unit of measurement was not exactly what it is to-day. But it has been urged by legislation that a custom of measurement prevailed when the lands were let out and if any excess land is found over and above the land originally let out, the rent of the raiyat should be enhanced. Here, wealth and intelligence and education of the zamindars are pitted against the poverty, ignorance and illiteracy of the raiyats. In addition to the advantages of education, the zamindars came to the field with expert knowledge in the persons of their *amins*. The fallacy of the whole thing lay in this that while the lands were meted out to tenants in arbitrary measurements, the same lands were measured according to scientific methods of modern times and the inevitable excess area came to be taxed to the utter dismay of the raiyats. Would not this Council in the exercise of their judgment and reason rather render help to the weaker party than to the stronger? In the notes on the clauses to the Bill which afterwards became Act I (B.C.) of 1907, it is said "the proposed modification of section 52 will allow the custom of settlement on measurement to be taken as a presumption that the area of a tenure or holding mentioned in the landlord's papers has been ascertained by actual measurement and *thus make it easier* for the landlords to prove the existence of excess area." Thus clauses 5 and 6 added to section 52 of the Bengal Tenancy Act successively in 1898 and then in 1907 will show how custom and usage, when landlords were concerned, have given place to positive evidence of presumption. When the landlords could not prove the custom of measurement in a few cases before the Special judges under the Rent Law, the legislature came to their rescue and enacted that the presumption should always be that the area of the tenure or holding has been entered in the *patta*, *kabuliyat* or rent-roll after actual measurement. Would not the present legislature, based on popular franchise, come to the rescue of the raiyats when two and a half lacs of transfers take place annually, to do away with the vagueness of custom or usage altogether, and enact that transfers are made by the raiyats in exercise of their legitimate rights which are acquiesced in by their landlords on payment of a reasonable *nazar*? The nebulous custom and usage, always the fruitful source of controversy in which the weaker party is always worsted to the detriment of justice, should no longer find

place in the Bengal Tenancy Act when the right of transfer or bequest of occupancy rights and the right of cutting down trees planted by the raiyats or their ancestors are in question. It is for this reason that the proposed amendment of sub-section 6 in section 52 has been brought before the hon'ble members of the Council and I sincerely hope that I shall be allowed to introduce the Bill. The Permanent Settlement is spoken of as the Magna Charta of the landed aristocracy of Bengal. We go further and say it is the Magna Charta of the tenantry too, and I have read to the Council the regulations and provisions made by Lord Cornwallis. To the representatives of the raiyats of Bengal as being the chosen few of the popular franchise—the gift of His Imperial Majesty to the population of the province—also to the representatives of the Europeans and the Anglo-Indians, to the representatives of Commerce and Industry, to the representatives of the landlords and the municipal population who all have to depend on the raiyats for their necessaries of life, the opportunity that has presented itself to enact a law for the welfare of the raiyats of Bengal should not be thrown away, but should be utilised to the fullest extent. If you give to the raiyats the right of transfer and bequest, you complete the bundle of the rights which are conferred by the Transfer of Property Act to the whole of India, and the raiyats will rise superior and strong, self-reliant and conscious of their own powers, will be "manly and useful citizens" assisting their landlords and their gracious Sovereign in converting jungles and wastes into green fields.

The PRESIDENT: You have already exceeded your time-limit. However, I give you five minutes more to finish

Maulvi YAKUINUDDIN AHMED: The reformed Council is going to give to the people higher ideals of political and social life; improved sanitation and education will give them the means of attaining happiness and prosperity It is high time that the raiyats should be given the rights of transfer and bequest, the right to cut down trees and that they should be freed from harassment and unnecessary enhancement of rent.

With these observations I beg to place the Bill before the Council and I hope that a favourable treatment will be accorded to it.

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: As this is a private Bill, at this stage I only wish to say that Government do not propose to oppose the introduction of the Bill, but I reserve the right to speak at a later stage.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: I beg to oppose motion under section 52, sub-section 1 of the Council Manual. If you will kindly permit me, I should like to give my reasons for doing so. [The member proceeded to discuss the Bill]

The PRESIDENT: I do not think I can permit you to discuss the provisions of the Bill at this stage. The question of leave to introduce the Bill must, under the rules, be put to the vote at once.

Raja RESHEE CASE LAW: I rise to oppose the Bill No case has been made out——

The PRESIDENT: I must interrupt you There can be no debate on the merits of the Bill on a motion like this You can press for a division if you like, but no debate can be permitted at this stage.

Raja RESHEE CASE LAW: Then I simply say that I oppose the Bill, as no case has been made out.

Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ: It gives me much pleasure to support the original motion.

Khan Bahadur Maulvi WASIMUDDIN AHMED: I beg to support the motion

On the motion being put, a division was taken with the following result:—

AYES.

Ahmed, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Wasimuddin.
Ahmed, Maulvi Rafi Uddin.
Ahmed, Maulvi Yakuinuddin.
Ali, Mr. Syed Ertan.
Arhamuddin, Maulvi Khandakar.
Barma, Rai Sahib Panchanan.
Bhattacharji, Babu Ham Chandra.
Bose, Mr. S. M.
Cathcart, Mr. M.
Chaudhuri, Maulvi Shah Muhammad.
Das, Babu Bhishmadev.
Dutt, Mr. Ajay Chunder.
Haq, Shah Syed Emdadul.
Huq, Maulvi Ekramul.
Hussain, Maulvi Mahammed Madassur.
Karim, Maulvi Fazlul.
Khan, Maulvi Hamid-ud-din.
Khan, Maulvi Md. Rafique Uddin.
Mullick, Babu Nirode Behary.
Rauf, Maulvi Shah Abdur.
Ray Chaudhuri, Mr. Krishna Chandra.
Salam, Khan Bahadur Abdus.

NOES.

Addy, Babu Amulya Dhone.
Ahmed, Munshi Jafar.
Alley, Shaikh Mahboob.
Ali, Munshi Amir.
Ali, Munshi Ayub.
Azam, Khan Bahadur Khwaja Mahamed.
Charmakar, Babu Rasik Chandra.
Chaudhuri, Babu Kisheri Mohan.
Chaudhury, Babu Tankanath.
Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Nafizar Rahman.
Chaudhuri, Rai Narendranath.
Chaudhuri, Sir Ashutosh.
Das Gupta, Babu Niharan Chandra.
Dutta, Babu Annada Charan.
Faroqui, Mr. K. G. M.
Ghatak, Rai Sahib Nitmani.
Ghose, Mr. D. C.
Ghose, Rai Bahadur Jogendra Chunder.
Gordon, Mr. A. D.
Khan, Babu Devendra Lal.
Khan, Mr. Razaur Rahman.
Larmour, Mr. F. A.
Law, Raja Reshee Case.
Makramali, Munshi.
Mitra, Rai Bahadur Mahendra Chandra.
Mukharji, Babu Satish Chandra.
Mukherjee, Babu Nitya Dhon.
Mukhopadhaya, Babu Sarat Chandra.
Mullick, Babu Surendra Nath.
Naikat, Mr. Prasanna Deb.
Ray, Babu Bhabendra Chandra.
Ray, Babu Surendra Nath.
Ray, Kumar Shib Shekhareswar.
Ray Choudhury, Raja Manmatha Nath.
Ray, Babu Sijoy Prosad Singh.
Ray, Babu Nalini Nath.
Ray, Maharaja Bahadur Kshaunish Chandra.
Ray, Rai Bahadur Lalit Mohan Singh.
Roy, Raja Manilall Singh.
Sarkar, Babu Jogesh Chandra
Sarkar, Babu Rishindra Nath.
Sinha, Babu Surendra Narayan.

The Ayes being 22 and the Noes 42, the motion was lost.

Resolutions

(under the rules for the discussion of matters of general public interest).

Withdrawal of resolutions.

Maulvi A. K. FAZL-UL HAQ being absent, the following resolution was deemed to be withdrawn:—

"This Council recommends to the Government that immediate steps be taken to give effect to the resolution carried in the Bengal Legislative Council on the 7th April, 1915, for the establishment of a City Civil Court in Calcutta."

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: I beg to withdraw the resolution standing in my name.

The following resolution was then withdrawn:—

"This Council recommends to the Government that early steps be taken to give effect to the resolution passed at a meeting of this Council for the establishment of a City Civil Court for Calcutta for the trial of suits up to Rs. 10,000 in value."

Postponement of Resolutions.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: I beg that my resolution might be postponed. As the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath is not here to-day, I may be allowed to move it to-morrow.

The PRESIDENT: If you do not move it to-day, it will go to the bottom of the List of Business.

The following resolution (No. 3) was then, with the permission of the President, postponed and placed at the bottom of the List of Business:—

"This Council recommends to the Government that immediate steps be taken to establish a Medical College at Bhowanipur, Calcutta."

The following motion and resolutions were, with the permission of the President, postponed and placed at the bottom of the List of Business:

"4. **Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK** to move by way of amendment to resolution No. 3 that after the word 'College' the words 'or schools' be inserted.

"5. **Mr. S. R. DAS:** This Council recommends to the Government that a committee, consisting of official and non-official members be appointed to consider and report as to whether the posts of Divisional Commissioners may be abolished with due regard to efficiency; and, if their opinion be in the affirmative, to report as to the steps to be taken to give effect to such opinion.

"6. **Maulvi ABDUL KARIM:** This Council recommends to the Government that the tenure of office of Government Pleaders and Public Prosecutors appointed in the mufassal be limited to a period of five years or such other period as the Government may think fit

"7. **Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA:** This Council recommends to the Government that the age restriction of the Calcutta University for appearing at the Matriculation Examination be abolished.

"8. **Mr. HUSEYN SHAHEED SUHRAWARDY:** This Council recommends to the Government that the necessary steps be taken to reduce the minimum age for a student appearing at the Matriculation Examination to 14 years"

Panskura railway station.

Babu SARAT CHANDRA MUKHOPADHAYA: "This Council recommends to the Government that they may be pleased to request the Bengal-Nagpur Railway authorities to remove, early, the great inconvenience felt by passengers for want of suitable waiting rooms, like for ladies and for first and second class passengers, generally, on the Panskura railway station"

Tamluk is a very big and important subdivision of the Midnapore District. It has four permanent Civil Courts, two Criminal Courts, and three honorary Magistrates' benches which sit daily. There are many big local zamindars and landholders in Tamluk. A large number of zamindars who are residents of Calcutta and other districts have also zamindaries in the Tamluk subdivision. The town of Midnapore is the headquarters of the district. The means of communication between Midnapore and Tamluk is the Bengal-Nagpur Railway *viâ* Panskura station. The distance of the Panskura railway station from the town of Tamluk is a little over 16 miles, which is covered by a District Board metalled road. The means of communication between Calcutta and Tamluk is either by steamer which plies between Calcutta and Ghatal on the rivers Hooghly and Rupnarain, or by the Bengal-Nagpur Railway *viâ* Panskura station or Kola Ghat station. After the construction of the big railway bridge across the river Rupnarain near Kola that the portion of the river Rupnarain below the Kola bridge has become so much interspersed with *chars* that the steamer service to Tamluk is daily becoming inconvenient and threatens to be impossible before long. The steamers cannot approach, far less reach, Tamluk, but the passengers have to tranship into boats on the river Rupnarain about three miles from the town and during ebb-tide they have to wade through the soft unsettled *chars* for over two miles before reaching the town. Besides, there are treacherous sand banks in that *char* and the passengers have to run the risk of being embedded in them. No wonder persons generally prefer travelling by the Bengal-Nagpur Railway in

coming to Calcutta or Midnapore. There are two companies running motor—taxis or lorries between Tamluk and the Panskura railway station for convenience of the public. Motors run eight times a day between Tamluk and Panskura and the cars are generally overcrowded, even first class passengers cannot get seats unless they secure seats half an hour before the starting time. As there are several civil and criminal courts in Tamluk, counsels and vakils from Calcutta and Midnapore occasionally come to Tamluk for conducting cases. High Government officials such as the Divisional Commissioner, the District Magistrate, the Assistant Magistrate, the District Judge, the Superintendent of Police, the Civil Surgeon, etc., have occasionally to come to Tamluk for inspection and on other public business. The Subdivisional Magistrate and the chairman of the Tamluk local board have to go to Midnapore every month to attend district board meetings. Respectable gentlemen, such as zamindars, pleaders, mukhtears and merchants, have occasionally to go to Midnapore and Calcutta. Private gentlemen with their families have occasionally to go to Midnapore, Calcutta, and other places by railway *viâ* Panskura station. But there are no waiting rooms at the Panskura station either for Indian ladies or for first and second class passengers. These gentlemen have to walk on the bare platform or to sit under the plants on the platform during the wait in summer as well as in the rainy season. The station building is rather a small structure, half of which is occupied by the booking office, etc., and the other half is taken up by a very large wooden chest of the railway company, the weighing machine, the water-filter and the water buckets; and what of open space there remains is generally occupied by parcels and luggages. The small verandah without any seat on the up platform serves as a waiting room for third class passengers and this, too, is quite insufficient to accommodate them. There is a small bench about six feet long put in front of the doors of the station master's room, which can accommodate four persons with difficulty and this bench is generally occupied by the station staff. The Bengal-Nagpur Railway trains are most irregular, the down trains generally come late by from half to two or three hours. It is natural, therefore, that the first and second class passengers have to loiter on the bare platform. After the last Council election, the Subdivisional Magistrate had to remain at the Panskura station from morning till evening for collection and despatch of the ballot paper boxes. That gentlemen had to take with him a chair and two stools to the station and had to take his seat under a tree on the platform, and these stools served the twofold purpose of dining and office table and his *chaprasi* had to stand by him and drive away crows from the tree so that they might not spoil his dress. Some inspecting officers when coming to Tamluk missed the motor-car and had to wait for three or four hours at the Panskura station for the next available motor-car. These European gentlemen had to spread their table cloth upon two bundles of gunny bags lying on the platform to serve as a

dining table and to take their seats upon two luggages. It is easy to imagine the inconvenience felt by respectable ladies who have no other alternative than to wait under trees on the platform and take shelter there from the sun and rain. The hardship, worry and trouble felt by Indian ladies and first and second class passengers for want of suitable waiting rooms pass all powers of description. Representations were made more than once to the railway authorities but to no effect. I have therefore thought it imperative to champion the cause of the sufferers and move the resolution in the earnest hope of its being carried without opposition.

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: I accept this resolution in so far as it only asks the government to make a request to the Bengal-Nagpur Railway Company to provide waiting rooms for the convenience of passengers which will meet the wishes of the mover of the resolution. The authorities of the Bengal-Nagpur Railway have informed Government that, although the necessity for providing waiting room accomodation is receiving attention, the construction of permanent waiting rooms must necessarily be delayed owing to the remodelling of the station yard, and to the present financial stringency.

This remodelling is necessary as it is consequent on the early provision of further traffic facilities at Panskura Station.

Government are prepared to assist the travelling public to obtain such amenities as are possible, but the Railway Department of the Public Works Department is not empowered to exercise control over the internal working of a railway system, of which the provision of waiting rooms or other station buildings is a concrete part.

In such a case as the present which affects a railway station on a trunk line of railway, the power of control is vested in the Railway Board and the authority of the Railway Department of the local Government is limited to bringing the needs of the travelling public to the notice of the Railway Company.

The Railway Department may also request a Railway Company to obviate those needs by providing for them, but it cannot insist on its demands being complied with.

In the present case I am prepared to ask the Railway Company to provide temporary waiting rooms until permanent buildings can be erected for the purpose, but I cannot compel the Railway Company to do what I ask.

The resolution was then put and agreed to.

Postponement of Resolution.

Khan Bahadur Maulvi WASIMUDDIN AHMED: I have been asked by the Secretary to the Member in charge to postpone my resolution for a day or two.

The PRESIDENT: It is postponed and will go to the bottom of the List.

Khan Bahadur Maulvi WASIMUDDIN AHMED: I would like to postpone it for two days.

The PRESIDENT: I can allow you to go on now or the motion must go to the bottom.

Khan Bahadur Maulvi WASIMUDDIN AHMED: If I have no other alternative I suppose it must go to the bottom.

The following resolution was then postponed:—

"This Council recommends to the Government—

(*i*) that the typists and copyists of the Civil, Criminal and Revenue Courts be organised into a regular establishment, with fixed salaries on a time-scale basis, and with the conditions and privileges attached to the Government services; and

(*ii*) that the services of the existing typists and copyists be counted towards their pension."

Withdrawal of Resolution.

Babu FANINDRALAL DE: I beg leave to withdraw the following resolution:—

"This Council recommends to the Government that a comprehensive scheme be prepared and works duly started to utilise, properly, the natural waterways, and to excavate new ones, suitable to the geographical and topographical nature of the country."

The resolution was then withdrawn

Calcutta University.

Babu JATINDRA NATH BASU: "This Council recommends to the Government that steps be taken to effect the following changes in the Calcutta University, namely:—

(*a*) that at least 80 per cent. of the Fellows of the University should be elected;

(*b*) that the registered graduates of the University should elect at least 60 per cent. of the Fellows; and

(*c*) that the fee for enrolment on the list of registered graduates should be Rs. 2, and the annual subscriptions of registered graduates should be Rs. 2."

The University of Calcutta was established in 1857. At the commencement, the controlling authority of the University was a Senate,

which consisted of the Fellows of the University. At that time all he Fellows were nominated by the Government; and this went on till bout 1889 or 1890, when the Marquess of Lansdowne, as the Chanellor of the University, introduced an element of election; he gave the ellows the privilege of electing a small proportion of their own body. hat continued for 13 or 14 years until the passing of Lord Curzon's niversity Act. Under that Act, the institution which we all know s the Registered Graduates was established. The Registered Graduates are graduates of the University of a certain standing, that is to ay, they must be Masters of Arts or holders of similar or higher legrees, Doctors or Masters of Science, or they must be Bachelors of 0 years' standing. They are entitled to be placed on the list of egistered Graduates upon certain payments. The payments are an nitial fee of Rs. 30 and a recurring fee of Rs. 10 every year. The rivileges that they have for these payments and for being placed on he list of Registered Graduates are that they get certain publications f the University free of charge and they can elect a very small proortion of the Fellows. I believe the proportion that they can elect oes not exceed 20 per cent. Having regard to the fact that the Univerity has now a very large number of graduates and that the public now ake a very considerable amount of interest in University education, the ime has now come when the constitution of the University should be endered more popular.

In other departments of public life, viz., those that are under the inister in charge of Local Self-Government, we are having measures hich are gradually popularising the local bodies. We have not heard et as to what is being done about popularising the University. We ll know of what the Calcutta University Commission has recommended. n paragraph 24 of their Report, they say:

> Advisable as it may be to make use of nomination as a means of securing the ght composition—at once representative and administratively homogeneous—in a mall body charged with executive functions, we are doubtful whether nomination is he best method to adopt in a predominant degree for the constitution of a large ody, the main function of which should be to keep an executive in touch with public pinion. In such a case it is desirable that the members of the large body should eel that in a real sense they are spokesmen of special bodies and though not to the rejudice of their independence of judgment responsible for giving expres on to the views which those bodies entertain.

As I have said, a very large number of graduates belong to the everal faculties—Law, Engineering, Medicine and various departments f Science as well as of Arts. They take a very considerable amount of nterest in the affairs of the University. They have by their own examinaion and tuition fees contributed in a great measure towards the upeep of the University. There is no reason why they should not have voice—a controlling voice—in the management of the University. hey know what they want; they know what the country wants and to ake the University an exponent of the views of the public in its

various requirements, it is necessary that the constitution of the University should be so popularised as to focus the opinion of the public in the various departments of the studies which the University imparts. My proposal is that a certain proportion, viz., 20 per cent. be set apart for nomination But as regards the remaining 80 per cent., they should be elected. I propose that 60 per cent. be elected by the Registered Graduates, of whom there is a very large number, the remaining 20 per cent. being elected by the teachers and professors who are concerned with the education which the University imparts.

As regards the fees, what I desire to say is that the fee that is now charged for enrolment on the list of Registered Graduates is too high. There is a very large number of graduates who are ordinarily clerks and teachers in schools in receipt of a very small salary and it would be a hardship to them to pay the large sum of Rs. 10. For professional men and men in the higher services, probably that would be a small sum, but to the large majority of graduates, it would not be a small sum. The publications of the University that are distributed free among the Registered Graduates need not be distributed free and the University may say that they will be supplied at a little lower cost or a little over the cost price.

On these grounds I move the resolution that stands in my name.

Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR moved by way of amendment: "This Council recommends to the Government that steps be taken to effect the following changes in the Calcutta University, namely:—

(*a*) that at least 80 per cent of the Fellows of the University should be elected;

(*b*) that all persons who have taken the degrees of Doctors and Masters in any faculty and those who have graduated in any faculty not less than 7 years before the date of election shall be entitled to elect 60 per cent. of the Fellows; and

(*c*) that no fee, whatsoever, be charged from any graduate who is entitled to take part in such election."

The result of this amendment is that the original motion is amended by items (*b*) and (*c*). Item (*b*) is proposed, because the electorate which elects one member only to this Legislative Council, a more responsible body than that of the Calcutta University, are graduates of 7 years' standing. But if the motion that is proposed be given effect to the result will be that a far lesser number of graduates—I mean the Registered Graduates—will elect 60 per cent. of the Fellows. From the result of the election of past years by Registered Graduates of Fellows of the Calcutta University, We find that about 500 Registered Graduates usually take part in the election. So the result will be that five hundred graduates will elect 60 per cent. of the Fellows of the Calcutta University. My proposal, therefore, is that a larger electorate

than that which elects a member to this legislative body should be the electorate which should elect Fellows of the Calcutta University. The amendment which I propose will give us an electorate a little larger than that for the election of members to this Council; because by this amendment I propose that all graduates of 7 years' standing and Doctors and Masters of any faculty as soon as they obtain the degree should take part in the election. So a larger electorate will elect 60 per cent. of the Fellows of the Calcutta University.

Then as regards item (c) my submission is that the graduates should take part in the election more generally than they used to do in previous years; and in order to induce the graduates to take part in the elections there should be no fees at all. By this I do not intend that the income of the University should in any way be affected, because the Registered Graduates will be there; they pay a subscription of Rs. 10 and they get some benefit I believe they get the University Calendar and some other publications They are entitled to use the University library and enjoy also certain other privileges So by this amendment no harm will be done to the University; on the other hand it will popularise the University by inducing the graduates to take part in the elections

With these words I commend this amendment to the acceptance of the Council.

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: I beg to support the amendment As a matter of fact I do not think there is much difference between the original motion and the amendment so far as the principle of election is involved. It is now too late in the day to deny that in the management of the Calcutta University the elective principle should be more fully followed if we are to nationalise University education. From that point of view we would like to have cent. per cent. elected members on the University Senate. Now coming to the next point as to the realisation of certain fees for registration of graduates, I am sorry to differ from the proposer of the original motion. There was a time when the M.A.'s and B.A.'s of a certain period—I believe 1863 was the period were allowed to elect a certain number of Fellows on the Senate. I remember to have voted for my friend Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur and I am glad to say that he has justified his election. At that time there was no such thing as the registration of graduates to entitle them to vote, nor was any fee realised from them If it is really to be dealt with as a question of franchise and there is any value put upon the exercise of this franchise I do not see why anything should be exacted from the graduates who take part in the election of the Fellows. One might say that the University purse will be poorer. Therefore, in some indirect way some money should somehow or other be realised. But the gentlemen who will take part in the election will be helping

in the management of the University and should rather be paid for their labours instead of making them pay something for the exercise of their franchise. With these words I beg to support the amendment proposed by Mr. Sarkar.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: This resolution and the amendment to it are certainly good. I would prefer the amendment to the resolution. I was the first elected Fellow of the Calcutta University by the Masters of Arts and Doctors. Since then the rule has been changed and graduates are entitled to elect Fellows; but only such graduates who pay Rs. 10 a year, with the result that not more than one thousand graduates are enrolled as Registered Graduates. Who are these men? These are gentlemen who are mostly examiners. The result we all know is that there is no fair election of the Fellows to the Calcutta University. Therefore it is time that the rule should be changed and graduates should be allowed to vote without any payment. Is it not known to many members that at the time of the election the candidates for election sometimes pay Rs. 10 for many of the graduates for being registered? That is the reason why I object to even Rs. 2. Why should there be any payment at all? Graduates of 7 years' standing elect a member to the Legislative Council without any payment. Why should not they be allowed to elect Fellows without a payment of Rs. 2 or Rs. 10? It is a bad and vicious system altogether.

While I support this amendment, I must say that there is a great obstacle to it. What is the use of passing this amendment or this resolution without any legislation. We thought and expected that as soon as the Government of India sent the University Bill to this Council it would be introduced. But it has not yet been introduced; and I do not know when it would be introduced or whether it would be introduced at all. If that Bill is not introduced soon what is the good of passing this resolution, as it cannot be given effect to without an amendment of the present law. Therefore, all we can do is to express a hope that it should be so; so far we can go and no further. I shall tell you a further reason why it should be so. There is a cry and a persistent cry that education should be national in this country. Let the Senate of the Calcutta University be composed wholly of members elected by all the graduates of this country. It shall certainly then be a national University. Whosoever may deny its national character it will not matter much. Therefore it is right that the Government should take courage in both hands and legislate that the graduates of the University should be entitled to elect the entire Senate. Then you may say—"Here you are, your University is wholly national in character." And I shall certainly welcome the day when this shall be done and if the Government brings in a Bill, I shall certainly put in that provision. As it is all we can do is to express our opinion that it should be so and no more. In that view of the matter alone I support the amendment.

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: With your permission I wish to intervene at this stage in the hope that if I state the Government view of the matter, perhaps the debate will be shortened. My friends are all aware that the provision about the number of elected members on the Senate is a statutory provision. Under the Indian Universities Act, 10 per cent. are to be returned by the Registered Graduates, 10 per cent. to be returned by the faculties, and 80 per cent. to be nominated by Government. Now that is a statutory provision and as Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur has rightly pointed out, it can only be changed by another statute. Therefore, this question is a question of mere academic interest for the present. When the time for changing the present University Act comes, the recommendations of this Council will be of very great weight. But the Council will remember, in this connection, that it is not possible for Government at this stage to formulate the lines of the University legislation. As members of Council know we are not financially very well off and that we have made certain representations to the Government of India and the Secretary of State for improving our financial position. If the answer be favourable and if we have money at our disposal speaking provisionally, I may say that I desire to follow the lines of the recommendations of the Calcutta University Commission's Report. Members of Council are also aware that if the Government follow the lines of the Calcutta University Commission's Report then the largest body will be the court; there will be various other bodies, the Executive Council, etc.

On the other hand if the Government of India do not listen to our representation it is not possible to legislate on the lines of the Calcutta University Commission's Report. Then I may have to consult this Council about legislation on other lines. It may be possible to change the present constitution of the Calcutta University, perhaps retaining the Senate or an Executive Council in place of the Syndicate, but there again whenever there is any question of legislation I have got to come before this House and this House cannot say just now what their views will be on the Bill as a whole. For the present, Sir, I think the Hon'ble Members of the Council will be satisfied if I tell them that I have every possible sympathy with the object of this resolution and I shall place myself in the hands of this Council and shall try to give effect to their recommendations. But as the Council will have an opportunity to go into this matter when legislation is before them, I may just as well point out that perhaps it will not be desirable from the object that they have in view, to proceed on the lines recommended by the resolution or by the amendment. I am sure the Council will agree with me that it will be necessary to provide seats in the Senate for a number of people who are connected with educational institutions. In the bald form in which the resolution and the amendment have been presented this cannot be provided for. The Council will also agree with me that it would be necessary to provide for a number of Muhammadan gentlemen to be elected.

In the bald form of the resolution this cannot be done even if I accept the resolution or the amendment. It is also necessary that professors and teachers connected with Medicine, Engineering and Law and various other institutions should be properly represented. Therefore, when it comes to legislation I am willing to accept the democratic principle underlying the resolution and the amendment, but it will not be right to tie our hands as indeed our hands cannot be tied by a resolution of this nature because it is the Council which will decide the legislation. If it were an administrative matter, then the recommendations of the Council will have due weight with Government, but as it would be a matter for legislation I can only give the assurance that I am willing to accept the principle of the resolution and the amendment. I am willing to leave it to the vote of the non-official members of the Council and if the Council accept the position the discussion will, I hope, be short.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: I certainly agree with Babu Jatindra Nath Basu, the mover of the resolution, but there is also no doubt that, as the Hon'ble Minister for Education has pointed out, the discussion of such a resolution at the present moment has only an academic interest more or less. As regards the resolution I will say this that it does not go far enough. It only provides for election by the Registered Graduates. I do not know whether the mover has made a particular study of the ways in which the system of having Registered Graduates works. I say that this system of Registered Graduates must be done away with. Anybody who has studied the question knows fully that favouritism, which is the result of this system, has grown to an enormous extent of late, and it has become absolutely repulsive in character. This must be put an end to, and I may therefore be allowed to place my views in advance on this subject that this system of Registered Graduates is absolutely mischievous. It is mischievous again in this way. It practically consists only of professors and other people residing in and around Calcutta. It gives the surest chance to the Calcutta people, and no chance to the mufassal men at all. It provides wonderful facilities for canvassing, which goes on to a shameful extent, and I say without any fear of contradiction that I know of instances where candidates for Fellowships have paid the fees of Registered Graduates, which would seem incredible to you. But such is the case, and this is what is being done. If this University of ours is to be reformed, and we all think that it ought to be reformed, then not only this system of Registered Graduates, but the whole of the beehive must be destroyed, and the right of election must be thrown open to the whole body of graduates, say of 7 years' standing, as in the case of election to the Council. If graduates of 7 years' standing can elect members of the Legislative Council it is idle to say that they cannot be voters for University elections. Therefore I say, that instead of saying 80 per cent. as in the resolution, we should have said something more,

it as the resolution shows some appreciation of the mischievous charae-r of the existing system, I certainly support it, and I say that the ischief must be put an end to.

As regards the fee the Mover wants it to be reduced to Rs. 2. We now that this is being paid at Rs. 10, and it is not spent in the interest Registered Graduates It is spent on other things. Money is want-g and any weapon is good for the University. I for myself have been Registered Graduate for the last 15 years or so, and I have been get-ng all the University literature which I do not want and I do not know here to keep them. They are quite unnecessary. Nobody wants iem. I therefore put my views in advance to show how the country els as regards the system of Registered Graduates which has got to).

Dr. HASSAN SUHRAWARDY: This resolution has caused some prehension in the minds of the Muslim members of this Council, ecause it did not lay down any percentage as to the number of Fellows be elected by the Registered Graduates or by others. I am myself a ember of the Senate of the Calcutta University and I know that great portance is attached by the Muhammadan community to have their presentatives on the various administrative academic bodies and am ware of the good that their representatives can do. Sir, the principle f communal representation has been recognised everywhere. My very resence here is due to that fact and when this principle has been recog-ised in other places, it should, I think, be also recognised in every other ranch especially in the important branch of education. The speech of he Hon'ble the Minister for Education just a few minutes before has, to a ertain extent, removed the feeling of danger from our minds, and lthough he could not give any definite assurance at the present moment, he discussion being now of an academic character, he has said that he ill consider the question of Muslim representation when the reformed niversities legislation comes into existence. I wish to point out that he Universities Commission has made definite recommendations as to the ercentage of Muslim representation. The University of Dacca has llotted 50 per cent of Muslims in its executive body, and I place my iews in advance, that the Muslim interests should be adequately safe-uarded and represented in the reformed Calcutta University Senate, hen it comes into existence. So far the Registered Graduates are oncerned they have not shown justice and fairness to our best gradu-tes in the past, and I do not think their future action can be depended n with equanimity. I am glad the resolution has legal or statutory lefects and therefore cannot be acted upon by Government even if it is assed through the Council.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: The Hon'ble Minister for Edu-ation has been pleased to say that this resolution is more or less of an cademic importance. It seems to me, Sir, that most of the resolutions

that we pass in this Council are of academic importance only because we have no right to say that the recommendations must be given effect to. All the same, there is no reason why we should not give expression to the sentiments that we feel uppermost in our minds. Sir, these are the days of democracy, and in the fitness of things, this spirit of democracy should enter into the precincts of the Calcutta University. Lately we have heard a lot of criticism about the management of the Calcutta University and those who have carefully studied the proceedings of the Senate have sometimes wondered whether the discussions there, are the discussions of the representatives of the best brains of this country. The Calcutta University, like Cæsar's wife, should try to be above criticism, because it represents the best brains of the country; and how can we best effect this? By sending our best men there. Lately, Sir, a most curious spectacle has been seen of a large number of graduates having the right to elect a member of the Council, who have no right to elect a Fellow of the Calcutta University. Is this not strange? They can send a representative to this Council, but they cannot send a representative to the Senate. This sort of thing has got to come to an end. As my friend, Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur, says that these are the days of national ideas in University training. Only a few months ago, there was a great danger of the Calcutta University being boycotted by most of the students. We must see that this sort of thing does not occur again. We must, therefore, see that the real representative of the students get into the senate and have a hand in the management of its affairs. I do not think there is anything more to be said in this matter. The establishment of the Dacca University has produced a keen competitor to the Calcutta University and we, who belong to the latter University, must see that it carries its laurels nobly and that its affairs remain above criticism.

With these words, Sir, I support the amendment.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: I think the amendment should be accepted and that Babu Jatindra Nath Basu would be pleased to withdraw the main resolution. I thank him, however, for giving us an opportunity to express our views on this important matter. It is not right that the affairs of the University should be managed by a nominated few. The principle of election should be introduced. It may be necessary to consider the communal representation. In that view the proposal that 80 per cent. of the Fellows should be elected is sound. I think both the mover and the mover of the amendment will agree with that. If the Government accept the principle of the resolution I do not understand why it should not be given effect to immediately. The question of legislation of the Calcutta University is a complicated one, and it should take time. As this is a matter in which the public are much interested I simply press for immediate action being taken for the election of Fellows for the present. The realisation of registration

e should not be thought necessary, and the Registered Graduates only ould not be allowed to take part in the election. If we are to accept e principle of election for fellowship it should be given effect to as ovided in the Council election.

With these few words I support the amendment. If necessary, a ill may be introduced for this purpose only.

Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ: In so far as the resolution is a protest gainst the dominance of a particular individual over the affairs of the niversity, and in so far as it aims at introducing the system of election nd making the University a representative body I have my fullest sympathy with the resolution. But I have my misgivings also and I spoke ut to my hon'ble friend, the mover, who says that by this resolution e does not mean that the Muhammadans, Christians and others, who ught to be represented in the body as Fellows of the University will ot have their adequate and proper numbers, for at the time when the niversity Act will come before the House their numbers will be settled nd secured. When this assurance is given, I do not think, I should bject to the carrying out of this resolution.

It has been said by an hon'ble member that, according to the preseding system, Muhammadans have got their fullest representation, ut to my mind and also to the minds of those Muhammadans who live n the mufassal that does not seem to be a fact. Those persons only who happen to live in Calcutta and have the opportunity of meeting a articular individual have the good fortune of being taken in as ellows. But those who do not care to do that they have not found a place in the body of the University. As election of the members of he University will do away with favouritism and will not be to he detriment of the Muhammadan and other communities I do not see why we Muhammadans should oppose it. It is true that, from what has fallen from the Hon'ble Member we do not seem to possess the power to give effect to the resolution but this may go as a sort of recommendation and I would wait for the result.

Babu NIRODE BEHARY MULLICK: It may be known to members of this Council that recently a resolution was accepted in the Council of State to the effect that the Indian Universities should be based on a democratic basis that is to say all interests connected with education should have their full representation on the Universities. This resolution and the amendment thereto certainly do not attempt to fulfil this desired improvement. Moreover if the resolution or its amendment be accepted the Muhammadans who form 52 per cent. of the total population, and the backward classes who form no less than ten millions of the people of Bengal will have no place at all in the Calcutta University. This is certainly absurd.

M

In the second place, I would like to point out that the resolution or its amendment is premature. It has been stated by the Hon'ble Minister for Education that the whole University scheme will come before the House within a very short time. It will then be possible for members of this Council to consider the whole scheme together

In the third place, Mr. Indu Bhushan Dutta has spoken of the sentiments, which he would like to give expression to. I would like on the other hand to enquire whose sentiments they were Certainly they were not the sentiments of a large number of the classes of the province. And in regard to this I would like to meet Mr. Dutta by reminding him of his own words, namely, that a person who can vote at the Council election cannot vote at the Calcutta University. This is certainly not what it should be But this the original resolution or its amendment does not propose to remedy. On the other hand, if this sentiment is given effect to, the would-be electorate of the Calcutta University would be completely different from what is proposed in the resolution or its amendment

With these words I oppose both the resolution and the amendment

Mr. SYED NASIM ALI: I rise to oppose both the resolution as well as the amendment, not because I am opposed to a system of election as against the system of nomination, not because I am in favour of the so-called favouritism alluded to by my hon'ble friend, Mr. Mullick, but because I have my misgivings regarding the interest of my community Sir, the resolution as well as the amendment are both silent as to how the interest of my community would be adequately safeguarded. If a system of election is to be introduced in preference to the present system of nomination the interests of all communities ought to be safeguarded by Government If a system of election is to be introduced, I would certainly accept that principle provided, by that system of election, the interest of my community is "adequately safeguarded" and not simply represented. Therefore, Sir, both in principle as well in view of the fact that the resolution as well as the amendment are silent on this point, I strongly oppose both the resolution as well as the amendment.

Babu NIBARAN CHANDRA DAS GUPTA: At this fag-end of the day, it was not my intention to take part in this debate, after what has fallen from the Hon'ble Minister in charge of Education, accepting the principle, underlying the original resolution as well as the amendment. But as an Act to amend the existing University Act is going to be shortly introduced, there will be time enough to go into all these details. My Muhamadan friends have ventured, I am afraid, to tread on dangerous grounds, namely, the communal, the racial, and other questions. Sir, the University is not an executive democratic body but it is the temple of learning. Therefore, the principle of selection as well as the

principle of election must be combined here, otherwise, in many cases, worthy men who ought to be in the University, such as scientists, philosophers, literary men and others who fight shy of going to the hustings, will not care to go there and I beg to submit that any University worthy of its name must have the best intellectuals of the land in it. Sir, if you look to the constitution of the Universities of Europe, you will not find this democratic principle everywhere. What is the constitution of the Oxford University? Of course, that is too large a question. So I do not think it is the proper time to go into it. The time is not far off when the new University Act will be before us, and so I think both the movers of the motion and the amendment should not press for them in view of the assurance given by the Hon'ble Minister in charge of Education. Sir, there is no doubt that there is something rotten in the State of Denmark. The Calcutta University has of late been subjected to much criticism. It is said that it is very autocratic in its ways. Sir, I think these discussions are taking a somewhat academic turn, and the proper time for considering these things will be, when the Hon'ble the Minister will introduce a Bill to amend the present Calcutta University Act on the lines suggested by the Commission, which are embodied in several volumes of voluminous literature.

Professor S. C. MUKHERJI: Sir, I beg to oppose both the motion and the amendment but not on the ground that I am opposed to the principle of election. I am entirely in favour of the elective principle. I may say frankly I have not the least objection if cent per cent. is elected and not a single member be nominated. But I oppose this because I find one set of speakers is very anxious that communal interests should be sufficiently safeguarded. I am certainly in favour of communal representation but I feel objection to its extreme emphasis as in the case of such a body as the University. I am not very anxious to see there so many Hindus, so many Mahomedans, so many Europeans, so many Indian Christians and so many of other communities elected on the communal basis. I should like to see there the very best men, the most highly educated men, men who by their culture are best fitted to guide the destinies of the University. Secondly I oppose this motion because there is no indication of any procedure. There is no indication whatever as to who are going to be represented on this University. Are the teachers, the professors, the medical men, the engineers and the lawyers going to be represented on this body in due proportion? There is nothing indicated in the resolution here. I oppose this motion also on the ground that it seems to be a piecemeal reformation of the University. There are drastic reforms proposed by the University Commission's Report and I understand from the Hon'ble Minister in charge of Education, that a legislation will sooner or later come before this House indicating the lines along which reforms are needed in the University, and I am sure this will certainly find its legitimate

place when the drastic reforms suggested by the University Commission are taken in hand.

Babu JATINDRA NATH BASU: I am thankful to the Hon'ble Minister in charge of Education for expressing his sympathy with the principle which underlies the resolution moved by me. The Hon'ble Minister has stated that the discussion is more or less academic, because certain proportions of elected and nominated members have been fixed by statute. He mentioned the proportions 10 per cent. by Registered Graduates, 10 per cent. by the Faculties and 80 per cent. by Government. But I submit, Sir, that this 80 per cent. which Government can appoint, may be appointed by Government on the recommendations of the electors. The Hon'ble Minister knows that when Lord Lansdowne introduced the element of election, the statute did not provide for election, but for 14 or 15 years Fellows were elected. The Chancellor appointed the Fellows on the recommendation of certain electors. That can be done. There is no reason why this 80 per cent. which the Government have power to appoint should not be elected by the graduates. As regards the apprehension of the Hon'ble Minister that certain special departments, for instance, the profession of teaching, certain communities like the important community of Muhammadans, are not likely to be adequately represented if this resolution is passed, I beg to submit that if the Hon'ble Minister will kindly look into the resolution, he will find that there is nothing in it which prevents Government from regulating the proportion in which the election should take place. As the mover of the resolution, I can say this that he will have every sympathy if the regulations are so framed that the interests of the Muhammadans, of the Christians both European and Indian, of the depressed classes and of other important classes are fully and adequately represented. On this ground I do not think that Dr. Suhrawardy need have the apprehension which he entertains in the event of this resolution being passed.

It has been stated that the resolution is of academic interest because there is likely to be legislation very soon. We know, Sir, from past experience that when need for a legislation is urgently felt, it is some time before the legislation comes. The Hon'ble Minister has himself stated that there are great financial difficulties in the way of carrying out the recommendations of the Calcutta University Commission. Those financial difficulties may prevent the early introduction of the legislation which is contemplated in consequence of the recommendations of the Commission. We all know, Sir, that about the year 1888 or 1889 the Government and the public felt the need for reform, but it took nearly 15 years before the ideas of reform crystalised.

With reference to the amendment that has been proposed by my friend, my resolution contains three clauses (*a*), (*b*) and (*c*). Clause (*a*) is the same as proposed by him. Clause (*b*) is different. I am willing to

accept clause (*b*) as amended by Babu Rishindra Nath Sarkar. As regards clause (*c*), I do not accept what he proposes that no fee should be charged. As a matter of fact, and all graduates of the Calcutta University know it, postage fees for sending the election papers and other notices to each elector hardly fall short of a rupee per head. Therefore, in order to meet the charges which the University have to incur if a large number of graduates are placed on the list, I am willing that instead of Rs. 2, Re. 1 should be mentioned in clause (*c*) proposed by me and the enrolment fee should be Re. 1.

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: The member cannot amend his motion at this stage.

Babu JATINDRA NATH BASU: I think I am entitled to accept the amendment with certain modifications.

The PRESIDENT: I do not think you can make any such modifications, but if you accept the amendment, it is all right.

Babu JATINDRA NATH BASU: In that case I accept the amendment.

Adjournment.

The Council was then adjourned to 3 P.M. on Tuesday, the 8th instant, at the Town Hall.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Council assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act.

THE Council met in the Town Hall, Calcutta, on Tuesday, the 5th July, 1921, at 3 P.M.

Present:

The Hon'ble the President, the Hon'ble the four Members of the Executive Council, two Hon'ble Ministers (the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea was absent owing to illness) and 97 nominated and elected members.

The PRESIDENT (the Hon'ble Nawab Sir Syed Shams-ul-Huda): Order! Order! I wish to inform you that with regard to the demand for supplementary grants which will be presented on the 15th and the 18th instant, I have fixed the 11th as the last day on which motions for reduction or refusal will be received. This gives less than 10 days to the Departments but they have agreed to this.

The debate on the resolution of Babu Jatindra Nath Basu was resumed.

Calcutta University.

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of EDUCATION (the Hon'ble Mr. P. C. Mitter): The matter has been fully debated yesterday and I do not propose to take up the time of this Council at any length. Babu Jatindra Nath Basu has told the House that in my view the question was an academic one. Babu Jatindra Nath Basu has done me some injustice. I think I made it abundantly clear in my opening speech that in my view the question was academic only *for the present* and I made it quite clear that when the time for legislation came, the views of this House would receive the utmost consideration at the hands of the Government. Therefore, as the matter has been fully debated and as I have said that even if the recommendations of this House were accepted by Government, I cannot give effect to the recommendations so long as we did not legislate. At the time of legislation the members of the House will have ample opportunity of discussing this question in all its details and in all its bearings. Therefore, I propose to treat this resolution from this point of view, namely, that, in framing the Bill, I am prepared to accept the democratic principle underlying it. I am prepared to state that the Government will take early steps to modify the constitution of the Calcutta University in such a way as to make it thoroughly representative of public opinion in Bengal, and of various interests which the University has to serve, and for this purpose I am prepared to introduce the elective principle in the constitution of the Calcutta University on a broad and

liberal basis. I am also prepared to give an effective proportion of the representation being given to graduates but, in framing the Bill, I must safeguard the various teaching interests and the different courses of study, for example, medical, engineering and so on.

With these words, I leave this resolution to the vote of the non-official members of the Council.

The following amended resolution was then put and carried:

"This Council recommends to the Government that steps be taken to effect the following changes in the Calcutta University, namely:

(a) that at least 80 per cent. of the Fellows of the University should be elected;

(b) that all persons who have taken the degrees of Doctors and Masters in any faculty and those who have graduated in any faculty not less than seven years before the date of election shall be entitled to elect 80 per cent. of the Fellows, and

(c) that no fee, whatsoever, be charged from any graduate who is entitled to take part in such election."

Commercial Schools.

Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: "This Council recommends to the Government that at least one commercial school, with a museum attached to it, be established and maintained in every division of Bengal."

I will first of all explain to you the importance of a commercial school, secondly, as to whether this institution should be established in the mofussil or not, and, thirdly, whether a commercial museum should be attached to this school.

With regard to the first point I beg to draw attention to the fact that there is a great discontent amongst the youths of Bengal, what is the reason? I think that they are sick of the present system of education. They want national education and having consulted some of them I find that they really want technical education. It is well known that the Bar is overcrowded; they want such education by which they can earn their livelihood. We find that the commerce of Bengal, or rather of India, is now in the hands of the Europeans. We also find that the inland trade of India is in the hands of the Marwaris, and what is the condition of the people of Bengal? Properly speaking, they consist mostly of lawyers and clerks. I know of several capitalists who do not venture to invest their money in business; and what is the reason? Nothing but want of commercial education. That is the reason why I suggest that commercial schools and colleges should be established in every part of India. We find that in the United States of America there is not a single town which is not provided with a commercial school. We also find that in Japan every town is provided with a commercial school, and in Tokio, the

apital of Japan, there is a commercial University and there is a college n which no less than 2,000 students study commerce. We find in England there is a number of commercial universities, a number of colleges of commerce and schools of commerce. We find that even in Germany here is a number of day schools and a number of evening schools of ommerce. We find from the statistics that there are no less than 100 lay schools of commerce and no less than 250 evening schools of commerce We find that in Berlin, there is a commercial college in which here are no less than 3,000 students who study that subject It is a subject which has been strongly recommended by several public bodies it appears from the proceedings of the meetings of the Indian National 'ongress from year to year that they have repeatedly suggested to the iovernment to establish commercial colleges and schools We find also rom the proceedings of the Indian Industrial Conference a similar suggestion has been made It appears also from the report of the Indian Industrial Commission that they have strongly recommended the establishment of commercial colleges as well as schools in every part of India I draw your special attention to the very learned note of the Hon'ble Pandit Madan Mohan Malavya, a member of the Commission It appears from that report itself that those nations of the West who are foremost in the commerce of the world have devoted the greatest attention to commercial education Germany was the first to recognise the necessity and usefulness of such kind of education America followed suit and so did Japan During the last twenty years England has fully made up its deficiency in the institutions for commercial education So it appears that all public bodies the Indian National Congress the Indian Industrial 'ommission and Conference have unanimously repeatedly suggested to he Government to establish commercial colleges and commercial schools n every part of India But what do we find so far as India is concerned? properly speaking nothing of the kind There is only one college of commerce worth the name, I mean the Sydenham College of Commerce in Bombay I do not know whether it is maintained by Government I am informed that it is maintained by some of the leading merchants of Bombay So far as Calcutta is concerned I find there is only one Government Commercial Institute, an institute established by the Government of India, but that is the only institute worth the name in Bengal, and only 180 students are allowed to be admitted into that institute every year, quite inadequate for the purpose for which it has been established In the mufassal I find there is only one such institute That is the college of commerce in Berhampore which has been established and maintained by the Hon'ble Maharaja of Cossimbazar to whom we are grateful I admit that there is a number of commercial schools in Calcutta and two or three in the mufassal, one in Dacca and one or two in the other towns of Bengal, but they teach typewriting, shorthand and, book-keeping. What is their object? Not to impart commercial education or scientific education in commerce in the literal sense of the word. They are nothing

but machines for the manufacture of clerks. What I want is to have such institutions so that we may create a number of traders and merchants if possible. It will appear from the report of the Calcutta University Commission that the export and import trade of India totals more than Rs 3,00,000,000 every year. You can therefore imagine what an amount of employment can be found for our young men in the various branches of commerce, if satisfactory arrangements can be made for their business education and training, so that, as I have already said, as our Bar is overcrowded there is no fair field for our young men of Bengal, and commercial education is the only course left to them.

I have suggested that at least one commercial school may be established in every division of Bengal. I know the state of the finance of the Government of Bengal, that is the reason why I am so moderate. I could have asked you to establish a commercial school in every town or every centre of trade of Bengal, but as I am a Moderate I am also moderate in my demand. I suggest that we should make a beginning. We should start with at least one commercial school in every principal centre of trade of every division of Bengal. We can start at once. We can meet the expenditure from the closing balance of the Revenue Fund of this year and, next year, we can increase the number of such institutions. I have suggested that every commercial school should be provided with a museum. Otherwise it will be a play of Hamlet without Hamlet. In order to provide practical commercial education, we must have a commercial museum attached to the school. As the Medical College or school is provided with a hospital, so a commercial school should be provided with a commercial museum.

With these remarks I beg to move the resolution that stands in my name.

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of ACRICULTURE and INDUSTRIES (the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri Khan Bahadur): I shall not take up much of the Council's time in dealing with this resolution, but I wish to make it clear that I am fully alive to the present demand for vocational education. I recognize the reasonableness of the demand and I am doing all that lies in my power to meet it. A scheme for the extension of elementary and secondary agricultural education has been prepared and is now under my consideration. The Director of Industries is drawing up a scheme for the extension of technical and industrial education. As regards commercial schools, I agree with the Indian Industrial Commission in the view that the practice of up-to-date methods of business and account-keeping is certain to spread in the mufassal and that the demand for men with a training such as commercial schools will afford is bound to increase. I am therefore prepared to accept this resolution and to instruct the Director of Industries to prepare a scheme for the establishment in every Division of a commercial school with a commercial museum attached. I must however remind

the Council that the rate of progress in establishing these schools must depend on the financial position and on the amount of assistance which local bodies are ready to afford.

Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: I have heard the Hon'ble Minister in charge. I am grateful to him for accepting my resolution.

The resolution was then put to the vote and carried.

Dredging of the river Lohajang.

Raja MANMATHA NATH RAY CHOUDHURY: "This Council recommends to the Government that steps be taken to thoroughly dredge the silted-up portions of the mouth of the river Lohajang, in the subdivision of Tangail with a view to make the river a perennial source of drinking water and river-borne trade by country boats as it used to be throughout the year in the past."

I am free to confess that the resolution embodies a question of purely local interest and I am conscious of the fact that even to-day there is a tendency on our part to belittle local problems, which naturally and primarily touch a limited area. In my opinion, however, it should not be so; for the right solution of local problems, however insignificant they may appear to be, can alone make up the whole for which the Reformed Council has been called into existence. I therefore, hope that my resolution will receive the sympathetic attention of this House, inasmuch as it is calculated to contribute, if given effect to, towards the prosperity of a large section of our countrymen.

Sir, I may be permitted to remind this House of the question, which I put to the Hon'ble Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation, at the last session of the Council.

The hon'ble member may remember I got a very meagre and stereotyped reply from the Hon'ble Member in charge of Irrigation. I think that he was not right in saying that there was no information before the Irrigation Department with regard to the miserable condition of the river in question. I find that since the year 1887 this question has been before the public and the Government. If I remember aright it was in the year 1887 that the local board of Tangail, by means of a resolution, granted a certain amount to improve the mouth of the river Lohajang. The question was again taken up in 1892 by Sir Charles Elliot when he visited Tangail. In 1907 or 1908 I do not exactly remember when - it again came up for solution before Sir Lancelot Hare when he visited Tangail. I was present there on that occasion. Sir Lancelot himself, I regret to say had a sorry experience. He left his steamer on the main river and proceeded to Tangail by a small steam launch. As fate would have it, the steam launch got stuck at the mouth of the river Lohajang almost immediately after the start was made. His Honour was compelled to perform the rest of the journey by a small country boat and he got back to his

steamer from Tangail in one of my green boats. In 1918, I think, Lord Carmicheal met with a similar fate, when he visited Tangail. The question was then reopened and dealt with at length. In 1919 the river was surveyed by the Public Works Department and an exhaustive report was submitted to the Government for its consideration. Under the circumstances, Sir, I think I am right in saying that before giving an answer light-heartedly, the Hon'ble Member in charge ought to have looked into old records, made inquiries and called for reports from local bodies and officials on the spot. At any rate, I shall be guilty of not telling the truth if I do not say that the answer surprised me and not only surprised but also disappointed my constituency. Sir, this Council must have learnt with deep regret about the prevalence of malaria and kala-azar in the ill-fated subdivision of Tangail, which has also become notorious for periodical epidemics of typhoid and cholera. There can be no doubt that the want of a perennial source of drinking water and running stream through which dormant tanks, stagnant pools and canals of the locality can get flushed in the natural course all round the year, is primarily responsible for its present state of unhealthiness.

Sir, as regards river-borne trade in that part of the country, I think this Council will be able to realise the great difficulties which confront the people when I tell them that in that part of the country, country-boats are the only means of transport and, in fact, almost all the big *hats* and bazaars are on the bank of the river Lohajang, where the people of the subdivision have to take their marketable commodities for sale. It is therefore, no wonder that the trade there has materially suffered since navigation has become impossible in that river.

I think that it is the duty of Government to see that malaria and kala-azar are not allowed to work havoc in that part of the country and that the local trade there is not dislocated to the great loss of the people. I am not aware if any dredger is available at present for the purpose I have in view, but, this House will remember that during the last session of the Council, the Hon'ble Member in charge of the Department of Irrigation gave us to understand that the Government had ordered for some dredgers and that we have to pay for them this year. In my speech on that occasion, I pressed for more information and for the exact terms of the contract into which Government was represented to have entered for the dredgers; but unfortunately there was not a single word for me in the Hon'ble Member's reply! I, however, presume that the dredgers will be available this year. If my supposition is right, then the task that lies before Government will not be a very difficult one. At any rate I appeal to the Hon'ble Member in charge to take up this question and try to find a solution for the great difficulty which stares us in the face.

With that end in view, I beg to move the resolution.

Maulvi KHANDAKAR ARHAMUDDIN: The subdivision of Tangail is the biggest subdivision in the Presidency in area and in population.

But it is inaccessible from the outside world for want of easy means of communication.

It has become notorious for some time past for malaria, kala-azar and other fell diseases. It has been made a two-years station instead of three-years in view of its bad climate for judicial officers. Recently the population, as shown by the last census, of the municipal area itself is decreasing. From 16,000, it has come down to 14,000 in course of ten years. If this high rate of mortality continues the area will be depopulated in course of 70 years. Expert opinion shows that all these are due to want of proper drainage and good drinking water. Only a few years ago, when the river Lohajang was a flowing river in all seasons of the year, Tangail was a sanitarium. So experience shows that the drying up of the river is one of the main causes of the bad health of this subdivision. It will certainly improve trade and local industry and supply pure drinking water, as my hon'ble colleague, the mover, has said, if the mouth of this river be dredged with a view to make it a continuously flowing river throughout the year. It will certainly be a great boon to the people of the biggest but neglected subdivision of the Presidency. With these few words, I beg to support this resolution.

Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: My friend Raja Manmatha Nath Ray Choudhury has very ably moved this resolution.

We often find—I hope I shall not be taken amiss by the Calcutta members—that all works of improvement are done generally near Calcutta and the mufassal is neglected and, coming from the mufassal, I naturally wish that some sort of improvement should be made in the mufassal also.

With these remarks, I beg to support the resolution, and I wish, rather, I beg the Council, to support this resolution whole-heartedly.

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of IRRICATION (the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan): It is a notorious fact that in the province of Bengal the number of schemes for drainage and for improving the drinking water are numerous, and what Raja Manmantha Nath Ray Choudhury has said with intimate knowledge about the portion of the Mymensingh district from which he comes is, I am quite sure, true. It is quite possible, as the Maulvi Sahib has said, that there has been a general deterioration in the health of the inhabitants of the locality. Nor have I anything to say against the principle that the Raja Sahib enunciated that "many a mickle makes a mukle". A small scheme should not be lost sight of, but when we come to the actual facts we find that before we can get to the stage of dredging we have got to make an inquiry and investigation. The scheme which the Raja Sahib has in view has never been examined in detail and, before any proposals for dredging can be accepted, we must secure expert opinion as to what the result of such dredging is likely to be, whether the benefits accruing would be commensurate with the expenditure that we might have to

incur, and whether there are any dangers of damages to property as a result of throwing more water into the river by such dredging operations. No level of the country has yet been taken, neither are the records of the level of the main river which the Lohajang river connects in the different seasons of the year available. The consideration of a project like this can only be made after these data have been collected. It is a well-known fact that over a very large area of the deltaic tract of Bengal, constant changes in the river courses are bringing about new conditions which require investigation and that the proposal for the improvement of the Lohajang river is only one of the very large number of schemes which require investigation but which unfortunately, cannot be carried out owing to the paucity of staff in the department, not to speak of the present financial position. This question has had the serious attention of the department lately and, as a result, a scheme for opening up new engineering divisional and circle charges has been made out and it has received the sanction of the Secretary of State. It will, however, be some time before we can give effect to it, and this investigation will unfortunately have to wait. In fact all the three divisions of the Dacca, Rajshahi and Presidency require investigations. As however, investigations cannot be taken up at once, it is not possible to consider the question of dredging now and on this ground alone the resolution cannot be accepted. For these reasons I am unable on behalf of Government to accept this resolution.

Raja MANMATHA NATH RAY CHOUDHURY: I would not press this resolution if the Hon'ble Member in charge would assure me that the investigation will be taken up as soon as possible and that a right solution would be found for the great difficulty complained of.

The PRESIDENT: Then you withdraw.

The President then declared that the leave of the Council had been given to withdraw the resolution.

Raja MANMATHA NATH RAY CHOUDHURY: I do so only if the Hon'ble Member in charge would give me the assurance.

The PRESIDENT: I am afraid I cannot allow you to do that. You have made your choice and have been allowed to withdraw.

Raja MANMATHA NATH RAY CHOUDHURY: I did not mean that. I simply said that if the Hon'ble Member in charge would assure me that the investigation would be made, then I would withdraw otherwise not.

Mr. HUSEYN SHAHEED SUHRAWARDY: May I claim a division?

The PRESIDENT: I am afraid I cannot allow that. The resolution has been withdrawn.

Publications of Council Proceedings in Bengali.

Mr. D. C. CHOSE: "This Council recommends to the Government the desirability of publishing in Bengali a review of the work of the Bengal Legislative Council of each session and taking measures for circulating it among local bodies and public associations in the province."

With the leave of the House, I should like to make a little verbal alteration in the resolution before I speak on it. The alteration that I desire to make is this. I should like to substitute in place of "a review" "an account."

The PRESIDENT: You are permitted to do so.

Mr. D. C. CHOSE: It has struck me as being somewhat incongruous that with the advent of what may be described as Parliamentary form of Government in Bengal there is no adequate arrangement for giving the widest publicity to the proceedings of the legislative council. In countries more advanced than ours, the work of publicity is mostly done by the Press, but unfortunately in this country the vernacular press which alone can reach the masses is not so well organised as it should be and accordingly the vast majority of those who form the electorate for the purpose of returning members of this Council are either unaware or have a very imperfect knowledge of the work of the legislative council. Now this is a state of affairs which we cannot permit to continue, for it is fatal to the growth of the form of Government which we now possess. It is important, vitally important, that our constituents should know what we their representatives, and the Government are doing for them. It may be that when they know what we are striving to do for them they would be able to help us with ideas and suggestions for they are much nearer reality, much nearer the truth than perhaps we are so far as problems affecting their every day life are concerned. Then as they have returned us it is only right and proper that they should know how we are serving them and how far the Government are willing to accede to our demands. Further, a knowledge of the proceedings of the Legislative Council on the part of our constituents is also desirable on the ground that they will learn gradually to think more of measures than of men, when they are called upon to exercise their franchise at the time of the election. In other words, if they are placed in a position to follow the activities of the Council they will learn by and by to vote for such men who they think will best advance the causes in which they are most interested. The last election was fought more or less upon purely personal issues. Now it is not desirable that such contests should be allowed to continue. But if we are anxious to prevent such contests we must enable our constituents to take an intelligent interest in the proceedings of this Council, and this can only be done by giving the widest publicity to the works of the Council. There is a deeper consideration in support of the resolution which I have

placed before the Council to-day. So far as I am aware the policy underlying the reforms and the great change in the system of Government which the reforms have brought about has never been presented to the great mass of our countrymen. Nor have they been told that the present legislative councils especially of the provinces are now armed with plenary powers which, if exercised with judgment and foresight, will enable us to make a still further advance towards the goal of our ambition, namely, complete self-government. It is necessary, I submit, that they should be told these things. I can conceive of no better method of imparting information or knowledge about these things than to prepare, in an attractive form, an account of the work of the Council of each session in Bengali to give it the widest possible circulation. There is a more urgent, and more pressing consideration than those that I have stated already in favour of the acceptance of my resolution. We are all aware that a section of our countrymen, who call themselves non-co operators, have made it a part of their business to belittle the reforms, to describe the present legislative councils as much the same as they were before and further to say that the attitude of Government has not changed a bit, and the representatives of the people are altogether powerless to do anything for their countrymen. Also, they have made it a rule to minimise, as much as possible, the earnest and anxious efforts of the Ministers to ameliorate the condition of their countrymen and to magnify, as much as they can, any little error, any little mistake, that they can find in their work. I venture to think that the best antidote to this deliberate and wilful misrepresentation and gross perversion of truth is to present to the great mass of our countrymen a faithful accurate picture of the work of the legislative council. They must be told they must be placed in a position to realise that the issue now is with them and those who lead them. They can have no doubt any longer. It might have been possible before, they can have no doubt any longer as to the intentions of the British Government. It lies with them and them alone to work out their own salvation. Now, having given all my reasons for commending this resolution to the acceptance of the House, I should like to say what I would do if I were called upon to take action for the purpose of carrying out this proposal. In the first place, as soon as a session of the Council is over, I would get a faithful account of the proceedings prepared, giving salient points of the debates and discussions and the conclusions to which the House had arrived. I would have it done in as attractive and popular a manner as possible. Then I would send a copy to every member of a union committee or a union board, every member of a local board, every member of a district board, and I would send a few copies to every thana for distribution among prominent and influential men in the surrounding villages. Besides I would send copies to all the well known public associations of the province. Two factors, and two factors alone, can achieve the object of my proposal. One is the preparation, speedy preparation of a faithful and accurate picture of the proceedings of the

Council and the other is its distribution in such a manner as to secure the the widest publicity.

Babu NIBARAN CHANDRA DAS GUPTA: I heartily accept the principle outlined by the mover in commending the resolution to the acceptance of the House. But there are certain practical difficulties in the way which should not be overlooked. In the first place, we must remember that the work and proceedings of the Council have become so heavy that Government have not yet been able to publish fully the proceedings of the last session, and it is very difficult to publish with precision and accuracy the proceedings of the Council so quickly and then to translate them into the vernacular for giving the widest publicity possible of these proceedings. Apart from the question of cost the practical difficulties are enormous. I fully appreciate the spirit which led the mover to move this resolution. We know to our regret that the newspaper reporting has been very unsatisfactory. There may be some good reasons for this, but at the same time it is very unfortunate that advantage has been taken of the inaccurate reporting by a section of the press in misrepresenting the Council and to belittle, as it has been said, the importance of the Reforms. How to combat this difficulty? On the side of Government it will be said "Well, you have abolished the Publicity Bureau, and how are we to proceed?" But I do not think any amount of reporting can put down that spirit, any amount of reporting can stop the mouth of the calumniators, and the Government version or publication will not be accepted by the people who usually prefer any distorted account given by the so-called independent newspapers. To obviate this difficulty, I think the best course would be to afford every possible facility to the reporting establishment for accurate reporting and the vernacular newspapers which are moderate, which are sensible, may translate those proceedings for the edification of the public. Government may subscribe for a large number of copies of the enterprising newspapers which undertakes to do it, and that is the way of subsidising a newspaper which is accurate and which gives out the truth. But I do not know whether the proposal as worded in the resolution can be given effect to without incurring enormous costs, and the easiest solution of this is to subsidise a good vernacular newspaper that will undertake to report correctly and accurately a summary of the work of the Legislative Council. I thoroughly disapprove of starting again a department of giving publicity which will not attain this object. If even these daily newspapers cannot afford to give an exact account of the proceedings of the Council, then these difficulties should be thought out and should be considered before we accept this resolution, and I suggest that Government should subsidise a newspaper which undertakes to do this. There is no shadow of doubt that the country wants to know what the Council and the Councillors are doing and, if they know that we are doing something, they will appreciate the reforms; the question of cost in all departments stands in the

way of the Reforms being accepted as a boon by the ordinary people. With these few remarks I ask my friend, the mover of the resolution, to accept the suggestion and I also ask the Hon'ble Member in charge of the department of "Politics," to consider the object of the resolution by subsidising a vernacular newspaper of this discription.

Khan Bahadur Maulvi WASIMUDDIN AHMED asked for permission to move the following amendment which stood in the name of Mr Syed Erfan Ali, who was absent, viz:—

that after the words "local bodies" the words "principal vernacular newspapers" be inserted.

Permission was granted.

As has been pointed out by the learned mover it is highly important that the proceedings of this Council should be brought to the notice of the people who have sent up their representatives to this House. The best means of doing this would be to publish in the local newspapers written in Bengali—I think for Bengal Bengali literature would do—by which the mufassal people could be made aware of the proceedings of the House. I do not propose that all the speeches and every thing should be reprinted but only the notes, the principal features of the proceedings should be circulated to the mufassal through the medium of the principal vernacular newspapers.

The PRESIDENT: You move the amendment only?

Khan Bahadur Maulvi WASIMUDDIN AHMED: Yes.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: I beg to support the resolution just moved by my friend, Mr. D. C. Ghose; but I do not entertain the rapturous admiration with which he is animated as regards the Reforms. The Reforms have no doubt been a great advance—say what the out-and-out non-co-operators might. The work of this Council cannot be pooh-poohed. During the last session, we passed resolutions providing for medical relief to the meanest and the lowest of the people of Bengal. We passed resolutions for the establishment of technological and agricultural colleges at Calcutta. We passed resolutions for the separation of the judicial and executive functions. I mention only two or three. Furthermore we struck out about 20 lakhs of rupees by way of curtailment, or rather by way of economy from the Budget as presented to us by Government. Is that to be pooh-poohed? Is that nothing? This Council, I do hope, will during the course of three years be of great service to the country; but I must say this to Mr. D. C. Ghose that no credit whatsoever is due to his party—the National Liberal League or to the Ministers who have opposed every good resolution. We are neither Moderates nor Extremists, but we are the people, we are not the few Moderates or those people who non-co-operate with the Government and make the Government impossible.

MEMBER in charge of LEGISLATIVE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): May I rise to a point of order? The resolution is a request for the circulation of the proceedings of this Council in Bengali, but the Rai Bahadur's speech is a comment on the proceedings of this Council.

The PRESIDENT: The member is out of order.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: I do quite believe that this resolution is good, but I do believe also that it will do a great deal of harm when the people will see how their best interests have been opposed by the Government and when every Minister has opposed every good resolution. You may be sure that it will do a good deal of harm.

Maulvi SHAH ABDUR RAUF: It is with great pleasure that I support the resolution of Mr. D. C. Ghose. It is quite known that the Reforms have given a wide franchise to the people of this country. We know perfectly well that the number of electorates have increased; and we also know it perfectly well that we come here as the representatives of a vast mass of people and it is, in the fitness of things, highly desirable that these electorates should know what their representatives are doing for them in this Council. We all know that there was a weekly newspaper called the *Shaptahik Judha Barta*, which was circulated by the Government among the rural people through the village headmen, even in the remotest villages, in order to give them an idea of the progress of the War. It will not do now for the Government to say that it will entail a heavy expenditure on the part of the Government to have the reports of the Council circulated among local bodies and public associations. One of the learned members of this Council has said that local newspapers might take up the task; but then, I submit, it will not do. We know it perfectly well that Bengal, or for the matter of that India, is not a country where a large number of persons take any interest in newspapers or subscribe for them. I however submit that if the reports of the Council are published in a handy volume after each session and are circulated to the local bodies and public associations, these reports will give the people an idea as to what work is being done in the Council and the reports will help them to understand what the Reforms are and the people will also have an idea of what the members of the Council are doing for them.

With these words, I beg to give my hearty support to the resolution that has been moved.

Khan Bahadur ABDUS SALAM: The resolution moved by Mr. D. C. Ghose does not commend itself to my mind from different points of view. The first and foremost motive that underlies the resolution is a sordid one, as has been acknowledged by the mover himself. He wants self-advertisement; he wants to catch votes at the next election through this device. He wants that the people should know that the members have

been doing work in this Council. I wonder why he did not suggest that the photos of the members should be printed along with their speeches. That would have been, I suppose, quite consistent with the modesty with which he has suggested the resolution. It would be a waste of public funds to publish all the speeches and proceedings in Bengal, as I believe in the old adage—good wine needs no bush. I do not believe in self-advertisement. That is my first objection to this resolution. Secondly, I believe that it is a futile resolution if it is intended to reach the masses, as 75 per cent. of them cannot read. What is the good then of printing these speeches when the masses will not be able to read them? Burning candle before the blind is sheer waste of candle. I think my friend does not want that so much of the public funds should be wasted on this when there are so many other crying needs. First, we should spend money on the education of the masses and then we can think of printing these things for their consumption. Thirdly, the procedure he suggests is impracticable. He says that the Bengali review should be circulated among the local bodies and public associations. The members of the local bodies are generally men who know English and can easily take the trouble of interpreting these things to the men near them. So what is the good of wasting public money in printing again these things in Bengali? Fourthly, I think the resolution is unfair, as the mover suggests that the review should be printed in Bengali only. I find in the national system of education which is now rampant in Eastern Bengal (I have been recently to some parts of Eastern Bengal), Urdu and Hindustani are compulsory subjects. Therefore, my friend should have taken time by the forelock, and should have suggested that the review should be printed in Urdu as well.

For all these reasons, I oppose this resolution.

Mr. HUSEYN SHAHEED SUHRAWARDY: It is pity that last session we thought it fit to abolish the post of Director of Information; it is a great pity that this session Mr. D. C. Ghose thinks of reinstating some such official in our midst. If, as Mr. Ghose points out, it is fatal that the country should not know the good work that we are doing in this Council, I say that it will be still more fatal if the country knows that, in these days of financial stringency, we intend to spend money on self-advertisement. If we cannot justify our existence in this Council by the work that we do here, no amount of resolutions and no amount of literature will convince the people that we are working here for their benefit. If the Government have such few friends, if there is no party inside the Council or if there is no party outside the Council to carry on the work or if the representatives do not care to go back to their constituencies and tell them what we have done, what we are doing, and what we can do, then I think it scarcely proper on the part of Government to come forward and make an appeal on its own behalf. No amount of literature will fill the empty stomachs of the poor; no amount of literature will cure them of

the fell diseases which are devastating Bengal. And I fear that these reports will find their way back into our own household as those receptacles which are utilised by grocers and which usually contain sugar and like things, or they will be sold like the Minutes of the Calcutta University at four annas a seer. One last alternative prayer—one last defence—why should the publication be confined only to Bengali—why not Urdu, Hindi, Pali, Chinese, why should we not requisition the services of the Post-graduate Professors of the Calcutta University in this effort to popularise the Government and the Reforms?

Babu NITYA DHON MUKHERJEE: I do not know why there is so much opposition to such a small matter like this. If I be pardoned for being a little rude the only question that may make my friends afraid of such publication is that they do not want to let our constituencies know what we are doing here. There are also those who after a long discussion withdraw their motions and know that they waste the time of the Council for nothing. I think these people must be afraid. Arguments have been put forward about the cost but we do not know what the cost will be. The previous speaker (Mr. H. S. Suhrawardy) has argued why should it not be published in Chinese or Pali. But we must remember that we are living in Bengal and not in China or Japan. I think in our anxiety we are forgetting what we are doing and what we are saying. Then Babu Nibaran Chandra Das Gupta has made an alternative suggestion that a special newspaper may be subsidised to do the work. I do not think that there is much difference between the motion proposed by Mr. Ghose and Nibaran Babu's proposal. I do not think also that there can be any reasonable objection save on account of the cost, and unless the cost be prohibitive we should all join in supporting the proposal of Mr. D. C. Ghose.

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: At first I had no mind to speak on this resolution because I have got a resolution which runs exactly on these lines. But the speeches of two of my friends just preceding me compel me to speak a few words in support of the resolution of my friend, Mr. D. C. Ghose. They have raised some false issues by which they want to confuse the whole situation. Certainly it was not the intention of Mr. Ghose in any way to advance his self-advertisement before his constituencies; but the underlying principles of this, as well as my resolution, is the educative element which in these days at least should count as a very important factor, so far as the masses are concerned. One gentleman said that when 75 per cent. of the masses are as yet illiterate, what will be the utility of publishing these in any language whatsoever. My friend ought to know that since the advent of the Reforms Act the illiterate people are our voters, they are our leaders and we are here really upon the basis of their votes. Knowing all that it is our duty, and it is incumbent upon us, to educate our voters as much as we can, as on this

education depends the very heart and soul of the present constitution, and it goes without saying that the present constitution is different from what we had. It is certainly not what we would like to have and I do not go so far as to say that it is the Parliamentary constitution, but certainly it is the beginning thereof; and at this preliminary stage the education of the people, who have been allotted the franchise and who are still perhaps asking for more expansion of it, should count to be of the utmost importance. That being so, the question of self-advertisement does not come in. Those who are illiterate will have them read out to them in their vernacular. I would mention another point. Unfortunately for some of us, as we all know, some of the leading journals have gone over to the side of non-co-operation and they are always looking askance at us and always trying to find out our faults—imaginary or real. We cannot count upon their reports. Some of the newspapers have hardly got any space—I consulted some of them—to put in a verbatim report of what we are talking here or even proper summaries of the proceedings of this Council. In order to meet this difficulty we are asking Government to publish the proceedings in English which they have hitherto been doing and also to publish in Bengali because it is the mother-tongue of the population of Bengal, so that the people may know exactly what the Council is really doing, what really the functions of the Council are, and in what way we are doing service to the country and whether we are failing in our duty. I am sorry I have not the weight of my friend who preceded me, but I know that if our constituencies know what we are doing they will keep us erect by some sort of muscular arrangement which may not always be palatable to us. That should be the real reason why the proceedings should be published more widely. The people should know how some of us sit on the fence and, in order to expose these people, it is very necessary that the proceedings should be given as much publicity as possible. One word more and that is in yesterday's proceedings we have had some sort of performances when some questions came up for discussion, but the officials were not willing to give us all the information. If these proceedings are given the utmost publicity, and if the officials think that they have come under some sort of popular Government, they will think twice before they give us this sort of hazy answers. I therefore strongly support this resolution.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: This resolution, and another which comes later in the agenda, emphasise the desirability of disseminating more widely information as to the proceedings of this Council. The later resolution would do this through the medium of English, but the present one proposes a system of vernacular summaries. For the theoretical merits of that proposition there is a good deal to be said. It is, of course, a truism to say that the vast majority of the people in this province are not literate in English; it is a truism to say that scarcely a much larger minority is literate even in the vernacular; and it is also a truism to say that in so far as the proceedings of this Council will from

year to year inevitably have an increasing influence in moulding the destinies of the province, it is desirable that the electors, by whose choice members attend this Chamber, should know what is being carried on within these walls, and what attitude is being taken by their representatives on one side and by Government on the other. All these propositions seem to me to be perfectly sustainable, and it is on them that Mr. Ghose mainly rests his case. There has been a certain amount of doubt expressed to-day whether it would altogether be to the advantage of the reputations of some of us if our proceedings were more widely known; but as to that we must take our chance, if publication is in itself desirable and possible.

My doubts are as to the possibility of such a scheme, and inherent in it there are obviously various difficulties. One of the greatest objections to my mind is that of delay. Mr. Ghose would like to see a "faithful and accurate picture" put out after the conclusion of the session. That in itself would mean, I am afraid, a delay of two or three months before our proceedings are printed (the account of the April sittings is not yet out), let alone the further delay in preparing the summary which is to be the basis of this vernacular version. Therefore, by the time the news trickles down to the four corners of the mufassal, it will be of a somewhat stale character.

Another point is that of expense. Obviously we have not at present the machinery which will be required to issue any such publication. We have not even the mechanical means of printing it, that is to say, our facilities for printing in the vernacular would have to be increased, all entailing further delay; and we should have to employ in some form or other an editor or summariser to prepare the version which is subsequently to be translated. All that must cost money. At present we print about 1,500 copies of our proceedings in English at a cost of about Rs. 22,500. It is very difficult to form any accurate estimate of what the scheme outlined in this resolution would involve; but we tried to make an estimate within the time available, and it was put at something between Rs. 8,000 and Rs. 10,000. All will depend on the length of the summary and the numbers to whom it is despatched.

The third difficulty, and a very great difficulty to my mind, is one of preparing this "faithful and accurate picture." It must be agreed that it would be impossible, even if it were desirable, to attempt a full translation into the vernacular of all the proceedings of the Council. That was proposed in a resolution of which notice was given last session, but which was crowded out in the rush at the end, but had it been moved, I should have pointed out the very great and unjustifiable expense involved therein. Therefore, it being assumed that what we want is a summary or picture, I put it to the Council that, with the best intentions in the world, it will be extraordinarily difficult to prepare. We have had complaints in a question put yesterday that the daily press does not give adequate attention to the utterances of different members. I have been

able to meet that charge by placing the responsibility upon the competent shoulders of the gentlemen in the press gallery, but if we attempt a summary, and whatever officials are connected with it are to be attacked in this Council for not having given due prominence to this member or that, or for having misrepresented some utterances or missed the best points of others, then our lives will indeed become a burden to us. We shall always, too, be open to the charge that we have unduly emphasised the Government point of view or have unfairly minimised the arguments on the other side.

These three main difficulties seem to me to be very real. Perhaps the Council do not quite know what we do at present by way of circulating our proceedings, but it has a bearing on both resolutions. At present our free distribution list covers about 700 names, of which some 400 are outside Calcutta and 300 within it. The majority, of course, are Government officials.

But we also send to some twenty-one newspapers and to the Associated Press, which ensures distribution to various sources, and we also send to some 15 public associations. In that way our proceedings are circulated over a fairly wide field. The resolution wants us to supply our proceedings to public associations and local bodies in the vernacular, and to that extent it does not seem to be quite happy. In the first place there are various associations who get, and would prefer to get, our full proceedings in English, and in the second place there are various local bodies, such as municipalities and district boards, which are largely composed of enlightened and educated men who, if they read any literature on the subject at all, would like to read it in *extenso* and in English. So the real proposal comes down to devising some means of reaching union boards and village panchayats. They would have to be, I take it, the main recipients of any such distribution. There are about 1,700 of the former, while if the latter are to be supplied, our distribution list will be considerable and the expenses very great.

That is the proposition as it strikes Government. Theoretically there is something to be said for it; practically there are various obvious difficulties. Really the proposal amounts in great measure to what Mr. Suhrawardy has pointed out, namely, that this is another example of the need of something in the nature of a Publicity Officer, regarding which I, for one, greatly regret the vote of the Council in connection with the last budget. A competent and expert Publicity Officer would be the best agency for preparing, in a short space of time, a bright and readable account of the proceedings of this Council. But to judge by that vote the idea of a Publicity Officer does not find favour in the eyes of the Council. That being so, the attitude of Government on this resolution is to ascertain what the wish of the Council in the matter is. I hope that all members of this Council, official or otherwise, will let us have the benefit of their opinion. If it is the wish of the Council that we should try something of this kind, we will try to work out practical lines. But I again

emphasise that it is going to cost money, and that we cannot guarantee that we shall be able to devise any system which will not be open to a considerable amount of criticism,

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: All that I have to say has been said by my young friend, Dr. Suhrawardy.

The PRESIDENT: I do not think you should call him your young friend.

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: As the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler has pointed out there are two objections to this resolution—first, that the review of work which the mover wants the Government to publish——

Mr. D. C. GHOSE: I substituted the words "an account".

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: Let it be "an account." But the proceedings of the legislative council would take two or three months to be published in vernacular —

Mr. D. C. GHOSE: Not necessarily.

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: And they would be stale and unprofitable to the large majority of the people of this country,— I mean the reading public.

Secondly there is the question of cost. My friend ought to remember that we have now got an independent and popular vernacular Press and if the proceedings of the Council are worth publishing they publish them, and the people of this country get an idea as to what the Council has been doing and how the members have been working. But if this account, as suggested, be published, Government might give a very impartial account of the proceedings, but still the people will consider that it is only the Government version of the proceedings and of the working of the Legislative Council. All that is worth publishing is published in these papers and people get the information of all that happens in the Council the very next day. If this resolution be accepted by Government, I think the Director of Public Information, whose post was abolished only the other day, will come in another garb. That is what we do not like. Besides, that would mean an expense and an expense of a very large amount. The post was worth Rs. 2,000 a month. We have abolished it; and if we want to have an account of the Legislative Council you will have to appoint an editor, then a translator and a host of other numerous clerks. We are not going to have all that simply that some of the members may see their names published and their deeds advertised before their constituencies. We have come here to do our work honestly; and if we do honest work in the Council that will be appreciated by the public.

With these few words, I beg to oppose the resolution.

Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: I move that the question be now moved.

The motion for closure was then put and agreed to.

The PRESIDENT then put the amendment which was lost.

The original motion then being put, a division was taken with the following result:—

AYES.

Ahmed, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Wasimuddin.
Ahmed, Maulvi Rafi Uddin.
Ahmed, Munshi Jafar.
Ali, Munshi Amir.
Ali, Munshi Ayub.
Arhamuddin, Maulvi Khandakar.
Banerjee, Rai Bahadur Abinash Chandra.
Bose, Mr. S. M.
Catheart, Mr. M.
Charmakar, Babu Rasik Chandra.
Dutta, Babu Annada Charan.
Chose, Mr. D. C.
Chose, Rai Bahadur Jogendra Chunder.
Cardan, Mr. A. D.
Haq, Shah Syed Emdadul.
Huq, Maulvi Ekramul.
Khan, Maulvi Hamid-ud-din.
Khan, Maulvi Md. Rafique Uddin
Larmour, Mr. F. A.
Makramali, Munshi.
Mukherjee, Babu Nitya Dhon.
Mukherji, Professor S. C.
Mullick, Babu Nirode Behary.
Mullick, Babu Surendra Nath.
Rauf, Maulvi Shah Abdur,
Ray, Babu Jogendra Krishna.
Ray, Raja Manilall Singh.

NOES.

Addy, Babu Amulya Dhone.
Afzal, Khan Bahadur, Nawabzada K. M.
Ahmed, Maulvi Yakuinuddin.
Aley, Shaikh Mahboob.
Azam, Khan Bahadur Khwaja Mohamed.
Barma, Rai Sahib Panchanan.
Birla, Babu Chaneshyam Das.
Birley, Mr. L.
Chaudhuri, Babu Kishori Mohan.
Chaudhuri, Babu Tankanath.
Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Nafizar Rahman.
Chaudhuri, Maulvi Shah Muhammad
Chaudhuri, Rai Harendranath.
Das, Babu Bhishmadev.
Das, Rai Bahadur Amar Nath.
Das Gupta, Babu Nibaran Chandra.
De, Babu Fanindralal.
Donald, Mr. J.
Dutt, Mr. Ajoy Chunder.
Faroqui, Mr. K. C. M,
Chatak, Rai Sahib Nilmani.
Gupta, Mr. N. B.
Hornell, Mr. W. W.
Karim, Maulvi Abdul.
Karim, Maulvi Fazlul.
Karr, the Hon'ble Mr. J. N.
Khan, Babu Devendra Lal.
Khan, Mr. Razaur Rahman.
Lang, Mr. J.
Lees, M. D. M.
Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan, the Hon'ble.
Marr, Mr. A.
Mitra, Rai Bahadur Mahendra Chandra.
Morgan, Mr. C.
Mukharji, Babu Satish Chandra.
Mukhopadhaya, Babu Sarat Chandra.
Nasker, Babu Ram Chandra.
O'Kinealy Lt.-Col. Frederick.
O'Malley, Mr. L. S. S.
Payne, Mr. C. F.
Rahim, the Hon'ble Sir Abdur.
Raikat, Mr. Prasanna Deb.
Ray, Babu Shabendra Chandra.
Ray, Babu Surendra Nath.
Ray, Kumar Shib Shekhareswar.
Ray Chaudhuri, Mr. Krishna Chandra.
Ray Choudhury, Raja Manmatha Nath.
Ray, Babu Nalini Nath.
Roy, Maharaja Bahadur Kshaunish Chandra.
Ray, Mr. Tarit Bhusan.
Roy, Rai Bahadur Lalit Mohan Singh.
Salam, Khan Bahadur Abdus.
Sarkar, Babu Rishindra Nath.
Sinha, Babu Surendra Narayan.
Stark, Mr. H. A.
Suhrawardy, Mr. Huseyn Shaheed.
Watson-Smyth, Mr. R. M.
Wordsworth, Mr. W. C.

The Ayes being 27, and the Noes 58, the motion was lost.

Dredging of the river Lohajang.

The PRESIDENT: Order! order! Before I proceed to the next item of business, I think I must correct a mistake which I committed in connection with resolution No. 14. I understood Raja Manmatha Nath Ray Choudhury to say that in view of the assurance given by the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan, he withdrew his resolution. But I now understand that what he said was that if the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur would give him an assurance that the matter would be investigated he would withdraw his resolution. I think, in that case, I was wrong in putting the question of withdrawal to the House and I will now ask the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan if he is prepared to give the assurance.

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: Sir, the assurance of Government cannot be given so light-heartedly as my friend the Raja seems to think. What I said was this that when the new circle is established we shall make an investigation and when such investigation is complete it would be the time for Government to consider a scheme. At present there is no such scheme and it will be difficult to give any such assurance, but if the assurance that the scheme will be considered after an investigation was made when the circle is formed will satisfy the Raja I have no objection in giving such assurance

Raja MANMATHA NATH RAY CHOUDHURY: In the absence of anything better, I must be satisfied with that assurance.

The motion was then, by leave, withdrawn

Report of Taxi-Cab Committee.

Mr. F. A. LARMOUR was given permission to move the resolution standing in the name of Colonel A. J. Pugh which was as follows: —

"This Council recommends to the Government to withhold for one year the giving effect to that part of the report of the Taxi-Cab Committee (published at page 596 of the Supplement to the *Calcutta Gazette* of the 6th April, 1921) which deals with (*a*) evolution of type, (*b*) horse-power, (*c*) driving seat, and (*d*) luggage accommodation, in order that owners and dealers in motor cars who have already imported cars of types which have been passed during the last few years may be safeguarded."

I will rest my case on the justice of the cause.

Members of this Council will remember the taxi-strike in Calcutta in January of this year. It was a fight between the taxi-drivers on the one hand and the police on the other. A Committee was eventually appointed to go into the whole matter, and their report was published in the *Calcutta Gazette* of the 6th April. This report dealt with not merely

the grievances of the men, but also with matters which have seriously affected the interests of owners and dealers in motor-cars. The report deals with matters calculated, in the opinion of the Committee, to give an efficient, safe and clean service of taxi-cabs for Calcutta, and they have made certain recommendations.

Now, I am not going into a criticism of the recommendations of the Committee.

The resolution, you will see, does not attack any of these recommendations. It merely asks the Government not to give immediate effect only to that part of the report which deals with the special type of motor-cars which are now recommended for taxi purposes. I will not go into details, but hon'ble members will see from the report that the Committee recommends:

(*a*) The use in future of a special type of cars for taxi purposes.

(*b*) That such cars should have a particular horse-power according to what is known R.A.C. as R.A.C. rating. This is a new provision.

(*c*) The cars should henceforward have the bodies built in a particular way, with reference to the driving seat and room for luggage, accommodation, etc.

Now, long before these new recommendations were made, and indeed before there was any indication that there would be a change in the rules about the type of cars which would be allowed to be used in Calcutta, a large number of cars suitable for taxi purposes had been imported into Calcutta and are now here but cannot be sold because of the new rules.

These cars satisfy all the conditions that have been in existence till April last, when the report was published. They were imported *bonâ fide* by owners and dealers in motor-cars who are now told that these newly imported cars are unsuitable for taxi purposes and will not be passed because of the recommendations of the report. Again, I say, I am not attacking these new regulations, although a good deal may be urged against them. I am not doing that.

But let me ask, is it just, is it fair to penalise these importers for no fault of their own? The Motor Trade has been very hard hit during the last few months. First came the unfavourable exchange, then the newly-imposed enhanced import duty on cars, and lastly, the general slump in business. These are bad enough. But do not, I beg of you, add to the list. All I ask for is that Government should hold its hands for one year, and not insist on immediately enforcing the new type of cars for taxi purposes.

I do not plead for any cars which have not already arrived. It is only with respect to cars which are now in Calcutta, and which were imported before the new Regulations were even discussed, that I ask the the Government to relax the new rules.

I know that every trade has had a bad time. Why then do I speak on behalf of the Motor Trade? The reason is this. They had, without any fault of their own, already imported the cars. Their capital is locked up and there is little hope of getting more. They cannot be expected to import a fresh lot of the new type of cars till they are able to dispose of the stock in hand, which again they cannot do because of the suddenness of the decision to enforce the new regulations.

I ought to mention that the Commissioner of Police had recently been approached by various dealers to redress this just grievance.

He has, I am told, made a light concession in favour of only a few firms, and that with reference to a few particular makes, such concession to apply to not more than 10 per cent. of the relative number of cars registered, during the last year. This, I am afraid, has made the case worse.

I can confidently assure this Council that if this temporary but necessary relaxation of the rules, for which I am pleading, be granted it would not do any serious or appreciable injury to the taxi service in Calcutta. I can name types of cars which, though disqualified under the new rules in Calcutta, are employed as taxis in London, New York, Paris, Marseilles, Boston, Philadelphia, Chicago, Washington, etc., Striving after a uniform type of taxi-cabs may be a very good thing, but after all it is not so important as doing justice to the innocent trader or relieving him from unnecessary hardship and loss when this can be done without injury to the public.

Sir, I have done. I again earnestly appeal to the Government to accept this resolution, and ask this House to indicate its wishes by strongly supporting it.

These, Sir, are Colonel Pugh's own words and I have given them to the Council as they are. With these words, I place the resolution before the Council.

MEMBER in charge of POLICE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): I am in some difficulty in replying to this resolution that has been moved by Mr. Larmour, for reasons which I may frankly state. We received the report of the Taxi-cab Committee, it is true, some time ago, but unfortunately much time was taken up in the press, which has been seriously congested, largely by the rush of Council work, and we then published the report in order to give the public and those interested in the trade an opportunity of expressing their views about it. That further delayed action, and when the replies came in, the Secretariat was fully occupied and has not, up till now, been able to put them up before me for consideration. The case is now, I understand, practically ready, and as soon as the present sitting of the Council is over I will lose no time in dealing with it, but at present we have not come to any decision as to what action we should take on the various

recommendations made by the Committee, and, in particular, those relating to the structural type of the vehicles which will be allowed to run on the streets. That being so, Sir, it is impossible for me to say whether we can withhold these recommendations for a year or even scrap them altogether. But I can say this to Mr. Larmour that, on more than one occasion, I have discussed this matter with representatives of the motor industry in this city, and I have told them more than once that I fully realise that there is justice in their request that before substantial alterations in type are made, a reasonable time—I do not necessarily say a year—but a reasonable time should be given to the trade to adjust themselves to new conditions. That assurance I quite readily repeat here, and I trust Mr. Larmour will see the reasonableness of our expressing our inability at this moment to go beyond it.

Mr. F. A. LARMOUR: Sir, I quite recognise what the Hon'ble Member has said. I would, therefore, ask him that when the matter does come up before him for consideration, he will not decide on the papers that are placed before him, but will listen and give attention to some very serious questions which the Secretary of the Motor Trades Association might bring before him. With the assurance that the Hon'ble Member has given us, I ask for permission to withdraw this resolution in order that the matter may receive the attention of Government as has been promised by the Hon'ble Member.

The motion was then, by leave of the Council, withdrawn.

Reorganisation of the Police Department.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: "This Council recommends to the Government that a Committee, consisting of seven members, five of whom shall be non-officials, elected from amongst, and by the non-official members of the Council, by means of the single transferable vote, be appointed to inquire into and report at an early date as to what practical steps may be taken in order to effect a reorganisation of the Police Department on a more economic and efficient basis."

My proposal is so modest that I feel that there cannot be any ground for serious opposition: nay, I have been so much encouraged by a statement made by my friend, Mr. S. R. Das in the press, that I feel confident that even those members, who could not support me during the supplementary police budget debates, will not hesitate to give me their valuable support to-day. In course of a letter published in the *Amrita Bazar Patrika* of the 19th May last, Mr. Das said:—

> I fully agree with the view that the Police Department should be managed more economically and efficiently.

These are the actual words used by him, and indeed, even a casual student of the administration of Bengal must admit that the Police

expenditure has gone up beyond all proportion and that there is an incessant need of improving the efficiency of the police.

It seems, Sir, that the Government has also not been idle about this matter. If I am not much mistaken, I believe, that since the last sessions of the Council, the district officers have been asked to arrange conferences with the local members of the Legislative Council, in order to secure their advice as to how economy may be effected in the district Police expenditure. There was one drawback about this conference, *viz.*, that the members had not been given sufficient time. I do not know what has been the result of these conferences in other districts, but, if I am to judge by the result in my own district of Tippera, I have the greatest confidence that retrenchment may safely and surely be effected.

The police is rather a delicate and thorny subject, and I believe that our criticism of the police department is looked upon by the authorities with a sort of half-amused contempt in the curious impression that the police is an easy target for members of the Council. Critics of the police department have been charged with idiosyncrasy even inside this Council, but does this Council know, Sir, what was the attitude of the authorities in England, when the question of Police reform was taken up? When Robert Peel introduced the Police reforms, we find, on the authority of Captain Melville Lee's History of the police in England, that the new police were not popular at first, that many people were ready to find fault, but that every complaint was regarded as made in good faith, and that Commissioners investigated each case; weak members of the police were removed and public confidence gained. This, Sir, is the proper attitude to treat criticisms, and I sincerely trust that in this reformed Council, the old fetish of the prestige will never be brought up to cow down honest criticism. Unless the administration of the police can keep pace with the standard of efficiency which modern conditions demand, there can be no hope of the successful working of the Reforms. Efficiency of the police is the true criterion of the prestige of the Government.

Let us see how the Police Department is now being managed and at what cost. What is the standard by which to judge the efficiency of the police? It may not be unknown to many members of the Council that the police in England is one of the most efficient in the world. What is their standard of efficiency? I will quote here one of the rules that were laid down for the guidance of the new London police, as early as the thirties of the nineteenth century:—

> Prevention of crime was inculcated as one of the great duties of the Police, this duty was placed higher than the duty of detecting and securing the punishment of the offender, and officers and men were alike told that absence of crime would be looked upon as the best test of their efficiency.

Here we have a definite test of efficiency laid down and acted up to for the successful reform of the London police. Let us see how the police in Bengal stands this supreme test.

The province of Bengal, as at present constituted, dates from 1912, and I shall take some figures from the police administration reports since that year. The number of reported crimes in 1912 were 80,999; in 1914, it was 83,532; in 1918, it was 99,513; and in 1919, the last figures available, it was 107,696., *i.e.*, during 7 years, the number of crimes has steadily gone on increasing, till it shows an increase of 34 per cent. in seven years. The history of the Calcutta Police, as judged by the increase in number of crimes, tells the same sad story. This is the result of statistics. Let us now go on to authoritative opinion on the subject. I shall not tire the patience of the House by going into old history. The last official authoritative opinion was given in the first few years of this, the twentieth century. Lord Curzon, in his third budget speech, in 1901, thus described the administration of the police. He said that grave abuses had crept into this branch of the service and were responsible for administrative and judicial shortcomings, that were generally deplored, besides producing a widespread and legitimate discontent. As a result of this authoritative statement, the Indian Police Commission was appointed and submitted its report in 1903. This Commission, presided over by Sir Andrew Fraser, came to this conclusion:

> The Police force is far from efficient it is defective in training and organisation; it is inadequately supervised it is generally regarded as corrupt and oppressive, and it has utterly failed to secure the confidence and co-operation of the people

This was in 1903. Eighteen years have passed since then. Government have tried to give effect to some of the recommendations of the Police Commission, money has been lavishly spent. From a mere Rs. 59 lakhs in 1905-06, the cost of the police has gone up to Rs. 1 crore and 90 lakhs in 1921, showing an enormous increase of 216 per cent. in course of 15 years.

But have things improved very much? Some improvement has, no doubt, been effected, but has it been able to keep pace with the standard of efficiency demanded by modern conditions? The steady increase in the number of crimes has shown how this test of efficiency has failed. Then again, even during the past few years, some of the important judicial courts and even the High Court have severely condemned the conduct of the Police in some cases. The Mussalmanpara Lane bomb case is still fresh in the memory of many people. Only the other day the Sealdah munition case showed the conduct of the Police in lurid colours. The Sindhubala affair can never be erased from the memory of the people of Bengal. It is no use multiplying instances. Let us only examine two typical cases that have occurred during the last few months since the introduction of the reforms. I mean the Mohunganj and the Kalighat shooting affairs. I take these cases because it is only in an emergency, that the calibre of a force can be judged. Here is the Mohunganj affair in a nutshell. A large number of police recruits from the training college of Sardah, pursued the escaped convicts from Rajshahi Jail and reached Mohunganj at dead of night. One Subedar-major and two con-

stables who had gone forward to reconnoitre, reported that some forty persons, who looked like convicts, were sleeping in a shed in the village and the police naturally (mark the word naturally) tried to arrest the inmates. This was done evidently without making sure that they were really convicts. It now transpires that the sleeping people were not convicts at all, but ordinary coolies. The police fired shots and one death occurred . The Government *communique* says that "there was an unfortunate mistake over the whole affair." Sir, mistakes and misunderstandings are very convenient terms. But is it not curious that when one man's mistake means another man's death, such mistakes have a tendency to recur in this unfortunate coutnry? We have read in the story books, how the chivalrous Don Quixote of old mistook the windmill for an army of giants, but it seems that the days of chivalry are not yet gone. Sleeping coolies seem to make a good target for the bravery of many a chivalrous policeman. Let us now go on into the Kalighat shooting case. An innocent man was shot dead by a European police sergeant. Here is what the Government resolution says about the affair—"It is clear to the Governor in Council, that the sergeants, evidently with a view to screening one of their number, have failed to tell the truth . . The Governor in Council can only unreservedly condemn the attitude of the sergeants concerned." It is out of place to go into the details of this sorry business here, there will be time enough for that, but I ask, in all seriousness, is it not a shame that this is the class of men for whom the Council voted an increment of pay and house allowance only the other day; nay, these are the sort of men, for some of whom quarters are to be provided even against the vote of this Council?

I am not fond of using strong language, and it is not my business to enter into a diatribe against the police, but I ask this Council, has the police force, as at present managed, fully proved its efficiency? Has it done its best to secure the cordial co-operation of the public? There is plenty of room for improvement, and I request this Council to appoint a Committee to inquire into and report as to how this efficiency can be attained.

To come now to the extraordinary increase in the cost of the police administration, I shall not take much time of the Council. A simple statement of the figures will be the most forcible argument that I can use. In 1905-06, when the revenue of Bengal was Rs. 6 crores and 50 lakhs, the police expenditure was Rs. 59 lakhs. The revenue now is Rs. 9 crores and 50 lakhs, whereas the police expenditure is Rs. 1 crore and 90 lahks, *i.e.*, when the revenue has increased by less than 50 per cent., the police expenditure has gone up by more than 215 per cent. The following figures of police expenditure will prove instructive. In 1905, police expense was Rs. 59 lakhs; in 1912, Rs. 83 lakhs; in 1916, 116 lakhs; in 1918, 132 lakhs; in 1919, 143 lakhs; in 1921, 190 lakhs. Before the inauguration of the reforms in 1918-19, the proportion of police expenditure to revenue, as far as the whole of India was concerned, was 1 in

20, whereas in Bengal to-day it is 1 in 5. Can extravagence go any further? The time has surely come when the whole question should be seriously considered and who can do it better than a representative Committee of this Council, as proposed by me.

I think, I owe it to this Council to show broadly and, in a few words, how economy and efficiency may be effected. Here also a comparison with the English police will be found useful. It may be news to many members, that in the early nineteenth century, the London police was in a sad state. As Captain Melville Lee says, "England was passing through an epoch of criminality darker than any other in her annals." How was this state of affairs improved? Not by repression by any means. As the same author says "in the history of England, strong repressive measures have never led to a decrease in the number of criminals." Is India different?

It was the reform of the police that was badly needed, and Robert Peel, in 1832, passed his Act for improving the police; the main principles laid down for working out the reforms included (1) that prevention of crime was the first duty of the police, and that absence of crime would be looked upon as the best test of efficiency, and (2), it was impressed upon the police force that it was their duty to keep perfect control of temper in all circumstances. Have these two duties been impressed upon the police in this country?

Then again we find from Captain Melville Lee's history that it was no easy matter to recruit a force with the necessary qualifications of honesty, intelligence, and good physique. In the first 8 years, out of a total force of 30,000, there were 5,000 dismissals and 6,000 resignations, but the authorities persevered and never faltered, success crowned their efforts at last. May I ask, Sir, if the authorities in this country have approached police reforms in this attitude? May I ask, Sir, how many officers and men have been dismissed or made to resign as a result of their censure by courts of law. May I ask, Sir, what has been done to the officers connected with the Sindhubala affair? The whole country is keenly waiting to hear what is done to the sergeants of the Kalighat affair.

To come now to some broad details, as far as I have been able to study the matter, it seems to me that the Police Department may be reorganised on the following lines:

(1) A greater Indianisation in the higher grades of the Police Department.—The very first sentence of the preamble of the Government of India Act, which has brought the Reforms, speaks of increasing association of Indians in all branches of the administration. I believe that a pitiful 11 per cent. is the highest proportion sanctioned for Indians. Surely 50 per cent. is not too much to ask now.

(2) Amalgamation of the Calcutta and Bengal Police.—This matter has been discussed times without number since Mr. Halliday (afterwards

Sir Frederick Halliday) first took it up in 1838. Even in 1873, Sir George Campbell, Lieutenant-Governor of Bengal, was for amalgamation of Calcutta and Bengal Police. Both the Government of India and the Secretary of State then approved of the matter, but it was deferred. This proposal has gone through various phases, and there is no reason why it cannot be taken up again under an I.C.S. Inspector-General, specially when the Bengal Government and not the city of Calcutta, pays for its upkeep. It passes ordinary comprehension how a Police Sub-Inspector working in Bhowanipur gets Rs. 150-250, when his brother Sub-Inspector gets only Rs. 80-130, working a few hundred yards away in Alipur. The expenses at the top of the Calcutta Police are very great. Even as late as 1887, the Finance Committee of the Government of India noticed by a comparison with Madras and Bombay, that the Calcutta Police establishment was the most expensive of the three.

(3) River Police.—I do not know why the river police should be kept as a separate establishment.

(4) Military Police.—The Indian Police Commission of 1903, after careful inquiry, came to the conclusion that the military police in Bengal should be abolished. Has that recommendation been followed? If it had been, we should not have heard so much of these men to-day at Chandpur and other places. The authorities should remember the well-expressed maxim that the strength of the police ought to be not that there is a military force behind, but that there is the good will of the people behind it.

The PRESIDENT: I hope you will not bring the Chandpur incident into this discussion.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: (5) Then, there is the much vexed question of the Railway Police, and as to who should maintain its upkeep. There does not seem to be any reason why the Railway people should not pay the whole cost.

(6) In Bengal, for the important work of investigation, there is only one class of officers, *viz.*, Sub-Inspectors, whereas for inspection or supervision, there are six classes of officers, *viz.*, Inspectors, Deputy Superintendents, Assistant Superintendents, Additional Superintendents, Superintendents, and Deputy Inspectors-General of Police. There is some duplication of work in supervision, and it is not unlikely that supervision may be carried too far, and may sometimes and not in looking over the work but rather in overlooking it. Why cannot the number of Deputy Inspectors-General be reduced? Why cannot the posts of Inspectors and Deputy Superintendents of Police be amalgamated or their total number reduced? Why cannot the number of the superior service men be reduced?

(7) Then there is the Intelligence Branch. Why can it not be abolished altogether? In England, it has been said that the people have

always a terror of espionage and have viewed with critical eyes any system that employs spies. Is the mentality of the Indian people very different from that of the English people in this respect?

Mr. CATHCART: May I rise to a point of order. This motion asks for a Committee, but it seems to me that the mover is trying to guide the deliberations of the Committee before permission has been given even to form the Committee.

The PRESIDENT: I think he is in order. In urging the necessity of a Committee, he is entitled to show that there is room for reorganisation and economy.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: I need not go into any more details. I have only suggested some broad points that have appeared important to me; it is the Committee that will go into details and suggest what practical steps may be taken. My suggestions may or may not be the best that could be made, and I want to make it clear to those who may differ from me in details, that the adoption of my resolution does not mean the adoption of these my suggestions. If the Council is pleased to adopt my resolution, which I sincerely trust it will, the Committee will be in the best position to go into details.

As regards the formation of the Committee, the Government has recognised the necessity of taking recourse to the single transferable voting system for getting representative standing Committees, and I think, this is the best means of getting a Committee which will carry the confidence of the Council. The two official members will be able to help with their administrative experience.

Before I sit down, let me once more give emphasis to these two points.

(i) Unless some substantial economy is effected in the Police expenditure, no important nation-building work can be taken up; nay, not only that, the Government is in danger of becoming bankrupt. The excessive police expenditure hangs like a heavy load around the neck of Bengal, and the burden must be lightened.

(ii) As for efficiency, unless urgent reforms are effected, the Police will not, and cannot get the cordial co-operation of the public, without which no police can do successful work. Let there be no cry of false prestige; the true prestige of an administration lies in the efficiency of its Police.

The PRESIDENT: I call upon Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray to move his resolution. It is very much of the same kind, though not identical.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: "This Council recommends to the Government that a Committee consisting of nine members, six of whom are to be elected from, and by, the non-official members of the

Sir Frederick Halliday) first took it up in 1838. Even in 1873, Sir George Campbell, Lieutenant-Governor of Bengal, was for amalgamation of Calcutta and Bengal Police. Both the Government of India and the Secretary of State then approved of the matter, but it was deferred. This proposal has gone through various phases, and there is no reason why it cannot be taken up again under an I.C.S. Inspector-General, specially when the Bengal Government and not the city of Calcutta, pays for its upkeep. It passes ordinary comprehension how a Police Sub-Inspector working in Bhowanipur gets Rs. 150-250, when his brother Sub-Inspector gets only Rs. 80-130, working a few hundred yards away in Alipur. The expenses at the top of the Calcutta Police are very great. Even as late as 1887, the Finance Committee of the Government of India noticed by a comparison with Madras and Bombay, that the Calcutta Police establishment was the most expensive of the three.

(3) River Police.—I do not know why the river police should be kept as a separate establishment.

(4) Military Police.—The Indian Police Commission of 1903, after careful inquiry, came to the conclusion that the military police in Bengal should be abolished. Has that recommendation been followed? If it had been, we should not have heard so much of these men to-day at Chandpur and other places. The authorities should remember the well-expressed maxim that the strength of the police ought to be not that there is a military force behind, but that there is the good will of the people behind it.

The PRESIDENT: I hope you will not bring the Chandpur incident into this discussion.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: (5) Then, there is the much vexed question of the Railway Police, and as to who should maintain its upkeep. There does not seem to be any reason why the Railway people should not pay the whole cost.

(6) In Bengal, for the important work of investigation, there is only one class of officers, *viz.*, Sub-Inspectors, whereas for inspection or supervision, there are six classes of officers, *viz.*, Inspectors, Deputy Superintendents, Assistant Superintendents, Additional Superintendents, Superintendents, and Deputy Inspectors-General of Police. There is some duplication of work in supervision, and it is not unlikely that supervision may be carried too far, and may sometimes and not in looking over the work but rather in overlooking it. Why cannot the number of Deputy Inspectors-General be reduced? Why cannot the posts of Inspectors and Deputy Superintendents of Police be amalgamated or their total number reduced? Why cannot the number of the superior service men be reduced?

(7) Then there is the Intelligence Branch. Why can it not be abolished altogether? In England, it has been said that the people have

always a terror of espionage and have viewed with critical eyes any system that employs spies. Is the mentality of the Indian people very different from that of the English people in this respect?

Mr. CATHCART: May I rise to a point of order. This motion asks for a Committee, but it seems to me that the mover is trying to guide the deliberations of the Committee before permission has been given even to form the Committee.

The PRESIDENT: I think he is in order. In urging the necessity of a Committee, he is entitled to show that there is room for reorganisation and economy.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: I need not go into any more details. I have only suggested some broad points that have appeared important to me; it is the Committee that will go into details and suggest what practical steps may be taken. My suggestions may or may not be the best that could be made, and I want to make it clear to those who may differ from me in details, that the adoption of my resolution does not mean the adoption of these my suggestions. If the Council is pleased to adopt my resolution, which I sincerely trust it will, the Committee will be in the best position to go into details.

As regards the formation of the Committee, the Government has recognised the necessity of taking recourse to the single transferable voting system for getting representative standing Committees, and I think, this is the best means of getting a Committee which will carry the confidence of the Council. The two official members will be able to help with their administrative experience.

Before I sit down, let me once more give emphasis to these two points.

(1) Unless some substantial economy is effected in the Police expenditure, no important nation-building work can be taken up, nay, not only that, the Government is in danger of becoming bankrupt. The excessive police expenditure hangs like a heavy load around the neck of Bengal, and the burden must be lightened.

(2) As for efficiency, unless urgent reforms are effected, the Police will not, and cannot get the cordial co-operation of the public, without which no police can do successful work. Let there be no cry of false prestige; the true prestige of an administration lies in the efficiency of its Police.

The PRESIDENT: I call upon Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray to move his resolution. It is very much of the same kind, though not identical.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: "This Council recommends to the Government that a Committee consisting of nine members, six of whom are to be elected from, and by, the non-official members of the

Council, in accordance with the principle of proportionate representation by means of the single transferable vote, as laid down on page 204 of the Council Manual, be immediately appointed to inquire into and report on the administration of the Police in Bengal, in such manner as the Government may direct, with special reference to the following:—

Whether any change in the existing system of the Police administration, effecting a reduction of expenses without impairing its efficiency, is possible."

My resolution is analogous to one which has been just moved, and I am much obliged to the mover of the previous resolution for the very able speech which he has made and which has therefore considerably lightened my task so far as making out a strong case in favour of the appointment of a committee of inquiry is concerned. Sir, the Police alone swallows up a fourth of the total revenues of this province. Rightly or wrongly, people feel that the expenditure is rather too much for the preservation of internal peace and order. They are also not satisfied with its present efficiency and think that there is scope for increasing the efficiency and at the same time reducing the expenses. We, the representatives of the people here, must perforce voice this feeling. We are in duty bound to inform the Government that it is on a perilous way we are travelling, where we must cry halt, and look round. The other day, in this very hall, we had effected a reduction on the police demand in obedience to this popular feeling. But later on we were made to realise that the system of administration that we now have, is such that the whole fabric of police organisation would collapse, if the entire demand of the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler were not satisfied. It was a regular contest between the popular feeling on one side and the exigency of the State, as represented by the bureaucracy, on the other, and in the end, the latter had its way. It was not expected that it should be so. Whereas the State officials were masters of details, we, the representatives of the people, were groping in the dark. We could only be exponents of general principles. In view of our financial position and crying needs of the nation-building departments, retrenchment and prevention of waste, wherever possible, were felt by us to be an absolute necessity. The Reforms, the most generous gift of a great nation to a backward nation, are on their trials. We had sought for them, we have got them and we mean to make them a success. And, therefore, our greatest concern now is that a discontented and overtaxed people might not think that the Reforms are a failure. It was for this reason that we fought for a reduction of police expenses and we hoped that we would be able to make the authorities realise the situation and agree to a reasonable reduction. But they contended that no reduction was possible under the present system of administration. They convinced the majority of the House and they won. But, Sir, the moral victory was ours. If the maintenance of the police alone in a country requires a quarter of

its revenues, it proves one or the other of the two facts, *viz.*, either the administration of the Police Department is faulty or there is an internal disorder in the country of a serious and chronic nature. But, Sir, the police reports do not justify the latter. It is the system of administration which is defective. Then, Sir, there can be no doubt about the fact that there is still a strong feeling in the country against the heavy police expenses. I assert, Sir, even Sir Henry Wheeler realises this, otherwise he would not have asked the district authorities to confer with local Council members and try to find out what economies are possible. But this method has got several drawbacks. Not all the members are properly equipped for such a complex inquiry nor can every one of them devote sufficient time and labour to this matter. So I suggest that a committee be formed composed of members who are ardent in the matter, and able and willing to sacrifice time and energy. And as they will proceed with their inquiry, they will gather greater experience and confidence and a comparative estimate of different districts and different conditions would enable them to generalise and come to definite conclusions. Sir, my resolution differs with the previous one inasmuch as I have fully made over the scope of the inquiry to the Government. The number of members in the committee suggested by me is also larger so that it may be properly representative of official views as well as the views of the different schools of thought in this Council. Sir, I hope the House would agree with me when I say that the Government fully deserves all our help in this very difficult matter. We, in our turn, expect the help of the Government and a hearty co-operation of the heads of the department. The onslaught which Sir Henry Wheeler has to bear is due solely to his onerous charge. We all know that this increased expenditure does not benefit him in any way. But his is the unpleasant task of trying to defend and to defend a system of administration and the cost of maintaining it, which to a large section of the public, rightly or wrongly appears to be defective and objectionable. So I move this resolution with a view to lighten his burden and make a representative committee of this House share in the blame or praise for the administration of the Police Department.

One word more and I finish. It might be said that all this increased expenditure is due to giving effect to the recommendations made by the Fraser Commission, after a careful and prolonged inquiry. To this, Sir, my reply would be that in many cases the Government has not followed the recommendations. In some cases it has acted contrary to the recommendations. To give one instance, the Commission recommended the abolition of military police but on the contrary the Government of Bengal has given it a better status and converted it into the East Bengal Frontier Rifles at an enormous cost. We had a taste of its usefulness the other day at Chandpur. Moreover the recommendations were made at a time when there was no talk even of granting us responsible form of Self-Government. The recommendations were made with a view to

strengthen the hands of the bureaucratic form of Government and the police were thought to be the best link between the people and the Government. But all this is now changed. Now we are moving fast towards the Government of the people, by the people and for the people. The whole outlook is changed and we must have a changed system of police administration to suit the changed conditions.

Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: I beg to support the resolution that has been so ably moved by my hon'ble friend Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta. That police expenditure and efficiency in this province are subjects of perennial public criticism admits of no doubt. Some of the criticisms may not be well founded in the opinion of the Government, but it cannot be said that all of them are prejudiced and none of them is backed by reason.

It has been a fashion nowadays, Sir, whenever police questions are raised to set up the Bombay ideal and example and work out the proportion of the strength of the police force to the number of population in these provinces. Why the number of police in Bombay has come to be so high and what is the history behind it nobody takes pains to enquire. Only to silence criticism the present figures are quoted and it is thought that the very last word is said on the subject.

However to use an argument much on the same lines I cannot resist the temptation of quoting the following figures.

In the absence of later statistics I am obliged to quote figures for 1918.

1918.

Total number of constables.	Number of Inspector-General and Deputy Inspectors General	Number of Superintendents.	Number of Assistant Superintendents.	Number of Deputy Superintendents.	Number of Inspectors	Number of Sub Inspectors	Number of Sergeants
BENGAL.							
27,678	24	43	50	27	280	1,827	192
BOMBAY.							
31,036	10	48	28	41	207	974	86

Now it will be seen at a glance that police administration in Bengal is proportionately by far the more top-heavy than in Bombay. While Bombay manages more men in the police force by much less superior and subordinate officers, in Bengal not constables but officers are being increased as fast as it is possible to do so.

What is the net result of this disproportionate increase of officers and high salaried posts. In the first place it is increasing the cost of police administration in this province beyond all proportion. Thus you

will find that while the total cost of police in 1918 was Rs. 1,00,64,570 in Bombay, in Bengal it was Rs. 1,27,22,620; yet at so much smaller cost Bombay had 1 police to every 635 men, while the proportion of police to population in Bengal was 1 to 1,644.

Secondly, this costlier and much more expensive arrangement has not secured greater efficiency. This is apparent from the following figures:—

1918.

Number of cases in which property was stolen.	Number of cases in which property was recovered.	Percentage of cases in which property was recovered to cases in which property was stolen.	Amount of property stolen.	Amount of property recovered.	Percentage of value of property recovered to value of property stolen.
			Rs.	Rs.	
BENGAL					
66,346	14,007	21·0	43,83,554	6,04,075	13·8
BOMBAY					
26,779	14,445	53·9	32,91,611	10,72,204	32·6

And who knows if such detection and such efficiency are not making for a rapid increase of crimes in our hapless province. It may well be remarked at least that the recovery of stolen property in this province is in inverse ratio to the number of Inspectors-General and Deputy Inspectors-General.

And if this is the brilliant record of the Bengal police with regard to theft cases, its achievement in the detection of cognisable crimes and securing conviction thereof is equally marvellous. Thus in 1918 (the latest year for which statistics are available, while of 103,515 cognisable crimes reported in Bombay 69,625 cases met with conviction and only 16,342 cases went undetected; in Bengal of 182,553 reported cases in 97,669 cases only conviction was secured and as high as 14,039 number of cases went undetected. If such a state of things does not call for a committee of searching inquiry when about two crores of rupees *i.e.*, a quarter of the receipts of the Government of Bengal are being offered at the feet of the police we do not know, Sir, what state of things will justify such a step.

Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: The resolution of Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta urges that a committee be appointed to inquire into and report as to what practical steps may be taken in order to effect a reorganisation of the Police Department on a more economic and efficient basis.

There are two questions before the Council for decision. Firstly, is there any necessity for the reorganisation of the Police Department? Secondly, if a reorganisation is necessary, what effective steps should be taken in this connexion? Regarding the first proposition about which I need not say much, can there be any doubt that the claim for reorganisation by the people of Bengal is reasonable? We must first of all take into consideration the popular feeling of the people of this country, and that feeling is one of the factors which place me in a position to say to the Council that a reorganisation is necessary. Now if you look into the facts, it will be a matter for consideration that the expenditure which Bengal has to incur is a very heavy one and, if that be so, can it not be argued on behalf of the people of Bengal that attempts should be made by Government to reduce the expenditure? Now, my friends who have moved the two resolutions have already brought to the notice of the Council that so far as the superior officers are concerned reduction would be possible and that as far as the number of constables in Bengal is concerned, it is a smaller one. My experience also warrants me to say that the proportion of constables in Bengal is a lower figure. There ought to be a wholesale reorganisation. First of all, it would be necessary to see whether there ought to be a change or not and, if it be agreed that there should be a change, then I submit that effective steps should be taken to give effect to it. I am fully aware of the fact that Government has already noticed this matter and that information was sent to the District Officers in this connection, but so far as the latter is concerned, it is not so very satisfactory. If a committee of non-official members of the Council be formed, it will be time for gathering facts. If the committee had figures of the number of crimes in each thana for the last five or ten years, then it will be a matter for consideration whether two or eight sub-inspectors are to be kept in each thana or whether the number of constables kept there in charge of the police work can be reduced or not. It will also be for the committee to consider the number of members of the committee in each thana. With facts and figures before them, the committee only can come to a safe conclusion whether the number of police officers engaged in a particular area should be kept on or reduced. Such matters would require careful consideration and the work of the committee may be helped by the superior police officers who have better and more intimate knowledge of these matters than non-official members who do not understand police affairs. I thoroughly understand the situation of the country and also the feeling of the country which is the everyday talk here, there and everywhere and I do, therefore, feel it my duty to put before the Council that it is necessary that there should be an inquiry as to the reorganisation of the Police Department. There ought to be a harmonious feeling between the people and the police. Unless that harmony exists, all the attempts made by the police to check crimes will prove useless and the people will not ask the police to work

with them. If they do, I am sure all the unpopularity of the police will vanish and then you will find that the people themselves will serve police officers. In a neighbouring locality, I have the duty and pleasure to form a defensive police force and I want to bring to the notice of the Council that the people's force—call that police force or people's force—is working harmoniously with the police officers in the locality. I have been informed that Government have recognised the services of the people's force and if the people's defensive force in that locality can work harmoniously with the police, I fail to see why other defensive forces in other parts of the country should not work harmoniously with the police. My submission to the Council is that I feel, and I strongly feel, that there ought to be good feeling between the police and the people. Unless it is worked out by any means, all the expenditure which may be one crore or two crores will be of no avail to check crimes. Therefore I take this opportunity of explaining in all humility my views in this connection, and I respectfully ask the Council to form a committee for the purpose of first of all seeing whether there ought to be a change or not and, if there should be a change, there would be no difficulty on the part of officials to reduce the high expenditure. We are fully aware that when we came to the Reformed Council for the first time we had two words in our brains that is "economy" and "efficiency." When we entered the Chamber, we saw the words "economy" written on the walls of the Council. In that view of the matter, I do fully support the resolution moved by Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta.

Babu NALINI NATH ROY: I support this resolution as I wish that more money must be made available for the development of the country. If people are enabled to earn more and to produce more they may be expected to live an honourable life. It was one that is responsible in many cases for the increase of crimes in the country. It is want of education and sense of responsibility towards fellow-brothers that also contribute to the larger number of offences in the country. When we compare Bengal with an area of 78,699 square miles and with a population of 45,483,077 with the United Provinces with an area of 107,267 square miles and a population of 47,182,044, the number of districts 28 and 48, total police force 27,460 and 30,668, we find that the population and number of districts is larger in the United Provinces than in this province, but the cost of police in Bengal exceeds the cost of the United Provinces.

The PRESIDENT: I don't think these details are strictly relevant. We are only considering the question of the appointment of a committee to investigate if economy can be effected in the Police Department consistent with efficiency.

Babu NALINI NATH ROY: Surely Bengal is in no respect backward to the United Provinces. Then why should there not be a decrease

There are two questions before the Council for decision. Firstly, is there any necessity for the reorganisation of the Police Department? Secondly, if a reorganisation is necessary, what effective steps should be taken in this connexion? Regarding the first proposition about which I need not say much, can there be any doubt that the claim for reorganisation by the people of Bengal is reasonable? We must first of all take into consideration the popular feeling of the people of this country, and that feeling is one of the factors which place me in a position to say to the Council that a reorganisation is necessary. Now if you look into the facts, it will be a matter for consideration that the expenditure which Bengal has to incur is a very heavy one and, if that be so, can it not be argued on behalf of the people of Bengal that attempts should be made by Government to reduce the expenditure? Now, my friends who have moved the two resolutions have already brought to the notice of the Council that so far as the superior officers are concerned reduction would be possible and that as far as the number of constables in Bengal is concerned, it is a smaller one. My experience also warrants me to say that the proportion of constables in Bengal is a lower figure. There ought to be a wholesale reorganisation. First of all, it would be necessary to see whether there ought to be a change or not and, if it be agreed that there should be a change, then I submit that effective steps should be taken to give effect to it. I am fully aware of the fact that Government has already noticed this matter and that information was sent to the District Officers in this connection, but so far as the latter is concerned, it is not so very satisfactory. If a committee of non-official members of the Council be formed, it will be time for gathering facts. If the committee had figures of the number of crimes in each thana for the last five or ten years, then it will be a matter for consideration whether two or eight sub-inspectors are to be kept in each thana or whether the number of constables kept there in charge of the police work can be reduced or not. It will also be for the committee to consider the number of members of the committee in each thana. With facts and figures before them, the committee only can come to a safe conclusion whether the number of police officers engaged in a particular area should be kept on or reduced. Such matters would require careful consideration and the work of the committee may be helped by the superior police officers who have better and more intimate knowledge of these matters than non-official members who do not understand police affairs. I thoroughly understand the situation of the country and also the feeling of the country which is the everyday talk here, there and everywhere and I do, therefore, feel it my duty to put before the Council that it is necessary that there should be an inquiry as to the reorganisation of the Police Department. There ought to be a harmonious feeling between the people and the police. Unless that harmony exists, all the attempts made by the police to check crimes will prove useless and the people will not ask the police to work

with them. If they do, I am sure all the unpopularity of the police will vanish and then you will find that the people themselves will serve police officers. In a neighbouring locality, I have the duty and pleasure to form a defensive police force and I want to bring to the notice of the Council that the people's force—call that police force or people's force—is working harmoniously with the police officers in the locality. I have been informed that Government have recognised the services of the people's force and if the people's defensive force in that locality can work harmoniously with the police, I fail to see why other defensive forces in other parts of the country should not work harmoniously with the police. My submission to the Council is that I feel, and I strongly feel, that there ought to be good feeling between the police and the people. Unless it is worked out by any means, all the expenditure which may be one crore or two crores will be of no avail to check crimes. Therefore I take this opportunity of explaining in all humility my views in this connection, and I respectfully ask the Council to form a committee for the purpose of first of all seeing whether there ought to be a change or not and, if there should be a change, there would be no difficulty on the part of officials to reduce the high expenditure. We are fully aware that when we came to the Reformed Council for the first time we had two words in our brains that is "economy" and "efficiency." When we entered the Chamber, we saw the words "economy" written on the walls of the Council. In that view of the matter, I do fully support the resolution moved by Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta.

Babu NALINI NATH ROY: I support this resolution as I wish that more money must be made available for the development of the country. If people are enabled to earn more and to produce more they may be expected to live an honourable life. It was one that is responsible in many cases for the increase of crimes in the country. It is want of education and sense of responsibility towards fellow-brothers that also contribute to the larger number of offences in the country. When we compare Bengal with an area of 78,699 square miles and with a population of 45,483,077 with the United Provinces with an area of 107,267 square miles and a population of 47,182,044, the number of districts 28 and 48, total police force 27 460 and 30,668, we find that the population and number of districts is larger in the United Provinces than in this province, but the cost of police in Bengal exceeds the cost of the United Provinces.

The PRESIDENT: I don't think these details are strictly relevant. We are only considering the question of the appointment of a committee to investigate if economy can be effected in the Police Department consistent with efficiency.

Babu NALINI NATH ROY: Surely Bengal is in no respect backward to the United Provinces. Then why should there not be a decrease

of expenditure in the province. If we appoint a committee to investigate the possibilities of reduction of expenditure there cannot be any complaint that we are not looking to the maintenance of order and tranquillity within the province. In my own districts it is want of healthiness that is at the root of inefficiency of the police because the police force generally suffer from attacks of malaria. Unless we drive out malaria, increase of staff may be resorted to, to give relief; but that will not reduce the possibility of the increased staff being rendered inefficient through malaria attacks. Hence the driving out of malaria in our districts is essentially necessary to make the police more efficient and vigorous. In other districts other reasons are at work but all those are traceable, to the want of development in the country that is needed, and we must anyhow find money to effect the purpose and it is the development of the country that will surely lessen the number of crimes.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: At this fag-end of the day, I do not propose to detain the House with any lengthy speech. All I can say is that I whole-heartedly support the proposal of the immediate appointment of a committee as proposed in these two resolutions. It is an admitted fact that the police expenditure is gradually increasing and the country is groaning under the burden of that. It might be argued that the reason for this is that the crime has considerably increased. But I think there might be some other reason at the root. It is a matter for inquiry whether corruption on the part of the investigating officers is responsible for the inefficient administration of the police. I can speak of my own district where for every crime, for every report of crime, the complainant is to pay a rupee for recording the information; in some cases the informants are even to pay two rupees. No doubt it is a defect in the investigation department. That is the state of things in my own district. I do not know why the prevention of crimes is not properly attended to. Village chaukidars have to go to the police-station every now and then; for every report they have to accompany the complainant. In fact, the village chaukidars do not attend to their watch duty at night. They work for the sub-inspectors and procure things at cheap rates for the high officials. Somehow or other they are not available for the night duty, and the result is that thieves are not detected at all. If the services of the chaukidars are not made available in the detection of bad characters, the whole money spent for them goes for nothing. Prevention and detection of crimes are the most important factors.

The PRESIDENT: I do not think these matters are strictly relevant to the motion.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: All I can say is that an investigation is absolutely necessary. The other day, in an informal conference in our district, we found that out of 27 police-stations 3

could be easily abolished, if not more. The Police Department is, I think, a top-heavy department and some economy can be effected at the top. If hereafter there be a separation of judicial and executive functions of the district magistrate, he can devote much time to the administration of the Police Department. So I think a proper investigation is necessary to see how the prevention and detection of crimes could be efficiently effected. In fact there is much room for improvement here. So I think the proposal is a very good one and should be accepted by the Council and a committee appointed to report on the circumstances.

With these few words, I heartily support the resolutions.

Mr. C. MORGAN: I move that the question be now put.

The PRESIDENT: I think I must give the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler an opportunity to speak before I put the question.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: These two resolutions are similar in object and somewhat similar in form, as although the numerical strength of the committee proposed by Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta is slightly smaller, and the proportion between elected and non-elected members slightly different, yet the object of both the resolutions is, as I understand, to ask for an inquiry with a view to ascertaining whether economies can be effected in the administration of the police without sacrificing its efficiency. There are words in both resolutions which might be interpreted in a wider sense, extending possibly, in the extreme, to a general indictment of the police force, and in that sense the resolutions, of course, would be entirely unacceptable to Government; but I take it that the meaning which I have just mentioned is really what is in view, and it is on that basis that the matter is discussed.

Now, so far as the request is one for an inquiry whether greater efficiency can be obtained at less cost, I may say at once that Government are not opposed to such an inquiry. Anybody who has sat in this Council for a month, much less anybody who, as I have, has sat in it for some years, knows that the question of the police is one of considerable interest to all members, and it is evident that it is a question on which misunderstanding and misapprehension prevail to an extraordinary degree. If by an inquiry anything can be done to clear up this misunderstanding, anything can be done to impart to a portion of the members an exacter knowledge of what the details of police administration are, and if anything can be done to put a stop to this incessant wrangling over the subject of police expenditure in Bengal, then certainly all that would be for good. While, obviously, if we are in a position to effect economies without sacrificing efficiency, we shall be only too ready to do so.

But I am bound to confess that, while recognising that the request for an inquiry is not unnatural on the part of the Council, and while admitting the request to be one to which Government would be wise to

accede, one cannot altogether shake off a certain amount of apprehension as to what the methods and results of this inquiry may be: all depends upon the spirit in which the inquiry is approached, and I should have been glad to have heard this afternoon some more definite information as to the exact lines which it is proposed to explore with a view to bringing about changes in the existing organisation. Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta gave us a few details, but apart from them the arguments fall into the two old categories—the police is inefficient and the police is expensive. But in reiterating this charge of inefficiency we still have no recognition of the circumstances in which the police have to work and the difficulties they have to surmount. We have totals of crime produced before us without any analysis of the reasons to which the fluctuations are due. All is ascribed to this one great fault "inefficiency."

Now, Government have never denied that the police is not as efficient as it ought to be. In fact this view permeates the whole of the provincial police literature. But Government are also painfully conscious that when, on occasions, they do make proposals to remedy this state of affairs, say, to introduce a better type of officer or to strengthen the supervision which is exercised over them, they too frequently find not co-operation but opposition in this Council. It is difficult to appreciate how, assuming that inefficiency is largely due to the unsatisfactory character of the subordinate material and to the inadequate supervision by higher officers over it, this can be cured by curtailing the superior staff so that supervision will be weaker, extending jurisdiction, thus making charges more heavy and responsibility greater, and generally in the name of economy cutting down expenditure upon which the efficient administration of the department rests.

As regards the cost, nothing has been said this afternoon in recognition of the reasons for the rise in police expenditure in Bengal, which, moreover, is common to other provinces in India: I mean the rise in the cost of labour, the increase in the complexity of administration, and the development of the country, particularly in the industrial sphere. To these three main reasons, which I have often previously emphasised, not one speaker unfortunately has made any reference this afternoon. We are told again and again that the police is expensive. Certainly it is expensive. But may I give the Council a few figures? I take the actuals of 1916-17 as compared with those of 1920-21. Taking these two periods, it is true that the cost of the police in Bengal has gone up roughly from Rs. 96,00,000 to Rs. 1,31,50,000; but in the United Provinces the cost has gone up from Rs. 93,75,000 to Rs. 1,34,50,000; in Madras it has gone up from Rs. 89,75,000 to Rs. 1,42,00,000; in Bombay it has gone up from Rs. 82,00,000 to Rs. 1,38,50,000. Therefore, it is not in Bengal alone that police expenditure has gone up. The factors that have been operative in other provinces have been equally operative in Bengal.

Apart from these two defects which we are asked to cure, it might be inferred from some of the speeches which we have heard that police administration in Bengal has sprung up haphazardly without any plan, supervision or attempt at improvement. Is that the case? I am not going to inflict upon the Council a history of police administration in Bengal. But as must be well known to many members, the local system of police in the early days of the Company was under the control of the zamindars, and for practical purposes there was no police judged by any modern standard of efficiency. The Company slowly and gradually attempted to improve it; and it is to be remembered that it is only in comparatively recent years that the improvement of the police system was effected in England: outside the metropolis it may be said to date from the year 1839. In their attempts to improve the police, the Company did away with the zamindary police system and established the thanadary system in 1792, relieving the village watch from their subordination to the zamindars. That was the foundation of the modern police system in Bengal, and the arrangements made in those early years were vitiated by defects which have been constant ever since. Men were under-paid, there was no proper supervision over them, and they were entrusted with charges with which their staff was unable to cope. Was the daroga on Rs. 25 ever likely to be an angel, and was he with an establishment of a writer, one or two jamadars and a score or two of barkandazes, supplementing the village watch, ever likely to be able to manage properly a charge of 20 miles square? And be it remembered that in those days there were no Superintendents of Police. These are the common police defects in Bengal to-day, and ever since those early days we have had inquiries after inquiries, committees after committees, seeking means of remedying these deficiencies. If that is the history in outline of police administration in Bengal, a committee of non-experts is taking on a somewhat large task if they think that fundamental defects in police organisation can easily be discovered which were hitherto unknown. I am not aware of the lines upon which the committee proposes to work, and it must be left to it to lay them down. I have been endeavouring within the last few months to compile detailed information as to the state of affairs in individual districts, and I hoped to have been able to lay it before the Council to-night, together with the views on each district of the local officials and members of the Council. But the inquiry has taken a longer time than was expected, as members of Council in some cases found it difficult to attend, and in others asked for elaborate statistics which it would have taken months to compile. However, although some six or seven replies are still wanting, it is interesting to note that, speaking generally, those which have come in do not point to the probability of any marked reductions being possible. An attempt has been made to flout these inquiries on the ground that members are not all experts and may not have been able to find time for a proper examination of the question. But it seems to

have been forgotten that an inquiry of this kind has this great advantage that members are being consulted about matters concerning which they have personal knowledge, and not on issues affecting other parts of the Presidency about which they know little.

Another point to which I may refer with a note of warning is the effect of such an investigation on the discipline of the force. At present there is considerable discontent prevailing throughout most ranks of the police, and if an inquiry of this kind is not conducted with singular discretion, the discipline of the force may be seriously impaired.

Another danger is this. The committee will find that there are few districts in which the existing ranks are satisfied with their pay and in which the local officers are not able to bring forward many schemes involving an increase of expenditure. The opportunity is very likely to be taken to represent alleged grievances as to pay, and discontent may increase if requests are refused.

Apart from that the inquiry itself will clearly be an expensive one, as if it involves touring on the part of the members, touring is expensive, while if witnesses are brought to Calcutta there is equally the cost of that. There is too the incidental expenditure resulting from interference with work and the transfer of the time of officers from their ordinary duties to this special purpose.

For all such expenditure the Council will be asked to grant a vote, and I trust it will be clearly understood that the acceptance of this resolution will entail the acceptance of a subsequent proposal for expenditure. While then Government do not oppose the proposal for an inquiry, I have thought it desirable to point out one or two pitfalls which possibly surround it. Of these risks Government cannot but be conscious, but they acquiesce in the recommendation in the confident expectation that the inquiry will be undertaken with a sincere and earnest desire to secure efficiency in the first instance. If economy can be combined with efficiency so much the better, and we shall all rejoice. But we trust that proposals will not be laid before us which, in the sacred name of economy, will entail the scrapping of safeguards and systems which we, who have had more to do with the working of the department, consider essential for its proper working.

Mr. R. M. WATSON-SMYTH moved that the question be now put.

The PRESIDENT: I will take No. 19 as an amendment to No. 18 and put the amendment first. If that is carried, the original motion cannot be put.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: I do not wish to make any distinction between the resolution and the amendment. If the mover of the amendment has no objection, I will accept his amendment. Motion

No. 19 was then put and agreed to. The other motion was deemed to have been withdrawn.

Babu JOGENDRA NATH ROY being absent, the following motion which stood in his name was deemed to have been withdrawn:—

"This Council recommends to the Government that steps be taken to reintroduce the ferry steamer service between Narayanganj and Munshiganj (Dacca)."

The following motion stood in the name of Mr. Ajoy Chunder Dutt: "This Council recommends to the Government that steps be taken to produce a Bengali translation of the Bengal Village Self-Government Act, with necessary notes and explanations, and that the same be made accessible to the public of Bengal through the medium of post offices thanas and dispensaries."

The PRESIDENT: The Member of Government in charge of the resolution is absent. Perhaps you will agree to its postponement.

Mr. AJOY CHUNDER DUTT: Yes, certainly.

The PRESIDENT: The resolution is placed at the bottom of the Agenda Paper.

Adjournment.

The Council was then adjourned till 3 P.M. on Wednesday, the 6th July, 1921, at the Town Hall, Calcutta.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Council assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act.

THE Council met in the Town Hall, Calcutta, on Wednesday, the 6th July, 1921, at 3 P.M.

Present:

The Hon'ble the President, the Hon'ble the four Members of the Executive Council, the Hon'ble the three Ministers, and 93 nominated and elected members.

Starred Questions

(to which oral replies were given).

Conversation between Mr. K. C. De and Babu Akhil Chandra Dutta regarding Assam tea garden coolies.

***XXXVII. Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department aware of the purport of a conversation between the Divisional Commissioner of Chittagong and Babu Akhil Chandra Dutta relating to the recent happening at Chandpur, published in several papers and that the action of the said Commissioner has been severely criticised by both Indian and European journalists and public men?

(*b*) If so, has the Hon'ble the Member ascertained from the Divisional Commissioner himself whether the purport of the conversation as published is substantially correct, or whether there is any prevarication of truth in important particulars in the above statement?

(*c*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state those particulars and the truth so far as the Government have been able to ascertain them?

MEMBER in charge of POLITICAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (*a*) Yes. The conversation referred to was not an interview, and the Commissioner and the District Officer were not cross-examined in the manner shown in the published statement. There were general conversation on the occasion of three separate visits paid by Babu Akhil Chandra Dutta to the Commissioner, at which others were also present, the main subject discussed being how best to arrange for the welfare of the coolies.

(*b*) and (*c*) Government have ascertained from the Commissioner that the report of the conversation as published is inaccurate in many respects.

In some cases the answers given were not answers to the questions to which they were appended, in others the questions are distorted and are not the actual questions to which the answers were given, while in others both the question and answer are incorrect. The most important items in the conversation are those in which the Collector is stated to have said that the removal of the coolies from the railway station was carried out in order to produce an impression, and the Commissioner to have observed that he proposed to fight the non-co-operation movement with the aid of the Gurkhas and that he wanted to produce a moral impression with the Gurkhas. The statement imputed to the Collector is incorrect. Mr. Wares said that there was an impression among the coolies that the law could be broken with impunity, and that he could not allow this to continue. The statement had no particular reference to the eviction of the coolies. Mr. De made no statement to the effect that he proposed to fight the non-co-operation movement with Gurkhas, and as regards the moral impression, what he conveyed by his remarks was that he had then sufficient force to check any violence among the non-co-operators, and that the presence of the military police would prove this to the people and create a moral impression. He never threatened "to stop the *hartal* at any cost" or "to take other drastic repressive measures." He never threatened "to send the Gurkhas to the town."

Mr. De has detailed other inaccuracies in the account of the conversation, and has made the general criticism that Babu Akhil Chandra Dutta has only put down such parts of the conversation as suited his purpose. The upshot of the Commissioner's report is that the conversation as reproduced in the press could only convey, in various important respects, a misleading impression of what was said.

Price and supply of quinine.

***XXXVIII. Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) aware that the charitable dispensaries are being required to arrange for a big stock of quinine, especially in the malarious districts?

(*b*) Is it a fact that the rate of prices of quinine supplied from the Government plantations is three times the pre-war rate, and that even the rates published in the *Calcutta Gazette* are not followed in some instances?

(*c*) If so, are the Government considering the desirability of reducing the sale-price to mufassal charitable dispensaries if free supply is an impossibility?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of REVENUE [LAND REVENUE] (the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan): (*a*) The answer is in the negative.

(*b*) The price of quinine supplied to hospitals and dispensaries in 1914 was Rs. 13 per lb. It is now Rs. 48 per lb. The rates published in the Gazette are followed.

(*c*) The member is referred to the reply given to starred question No. 11 at the meeting of the Bengal Legislative Council held on the 1st April, 1921.

Unstarred Questions

(Answers to which were laid on the table).

Buick cars for taxi-business.

145. Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: (*a*) Has the attention of the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department been drawn to the application of Messrs. M. T., Ltd., of No. 1, British Indian Street, Calcutta, for the registration of their Buick cars for taxi-business?

(*b*) If so, will he pleased to state the special reasons as to why the said application has been rejected?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware of the fact that these cars used to be registered by the police for taxi-business about two years ago, and also that a large number of these cars has been imported by the said company for taxi-business?

MEMBER in charge of POLICE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (*a*) and (*b*) The Buick cars presented for registration as taxi-cabs did not comply with the rules under the Motor Vehicles Act and registration was refused for that reason.

(*c*) During the war when the import of suitable motor-cars was restricted, the rules were relaxed temporarily in respect of the specifications prescribed for taxi-cabs. It is no longer necessary to allow such concessions, but in order to avoid hardship to dealers, the Commissioner of Police is accepting for registration for a certain period, a certain proportion of Buick and other types of motor-cars, which do not comply strictly with the rules.

Recommendations of Ministerial Officers' Salary Committee.

146. Babu BHISHMADEV DAS: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state what are the recommendations of the Committee appointed to advise as to the revision of pay of ministerial officers and menials?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of FINANCE (the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr): The Member is referred to the Report of the Salaries Committee and to the note of dissent, copies of which will be laid on the table during the present session.

Taking of thumb-impression in registration offices.

147. Babu BHISHMADEV DAS: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education aware that in registration offices it is the rule to take the thumb-impression of literate and respectable Indian executants on the back of the documents and in the register of thumb-impressions, and that as a matter of practice such impressions are not taken in the cases of European executants?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of exempting literate Indians, or certain classes of literate Indians, from affixing their thumb-impressions?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of EDUCATION (the Hon'ble Mr. P. C. Mitter): (*a*) Under rule 52 of the Registration rules, literate executants are required to affix their thumb-impressions on their documents, as also in the book of thumb-impressions, if they are not personally known to the registering officer. Clause (*f*) of the rule, however, provides that the registering officer "may, in his discretion, dispense with the taking of impressions in the case of European ladies and gentlemen and other persons of position regarding whose identification there can be no doubt or room for suspicion."

(*b*) The system of identification by means of thumb-impressions is the best possible, as it reduces to a minimum the chances of false personation, and Government do not propose to exempt literate executants as a class from the operation of the rule. The wording of the rule is however defective, and it will be amended by the omission of the words "European ladies and gentlemen and other. . . ."

Practice of tying under-trial prisoners with ropes and leading them through public places.

148. Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department aware that under-trial prisoners, and even persons against whom a police inquiry is pending, are led openly through the public streets and places, by the police after tying them up with long ropes?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware of a feeling that exists that such treatment is unnecessarily humiliating and that it creates prejudice against them in the estimation of the public and thereby hampers them in their defence in the cases brought against them?

(*c*) When was this system introduced and by whom?

(*d*) What is the average number of convictions for offences for escaping from police custody during each of the five years before and after the introduction of this system?

(*e*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that the carrying out of this system is not always insisted upon, but that in many instances it is left to the discretion of the police officer concerned?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*), (*b*) and (*c*) Persons arrested by the police may be secured by ropes in certain circumstances. The instructions for the Bengal Police are contained in rules 159 and 160 of the Police Regulations, Bengal, Volume 5, which are as follows:—

"159 (*a*). Handcuffs shall be kept in good order. If broken, they shall be mended or replaced without delay.

(*b*) Great caution shall be exercised at all times in the removal of handcuffs or other fastenings from prisoners *en route*, whether by land or water.

(*c*) In non-bailable cases prisoners shall be handcuffed in couples, the right wrist of one to the left wrist of the other. In bailable cases prisoners shall not be handcuffed, unless violent, and then only by order of the officer in charge of the station.

If it is necessary to handcuff a prisoner in a bailable case, the reason for doing so shall be entered in the general and case diary and in the certificate in P. R. B. Form No. 242.

(*d*) In all cases in which the use of handcuffs is necessary, but no proper handcuffs are available, the prisoners may be secured by ropes or pieces of clothing. They shall not be subjected to more restraint than is absolutely necessary to prevent their escape. Ropes, when used, shall be so tied as not to interfere unduly with proper circulation, and shall be replaced by handcuffs as soon as possible.

160. (*a*) The use of handcuffs is often an unnecessary indignity. They shall be used only when violence is anticipated and they are clearly required to prevent the escape of the prisoner.

(*b*) Witnesses arrested under section 171, Criminal Procedure Code, shall not be treated as criminals and handcuffed, but simply as persons arrested under civil process.

(*c*) Exceptions to rule 159 shall be made in favour of prisoners who by age, sex or infirmity, are easily and securely kept in custody without handcuffs."

The rules for the guidance of the Calcutta Police are as follows:—

"Prisoners arrested by the police for transmission to a Magistrate or to the scene of an inquiry should not be subjected to more restraint than is necessary to prevent their escape.

In bailable cases prisoners should not be handcuffed unless violent, and then only by order of the officer in charge of the police-station.

In the case of two prisoners whom it is necessary to handcuff, they will be handcuffed in couples, the right wrist of one to the left wrist of the other.

Under no circumstances should more than two prisoners be secured together by handcuffs.

In all cases in which the use of handcuffs is allowed and when no proper handcuffs are available, the prisoners may be secured by ropes until handcuffs can be procured.

Should there be a head constable in charge of a party of prisoners, he must walk behind the prisoners and their escort and not in front of them."

It will thus be seen that the use of ropes is allowed only as a substitute for handcuffs and in circumstances in which the use of handcuffs would be permissible, such restraint being enforced only when it is necessary for the security of the prisoners. Under-trial prisoners in jail are conveyed between the jail and the courts in Calcutta and Dacca in prison vans. The Commissioner of Police has applied for another motor prison van for the conveyance of arrested persons from the section and sub-section houses to the central lock-up at Lal Bazar and the matter is under consideration. A van was asked for at Howrah some time ago, but it has not yet been found possible to supply it. The alternative to the escorting of prisoners in public is the use of closed prison vans. These could be used only in urban areas; their employment in the mufassal is not practicable.

Further inquiry will be made whether the existing orders require to be supplemented in any way.

(*c*) and (*d*) The information is not on record.

Practice of tying offenders with rope on the waist.

149. Babu BHISHMADEV DAS: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department aware that alleged offienders after arrest are tied by the police with a rope on their waist and taken through public places?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state whether such a practice exists in any other civilized country?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of discontinuing such practice?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*), (*b*) and (*c*) Attention is invited to the answer to unstarred question No. 148.

Salaries Committee's Report.

150. Maulvi ABDUL KARIM: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state when the report of the Ministerial Officers' Salaries Committee, which was to be submitted by the 31st March, 1921, was actually received by the Government, and when the Government's resolution on it will be published?

(*b*) Will the report of the Committee and the evidence or memorandum recorded by it be published for general information?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the advisability of publishing their scheme for ascertaining the views of the public as well as of the ministerial officers before issuing final orders on the subject?

(*d*) Is the Hon'ble the Member now in a position to state the approximate rate of increase which the Government propose to introduce in the substantive pay now drawn by the ministerial staff?

(*e*) When do the Government propose to give effect to the new scale of salaries to the ministerial officers?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (*a*) The report of the Salaries Committee was received by Government on the 29th April, 1921. The note of dissent was received on the 10th June, 1921. Government propose to deal first with the recommendations as regards the pay of menials and hope to lay before the Council their proposals as regards these during the current session.

(*b*) and (*c*) The report of the Committee, with the note of dissent, has already been laid on the table during the present session.

(*d*) and (*e*) Government hope to lay before the Council their proposals as regards the pay of ministerial officers in the September session.

Passengers' fares and waiting rooms of steamer companies.

151. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Marine Department be pleased to state—

(*i*) the decision of the India General Navigation and River Steam Navigation and Railway Company, Limited, on the resolution passed in the last session asking them to reduce the passengers' fares to the rate of fares of the Government-owned railways;

(*ii*) if the Company has any proposal for furnishing waiting-rooms in any of its stations;

(*iii*) if so, in which station, and when are they to be erected?

MEMBER in charge of MARINE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr): (*i*), (*ii*) and (*iii*) When the resolution in question was passed a promise was given on behalf of Government that a copy of the discussion in Council would be sent to the Joint Steamer Companies for their consideration. The Steamer Companies have not been addressed as the printed record of the proceedings is not yet available but it will be sent as soon as it is ready.

Considerations while fixing the pay of ministerial officers.

152. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state—

(*i*) the standard upon which the pay of ministerial and menial officers is fixed;

(ii) whether their pay is taken as the main or supplementary source of income for their maintenance;

(iii) how many persons an officer is expected to maintain with his pay; and

(iv) the monthly average expenditure of a man of the class of the ministerial and menial officers, for his maintenance, clothing and housing, etc.?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (i) The pay varies according to the class of work to be done, the qualifications required and the locality.

(ii) The pay is taken as the main source of income

(iii) Government have no information.

(iv) The member is referred to Appendices I and II to the Salaries Committee Report, Volume I, where some material for estimates will be found.

Muhammadan Officers for Jails.

153. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: (a) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (jails) be pleased to state:

(i) whether it is a fact that some of the jails have no Muhammadan officer at all; and

(ii) whether the number of Muhammadan prisoners form the majority in such jails?

(b) Are the Government considering the desirability of issuing orders to place at least one Muhammadan officer (warder or jailor) in each jail where 30 per cent. or more of the convicts are Muhammadans?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of REVENUE [Jails] (the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur Rahim: (a) (i) All jails have got Muhammadan officers, head warders and warders being included.

(ii) The number of Muhammadan prisoners form the majority in most of the jails.

(b) The question does not arise.

Pay of ministerial officers.

154. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state—

(i) when the scheme for improving the pay of ministerial officers in Bengal is likely to be published; and

(ii) whether retrospective effect will be given to it and, if so, from what date?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (*i*) The Salaries Committee report, with the note of dissent, has already been laid on the table during the present session.

(*ii*) The report is under consideration of Government, and no decision has yet been come to as to the date from which the proposals will be given effect to.

Expense on Government launches or motor boats and their use and loan.

155. Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur:(*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Marine Department be pleased to lay a statement on the table showing the number of Government launches or motor boats maintained for use of Government officers in Bengal, giving the designation of the officers, with the annual charges for maintaining each of them (launch by launch) together with a cost of repair?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state for how many days each of these officers use each of these launches for their official duties, and how many miles each of them travel during the last 12 months, and what was the cost of coaling for each?

(*c*) Are the Government officials to whom launches are given for use allowed to give the loan of these launches to private gentlemen or officers of other departments?

(*d*) If so, with whose permission?

(*e*) If a launch belonging to an officer of the transferred department is lent to one of the reserved departments, and it has coal in it, to whom is the cost debited, the former or the latter, and how is it adjusted?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (*a*) and (*b*) Government are not in possession of all the details necessary to reply to these questions. A copy of the most recent list of steamers, steam launches, etc., under the control of the Government of Bengal, which contains much of the information desired by the Member, has been placed in the library.

(*c*) and (*d*) Government launches may not be lent to private gentlemen, but the officials to whom they are allotted may lend them at their discretion to officers of other departments.

(*e*) A copy of Finance Department letter No. 6678 F.,* dated the 27th April, 1921, containing the orders of Government on the subject, has been placed in the library.

*Not printed in these Proceedings.

Introduction of a heading under "caste" in the form of recording deposition of witnesses in civil courts.

158. Babu BHISHMADEV DAS: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department aware that in the new form of recording the depositions of witnesses in civil courts a heading under "Caste" has been introduced?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the reasons for this departure?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware of a feeling that exists that witnesses of the depressed classes may feel delicacy in stating their caste in open court, and that the practice tends to accentuate caste distinction?

(*d*) Are the Government considering the desirability of discontinuing the practice?

MEMBER in charge of JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur Rahim): (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) The High Court considered that references to the caste of parties or of witnesses were unavoidable.

(*c*) No.

(*d*) No.

Conduct of nurses in female wards of the Calcutta Medical College Hospital.

157. Babu BROJENDRA KISHOR RAY CHAUDHURI: (*a*) With reference to the answer given to my unstarred question No 132 of the 1st April, 1921, will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state what inquiry was made regarding the truth or otherwise of the statement made in clauses (*c*) and (*d*) of the abovementioned question justifying the characterisation of it as an "insinuation conveyed under the cover of this question?"

(*b*) When, and by whom, was the inquiry made?

(*c*) Were the patients asked about these allegations?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea): (*a*) and (*b*) A reference was made to the Principal of the Medical College and the Professor of Midwifery at the Medical College and Obstetric Physician and Surgeon at the Eden Hospital, whose reports were received in the latter half of March.

(*c*) It does not appear from the reports that the patients then in the hospital were asked about these allegations. In this connection the attention of the Member is invited to clause (*d*) of the reply given to the question referred to, in which it was stated that no complaints had been received of any insults [illegible]

Employment of under-trial prisoners in the Kandi Sub-Jail.

168. Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Jails) be pleased to say whether it is a fact that the Subdivisional Officer, Kandi (in Murshidabad), used to employ under-trial prisoners at the Kandi Sub-Jail for grinding his flour and rearing his vegetables?

(*b*) Has the action of the Subdivisional Officer the approval of Government?

(*c*) If not, what steps have the Government taken to put a stop to the practice?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (*a*) No; the Subdivisional Officer reports that it is not a fact.

(*b*) and (*c*) These questions do not arise.

Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ: Are the Government aware that two non-official visitors of the Jail complained about the matter contained in the question to the Commissioner of the Presidency Division?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: I must have notice of the question.

Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ: Will the Government be pleased to collect —

The PRESIDENT (the Hon'ble Nawab Sir Syed Shams-ul-Huda): I cannot allow that. It is a request for action.

Salary Committee's report.

159. Mr. K. C. M. FAROQUI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Finance be pleased to state whether the Ministerial Officers' Salary Committee have since submitted their report which was due by the 31st March, 1921?

(*b*) If not, why not?

(*c*) Of the Rs. 45 lakhs provided in the Budget for the purpose of improving the pay of the ministerial and menial establishments during the year, how much is proposed to be expended on account of each of these establishments?

(*d*) What is the strength of the ministerial and menial establishments separately?

(*e*) Is it in the contemplation of Government to lay the Salary Committee's report before the Council for consideration and also to furnish a copy to the President of the Ministerial Officers' Conference before final orders thereon are passed by Government?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (*a*) and (*b*) The Committee have submitted their report.

(*c*), (*d*) and (*e*) The member is referred to the report, a copy of which, with the note of dissent, has already been laid on the table during the present session. A copy has already been supplied to the President of the Ministerial Officers' Conference.

Qualification of certain professors in the Calcutta University.

160. Babu HEM CHANDRA NASKER: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state—

(*i*) the year in which the gentlemen named below completed their career as students;

(*ii*) the date on which they were appointed as professors, or to other officers of the University;

(*iii*) the total amount of remuneration they draw each year for all kinds of services done to the University;

(*iv*) the various kinds of offices they hold, and

(*v*) the various subjects in which they are appointed examiners or paper-setters or both:—

(1) Babu Promotha Nath Banerjee;

(2) Babu Rama Prosad Mukherjee;

(3) Dr. Anath Nath Chatterjee;

(4) Babu Satish Chandra Roy?

(*b*) Is it a fact that Dr. A. N. Chatterjee has been provided with a motor-car, which is maintained by the Calcutta University?

(*c*) Is the Inspector of Colleges provided with a motor-car? If not, what is the reason for this differential treatment?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: A statement which has been received from the Registrar, Calcutta University, is laid on the library table.

Running of municipal (scavenging) railway in Calcutta.

161. Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government aware that the municipal railway which runs through the heart of Calcutta is a nuisance to the public, and is detrimental to the health of a large number of the Calcutta population?

(*b*) Is it a fact that the attention of the Government has been repeatedly drawn to this matter by different Inspectors-General of Civil Hospitals and Superintendents of the Campbell Medical Schools, and others?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state what steps have been taken by Government to remedy this state of things?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) Government are aware of the nuisance caused by the municipal railway.

(*b*) Yes.

(*c*) The Member is referred to the answer given to clause (*b*) of unstarred question No. 29 asked by Mr. Tarit Bhusan Roy at the meeting of the Legislative Council held on 7th February, 1921. Subsequently, the Corporation was addressed on the subject of the nuisance caused by the railway in the neighbourhood of the Campbell Hospital, and a copy of the Chairman's reply No. S 1172, dated the 9th June, 1921, mentioning the steps taken by the Corporation to mitigate the nuisance, is laid on the table.

Copy of a letter referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 161 (c).

No. S 1172, dated Calcutta, the 9th June, 1921

FROM C. F. PAYNE, ESQ., C.S.I., I.C.S., Chairman of the Calcutta Corporation

To—The Secretary to the Government of Bengal, Local Self-Government Department, Medical Branch.

With reference to your letter No. 1037 Medl., dated the 11th April, 1921, forwarding an extract from a letter from the Surgeon-General with the Government of Bengal on the subject of the nuisance caused by the municipal railway in the neighbourhood of the Campbell Hospital, I have the honour to state that at the request of the Campbell Hospital authorities a special telephone arrangement was installed about two years ago in order to prevent the detention of loaded refuse trains in the Entally railway yard. It is extremely rare that refuse trains are detained at this point, and on the few occasions upon which they are unavoidably detained, the duration is only for 5 to 10 minutes and in each case the train is backed as far away from the Campbell Hospital as possible. The empty wagons are generally taken direct to the platform, but one train of such wagons is kept in the yard at night for the next morning service. These wagons are cleansed and disinfected during the hot weather months when epidemics are prevalent. The Health Officer recently inspected the railway yard and examined the wagon distribution register. He found no collection of flies at the time of his inspection and was satisfied with the arrangements for cleansing the empty wagons. He, however, suggested that the cleansing and disinfection of empty wagons should be continued throughout the year instead of being done during the hot weather months only. To give effect to this suggestion, the General Committee have at their meeting held on the 2nd June, 1921, sanctioned an additional staff. It will thus be seen that the Corporation are doing everything possible to minimise the nuisance complained of.

2. As regards the removal of the refuse platform to Chingrihatta, the construction of the new platform at Palmer's Bridge will be commenced during the current year. The execution of the scheme for the removal of refuse by motor lorries will require a great deal of organisation, and it is not possible to say at present when it will be completed. Fourteen motor lorries have already been purchased for the motor conservancy service and two electric lorries are expected shortly. An officer has been placed on special duty to organise the details of the service, and the matter is being pushed on as rapidly as possible.

Trains from Calcutta to Faridpur.

162. Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works aware that the

through passengers from Calcutta to Faridpur, proceeding by the night train, have to change trains at Rajbari in the dead of night?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware of the hardship caused to passengers thereby, especially in the cold weather, when railway coolies are not usually available?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of moving the Railway authorities to provide one or two carriages in the night trains for through passengers travelling from Calcutta to Faridpur?

(*d*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that the lighting arrangement in the trains of the Faridpur branch line is unsatisfactory, and that the passengers have often to use candles at their own cost?

(*e*) Are the Government considering the desirability of drawing the attention of the Railway authorities to this grievance with a view to its removal?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of PUBLIC WORKS (the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur): (*a*) It is within the cognizance of Government that passengers travelling to Faridpur by the Dacca Mail train change at Rajbari between the hours of 4-15 and 4-38 (standard time) in the early morning.

(*b*) Licensed coolies are available at Rajbari for handling passengers' luggage at train times.

(*c*) Railway statistics show that the average daily number of passengers travelling to Faridpur and all stations on the Faridpur Branch Railway by all trains is 28, which hardly justifies the running of through service carriages between Calcutta and Faridpur.

(*d*) and (*e*) These matters are under consideration by the Eastern Bengal Railway authorities with a view to improvement.

Borrowing from co-operative societies.

163. Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state—

(*i*) the number of real cultivating tenants who have become members of co-operative societies and the amount of money they have subscribed;

(*ii*) the number of members who are now non-cultivators and the amount of money they have subscribed?

(*b*) Is it a fact that only cultivators who borrow money from the societies subscribe or have to subscribe a portion of the money borrowed to the fund, and become members?

(*c*) How many cultivators have become members without borrowing money in the above fashion?

(*d*) Is there any truth in the rumour that the co-operative societies are made instruments by money-lenders for lending their moneys at nearly 18 per cent. interest and for easy realisation of their debts to the detriment of raiyats?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of AGRICULTURE and INDUSTRIES (the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur): (*a*), (*i*) and (*ii*) Up-to-date figures are not available as statistics are collected for the co-operative year, *i.e.* from July to June. The figures up to 30th June, 1920, are shown below:—

Class of societies	Total number of societies	Total number of members.	Total working capital	Capital subscribed by members.	Remarks
			Rs.	Rs.	
Agricultural ...	4,977	157,159	1,11,00,000	8,50,000	Practically all members are real cultivators
Non agricultural ...	260	50,676	48,00,000	30,00,000	Most of the members are non cultivators

(*b*) The answer is in the negative.

(*c*) The information asked for is not available and the labour that would be involved in collecting it would be out of all proportion to its value.

(*d*) There is no truth in the rumour. The attention of the Member is invited to the entries in column 24, Statement A of the Report of the Co-operative Department, 1919-20, where are shown the rates at which the greater part of the capital of agricultural co-operative societies is raised, and column 27, Statement C, in which the rates at which non-agricultural co-operative societies raise their capital are shown. A copy of the report* is laid on the library table.

Distress in Satkhira subdivision.

164. Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to state whether he is aware of the distress prevailing in the Satkhira subdivision and neighbourhood by which 200,000 people are reported to have been affected?

(*b*) Has the attention of the Hon'ble the Member been drawn to reports by Sir P. C. Roy on the situation and also to the latter's repeated appeals in the press for public help?

*Not printed in these Proceedings.

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to say whether the Government are considering the desirability of taking immediate steps to relieve the sufferings of the people?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*), (*b*) and (*c*) The member is referred to the *communiqué* recently published, which gives the answers to his questions.

Scarcity in Khulna district and the measures for relief.

165. Babu SAILAJA NATH ROY CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) aware that acute scarcity prevails in some parts of the Khulna district, and will he be pleased to lay on the table the reports on the subject, if any, submitted by the circle officers, the Subdivisional Officers and the District Magistrate?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state in which part of the district scarcity prevails and the area and population affected?

(*c*) What steps have the Government taken or are taking to relieve the suffering from scarcity, as also for the preservation of cattle in the affected areas?

(*d*) Has any case of death through starvation been reported to the Government from Khulna?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) The member is referred to the recently published *communiqué*.

(*b*) An area of about 59 square miles in the Sadar and Satkhira subdivisions is affected. The number of people reduced to extreme poverty is estimated at about 2,500.

(*c*) The action taken is stated in the *communiqué*. The cattle are reported to be in good condition

(*d*) No. Some allegations of deaths by starvation have been made, but inquiry has shown that the allegations were not correct.

Scarcity of coal.

166. Maulvi YAKUBNUDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Commerce aware that the people in the mufassal are suffering great hardship owing to the scarcity of coal?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that this is due to the shortage of wagons?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Member also aware that the price of building material has risen abnormally high owing to this scarcity.

(*d*) What action, if any, are Government taking in the matter?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of COMMERCE (the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr): (*a*), (*b*) and (*c*) Yes.

(*d*) The member is referred to the reply given to unstarred question No. 3 at the meeting of this Council on the 7th February last. Since then the Government of India have appointed a committee having for its object the distribution of wagons in the coal-fields with special reference to endeavouring, if possible, to distribute the wagons available daily between all collieries in a fair proportion and also to help in cases of urgent necessity any industry which may through the want of coal be on the verge of closing down.

Training Bengalis into mercantile marine.

167. Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Marine Department be pleased to state whether the Government propose to make provision for keeping training vessels in the ports of Calcutta and Chittagong, for training Bengali seamen and officers?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state whether the Government propose to establish schools for teaching ship-building and navigation?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: (*a*) and (*b*) As regards nautical training, the member is referred to the answer given to unstarred question No. 26 at the meeting of Council held on the 1st April. No proposal to establish training vessels is under the consideration of Government. As regards ship-building, the member is referred to the answer to unstarred question No. 119 at this meeting.

Bhowal Kumar and alleged high-handedness of the officers of Court of Wards.

168. Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to lay on the table a copy of the evidence which led the Board of Revenue to come to the conclusion that the second Kumar of Bhowal was actually cremated at Darjeeling nearly 12 years ago?

(*b*) Is it a fact that many of the tenants of the Bhowal Court of Wards submitted petitions to Mr. J. W. Needham, the Manager, at villages Sripur and Mowna on the 15th and 16th March, 1921, mentioning instances of oppression and illegal realisation by some Court of Wards officers under him, and that similar petitions were also submitted to the Collector of Dacca and to the Board of Revenue?

(*c*) If the answer to clause (*b*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state what action, if any, has been taken or is proposed to be taken in the matter?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) The Government are not prepared to lay any such papers on the table as the matter must rest with the Court of Wards, who must be guided by the actions that may be taken by the claimant.

(*b*) Yes.

(*c*) The Naib of Sripur has been removed from there and orders have been passed to transfer the Circle Officer elsewhere. Further inquiries have also been instituted.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: Will the Government be pleased to say whether the claimant has taken any action?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: It is a matter for the Board of Revenue. Government have no information.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: It has been stated that the Naib of Sripur has been removed from there. Will the Hon'ble Member be pleased to state whether the Naib has been discharged or dismissed?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: [illegible]

Strikes in Eastern Bengal.

169. Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Commerce aware that the recent strikes among the employees of the Assam Bengal Railway and of the India General and Rivers Steam Navigation Companies have been causing a great deal of inconvenience to the public?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state what action if any have the Government taken to bring about a compromise between the parties concerned with a view to bring the strike to an end?

The Hon'ble Mr. Kerr: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) The strikes are not due to any ordinary economic dispute between capital and labour, but have been deliberately brought about by certain persons for their own purposes, and the responsibility for the public inconvenience caused by the strikes must rest on them. In the circumstances, Government do not feel that they can usefully intervene at the present stage, but they are watching the situation.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: Will the Hon'ble Member be pleased to state whether they have held any inquiry to find out the causes of the strike?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: No particular inquiry was held, but Government had information on the point.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: Have the strikers or their associations declared that their strike is not due to any economic causes?

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: Government are not aware that the strikers have made any such declaration.

Resolutions

(under the rules for the discussion of matters of general public interest)

Allotments to District Boards.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: Sir, the motion before us deals with the primary needs of the people. We saved about Rs. 20 lakhs by curtailment of expenditure in the last Budget.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: The hon'ble member has not moved his resolution

The PRESIDENT: He is moving his resolution. (To the mover) You might formally say "I move the resolution"

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: In order to satisfy my young friend, I formally move the resolution that stands in my name, that "This Council recommends to the Government that out of the sums saved by retrenchment by the Council in the present Budget, a sum of Rs. 1,00,000 be allotted to the district boards for tanks and wells this year, and a further sum of Rs. 1,00,000 be allotted to the said boards for medical relief to the people in accordance with the resolutions passed by this Council."

The resolution deals with the primary needs of the people. We saved about Rs. 20 lakhs in the last Budget by curtailment of expenditure. That amount should be spent, I submit, on our primary needs. The day before yesterday we got the supplementary Budget. Government may spend as much money as they like, but our primary needs must be met. You are all aware that this year there has been a very great drought throughout the province. Tanks and wells have dried up and the sufferings of the people are very great. Women, I know, in many places, have to travel six to eight miles every day for bringing water—brackish water from distant tanks. People cannot get sweet water as most of the rivers in Bengal have dried up. In the Sunderbans which is intersected by salt water, river and creeks, people want, like old mariners, sweet water. Water, water, everywhere but not a drop to drink. Sir, this year the crops have partially failed throughout the province and the distress is great. The people have been hard hit and they are unable to help themselves. The district boards have got no money to help the people. Therefore, I propose that the district boards should be helped. This matter cannot be delayed because the distress will continue from year to year. All that I have at present proposed

is that the existing tanks should be deepened next cold weather. There is no time to lose. The sum is a very insignificant one. But what can we do? Let us have something and that before the next cold weather.

As regards medical relief you are all aware that Bengal has passed through an epidemic of cholera this year which has not quite disappeared yet; you will find that the death-rate from cholera is still high, not only in the interior of the districts but in Calcutta also. So far as the districts are concerned there is no water to drink but muddy and brackish water. Our Minister in charge of Sanitation, who did not at first look with favour on the resolution passed by us about medical relief, has since been convinced of the great necessity. He has allotted Rs. 15,000 for it and, in the supplementary Budget, I find he has allotted another Rs. 15,000 and he has been pleased to tell me that he may be able to find another Rs. 20,000 for the purpose. He has also been pleased to ask me to move that one lakh of rupees be allotted for the purpose in the next Budget. It is good of him to say so but we cannot wait. The money belongs to the people. They pay the taxes and their urgent necessities must be met. Then, and then only, will they pay the taxes and enjoy, with advantage, the benefits of a civilised Government. I therefore move, Sir, that this resolution be passed.

Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: It is highly desirable in the interest of the mofussil people that this proposal should meet with the acceptance of the Council. The district boards have to labour under considerable difficulties at present. Under the provisions of section 90 of the Local Self Government Act, it is very difficult for the chairman of the district board to provide good drinking water for the people. There is a corresponding section in the Village Self Government Act and the same difficulty has been felt here. Many of the tanks belong to co-owners. It is very difficult to get the consent of these co-owners and nothing has been done. The question, therefore, will assume a grave aspect if Government do not come forward to help the villagers. If the matter is left entirely to the district boards or to the village committees, there is little chance of good drinking water being supplied in the villages. Consequently, it is necessary to consider that if there be any money available, after retrenchment, the same may be utilised for this laudable purpose. If Government think that the district board will be in a position to meet the difficulties of the villages, there is no help for it. I avail myself of this opportunity to emphasise the importance of the resolution for the consideration of the members of the Council that such money as may be available should be utilised. There is another portion of the resolution dealing with medical relief. The members of the Council are aware of the fact that there are few dispensaries within the jurisdiction of the district boards and the people are badly in want of more. If statistics be taken, then it will be found to what extent medical

relief is given to the people who are suffering from epidemics. Consequently, if a good deal of money is utilised for this purpose it will be a great relief to the villagers.

With these few words, Sir, I beg to support the resolution wholeheartedly.

Raja MANILOLL SINGH ROY: As I am intimately connected with the district board of Burdwan, I know the sufferings of the people of my district for want of drinking water. The sufferings for want of medical relief are far greater and we are very thankful to Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur for this resolution of his. The fund at the disposal of the district board is not adequate enough for the purpose. Some time ago, a resolution was passed by my district board to carry out the provisions of this resolution, provided the Government comes forward with a helping hand. I therefore, very strongly support this resolution. Sir, the need and the expenditure of the district board may be taken into account when the Government will be pleased to grant the money.

Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: I heartily support this resolution. The mover asked for only one lakh of rupees. The needs of the province are so very great that a lakh of rupees cannot possibly meet all the demands of the districts, but any amount would be welcome. I would request the members to give this resolution their whole-hearted support.

With these words I beg to support this resolution.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: I have great pleasure in supporting this resolution. Three of our hon'ble friends here—one my friend behind—Raja Manilall Singh Roy, the Chairman of the District Board of Burdwan, Babu Tankanath Chaudhuri, the Chairman of the District Board of his own district, and Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur who is an authority in district board matters have all supported it. There is a consensus of opinion about this matter. All those gentlemen have devoted practically the whole of their lives in district board work and they say that the districts do require assistance in this work. No work can be of greater importance than the work of water-supply which helps to save our lives and which necessarily means life itself. Life first and then everything else, and it is our bounden duty to support this resolution and to say that this money should be allotted for this noble purpose. We all know how our district boards are scantily supplied with money and we all expect that something will be done by the district boards, but unfortunately very little can be done by them. I may also say that it is expected of the Hon'ble Minister in charge himself to move in this matter. Of course, I have every reason to believe that he will be the first to accept the resolution and to give effect to it. He is one of those persons who have devoted their lives in administering municipal affairs in the mufassal, and he is perfectly aware of the difficulties of

medical treatment and water-supply in such areas. I, therefore, without taking up any further time of the Council, support this resolution and I earnestly hope that Government will accept it and give effect to it at an early date. We cannot afford to waste time over a matter of such importance as this.

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: It must be admitted by everybody present here that it is with very great difficulty that the district boards can make both ends meet. Therefore any grant from Government to the district boards will come as a great relief to them and they will feel grateful to Government if this sum of two lakhs of rupees. I would say more money be paid to them for medical relief and for the purpose of excavating tanks and wells. The resolution of my friend is a very modest one. I wish he had asked for more money because we know that there are 29 districts and 29 districts boards in the province. Government have been pleased to hand over all the money which they used to get as Public Works Cess to the district boards since the year 1913. So that on an average the district boards are getting a lakh of rupees and the [illegible] of Government are that this money which they used to get as Public Works Cess should be delayed or rather should be spent for the purpose of [illegible] relief for carrying out sanitary measures and for the excavation of tanks. I think the district boards have been loyal in carrying out the instructions of Government, but still they find that they are not in a position to meet the demands of all the subdivisions in their districts. It is for these reasons that I support my hon'ble friend as I have said he should have asked for a larger amount.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: I do not think that any speech is necessary to support this motion. I rise to speak simply because I want to give emphasis to the fact that this sort of resolution deserves the fullest support of the people coming from all parts of the province. I know, Sir, from personal experience of my own district of Tippera that during the last six months in some of the villages on the west border people have died like flies for want of proper medical treatment. I think that there were altogether six or seven doctors sent by the district board, but I believe had not money enough to send more and many people had to go without any medical treatment whatsoever.

As regards tanks for drinking water, the district boards, no doubt, do something to meet the demands of the people in this respect, but for want of sufficient funds they cannot do more. So, I think, Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur would have done well if he had asked for more money. As he has not done it now I hope he will do it afterwards. I have the greatest pleasure in supporting this resolution.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: I whole-heartedly support the motion. It is a very modest demand for 27 districts in the province. It would be less than Rs. 4,000 for each of these districts for water-supply and medical aid, still it would go a great way in relieving the temporary

distress of the people. I know that in my district there is a great scarcity of drinking water and medical aid is also very inadequate. We have been able to save some money this year, and if Rs. 2 lakhs can be devoted to the purposes specified in this resolution, it will be a great relief to the people. With these few words, I beg to support the resolution.

Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: The district of Bankura, particularly the sadar subdivision of the district, is in need of tanks and wells more than any other district of the province. Sir, it is a notorious fact that, in recent years, there have been several visitations of famine and that is only due to want of irrigation. It is no doubt that the district is crossed by several rivers, but the defect in the geographical condition of the district is such that in the summer season, when irrigation is necessary, the rivers dry up and so also the tanks. Most of the tanks are neglected for want of funds and divided ownership and cannot, therefore, be excavated, and for this reason the poor ryots do not also get drinking water at the time of need. So the proposal made by the Rai Bahadur is no doubt very good, but the sum that is demanded is very insignificant in comparison with the requirements. It is not even quite sufficient to meet the wants of one or two thanas of the sadar subdivision of the district of Bankura. I may mention here that, during a fire that took place in a village, all the water that could be had in the houses of the villagers and also in the tanks was exhausted, with the result that when the fire was extinguished, the villagers there naturally became thirsty, but they could not get water for drinking and had to go to a neighbouring village at a distance of three miles to quench their thirst. So, Sir, the want is very great. It is especially very great in the district of Bankura and so I hope that at the time of distribution of the money, a large portion, if not the whole, would be expended in that district. With these words I support the resolution.

Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ: Sir, I rise to support this resolution. The mover of the resolution has asked for a lakh of rupees only for the purpose of supplying pure drinking water, but when I look to the condition of my district I find that about 10 lakhs will be necessary if immediate relief is to be given to the people of that district alone. That district, which was once the capital of Bengal has, during the last 10 years, lost 1,28,000 in population out of a total population of about 13 lakhs or so, and that is due particularly to the want of pure drinking water and medical relief. The waterways are now silted up and tanks are full of jungles and, instead of supplying pure drinking water, they supply poison to the inhabitants of the place. In order to bring relief not only to that district but to other districts as well, it is necessary that efforts should be made to find more money to meet the demands and so enable the people to live happily and well. I shall make a special appeal to the Minister on behalf of the district of Murshidabad and ask him to take into consideration the mortality in the district during the last 10 years when the question of distribution of the money comes up.

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: Sir, I rise to say on behalf of Government that we have the deepest sympathy with the aim and object of this resolution. No one could have listened to the speeches that have been delivered in this Chamber this afternoon to the unanimous consensus of opinion emanating from all the districts of Bengal in support of the contents of this resolution without feeling the greatest sympathy, and as a Minister of Government, and also as a representative of the people, I feel that I should be false to myself if I did not re-echo the sentiments which have been so eloquently expressed. Sir, one of my friends—I think it was Mr. Surendra Nath Mullick—observed that he expected that the Minister would, in this matter, take action of his own accord. I may tell my friend that I have already done so. Those gentlemen who are members of district boards will probably remember that they have received a circular letter addressed by the department of Government over which I have the honour to preside, asking them to hold conferences in each district of the leading men of the district with a view to formulate schemes of water-supply for the district and to indicate the cost and the financial resources from which that cost is to be met, and, in order to convince them of the deep personal interest which I feel in this matter, I have promised to be present at these conferences, if invited. Therefore, Sir, the matter is engaging my attention, my most earnest and personal attention, and I feel that it is necessary that something should be done. The whole country feels it—the want of adequate and proper supply of water has been the cry of the country for the last 30 years. The want of adequate medical relief has also been echoed and re-echoed in this Council Chamber. It has been said to-day that the district boards are unable to supply funds to cope with the difficulties of the situation. I quite admit that, but the remedy lies partly in the hands of the district boards themselves. Taxation lies in their power. I myself would be no party to the imposition of fresh taxation on a people who are already heavily burdened. But, Sir, it does seem to me that there is a way out of the difficulty. Why should not the district boards embark upon an extensive system of loans upon the hypothecation of funds which they possess? It seems to me that they can do so without any difficulty if the loans are spread over 30 or 40 years, and they can thus raise a capital fund which will enable them to meet their needs in respect of these matters. I may point out, for the information of the members of this Council, that I was present as a member of the Imperial Legislative Council when the question of the grant of the Public Works Cess was discussed, and, if I remember aright, that grant was made on the condition that the proceeds should be devoted to the supply of water in the rural areas. I am trying to enquire from my office as to whether when the grant was made over to district boards it was not earmarked for this particular object, and though it might not have been at that time, it will be my endeavour, as responsible Minister, to earmark it for sanitary and water-supply purposes. At any rate, the matter is one

which the district boards should consider. Reference has been made to Government help. But the funds of the Government are not in a very flourishing condition. You will remember that we drew upon our reserve balance and that we are working at a deficit at the present moment. We are waiting for an answer to the appeal which we have made to the Government of India for making over to us the export duty on jute. The matter is under the consideration of the Government of India and, I trust, the result will be satisfactory. If that amount is made over to us, we shall be in a position to meet some part of the requirements in respect of the sanitation of this great province. The resolution as it goes is all very good, but it seems to me that the financial situation at the present moment is not such as will enable us to give practical effect to it. Suppose you pass the resolution, how will you carry it out? My friend says: "This Council recommends to the Government that out of the sums saved by retrenchment by the Council in the present Budget ....." Therefore, we are to spend the money required out of the sum which we have saved. What is the measure and extent of that saving? Rupees 13 lakhs. But there is a deficit against it, we are Rs. 10 lakhs to the bad. On the receipt side we have not been able to obtain Rs. 13 lakhs which we anticipated in respect of Stamps. From Excise we have not been able to obtain Rs. 2 lakhs out of the sum budgeted for. The result is that on the expenditure side we have Rs. 15 lakhs against a saving of Rs. 13 lakhs. So there has been no saving at all. Where then are we to get the money from? How is the expenditure to be met? It is all very well to pass resolutions but you are the supreme authority in respect of finance. Give me the money and I will carry out your resolution with alacrity and enthusiasm. My advice to the Council, Sir, bear in mind I am in entire sympathy with this motion and I am quite ready to help. My advice to you is for the present to withdraw this resolution. I propose to make a statement in September in connection with this matter when we shall know more about our funds when we shall have probably heard from the Government of India about the Rs. 2½ crores from jute, and then we shall be in a better position to judge of our financial position and our capacity to meet our sanitary requirements. Having regard to all these circumstances, my earnest appeal I do not oppose the resolution and you to the House is to drop this matter for the present. I will make a statement in connection with this resolution in September next. I hope my friend and the House will accept the suggestion in the spirit in which it is offered.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: An overflow of sympathy is always suspicious. District boards have been told to borrow money on loans mortgaging their resources. It is not so easy to induce the district boards to raise loans. Sir, as I have said before, our primary needs must be met, we take no refusal, we shall be justified in withholding the payment of our taxes if you do not allow us to live. Sir,

we have been told that there is no money and that we only saved 13 lakhs. Now, Sir, we are not children. We shall take no refusal in this matter. This will be the first charge upon the revenues of the State. Here is another supplementary budget coming in. Let this be passed first and then we will see about the supplementary budget. You never thought that you had no money when you sent in the supplementary budget. We shall first pass this and see what the Government do.

The motion was then put and carried.

Burial of Muhammadan convicts.

Shah SYED EMDADUL HAQ: "This Council recommends to the Government that the Muhammadan prisoners dying in jails should, in places where there is no Muhammadan Burial Association to take over the dead bodies for disposal, be made over to the Muhammadan heads of the local Muhammadan mosque, and that the expenses incurred in burying the dead in accordance with Muhammadan religious custom be incurred by Government."

The member spoke in Bengali in support of his resolution.

Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ: I support this resolution. After what has been said by the learned mover, I do not think it will be necessary for me to go over the same points again. I think Christian convicts dying in jails are given a decent burial. I think Hindus dying in jails are cremated. If they are not, they should be. The Muhammadan religion requires the dead to be buried with certain rites. Sir, it is a very small request made to the Government and I hope it will be listened to. From the information which I have received I think the Government will have no hesitation in accepting this resolution. The Civil Surgeon at Berhampore made inquiries whether there would be persons available to take up the burial of Muhammadans dying in jails. This shows that the Government realises the necessity of passing this resolution.

Maulvi HAMIDUDDIN KHAN: I have much pleasure in supporting the resolution that has been just moved by my friend Shah Syed Emdadul Haq. It is well known that it is the duty of every Moslem to see that the dead body of a Moslem should be buried with proper religious ceremony. The ceremony consists mainly of washing the dead body and putting on a new cloth and performing a special prayer and then putting the dead body in the grave with certain rites. This is all the ceremony and so far as my knowledge goes it does not cost very much. It is quite possible for the Jail authorities in every place to send information to the head of the mosque or to the Secretary of the local Anjuman in case of inability of Government to dispose of the dead body, and I think that the Secretary of the Anjuman or the head of the mosque will be glad to receive the dead body and make arrangements for its burial. This is specially a question of religion, and I think that, as our benign Government is very tolerant

towards all religions, there will be no objection whatsoever on the part of Government to accept this resolution.

Maulvi SHAH ABDUL RAUF: It is a pity, indeed, if this resolution does not find its supporters. We all know that there are Muhammadan convicts in jails and that they also die in jails. It is in the fitness of things that proper rites should be observed in burying those poor creatures. It is a pity that up till now there is no arrangement in jails whereby Muhammadan convicts can be buried according to their religious rites; this has necessitated the introduction of this resolution.

I beg to submit that, so far as the expenses are concerned, Government need not be anxious, because the cost of burying a Muhammadan is not so great as to be impossible for Government to bear it. There are local Anjumans almost everywhere and it would be better if the dead bodies are given to the Secretaries of Muhammadan Associations. Where there is no association, the heads of local mosques will be very glad, I am sure, to take charge of those dead bodies and bury them according to the Muhammadan rites. In case they want some money to meet the expenses which they will have to incur in connection with the burial, Government will be pleased to pay that. With these few words, I beg to support the resolution and I hope that my colleagues here will also support it.

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR RAHIM: When Muhammadan prisoners die in jails, in places where there are burial associations, the dead bodies are made over to them for the purpose of burying. Where there are no such associations, the jail authorities make over the dead bodies to the municipalities who arrange for the burial the Jail authorities making small payments to the municipalities to meet the expenses. It may be that in some cases the burial does not take place according to the Muhammadan rites and the Government are willing to incur whatever expenses may be necessary in order to see that the Muhammadan prisoners receive burial according to the requirements of the Muhammadan religion. The resolution asks that where there are no Muhammadan Burial Associations, dead bodies may be made over to the heads of the local mosques. We are quite prepared to do that but, in any case, where the head of the mosque is not prepared to take charge of the dead bodies, it will be necessary for Government to make arrangements with any Muhammadan Association that there may be or the local municipality to take charge of the dead bodies and give them a decent burial according to Muhammadan religion. I therefore accept this resolution the object of which the Government will try to carry out.

Shah SYED EMDADUL HAQ spoke in Bengali, in reply on the misapprehension that the Government member had opposed his motion.

The PRESIDENT: I am afraid that you have not followed what the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-Rahim said. He has accepted the resolution.

The resolution was then put and agreed to.

Revenue Stamps for Bengal.

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: "This Council recommends to the Government that the Government of India be moved for the issue of separate one-annna revenue stamps for Bengal with effect from the next official year so that the revenue derived from this source may be properly adjusted"

It has been my good fortune, or shall I say misfortune, to knock at the door of the Government of India for the last three years since the Meston Committee came to Calcutta for the settlement of the financial relations between the Government of India and this Government. As a non-official witness on behalf of the Government of Bengal before the Meston Committee, I urged, along with my hon'ble friend, Mr. P. C. Mitter, the claims of Bengal to better treatment and to give us the revenue from jute and at least half the income-tax. But unfortunately the claims of Bengal were not properly considered either by the Meston Committee or by the Joint Committee of Parliament. The Joint Committee have given us very little. It may be after all a delusion—only one-fourth of the income-tax over and above the amount of income-tax derived in the year 1920-21.

We do not know as yet what has been the fate of my resolution to give us the amount of the revenue derived from jute. I think that the hon'ble members of the House are probably aware that postage stamps are used as receipt stamps—that is to say, two half-annna postage stamps or one one-annna postage stamp might be used as receipt stamps, that is, these postage stamps are known as postage stamps and revenue stamps. They have been mixed. Business men probably know that a few years ago we had one-annna receipt stamps quite separate from the postage stamps. The two have now been mixed up and we have now one sort of postage stamps. We get a lump sum of about Rs. 5 lakhs from the Government of India in the shape of contribution for the substitution of postage stamp for what was formerly known as one-annna receipt stamps. How this amount was arrived at, we do not know. I think that if a separate one-annna revenue stamp were issued, Bengal would be benefited financially. In any case, it is but meet and proper that the Bengal Government should get exactly the amount which is due to it under this head and there should not be any cause for grumbling. There might be some objection that a separate one-annna receipt stamp may not be as easily available to the public as ordinary postage stamps, but, I think, there need be no apprehension in the mind of the public on this account, as receipt stamps may be sold either at the post office like ordinary stamps or like other stamps by stamp vendors as used to be done before. It is to bring in a little more money to the Exchequer of Bengal that I move this resolution. I am quite certain that if my resolution be given effect to and revenue stamps be separately issued for Bengal, Bengal will not be a loser. The experiment is at least worth trying.

Babu NIBARAN CHANDRA DAS GUPTA: I beg to support the resolution which has been moved by my friend, Babu Surendra Nath Ray. Evidently, we should have a separate revenue stamp for receipts and postage stamps may be required to serve the same purpose on the ground that they are more easily available than revenue stamps in the mufassal Under the existing law - I refer particularly to the latest Government of India Act - posts and telegraphs are Imperial subjects, whereas, "Stamps," is a provincial subject Postal revenue constitutes item No. 10 of Schedule I of the Government of India Act, and Stamps item No 20 of Schedule II The reasonableness of the resolution is apparent, because all the revenue, whatever may be the amount derived by the sale of the stamps, ought to come to the provincial Exchequer, and the contribution of Rs 5 lakhs of revenue by the Government of India is based upon the principle of average. That was quite good enough When one-anna separate revenue stamp was used, nobody complained of the difficulty of obtaining it and there was not the slightest inconvenience Of course, postage stamps are far more easily available, but I do not think that on that account alone this matter should not be given up This is an item of revenue which is ours and it should not be considered as belonging to the Government of India We get only Rs 5 lakhs as a sort of dole We are not prepared to accept it A few minutes before, I had a talk with the mover of the resolution and I pointed out that there may be a loss in revenue if by sale of one anna stamps, we get less than Rs 5 lakhs We lose a certain amount, but if human estimates are of any use, I can assure the Council that we are not going to lose as such receipt stamps are used mostly in big towns I think most of the revenue on this head is derived from the sale of such stamps at Calcutta Consequently we are not likely to lose and a provincial subject ought to be kept entirely separate from the central subject I think that we will all agree that this resolution should be accepted and the old practice of issuing one-anna receipt stamps should be resorted to

The Hon'ble Mr. KERR: My friend, Babu Surendra Nath Ray, is always giving us little tips for the purpose of improving the financial position. I am afraid that he feels that I do not always accept his suggestions with the enthusiasm and gratitude which they deserve, but I can assure him that there is no ground for accusing us of any ungraciousness in this matter We are very glad to receive suggestions and to consider them, even though we find in the end that we cannot adopt them In all these taxation proposals, it is a question of taking money out of the pockets of the public, and one of the chief considerations which must be attended to is the question of the inconvenience which will be caused to the public as well as the actual pecuniary sacrifice they will be called upon to make That I think is the most important aspect of this case, but before I proceed to deal with it I should like to show to the Council exactly what the existing financial arrangements are

Up to 1906 a special receipt stamp was required in this country. It was not legal to use ordinary postage stamps for receipts. In 1906 the Government of India decided to follow the practice in England, and to allow postage stamps to be used for the purposes of receipts. This was of course convenient to the public, but it caused a certain amount of complication in the accounts, because postage stamps being sold by the Postal Department, the receipts are necessarily credited to that Department in the first instance. Then there was a second complication arising out of the fact that in 1906 as at the present day, the income from revenue stamps is a provincial asset, whereas the receipts from postage stamps are of course Imperial revenue. It was, therefore, necessary to transfer a sum from Imperial revenues to Provincial in order to compensate Provincial revenues for the loss of the revenue derived from the sale of receipt stamps. Now the system which the Government of India followed in fixing that compensation was this. They took the average sales of the special receipt stamps for 20 years and then added to that a liberal addition to allow for future growth of revenue. The figures are rather complicated but I will explain them as briefly as I can. In the old province of Bengal (excluding Assam) the receipts from the sale of these special revenue stamps in the year 1905-06 amounted to Rs. 4,61,000. The Government of India decided to give the combined province of Bengal and Assam a sum of Rs. 5,80,000 that is to say, Rs. 1,19,000 more than the receipts of the last year in which the special receipt stamps were sold. That I think the Council will agree was a liberal allowance. Not only that but they gave by far the larger part of the assignment to the province of Bengal. Bengal was given Rs. 4,70,000 of the total sum of Rs. 5,80,000 and the remaining Rs. 1,10,000 went to Eastern Bengal and Assam. In 1912 on the redistribution of the provinces, this assignment was further readjusted and again Bengal got the lion's share. Bengal got Rs. 4,00,000 Bihar got Rs. 60,000 and Assam Rs. 21,000. So, I think on the face of it the compensation was a fairly liberal assignment. I would ask the Council to follow the Bengal figures from 1905-06. The actual receipts from special stamps in 1905 were Rs. 3,61,000 in 1906 we got Rs. 4,70,000 in 1912 Rs. 4,90,000. When the Reforms came into force the matter was further considered in connection with the financial arrangements and the Government of India said that they were satisfied that any change in the existing system of grafted stamps would result in great inconvenience to the public and that the existing practice must, therefore, be retained. The existing credit of Rs. 4,99,000 on account of the loss of revenue due to the abolition of the revenue stamps was allowed for in the adjustment proposed by the Financial Relations Committee being included in the calculation regarding the percentage of growth of provincial revenues and of the increase in spending power under paragraphs 7 and 17 of their report. I need not tell Babu Surendra Nath Ray that we do not accept the proposals of the Financial Relations Committee regarding general

provincial revenues as in any way meeting our needs. The Council know that we have protested to the Government of India and asked for a reconsideration of the matter and we hope that our protest will bear fruit in the near future. But we need not go into this general question now. What I do say as regards this question of stamps is that we have, as a matter of fact, received quite a liberal assignment from the Government of India. There is no reason to suppose that it is insufficient; it is in fact larger than that given to any other province. Bengal gets Rs. 4,99,000, Madras Rs. 3,50,000 and Bombay Rs. 3,30,000. So much then for the existing financial arrangements. I say that on these figures we have not got much of a case for going up to the Government of India or anybody else and complaining that we have not been fairly treated. The main argument against the proposal of the mover is however the public inconvenience which a separate revenue stamp would cause. The mover apparently contemplates a special receipt stamp which could be used in Bengal alone. Now a stamp of that kind would be a nuisance to everybody and especially to the business community. I do not say it would be a very serious nuisance, but it would add to the minor worries of life, if we were to introduce special stamps which would be of no use outside the borders of Bengal. If we were going to make a decent profit out of it, it might be worth while asking the public to submit to this inconvenience, but we are by no means certain that we should make any money out of it at all. As I have shown we have got nearly Rs. 1,50,000 more than the value of the stamps actually sold fifteen years ago and I doubt very much whether in these 15 years the income from the receipt stamps has increased to this extent. Then again, it would cost us something to print a special Bengal stamp, whereas we do not pay anything for the printing of the postage stamps or for the services of the people who sell them in the post offices.

I think, therefore, that very likely there would be a loss rather than gain if we adopted this proposal. At any rate any gain that we might get would be so small that it would be not worth while inconveniencing the public by adopting this retrograde step. For these reasons, Sir, I am afraid Government is unable to accept the resolution.

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: The principal objection, or rather the objections of my hon'ble friend, Mr. Kerr, are first, if the receipt stamps are reintroduced, it would be a source of great inconvenience to the public. His second argument is that it may end in loss of revenue. He, moreover, says that the usage of England was introduced in the year 1906 in India and postage stamps were used for the purpose of receipts. Well, in England, I think, there are no two Governments. There is no Provincial Government and no Imperial Government. They have not to adjust their accounts in the way in which the Provincial Government of Bengal have to do with the Government of India. There is only one central Government in England which gets all the revenue.

We have been told that we have been very liberally treated by the Government of India and there may be loss if receipt stamps are reintroduced separately now. But we know very well that there has been loss all along the line. We have lost many things The income-tax is the principal source of our income That has not been given to us. If there be a loss of Rs 50,000 or a lakh by the issue of revenue stamps, we are quite willing to hazard the experiment At least it is an experiment worth trying. Nothing venture, nothing gain

As regards the inconvenience to the public, I say that we have used these receipt stamps up to the year 1906, that is for nearly half a century, and how can it be a source of inconvenience now if it is reintroduced in Bengal I have nothing more to add

A division was then taken with the following result

AYES.

Ahmed, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Wasimuddin.
Ahmed, Munshi Jafar.
Ali, Munshi Amir.
Ali, Munshi Ayub.
Arhamuddin, Maulvi Khandakar
Charmakar, Babu Rasik Chandra
Chaudhuri, Babu Tankanath.
Chaudhuri, Rai Harendranath
Das Gupta, Babu Nibaran Chandra.
De, Babu Fanindralal.
Dutta, Babu Annada Charan.
Dutta, Babu Indu Bhushan.
Ghose, Rai Bahadur Jogendra Chunder.
Haq, Shah Syed Emdadul.
Karim, Maulvi Abdul.
Karim, Maulvi Fazlal.
Khan, Maulvi Hamid ud din
Mitra, Rai Bahadur Mahendra Chandra
Maitra, Dr. Jatindra Nath,
Mukharji, Babu Satish Chandra.
Mullick, Babu Surendra Nath.
Ray, Babu Surendra Nath.
Roy, Babu Jogendra Krishna
Roy, Raja Manilall Singh.

NOES.

Addy, Babu Amulya Dhone.
Afzal, Nawabzada K M Khan Bahadur.
Ahmed, Maulvi Rafi Uddin
Aley Shaikh Mahboob
Azam, Khan Bahadur Khwaja Mahamed.
Banerjea the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath
Barma, Rai Sahib Panchanan.
Barton, Mr H.
Bhattacharji, Babu Hem Chandra.
Birley, Mr. L.
Bampas, Mr. C. H.
Bose, Mr. S M.
Cathcart, Mr M.
Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Hafizar Rahman.
Chaudhuri, Maulvi Shah Muhammad
Chaudhuri, the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali, Khan Bahadur.
Das, Babu Shishmadev.
Das, Rai Bahadur Amar Nath
Donald, Mr. J.
Farequi, Mr. K. C. M.
Gordon, Mr. A. D.
Gupta, Mr. N. B.
Hopkyns, Mr. W. S.
Hornell, Mr. W. W.
Huq, Maulvi Ekramul.
Karr, the Hon'ble Mr. J. H.
Khan, Maulvi Md. Rahque Uddin.
Lang, Mr. J.
Larmour, Mr. F. A.
Lees, Mr. D. H.
Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan, the Hon'ble.
Marr, Mr. A.
Mitter, the Hon'ble Mr. P. C
Mukhopadhaya, Babu Sarat Chandra.
Mullick, Babu Nirode Behary.
O'Kinealy, Lt.-Col. Frederick.
O'Malley, Mr. L. S. S.
Payne, Mr. C. F.
Poddar, Babu Kesheram.
Rahim, the Hon'ble Sir Abdur.
Rauf, Maulvi Shah Abdur,
Ray, Kumar Shib Shekharaswar.
Ray Choudhury, Raja Manmatha Nath.
Roy, Babu Bijoy Prosad Singh.
Roy, Mr. Tarit Bhusan.
Roy, Rai Bahadur Lalit Mohan Singh.
Salam, Khan Bahadur Abdus.
Stark, Mr. H. A.
Suhrawardy, Dr. Hassan
Watson-Smyth, Mr R. M
Wheeler, the Hon'ble Sir Henry.
Wordsworth, Mr. W. C.

The Ayes being 24 and the Noes 52, the motion was lost.

Postponement of Resolution.

Mr SYED ERFAN ALI being absent, the following resolution was, with the permission of the President, postponed and placed at the bottom of the List of Business: "This Council recommends to the Government that the Bengal Tenancy Act be so amended as -

(i) to secure fixity of rent for ever to the settled raiyats and to abolish the *utbandi* and the "tenant-at-will" system under the zamindars;

(ii) to secure to them the right of transference of *jotes*, whole or in part, the right of digging or re-excavating tanks, the right of planting and cutting trees, the right of building *pucca* or *kutcha* houses, and the digging of necessary earth free and at will, irrespective of the consent or permission of the superior landlord;

(iii) to make the collection of *abwabs* or illegal cesses, of any kind, and the levy of *begar*, or free, or concession labour, of any kind, a cognizable criminal offence;

(iv) to make the rent money-order in the zamindar's name in his sadar *kutcheri* a legal tender, and that raiyats be allowed to send in, in one money-order, the total amount of rent due on their different *jotes*, giving a descriptive account in a coupon or in a separate registered post-card or letter;

(v) to provide that in the case of money-orders for rent not taken delivery of in the *kutcheri* within one week after the last day of the *kist* the sender be free from the liability of paying interest;

(vi) to provide that zamindars be bound to send *gomastas* to collect rent in time, and that the liability of the *gomasta* to take rent, the issue of the cheque or rent-receipt should free the raiyat of the liability of paying interest; and

(vii) to provide that in the case of the refusal to receive rents in the *kutcheri*, the giving of due receipts on the part of the zamindar if proved, should be counted as an offence liable to an explanation to the Collector of the district, who should be empowered to appoint a receiver to collect the rent and allow compensation to be paid to any raiyat incurring unnecessary loss in tendering rent if such refusal is found repeatedly occurring to harass any raiyat."

Privilege leave of officers of the Bengal Civil Service (Judicial).

Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: "This Council recommends that the Government of India be moved to permit officers of the Bengal Civil Service (Judicial) to avail themselves of fifteen days' privilege leave on full pay each year."

I consider this to be a legitimate grievance of the Bengal Civil Service (Judicial). It is said that these officers do not get leave on full pay because they enjoy the vacation. But the fact of the matter is that there is not more than 15 days' difference approximately speaking between the number of holidays enjoyed by the officers of this service and that enjoyed by the officers of the Executive branch. In other words, the Judicial officers are not granted a single day's privilege leave on full pay simply because they enjoy, in the course of the year, 15 days' holiday more than their brethren in the Executive branch do. But for this, the latter get one month's privilege leave on full pay. Why then should not the former, I mean, the Judicial officers get privilege leave on full pay. It is admitted by the highest authorities that these officers are very hardworking and painstaking. They require rest sometimes. But as matters now stand they can earn their much needed rest only by submitting to the loss of half their monthly pay. There is no justification for keeping back from such a body of public servants the small concession, which my resolution urges. As regards the vacation theory, there can be no comparison between the members of the mufassal Judiciary and the officers of the Education Department and those of the High Court with whom they are bracketed together in article 271 of the Civil Service Regulations. The officers of the Education Department have got a long vacation of two months and a half, if not more, in the summer, while officers employed in the High Court enjoy a vacation extending at a stretch of over two months may more. With these words, I urge upon the Government to accept the resolution.

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: As regards this matter, the question relates to a subject which can only be finally dealt with by the Government of India. It is, I believe, one of the recommendations of the Public Services Commission. The subject has been under the consideration of the Government and the High Court, and we are now awaiting the decision of the Government of India, so we are not in a position to give any definite reply in this matter, but it is purely one of the proposals of the Public Services Commission and as such has been engaging the attention of the Government of India.

The mover pressed his motion to a division which resulted as follows:—

AYES.

Chaudhuri, Rai Harendranath.
Chaudhuri, Sir Asutosh.
Das, Babu Shishmadev.
Farequi, Mr. K. G. M.
Ghose, Rai Bahadur Jogendra Chunder.
Karim, Maulvi Abdul.
Karim, Maulvi Fazial.
Khan, Maulvi Md. Rafique Uddin.
Law, Raja Reshee Case.
Mitra, Rai Bahadur Mahendra Chandra.
Maitra, Dr. Jatindra Nath.
Mukharji, Babu Satish Chandra.
Mukhopadhaya, Babu Sarat Chandra.
Mullick, Babu Nirode Behary.
Ray, Babu Surendra Nath.
Roy, Babu Bijay Prosad Singh.
Roy, Babu Jogendra Krishna.
Sinha, Babu Surendra Narayan.
Suhrawardy, Dr. Hassan.
Suhrawardy, Mr. H. S.

NOES.

Addy, Babu Amulya Dhone.	Das Gupta, Babu Nibaran Chandra.
Ahmed, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Wasimuddin.	De, Babu Fanindralal.
Ahmed, Munshi Jafar.	Dutta, Babu Annada Charan.
Aley, Shaikh Mahboob.	Gordon, Mr. A. D.
Ali, Munshi Amir.	Huq, Maulvi Ekramul.
Ali, Munshi Ayub.	Larmour, Mr. F. A.
Barma, Rai Sahib Panchanan.	Makramali, Munshi.
Barton, Mr. H.	Mullick, Babu Surendra Nath.
Bhattacharji, Babu Hem Chandra.	Nasker, Babu Hem Chandra.
Bose Mr. S. M.	Poddar, Babu Keshoram.
Cathcart, Mr. M.	Rauf, Maulvi Shah Abdur.
Charmakar, Babu Rasik Chandra.	Salam, Khan Bahadur Abdus.
Chaudhuri, Babu Tankanath.	Sarkar, Babu Rishindra Nath.
Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Nafizar Rahman.	Stark, Mr. H. A.
	Watson-Smyth, Mr. R. M.

The Ayes being 20 and the Noes 29, the motion was lost.

Inclusion of Darjeeling within the Reforms Scheme.

Sir ASUTOSH CHAUDHURI: "This Council recommends to the Government that a representation be made to the Government of India urging upon that Government the desirability of including the district of Darjeeling within the Reforms Scheme for the province of Bengal."

I do not think that much need be said in support of this resolution. Why Darjeeling was excluded is difficult for us to understand. I find from Notification No. 2 G., dated the 3rd January, 1921, of the Government of India published in the *Calcutta Gazette Extraordinary*) of the same date, that the district of Darjeeling has been declared to be a backward tract and excluded from the Reforms Scheme. So far as the expression "backward tract" is concerned, I find that the Government of Bengal does not accept it. In fact the Government of Bengal said that this district did not answer to the description of "backward tracts" as given in paragraph 199 of the Report. Then the question comes to this: how is the district backward? If it is a question of education, I find that the Government of India admit that the percentage of the literary population of the district is well above the average of the Presidency, and that the exclusion of the Darjeeling district is considered as a doubtful proposal. Apparently the Government was led to come to this conclusion upon a memorial which was presented to His Excellency the Viceroy and the Secretary of State for India by an influential body of memorialists. That influential body was led, according to what I find from the Report, by a Deputy Superintendent of Police, Mr. Laden La. I have the honour of knowing him. He is an excellent officer and socially he is also excellent in organising amusements. The deputation included among its members a very worthy individual—a billiard marker. I will tell you the name of the Association to which he belongs: it is the Gymkhana Club in which Mr. MacKenzie takes a very active part. Well, the billiard marker is a respectable individual and sometimes a great deal depends upon him. Another member of that deputation was a still worthier man, namely, the

durwan, caretaker or the chowkidar of the Raja of Dighapatia's house at Darjeeling. I do not know who the others were, but I am free to confess that the deputation was worthily led. Anyhow, it had the effect of making the Government shrink back from an obvious duty. Following that memorial, I find that there was another memorial sent up by a large number of people. How that meeting was held and the memorial was sent up and who the signatories were I will tell you. There were about 275 hillmen whose names appear in the proceedings, and resolutions appear to have been passed at a meeting held on the 13th March, 1920, at which they adopted this memorial. Examining the constitution of that body, we find very estimable persons composed it. Amongst the persons who were present at that meeting, there were 10 dandywallahs, 35 rickshawallas, 28 milk sellers or gowalas, 8 bearers and table boys, 7 butlers, 29 contractors including petty contractors and 78 more whose occupations are unknown. The memorial sent up by these people is of course very valuable. The country is getting democratic and one cannot ignore them, and everyone is anxious to take note of their opinion, but when we find as against that memorial another memorial sent up by five hundred Gurkhas was ignored one begins to ask how the thing was worked. The last memorial I was referring to, was sent up shortly after the memorial which was presented by Mr. Laden La. Mr. Laden La's memorial speaks of a very large number of representative men, persons belonging to the district and refers to Lepchas, Bhutias and Nepalese. The second memorial that I referred to was a memorial from a very large number of Gurkhas and Nepalese. So far as the Lepchas and the Bhutias are concerned I find that the former constitutes 3·65 per cent. of the total population, and the Bhutias 4·06. So far as the Gurkhas are concerned they form 54 per cent. of the population and yet the memorial by these people was apparently ignored. In this connection I should like to place before you the grounds which were made in the first memorial. The deputation headed by Mr. Laden La said:—

> We have treated the movement for Home Rule with neglect and even with disfavour. There is no real affinity between the people of these Himalayan and sub-Himalayan regions and those of the plains of Bengal. Geographically, racially, historically, religiously, and linguistically, we have no alliance with the rest of Bengal. Religiously we are, as regards the Lepchas and the races of Tibetan origin as well as members of the Nepalese caste quite distinct from the people of the plains, even the religious customs of the Nepalese who are classed as Hindus vary largely from those of the Hindus of Bengal.

That is what they asserted; but I find in the memorial submitted by the Gurkhas that the "Gurkhas are Aryans and therefore quite distinct from the Mongolians and other races inhabiting Darjeeling and the adjoining hills" and that "Home Rule is necessary in India". A memorial from a people who constitute the majority of the population asserts that they consider Home Rule to be necessary. Mr. Laden La, his durwan friend and the billiard marker however say that they look upon the Reforms Scheme with disfavour. Their opinion has got to be taken into

account. But is the Council going to accept an opinion of this character against the opinion of the people who have a real interest in the matter? The Gurkhas are not a backward people. I find that there are a large number of graduates coming from amongst them and they have fought for the British Government; whereas Mr. Laden La says that he and his friends claim to defend the frontiers and they have the right to do so and therefore their voice ought to be heard. One has never heard of them as fighting a single battle for the British. But we must not forget that the opinion of these gentlemen has prevailed against the opinion of a larger body of people. In this connection I find also that meetings were held and memorials were sent up by other bodies which have been ignored. The real truth is that the planters opposed it and they carried the day. But why did they oppose it? It is because they were afraid of the Bengali Ministers 'a terrible triumvirate' There we have the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea, the Hon'ble Mr. P. C. Mitter and the Hon'ble Nawab Sahib, but you have not found them at all terrible. So far as this House is concerned, we are very pleased with all of them and I do not think that you will accept the opinion of the planters that there are terrible possibilities behind them My submission to you is that Darjeeling had votes with regard to elections before the last one The Darjeeling Municipality is, I think, one of the biggest in Bengal Darjeeling is a large centre; it has an educated population, a large educated population and in fact it shelters the Bengal Government for a little time every year rightly or wrongly. Then we have two big subdivisions Kurseong which is also a populous place and Kalimpong is growing every day These are the three big centres and I do not see any reason why Darjeeling should be excluded from the operation of the Reforms Scheme There is a considerable feeling about this matter and I beg of you to accept the resolution which I have the honour to move

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: I have great pleasure in supporting this resolution. As my friend, Sir Asutosh Chaudhuri, has said, we do not know exactly why Darjeeling, which had enjoyed the benefits of the Morley-Minto Reforms and which used to send a representative, or at least had a voice in the election of a representative to the Bengal Legislative Council since the elective system was introduced, should have been by this Montagu-Chelmsford scheme debarred from doing it. It is said that there was a deputation composed of some very estimable and respectable gentlemen which waited upon His Excellency the Viceroy and the Right Hon'ble the Secretary of State, when he came to India. Sir Ashutosh Chaudhuri wanted to quote from the memorial, but he had not it handy: I have got it and I shall quote the exact passage from that representation. The hillmen said:-

> We have hitherto abstained from all political agitation and we have treated the movement for Home Rule with neglect and even disfavour But now that the British Government has definitely stated that Home Rule is the ultimate goal towards which it desires that India should gradually proceed, *we feel it our duty*

to safeguard our future position by presenting Government with a statement of our views on one point which seems to us of vital importance.

They are all loyal subjects and they did not like to force the hands of the Government like the agitators of Bengal and other provinces of India. And what is the reward they have got for their loyalty? They have been treated as a backward people and they will have nothing to do with, and will have no voice in the affairs of the country. As has been stated by Sir Ashutosh Chaudhuri, it is well known that the Darjeeling municipality is one of the most important municipalities of Bengal, and that it had a very potent voice in the election of a member to the Bengal Legislative Council: it had about 8 or 10 votes, and these votes used to carry great weight in the election of a member. The gentlemen who could get the support of Darjeeling was, I think, almost sure of success in getting himself returned to the Bengal Council. Then, the Muhammadans of Darjeeling had also a voice, and they have been debarred from giving their votes by the present arrangements, also the tea-planting community have been debarred, but we have been told that the tea-planting communities do not like to get the benefits of the Reforms Scheme, but we must remember that there are besides the European planting community the Indian planting community as well in Darjeeling. There are also the landholders, and we should like to know whether the Indian planting community and the landholders have said that they do not want to get the benefits of the Reforms Scheme.

Mr. Prasad: Sir Ashutosh Chaudhuri has already stated that the Gurkhas made a representation to the Government of India, when they came to know that a representation had already been made by the hillmen. Well, it is well known that the Lepchas and Tibetans are all Mongolians, and that they have no affinity with the people of Bengal, whereas the Gurkhas like the Bengalis are Aryans. I shall quote from Census figures and shall show that the Gurkhas made a representation to Government, in which they stated that they form about 54 per cent. of the population, and that the Lepchas and Tibetans form about 3·5 per cent. They said

In 1835 when Dr. Campbell was Superintendent of Darjeeling, the population was hardly 100 souls. Since then the Nepalese were induced to immigrate into Darjeeling where they steadily settled in increasing numbers and the latest Census put the numbers in Darjeeling to be 265,550. They are a pushing and thriving race, and the Hon'ble Mr. O'Malley thus mentions about them in the Darjeeling District Gazetteer: "The dominant race in Darjeeling is the Nepalese which, with a strength of 134,000, accounts for more than half the population. They are a capable, cheerful and alert people."

Then there was a further representation to the Government of India and the Secretary of State on the 24th May, 1920, by the Gurkhas, and they quoted from the Ninth Despatch on Indian Constitutional Reforms, in which we find the following:—

The exclusion of the Darjeeling district is a more doubtful proposal. It is entirely composed of mountains and *forat* and its inhabitants are mostly of

Mongolian origin, among whom Nepalese, Lepchas, Bhutias and Tibetans are numerous, while in the *tarai* there are large numbers of aborigines from Chota Nagpur and Santhal Parganas. The percentage of the literate population is well above the average for the presidency, but this is possibly due to the considerable Christian population.

That may be, but why should the Christian population be deprived of the benefits of the Reforms Scheme.

Then we find that the following significant passage in their representation of the 24th May, 1920:—

In asking for Reforms they do not for a moment think of encroaching upon any party's interests, what they mean is Reforms with adequate representation in the Council to safeguard their interests, thereby giving them a proper chance of evolving their destiny peacefully under the British direction and guardianship.

Further on they say that the Sikhs of the Punjab and Anglo-Indians and Europeans have been granted separate communal representation and they add:—

No amount of argument can convince them how they are excluded, when their brothers-in-arms, the Sikhs, are included. It is asserted that "the Sikhs in the Punjab are a distinct and important people, they supply a gallant and valuable element to the Indian Army, but they are everywhere in a minority and experience has shown that they go virtually unrepresented. To the Sikhs therefore, and to them alone, we propose to extend the system already adopted in the case of Muhammadans . . . ."

The PRESIDENT: A great deal of all this has been said by Sir Asutosh Chaudhuri.

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: Sir Asutosh Chaudhuri has not quoted these passages from the representation, in which it is mentioned that the Sikhs have been granted separate representation. If that is so, there is no reason why the Gurkhas should not be given such representation, when it is well known that they have sacrificed their lives so much for the British Government.

Then, as regards literacy, I may quote the following from the same representation:

According to Census of 1911, the number of literate persons per 1,000 of the total population of the district of Darjeeling was 169 males and 19 females against 99 males and 4 females in Jalpaiguri, 108 males and 4 females in Dinajpur and 76 males and 3 females in Rangpur.

The number of persons literate in English per 10,000 of the district of Darjeeling was 306 males and 101 females against 75 males and 3 females in Jalpaiguri, 52 males and 1 female in Dinajpur and 52 males and 2 females in Rangpur.

These figures conclusively show that the people of Darjeeling are more advanced from the educational point of view than the people of Jalpaiguri and Rangpur, and we find that whereas Jalpaiguri and Rangpur have been given the benefits of the Reforms Scheme, the people of Darjeeling have been unjustly excluded. With these remarks, I beg to support the resolution.

Mr. S. M. BOSE: I wish to thank the mover of the resolution for having brought to the notice of the Council a great piece of injustice done to the people of Darjeeling. The history of this injustice affords melancholy reading; it shows how a small but powerful section has so long been able to induce the Government to run counter to the wishes of the people for, as has been already said, the exclusion has been mainly due to the activities of the Darjeeling Planters' Association. I do not wish to repeat the facts which have already been referred to by the previous speakers, but I desire to lay stress on the fact that Darjeeling is not a backward area; it does not satisfy the definition of the term "backward area" as given in paragraph 199 of the Joint Report and it has, as has already been pointed out, been admitted by the Government of Bengal. It may be urged that the people desire exclusion, but that is not so. A very large number—over 54 per cent. of the population—desire to be included within the Reforms Scheme. The real persons who oppose this inclusion are the handful of planters. Instead of *Swaraj*, they wanted *planter-raj*. In their memorial to the Government of Bengal, the Planters' Association had the hardihood to say that the hill people strongly resented being placed in any way under Bengali Ministers and that any attempt to do so would give rise to a political situation which their Association contemplated with grave alarm. So utterly infeasible is this exclusion that I am not surprised to hear that there is a strong rumour that the Reforms Scheme will be extended to Darjeeling in 1924. But this belated piece of justice will not satisfy the people. I submit that Darjeeling should never have been excluded, and there is no reason why there should be a single day's delay. Denial of franchise to Darjeeling is denial of justice. I therefore hope that Government will take immediate steps to remedy this grievance of the people of the Darjeeling district.

Babu NIBARAN CHANDRA DAS GUPTA: I have not to make a long speech in supporting this resolution. It is quite evident, that the planters of Darjeeling were moved to seek the services of a few hillmen in organizing, what they described as a Hillmen's Association, with the sole object, it seems to me, to have a separate province, where they could reign supreme as in Olympia for the gods, but these gods living in the Himalayas do not live there for purpose of contemplation, but for purposes of making money. The personnel of the Hillmen's Association has been very humorously described by Sir Asutosh Chaudhuri, and it appears strange that such a movement manufactured and engineered by a particular class of men should have hoodwinked the Secretary of State and the Government of India too, in excluding Darjeeling from the Reforms Scheme. Darjeeling, which is a part and parcel of this province and which had hitherto the right of electing a member to the Bengal Legislative Council, has been deprived of this right for no reason whatsoever. Nor did the Government find it practicable to act up to the wishes of the planters in having a separate province, composed of the districts of Darjeeling, Jalpaiguri, the Duars and so forth. That being so, it strikes

us that the Right Hon'ble the Secretary of State could not see through the designs of these men and did this sort of injustice to the people of Darjeeling. While the whole country was aglow with enthusiasm on account of the coming reforms, the people of Darjeeling only felt that they had been deprived of their right of electing a member to the Bengal Legislative Council. It is quite time that the franchise should be extended to the people of Darjeeling; and I do not like to go over the grounds which have already been traversed with regard to the qualifications of the men of Darjeeling to exercise the franchise. A very large number of men live in the town of Darjeeling. It is not a backward place and, as it has been already stated, the Municipality of Darjeeling is a very big one. I think it can boast of a better Town Hall than the metropolis of Bengal. So, under these circumstances, it is our bounden duty to ask the Government of Bengal to move the Government of India, and, if necessary, the British Parliament for removing this anomaly and for doing an act of bare justice to Darjeeling.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: I beg to support this resolution. I do not wish it, however, to go forth to the world that this Council of Bengalis described the Bhutias and Tibetans as mere dandiwallas. That expression should never have been used. We Bengalis, ought to know what a debt of gratitude we owe to the Tibetans, when Bukhtiar Khilji conquered Bengal and destroyed the books of India, most of what remained were taken to Tibet and they are still to be found there. The civilization of Tibet was in no way inferior to the civilization of India and the Tibetans ruled over Nepal and a very large part of Bengal. That fact should not be forgotten. The fact that Atisa Dwipankara, who hailed from Bikrampur, went to Tibet should not be forgotten. It should not be forgotten what close relationship existed at the time between Tibet and Bengal. Next, as to the main question we know what petitions are worth; they are put up by wirepullers. Government should decide the question on the merits of the case; and the best thing would be to give the Tibetans a seat in this Council and also the Gurkhas and Lepchas another seat. We should like very much that the Gurkhas and Lepchas should begin to come to the wider life of India. From this large view of the matter, I do hope that Government should include Darjeeling and also extend to it the privileges of communal representation which have been extended to the Muhammadans. If this view is taken, I am sure even the dandiwallas of Darjeeling will not object.

Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ: I have great pleasure in supporting the resolution of Sir Ashutosh Chaudhuri. I find that the tea planters have come in for a great deal of criticism. They were a power in the land and it is not unnatural that they do not like another power to set itself up side by side with them. Is it not a fact that even in this Council itself we find ourselves wrangling with one another when the question of supremacy comes in? Is it not that only the other day when Maulvi Yakuinuddin

Ahmed brought in a measure which sought to give some of their rights to the tenants and some of the zamindars tried their best to oppose it? So it was quite natural that the planters opposed the inclusion of Darjeeling under the Reforms. All that it is necessary is that it should be our effort that justice be done to all people. Here we find that a wrong has been done somehow or other, and it is for us to see that it is remedied and I hope that when the recommendation goes from this Council, it will have the desired effect.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: In so far as whatever action was taken in connection with Darjeeling in its relation to the Reforms Scheme, was based upon the very palpably distinctive features of that district and upon the express wish, which was most carefully ascertained so far as it could be ascertained of the most influential sections of the people of that district, it is somewhat amusing in these days, when we hear so much of self-determination, to find these claims waived aside so lightly as has been done to-day; and I am not sure, after hearing the debate this afternoon, that these hillmen were not wise in expressing a preference at any rate to be allowed for the present to work out their destinies in their own way rather than to submit them to three eminent citizens of Calcutta and to two gentlemen whose names we had the pleasure of seeing this year in the list of temporary visitors to the hills.

My objections to Sir Ashutosh Chaudhuri's proposals are based on general and on specific grounds, and I will deal with the general grounds first. He is asking us at a time when the Reforms Scheme has scarcely been six months in working, to propose an alteration of one of its details. Now, quite apart from fundamental differences of principle, there are many details connected with the Reforms Scheme about which there were differences of opinion. As instances, I may mention the representation of Europeans, the representation of the zamindars and the representation of Indian commercial interests, while it would be easy to add half a dozen more. Are we in so short a space of time, at the instance of any particular section, to propose to the Secretary of State a reopening of the whole question? I venture to think that that is not a desirable or a workable proposition.

To turn to the particular case. The action which was taken was based on the fundamental differences existing between the Darjeeling district and the rest of Bengal—differences which seem so palpable that they scarcely need elaboration in detail, either linguistically or geographically or in any other direction. As has been said this afternoon, a deputation waited upon the Viceroy and Mr. Montagu and strongly pressed this point of view; and what we are now asked to believe is that, under the malign influence of Mr. Laden La, a bluff was put up on the innocent Mr. Montagu and the still more innocent Lord Chelmsford—a bluff, too, connived at by the Deputy Commissioner, the Commissioner of the Division and whatever officials were cognisant of the true facts. Now, was that even likely, even though Mr. Laden La happened to be a Deputy

Superintendent of Police? While, as everybody knows, Mr. Laden La is an absolutely typical hillman and an influential representative of the views of many of his kind. But apart from the improbability of that deputation having been a bluff, it was verified in the succeeding year (1918) by the Deputy Commissioner, who again represented to us that he had been waited upon by 20 influential hillmen, who repeated the same requests as were contained in the memorial. There, again, are we to believe that the Deputy Commissioner, who had been several years in the district, was imposed upon at the instance of these wicked and deceitful people? On the basis of that representation, which we verified to the best of our ability, the proposal was put up to the Government of India for the exclusion of this tract.

When it was sent to the Government of India, it was carefully examined, and I frankly admit that the Government of India did not at first wish to exclude this district if it could possibly be helped, and they put an alternative proposal before us—details of which need not be given here—but regarding which I may say that it was criticised unfavourably as being an impossible half-way house between the only real alternatives of total inclusion or total exclusion. In view of the arguments urged by us, however, the Government of India eventually accepted our view, and recommended to the Secretary of State the exclusion of Darjeeling. Other evidence accumulated during this time as to the correctness of our view. There were at least two influential meetings held at Darjeeling in support of it, and I have got here the lists of attendance at those meetings which include many hillmen. It is a travesty of the facts to say that these meetings were non-representative and got up at the instance of disgruntled tea-planters. Later local intrigues and jealousies got to work, and we had protests on the other side. Sir Asutosh Chaudhuri, in unfavourably criticising the first deputation, has given us to understand that all the evidence on which we relied is of little weight. Fortunately, when these jealousies developed, we made inquiries of Mr. Goode, the Deputy Commissioner, as to their true origin, and I have here his note in which he tells us something of those representatives who were working on the other side. I need not enter into details of local intrigue, but as to the personnel here are some particulars. In referring to a meeting at Kalimpong, Mr. Goode says that it was presided over by a retired sub-inspector of police. Personally, of course, I do not consider that a disqualification, though some of our critics ordinarily would. But the note says that he did not understand for what purpose the meeting had been called and that he did not know English. Amongst those present were A. B., a dismissed head clerk of the khas mahal office, and B. C. D., who was formerly a manager of a local press. Then Mr. Goode goes on with the signatories of another memorial, and states that a gentleman who was described as a B.A. was not a B.A. at all, and had been in Sikkim since the beginning of April, which raised doubts whether he had signed the memorial at all. About 20 of the signatories are said to be school-boys of the high English

school; another, one of the assistant masters, whose political antecedents were not free from reproach, represented the Bengali agitation which was the chief element among the Siliguri memorialists. Several of the names of signatories were in the same handwriting and presumably represented illiterate persons. E. F. was a dismissed sub-inspector of police. G. H. possessed one pony which he hired out. J.K. was a tea-shop servant. Other signatories were masons, coolies, chaprasies, butchers, vegetable-sellers, small shop-keepers and motor-drivers, while two vernacular names merely meant a second son and a youngest son. I put it to the Council whether, in face of this, Sir Ashutosh Chaudhuri has not perhaps been somewhat unwise in accepting as gospel truth the representations of these men and their friends.

Well, Sir, as I have said, the Government of India represented our view to the Secretary of State, by whom it was provisionally accepted. But at the same time the Secretary of State expressed a desire which of course will be loyally followed that opportunities should be given in this Council for the discussion of matters appertaining to the Darjeeling district and the answering of questions relating to its local affairs. This has been provided for in the notification and, so far as need be, will be ensured by executive action. I should add that the Secretary of State also in his provisional acceptance made it conditional on the preparation of a scheme of local self-government. That is at present being worked out and proposals are being formulated. When effect is given to it, the wishes of the local people can be more easily ascertained. And I put it to the Council, apart from the general argument against discussing anew individual items of the Reform Scheme at so early a date, is it not wiser, even in the case of Darjeeling, to wait and see how this plan of local self-government develops? It is perfectly possible that in future years the local people, having had more experience of the working of this Council, may wish their position to be reconsidered. The proper time to do so will naturally be when the next election of this Council comes on, in about two and a half years' time. Until the next election it would be impossible to enfranchise those in the district who would vote on the general electoral rolls of zamindars, Europeans, etc., and that fact points to a period two years hence, that is to say, six months before the next election, as the natural time for re-opening the question. By then the local Government will be in a position to consider the matter after watching the development of local self-government and ascertaining the wishes of the local people. But I submit that a recommendation of this kind at the present moment is neither opportune nor wise.

Sir ASUTOSH CHAUDHURI: Sir, I have very little to add to what I have already said. I may say, however, that I did not use any adjectives when I was referring to Mr. Laden La the adjectives are due to the literary proclivities of Sir Henry Wheeler.

No doubt Sir Henry Wheeler has brought before the House certain facts with regard to two meetings to which I did not make any specific

reference. It may be that Mr. Laden La led the one and a dismissed police officer led the other. It is perfectly possible that a defunct police-officer was played off against the other one.

Nor is it necessary for me to say that the Secretary of State and His Excellency the Viceroy were "bluffed." We have been engaged in the game of bluff for a great many years. Whenever Bengal submitted representations during the partition signed by lakhs we were told that it was merely bluff. In this case we have a representation by an insignificant number of people and we are told that they were not indulging in the game of bluff. Bluff requires a definition, which has never been found yet.

So far as Sir Henry Wheeler's assurance is concerned, that the whole question will be reconsidered two years hence, and six months before the next election, we are somewhat surprised that a promise of that kind should be made. It is interesting to note that we who have been endeavouring to get some sort of reforms for years have not yet been thought fit for the larger privileges we have claimed, but the hill people of the Darjeeling district will be found qualified in two years time for reforms when the period of training for them will be a short one. We have had a long time to wait and some people still doubt if we are fit, but the hill people apparently have succeeded improving that they will be fit within such a short time. They are to be congratulated.

So far as the hill people are concerned, if literacy is a test, it is a fact that they are not less literate than other people in this province and if we come to compare these people with some of the people in other districts in Bengal what difference do we find? None at all. There is no reason for not extending the same privileges which have been extended to us.

I am confident that the resolution will commend itself to this House.

The motion was then put and agreed to.

Investigation regarding beriberi and epidemic dropsy in Bengal.

Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: "This Council recommends to the Government that an investigation be forthwith undertaken into the prevalence of beriberi and epidemic dropsy in Bengal, with a view to discovering the best means of preventing the spread of these diseases."

The resolution is with reference to the public health question. In moving this resolution I cannot help confessing to a feeling of despair as to the future of this country. Bengal has become the breeding ground of epidemic and the health position of the country is daily growing worse. Like other epidemics beriberi and its concomitant epidemic dropsy have also come to stay. And the necessity of the

time is to make proper investigation as to the cause or causes of its spread and to adopt prompt remedial measures. Dietetic experiments in the Philippines have confirmed the view that it is a disorder depending upon an imperfect dietary.

In the Straits Settlements and Malay it has been the cause of high mortality and Japanese sailors, soldiers, and prisoners in jail, prior to 1884, were frequently disabled by beriberi. Recent researches have shown it to be a deficiency disease caused by a deficiency in the essential substance in dietary.

2. The two epidemics are very prevalent among the Malayese, Chinese, and Japanese and during the Russian War, more than 50,000 cases occurred in the Japanese Army. The disease prevails excessively in the Philippines. In India the labouring classes and the poor are markedly affected, and for the last three or four years the disease is causing enormous economic loss and efficiency of labour has also been seriously affected.

The disease is also prevalent in Bengal, especially in the Howrah, Hooghly, Burdwan and other districts and makes a large addition to the death roll of the country.

It has been stated that this disease is due to a diet of rice from which the pericarp has been removed in what is called "polishing and milling." It has been also said that Takogi eradicated beriberi from the Japan Navy by modifying rice diet.

In Malay healthy coolies fed on white rice developed beriberi whereas others living on brown rice remained healthy. In Bengal the classes affected generally take *Rangoon rice*. The chief deficiency between Bengal and Rangoon rice is that the latter is deprived of its sub pericarpal layers *i.e.* so-called beriberi Vitamine. According to Funk, this substance when not present in the food, causes the breakdown of the nerve tissues and gives rise to the signs and symptoms of beriberi. Some research work in Bengal was undertaken in the Medical College Hospital in 1919-20 by Lieutenant-Colonel D. McCay, I.M.S., to determine the cause and the best means for prevention, but up to now no report has been submitted or published, nor does the Government seem to have taken any action to fight out the disease as yet. Much has been done to prevent the disease particularly in Japan. There has been more remarkable triumph of modern Hygiene than Takogi's dietetic returns in the Japanese Navy. Everywhere in the East a change in the diet has been followed by the disappearance of the disease.

Now that the widespread character of the disease cannot be disputed and high medical authorities are of opinion that diseases of this character are preventible, I ask this Council to accord their support to this resolution.

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: I think, Sir, I shall best discharge my duty and consult the convenience of the House

and save its time if I say at once that I accept the resolution of my hon'ble friend subject to one very small modification—the elimination of only one word in the second line of his resolution. The hon'ble member wants a committee to be appointed "forthwith." It is somewhat mandatory, somewhat peremptory even when it comes from my hon'ble friend. I have no doubt that he will agree to modify the peremptory nature of his demand, and in that case I would be glad to accept his resolution.

Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: I accept the modification, Sir. I have always thought however that the Government coach moves very slowly. That is the reason why I used the word "forthwith".

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: Yes, the movements of Government are slow, as it must move according to conditions, circumstances and opportunities. I am glad that my hon'ble friend has agreed to omit the word thus making it possible for me to accept the resolution.

I am sure we have all listened with very great interest and I may say with no little admiration to the exhaustive dissertation of my hon'ble friend who has gone fully into the causes of the disease, the range of its scope, etc., etc. And in this view, it struck me, as I was listening to his speech, that perhaps it was not necessary, when my hon'ble friend himself was prepared to enlighten the Council to have a committee at all. I may point out to my hon'ble friend, however, that Government have not being sleeping over this matter. My friend has mentioned a certain inquiry which was initiated by Colonel McCay but which could not be finished by him. I also desire to call attention to the expert investigation made by Colonel Creagh. His reports contain very useful information which will be found to be vey helpful. Dr. Bentley last year applied to the Government of India for an expert for investigation into the causes of beriberi. His request could not be granted and so the inquiry could not be held. The inquiry of course would depend on funds. Dr. Bentley was of opinion that a sum of Rs. 20,000 would be needed. I am sure if the House accepts this resolution, the money would be provided. That being so, I accept the resolution in its modified form.

The motion was put in the modified form and agreed to.

Condition of the Saraswati river.

Babu SATISH CHANDRA MUKHARJI: "This Council recommends to the Government that early steps be taken to inquire into the present condition of the Saraswati river, in the districts of Hooghly and Howrah, and to adopt measures to clear the same and to widen and deepen the said river to admit a flow of fresh water."

This river, I suppose, is well known to many of the hon'ble members, and I will not deal with it at length this afternoon. It will suffice to say

that the village Satgong situated on its banks was known as the royal port of Bengal. Many populous villages stand on both banks of the river, but the present condition of those villages is too deplorable to be described. Malaria and cholera are causing a havoc in these villages. This river serves three-fold purposes—it serves the purposes of irrigation, drinking water and also of the drainage of the country. We say that it is a very narrow channel and the water during many months of the year is undrinkable and the people absolutely get no water. Moreover, the little water that can be found in the river is overgrown with water-hyacinth. Besides there is another matter which has been neglected. There are bunds, there are embankments and bridges thrown across the river and the result is that the river is going to be killed. The river is called "Notified River." I do not know under what section and of what law it has been notified. It is a very important river. It passes through two important districts of Bengal, *viz.*, Hooghly and Howrah. Therefore, I have brought this to the notice of the Hon'ble Minister in charge of Sanitation. Now, Sir, the demand embodied in the resolution is a very modest one and consists of three parts: firstly, a request for inquiry into its present condition; secondly, to adopt measures to clear the river of water-hyacinth and other weeds so that the people living on both sides of the river may safely use the water; and thirdly, to widen and deepen the said river. The only objection that may be urged against the adoption of this resolution is the question of costs, but I am quite confident that the costs that may have to be incurred to carry out this resolution may be realised from the people living on both sides of the river.

Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: I beg to support this resolution. I have taken much interest in regard to the excavation of this river, and in the old Council in the year 1918, I brought the matter to the notice of Government and I find that some effective steps have been taken. The river goes from Bhagirathi near Rajganj and ends in Triberi which is in the district of Hooghly. Government were pleased to allow a certain sum of money. I now forget the actual amount—it was more than a lakh of Rupees, and afterwards another grant of Rs. 40,000. I do not know why the work did not proceed, probably on account of want of funds. But it is necessary, highly necessary, that Government should take effective steps for its excavation. If I describe the condition of the villages on both sides of the Saraswati, once a broad, navigable river; if I describe the insanitary condition of the lands close by, if I describe to you the health of the people of the locality, if I describe to you the actual diseases which are occurring in those localities, I am sure that there will not be one of dissentient voice in advocating the resolution. Now I have personally seen the condition of the river and I have seen that trees have grown on some parts of the silted up lands. The question therefore is—we are talking about public health, we are formulating schemes here and there—the vital question is as regards the driving away of malaria from the soil. Malaria is our greatest enemy, and if we can get rid of it, I am

sure prosperity will come back to Bengal, otherwise not. The Minister in charge of Sanitation told us one day that if he got money he would be in a position to drive malaria out of the country within a short time. But as regards the question of money that is for Government to consider. I consider the health problem is a very important one, and the attention of our Minister ought to be first directed towards this matter. That is all that we can say. It is for Government to find out the money; it is for us to advise Government what is to be done. If the whole scheme is before the Council then it will be necessary for us to discuss the whole matter. We are perfectly in the dark as to what steps had been taken and what steps Government propose to take. Our earnest desire is that Government should take the whole matter into their consideration.

Babu FANINDRALAL DE: The history of the Saraswati is a tragedy. From the once well-known river, it has now dwindled into a mere streamlet, unnavigable even after the rain. It is mentioned as far back as in the twelfth century, in Muhammadan inscriptions and books and even in the maps of Valentine (1660-70) where it is shown as a large stream. Then began its deterioration as is shown in Rennel's Map in 1779-81, and half a century ago it was a dead river represented merely by a chain of pools. Water was then let into it in connection with the Eden Canal Scheme, by a cut from Kana Nadi near Gopalnagar and it became a running tiny stream though much silted up. The banks of the Saraswati are very densely populated, and the river is the only source of water-supply to the villagers, both for irrigation and domestic purposes, there being no tanks worth speaking of, in many villages, particularly in the Singur police-station, in the district of Hooghly. Between 1912 and 1916, certain correspondence passed between the representatives of the abovementioned villages and the Sanitary Commissioner of Bengal regarding the flow of water in Saraswati. The matter was subsequently taken up by the Government and a continuous flow was maintained, till the beginning of the current year, when the flow ceased in portions in the Singur police-station. The condition of the people of the adjacent villages during the hot season, with the bed of the streamlet entirely dried up and choked with rank vegetation can be better imagined than described.

Petitions were submitted, but the usual procedure prevented prompt action, in spite of the extreme urgency of the matter.

The people were compelled to have recourse to the unwholesome water-supply of the insanitary *dobas* for drinking and other domestic purposes, the inevitable result being the outbreak of cholera and other bowel complaints in these villages. Even the *dobas* were drying up and the people had the dreary prospect of absolute want of water-supply, when fortunately the rain came. There is an anti-malarial drainage scheme of the Saraswati in Howrah in progress, but the immediate need of the people is the reclamation of certain parts of the river in the Hooghly district, particularly from Nasipur and Magra. I therefore, earnestly

request the authorities to take up the matter in hand immediately and redress the indescribable sufferings of the people

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: Belonging to the district of Hooghly, I feel it my duty to support this resolution and to say a few words in connection with it. I know the river Saraswati itself, I know its present deplorable condition, I know that it has ceased to be a river long ago. I further know what troubles have arisen in the whole of the locality to which she used to supply water before from the point of view of sanitation. The great pity is that a question like this cannot but bring disappointment. Resolutions might be passed, but Government will pay very little attention to them. The question of sanitation does not affect the Europeans much. It is a matter which has received very scanty attention from Government and it is well-known. You may pass any number of resolutions, but the fact is that Government will not care for them. If it were the Police, many a stalwart would have stood up and gone on asking for more and more. But when it is the question of sanitation, I say with all the responsibility that I have that there is a perfect and systematic neglect on the part of Government. Why? because it is the poor Indians who suffer in this matter. The rich European, I mean the few officials who live in the mufassal, they do not care for all this. They are too rich even to be afraid of malaria, too influential even to be approached by it, and so long it is a question of the suffering of our own people it matters very little to them.

Well, Sir, so far as this resolution is concerned, I may tell you that a considerable portion of the Hooghly district has been made absolutely malarious on account of this river being silted up. There were days before 1860 when Hooghly and Burdwan were very healthy. In those days the family seat of the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan was a sanitarium. People from this side of Bengal used to go to Burdwan to drink the water of the river Banka for the purpose of getting rid of many of their ailments. What is Burdwan to-day? Let the Hon'ble Maharajadhiraja Bahadur say. So far as the town of Burdwan is concerned, I say that. Let the Hon'ble the Member say as regards the rest of Burdwan, the mufassal. It is a matter of great joy to us that he has got a palatial residence in Calcutta, otherwise I am sure the Hon'ble Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan would have broken down in health long ago. I congratulate him. If he had to remain in Burdwan, even he, I suppose, would have suffered considerably from the effects of malaria. That is the position. But the real question is why do not Government care for this? There is something in us, the fault is to be found with us for not being able to make Government take adequate care about our health and life. There is something in us which does not command respect for which the Government do not come forward to do all that is necessary in this behalf and to do their own duty in this connection, because we have not up till to-day pushed the matter to its

legitimate conclusion. If we, the people of this country, were to combine and to declare in one voice that the first thing we want is to make the country a healthy one, the Government must do it before it spends, misspends or squanders money in other directions. We will not listen to any other reason and Government will be obliged to do it. The weakness lies with us and Government takes advantage of it; nothing more nothing less. If we who represent the mufassal all combine and push it with all the vigour that it demands and with all the emphasis that is necessary, how long can the Government or for the matter of that any Government in the world, however great, however strong, remain apathetic? But we are not prepared to do it that is the whole question. We sometimes move in a spirit like that and Government know that these are the people who will shout and then go to sleep. Government further know that those people among us who shout are the people of the town and they shout because they do not suffer themselves. Nothing like suffering, personally in your family, in your children and all that. Mere theoretical realisation of the position is not enough. Most of us who are in the Council from the western part of Bengal live in Calcutta and therefore we are free from the baneful effects of unhealthiness and malaria in the mufassal. Big zamindars and Rajas have left their homes and have come to live in Calcutta not for electric fans and lights, but for the fear of malaria. It is a misfortune to our country that our zamindars are leaving their places and are coming to Calcutta. If they had been there they would have tried to improve it. Their absence from the places makes those places absolutely hopeless. That is the situation.

Then the question that is before us is with regard to this particular river and with regard to the ill-effects that the silting-up of this river has caused in the district of Hooghly and partly also in the district of Howrah. But this is only one instance. There are hundreds of instances in Western Bengal where malaria is raging and nothing is being done. Schemes are being formed, only to be overlooked and neglected. Officers are being consulted and notes recorded only to be relegated to an unknown portion of the Bengal Secretariat. That is the way in which our Government work is done. Look at the Malaria Commission and look at all those things which the Government do from time to time as a solace as a sop to the cries of the people. I say that Government have very little desire to help in this matter, and it is our bounden duty—nay it is our sacred duty to combine and make the Government do this for the sake of our life and health and for the sake of the people in the mufassal.

With these few words, I support this resolution.

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of IRRIGATION (the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan): Sir, on a simple issue before the House, we have been given a lecture in this hot afternoon by a gentleman hailing from the district of Hooghly, who has escaped

malaria because he practises at Alipore. But I shall lay aside his arguments as they were a general indictment against the Government regarding its dereliction of duty with regard to malaria and other things which relate to the Departments of the popular portion of Government—the Ministers. I am sorry that the Minister in charge of the Department was not present here to receive the illuminating ideas given by Babu Surendra Nath Mullick this afternoon.

What I am concerned with immediately is as to whether any steps could be taken to improve the condition of the Saraswati river. Regarding that the most clear statement that has been made to this House to-day has been by the mover of the resolution, because he naturally has been able to give us all facts connected with it in a better manner than the gentleman living in Calcutta, who, I do not think, travels much on the East Indian Railway between Calcutta and Burdwan for, if he did, he would have been able to give us the true condition of the Saraswati river.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: The Hon'ble Maharajadhiraja Bahadur is absolutely wrong as I do travel very often on the East Indian Railway

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: Anyone travelling that side could have at once seen that the Saraswati river or what is left of it is more like a nullah than a river. So there is no question as to the condition of the Saraswati river being what Babu Satish Chandra Mukharji has said in his speech The question of improving the Saraswati river has already been investigated As a result a length of about five miles of the lower end has been excavated lately The question of a fresh-water supply in the upper reaches is, however, a difficult one, because the best way in which this could be done, would be by drawing a supply from the Damodar river The Damodar Canal scheme has recently received the sanction of the Secretary of State It will soon be put before the Standing Committee to consider as to what steps should be taken regarding it It is an expensive scheme and as such I have my doubts as to whether, at the present moment in the present condition of finances of the province it will be pushed through But if the scheme fructifies, it will be possible to run down an assured supply of fresh water into the river Saraswati Any improvement in the bed of the dead river in its upper reaches will then be taken up In the meantime, an inquiry is being made to find out the feasibility of drawing a supply from the river Hooghly from the Tribeni Ghat, and this subject is now receiving the attention of Government. The question as to the adoption of this resolution really means adopting what we have already done or are doing If, however, it will give any satisfaction to those interested in the scheme, I am quite prepared to accept the resolution if the word "early" be deleted from the first line, for this reason and no other than this scheme depends on the completion of the Damodar Canal project Steps are being taken, and will continue to be taken, but "early" steps for admitting a fresh supply of water

into the Saraswati river is not possible unless the Damodar Canal project was pushed through. For these reasons, if the mover of the resolution deletes the word "early" from his resolution, I am quite willing to accept it on behalf of Government

Babu SATISH CHANDRA MUKHARJI: Having regard to the assurance given by the Hon'ble Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan, I am quite willing to delete the word "early" from the first line of my resolution.

The amended motion was then put and agreed to.

Distribution of Proceedings of the Legislative Council.

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: Sir, as motions Nos. 31 and 32 are practically on the same lines as my resolution, I beg permission to be allowed to move a consolidated resolution embodying a few verbal changes. The resolution will then run as follows: "This Council recommends to the Government that a copy of the Legislative Council Proceedings be supplied free to different Government offices, public associations, district and local boards and municipalities in Bengal, principal newspapers and public libraries of Calcutta and the mufassal Bar libraries and other important lawyers' associations in the Presidency and such other offices or persons or bodies as Government may think proper."

This was agreed to.

The desirability of wide publicity of the Council proceedings is recognised on all hands. The more the public know about the doings of the Council the better for all concerned. It was admitted by the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler, during the discussion of Mr. D. C. Ghose's resolution yesterday, that the proceedings would have a far-reaching influence in moulding the destinies of the country and that it was desirable that the voters should know the attitude of their representatives and of the Government. The publication will also be a good check upon persons sitting on the fence. Further a strong party outside has no particular affection for the present Council Government. Though this party can allow going into the District and Municipal Boards it cannot bear the name of the Council. Not only the activities of the Council are always belittled and sometimes perverted, it never conceals that it denies altogether that in the present Council Government the representatives of the people have got any power or scope to do good to the country. It will be idle to pretend that this party does not count or that it has not captured the imagination of a large section. To undo the effects of such preachings—at least to a great extent—it is necessary that Council proceedings should be made easily available for general public. One may not have rapturous admiration for the Council, but we, who have come here to work, should be actuated by one desire of working it out to a success—of course, if that is possible. This will not prevent our pointing out the defects of the existing system too. Personally, therefore, I would like that the proposition of Mr. D. C. Ghose were carried. Mine is however a more modest

one and it wants a little more extension of the present free distribution of the proceedings. One thousand five hundred copies are now printed and about half are supplied free to many Government offices and officers and members of the Council. Another 500 to 1,500 copies with the residue will be sufficient for extending the distribution to the other associations and persons referred to in my proposal. Bar associations, especially in the mufassal, exercise a great influence on public opinion. To them and to the public associations, Government measures are invariably sent for opinion. Is it not then proper and fair that a copy of the Council proceedings should also be sent to them?

To print the extra copies required will not cost much. The same machinery and staff will do the work and additional cost will only be practically for the additional paper.

Prompt publication of the Council proceedings would no doubt be very desirable. The local papers do, in fact, so far as their space allows, publish important portions of the speeches and other proceedings. For current purposes it serves very usefully and for this we rather should be thankful to the press than otherwise. For general reference, however, and for more correct and comprehensive knowledge one has to refer to the Government publications of the proceedings which give the true and accurate picture of what occurs in the Council.

I therefore hope the resolution will be accepted.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: I understand that the mover of the resolution has accepted a part of my resolution. That being so, I have nothing further to add to what the mover of the resolution has said.

The PRESIDENT: There is a resolution to be moved by Mr. Syed Lutfar Ali which was in the nature of an amendment. He is absent and the resolution is therefore considered to be withdrawn.

It was as follows:—"That after the word 'municipalities' the following be inserted, *viz.*, 'and recognised associations, principal newspapers and public libraries'."

Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: I rise to support the resolution which has been just placed before this Council. At the beginning, I must say that I am not actuated by the motive, as has been suggested by some members of this House the other day when the resolution of Mr. D. C. Ghose was before this House. It is regrettable that such remarks have come from hon'ble members of this Council against another hon'ble member of this House. I must say here that I voted against that resolution and my reason for voting against that resolution was that that resolution demanded that translations in Bengali and reviews or accounts in Bengali of the proceedings of this Council should be circulated to the different bodies mentioned therein. I always find during my course of experience of proceedings in courts that happy translations and reviews are not always available. And then again, in order to do this there must be another establishment like the Director of Information which we have,

during the course of the Council proceedings in the previous session, abolished, and which will be reintroduced in another shape. But the present resolution is quite a different thing. It is a demand by the mover of the resolution that certain copies of the Council proceedings be circulated amongst different bodies as Bar libraries, newspaper editors and such other bodies. If we want to make the reforms a success it is necessary that the public should be informed of the proceedings of the Council so that they may judge what the Council is doing and what their representatives are doing here on behalf of their constituencies. But there are some members who are very nervous and who say that it is nothing but self-advertisement. If that be the case, let them replace the name of the member by the name of the constituency such as the hon'ble member for such and such constituency, so that self-advertisement will not be made, as they are afraid of that. If we do not enlighten the public bodies what we are doing in this Council Chamber, then I think the people will not be in a position to know what we are doing. When the local newspapers of Calcutta always publish meagre reports—and it is not always possible for them also to publish the reports of the proceedings of the Council in detail—and when the practice in previous years was to publish the proceedings of the Council in the *Calcutta Gazette*, I do not find what harm will be done in circulating a few more copies of the Council proceedings to public bodies as has been suggested by this resolution.

With these words, I support the resolution

MEMBER in charge of LEGISLATIVE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): Sir, this resolution is somewhat similar to the one which we discussed the other day, the main difference, and an important difference, being that whereas to introduce the system which was recommended previously necessitated the setting up of new machinery, effect could be given to this proposal merely by an expansion of our existing practice, namely, by printing more copies of our proceedings than we now do. To that extent this proposal can be carried out more easily and at less expense than that which was made before. As I explained the other day, we do already distribute our proceedings on a fairly extensive free list which stands roughly at about 700 copies. That includes Government officers, a few newspapers, about 21; a few libraries, 9 in Calcutta, 27, outside; and one Bar library and the attorneys' association in Calcutta. We print altogether about 1,500 copies at a cost of some Rs. 22,500. That number 1,500 includes some 300 copies which are on sale, and it also includes a certain number of copies sent to subscribers to the Gazette who used to get the proceedings at the time they were included as part of the Gazette. If effect was given to this proposal, so far as I can make out, it might mean an addition of something in the neighbourhood of 500 or 600 more copies, that is to say, there appear to be 82 associations, which are recognised by Government; 216 district and local boards and municipalities; 83 Bar libraries and 369 libraries of various kinds, while the total

newspaper list amounts to 118. Taking those figures, and allowing for the elimination of the less important bodies, especially among libraries and associations, I should say roughly the proposal would mean an addition of something in the neighbourhood of 500 copies. Taking our present costs as Rs. 22,500 I suppose that the proposal would mean an addition to our expenditure of a few thousand rupees. If the Council desire that this should be done, Government will have no objection to the suggestion, but I would ask that the details of the list be left in the hands of Government. That is to say, if the proposal is accepted we should naturally supply to all district and local boards and municipalities which are more or less on one level but in the case of many associations, and still more many libraries, there is a large variety in importance and size and to some it will scarcely be necessary to send our proceedings. I take it that we should deal with the matter as we do now; we receive an application, and if we think that the particular applicant merits the concession, we put him on the free list. Assuming that the resolution is interpreted in that way, leaving us a certain amount of discretion as to details, I have no objection to it.

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: I thank the Hon'ble Member in charge for practically accepting my resolution. I would only point out that the cost of publication will not be a few thousand rupees because the cost of printing 500 copies will be the additional cost of paper only, and secondly, the last portion of my resolution will clearly show that it is intended to give a certain amount of discretion to Government for the purpose of distributing the Council proceedings free especially to the minor bodies.

The amended resolution was then put and agreed to.

Adjournment.

The Council was then adjourned to 3 P.M. on Thursday, the 7th July, 1921, at the Town Hall, Calcutta.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Council assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act.

THE Council met in the Council Chamber in the Town Hall, Calcutta, on Thursday, the 7th July, 1921, at 3 P.M.

Present:

The Hon'ble the President, the Hon'ble the four Members of the Executive Council, the Hon'ble the three Ministers, and 98 nominated and elected members.

Starred Questions

(to which oral answers were given).

Teaching staff of the School of Tropical Medicine.

*XXXIX. **Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state

(*i*) the number of professorships that have been created in the School of Tropical Medicine, Calcutta, with emoluments sanctioned for each of them, and

(*ii*) the names of the professors already appointed?

(*b*) How many vacancies in professorships and assistant professorships remain still to be filled up?

(*c*) Are these vacancies going to be advertised in the public press?

(*d*) Are the claims of suitable Indian medical practitioners (official and non-official) to be considered along with those of Europeans?

(*e*) Is the selection to be made by the Government of Bengal or by Government of India?

(*f*) Is it a fact that it is the intention of Government to give these professors high salaries, and some additional remuneration, and to debar them from the privilege of private practice?

(*g*) Is it a fact that the Director of Public Health, Bengal, will also be the Professor of Hygiene in addition to his own duties?

(*h*) If so, what will be his additional remuneration, and the number of hours he will have to devote to his new duties?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea): (*a*) (*i*) and (*ii*) A statement furnishing the information is laid on the table.

(*b*), (*c*), (*d*), (*e*) and (*f*) This Government are not at present in a position to make a statement as the matter is under consideration of the Government of India.

(*g*) The answer is in the negative

(*h*) This does not arise.

Statement referred to in the reply to starred question No. XXXIX (a).

(a) Number of appointments already created		(b) Pay already sanctioned		(c) Professors already appointed
		Rs		
(1) Director and Professor of Tropical Medicine.			1,800	Lt. Col. J. W. Megaw, I.M.S.
(2) Professor of Pathology, Bacteriology and Helminthology ...	Pay ...	750	1,650	Major R. Knowles, I.M.S.
	Allowance ...		300	
(3) Professor of Protozoology and Entomology	Pay ...	750	1,650	H. W. Acton, I.M.S.
	Allowance ...		300	
(4) Professor of Pharmacology	Pay ...	750	1,650	,, R. N. Chopra, I.M.S.
	Allowance ...		300	
(5) Professor of Bacteriology and Serology ...	... ...	... ...		To be held by the Imperial Serologist without extra remuneration

N. I. Revised proposals for the staff and pay are under the consideration of the Government of India.

Revised pay and prospects of Sub-Deputy Collector and Sub-Registrars.

***XL. Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI:** Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state from what date the scheme for the improvement of the pay and prospects of the Sub-Deputy Collectors and Sub-Registrars will be given effect to?

MEMBER in charge of APPOINTMENT DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): It is hoped to give effect to the scheme for Sub-Registrars from the 1st December, 1921. The decisions of Government with regard to the Subordinate Civil Service will be made public at an early date.

Expenditure on certain police cases.

***XLI. Mr. AJOY CHUNDER DUTT:** Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to furnish a statement of the cost incurred by Government during the last five years

in connection with the prosecution of such cases as were under the supervision and control of the Additional Legal Remembrancer, and also a statement of the cost of the prosecution of similar cases during the five years immediately prior to the creation of the post of Additional Legal Remembrancer?

MEMBER in charge of JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-Rahim): (*a*) Owing to the abolition of the post of the Additional Legal Remembrancer, it will take considerable time for the office to collect the necessary facts.

(*b*) As regards the second part of the question, a statement is laid on the table.

Statement referred to in the reply to starred question No. XLI.

Year	Names of cases	Counsel and Pleaders' fees	Contingencies paid out of Legal Remembrancer's budget	Total
		Rs. A. P.	Rs. A. P.	Rs. A. P.
1911-12	Khulna Jessore Gang case	19,902 0 0	0 4 0	19,902 4 0
	Howrah Gang case	47,870 0 0	1,437 14 0	49,307 14 0
	Manta Sedition case (Emperor versus Surendra Nath Adhikary)	Nil	0 14 8	0 14 8
	Rajendrapur Train Dacoity case (Emperor versus Naresh Chandra Sengupta)	6,070 0 0	Nil	6,070 0 0
	Manohirganj Bomb case (Emperor versus Lalit Chandra Roy Chowdhury)	5,114 0 0	Nil	5,114 0 0
	Dacca shooting case (Emperor versus Nripendra Bhushan Chakravutty)	6,885 0 0	Nil	6,885 0 0
	10th Jat's case	235 0 0	Nil	235 0 0
	Dacca Conspiracy appeal ...	51,415 0 0	Nil	51,415 0 0
	Total ...	...	...	1,37,972 0 8
1912-13 ...	Dacca Conspiracy case ...	18,110 0 0	100 0 0	18,210 0 0
	10th Jat's case	510 0 0	Nil	510 0 0
	Total ...	... ...	... ...	18,720 0 0
1913-14 ...	Comilla Dacoity case ...	22,025 0 0	Nil	22,025 0 0
	Barisal Conspiracy case ...	7,650 0 0	Nil	7,650 0 0
	Howrah gang case	137 0 0	Nil	137 0 0
	"Hablul Matin"	680 0 0	Nil	680 0 0
	Re pamphlet "Come over to Macedonia and help us"	5,780 0 0	Nil	5,780 0 0

Year.	Names of cases.	Counsel and Pleader's fees.	Contingencies paid out of Legal Remembrancer's budget	Total
		Rs. A. P.	Rs. A. P.	Rs. A. P.
1913-14 ...	"Amrita Bazar Patrika" Contempt case	2,620 13 6	Nil	2,620 13 6
	Madaripur Conspiracy case ...	[illegible],420 0 0	Nil	[illegible],420 0 0
	Nirmal Kanto Roy's case ...	Nil	1,200 0 0	1,200 0 0
	Re Certain Dacca events (April and May 1913)	7,990 0 0	Nil	7,990 0 0
	Confidential opinion ..	170 0 0	Nil	170 0 0
	Total	...	...	[illegible],672 13 6
1914-15 ...	Nirmal Kanto Roy's case ..	56,[illegible]18 0 0	1,668 0 0	58,186 0 0
	Madaripur Conspiracy case	1,010 0 0	Nil	1,010 0 0
	Raja Bazar Bomb case	[illegible] 12 0	2,165 0 4	[illegible] 12 4
	[illegible] Arms Act case ..	[illegible]1,930 0 0	Nil	[illegible]1,930 0 0
	Barrackpore Arms Act case ..	9,55[illegible] 0 0	Nil	9,557 0 0
	Supplementary Barisal Conspiracy case	[illegible],780 0 0	Nil	[illegible],780 0 0
	[illegible] Murder case ..	680 0 0	Nil	680 0 0
	Mussalmanpara Bomb case	2[illegible],110 0 0	560 8 0	2[illegible],670 8 0
	Emperor *versus* Sasi Kumar Guha Roy	1,000 0 0	Nil	1,000 0 0
	Emperor *versus* Gopal Chandra Roy	740 0 0	Nil	740 0 0
	Emperor *versus* Lal Mohan Roy ..	1,000 0 0	Nil	1,000 0 0
	Emperor *versus* [illegible]	500 0 0	Nil	500 0 0
	Total ..	.....	......	[illegible] 4 4
1915-16 ...	[illegible] Arms case	39,446 0 0	Nil	39,446 0 0
	Mussalmanpara Bomb case ..	12,240 0 0	1,105 14 0	13,345 14 0
	Emperor *versus* Radha Ch. Pramanik	9,775 0 0	Nil	9,775 0 0
	Barisal Conspiracy case ...	340 0 0	Nil	340 0 0
	Pragpur and Kalipur Dacoity case	250 0 0	Nil	250 0 0
	Sibpur Dacoity case	3,740 0 0	Nil	3,740 0 0
	"Comrade" case .	1,44[illegible] 0 0	Nil	1,44[illegible] 0 0
	Emperor *versus* Khagendranath Das	255 0 0	Nil	255 0 0
	Emperor *versus* Prafulla K. Bhattacharya	4,760 0 0	Nil	4,760 0 0
	Emperor *versus* Haralal Biswas ..	425 0 0	Nil	425 0 0
	Total ...	......	....	73,7[illegible] 14 0

Abstract.

				Rs.	A	P
1911-12	...	...	...	1,37,972	0	8
1912-13	...	...	...	18,720	0	0
1913-14	...	...	...	53,672	13	6
1914-15	...	...	...	2,30,004	4	4
1915-16	...	...	...	73,787	14	0
		Total	...	5,14,157	0	6

Erosion of Noakhali town.

***XLII. Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works aware that the erosion of the Noakhali municipality on the east and south-east, caused by the tides in the Noakhali *khal*, has been quicker than before, and that it is believed that the courts and other Government buildings are likely to be destroyed within a year and a half?

(*b*) Have the Government taken any action, and, if so, what, to reconstruct these courts and buildings in a safer place?

(*c*) Are the Government taking any action, and, if so, what, to stop the erosion of the Noakhali *khal*?

(*d*) Are they taking any steps to erect a *band* (embankment) higher up?

(*e*) (*i*) Have the Government received any representation from the people of Noakhali for erecting such an embankment, (*ii*) and have the local authorities reported on or recommended such action?

(*f*) Have the Government sent any river expert to report on such report or recommendation?

(*g*) If not, are the Government considering the desirability of sending such an expert to examine and report on the matter at once?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of PUBLIC WORKS (the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur): (*a*) Yes, the rate of erosion is greater than it was last year; but it differs little from the average of the last three years.

Yes; if the erosion continues at the present rate.

(*b*) Land has been acquired at Sonapur and Maigdi, where temporary buildings may be constructed when the necessity arises.

(*c*) Observations are being taken, and the result of these will be considered after the rainy season.

(*d*) No.

(*e*) (*i*) Yes.

(*ii*) Yes; the local Public Works Department officers reported on the proposal.

(*f*) and (*g*) No; the locality was inspected in August last by the Chief Engineer, Public Works Department, who was not in favour of making an embankment and diverting the *khal*. The question of deputing an officer to make a further report will be considered when the observations referred to in (*c*) are completed.

Muhammadans on the Board of the Calcutta Improvement Trust.

***XLIII. Mr. SYED ERFAN ALI:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether any Mussalman member has been appointed to the Board of the Calcutta Improvement Trust since its creation?

(*b*) If not, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state the reasons for not appointing a Mussalman?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) No, but Muhammadan members have sat on many of the committees appointed to hear objections to individual schemes.

(*b*) Under section 5 of the Calcutta Improvement Act, Government can appoint only four members. In making appointments Government endeavour to select those persons who are most competent to assist in carrying on the work of the Trust without reference to their religion.

Scarcity of drinking water in Murshidabad district.

***XLIV. Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ:** Has the attention of the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government been drawn to the great scarcity of water for drinking or irrigation purposes in the district of Murshidabad and other places?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: Government are aware of the complaints on the subject, which are most frequent during the hot weather.

Rangpur cattle farm.

***XLV. Babu JOGESH CHANDRA SARKAR:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state in what year the cattle farm at Rangpur was established, and also the total amount expended on it up to date?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister also be pleased to state what the object of starting the farm was?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability, instead of spending money on the maintenance of a farm, of improving the breed of Rangpur cattle by annually purchasing suitable stud bulls with the amount thus saved?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of ACRICULTURE and INDUSTRIES (the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur): (*a*) The cattle farm at Rangpur was established in 1914-15, and the total expenditure incurred on account of this farm up to the 31st March, 1921, amounted to Rs. 2,91,450.

(*b*) The farm was started as an experiment with the object of ascertaining whether improved cattle could be profitably bred in Bengal, as in the past this province has relied very largely on importations from Bihar and Upper India

The breeding experiments are divided into two parts. In one portion of the herd indigenous cows are being crossed with Hissar bulls to see whether improvement can be obtained through the sire. In the other half local bulls are used on the local cows with a view to ascertaining the immediate effect of proper food and better treatment. Milk records are kept of all the cows in the herd, as it is now generally accepted that a good milking cow is likely to prove a better mother and therefore produce better progeny than a poor milker. Another line of work which is being carried out is an investigation into the food of cattle and experiments with fodder crops

It will be obvious that until several generations of these cattle have been observed, it will not be possible to make a reliable pronouncement on these experiments. In the meantime, however, valuable experience is being gained which will prove of great value in framing our future cattle-breeding policy

(*c*) No

Formation of union boards in Rangpur.

***XLVI. Babu JOGESH CHANDRA SARKAR:** Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state why steps have not been taken to form union boards in the district of Rangpur, and also when the constitution of such boards is likely to be taken up?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: Proposals for the constitution of 102 union boards have been received but cannot be sanctioned pending the receipt of certain information which has been asked for. The local officers are being asked to expedite the supply of the information required

Unstarred Questions

(answers to which were laid on the table).

Chandpur affairs and Government officials' attitude.

170. Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department be pleased to say why, and at whose instance, Gurkha soldiers were sent to Chandpur?

(*b*) Who gave the order to the Gurkha soldiers to disperse the coolies from the railway platform at midnight when they were sleeping?

(*c*) Are the miseries and sufferings of the coolies at Chandpur depicted by Mr. Andrews true?

(*d*) If so, what steps are being taken to alleviate them?

(*e*) Is there any truth in the rumour that many of the high Government officials being shareholders of various tea gardens, are interested to see that the coolies return to the gardens and that, therefore, no sympathy is shown by Government to the sufferings of the coolies but that, on the other hand oppressive measures were taken against them?

MEMBER in charge of POLITICAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (*a*) The member is referred to paragraph 3 of the *communiqué* of the 7th June.

(*b*) The member is referred to paragraph 4 of the *communiqué*.

(*c*) and (*d*) The member is referred to paragraphs 8, 10, 11, 12, 17 (*a*) of the *communiqué*. Since its issue, except some 84 sick who are being treated at Chandpur under the arrangements described in the *communiqué* all the coolies have been repatriated.

(*e*) None whatever. If the member has not in his possession information substantiating the rumour the question is unjustified and improper. If the member or his informants will define the insinuation outside the Council as implicating any individual, Government will take further action.

Bankura famine.

171. Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to state the number of times that there has been famine or scarcity in the district of Bankura or any part of it during the last ten years?

(*b*) Have any steps been taken to ascertain how facilities for irrigation can be improved in the district?

(*c*) If so, will the Government be pleased to state the result?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of REVENUE (LAND REVENUE) (the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan): (*a*) Famine was declared in the district of Bankura twice during the last ten years, in the years 1916 and 1919.

(*b*) Several co-operative irrigation societies have been formed in the district of Bankura with a view to improving irrigation. The Barai river project and a project in connection with the proposed Damodar Canal have also been investigated by the Irrigation Department. Irrigation rights have been recorded in the record-of-rights prepared by the Settlement

Officers; it is hoped that this will facilitate the use of the Bengal Agricultural and Sanitary Improvement Act, 1920, for the restoration and improvement of irrigation works.

(c) Six irrigation schemes started by the co-operative societies are already in progress. The two projects investigated by the Irrigation Department were abandoned as examination showed that they could not be accepted as productive or protective.

Settlement costs in certain districts.

172. Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: (a) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to state what has been the initial estimate and the final expenditure in the survey and settlement operations of the districts of—

(i) Faridpur,

(ii) Dacca,

(iii) Mymensingh,

(iv) Midnapore, and

(v) Rajshahi?

(b) What was the amount recoverable from landlords and raiyats under section 111 of the Bengal Tenancy Act and the amount actually recovered, in the districts where the survey and settlement operations had recently been finished, viz:

(i) Mymensingh,

(ii) Dacca,

(iii) Midnapore,

(iv) Rajshahi, and

(v) Tippera-Noakhali?

(c) Is it a fact that the excess recovery in these districts was appropriated by the Government of India?

(d) If so, why have no steps been taken to get the amount back, to be constituted into a fund for works of some public utility in the districts concerned?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (a) A statement is given below to show (1) the initial estimate, and (2) the approximate final expenditure in the survey and settlement operations of the districts referred to. The initial estimate is not a detailed estimate, but is a rough estimate based on area.

As the accounts have not been closed the figures of final expenditure are not final:—

District.	Initial estimate (net)	Last revised estimate as approved by Government (net)	Final expenditure (net) (a).
	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Faridpur	9,16,646	27,45,547	26,95,670
Dacca	16,00,000	25,12,845	23,56,902
Mymensingh ...	29,00,000	43,38,069	39,64,150
Midnapore ...	17,35,860	28,44,088	26,85,029
Rajshahi	15,25,000	27,93,709	29,13,863

(*b*) The whole cost of all these operations was legally recoverable, under section 114 of the Bengal Tenancy Act, but in accordance with the orders of the Government of India, which have been incorporated in rule 96 (2) (*a*) of the Survey and Settlement Manual, proposals were framed to bring in three-fourths of the net expenditure. In some cases this expenditure was up to the last moment expected to be larger than the figures shown in (*a*). The amount recoverable under the principle referred to above and the amount recovered are given in the statement noted below:—

District	Amount recoverable from landlords and tenants	Amount actually recovered
	Rs.	Rs.
Mymensingh	30,10,097	32,42,163
Dacca	17,87,677	22,34,798
Midnapore	20,37,577	22,67,765
Rajshahi	22,06,193	22,31,868
Tippera-Noakhali	15,55,247	16,04,370

(*c*) It is a fact that the difference between the three-fourths of the net cost as shown in (*b*) and the amount actually recovered has been credited to the Government of India, but, as stated above, the total amount credited in all cases is less than the amount advanced.

(*d*) It is by an act of grace that Government do not collect the whole cost of settlement operations instituted under section 101 (*1*), Bengal Tenancy Act, from the landlords and tenants, and if three-fourths of the cost could not be collected in any district, the State would have to bear the loss. It would therefore be useless for this Government to claim any refund from the Government of India.

Qualifications and special claims for the appointment of Sub-Registrars.

173. Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased

to state under what minimum qualifications the appointments of Sub-Registrarships are given to candidates?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state—

(*i*) whether the cases of those candidates who have served in the "Indian Defence Force" are especially considered; and

(*ii*) whether the "Oversea Services" of their family members during the war are taken into consideration?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state—

(*i*) how many candidates, having the qualifications under clause (*b*), were there from Alipore, 24-Parganas, in 1919 and 1920; and

(*ii*) how many of these were nominated by the Commissioners of the Division, and how many were taken in, and how many of them were Mussalmans?

(*d*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether the cases of the unsuccessful nominees of the Commissioner will be reconsidered at the next selection?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of EDUCATION (the Hon'ble Mr. P. C. Mitter): (*a*) The member is referred to rules 3, 4 and 5 of the Rules for appointment in the Registration Department, a copy of which is laid on the table.

(*b*) (*i*) The answer is in the affirmative.

(*ii*) The member is referred to rule 6 (*c*) of the Rules for appointment in the Registration Department.

(*c*) (*i*) Three.

(*ii*) Three were nominated by the Commissioner of the Presidency Division and one was appointed. One of these, who was not appointed, was a Mussalman.

(*d*) They will be considered if they are again nominated.

Rules for appointment in the Registration Department, referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 173.

[As corrected up to 1st September, 1919—*vide* notification No. 14T. R., dated 20th April, 1918, notification No. 2290 Regtn., dated 10th March, 1919, and notification No. 910 T.-R., dated 28th July, 1919.]

1. The number of probationers to be appointed in the Registration Department will be determined each year by the Governor in Council. The number of appointments to be made and the authorities by whom nominations for these appointments will be made will be notified in the *Calcutta Gazette* as soon as possible after the 1st August of each year.

2. Ordinarily 75 per cent. of the appointments will be made on the nomination of the Commissioners of Divisions and 25 per cent. on the nomination of the Inspector-General of Registration. The Governor in Council reserves the power to make appointments in exceptional cases without calling for nominations.

3. Candidates nominated by the Commissioner of a Division must ordinarily fulfil the following conditions:—

(a) they must belong to families resident or domiciled in the Division,

(b) they must be of good character,

(c) they must be of sound health and robust constitution,

(d) they must not be under 20 or over 25 years of age on the 31st December of the year to which the nominations relate,

(e) (i) they must have passed the I A or the I Sc Examination of the Calcutta University, or the corresponding examinations of any other recognized Indian University or have qualifications declared by Government to be equivalent to passing such examinations or

(ii) they must have passed the higher standard or the final examination of the Arabic Department of a recognized Madrassa, and have sufficient knowledge of English for the proper performance of the duties of a Sub Registrar,

(f) they must be able to read with facility documents written in Bengali

4 Candidates nominated by the Inspector General of Registration must fulfil the conditions (b) to (f) in rule 3

5 The Commissioners of Divisions and the Inspector General of Registration are not precluded from nominating persons who may not be eligible under rule 3 (d) and (e) but whose claims appear for particular reasons to deserve special consideration and who have sufficient knowledge of English to enable them to discharge efficiently the duties of a Sub Registrar

6 (a) For each appointment allotted to the Division every District Officer will submit to the Commissioner on or before a date to be fixed by the latter the names of two candidates belonging to families resident or domiciled in his district In submitting these he will give in Form I appended to these rules a brief statement of the grounds of his recommendations in each case Form I should be accompanied by a certificate of character and conduct from the Principal of the Institution at which the candidate last studied for not less than one year, or from some responsible officers of Government a medical certificate in Form II appended to these rules and evidence of the candidate's age and educational qualifications

(b) The Commissioner and the District Officers in his Division will meet on a date to be fixed by the Commissioner and will consider the claims of all the candidates nominated They will also call the candidates before them and see and converse with them so as to form an opinion regarding their suitability The Commissioner will then select two names for each of the appointments to be made on his nomination and submit them in order of preference to Government by a date not later than the 1st October stating his reasons for the preference given With his report submitting these names the Commissioner will submit Forms I and II for all candidates, entering in each case in the last column of Form I his own opinion as to the suitability of the candidate

(c) In making nominations special attention should be paid to social qualifications and family status and influence, to services rendered by the candidate's father or his family, to the claims of backward communities and to the possession of a robust constitution.

7 The Inspector-General of Registration will submit to Government in Form I, on or before the 1st October in each year two names for each appointment to be made on his nomination

8 Each probationer will get an allowance of Rs 30 per month Appointments in grade V of Sub-Registrars will be given to approved probationers as vacancies in the cadre occur Probationers will, as far as possible, be posted to offices in the

T 1

Division to which they belong, but after confirmation they will be liable to transfer at any time to any office in the Province at the discretion of Government.

9. The Governor in Council may, in special cases, declare the period of probation to be unnecessary and may also make direct appointments to the higher grades of Sub-Registrars.

FORM I.

Column 1.—Name of candidate and address in full.

Column 2.—Father's name, profession or occupation and address in full

Column 3.—Religion and caste or race.

Column 4.—Date of birth (day and month to be given).

Column 5.—Educational qualifications.

Column 6.—Other information regarding the candidate (physique, moral character, present occupation, etc.), including a declaration whether or not he has at any time been pronounced unfit for Government employment by the Medical Board at the India Office, or any other duly constituted medical authority.

Column 7.—A memorandum of the status and services of members of the family

Column 8.—Special claims for consideration

Column 9.—Remarks indicating degree of District Officer's personal knowledge of candidate and sources of information about him, with Commissioner's opinion as to the suitability of the candidate

FORM II.

[Bengal Civil Medical Department Form No. 38.]

[Medical Certificate under Bengal Government Resolution No. 3889 Medl., dated the 30th June, 1897.]

Special Certificate of Physical Fitness for Government Service.

I, * do hereby certify that I have examined , a candidate for employment in His age is by his own statement years, and by appearance years.

(*a*) General conformation.
(*b*) Vision
(*c*) Hearing
(*d*) Lungs
(*e*) Heart.
(*f*) Liver.
(*g*) Spleen
(*h*) Hernia, present or absent. †
(*i*) Hydrocele, present or absent †
(*j*) Glycosuria, present or absent. †
(*k*) Albuminuria, present or absent.
(*l*) Distinguishing marks.

I consider that he is of sound health and good physique, and capable of bearing fatigue and exposure, and that he is fit to enter the service of Government †

I consider him unfit to enter the service of Government for the reason given at † .

Place ... } *Civil Surgeon.*
Date ... }

* Designation of Medical Officer

† Strike out "present" or "absent" in (*h*), (*i*), (*j*), (*k*), and whichever of the concluding sentences does not apply.

L. BIRLEY,
Secretary to the Government of Bengal.

Number of river dacoities and the work of river police.

174. Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing—

(*a*) the number of river dacoities committed year by year in Bengal since the introduction of the river police system;

(*b*) the number of such cases year by year detected by the river police; and

(*c*) the number of cases in which the river police interfered on the spot and prevented the commission of dacoities or similar crimes?

MEMBER in charge of POLICE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (*a*) The river police system is in force only in the river districts of Eastern Bengal. It was initiated in 1912 on a small scale, and has been gradually extended since; the scheme has not yet been completely introduced. The number of river dacoities reported in the districts in which the river police are employed is—

1912	17
1913	16
1914	40
1915	32
1916	37
1917	11
1918	18
1919	16
1920	11
1921 (to date)	3

(*b*) The river police is not employed on the investigation of crime. It is a preventive force which affords protection on the main waterways by means of patrols and its floating police-stations.

(*c*) There has been no occasion on which the river police intervened when a dacoity was being committed. Information regarding the work of the river police is contained in paragraph 14 of the annual report on the police administration.

Assistant Jailors.

175. Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Jails) be pleased to state—

(*a*) the number of temporary assistant jailors appointed as probationary assistant jailors on the 29th March, 1920, on the reorganization of the jail service;

(*ii*) the period for which they will have to serve as probationary assistant jailors before their confirmation to the grade of assistant jailors; and

(*iii*) the reasons for not reckoning their periods of services for which they served as temporary assistant jailors and sub. *pro tem.* probationers?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that in many jails the probationary assistant jailors have not been provided with any quarters in the jail premises, and that they live outside, and that no house rent is given?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the reason for not allowing the assistant jailors to keep cows in the jail premises at their own expense?

(*d*) Is it a fact that each jailor is allowed to keep two cows and two calves at a time for the supply of milk?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of REVENUE (JAILS) (the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-Rahim): (*a*) (*i*) None; but four temporary assistant jailors were appointed as assistant jailors on probation.

(*ii*) Ordinarily they will be on probation for two years.

(*iii*) In accordance with the conditions of their appointment, though they are admitted to the cadre of assistant jailors, they must render service for not less than two years on their probationary pay.

(*b*) The number of assistant jailors and probationers having been increased from 54 to 77, Government quarters are not available for all. Probationers are given quarters only when they are available. The Jail Code rules do not provide for the grant of free quarters to probationers and they are not given house rent.

(*c*) Rule 1098 of the Bengal Jail Code may be seen.

(*d*) Yes, under the same rule 1098.

Practice of "phooka" on milch cows in Calcutta.

176. Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to state what steps have been taken to prohibit the practice of *phooka* on milch cows of Calcutta?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state what steps have been taken to establish and maintain charitable veterinary dispensaries in Calcutta?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) The member is referred to the answer given to unstarred question No. 4 (*c*) (*v*) on the 7th February last.

(*b*) In Calcutta there is a veterinary hospital attached to the Bengal Veterinary College which affords free treatment of cattle belonging to other than "well-to-do people."

Nomination of candidates from Chittagong for provincial and subordinate civil services and excise service.

177. Munshi AYUB ALI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state the total number of candidates nominated by the District Magistrate, Chittagong, in September, 1920, for each of the following services:

(*1*) provincial civil service;

(*2*) subordinate civil service; and

(*3*) excise service?

(*b*) Of the total candidates selected for each department by the District Magistrate, Chittagong, how many were Muhammadans and how many from among these Muhammadan candidates have been appointed?

(*c*) Do the Government take into consideration the proportion of Moslem population of the district at the time of recruiting officers in the above services?

(*d*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to give a list of Muhammadan officers, having their domicile in the district of Chittagong, in the provincial and subordinate civil services, together with a list of Muhammadan officers recruited hitherto through nomination from the same district in the gazetted excise service?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) (*b*) One

(*2*) One

(*3*) Two for superintendentships and two for inspectorships

(*b*) The nominees for the provincial and subordinate civil services were both Muhammadans, and two of the nominees for the excise service were Muhammadans. None of them were appointed.

(*c*) No.

(*d*) The question does not arise.

Alleged employment of dismissed Government servant as the Government mukhtear at Pirojpur.

178. Maulvi AZAHARUDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department aware that Munshi Mahafezuddin Ahmed, mukhtear of Pirojpur subdivision, in the district of Bakarganj, has recently been appointed as a Government mukhtear?

(*b*) Is it a fact that he was a settlement kanungo and was dismissed, being accused under section 498, or a similar section, of the Indian Penal Code?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state whether there is any rule against the employment in Government service of a dismissed officer?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: (*a*) No. Munshi Mahafezuddin Ahmed, mukhtear of Pirojpur subdivision in the district of Bakarganj,

has not been appointed Government mukhtear. He was engaged on 30th April, 1921, by the Subdivisional Officer of Pirojpur, with the approval of the Additional District Magistrate of Bakarganj to conduct a few criminal cases when the services of a court sub-inspector were not available. His engagement was subject to the sanction of the Legal Remembrancer.

(*b*) It is a fact that he was a settlement kanungo and he was dismissed from the service. But the Government have no information that he was accused under section 498 or a similar section of the Indian Penal Code.

(*c*) The rule against the employment in Government service of a dismissed officer has no application in cases like the present.

Hill journey of the Director of Agriculture.

179. Babu BHABENDRA CHANDRA RAY: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state the number of days on which the Director of Agriculture, Bengal, was at Kalimpong or other hill stations during the current summer session?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that the jute crop this year is undergoing a crisis and that there is considerable uneasiness among the agricultural people on account of unfavourable weather conditions, etc.?

(*c*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state what steps the Director of Agriculture took to keep himself in constant personal touch with the situation?

(*d*) What was the urgency of the work which took him to the hills?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Twenty-five days.

(*b*) No definite information can be given till the 13th July, when an estimate of the area sown under jute in Bengal and a general survey of the prospects will be published in the preliminary forecasts of this crop.

(*c*) The situation is being watched as in previous years, through the agency of the local Agricultural Officers and Divisional Superintendents of Agriculture, who are constantly on tour in the jute-growing areas.

(*d*) The Director of Agriculture visited Kalimpong for the purpose of inspecting the demonstration farm and the various agricultural demonstration centres in the Government estates, and in order to discuss with the Imperial Protozoologist the question of the establishment of an Imperial research silk institute in the hills. He was requested to be at Darjeeling for a short time to discuss with Government certain important questions.

Indianising the Agricultural Department.

180. Babu BHABENDRA CHANDRA RAY: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries

be pleased to state how many of the Provincial Agricultural Service men in Bengal have had a training in foreign Universities, and whether it is a fact that some of them have had a brilliant academic career there?

(*b*) Has the attention of the Hon'ble the Minister been drawn to the various editorial articles and correspondence in the *Bengalee*, *Amrita Bazar Patrika*, *Englishman*, etc., on the question of appointing more Indians to the higher posts in the Bengal Agriculture Department?

(*c*) What steps have been taken to Indianise the Department in the manner recommended by the Public Service Commission?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) A statement showing the officers of the Provincial Agricultural Service who have had a training in foreign Universities and the distinctions gained by them is laid on the table.

(*b*) The attention of Government has been drawn to certain letters which appeared in the *Amrita Bazar Patrika* on the 19th, 20th and 22nd May 1920.

(*c*) The appointment of officers to the Indian Agricultural Service rests with the Secretary of State for India. The Provincial and Subordinate Agricultural Services are entirely manned by Indian officers.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 180 (a)

	Name of Officer	Educational attainments
1	Mr. Durga Das Datta (now officiating for 2nd Economic Botanist)	B.Sc. (Cal.), M.S.A. (Cornell, U.S.A.)
2	Mr. Nagendra Nath Gupta	B.A. (Cal.), B.Sc. (Edin.).
3	Jadu Nath Sarkar	M.S.A. (Japan).
4.	Hari Prasad Mitra	M.S.A. (Cornell, U.S.A.)

Sericulture research subsidies and Miss Cleghorn's practical work.

181. Babu BHABENDRA CHANDRA RAY: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state for how many years, and at what rates annually, did Miss Cleghorn of the Sericulture Department receive subsidies for sericulture research?

(*b*) What are Miss Cleghorn's educational qualifications and training for conducting research work?

(*c*) Has anything been recorded to show what work of definite value has been done by her up to date, and any results of practical importance that have been obtained by her so far?

(*d*) What is the reason for having her headquarters at Calcutta instead of in a place of sericultural interest, as for instance, Berhampore, Malda, Rajshahi or Birbhum?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) 1914-15, Rs. 5,615; 1915-16, Rs. 5,800; 1916-17, Rs. 20,782 1917-18, Rs. 20,700; 1918-19, Rs. 20,700; 1919-20, Rs. 20,700; 1920-21, Rs. 16,500.

(*b*) Miss Cleghorn is a Fellow of the Linnean, Entomological and Zoological Societies of London, and is a member of the British Geological Society and of the Asiatic Society of Bengal. She has also taken a course in Agricultural Science. She has studied silk-worms for about 19 years.

(*c*) The work involves a complete and detailed study of silk-worms, of which the production of hybrids is one branch. An observation made by Miss Cleghorn has been made the basis of a valuable method of selection, whereby the eggs of moths preserving the greatest vitality are used in the production of seed cocoons for distribution to rearers. Tests are in progress as to the suitability of her races for distribution among the rearers.

(*d*) Miss Cleghorn has been allowed to carry on her experiments in Alipore in view of the fact that she has been in possession of a nursery and laboratory there since her father's time.

Privately-owned insanitary tanks.

182. Babu BROJENDRA KISHOR RAY CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to make a statement showing the number of private tanks reported to be insanitary by the Sanitary Inspector in each district, and the action taken by the District Board in each instance?

(*b*) In how many instances have the requests for clearing the tanks been complied with by the owners of insanitary tanks?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: A statement compiled from the reports received from District Boards, is laid on the table

Statement referred to in the answer to unstarred question No. 182 showing the number of tanks reported to be insanitary in each district, the action taken by the District Board in each case, etc.

Name of district	Number of private tanks reported to be insanitary during 1920-21	Action taken by District Board	Instances in which requests for clearing tanks were complied with	Remarks
Burdwan ..	.	.....	...	There is no Sanitary Inspector
Birbhum ..	...	.....	...	There was no Sanitary Inspector during the last financial year
Bankura ...	160	The owner of each tank was asked to clear it at his own cost	125	The rest were not cleared for various reasons such as labour not being available, the filling up of tanks by rain water, etc

Name of district	Number of private tanks reported to be insanitary during 1920-21	Action taken by District Board	Instances in which requests for clearing tanks were complied with	Remarks.
Midnapore ...	Nil	Nil	Nil	
Hooghly ..	54	In 13 cases notices were issued by Local Boards and in 41 cases by Union Boards requesting owners to clear them	11	(The District Board has no information regarding the rest.)
Howrah .	77	Owners were requested to clear the tanks	70	
24-Parganas ..	381	Notices were issued for clearing in 3 cases and verbal instructions in 340 cases	92	
Nadia	4	Owners of 4 tanks were requested to clear them	1	
Murshidabad	Nil	Nil	Nil	
Jessore ..	260	Owners were instructed through the Sanitary Inspector to clear the tanks	10	
Khulna .	6	Owners were requested to clear the tanks	Under the orders of the S.D.O. Satkhira	
Dacca ...	.	.		There is no Sanitary Inspector and no private tanks have been reported to be insanitary
Mymensingh .	.	.		No action was taken
Faridpur ..	37	Notices were served upon the owners of all the tanks	9	
Bakarganj ..	..	....	...	There are no insanitary tanks
Chittagong ...	Nil	Nil	Nil	Seven private tanks were found to be insanitary but have been reported at the cost of the Board. Fifty-four private tanks have also been cleaned at the cost of the Board. There is no Sanitary Inspector under the Board
Tippera ..	..	..	...	There is no Sanitary Inspector

Name of district	Number of private tanks reported to be insanitary during 1920-21.	Action taken by District Board	Instances in which requests for clearing tanks were complied with	REMARKS.
Noakhali ..	...	.....	...	No Sanitary Inspector has been appointed by the Board
Rajshahi ...	23	Notices were issued on the owners to clear the tanks	4	
Dinajpur ..	Nil	Nil	Nil	
Jalpaiguri	Nil	Nil	Nil	There are no tanks in the district, the water of which is used for drinking purposes except one, and none were reported to be insanitary
Rangpur ..	Nil	Nil	Nil	
Bogra ..	10	In two cases owners were requested to clear them.	Nil	The District Board reports that a by-law is necessary to enforce the orders of the Chairman
Pabna ..	.	... .	...	It is reported that nothing has been done in respect of private tanks as the Board have no statutory power to compel owners to clear their tanks
Malda	53	Notices requiring owners to clear the tanks were issued in all cases	13	

Number of students from Eastern Bengal admitted into Calcutta Medical College.

183. Babu BROJENDRA KISHOR RAY CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to make a statement showing the total number of students admitted into the Calcutta Medical College during each of the last five years, and how many of them came from the Dacca, Rajshahi and Chittagong Divisions?

(*b*) Are the Government aware of the dissatisfaction that has been expressed in the newspapers at the non-representation of Eastern Bengal on the Selection Committee for admission into the Calcutta Medical College this year?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) The member is referred to the statement laid on the table in answer to unstarred question No. 185 asked by Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta.

(*b*) I have seen a letter expressing dissatisfaction on this account which was published in a Calcutta newspaper on the 6th June, but I am not aware of any general feeling of dissatisfaction. On the contrary, I think the appointment of the committee has given public satisfaction.

Uniform weights and measures.

184. Babu BROJENDRA KISHOR RAY CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state what steps are being taken to maintain uniform weights and measures in the different districts of the Presidency?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: The following remarks are quoted from the report of a special committee which was appointed in 1913 by the Government of India to inquire into the question of the feasibility of securing the use of uniform weights and measures in India:—

"It is well known that the weights and measures of India have never been settled upon an organized system for the country as a whole, or for provinces. . . . During the last 40 years the Government of India and the Provincial Governments have attempted to solve the problem of weights and measures. By section 8 of the Indian Weights and Measures of Capacity Act (XXXI of 1871) the Governor-General in Council was empowered to introduce a system of weights and measures of capacity consistent with a statutory unit prescribed by section 3. . . . Although this Act has been in existence for more than 42 years, no notifications have yet been issued under it, because it was hoped that weights and measures based on the statutory unit would be gradually and generally adopted without further intervention on the part of Government. This pious hope, however, has not been realized, although the Indian railways and Government departments have adopted as standards the tola of 180 grains, the seer of 80 tolas, and the maund of 40 seers."

A reference was recently made to the Government of India, which has replied that the recommendations made by the Weights and Measures Committee are under their consideration.

An extract* from the report showing the weights and measures in Bengal is laid on the library table.

Number of candidates admitted in Calcutta Medical College from each Division.

185. Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to

*Not printed in these Proceedings.

lay on the table a statement showing, division by division, the number of candidates belonging to each of the five territorial divisions of Bengal that were admitted into the Calcutta Medical College during the last five years?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: A statement is laid on the table.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 185 showing, division by division, the number of candidates, belonging to each of the five territorial divisions of Bengal, that were admitted into the Calcutta Medical College, during the last five years.

Year		Names of Divisions.				
		Presidency	Burdwan	Rajshahi	Dacca	Chittagong
1916-17	...	69	36	5	24	3
1917-18	...	57	32	9	28	6
1918-19	...	56	32	11	28	12
1919-20	...	61	45	9	23	5
1920-21	...	68	43	11	14	12

Tours by the district agricultural officers.

186. Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to say whether the Government are considering the desirability of stopping long tours by the district agricultural officers, and of directing them to keep a mufassal diary to show—

(*i*) the villages where they stopped;
(*ii*) the important persons they met with, and
(*iii*) the result of their tour in the villages?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: District agricultural officers are not permitted to make unnecessary tours.

They are at present required to submit tour diaries, in which the details suggested are furnished.

Resolutions

(under the rules for the discussion of matters of general public interest).

The Bengal Tenancy Act.

Babu BHISMADEV DAS: "This Council recommends to the Government that a Committee consisting of some non-official members of this Council, the Director of Land Records and some Settlement Officers and Provincial Judicial Officers be formed to consider and report what amendments are needed in the Bengal Tenancy Act."

That the Legislature has not been able to keep pace with the growing needs of the community is evident from the fact that the High Court after repeated requests in their judgments to the Government to take up legislation to clear up conflicting rulings on some matters, felt the need of constituting a special Bench last year and did, under colour of explaining the real law, what in effect was legislation. It would not be a healthy sign for the constitution if the Judiciary would take up the work of legislature or that the latter would take the work of the former. The high purpose which animated the members of the Civil Service, who tried to protect the raiyats against the oppression of the zamindars and to give some sort of status to the raiyats is evident from the Bengal Tenancy Act. The sympathy for the cultivators of the soil is so broad and deep that it manifests itself in many sections of the enactment. But the legislators did not bring into service as high a skill in draftsmanship as of genuine sympathy. The defects are many and I need enumerate only a few.

The enactment is silent as to heritability of under-raiyati holdings. Under-raiyats were permitted by local custom to acquire right of occupancy. But whether such a right is heritable or not does not appear from the enactment. Then, again, there is no provision for enhancing the rent of an under-raiyat having occupancy right even when his landlord, the raiyat, has to pay enhancement. The Act is silent as to the effect of dispossession by landlord and the Courts in Bengal have felt compelled to apply the English law on the subject. This recourse to a complicated system is undesirable in the interest of simplicity. The provision of payment of rent through the Court or through the post-office to landlords who are unwilling to accept rent and are bent on harassing the raiyats has proved illusory. Service of notice of deposit of rent is very difficult for the tenant to prove. Courts are not unanimous on the view whether the postal peon's note of refusal on the money-order form would itself be sufficient proof of non-acceptance. It would be ruinous for the tenant to attempt to prove remittance and refusal by examining the officers of the post-office. It has been held that the landlord is not bound to accept a remittance or a deposit if it exceeds the actual arrear by a single pice or if it falls short by any amount. The provision for the distraint of crops is a very powerful engine of oppression in the hands of tyrannical landlords. The absence of any provision for acquisition of right of occupancy in areas, which have not been made part of any village has proved a great hardship to the lot of the cultivators in the reclaimed areas of the Sundarbans, large tracts of which reclaimed about 50 years ago are even now described as lot numbers such and such, and the tenants there have to depend for continuance of their residency and cultivation upon the sweet will of the landlords or more properly of their subordinate officers. The provision about the effect of written registered leases or mortgages by raiyats is so incomplete and anomalous that one has to refer to rulings

instead of the enactments in order to understand how the law stands. This, in my view, is also undersirable. The law should be clear and definite and should not leave a large range of discretion to judges amongst whom there is a great diversity of views and temperament. There is no definition of *abwab* in the Act. The proviso to section 66 also operates very harshly on the under-raiyat.

Further, I would say that so long as holdings are not made freely transferable, the raiyats cannot feel that those are their own. They cannot sell them in time of need and even by sale they cannot realise the full value of their lands as a good slice of it is taken by the landlord. Holdings sold in mortgage sales do not bring their proper value as it is not known whether the landlord would recognise the transfer or what *salami* he would demand. It would be adding insult to injury to say that the raiyats are improvident and that they do not know how to protect their holdings from the clutches of rapacious money-lenders. Apart from the defects, some of which I have just enumerated, the movement of time has rendered it necessary to give a higher and better status to the raiyats. They have not the power to fell trees which have been grown by them; they cannot build any masonry construction without the landlords' consent. My zamindar friends in this Council will bear me out when I say that even the construction of some brick steps leading to their rooms to prevent stumbling down in the rainy season requires propitiation of not only the zamindars but of their underlings. We hear much of the scarcity of good drinking water, of the need for excavation of tanks and for other sanitary measures. Even those raiyats who have the means and the inclination to remove the distress of their neighbours by excavation of a tank cannot do it on account of the *salami* the amount of which depends directly upon the degree of want felt in the village for drinking water. I ask this Council to consider whether the dearth of good drinking water in this province is not mainly due to this cause. I think I can assure this Council that if this disability is removed the number of tanks supplying good drinking water will increase by leaps and bounds.

Sir, the time has come for the leaders of the province to show something more than profession of sympathy and to remove the impression that the cry for sanitation, health, better housing is not a cant but is really felt. Would you believe that some landlord in one locality has taken from the tenants *kabuliyats* by which they renounced the claim for the fruits of trees grown by them and which had been enjoyed by them for many generations? Sir, if we want to save this country from the upheavals suffered in Russia and the neighbouring countries, the visionary versions of which are reaching the ears of the cultivators of our country, it is high time that we should take a bold and vigorous step to save the country from a violent convulsion.

The Committee proposed to be appointed will be free to consider these and other questions which may come up before them.

Lastly, I might respectfully suggest, as it is not mentioned in my resolution, that the Government, while appointing the Committee in case the resolution is accepted, might fix a time-limit say, at least three months within which the Report of the Committee should come before the Council.

As to the formation of the Committee, I leave it to the discretion of the Government to appoint non-official members who, I hope, will represent the interests of the landlords and tenants. The presence of the Director of Land Records and some Settlement Officers and Judicial Officers will be of valuable assistance to the Committee on account of their experience in dealing with these problems.

With these few words, I commend my resolution to the acceptance of the Council.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: On behalf of the landlords of Bengal whom I have the honour to represent in this Council, I accord my hearty support to the resolution so far as it relates to the appointment of a committee and also to its aim and object. The present Bengal Tenancy Act was passed 30 years ago. It covered an extensive area including the provinces of Bengal, Bihar and Orissa and a part of Assam. It was enacted at a time when the legislators themselves had only an imperfect knowledge of the incidence of the Bengal Tenancy. Consequently many of its provisions have since been found to be extremely vague and indefinite and in some important aspects even contrary to the local usage and custom. As a result, a formidable crop of [illegible] High Court rulings have come into existence and rendered the Act even more obscure and complex. And it is keenly felt by every one interested in the matter that to conform with the actual condition and to suit the present-day requirements of the country the existing Tenancy Act should be thoroughly overhauled. This, however, cannot be effected without a thorough inquiry by a competent committee into the whole system of land tenure in Bengal, as well as the effects of the working of the present Act. It was for this reason that in the old Council, I myself gave notice of a resolution praying for the appointment of such a committee to inquire and suggest adequate measures. My resolution was withdrawn on the understanding that the Government too was contemplating an inquiry and only waited for the Settlement Reports of some of the important districts in each Division before taking the necessary action in the matter. I am therefore very glad to find that almost a similar resolution has been brought before the House by the representative of great community which is mainly agricultural by occupation and constitutes a very large portion of our tenantry.

I do not know whether the Government is now ready to appoint a committee. As far as I know the Settlement Reports of any of the important districts of the Rajshahi and Presidency Divisions have not

been published yet. I attach a special importance to these reports because conditions differ widely from district to district. Great care has been taken by the Settlement Department to collect accurate information of the incidence of tenancy in the districts where settlement operations have been completed. As such, these reports are almost indispensable to any inquiry into the land laws of Bengal.

Now one word about the personnel of the committee. This is the only objectionable feature in the hon'ble mover's resolution. The committee must be a strong and representative one. The Rent Commission of 1880 was presided over by Mr. H. J. Dampier, the then Senior Member of the Board of Revenue, a very high and honourable post of those days and all the other members of the committee were high Government officials or shining luminaries of the Bench and the Bar and though the landed interests were poorly represented on the committee, it included one of the ablest members of our community, I mean, Raja Peary Mohan Mukherjee. The committee suggested by the mover seems to me to be rather poor and to a certain extent one-sided. Such a committee should be presided over by a person having wide reputation for justice and fair mindedness and not below the rank of a High Court Judge. If I may be permitted to make a suggestion I would suggest that the committee should be presided over by the present Revenue Member himself than whom a greater friend of the raiyats and a more just and liberal-minded landlord and official, it is hard to get. Sir, the committee must proceed to work with an open and unbiased mind. It must work for the common good of the raiyats and the zamindars and it must not make any suggestion that might embitter our relations. If the present condition of the country requires any interference with the long established usage or custom of the country or the vested interests of the tenants and landlords it should provide for adequate compensation to the affected party.

Sir, in this connection, I would like to refer to a practice which is indulged in, in season and out of season, to vilify the zamindars as a class by some members of the Council who pose as friends of the raiyats but, in reality, are not the friends of the raiyats of the cultivator class who are the backbone of our tenantry but of the so-called raiyats of the *mokarari* and usurious money-lender class who are displacing the real raiyats. Sir, I admit that this class of raiyats do not like the zamindars and perhaps they are justified in not liking us because we, too, do not like them. Sir, we do not care what these people think of us and we can very well afford to ignore their onslaughts against us because we are quite secure and in full enjoyment of love, affection and confidence of the real raiyats of the land. If a proof is needed, I point out to the composition of this Council. There is not a single row of benches in this House, which does not contain a landlord, and it is by the votes of the raiyats that they have been able to come here and would to God that they would [illegible] to do so. If we were really grasping vampires and

enemies of the raiyats they would have hardly sent us here to represent them.

It might be said that illiterate, ignorant and overawed tenants were forced to return us, but who do you think is the representative of the University of Calcutta? He is a big zamindar, I mean Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur. Who are the chosen representatives of Indian Commerce here? Raja Reshee Case Law and Mr. Tarit Bhusan Roy who are both big zamindars. Did we force the hands of the Government to nominate two of their ablest Ministers from our community? Who is here to defend the interests of the tenants on behalf of the Government? It is the premier zamindar of Bengal. Sir, if we were really the enemies of the raiyats, could we have secured the confidence not only of the raiyats themselves but also of the University graduates, commercial people and the Government? Sir, I would not detain the House any longer I only wanted to show our true position in relation to our tenants and that we [illegible] confidence and this regard if we only exploited our [illegible].

[illegible] will support the resolution if the mover agrees [illegible] of the committee in the hands of the Government [illegible] the Government thinks that the time is ripe for the appointment of a committee.

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: I [illegible] this stage for two reasons: first of all, probably [illegible] the attitude of Government is, will clear up [illegible] and secondly that it might help to make the flow of [illegible] little less.

The [illegible] has been engaging the attention of Government for a [illegible] as to the lines on which the Bengal Tenancy Act [illegible] be further amended especially in connection with the position of [illegible] raiyats. I am sorry that although the Bill that was introduced the other day by Maulvi Yakuinuddin Ahmed had many serious defects, yet it was not allowed to be introduced in this Council for the simple reason that if it had been permitted to go to the stage of collecting opinions, it might have assisted Government in getting hold of the requirements that are urgently needed to amend the Bengal Tenancy Act. However it is most welcome to me to find my friend Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray speaking on behalf of the landlords' representatives in this Council in support of the proposal of a committee. That is the right spirit to take, if I may say so, for in these days it would never do for the zamindars to take up an attitude of hostility or of obsolete conservatism. We have got to move on with the times. I welcome the suggestion that has come from the mover of this resolution with regard to the appointment of a committee to inquire into the requirements of the Bengal Tenancy Act in the way of further amendments. I hope my friend the Kumar will not get angry with me, when I say that I thank

him cordially for having said a good word for the Settlement Department, because when he opposed me with regard to the grants for the survey and settlement operations, he certainly did not pay the Settlement Department the same compliment which he has done to-day. I freely welcome this, and I hope that the Kumar has paid us this compliment, sincerely believing in the good that the Settlement Department does, and not because now that we are about to consider what amendments are necessary with regard to the Bengal Tenancy Act he thinks a change of attitude wise; but I must say that the Kumar has certainly raised a very important point, namely the need of settlement reports to help us in legislating. When the Kumar brought his resolution in the old Council, Sir John Cumming (then Mr. Cumming) in reply gave him the assurance that Government itself was considering as to what action it should take, and with regard to the other questions, Sir John Cumming, in the course of his argument in reply to him, said that it was very important to get the reports of the major districts where settlement operations were in progress. Unfortunately, as I explained in this Council when introducing the Budget, so far as it related to my departments and to the settlement operations, our progress has been slow. In consequence, if we were to wait we would be waiting longer than it would perhaps be healthy for the country to do in a matter which is engaging a great deal of attention nowadays outside and, especially in this Council, where we all welcome the larger number of the representatives of the tenants. For these reasons, I see no objection to such a committee, but my friend, the Kumar, has very rightly pointed out that the committee, in the way in which it has been worded in the resolution, would be an impossible committee. In the first place, the committee, as suggested by Babu Bhishmadev Das, if accepted, would exclude expert zamindars and jurists or lawyers among the non-officials, who have special knowledge of the revenue laws and Tenancy Act in Bengal. On the other hand, he has only put in the Director of Land Records. I do not know what particular affection he has for Mr. Sachse, unless it be his stature, but he has excluded the revenue Secretary without whom such a committee would be quite incomplete. For these reasons, I would suggest that if the mover of the resolution were to accept the modification of the wording in the resolution which I will read out, I would be willing to leave this resolution to the free vote of the Council in so far as the Government officials are concerned. If the mover has no objection, I would like to word the resolution as follows:—

"This Council recommends to the Government that a committee consisting of officials and non-officials to be appointed by Government be formed to consider and report what amendments are needed in the Bengal Tenancy Act."

I am quite willing, on behalf of Government, to accept the resolution in the above form.

Babu BHISHMADEV DAS: I accept the amendment proposed by the Hon'ble Member in charge.

The PRESIDENT: The mover of the resolution has accepted the amendment proposed by the Hon'ble Member in charge and the discussion will now go on the basis of that.

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: I rise to a point of order. After the mover has accepted the amended resolution I do not know if it is at all necessary to have any further discussion on the subject.

The PRESIDENT: The mover accepts the amendment proposed by the Hon'ble Member in charge but that does not do away with the necessity of a discussion. I shall put the resolution in the amended form after those who desire to speak have spoken.

Khan Bahadur Maulvi WASIMUDDIN AHMED: I heartily support the resolution in its amended form as suggested by the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan. It is an admitted fact that three-fourths of the civil cases that crop up in the mufassal have reference to the Bengal Tenancy Act. These litigations affect the people who, it is desirable, should live in peace and amity and ply their humble professions on the success of which depends the prosperity of the nation. Some sections of the Bengal Tenancy Act are very vague and some others have to be applied with reference to the local customs and usages. We all know how difficult it is to determine what local customs and usages are within the narrow compass of a suit. Any attempt at the task would entail such expenditure and waste of time and energy that no landlords have ever succeeded to prove any custom or usage, not to speak of a ryot. So it is highly desirable that a committee should determine what customs and usages are prevalent in what parts of the district or districts without leaving the matter to the judiciary to determine these customs, they should form a schedule to the Act in order to show the position of the tenants and the zamindars so that every one may have a clear idea of one's rights and obligations. Without such a clear conception of one's right one cannot shape his activity. Even a lawyer of considerable practice cannot form an idea of what amount of evidence would be necessary to establish a particular custom or usage and it is so very elastic that what one court may consider sufficient evidence may appear to another court quite insufficient and the ryots often fall victims to such vagaries of law and decisions. Moreover, to secure justice means such a high amount of cost and trouble that it is next to impossible for an ordinary ryot to command. The Calcutta High Court has drawn a very nice distinction between the right of cutting down trees and that of appropriating the wood and has distributed the burden of proving the custom on the landlord and the tenants with the result that the tenants in the estates of smart landlords have found it difficult to get the small

quantity of wood necessary for making their ploughs, though the required trees are growing on his own land to the detriment of his interests. The landlords have ceased to excavate tanks and wells. Formerly the landlords used to excavate tanks and wells and to make other improvements in order to attract tenants. Now with the increase of tenants and with the increase of population they have ceased to make these improvements. So the raiyats should have a free hand in effecting these improvements themselves without let or hindrance. The transferability of the right of occupancy holdings depends on local custom and usage; and this has led to many litigations and brought about ruin to many cultivators. Trying to improve their lot by purchasing some lands they have often lost what they had before in the litigation and the landlords without making any consideration for the purchase which gave them the opportunity of re-entry into their lands, have realised a large amount of profits by settling the lands with new tenants. It is high time that the people should not be allowed to live in a fool's paradise but must be made aware of their position. Hitherto by invoking the aid of the local custom and usage the raiyats could save their holdings from the clutches of the *mahajans* and the money-lenders, whenever they sought to sell their holdings in execution of money decrees. But I am sorry to say that Mr. Justice Mukherji's recent ruling has created a very serious situation and has sent a thrill of horror throughout the length and breadth of this province. That legal prodigy, the towering genius sitting on the bench of the High Court and far away from the pangs and sorrows of Bengal peasant life has, in his infinite mercy towards poor raiyats, decided

The PRESIDENT: You should not make any reflection on the Judges of the High Court.

Khan Bahadur Maulvi WASIMUDDIN AHMED: It is not a reflection.

The PRESIDENT: I think you may refer to the decision without mentioning any names.

Khan Bahadur Maulvi WASIMUDDIN AHMED: Very well, I may only refer to the fact that it is decided that the tenants have got some right which can be put up to sale, but the tenants have not the right to object to it, but the same right of objection has been reserved to the landlord.

The PRESIDENT: I do not think that this is at all relevant to the matter we are now considering. The subject which we are discussing at present is whether a committee should be formed to consider and report what amendments are necessary in the Bengal Tenancy Act.

Khan Bahadur Maulvi WASIMUDDIN AHMED: These are suggestions which may be considered. (Cries of "Order", "Order.")

The PRESIDENT: I rule that you are out of order.

[While walking into the Council Chamber, Dr. A. Suhrawardy asked whether it was permissible to any member of Council to call another member to order.]

The PRESIDENT: Any member may rise to a point of order, and I have to decide whether he is right or wrong.

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: I think that any Member who wishes to raise a point of order should do so from his seat and not do so while walking into the Hall of Legislature.

Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: Is a member restricted from criticising the judgment of the Hon'ble Judges of the High Court?

The PRESIDENT: I have already ruled that criticisms of decisions of the Judges of the High Court are improper and irrelevant.

Khan Bahadur Maulvi WASIMUDDIN AHMED: My point.

The PRESIDENT: I have ruled that you are out of order.

Khan Bahadur Maulvi WASIMUDDIN AHMED: My point is that, as a new Court of Law has been created, no time should be lost in forming a committee and that the committee should set to work at once.

Babu NITYA DHON MUKHERJEE: I move that the question be now put.

The motion that the question be now put was put and agreed to.

The resolution in the following amended form was put and agreed to:

"This Council recommends to the Government that a committee consisting of officials and non-officials to be appointed by Government be formed to consider and report what amendments are needed in the Bengal Tenancy Act."

Withdrawal of Resolution.

Owing to the absence of Maulvi A. K. Fazl-ul Haq, the following resolution was deemed to have been withdrawn:

"This Council recommends to the Government that two more Judges be appointed to the Calcutta Court of Small Causes without delay."

Postponement of Resolution.

The PRESIDENT: As Rai Lalit Mohan Singh Roy Bahadur has requested that this resolution be postponed, it goes to the bottom of the List.

It runs as follows: "This Council recommends to the Government to appoint a committee of scientific experts, both Indian and European, to report on the possibilities of manufacturing such articles as magnetos,

incandescent lamps, ferro-tungsten, "high speed" steel, graphite crucibles, special forms of porcelain for insulators, chemical glass, certain forms of heavy chemicals, motor tyres, locomotives and glass."

Industrial Boards.

Mr. KRISHNA CHANDRA RAY CHAUDHURI: "This Council recommends to the Government that early steps be taken to establish or institute Industrial Boards for determination of a minimum wage for each industry in Bengal."

My object in bringing this resolution before the Council is to draw the attention of the Government and the members of Council to the low rates of wages paid to employees in a large number of Trades and Industries in this province.

There was overwhelming evidence before the Industrial Unrest Committee of which I was a member that strikes of workmen in large industries arose in majority of cases from demand for higher wages. Out of 137 strikes which occurred between July, 1920 and March, 1921, 110 were due to demand for higher wages and 74 of these strikes, *viz.*, 65 per cent were settled by yielding to the strikers' demand wholly or partially or by making promises to meet the demand. I found from personal inquiries that workers in small industries and trades, such as ready-made tailoring carried on in Garden Reach, tanneries in Tengra, the small printing presses the oil-mills and soap factories in this city and in other trades are paid wages hardly sufficient to meet the high cost of living. The shop assistants of Calcutta engaged in the New Market, Chandney and throughout Calcutta are the worst victims of long hours and small pay. A large body of women-workers engaged in the export produce trade, *viz.*, shellac, linseed, and other seeds, equally suffer for want of a living wage and I am of opinion that if women-workers in Commercial Calcutta had received anything like fair wages there would have been less of the unfortunate class.

Sir, I want a discussion in this House on the great question the bread and butter question - that affects the lives of millions, *viz.*— What is a living wage in India? The doctrine of a "living wage" has been discussed by great economists and labour leaders in Europe and America and one of them said, as far back as 1892, that "it was a vital principle that a man by his labour should live and notwithstanding all the doctrines of the Political Economists, all the doctrines taught by way of supply and demand, there is a greater doctrine over-riding all these and that is the doctrine of humanity."

The cost of living and the monthly index of the cost of living was discussed by the Imperial Conference on statistics in 1920, and it was resolved that the Index Number should be so constructed that their comparison for any two dates should express the proportion of the aggregate expenditure on the selected list of representative commodities

in the quantities selected as appropriate at the one date, to the aggregate expenditure on the same list of commodities in the same quantities at the other date. The Egyptian Ministry of Finance collected family budgets of 713 families of Egyptian clerks, and Egyptian artisans and labourers and collected informations regarding

(1) The composition and earnings of the family.

(2) The principal expenses for the year ended March 1st, 1920, upon rent, clothing, medical attendance and certain food articles (wheat, butter, lentels (dal), onions, garlic).

(3) Detailed expenditure from March 1st to 7th in 1920 upon specified foods, fuel, lighting, rent, taxation and various miscellaneous items.

It was recently calculated in Egypt that in 1920, the cost of living since pre-war days increased 92 per cent. for clerks and 97 per cent. for labourers and artisans.

I should like to see a similar inquiry into family budgets of clerks, artisans and labourers in Bengal and results published.

It is past history in all Christian countries where labour was formerly paid just enough to feed and clothe, just to keep body and soul together and not to worry about other good things which were meant for people who did no manual work.

In less than 50 years, the combination of industrial workers in the West and in the British Colonies brought about an Industrial revolution and all theories and practices regarding wages and conditions of work have undergone marvellous changes for the benefit of the majority of mankind known as "manual workers." They were once described as "bottom" dogs but they are now climbing to the top and will soon dictate to the minority of mankind, viz., those who possess properties or brains or both what is right and what is wrong. Industrial West has thundered and the echo is here. The West has long repudiated the idea that labour should be treated as a merchandize and the price paid for it, viz., wages, should be regulated by its demand and supply. In the East and specially in India where labour is just passing through a transitory state from being agricultural to industrial, this soulless idea of labour being a commodity is deep rooted everywhere in the country. It is common knowledge that Industrial wages in India are more or less regulated by the rates paid for agricultural labour, that is to say, that if a field-labourer gets four annas a day in the village or a peasant makes that much out of his produce per day, give the poor devil an anna or two more and transport him and his family, if agreeable, to the suburbs of Calcutta or to the jungles of Assam. It does not matter about the destruction of his family life by such transportation or his freedom and cheerfulness, his compensation is to be two annas more than he earns at home per day.

Sir, I maintain that this is the doctrine that our employers hold in India and one of the objects of my resolution is to press the Government to take immediate steps to investigate the economic position of

labour in Bengal and to intervene between capital and labour and if investigations prove that wages in such and such trades and industries are miserably low and cannot possibly maintain workers except at the cost of their health and without suffering, fix a minimum wage.

England, notwithstanding its industrial policy of non-intervention, recognised the principle that the State must intervene between capital and labour in the matter of wages and the British Parliament on the motion of Mr Winston Churchill passed the first Trade Boards Act in 1909, to improve the miserable lot of ill-paid and long-worked men and women engaged in sweated industries and trades such as ready-made tailoring, chain-making, button-making and similar small trades. Statutory Industrial Boards or Wages Boards were first initiated in the State of Victoria in Australia and was copied by almost all the States of Australia.

The second Trade Boards Act, known as the Amending Act, was passed by the British Parliament in 1918, hardly three years ago, and the Bill was introduced by Mr. Roberts, the Minister of Labour. It amended the old Act to extend its scope to any other industry that the Ministry of Labour thought fit, provided it is satisfied that the rate of wages in any of the trades is exceptionally low as compared with other employment. The objects of that Act were to remedy existing abuses in regard to sweated industries. Sweating is understood to mean that the work is paid for, at a rate which, in the condition under which as any of the work-people do it, yields to them an income which is quite insufficient to enable an adult person to obtain anything like proper food, clothing and house accommodation.

The British Boards consist of members, mostly economic experts appointed by the Labour Ministry, and equal number of representatives of employers and workers, and the duties of the Boards are to fix a general minimum time-rate wages for time-work, to fix a general minimum piece-rate of wages for piece-work and over-time, etc.

Penalties for not paying minimum rate is, on summary conviction, a fine not exceeding £20 and £5 for each day after conviction. For refusal to comply with the lawful requirements of officers a fine not exceeding £5 in respect of each offence.

For a false list a fine not exceeding £20 or three months' imprisonment with or without hard labour.

I venture to say that if England, notwithstanding her strong trade unions and healthy public opinion, felt the necessity of passing such an Act, the necessity in India, where employers are all powerful and legitimate combinations of workmen are in the infancy, the necessity, I say, is much greater.

I know fully well that this Council has no power to legislate on this question, but I want Bengal, with its teeming population of industrial workers approaching a million, to press the Government of India for the passing of a similar Act.

I maintain, Sir, that most of our industries are sweated industries with a few notable exceptions. One has to glance at statistics of wages in different industries, published by the department of Statistics and other bodies to find that very few workers in paper mills, in our collieries, in tea plantations, in rice and oil mills, in small foundries in our jute presses, get anything like living wages. Take, for example, the tea plantations in Darjeeling, the Dooars and Chittagong, which employ 250,000 men, women and children with a paid-up capital of about 7 crores of rupees (English and Indian Companies) and which is the second largest Industry in Bengal. Average wages in the Dooars including "ticca," diet rations, subsistence allowance and bonus per head are about Rs. 8 per month for men, Rs. 7 for women, and Rs. 4 for children. I grant that some of the coolies have cultivation of their own. I grant that occasionally they are supplied with grain and things at cost price. I grant that they have some sort of sheds for shelter with free medical treatment and medicines, but when one computes the money value of all these items, they cannot exceed Rs. 2 per month per head, which means Rs. 10 for men, Rs. 9 for women and Rs. 6 for children. I make bold to say that in these days of high prices and of slightly increased standard of living these figures do not by any means represent living wages. According to Prison Statistics of Bengal the cost of feeding and clothing a Jail prisoner was Rs. 86 a year or over Rs. 7 a month in 1919-20. Sir, I find from tables of Tea Gardens vital statistics that, out of a total labour force of 11[illegible] in Sylhet District 5 [illegible] in 1919-20 from all causes, including 686 deaths from [illegible]. I am not a medical man, but I believe that underfeeding is one of the causes of anaemia. I would like any hon'ble member of this Council representing Tea Industry, to explain this to us. I take it that in the Dooars Tea gardens vital statistics are similar.

I appeal to the Government and to the members of this Council to help, in the first instance, in constituting a committee of economic experts and representatives of employers and employees to investigate the rates of wages paid to different industrial workers and the committee is to recommend to employers to fix a minimum wage for each industry.

I would like to see an All-India Act to abolish sweating by fixing a rate of something like one and a half anna per hour as a general minimum piece rate of wages based on 48 hours a week with over time for all industrial workers including plantations.

With these words I commend this motion which practically amounts to a request for an inquiry about "low wages" paid to workers in certain industries of Bengal, and the recognition of the principle of the right of State intervention between labour and capital to the acceptance of this Council.

Mr. R. M. WATSON-SMYTH: I think the mover of this resolution will do me credit for having no idea hostile to labour in my opposition to this resolution. He and I have worked together more than once

during recent months and I think that we have to a great extent got to know and to appreciate each others' point of view. That he has brought forward this resolution entirely in what he thinks is the interest of labour, and without any hostile intention towards employers, I have no doubt, and at the same time I can assure him that I only oppose it because I think he is honestly mistaken, and that any such Industrial Board as he suggests, would be both expensive and unnecessary.

I would like to point out, in the first place, that a resolution of this kind should hardly be brought forward in the provincial Council. The right place for it, if there is a right place, should be the Legislative Assembly at Simla or Delhi, for any legislation of this kind cannot possibly be provincial, it must be imperial. You cannot have an Industrial Board determining minimum wages in one province, while other provinces have no such institution and no such rules and regulations. How would it be possible, I ask, as an instance, how would it be possible to develop and work your coal-fields in Bengal?

Mr. KRISHNA CHANDRA RAY CHAUDHURI: I said it would be only a Provincial Board.

Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ: May I rise to a point of order? When a resolution is on the list can it be questioned?

The PRESIDENT: A member by way of argument may say that a Provincial Board will not find it possible to discharge its duty proposed to be entrusted to it.

Mr. R. M. WATSON-SMYTH: That is what I was about to say. What I was going to say is how would it be possible to develop and work your coal-fields in Bengal, if you were bound and hampered by mining legislation which did not exist in the Bihar and Orissa coal-fields just across the Barakar river? The position would be impossible and absurd, and I repeat that any such Industrial Board, or any such legislation for a minimum wage must be imperial and not provincial.

At the same time, I am prepared to urge that under present conditions, at any rate, such a Board is quite unnecessary. The mover no doubt takes his idea from English legislation, which was entirely directed against certain industries in England, the labour of which was supposed to be sweated, and, in many instances, undoubtedly was sweated. There may possibly be instances of sweating industries in India, but they must be very few, and the industries must be very small. Certainly no such state of things exists amongst the big industries. Those connected, for instance, with our great jute and cotton mills would laugh at the idea of their spinners or weavers being regarded as sweated labour. Far from being sweated they are, I assure you, very truculent and quite able to look after themselves. Then again the coal industry which has been specially mentioned is equally far removed from any suspicion of sweated labour. To anyone who has experience of the

Indian miner, especially those from the Santhal Parganas, the idea of sweating is ridiculous. If there is one man who it is quite impossible to sweat, who is most independent, and who will not do one handful of work more that he wants to, it is the Santhal miner. He comes to one's colliery with his own idea of how he wants to live: how he wants to work: how much money he wants to earn, and if the conditions at your colliery fit in with his ideas, he may condescend to stay there for the period usually a short period, during which he stays in the coal-fields. If conditions do not suit him, he goes off elsewhere. How can you sweat labour, if there is not enough labour to go round. That is the test that should be applied to these indiscriminate statements of bad treatment and resultant low wages. We, the big industries, are all competing one with another for labour. None of us have got as much as we want, and we know, quite apart from any feelings of humanity, that if we do not pay our labour well and do them well, they will go elsewhere. It is therefore to my opinion entirely unnecessary to set up a great institution like an Industrial Board which, if it is to carry out its functions, must have an enormous staff, headed by high officials and finished off by countless inspectors who, as far as I can see, will do a minimum of good with a maximum of trouble and a maximum of expense. These sort of Government institutions are not required at present in this country. It is not labour that requires to be protected. It is the employer of labour. Labour at the moment has everything its own way. The supply, as I said before, is not equal to the demand, and therefore the labourer can extract, within limits, anything that he likes from his employer. There is no question of the hard hearted employer sweating his labour. The protection that is required is for the employer to prevent outside influences inciting badly organized labour to demand outrageous and impossible terms. Therefore, although I look on this resolution as affording an opportunity for an useful discussion on an interesting subject I trust that my friend the mover will not press the resolution which he has brought forward.

Mr. R. H. L. LANCFORD JAMES: Mr. Watson-Smyth has traversed the ground so completely that there is really very little left for me to say. But as I do represent very great tea interests and as Mr. Chaudhuri has referred to the tea industry and as Mr. Watson-Smyth is under the impression that some one representing that interest would speak, I would like to say just a few words. To begin with, Sir, I should like to associate myself with Mr. Watson-Smyth in all he said regarding the mover of this resolution. I recognise, Sir, and I believe the whole Council recognises, the singleness of aim which led the mover to put this resolution on the paper. Mr. Chaudhuri therefore will not mistake my motives in any way if I am unable to agree with him. So far as this Council is concerned, we are dealing with the tea districts of Bengal only, that is to say, the Jalpaiguri district, commonly known as the Dooars, and such districts of the Terai as lie

in Bengal. Well, Sir, very nearly a quarter of a century ago, I started my career in India on a tea estate in the Dooars. We had on that estate a labour force of about 700 or 800 coolies, I think I am right in saying entirely consisting of what we call *jungli* labour, that is to say, Chota Nagpuris, Santhals, Mundas and Oraons. That is the class of labour, Sir, which you find throughout the Dooars gardens. They are the finest labour that goes up to any tea districts; and so far as the Dooars are concerned, they are free labour. There is no indenture, there is no agreement, and, therefore all the remarks that Mr. Watson-Smyth has made regarding the labour in the coal-fields equally apply to these tea garden coolies. They are extremely independent. If they do not wish to work for me, if I do not make it sufficiently attractive to them, I do not keep them. They go off to my next-door neighbour. Only the other day we had a meeting in Calcutta, which was attended by the Chairman of the Dooars planters' Association, and seeing that the question of wages on tea estates had taken such prominence of late, I asked him to give his candid opinion as to the wages in the Dooars. He said "Have you ever been in the Dooars?" I said "Yes, I started my life there in India." He said "Have you ever seen starving coolies in the Dooars or one who is underpaid?" I said "Not in my time," and his reply was "things have not changed since then." Mr. Chaudhuri has put in certain statistics regarding tea garden wages, and I could not quite catch whether his remarks applied to Sylhet or the Dooars.

Mr. KRISHNA CHANDRA RAY CHAUDHURI: They are of the Dooars.

Mr. R. H. L. LANCFORD JAMES: These statistics are hopelessly misleading, Sir. Apart from the fact of the various other items which go to make up the income of a tea garden labourer—apart from all that—those statistics are compiled in such a way as to be extremely misleading as to the position. I am not, I admit, in a position to argue with Mr. Chaudhuri or to go into the details. But what I would ask him is this. Before he comes seriously before this Council and cites the tea industry as one in which a Board for minimum wages should be established I would ask him to go up to Jalpaiguri Dooars, travel through the district, talk to any of our labourers or those on Indian owned concerns, then come back and tell us what he thinks of it.

With regard to the general question of a minimum wage, I personally have had no experience of it, but it appears to me that there would be a very grave danger of the minimum wage becoming the maximum wage. Now in tea, as in every other walk of life, the honest industrious worker comes out on top. He makes the most money and I would like Mr. Chaudhuri to consider whether there may not be a tendency for the minimum wage to become the maximum wage?

There would undoubtedly, from an employer's point of view, be a tendency to see that he is getting his money's worth out of his coolies or out of his labourers under such changed conditions.

When I was in the Dooars, for a large portion of the year, our labourers used to start their work at about 8 o'clock in the morning. In the cold weather by 12 o'clock in the day there was not a soul left in the garden. They had all finished their task and gone! We are told of course that we underpay these people. We do not pay them large wages. We cannot pay them. We have never claimed to pay large wages. But I gave those working hours as an instance that, although the pay may not be large, the hours are extremely light and the labourers are able to devote the remainder of the day to their own concerns, many of which are money-making concerns. Mr. Chaudhuri mentioned the number of deaths in a given year from anaemia in Sylhet. He said that he believed that anaemia came from under-feeding. Now anaemia is simply another word for our old friend hookworm. When I was a tea planter in my young days—and as the Surgeon-General is not present I may venture to say that we used to call it [illegible] anaemia. It is the same anaemia and it is now hookworm. But one more word. I would urge Mr. Chaudhuri very seriously to consider one [illegible] which appeals to me more than any other, as [illegible] we all know we have been going through a very troublous [illegible] labour. So far nothing particularly tangible [illegible] in the Dooars; but we who are interested in tea know that [illegible] the Dooars has not escaped the campaign which has met with [illegible] success in the Surma Valley. I saw a letter only the other day which summed up the situation, I thought, extremely well. It was written by the manager of an estate in the Dooars. He said: "So far we have had no trouble among our labourers, but that agitation is at work among them there is no conceivable doubt. They appear to be looking forward in an attitude of expectancy to some great event that may be going or will be going to take place." In other words, Sir, the atmosphere as regards labour in the Dooars is very far from normal and I think myself that it would be the greatest mistake at the present time to risk taking action which might lead to the most serious results. I have no more to say but I commend that point in particular to the mover of the resolution.

Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: I rise to support the resolution. The resolution as far as it goes asks the Council to recommend to Government the establishment of an Industrial Board for the purpose of settling the minimum wages of labour.

The first question which arises in my mind is: Is it necessary to have to establish an Industrial Board or not? The second question is a question of details. Can there be any doubt about that? I submit to the Council that it is necessary to have such a Board. I say

this because the Council knows that there is considerable discontent and unrest on the labour question and if that be so, is it not desirable that there should be a Board to settle the question at issue? It is a world-problem which has affected the world-wide rise of prices of food-stuffs, clothes and everything. Those things have driven the labourers to ask for an increased rate of wages. If that argument stands upon correct premises then, I contend, that it is necessary that a Board should be established. There are many factors which go for consideration The standard of living, the market rate and also the status of the labourers are to be taken to an account.

The standard of living ought to be raised. Are the coolies to starve? Are the coolies to remain naked? I do say that it is necessary that in discussing the question of minimum wages, these fact rs ought to be taken into consideration, and can there be any doubt in the present day in the present century that when we are under the protection of the British Government the labourers are not to be left adrift? They should get higher wages than now, and Mr. Chaudhuri has come forward with a modest proposal that the whole matter should be discussed by Industrial Boards One question arises, viz., what should be the maximum wages, but so far as I understand, the Boards being in a position to settle the question of minimum wages, it will not be difficult for them to come to a proper conclusion as to maximum wages Therefore, I think, if the procedure recommended by Mr Chaudhuri be accepted, the labour trouble, which is going on in this province for some time, will be over If I am to rely on my experience on the subject, what I find is that in the mufassal there is a great deal of trouble We find that formerly we used to get labourers at 4 to 6 annas a day, but now the charge is 14 annas or one rupee Just as I was coming to the Council to-day, I had to pay Re 1 per head to some coolies for doing certain work These are troubles which ought to be grappled with firmly and strongly There should not be any hesitation in the matter There are employers on the one side who must have their profits, and there are labourers on the other who should get living wages How can that be arranged? That can be secured by the establishment of a committee representing both sides, namely, the capitalists and the labourers The labour question is a very difficult one it is a question which is the subject matter for discussion everywhere in the world, and, consequently, we find it necessary that it should be settled here in Bengal Therefore I say that the necessity is very great, and if anyone comes forward and challenges me and says that it is not necessary to do so, all that I can say is that he is perfectly wrong. I do not discuss the question of details, but I do say that the dictates of humanity demand that this resolution should be accepted.

Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: I thank Mr Chaudhuri for his sympathy towards the poor labourers of Bengal. I am of opinion that

Industrial Boards should be appointed, not for the determination of minimum wages but for the settlement of disputes between capital and labour. The remedy which has been suggested does not appear to me to be the right one. Sir, he has suggested to us the appointment of Industrial Boards to fix the minimum wage on account of the high prices of food-grains and other necessaries of life. I think, Sir, if we fix the minimum wage of labourers in an industry like rice or other food-grains, I am sure it will raise the prices of those articles of food. Similarly in the case of other industries, the fixing of a minimum wage will raise the price of the produce thereof. So the remedy which is suggested appears to me to be worse than the disease itself. I am sure if the minimum wage is raised, it will encourage idleness and discourage technical education. I am afraid we want skilled labour in Bengal, and, therefore, I am sure if we fix a minimum wage, people will not take to technical education, because however unskilled they may be, they will be sure that they will get the minimum wage. The question is one of demand and supply, which should concern the Controller and not the Government. It is not desirable, unless there are special reasons to the contrary, that Government should interfere with the trade. If you fix a minimum wage, then, as in the case of England and other countries of the world, there will be lots of people unemployed. If, on account of the raising of the minimum wage, the capitalists cannot make profit, they will certainly close their works, and this will throw a large number of men out of employment. I admit that the wages of the coolies in the tea estates are not adequate. The contract system under which the coolies of the tea estates work is not a sound one, and the sooner the law is repealed the better. In the case of the coal industry, in the case of the jute industry, and in the case of other industries, I find that there is no such system, and I have not heard of any complaint from the labourers thereof.

With these remarks, I am sorry I have to oppose the resolution.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: I confess I was very much surprised to hear the representatives of capital opposing this resolution. Those days are gone, when labour used to try to do the least and capital used to try to pay the least. These are days of co-operation between labour and capital, and unless there is cordial and healthy co-operation between those two important elements, every industry must suffer. That being so, I am surprised that any representative of capital should oppose this resolution, which gives them the advantage of securing a willing and contented labour. These are the days, when the industrial development of the country is being taken up in right earnest. Every day and every week we hear of new joint-stock companies being floated for developing certain industries. The time has come when, unless some minimum wage is fixed for labourers, the

struggle between labour and capital, which has been so much in evi dence of late will go on. My friend, Babu Amulya Dhone Addy, ha spoken of the law of supply and demand. Sir, of all the economi laws, the iron law of supply and demand in connection with labour especially in a poor country like India, is the most cruel. You ca get a starving labourer for 2 annas a day, but everybody will admi that this paltry sum is not sufficient to meet even his bare requirements That is not the way to get your work done. You must give him a wag that will enable him to keep his body and soul together. During th last 20 years, the prices of all necessaries of life have gone up abnor mally. May I ask the employers of labour in tea industries, by wha percentage they have increased the pay of their coolies during the las 20 years? Mr. James has mentioned that anaemia is due to hookworm Since hookworm was discovered a few years ago, it seems to have bee made the cause of all sorts of troubles and difficulties in our country but I do not know how anaemia, which comes from starvation, ca have any connection with this inoffensive worm. Sir, if the capitalist really want their interests to be safeguarded, if they want to preven frequent strikes, they must be prepared to give fair wages to the laboure so that they can demand a fair amount of work in return.

With these few words, I beg to support the resolution.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: This is a matte of great difficulty. The condition of industry in this country is not matter so lightly to be dealt with. I have been all my life workin to the best of my little powers for the improvement of the industrie of this country, and I know what grave difficulties there are in th way of our industries. The first and the greatest amongst them is th work of organisation of labour. You bring in English ideas here, bu where is the organisation of labour? You employ a man here in agr culture or in an industry and you will find the difficulty. You pay hi Rs. 6 or Rs. 7 and he will not give you any work at all. No man her will work on the contract system - so much work done, so much pay ment. It is the English large capitalists who organise labour an there you find the piece-system. I find from personal experience thi organisation of labour is the most difficult part in the way of ou industries. Now you talk of fixing a minimum wage. For whom For whom do you say so? I say it is a very good thing to be assure that labourers should be well paid, but as it now stands, I suppos Mr. Chaudhuri knows it very well, the labourers of Calcutta are muc better off than they are supposed to be. Fixing of a minimum wag for us educated people is required. There are also other views of th matter I am considered to be rather leaning towards extremism, bu you will find that I wholly disagree with them. They say there shoul be no organisation of labour, but there should be only cottage indu tries. The great difference between me and the agitators is that

want the industries to be developed, they want to go back to the cottages. They want *charkas*, I want the great big mills. I can go on for days on this question, but I will not take up any more time of the Council.

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of COMMERCE (the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr): I must confess that I was somewhat surprised when I received notice of this resolution about the middle of last month. For some weeks before then, Mr. Chaudhuri and I had been sitting on a committee, which was appointed at the request of this Council, to inquire into the causes of industrial unrest in Bengal. The committee was, if I may say so, a very competent body. On the side of the employers it contained Sir Alexander Murray and Mr. Watson-Smyth. On the side of labour, the committee included Mr. Chaudhuri himself and Babu Hem Chandra Bhattacharji, the other labour member in this Council. As representatives of the general public, we had Dr. Hassan Suhrawardy and Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur whose sympathy with the working classes is well-known. Now that committee, as I have said, sat for several weeks and explored a large number of questions bearing on labour unrest. In the committee Mr. Chaudhuri made no suggestion regarding a minimum wage, and in view of his speech to-day I cannot help thinking that this was a great pity. If the question of a minimum wage had been brought up before the committee, we could have gone into it thoroughly from every aspect in the same way as we treated the other proposals which were put before us. I mean no disrespect to this Council when I say that probably very few of the members have made any study of this particular problem of the minimum wage. I frankly confess that up till a fortnight ago, I had only a very general acquaintance with the subject. Since then I have made it my business to study the literature on the subject, and if anybody cares to come into my room in Writers' Buildings, he will see that that literature is very considerable. I say therefore that I think it is a pity this question was not examined by the recent committee before it was brought up for discussion in this Council. However, as the question has been mooted, we must deal with it as best as we can, though it is difficult to treat the subject in a speech on an occasion of this kind. In the present state of public knowledge, it is a matter for the lecture hall or for the study rather than for this Council, and I trust that the Council will excuse me if my remarks seem to take rather the form of a lecture than a debating speech.

Mr. Chaudhuri has given us quite correctly a history of the Trade Boards Act in England, a statement of the functions which the authorities exercise under the Act and the penalties which are imposed for disobedience of the Act. I need not repeat what he has said on these points. What he has not told us is how the Act is working, and as I have collected considerable information on that subject, I may perhaps

be allowed to place it before the Council briefly. Now the first thing to notice is that the present Trade Boards Act only came into force in 1918. The original Act of 1909 applied only to four trades, the ready-made tailoring trade, paper box-making, the finishing processes of the lace trade and chain-making. It was only in 1918 that the Ministry of Labour was given power to extend the Act to other trades in which there was reason to believe that the wages paid were not sufficient. The Act, therefore, has really been in force for about three years only. Now it would appear that this legislation worked fairly well at first because wages were then rising. There are not wanting signs, however, of serious dissatisfaction both among employers and employed with its operation now that the country has to undergo the painful process of having wages reduced. As a matter of practice, as far as I can gather, the Trade Board at home usually consists of 13 people—6 representatives of employers, 6 representatives of the employed and a Chairman from the Ministry of Labour. In practice, as might be expected, the minimum wage is ordinarily settled by the Chairman. The workers had no objection to this so long as the Chairman decreed an increase, but now that the existing economic conditions require a decrease, considerable dissatisfaction is being felt on both sides. Lord Bryce in his recent book on Modern Democracies comments on the same results in Australia. He says—"The method operates unequally upon the two parties to a dispute. The employer can be compelled to pay certain wages so long as he keeps his factory open, and he can escape liability only by closing down his factory, but the individual workman cannot be compelled to work. The power given to the Courts to meet this difficulty in Australia by fining the Union has not proved effective. In the earlier days the awards were usually obeyed, but it is to be remembered that they almost always prescribed a rise in wages." "The gravest test," says Lord Bryce, "will come when the workmen are denied some increase they ask for, or employers begin to ask for a reduction." Apart from this point, the frequent delays in the proceedings of the Wages Board and the inevitable technicality of some of the rulings of the Industrial Courts are giving rise to great irritation. There are many instances of that, but the best way to illustrate it is by reference to the orders in the *Labour Gazette* fixing minimum wages in respect of certain industries. I have here a copy of the Gazette containing the orders relating to the rope and twine industry. It covers nearly four closely printed pages and fixes wages for more than 50 different classes of operatives. Now an order of that kind means an enormous amount of work and imposes a heavy responsibility on the department which undertakes it. I find in a recent trade paper a statement which says that it is apparent that Trade Boards serve no satisfactory purpose because decisions are made by Government representatives who cannot be expected to have a sufficient grasp of the position. An even more

striking condemnation of the minimum wages system is given in a Report of the American Commission on Foreign Inquiry of the National Civic Federation in 1919. As far as I can gather, this body is representative of all classes of the community in America, and their views, as set forth in their Report, strike me as thoroughly impartial and deserving of great weight. As it may be of interest to the Council to hear what they say, I will read from the Report. They say:—"In the United States the minimum wage is unscientific and uneconomic in character. As its foundation, it has the idea that the opinion of one or two individuals may properly establish a standard of living for the members of some particular group, and at the market prices of some particular day, which society as a whole is obliged to provide to the individuals of that particular group in return for a certain number of hours of work and quite without reference to any practical or scientific co-ordination of real wages between different sections, or in relation to the service or work performed by those to whom that wage is paid." In Great Britain and France, they go on to say there has been a more serious attempt to determine the economic wage, and those countries enjoy the advantage of being under a single central Government, whereas in America there are forty-eight States, each regulating these questions on its own lines. But even in Great Britain and France, the Commission say, the application of the system is at fault in ignoring differences in individual or group standards of living, also market variations, and ignoring entirely the question whether society as a whole can pay the wage for the work done. This is an important lesson on which we in India would do well to ponder.

Here in India, as in America, we have the country divided into a number of provinces, each under its own system of local administration, and although minimum wage legislation would be passed by the Imperial Legislative Council in Simla, yet the duty of carrying out the principles in practice would fall upon the local governments. Variations and differences of opinion would certainly creep in. But I think that the most important thing for us to consider in India is, the American Commission's finding that in all the countries in which they made inquiries, the minimum wage system ignores entirely the question whether society as a whole can afford to pay the wage for the work done. I need hardly point out the enormous difficulties of coming to a satisfactory decision on a question like that under the conditions of society in India.

Mr. Chaudhuri wants to know something about Australia. I have here an article written by Mr. Sidney Webb. What he says is that the minimum wage system has been a great success in the colony of Victoria in Australia, but there are only 11,000 workers under the protection of the minimum wage system in Victoria. Now 11,000 is about the number of people who are employed in a single fairly large jute mill on the banks of the river Hooghly. I think that that figure alone is sufficient to show that we cannot base very much of an argument

on the application of this minimum wage legislation to the small and homogeneous population of an Australian colony. I have now given the Council some practical illustrations from people who have had experience of this minimum wage system in England. I have here also the opinion of some of the economists who have watched the working of the system in England. Professor Pigou, the professor of Political Economy in Cambridge, in his recent work on the Economics of Welfare, says that one result of the minimum wage system has been the expulsion from private industry of a number of low grade workers, although this tendency has in many cases been masked by the fact that the minimum wage fixed is very much below the worth of anybody except extraordinarily inefficient apprentices. But, he says, that when it is enacted that low grade workmen shall not in future be paid the rates of wages which they have been paid in the past, it necessarily follows that some of them will no longer be worth employing. Professor Pigou further says that the minimum wage system would be impracticable in any country, except where it is associated with a well organised State policy of poor relief. We have of course no such policy in India.

Another tendency of the minimum wage system is that it is apt to bear hardly on home industries. Home industries are in any case subject to fierce competition with factory industries; and the home industry is of course one of the most important cases to which the minimum wage system is applied, because sweating is more common in the home industries than in a large well organised work, and it is home industries which are least able to bear a rise in wages. A further objection to the minimum wage system is its tendency to encourage what is now called the "Ca Canny" principle, that is to say, the workman does as little as he can for his wage. That principle, unfortunately, is not confined to Western countries. It is, to put it mildly, as common in India as anywhere else, and as a matter of fact before the Committee on Industrial unrest, we had some evidence to the effect that the raising of the daily wages in coal mines had the effect of inducing labourers to put in less days' work in the week.

I do not propose to go further into the theoretical objections which have been raised by political economists to the minimum wage. It is time now to turn to the practical position. In the first place I would ask the Council to notice that here in Bengal we have not, speaking generally, the conditions of sweated industries which gave rise to this legislation in England. It is possible that in some of the small trades mentioned by the mover of the resolution, things are not what they ought to be, but we have not at the present time sufficient information to justify us in taking action in regard to these small trades. If we did, we should run a very grave risk of destroying the trades. So far as the large industries are concerned, I do not think that we have any evidence that the

state of affairs is such as to call for minimum wage legislation. Moreover there would be one practical difficulty in applying this minimum wage system in Bengal. Broadly speaking, the wages in the industries in Bengal are regulated by agricultural wages, that is to say, the ordinary labourer comes from a village and, industrial concerns, in order to attract labour, must offer higher wages than he gets in his own village. Now that is the only principle on which we could regulate the minimum wage in Bengal. It is true that the minimum wage has been applied to the agricultural industry in England by a special Act passed in 1917, but that Act has given rise to serious complaints and a proposal to withdraw it is now under consideration in the British Parliament. However that may be, I think that members of the Council will agree that it would be impossible to apply the minimum wage to agricultural industries in this country. Apart from the fact that we have not sufficient knowledge for the purpose, apart from the fact that we should have to make allowances for all sorts of differences in land tenures and agricultural products and so forth, even if we could get over all these difficulties and fix a minimum wage which would be accepted by all as fair and reasonable, we have not got the staff to go round and see that these minimum wages were paid. I do not suppose that members of this Council would approve of the police being employed for regulating the minimum wage in the mufassal but as things stand, the police is the only agency which could be employed.

Mr Chaudhuri has to some extent shifted his ground in his speech. In his resolution he asks for an Industrial Board to determine the minimum wage in each industry in Bengal. What he was really asking for in his speech seemed to be an inquiry to see whether there are any industries in Bengal in which wages are insufficient. This is a very different matter, though of course, this proposal might lead to the adoption of the proposal in the resolution. I am not going to commit myself to the assertion that wages in every industry in Bengal are in a satisfactory state, but I do say that it would be very risky for Government or the Council to institute an inquiry into wages generally or in specified industries on the sort of information that we have had before us this afternoon. The worst of inquiries by amateurs into labour conditions is that they are likely to do more harm than good. We have just had an inquiry into the causes of industrial unrest and Mr. Chaudhuri himself was responsible for that inquiry. Some of the members of the committee had experience of labour, either from the side of employers or from the side of employees, but I think I am speaking for my other colleagues who had no such experience when I say that we were conscious throughout, that we were treading on dangerous ground, that we were dealing with forces whose exact magnitude was unknown to us and with facts and conditions, the importance of which it was very difficult for us to appreciate. I hope and believe that we have done no harm. I hope we may have done

some good, and that the result of the inquiry will be useful; but I do suggest that we should wait and see what the results of these inquiries are before we venture to tread on very much more dangerous ground. After all is it necessary for us to start an inquiry into wages in general? The experience of Bengal during the last twelve months shows that labour has its own ways and means of pressing its demands on capital, and the recent Committee following the English authorities, laid it down as an axiomatic principle that the best and most satisfactory method of settling labour disputes between employers and workmen, is for the parties directly concerned to come to an agreement between themselves. The Rai Bahadur agreed to this principle, but he now supports the proposal that we should set up an Industrial Board to settle wages. I suggest that on the principle laid down by our committee we ought to give employers and employed in the industries mentioned by Mr. Chaudhuri a chance of settling their differences, if differences exist. If, unfortunately, they are unable to come to an agreement, the proposals of our committee provide machinery for avoiding an open rupture and for facilitating the settlement of any matters on which these people cannot come to an agreement among themselves. I would urge that we should wait for the result of these measures before proceeding to institute further inquiries into industrial conditions on more detailed lines.

That, I think, is all I need say in regard to the new issues raised in Mr. Chaudhuri's speech. Turning to the resolution I need not point out that in a matter of this kind legislation must be undertaken in Simla or Delhi. At the present moment the Government of Bengal feel that, for the reasons I have stated, such legislation would be premature in Bengal. We have not sufficient information on which to base legislation or to propose legislation to the Government of India. We see that legislation would involve very great risks to industry which we cannot at present see how to meet. We know that it would involve great expense as well as bureaucratic interference with industry which should not be undertaken unless we were very much more sure of our ground and of the benefits which we should secure than we are at present. For these reasons, I am afraid, I cannot accept the resolution on behalf of Government.

Mr. KRISHNA CHANDRA RAY CHAUDHURI: I rise to reply to a few points raised by various members. Mr. Watson-Smyth said in his speech that industrial boards are unnecessary and very expensive. Here in this Council we have all heard of industaial boards in England; Trades or Industrial Boards were not set up in England by the agitation of labour. I can show from speeches reported in the Hansard that labour was asleep when the first Trades Boards were introduced in England. It was simply due to a few humane workers like Mr. Rowntrie and others, who saw that the wages were very very low, in certain industries that the matter was brought to the notice of the Government. My point is that we cannot compare the conditions of

England with the conditions of India, but we can compare the conditions of Australia with those of India because both of them are semi-agricultural countries and in both of them industries are only partially developed. If I had the report in my hand I could have shown that the minimum wage system was a tremendous success in Australia. The figures quoted by the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr, viz., 11,000 workers affected by the system in Australia, relate to the year 1912, that is about nine years ago. Mr. Roberts, who introduced the Amending Trades Board Bill in 1918, showed that it was a tremendous success in Australia since it was introduced in Victoria. Labour in England, I mean the great Parliamentary Labour Party, had taken little or no interest in the discussions in Parliament. That is because the labour party knew that the British workers could raise their wages by demand and not through the Trades Boards Act. They knew that by strikes they could raise their wages. Here, in India, there is no strong striking capacity and I do not want strikes. There is but very weak combination among workers in India to strike and an Act of this kind is bound to protect labour from being exploited and minimise the miseries due to low wages, long hours and other conditions which, I may say, are almost brutal at least in some of the industries. Mr. Watson-Smyth said that the very fact that there is a scarcity of labour in the collieries shows that labour is well paid. I do not at all believe it. I can show you from statistics of wages published by the Department of Statistics a Department which has been often unjustly pooh-poohed that it does not give accurate information - that colliery wages per month have risen from Rs. 11 to Rs. 13-8-0 in four years since 1914, and Rs. 15 in 1921. An Indian miner, according to official report, can raise 119 tons a year. Taking the new rate of wages that has come into force four months ago viz., nine annas a tub, the utmost a miner can earn is Rs. 119 a year. A Belgian miner noted for his skill, could only raise 130 tons a year and gets 15 shillings per ton, while an Indian miner hardly gets 15 annas. In England the rate of miner's wages averages £1-6-0 a ton, while a miner in India is considered to be well-paid by the mine-owners though he is given 15 annas a ton and his utmost wage is Rs. 119 a year.

Coming to sweating, a great misconception has arisen regarding the definition of "sweating." The Hon'ble Mr. Kerr has admitted that there is sweating in this country. The meaning of the word "sweating" was given by Mr. Roberts when he introduced the Bill. "Sweating" means "under-paying" or "paying wages far below the subsistence allowance." I am not thinking of housing or sanitary arrangements but simply of the rate of wages that is in force in Bengal that I gave the figures of tea garden wages. The maximum wage a coolie can earn to-day is Rs. 10 a month including every kind of grant made by the tea companies in the shape of distribution of grains at cost price, medicines, etc. Does any member of the Council honestly believe Rs. 10 a living wage for a tea garden coolie? In the Central Provinces

and Orissa an agricultural labourer gets 8 annas a day and, in Bengal, we cannot get a day-labourer for anything less than 12 annas. Still there are some who say Rs. 10 is a fair wage in the tea garden because the coolies do not come away from there. What are they to do? In the country we have more than sufficient agricultural labour. Our agriculture is not properly developed and added to this there is the trouble of the money-lender; hence villagers go away and work at low wages in far off places.

The Hon'ble Mr. Kerr has pointed out that the passing of an Act like this will necessitate the employment of executive officials and police officials to proceed against those who do not comply with its conditions. I did not suggest in my resolution that we were going to pass an Act in this Council for an Industrial Board. What I asked is the formation of a committee to inquire into the conditions of labour and to recommend to the Government of Bengal or to the Government of India the propriety or otherwise of passing such an Act. It would be open to the Bengal Government or the Government of India either, to accept the Committee's recommendation or to refuse it. If the local Government refuse and the Imperial Government takes no steps, I am sure the League of Nations will compel them to do so.

The resolution was then put and lost.

District Advisory Boards.

Babu NIBARAN CHANDRA DAS GUPTA: "This Council recommends to the Government that immediate steps be taken to constitute district advisory boards composed of a few leading and representative men of the districts, to keep the District Officers informed as to the trend of public opinion on all important questions, and to advise them on all important legal and executive measures."

The idea or the principle underlying the resolution is an old one; though not "as old as the hills," it has no pretensions to novelty. The Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler, in meeting a similar proposal brought into this Council by my friend Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri, described the proposal as something similar to the process of bringing out the old horse out of the stable to give it a fresh run-out. The question was also before the District Administration Committee, which evidently did not favour the idea, as the necessity for such advisory boards was not so much felt. The District Officers were the chairmen of the district boards, and as such they were in constant touch with a large number of representative men of the district and in a few cases, they were the Chairmen of the district headquarters municipalities. Further, as District Officers, they had to come in touch with many men in the discharge of their judicial and revenue duties. I remember to have been asked for an expression of opinion on the advisability or otherwise of instituting such boards and at that time the step did not strike me

as at all necessary, exactly on the grounds set forth by the District Administration Committee. But the circumstances have completely changed since then The District Officers are no longer the Chairmen of the district boards and municipalities and in many districts they have been relieved to a large extent of their judicial and revenue duties, which are now relegated to the officers known as Additional District Magistrates.

Their position is now one of great isolation. Further, under the present arrangements, these officers are not even so much in touch with the police, who are the purveyors of news to the official world, because the Police Department has been denuded of a great deal of its old magisterial supervision. There are now fewer opportunities for district officers to come in touch with the public and the trend of public opinion, which, it must be admitted, has considerably developed and grown more and more.

It may be said that District Officers have to tour a great deal in the mufassal and they come in touch with the people in the course of such tours Sir, we know that though such tours are meant for the purpose at which the resolution aims, yet I am bound to say that they are not productive of the results which we naturally expect out of them Further, Sir, a good deal will depend upon the personality of such officers. Those that are young and shy, those who cannot cast off their natural insular habits, and those who can hardly understand the vernacular of their districts and express themselves intelligibly to the common people in their own tongue are really very much handicapped in their work. No doubt the Government has issued circular after circular, calling upon the District Officers to make themselves accessible to all classes of people, to be courteous and polite to visitors and so forth, yet they have proved infructuous as the people did not feel the necessity of taking advantage of the good intentions of the circulars. Many people, who have their own axes to grind, own ends to achieve, and own purposes to serve, approach these officers and they are hardly the people, who are competent to advise independently and on right lines and who can be regarded as exponents of public opinion. Sir, the necessity for such boards becomes apparent, when we consider that there are many people who fight shy of approaching the officials, unless called on to do so; and do not like to be very communicative, unless and until they feel that it is their duty to communicate the trend of public opinion frankly and fearlessly. There is now no paucity of independent, educated, honest and sober public men in the districts, who will only too gladly help the administration and the District Officers, by placing their honest opinion and information at their disposal, if they feel that it is their duty to do so. It is not my intention that the officers shall in any way be fettered or bound to follow such advice and to accept such information as the very essence of truth. They are to be left perfectly unfettered in their discretion, no hard and fast rules are necessary. The body is to be

purely "advisory" and nothing more. It has been said that many people get offended if their advice is not accepted. But, Sir, I have not much to say about the mentality of men, who consider themselves, as the very repositories of wisdom; unless an opportunity is given for developing a sense of public duty, there is not much to hope for the growth and development of a healthy public life in the country—a consummation which we all devoutly wish for.

It has been said with a great deal of truth and emphasis, that the District Officers are the real pivots of the administration and, unless facilities are afforded to these officers to be in the closest possible touch with the people and public opinion, it is not quite fair to charge them for blunders and mistakes fraught with serious consequences. Many a pitfall can be avoided, many errors rectified, if the District Officers can read, fully and correctly, the public sentiments and thoughts. There is no use initiating grand and beneficent policies, there is no use promulgating useful laws, unless full facilities be given to put them into real practice and operation. Here in the Council Chamber, there are many officials, who served their terms as District Officers and know and appreciate full well the responsibilities of the position of District Officers. The times have changed. The circumstances have altered and, it is said, we have to look at every question from a new angle of vision. We are all for efficient administration and any step calculated to make it more efficient is welcome. My idea is not to introduce a complicated machinery. The selection of advisors, the subjects on which advice and information should be sought, the occasions on which they are to be sought, must all be left to the unfettered discretion of the officers themselves and Government, and I am confident that the experienced members of the Government can easily formulate a scheme, elastic and fluid enough, for the composition of such non-statutory advisory boards.

I had talks with several officials in the mufassal, who regard the idea as useful provided their discretion is in no way hampered or fettered. Our Government is anxious to have a machinery for the dissemination of truth or a propaganda for placing correct views of Government policies and measures before the masses, who are gullible enough to swallow any amount of baseless rumours or wilful misrepresentations and distortion of facts. Here is such a machinery which, if properly handed, will be of immense use and has great potentialities. Such Boards if properly constituted, will be good interpreters of Government policies and measures. A good deal will no doubt depend upon the selection of the right sort of men, constituting such boards and I am confident that the Government with the help of the local officials can easily make a good selection. The necessity has been all the greater, on account of the fact that comparatively junior officers are now appointed as District Officers through the exigencies of the service. Popularisation of the Government at the top and Indianisation of the

services are no remedy; unless and until we forge some machinery for the crystallisation of public opinion and for information and knowledge, and also something which may serve as interpreters between the Government and the people, we cannot expect real popular Government.

The Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler, by his very tactful direction to the District Officers to consult the local members of the Council upon the relative importance and urgency of many requirements and projects of the Police Department, has, to my mind, taken a step forward towards the materialisation of the idea underlying the resolution. I only want a further extension of it to some other subjects too and the inclusion of some more representative men into this proposed consultative and advisory body. Mine is a very modest proposal, involving no expenditure, no loss of prestige and no complication. It is, I believe, calculated to make the machine of administration smoother and more liable. I hope the Government will see its way to accept it at least as an experiment well worth trying.

With these few words, I commend the resolution to the acceptance of the House.

Mr. SYED NASIM ALI: I fully appreciate the spirit which has actuated Mr Das Gupta to bring this resolution before the Council. He has very clearly pointed out the necessity for framing or forming such an advisory board, but there is one thing which has raised certain misgivings in my mind. The resolution is silent on the point as to how the advisory boards should be constituted. The resolution simply says that the advisory boards should consist of a few leading and representative men. The word "representative" is rather ambiguous. I do not know whether the learned mover has included therein the representations of different communities. If in such Advisory Boards the different communities are adequately represented, then I think it would serve a very useful purpose. If my suggestion is accepted, the resolution would run thus:

"This Council recommends to the Government that immediate steps be taken to constitute district advisory boards in which different communities will be adequately represented to keep the District Officers informed as to the trend of public opinion on all important questions, and to advise them on all important legal and executive measures."

If that amendment is accepted, I would support the resolution in the amended form.

Babu NIBARAN CHANDRA DAS GUPTA: I am prepared to accept the amendment.

The PRESIDENT: The mover of the resolution wants to make a change in the wording of the resolution; he is allowed to do that. The discussion will now proceed on the basis of the amended resolution.

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: I have great pleasure in supporting the resolution. It may be in the recollection of many of the members who are in the habit of reading the proceedings of the Imperial Legislative Council that Mr. Gokhale brought in almost a similar resolution before the Imperial Legislative Council years ago, and the objection on the part of the Government to accept that resolution was that there were district boards consisting of both elected and nominated members who fully represented the districts and upon whose advice the District Officers could always act. So there was no use having another advisory board superseding the district boards or sitting side by side with the district boards. But now there has been a complete change. The District Magistrate is no more the Chairman of the district board and he has scarcely any opportunity of coming in contact with men of light and leading in the district. No doubt he goes once in one or two years to inspect the municipalities, but he goes there not with a view to ascertain the wants of the people of the place but he goes there as a critic. He goes there with the last inspection report of the Sanitary Commissioner, the last audit report and also he goes there to see if the remarks and suggestions made by him in his last inspection report have been carried out by the municipal authorities. These are his functions when he goes to inspect the municipalities. He never comes in contact even with the municipal commissioners and consequently he cannot know their views on any subject; so I think that it would be a very good thing if the suggestion of my friend Babu Nibaran Chandra Das Gupta be carried out, namely, that district advisory boards be formed. I think these district advisory boards may consist of members of the district boards both Hindus and Muhammadans as well as the leading commissioners of the municipalities of the district; also other leading men who fully represent the views of the people, because there are many men who do not want to come in as commissioners or as members of the district board but who still fully represent the views and feelings of the people of the locality. District magistrates will not lose anything by an interchange of views with these people. In fact they will gain much.

My friend Mr. Das Gupta has already referred to the circular which has been recently issued by the District Magistrates, probably at the instance of the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler, to gauge the opinions of the members of the Legislative Council about the requirements of the police. This is no doubt a very good move on the part of the Government, but this is only one instance in which there have been meetings between the District Magistrate and the members of the Council regarding an important question. There are people in the district who are not members of the Council but who still fully represent the views and feelings of the people. I know that, as a matter of fact, at the time of famines or when the Prince of Wales or some member of the Royal

family comes to Calcutta or near Calcutta they are invited by the district authorities or by divisional Commissioners to take part in the proceedings and to do what they think proper and raise some funds either for alleviating distress or for the purpose of giving a suitable reception. I am of opinion that there should be permanent advisory committees who may meet once in two or three months for the purpose of an interchange of views between the District Officers and the leading and representative men of the district.

With these words, I beg to support the resolution.

Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ: I rise to oppose the resolution amended as it is. My reasons are that even in the amended form it does not give proper representation to the different communities; for the words used there are simply "representation of the different communities" and even if that amendment will go to the length of giving adequate representation, even then I would have objected to it

The PRESIDENT: There is the word "adequate" in the resolution as amended.

Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ: I think it absolutely necessary that the words used in the resolution should be "full and adequate representatives of the different communities" We know that representation on bodies like these when left to the officials and to their sweet will are done in a most haphazard way We have got a bitter experience of these matters Even to-day a certain question was raised and the Hon'ble Member for Government said that what was right and proper was done and the Hon'ble Member had no reason to look into the question of the representation of various people This is the way of the officials" I am referring to Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea: he is absent, but I hope his Secretary will take note I think I am right in saying that the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler also gave a similar reply to a question that was raised with regard to the Police Department so far as I can remember.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: My recollection does not follow the speaker at all.

Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ: My recollection is that we get answers like these from various officers and it is for these reasons that even now we have not made enough progress in the matter of education and we are not fully represented in the various departments of Government. To my mind these officers in their private capacity are perfect gentlemen and they are not blind, but as officers they have no eyes to see and it is on the advice of their Secretaries and office notes that they act. And it is on this ground that I oppose the resolution and I would like to have the various interests defined There is another ground which I think will appeal to most members of the Council.

My friend Babu Surendra Nath Ray referred to a similar resolution having been moved in the Imperial Council. But he forgot to say that the resolution was to the effect that a portion of representation to the district councils was to be by election. At a time like this, when we have got the Reforms, is it not disgraceful if the Council agrees that we are to depend for representation in the different districts on the sweet will of the Magistrate? We should consider this point and we should also think whether it is not right and proper that this resolution be withdrawn and a similar resolution brought later on. I may tell the House that I sent notice of a similar resolution on the lines of the late Mr. Gokhale, but it was out of time and so was not placed before the Council. All that I say is that I am fully in agreement and accord with the spirit of the resolution, but I wish that a resolution which will be according to the wish of the people of the country should be brought before the House and not the one we have before us at present.

Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: I heartily support this resolution. In times of trouble there is a very great necessity for such an advisory board in the district headquarters. When there is no trouble, there may be no necessity for Advisory Boards, but in troublous times the necessity of having these boards is very great.

Now, I want to say one thing. In the resolution and in the amendment the word "representative" has come in. I do not understand what the mover of the resolution means by the word "representative." Does he want that the members of the Board should be elected by the people, or does he mean that Government should select such men as they consider to be called representatives of the people? In his reply, I hope he will make the point clear.

With these words, I beg to support the resolution.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: As the mover of this resolution has admitted, it raises a question of considerable antiquity. Most matters relating to Indian administration have fairly respectable pedigrees, and this question is no exception to that rule. The idea of these advisory committees found considerable favour about the years 1907 and 1909, at the time when the Decentralisation Commission was sitting, and it found favour then largely on account of the support given to it by the late Mr. Gokhale. The idea was most fully investigated by the Decentralisation Commission, which started by being rather attracted by it, but after lengthy inquiries they, with the exception of Mr. Romesh Chandra Dutt, were of opinion that it was inexpedient and inadvisable. Since then there was a very well known discussion in 1912 in the Imperial Legislative Council, in which the difficulties of the proposal were pointed out; and subsequent to that, to pass to the minor sphere, it came before the old Council here in January, 1919, when I again went over the ground. This afternoon,

therefore, it is not unnatural that we have heard little that is new, and I can urge little that is new on the other side. In fact one cannot but regret that, with the rather lengthy agenda before us, we have to spend our time in reroasting those rather ancient chestnuts. However, one important consequence of the antiquity of this subject has been that since the question was advocated in various quarters, now some 11 or 12 years ago, there have been two changes of prime importance bearing upon it. The first is, surely, the constitution of the new and enlarged Legislative Councils, which disposes of many of the reasons which, in the old days, were argued in support of these ideas. As our Councils are now constituted, we have in them from every district in the province practically three or four members (including the miscellaneous constituencies connected with every district), and if those members are not competent to keep themselves informed as to the trend of views prevalent in their constituencies, one may well ask what are they here for? This new factor in the situation must add an additional argument against the idea of setting up new and local bodies. Another change is this. The de-officialisation of the local bodies has been urged to-day as a reason in support of the proposal, whereas, to my mind, it can only have a contrary bearing in. We are told that the Collector now stands in a position of isolation, but, surely, whether he is with, or without, the district board, it is equally open to him to consult it, whereas he can now consult it as a purely non-official body, free from the sway which, we were often told in the old days, was exercised by the Collector himself to pervert its views. Therefore, in so far as the non-official advisory boards are concerned, we have them by the de-officialisation of the local bodies to an even greater extent than they existed previously.

Now, one difficulty in dealing with this question, which has been fairly constant throughout the discussion, is that it is mainly argued on the basis of generalities, and few care to tell us in detail either precisely what they want as regards the constitution of these committees, or exactly what they want these committees to do. We have a description in the resolution that these committees are to consist of a few leading and representative men. Well, how are they to be chosen? If they are to be chosen by selection—and Maulvi Ekramul Huq has already voiced this criticism this afternoon—there is one certain result, namely, that those who are not so chosen will at once deny that the members are either leading or representative. If they are chosen by election, by whom are they to be elected? Are we to set up the same paraphernalia which we have for the purpose of Council elections? We have already heard to-day that we must have communal representation for Muhammadans, but, if so, it is equally arguable for Europeans and zamindars. Are we to have the same elaborate system of constituencies which we have for the purpose of the Council? Are we to set up the same machinery

for local bodies of this kind? What will be the result? If the constituencies return the same representatives and leading men as they return to the Council, that will of course make it easier for the members of this Council, as knowing the opinions of the advisory committees to be those of themselves, they will be able to endorse and support them with far more emphasis. But if we are merely going to have a repetition of the same opinion, why set up a double machinery? And again, suppose different men are elected, and we have two bodies of leading and representative men, surely this unfortunate Council will be left in some quandary as to which is to be taken as really leading and representative?

Babu Surendra Nath Ray has certainly broached an idea which is altogether new to the previous discussions. In Mr. Gokhale's scheme these committees were to consist of some 9 to 12 members, so far as my recollection goes: but Babu Surendra Nath Ray would have all the members of the district boards, all the members of the municipalities, *plus* others, on these committees. But the former are already sitting on bodies which can be consulted; while to assemble them with others would mean a local parliament of some 50 or 100 members. Is such a body going to make for rapid working in the machinery of the district? As Babu Surendra Nath Ray has reminded us, I recently requested District Magistrates to constitute small local advisory committees of their Council members to discuss local police affairs. Babu Surendra Nath Ray complains that this has been done only once; but I may tell him that I have been waiting for two months and have not yet received replies from all districts. What would happen to the unfortunate District Magistrate if he had to work his district in consultation with 100 members, one shudders to think.

Then again, another point of the first importance is—are the functions of these committees to be executive or advisory? Directly this point is proved among different witnesses we come to absolute divergence of views. The mover says—let them be advisory. One of the difficulties of that system is that it satisfies nobody, and we at once get the request, in one form or another, that these committees should be given the right of executive control. This is sometimes put forward in the form that the District Magistrate, if he differs from his committee, shall refer to the Commissioner, and there are other variations. But a purely advisory function does not, and will not, satisfy any one. But if we are to have executive boards, it becomes all the more important to consider what they are going to do. We are told that they will keep District Officers informed as to the trend of public opinion on all important questions. If, by "important questions" is meant matters of local interest, which, as everybody knows, are the subject of much local tittle-tattle in every Collector's charge, then I have no hesitation in saying that we shall create little *foci* of intrigue and jealousies

which, far from assisting the Collector, will seriously hamper him in his work. If, on the other hand, by "important questions," we mean those questions which bulk large in the public view, such as matters which come before this Council, then can anybody say at present that, in so far as there is a vocal opinion in this country, it is not fully voiced and made known to all? There are non-vocal sections which are apt to be overlooked now, and would be more apt to be overlooked under the system of local advisory committees, but in so far as vocal opinion goes which is able to express itself in a tangible form, that opinion, I submit, as is known to anybody who has any first-hand knowledge of the working of the legislature or of the discussions of large administrative questions, is fully known to all and sundry.

One noticeable feature in this resolution, in which it differs widely from the resolution which was moved two years ago, is that it does not bring in the executive functions of the Collector. In the earlier debate I went through, one by one, the different functions which the Collector had to perform, and pointed out in detail that in connection with none of them was there a place for this executive advisory committee. I do not wish once more to go through all these details; but again I would remind the Council that to the extent that the work of Collector lends itself to advisory help, the Collector has already such bodies. Taking judicial work, what is a jury but something in the nature of an advisory committee, in so far as it brings in non-officials to assist the Sessions Judge? Though honorary magistrates the non-official public is brought in to assist the Magistrate. Then again, on the executive side, we have advisory committees for excise, we have district agricultural associations, we have co-operative societies and we have visitors to the local jails. Therefore whenever the subject lends itself to treatment in this way, bodies of this kind are already in existence.

It has been suggested this afternoon that advisory committees might be useful in the direction of publicity, and far be it from me to underrate the importance of that subject. But if I am convinced of one thing more than anything else, it is that if any success is to be achieved in this direction, it will be through the agency of non-official organised effort. To make publicity work a part of the function of the District Magistrate, pure and simple, will be largely to detract from its value.

My general and final objection to this resolution is that it is out of date. Whatever might have been said for it when the late Mr. Gokhale first put it forward, circumstances have now altogether changed; and they will change further in future. The proper line of development in associating the people more closely with the administration will be in devolving to local non-official bodies particular functions, not, while keeping these functions in the hands of responsible officials, attempting to tie their hands by associating with them a body of this kind.

Babu NIBARAN CHANDRA DAS GUPTA: I am not going to press this resolution to a division. My object in moving this resolution was to suggest a machinery for helping District Officers in times of urgency, as it has already been pointed out by my friend Babu Tankanath Chaudhuri. However, as the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler thinks that it will be a complicated machinery and that many questions will arise which will lead to difficulties and that an advisory board of this kind will practically be of no use to the District Officers I am prepared to accept the opinion of the doyen of the Indian Civil Service. As far as my little knowledge of the mufassal goes we know that in spite of the existence of the district boards and other local bodies, the District Officers never care to have any contact or touch with them, not to speak of consulting them for purposes of advice. Of course it is a very good thing to say—here you are, there are these bodies and if you adopt the ways suggested everything will be right. We know that it is not always done. I may inform the House, however, that it all depends on the personality of the officer. There are officers and officers; and I know there are some who are too anxious to know the views and sentiments of the people. But there are also officers who are too proud and too lazy to this sort of thing. However, as the officials do not like such things, I would be the last person to move for setting up a machinery like this. After what has fallen from the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler I do not press for a division. As regards the question of representation which has been raised by some of my friends, I may tell them that *selection* or *election* would have been a matter for the Government to decide. As however Government do not like the idea I do not press the motion.

The PRESIDENT: Do you want to withdraw the resolution?

Babu NIBARAN CHANDRA DAS GUPTA: Under the circumstances it comes to that.

The resolution was then, by leave of the Council, withdrawn.

Postponement of Civil Appeals.

Maulvi RAFI UDDIN AHMED: "This Council recommends to the Government that the practice of postponing civil appeals *sine die* and hearing them *de die in diem* without fixing any dates, in mufassal courts, be discontinued."

The wording of the resolution requires a little explanation. It simply means that in the district of Jessore, civil appeals are kept pending for some time without date and they are taken up from day to day and heard. This is really very hard both to the lawyers and to the litigants. I asked a question in the Legislative Council, inquiring in which districts this practice was prevalent but no reply was given. This shows that this illegal practice cannot be prevalent anywhere. I beg to say that

I have ascertained that this practice was introduced by one Mr. Sankey, who became a judge of Jessore in May, 1920, in the first year of his service. I am afraid that this judge had no idea whatsoever of the difficulties of the lawyers and the litigants owing to this system. Of course in the High Court there is a practice of postponing appeals *sine die* and hearing them from day to day. But these appeals lie on matters of law only. But in the mufassal courts it is otherwise. Before going into the legislation on the subject, I beg to state that when appeals are first filed before the District Judge, after scrutiny, some days are fixed for the appearance of the respondent; when the respondent appears the law says, some date must be fixed. Section 16, order 41, says that on the date fixed or on any other date to which the hearing may be adjourned . . . . Rule 17 says that on the date fixed, if the appellant does not appear the court may go on with the appeal. The rulings on the point are reported in 11 Weekly Reporter. The rulings say that if an appeal is heard without any day having been fixed and the appellant is absent the appeal is not liable to be dismissed for default. It should appear on the record that a date was fixed and thereupon the default will be valid.

The circular of the High Court is also in accordance with this rule. The circular of the High Court (rule 18, chapter I, volume I of the High Court's General Rules and Circular Orders, Civil) runs as follows: "No Judicial proceeding of whatever nature should be postponed *sine die*."

But in Jessore what is being done is this: A date is fixed for the appearance of the respondent and these appeals are kept pending for several months and, all on a sudden after, an order is hung up on a notice board that the following appeals are liable to be heard from Monday. The difficulty under this arrangement is that the clients cannot be communicated with and the respondent's pleader cannot be found and the lawyers have to take all the briefs together and have to remember all the facts in order to be prepared for the hearing of these appeals. The lawyers cannot be expected to remember all the facts when all on a sudden the appeal is taken up for hearing as they are not phonographic machines. From my little experience of the mufassal I know that when the hearing is continued in the presence of parties many cases are compromised. In many cases the pleaders cannot always be present with the result that those cases are dismissed for default. Moreover when there are sessions cases and those cases collapse then the civil cases are taken up and the lawyers cannot put in their appearance. These are practical difficulties which we have felt in Jessore. A representation was made to the High Court Judges who said that the Judge would accommodate the lawyers and the clients. In the meantime, however, the Judge was transferred and another Munsif Judge (Munsif promoted to a Judgeship) came and he was afraid to upset the orders of his predecessor. Another Judge

of the Indian Civil Service came and he also said that he would follow the practice of his predecessors whether it was legal or illegal.

I may point out that when appeals are fixed some dates are given and the judge has to sign the order sheet. Simply to shrink this work the judge followed this practice which is not in accordance with the practice of the mufassal. The judge is there only to see that justice is done and not shirk his work. A great injustice in the name of justice is done to the parties only in the districts of Jessore and Rangpur where this practice is alone prevalent. I appeal to Government to make some such arrangement by which the law may be followed in Jessore and Rangpur, and with these words, I beg to commend this resolution to the acceptance of the Council.

Maulvi SYED NASIM ALI: First of all I rise to support this resolution not because I am acquainted with the practice of Rangpur or Jessore, but the members of the Alipore Bar Library were victims of this procedure for some time within the past ten years. Since I joined the Bar I have found that as soon as appeals are filed according to provisions of law, a certain date is fixed for the appearance of the respondent and after the respondents appear the appeals are postponed *sine die* and they are put on the board. That is the usual practice because the appeals which have been filed earlier must be taken up first and disposed of, and then subsequent appeals are taken up. A certain European—a comparatively junior officer—came to preside over the district as District Judge, and his idea was that, on some occasions when the sessions collapsed, or the original suits are compromised or the probate cases collapsed, the Judges had no work to do. Therefore some provision must be made for such contingencies and the learned judge was also of opinion that small appeals, such as rent appeals or money appeals, might be fixed for hearing and no date should be fixed so that, if such contingencies occur, the Judge may take up any of such appeals and dispose of them; and his idea was that it would not cause any inconvenience because the pleaders of that particular district were quite competent to deal with these appeals and finish these appeals by looking into the records for five minutes and, therefore, they did not require any previous preparation. But as the pleaders have got to give a certificate as to the grounds of appeal, the members of the Alipore Bar met the learned judge and pointed out their difficulties, and also pointed out the legal difficulties to which the mover has invited the attention of this Council—I mean to certain rulings of the High Court wherein their Lordships have said that, if no date is fixed and then if the appeal is dismissed for default, then that would not be a default within the meaning of rules 16 and 17 of the Criminal Procedure Code. The learned judge ruled that a date must be fixed and when he did not fix a date he said that that appeal would be taken up any day that the court had time. It meant that it would be fixed from day to day. Therefore, the requirements of the law would be fulfilled. He further

argued that this was the practice in the High Court. In the High Court they prepare weekly lists and afterwards they prepare daily lists from the list prepared for the week. Our contention, therefore, was that in the High Court on the appellate side they have not any original work to do. There the pleaders take up the appeal work and, therefore, they are not inconvenienced in any way. Besides the High Court has got to deal with questions of law on second appeals and there are some cases of first appeals and there, of course, the presence of the client is unnecessary to a certain extent. But in mufassal courts the appeals are first appeals and they are on questions of facts and, therefore, it is absolutely necessary that the clients also should be present at the time of the hearing of the appeal. The learned Judge after hearing us said that he would try his best to accommodate the pleaders and the clients as much as possible, but how that was to be done was left vague. However, in the meantime, the learned Judge took leave and the permanent incumbent came and that practice was abolished. We have no difficulty now. As the mover has remarked, in some districts, some Judges simply to find out work, when original suits or sessions cases fail, try to adopt such a procedure. It is desirable, therefore, that this should be put an end to, and that the judges may be directed to fix a certain number of appeals for each day even if there be sessions work. He can do two or three appeals even with sessions cases. That has been done in every district. What is the good of putting a certain number of cases on the board and then fixing no other date, and informing the pleaders that these appeals may be taken up any day that the court would have time. Under such circumstances it would be most inconvenient not only to the lawyers but also to the litigants. They cannot anticipate when sessions cases would collapse or when original suits would be compromised and they would be dancing attendance from day to day while their appeal is not taken up—that is how the public are inconvenienced. There is no doubt that it is very inconvenient to the pleaders also, as they have got to prepare their briefs and, if they are to prepare eight or ten appeals, they have to be prepared in every case although it is not likely that they will be taken up when sessions cases collapsed. That is the difficulty to which the pleaders are put under such circumstances. The practice, as is prevalent in most districts, ought to be followed and there should be an universal practice everywhere.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: Sir, I have much pleasure in supporting this resolution. Everything that could be said has already been said by the gentlemen who preceded me. But I ought to tell the House that the practice of the High Court is not exactly what it is represented to be that appeals are heard *de die in diem*. What happens is this. We have got a list for the day. Sometimes a list of below fifty cases is put up, for the cases which may be taken up, after the court has finished hearing of appeals. But I do not know that within the last six months this has been done. So, even in the High Court, that practice is not followed as a rule, and I must say, in support of my hon'ble friend,

the mover, that it is against the law to postpone a case without fixing a date. It may be convenient for the court but it is very inconvenient to the pleaders, the most prominent of whom are engaged in original cases in the mufassal. I support the resolution.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: Sir, I perfectly sympathise with the hon'ble mover and I fully agree with him and that for two reasons. The first is, that pleaders are not gramophones, and the second is, that considerable difficulty is felt if cases are taken up in this way. What is done by some judges is to treat these cases as what may be called stop-gap cases. That is a very mischievous policy. When a sessions case breaks down, owing to the non-attendance of the jury or the illness of the accused, and so on, these cases are called up. This helps the judge in reducing the number of appeals by dismissing them straight away. But it does not seem to be justice. It causes trouble both to the parties and to the lawyers concerned. I have experience of these matters—a pleader is sent for and asked to plead when he has not even got his brief ready. It is certainly inconvenient for him when he is suddenly called upon to argue such a case. That is an arrangement which I am perfectly sure ought to be abolished. It may be very convenient to the judicial conscience of some of our judges though, I must say, not of all. There are judges who would do everything possible in the interests of justice to convenience the pleaders and parties and there are some who take these opportunities to knock out some of their appeals by dismissing them straight away. I therefore think that this motion ought to be supported.

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: Sir, when I first read the resolution, I thought it meant something quite different from what has been explained in this House by its mover and the other speakers. As regards the postponing of appeals *sine die* appeals have sometimes to be postponed *sine die* as they may be governed by common questions of law which are pending decision of a superior appellate court. In such cases it is perfectly right to postpone other appeals in connection with which the same question of law are raised. Otherwise, the time of the Court would unnecessarily be wasted. Then, as regards the other part of the resolution, that civil appeals should not be heard from day to day, it would mean that if an appeal is taken up to-day it ought not to be heard the next day. Surely, that is how it reads though that is not apparently what was intended. What I understood the mover and the other speakers to say was that certain District Judges do not arrange their lists, in such a way as to suit the convenience of the pleaders. Now, in the High Court, a list is put up for appeals which the judges think they might be able to dispose of in the course of the day. As a matter of fact often they are not able to dispose of all those appeals. They dispose of some of them and the others are postponed, and that goes on from day to day. It sometimes happens that in the High Court an appeal is not reached even for a fortnight. It is absolutely impossible to avoid contingencies of

that sort. The district judges in the mufassal have to hear appeals from the decision of munsifs and they have also to do original work both criminal as well as civil. They have to put up a list of appeals expecting that if the original business of the day is finished they would be able to go on with the list, but it sometimes happens that these appeals have to be adjourned from day to day. It may be that this causes some inconvenience to the pleaders, but that is not a matter for this House to deal with. If a wrong procedure is followed by a district judge, contrary to the ruling of the High Court, as has been suggested, then the aggrieved party should go to the High Court with his grievance. It is not for this House to lay down what would be the right procedure or wrong procedure. We are in fact asked that instructions may be given by the Government to the Court to arrange the business before them in a particular way, but surely the Government cannot lay down that in matters of procedure which are regulated by the law, the court should do this or should not do that. If in any particular case there has been a miscarriage of justice it is for the aggrieved to go to the High Court and have it redressed. It is not within the competence of Government to interfere with the discretion of the Court in such matters.

Maulvi RAFI UDDIN AHMED: Sir, of course the Hon'ble Sir Abdur-Rahim has said that it will be too hard for judges if my resolution is accepted. My idea is that when a case has been taken up it should be continued from day to day but that a date should be fixed before it is taken up. But this is not done in Jessore and that is what is objected to. We want that there should be some date given—some particular date—when such and such appeals are likely to be heard. But without fixing a date the appeal should not be heard. The Hon'ble Member has said that parties with grievances should go to the High Court. But in every case it is not possible. So they want the Government to recommend to the High Court that such practice should be discontinued in mufassal courts. I do not think it is illegal for this Council to make such a recommendation. This Council would not be laying down the law in the matter but would only send a recommendation to the High Court. The lower courts are under the Government also. If a reply were given to my question the matter would have been more clear. But it has not been given. All that I want is that our recommendations may be forwarded to the High Court. As regards the wording of the resolution, I may say that it is the wording of the Judge as he dictates it.

The motion being put a division was taken with the following result:—

AYES.

Ahmed, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Wasimuddin.
Ahmed, Maulvi Rafi Uddin.
Ahmed, Munshi Jafar.
Ali, Mr. Syed Nasim.
Bhattacharji, Babu Hem Chandra.
Charmakar, Babu Rasik Chandra.
Chaudhuri, Babu Kishori Mohan.
Chaudhuri, Maulvi Shah Muhammad.
Chaudhuri, Rai Harendranath.
Das, Babu Bishnudev.
Dutta, Babu Indu Bhushan.
Ghatak, Rai Sahib Nilmani.

Ghose, Rai Bahadur Jogendra Chunder.
Huq, Maulvi Ekramul.
Karim, Maulvi Abdul.
Karim, Maulvi Fazlul.
Khan Maulvi Hamid-ud-din.
Makramali, Munshi.
Maitra, Dr. Jatindra Nath.
Mullick, Babu Surendra Nath.
Nasker, Babu Hem Chandra.
Ray, Raja Manilell Singh.
Sarkar, Babu Jogesh Chandra,
Sarkar, Babu Rishindra Nath.

NOES.

Birley, Mr. L.
Bompas, Mr. C. H.
Chaudhuri, the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali, Khan Bahadur.
Das, Rai Bahadur Amar Nath.
Donald, Mr. J.
Gupta, Mr. N. B.
Hopkyns, Mr. W. S.
Nernell, Mr. W. W.
Kerr, the Hon'ble Mr. J. N.
Lang, Mr. J.
Lees, Mr. D. N.
Marr, Mr. A.
Mitter, the Hon'ble Mr. P. C.
O'Malley, Mr. L. S. S.
Payne, Mr. C. F.
Rahim, the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur.
Ray, Babu Surendra Nath.
Suhrawardy, Dr. Hassan.
Suhrawardy, Mr. Huseyn Shaheed.
Wheeler, the Hon'ble Sir Henry.
Wordsworth, Mr. W. C.

The Ayes being 24 and the Noes 21, the motion was carried.

Adjournment.

The Council was adjourned to the next day, Friday, the 8th July 1921, at 3 P.M.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Council assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act.

THE Council assembled at 3 P.M. on the 8th July, 1921, in the Council Chamber in the Town Hall, Calcutta.

Present:

The Hon'ble the President, the Hon'ble the four Members of the Executive Council, the Hon'ble the three Ministers, and 104 nominated and elected members.

Unstarred Questions

(answers to which were laid on the table).

"Sadhu" as Kumar of Bhowal.

187. Babu FANINDRALAL DE: (*a*) Will the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to make a statement giving particulars of the inquiry made prior to the publication of the notification by the District Magistrate of Dacca, declaring the *sadhu* claiming to be the Kumar of Bhowal, to be an impostor?

(*b*) Is it a fact that a few supporters of the said claimant wanted an opportunity to produce evidence and to cross-examine witnesses who were then making statements affirming the fact of cremation?

(*c*) If so, was such opportunity given to them? If not, why not?

(*d*) Is there any truth in the allegation that the witnesses examined in Calcutta, Darjeeling and Dacca were either produced by or on behalf of Babu Satyendra Nath Banerjee, brother-in-law of the second Kumar of Bhowal?

(*e*) Is there any truth in the allegation that the Deputy Magistrate who made the inquiry at Dacca, was assisted by men belonging to a party whose interests would be adversely affected if the alleged identity of the *sadhu* were established?

(*f*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to make a detailed statement giving particulars of the recent incident at the Mirzapur cutcherry of the Bhowal estate, in which a Muhammadan was shot dead and two other persons were wounded?

(*g*) Under whose orders and why were armed escorts provided to the drummer while making the proclamation?

(*h*) Is it a fact that copies of printed notifications were widely circulated among the tenants before the said proclamation of the purport thereof by beat of drum was made?

(*i*) If so, what was the reason for making the proclamation?

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of REVENUE [LAND REVENUE] (the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan): (*a*), (*b*), (*c*), (*d*) and (*e*). The matter is being dealt with by the Court of Wards, and Government must decline to make any statement.

(*f*) The incident will form the subject of judicial proceedings. When these proceedings are completed, a copy of the judgment, if desired, will be laid on the library table.

(*g*) No armed escort was provided for the drummer.

(*h*) Printed notifications were sent to all naibs to have them published by beat of drum.

(*i*) The object of the proclamation was to acquaint the tenants with the facts and to prevent ignorant tenants paying money to wrong persons.

Financial management of the Calcutta University.

188. Babu HEM CHANDRA NASKER: (*a*) Has the attention of the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education been drawn to the fact made public by Mr. Charu Chandra Biswas, a member of the Syndicate of the Calcutta University, about the mismanagement of the finance and trust funds and the objectionable manner in which the budget of the University is usually prepared and passed by the Senate?

(*b*) What steps are taken to check the accounts and control the finance?

(*c*) Is it a fact that treasury bills belonging to a specific trust fund were pledged by the University last year?

(*d*) If so, what is the name of the fund to which the treasury bills belonged?

(*e*) What are the terms and conditions under which the University held the said fund?

(*f*) What are the exact terms of the resolution of the Syndicate empowering the Registrar of the University to pledge the treasury bills, and what are the terms of the resolution of the Senate confirming the action of the Syndicate?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of EDUCATION (the Hon'ble Mr. P. C. Mitter): (*a*) The newspaper accounts of the episode to which the member refers have been noticed.

(*b*) The accounts of the University are annually audited by the Accountant-General, Bengal, and the audit reports were, until the control of the Calcutta University was recently handed over to this Government, submitted to the Government of India. In future these reports will be submitted to the local Government.

(*c*), (*d*), (*e*) and (*f*) The Government have no information, but a reference has been made to the Calcutta University and when replies have been received they will be placed on the library table.

Cholera and Malaria in Faridpur.

189. Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state what has been the number of deaths from cholera in the different subdivisions of the district of Faridpur in the years 1918, 1919 and 1920?

(*b*) What arrangements have been made by Government to supply good drinking water in the areas particularly affected with cholera in that district?

(*c*) Have Government any statistics to show what parts of Faridpur are considered as highly malarious?

(*d*) Has there been any anti-malarial project worked up in those parts?

(*e*) If not, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state when such a project is likely to be taken in hand?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea):

(*a*) The figures are given in the following statement:—

SUBDIVISION.	1918	1919	1920
Sadar	1,035	1,684	312
Gopalganj ...	774	307	736
Madaripur	1,494	797	760
Goalundo	1,282	494	409
District Total ...	4,585	3,282	2,217

(*b*) The provision of good drinking water is a work of local sanitary improvement which should be taken up by the local authorities concerned. They have been urged to improve the sources of water-supply so as to check the periodical recurrence and spread of cholera.

(*c*) The following statement shows the five thanas in which malaria is most prevalent:—

NAME OF THANA.	1918.		1919.		1920.	
	Mortality.	Ratio per mille.	Mortality.	Ratio per mille.	Mortality	Ratio per mille.
Madaripur	5,732	25·3	7,382	32·6	8,954	39·5
Palong	8,115	22·8	7,777	21·9	10,776	30·3
Balliakandi	2 391	29·2	1,762	21·5	2,683	32·2
Bhusna	2,613	29 0	2,029	22·5	3,030	33·6
Pangsa	3,345	27·2	2,604	21·2	3,774	30·7

(*d*) and (*e*) No anti-malarial scheme has been prepared. The District Board of Faridpur, like other District Boards, has been asked to convene a conference to which the leading men of the district will be invited to formulate schemes of water-supply and anti-malarial operations. The conference will be held shortly and I hope to attend it.

Epidemic of cholera due to drought.

190. Babu JATINDRA NATH BASU: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to say whether the attention of the Government has been drawn to the spread of cholera in Bengal during the present hot weather?

(*b*) Is it a fact that there was very little rain last cold weather?

(*c*) Did the Government take any special steps or urge local bodies to take such steps so that the drought during the hot weather might be met, and the spread of epidemics due to the want of a supply of good water might be retarded?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea): (*a*) Government are aware that there was a genaral increase of cholera during the month of April, but it has been on the decline since May.

(*b*) Rainfall was in defect in the month of November and December 1920; it increased appreciably in January, 1921, but again diminished in February.

(*c*) The Department of Public Health has been periodically notifying the cholera figures through the medium of the Associated Press. In the month of March last, the Director of Public Health issued a

circular to the Chairmen of all District Boards urging upon them to adopt a proper system of anti-cholera work: a similar circular was issued in the following month to the chairmen of Municipalities. Copies* of these circulars are laid on the library table. Local authorities of the localities which returned a serious increase of cholera were specially urged by the Department to adopt immediate preventive measures and to improve the water-supply.

Partition of tauzi No. 127, Khulna.

191. Babu JOGENDRA NATH ROY: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue (Land Revenue) be pleased to state—

(*i*) since when the work of partition of tauzi No. 127, Khulna, has been going on;

(*ii*) when Government expect to finish the work;

(*iii*) the number of office staff engaged in this work and the cost incurred up to date by the parties concerned in the partition of tauzi No. 127; and

(*iv*) the area of the tauzi.

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of finishing the work of partition of tauzi No 127 before undertaking settlement operations on the tauzi, or, in case it is not found possible to finish the partition of the tauzi within a short time, to defer settlement work till the completion of the partition?

(*c*) Are the Government aware of the fact that the proprietors will not benefit by the settlement unless partition is completed before settlement?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) (*i*) Since the 9th September, 1912

(*ii*) Partition is expected to be finished by the end of September, 1922, provided no objections are raised by the parties at any stage

(*iii*) The number of office staff is 6. They do work in connection with the partition of other estates in addition. The cost incurred up to date for this estate is Rs. 59,848-0-9.

(*iv*) The area is 65,000 acres.

(*b*) As the attestation in the settlement proceedings will be done in 1923-24, and final publication will not take place till the middle of 1925, there would be no difficulty in incorporating the results of the partition in the settlement record, even if the partition proceedings are not finished until a year after the estimated time. There is, therefore, no necessity to defer settlement work till the completion of the partition proceedings.

(*c*) The benefit to the proprietors will be enhanced if the partition is completed before the settlement records are finally published.

* Not printed in these proceedings.

Primary schools in Faridpur.

192. Maulvi ABDUL KARIM: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state the number of the following class of schools in the Faridpur district:—

(*i*) Board primary school for boys,
(*ii*) Board primary school for girls,
(*iii*) Aided primary school for boys,
(*iv*) Aided primary school for girls,
(*v*) Unaided primary school for boys,
(*vi*) Unaided primary school for girls,
(*vii*) Aided *maktabs* for boys, and
(*viii*) Aided *maktabs* for girls?

(*b*) What is the average number of primary schools under a sub-inspector of schools in Faridpur?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that the District Board of Faridpur passed a resolution in December last recommending the appointment of five additional sub-inspectors in the district of Faridpur?

(*d*) Are the Government going to make these appointments?

(*e*) If so, when?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) (*i*) Board primary schools for boys, 196.

(*ii*) Board primary schools for girls, 2.
(*iii*) Aided primary schools for boys, 1,080.
(*iv*) Aided primary schools for girls, 573.
(*v*) Unaided primary schools for boys, 225.
(*vi*) Unaided primary schools for girls, 209.
(*vii*) Aided *maktabs* for boys, 457.
(*viii*) Aided *maktabs* for girls, 293.

(*b*) The average number of primary schools under a sub-inspector of schools in Faridpur, 208.

(*c*) Yes.

(*d*) No; funds do not permit.

(*e*) This question does not arise in view of the answer to (*d*).

Technical schools in Faridpur.

193. Maulvi ABDUL KARIM: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education aware that the District Board of Faridpur passed a resolution for the establishment of one technical school in each subdivision of the district, and prayed for pecuniary help from the Department?

(*b*) Are the Government prepared to offer the help sought in the current year?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) If the resolution to which the member refers had for its object the establishment of technical schools, this question should have been addressed to the Hon'ble Minister in charge of Agriculture and Industries. The Hon'ble Minister in charge of Education is informed that in April last the Vice-Chairman of the Faridpur District Board submitted to the Industries Department a scheme for starting wood-work classes in the ordinary schools. The Industries Department were not in a position to provide funds for the proposed classes, as they lie outside the sphere of that Department.

(*b*) The Education Department are making inquiries

Cost of bandage cloth for patients of police cases.

194. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state the cost of price of bandage cloth for patients of police cases in each subdivision from 1917 to 1919, and the average savings of Government from non-payment of that cost for those years in the whole of the Presidency?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: A statement is laid on the table. The orders directing that the charges for the dressings of patients in medico-legal cases in class III dispensaries should be met in all cases from the funds of the dispensaries concerned were not in force before June, 1919

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 194.

DISTRICT.	Subdivisions.	COST OF PRICE OF BANDAGE CLOTH FOR PATIENTS OF POLICE CASE.			AVERAGE SAVINGS OF GOVERNMENT FOR NON-PAYMENT OF THAT COST.			REMARKS.
		1917	1918	1919	1917	1918	1919	
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
		Rs. A. P.	Rs. A. P.	Rs. A. P.	Rs. A. P.	Rs. A. P.	Rs. A. P.	
Burdwan	Burdwan Sadar		42[illegible]		...	...	...	Met from the hospital fund
	Asansol		[illegible]		...		...	
	Katwa		[illegible]		...		...	
	Kalna		[illegible]				...	
Birbhum	Sadar		[illegible]				...	Met from the hospital fund.
	Rampurhat		36 [illegible]					
Bankura	Sadar	45 [illegible]	[illegible]	31 4		...	...	The cost was paid from the dispensary fund.
	Vishnupur	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]				
Midnapore	...				...	...	...	No separate accounts are kept for police cases and the bandage is used from hospital stock in all subdivisions of the district
Howrah					...	...	...	No separate figures are available.

DISTRICT	SUB-DIVISION.	COST OF ESTABLISHMENT PER PATIENT TREATED DURING THE YEAR			AVERAGE DAILY VALUE OF GOVERNMENT FREE ESTABLISHMENT OF THE STATE			REMARKS
		1917.	1918.	1919.	1917.	1918.	1919.	
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
		Rs. A. P.	Rs. A. P.	Rs. A. P.	Rs. A. P.	Rs. A. P.	Rs. A. P.	
Dacca	Sadar (Dacca)							
	Narsingdi	3 [illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]				All the cost met from the hospital fund.
	Manikganj	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]				
Mymensingh	Mymensingh		[illegible]					
	Sadar		[illegible]					
	Tangail		[illegible]					
	Jamalpur		[illegible]			[illegible]		
	Kishoreganj		[illegible]			[illegible]		
	Netrakona		[illegible]			[illegible]		
Bakarganj	Sadar	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]				Whole cost was met from the hospital fund.
	Pirojpur	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]				
	Patuakhali	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]				Met from the hospital fund except Rs. 9-3 for 1917 and Rs. 30-5-6 for January and February 1918, which was met by Government.
	Bhola	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]				Whole cost was met from the hospital fund.

District.	Subdivisions.	[illegible]			AVERAGE SAVINGS TO GOVERNMENT FOR TREATMENT OF THAT COST.			REMARKS
		[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9
		Rs. A. P.	Rs. A.	Rs. A. P.	Rs. A. P.	Rs. A. P.	Rs. A. P.	
Rangpur ...	Sadar	28 [illegible]	[illegible]	44 4				
	Kurigram	27 2	[illegible]	[illegible]				
	Nilphamari	[illegible]	3	3		...		[illegible] cost was met from [illegible] fund.
	Gaibandha	42 19 0	56	24 [illegible]				
Pabna ...	Sadar	18	[illegible]	2 [illegible]				
	Serajganj	12 5 [illegible]	22 3	[illegible]				All cost was met from the hospital fund.
Malda ...	English Bazar	46 12	42	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	7 4 0	No separate account is kept. Magistrate used to pay at [illegible] for police case [illegible] them. This system [illegible] from June 1919.
Bogra ...	Sadar	58 3	[illegible]	[illegible]			...	No separate account is kept for this in the hospital.
Jalpaiguri ...	Sadar	4 8 0	34	[illegible]				
	Alipur Duars	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]				Whole cost was met from the hospital funds.
Darjeeling ...	...	...			...		...	Information is not available.

Muhammadan marriage registrars in the Bakarganj district.

195. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state -

(*i*) whether it is a fact that the posts of four Muhammadan marriage registrars were sanctioned in the year before last or thereabouts for the district of Bakarganj, and that the Standing Committee nominated the candidates for the posts;

(*ii*) why the posts remained vacant for these years;

(*iii*) whether the Government are considering the desirability of appointing Muhammadan marriage registrars and *kazis* for each thana of the district of Bakarganj;

(*iv*) the number of bigamy cases in the criminal courts of each subdivision of the district of Bakarganj from 1918 to 1920?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*i*) and (*ii*) Yes. In June, 1918, four new offices in the district of Bakarganj, viz., at Bakarganj, Uzirpur, Rajapur and Daulatkhan, were sanctioned. On the representation of the Muhammadan registrars, whose incomes were affected, the district registrar of Bakarganj proposed that the opening of these offices might be postponed and the matter was kept in abeyance for one year. On the expiration of this period the district registrar was asked to submit nominations for these offices, but the Muhammadan registrars who were affected, again prayed for a postponement, and the Inspector of Muhammadan Registration Offices was deputed to make local inquiries and to report. His report has been received and appointments for the Rajapur and Uzirpur offices have been made. The appointment of the Muhammadan registrar for Daulatkhan has been gazetted, and a nomination for the Bakarganj office has been called for from the district registrar.

(*iii*) The answer is in the negative. The opening of new offices is governed by the principle laid down by Government in paragraph 11 of Government resolution No. 1410 T. R., dated the 24th September, 1917 (extract laid on the table), and is determined by the demand for such offices in a particular place.

(*iv*) A statement is laid on the table.

Extract, paragraph 11, from Resolution No. 1410T. R., dated Darjeeling, the 24th September, 1917, referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 195(iii).

11 Between 1912 and 1916 the number of Registration offices has only increased from 273 to 276 the Governor in Council desires that the Inspector-General of Registration will examine the position with a view to increasing the number of offices in areas in which facilities for registration are found to be insufficient. In making this examination the Inspector-General of Registration will of course bear in mind that the multiplication of offices tends to reduce the income of Muhammadan Marriage Registrars and thereby to discourage suitable men

from taking up this work. Moreover, in areas in which an individual Registrar has made the Act popular and increased the number of registrations, consideration should be shown to the successful Registrar during the continuance of his incumbency. But even after due weight has been given to those factors in the situation there is probably room for a substantial increase in the number of offices. The Governor in Council therefore awaits the specific proposals of the Inspector-General of Registration.

* * * * * * *

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 195 (iv) showing the number of bigamy cases in the criminal courts of each subdivision of the district of Bakarganj from 1918 to 1920.

Subdivision	Years		
	1918	1919	1920
Sadar	38	61	50
Pirojpur	15	23	29
Patuakhali	9	25	32
Bhola	23	29	29

Salary slips to officiating Munsifs.

196. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to state

(*i*) whether it is a fact that salary slips for Rs. 300 have been issued to only some of the officiating Munsifs who have completed one year's service, and not to all such Munsifs;

(*ii*) if so, what is the reason for this differentiation in treatment between one officiating Munsif and another;

(*iii*) whether the officiating Munsifs who were in employ up to the closing day of the Puja vacation, 1920, and then again in employ from the reopening day after the Puja vacation, will get their salary for the Puja vacation of 1920 when the scheme for appointing probationers is ultimately given effect to;

(*iv*) the number of vacancies at the present time in the existing cadre of Munsifs;

(*v*) the reason why these vacancies have not been filled up yet;

(*vi*) whether it is a fact that some of these vacancies have been in existence for more than one year; and

(*vii*) whether these vacancies are likely to be filled up before the Puja vacation, 1921?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to state —

(*i*) whether he proposes to undertake in the course of this year a tour to some of the outlying parts of this Presidency to ascertain on the spot some of the legitimate grievances of officers of the Bengal Civil Service (Judicial);

(*ii*) whether the scheme for appointing probationers to the Bengal Civil Service (Judicial) is likely to be given effect to before the Puja vacation of this year; and

(*iii*) if not, how many of the officiating Munsifs are likely to be relieved on the date of the closing of the Civil Courts for the Puja vacation.

MEMBER in charge of JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-Rahim): (*a*) (*i*) Salary slips for Rs. 300 were issued to all Munsifs who could not complete two year's actual service before 1st December, 1919, the date from which the new time-scale of pay was given effect to.

(*ii*) Does not arise.

(*iii*) The question does not arise at present, as the probationary system has not as yet been introduced

(*c*), (*i*), (*ii*) and (*iii*) There is only one vacancy at the present time in the existing cadre of Munsifs, and it occurred on the 21st May, 1921, and this recent vacancy is likely to be filled up before the Puja vacation, 1921.

(*b*) (*i*) The Hon'ble Member will go on tour in the usual course when he will be glad to see any judicial officer.

(*ii*) No definite statement can now be made, as the matter is still under consideration.

(*iii*) Does not arise.

Demonstration farms in each thana and circulation of reports, etc., in vernacular.

197. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state whether he is in a position to give an approximate time by which each thana will have at least one demonstration farm?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of circulating in the vernacular of each district, the annual report and the results of the research of the Agricultural Department through the union committees, primary schools and other proper agencies?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of AGRICULTURE and INDUSTRIES (the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur): (*a*) It is not at present under the contemplation of

Government to establish demonstration farms in each thana. Under present arrangements district farms are to be established first and such funds as are available are being devoted to this purpose.

(*b*) The annual reports of the agricultural stations and the bulletins and leaflets are translated into the vernacular and distributed locally. An agricultural journal in the vernacular is issued quartely and widely circulated.

Registration in Bakarganj and a substitute for the Sub-Registrar at Patuakhali.

198. Maluvi FAZLAL KARIM: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the greatest number of documents are registered in the month of May each year in the district of Bakarganj?

(*b*) Is it a fact that the sub-registrar of Patuakhali took leave for 21 days in the month of May, 1921, and that no substitute was placed there for the time?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) The figures for 1921 are not available. In 1919 and 1920 the number of documents registered in May was greater than in other months, while in 1918 the number of documents registered in April and June exceeded that for May.

(*b*) Yes. The office of the Sub-Registrar, Patuakhali, was closed from the 3rd May to 25th May, under the exceptional circumstances detailed below; but there has been no complaint of any inconvenience. There is a joint office at Betagi (a steamer station) within easy reach of Patuakhali.

On the 11th May last the District Registrar informed the Inspector-General that he had permitted the sub-registrar of Patuakhali to proceed on leave from 3rd May in anticipation of sanction, and had directed the Subdivisional Officer of Patuakhali to depute a Sub-deputy Collector to carry on the work, but unfortunately no Sub-Deputy Collector was available. A relieving officer, who was then acting at Daudkhandi in Tippera, but who was expected to be relieved on or about the 10th, was directed by wire to join Patuakhali without taking joining time. He was delayed in being relieved, and when he started for Patuakhali he was prevented from joining there on account of steamer and railway strikes. The permanent incumbent joined Patuakhali on the 26th May, after cancelling the unexpired portion of his leave.

Appointment of members of Bengal Civil Service to posts of Under or Assistant Secretaries.

199. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state whether

it is a fact that no member of the Bengal Civil Service (Judicial) has been appointed to act as Under-Secretary or Assistant Secretary to Government?

(*b*) Whether it is a fact that two members of the Bengal Civil Service (Executive) are serving as Assistant Secretaries to Government at present?

(*c*) Whether the Government are considering the desirability of appointing two members of the Bengal Civil Service (Judicial) in the Bengal Secretariat?

(*d*) Whether the Government intend to throw open to the Bengal Civil Service (Judicial), the Assistant Secretaryship in the Legislative Department and the Registrarship of the Bengal Legislative Council?

MEMBER in charge of APPOINTMENT DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (*a*) The answer is in the affirmative, so far as concerns the appointment made up to the present.

(*b*) Yes.

(*c*) The question is apparently based upon a theory that these posts must be filled on equal proportion from the Executive and Judicial Branches. That theory has never been accepted and there is no intention of accepting it.

(*d*) These posts are at present not vacant and the question of how they are to be filled in future will not arise so long as the present incumbents remain in the office.

Scheme for training mechanical apprentices at Kanchrapara.

200. Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state the present progress of the scheme for training mechanical apprentices at Kanchrapara the present number of such apprentices and the amount of the yearly allotment for this particular purpose?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDURI, Khan Bahadur: In accordance with the recommendations of the Kanchrapara school committee a hostel with superintendent's quarters for the Indian apprentices has been constructed at a cost of Rs. 76,553 and it has been arranged to purchase the loco superintendent's office at Kanchrapara for the accommodation of the school at a cost of Rs. 43,139. The whole scheme for the training of apprentices is now being submitted to the Government of India for approval. The number of apprentices at present undergoing training is not known. An enquiry has been made, and on receipt of the information it will be communicated to the member. The cost of the training of apprentices is met by the Eastern Bengal Railway. No provision for annual recurring expenditure was made, as the new scheme has not come into effect yet.

Development Board.

201. Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state when the Development Board, as indicated by Sir T. Holland, for Bengal is going to be formed, and how it is to be constituted?

(*b*) Will non-official Indian industrial experts be included in the forthcoming Board?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) and (*b*) A Development Board for this province is not considered necessary at present.

Supply of officers for working private demonstration farms.

202. Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: (*a*) will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the Agricultural Department supplies officers at the cost of the Government to private individuals for working demonstration farms?

(*b*) Is any distinction made for supplying officers for the purpose, between Europeans and Indians who offer land for demonstration farms?

(*c*) Has an officer been supplied to work a demonstration farm, lands for which have been given by a private individual, in Ghosa, in the Sundarbans?

(*d*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge be pleased to state the quantity of land offered by the owner for this particular farm, and the yearly cost to Government for permanently keeping an officer and his staff of men on the farm?

(*e*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that the locality where this farm is situated is considered unhealthy and unsuitable for demonstration farm?

(*f*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether it is a fact that a private gentleman, an Indian of Mahisadal, Midnapore, offered land and building worth Rs. 1,00,000 to the Agricultural Department, Bengal, and prayed for the opening and working of a demonstration farm there?

(*g*) Is it a fact that this offer has been refused by the Agricultural Department?

(*h*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state the reasons for the refusal?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) In exceptional circumstances an officer is supplied in an advisory capacity to assist a private concern or individual to start a demonstration farm.

(*b*) No.

(*c*) Yes.

(*d*) 20 bighas. Annual cost to Government amounts to Rs. 600 at present.

(*e*) No.

(*f*) Yes. The value of land and buildings was estimated by the Collector at Rs. 15,000 only.

(*g*) and (*h*) Yes. The offer of land and building in question was made in 1920, but as the place was found to be somewhat inaccessible, either by rail or steamer, and our staff was very limited, the scheme had to be dropped pending the further development of the Agricultural Department. A proposal has been recently made by the District Board of Midnapore to utilize this land as a District Board Farm, and arrangements have been made to provide a suitable farm manager and to render all assistance and advice possible.

Mining education.

203. Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state the number of mining students receiving practical training in the Bengal coal-fields, either at their own cost or at the cost of colliery owners, and what it costs the Government for their theoretical training in different lecturing centres?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: From the latest figures available, it appears that the number of mining employees attending the different lecture centres in the Bengal coal fields is about 150 at the ordinary lectures conducted in English, and about 90 at the elementary lectures given in Bengali. The numbers fluctuate considerably. The total cost to Government for the session 1920-21 amounted to Rs. 2,213.

Non-official chairmen for local boards.

204. Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the principle of appointing non-official chairmen for the local boards in this province has not been enforced as a general rule as in the case of the district boards?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to make a statement showing the number of local boards in this Presidency as against the number of elected non-official chairmen of such boards?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) In pursuance of a resolution moved by Babu Fanindralal De at the meeting of

the Legislative Council held on the 5th of April, 1921, which was accepted by Government and carried *nem con*, Government have already directed that no official member of a local board should stand for election as its Chairman. The order will be given effect to as the terms of office of the existing official Chairmen expire.

(*b*) A statement is laid on the table.

Statement referred to in the answer to unstarred question No. 204 (b) showing the number of elected non-official Chairmen of Local Boards in each Division and the total number of Local Boards in each.

Division		No. of Local Boards	No. of elected non-official Chairmen of Local Boards.
Burdwan	...	17	9
Presidency ...	...	21	12
Dacca	...	17	12
Chittagong ...	...	7	7
Rajshahi	...	13	6
Total	...	75	46

Government Commercial Institute Calcutta.

205. Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state whether it is contemplated to enlarge the present teaching staff of the Government Commercial Institute, Calcutta, by the appointment of a Principal from England?

(*b*) Is it a fact that there is already a strong staff with a Principal?

(*c*) If the answer to clause (*a*) of the question be in the affirmative, are the Government considering the desirability of abandoning the proposal?

(*d*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state the number and the names of the members of the Governing Body of the said Commercial Institute?

(*e*) Is it a fact that there has been no substantial change in the *personnel* of the Governing Body since the foundation of the institute?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Yes. But if there is no prospect of an officer being recruited in England in the near future the Secretary of State has been asked to permit this Government to advertise the post and recruit an officer locally.

(*b*) The post of Principal has not been substantively filled since the resignation of Mr. J. A. Chapman some years ago. The lecturer in

Commercial Geography has been officiating as Principal and there is a qualified staff.

(*c*) No.

(*d*) The present Board is composed of nine members, including the President. Their names are given below:—

(1) W. A. Lee, Esq., President.

(2) W. H. Everett, Esq., Inspector of Technical and Industrial Institutions, Bengal.

(3) W. Stather Hale, Esq., Registrar, Joint Stock Companies, Calcutta.

(4) B. E. G. Eddis, Esq., Messrs. Gillanders, Arbuthnot & Co., 8, Clive Street, Calcutta.

(5) J. C. Coyajee, Esq., Senior Professor of Economics, Presidency College, Calcutta.

(6) Babu Amulya Dhone Addy, M.L.C., 78, Chetla Road, Alipore, Calcutta.

(7) Rai A. C. Banerjee Bahadur, M.A., M.L.C., 8 B, Lall Bazar Street, Calcutta.

(8) W. Kirpatrick, Esq., Messrs. Bird & Co., Chartered Bank Buildings, Calcutta.

(9) Rai Sahib G. K. Sen, officiating Principal, Government Commercial Institute.

(*e*) The *personnel* of the present Governing Body is entirely different from that of the original Advisory Board appointed in 1905 when the Institute was started. None of the original members remain.

Practical demonstration of the results obtained by Agricultural Department to raiyats.

206. Maulvi RAFI UDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to refer to the Final Report of the Midnapore District Settlement Operations, pages 120-21, regarding the amelioration of the condition of the agriculturist class, and say whether the Government are considering the desirability of bringing home to the raiyat, by actual demonstration in his own village, the practical results obtained by the Agricultural Department?

(*b*) If not, what are the reasons for not doing so?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) The member is referred to the reply to question No. 34 (*c*) asked by Babu Fanindralal De at the Council meeting of the 14th March, 1921.

(*b*) No definite steps in respect of the demonstration work could be taken in Midnapore district till the appointment of a district agricultural officer and a demonstrator in 1917. The present staff in Midnapore district consist of a district agricultural officer at headquarters, an additional agricultural officer at Ghatal, and five Government demonstrators. There are also seven demonstrators maintained by the District Board and *Khas Mahals*. Demonstration work is now being extended as rapidly as funds and staff permit.

Pay of men while officiating in posts of Provincial Service.

207. Maulvi RAFI UDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state why the members of the Subordinate Educational Service are not allowed to draw the full pay of the Provincial Service when they are appointed to officiate in the latter service?

(*b*) Is it a fact that the members of all other services are allowed to draw the full pay of the service in which they are appointed to officiate?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*a*) and (*b*) Officers of the Subordinate Educational Service who are officiating in appointments included in the Bengal Educational Service are entitled to allowances in accordance with the prescribed rules. These allowances were previously regulated by article 139 of the Civil Service Regulations, in accordance with which an officer of the Subordinate Educational Service acting in the Bengal Educational Service received an acting allowance of Rs. 50 a month only. In accordance with the Government of India resolution No. 2097 C.S.R., dated the 27th November, 1920, an officer of the Subordinate Educational Service while acting in the Bengal Educational Service (the latter service having been reorganised on a time-scale basis) is entitled to an acting allowance equal to the difference between his pay and the minimum pay of the Bengal Educational Service. These new rules have not yet been made applicable, but the matter is receiving attention.

Government expenses on the "Bangavasi" defamation case.

208. Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to state how much, on the whole, has been spent by the Government for conducting the case of police inspector Dwijendra Chandra Ghose *versus* the Editor of the *Bangavasi* in the Original side of the High Court?

(*b*) Is it a fact that the amount of damages claimed by the plaintiff in the suit was only Rs. 5,000?

(*c*) Where did the cause of action in the suit arise?

(*d*) Was the suit filed in the Original side of the High Court or was it brought there through an order of "transfer?"

(*e*) If it was so brought, who applied for the transfer?

(*f*) How many witnesses for the plaintiff were examined in the High Court and how many were examined in the mufassal on commission?

(*g*) What is the total amount of fees paid to the counsel of the plaintiff?

(*h*) What is the total amount of expenses incurred by the Government for the cost of the commissions and how much of it was for the fees of the plaintiff's counsel?

(*i*) How many counsel were engaged by the Government in the case for the plaintiff?

(*j*) What was the daily fee allowed to the leading counsel in the case while attending commissions in the mufassal?

(*k*) Was any rough estimate submitted to Government by any of its officers as to the probable cost of conducting the suit in the Original side of the High Court before the Government accepted the liability of conducting the same?

(*l*) Who was the officer who gave the estimate?

(*m*) What was the amount as per that estimate?

(*n*) From what heads of sanctioned expenditure in the Budgets of the last and the present years has the Government met the whole of the costs of this suit, giving details and references to the Budget items and the pages of the Budgets containing these items?

MEMBER in charge of POLICE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (*a*) A sum of Rs. 1,13,159-10 has been expended.

(*b*) Yes.

(*c*) The cause of action in such cases arises wherever the defamatory matter is published.

(*d*) The suit was filed in the Original side of the High Court.

(*e*) This does not arise.

(*f*) Twelve witnesses for the plaintiff were examined in the High Court, and one witness, in full, and another witness, partly, were examined on his behalf on commission in the mufassal.

The application of the defence to have some of their witnesses examined on commission in the mufassal was granted by the Court, and counsel for the plaintiff cross-examined these witnesses, 29 in number.

(*g*) The total amount of fees paid to the plaintiff's counsel is Rs. 1,02,306.

(*h*) The total cost of the commission was Rs. 95,148, out of which Rs. 88,740 represent the fees of the plaintiff's counsel.

(*i*) Three. The Advocate-General, the Standing Counsel and a counsel to take notes.

(*j*) Only one counsel was employed for the plaintiff for the purposes of the commission and he was paid sixty gold mohars as a daily fee.

(*k*) No

(*l*) and (*m*) These do not arise.

(*n*) The charge for the last financial year was met from the budget estimate of Law and Justice under the head "Legal Remembrancer and High Court Pleaders—Fees to pleaders in criminal cases." The charge during the current year has been met from the Legal Remembrancer's budget under the heads "Charges for conducting law suits" and "Fees to pleaders," as shown at page 60 of the Civil Budget Estimate for 1921-22

Increase in the pay and prospects of men in the Educational Service.

209. Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state—

(*i*) the date from which the pay and prospects of the educational officers of Bengal, below the rank of the Provincial Service, will be increased to the new rate contemplated,

(*ii*) the amount that will be required for giving the increased rate of pay to the said officers;

(*iii*) whether the above amount will be covered by the allotment made for the purpose in the Budget for the year 1921-22;

(*iv*) if not, why the full amount necessary was not provided for in the current year's Budget;

(*v*) whether these officers will have to wait for another year for increment till due provision is made in the Budget for the year 1922-23, and

(*vi*) if so, whether the Government are considering the desirability of diverting expenditure on some other head and of utilising such money for giving effect to the proposal for increment of the pay and prospects of the said officers?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (*i*), (*ii*), (*v*) and (*vi*) The matter is still under consideration, but the Government hope soon to be in a position to make a statement

(*iii*) and (*iv*) The allotment in the Budget for the current financial year is Rs. 3½ lakhs only; and this provision is not sufficient. In October, 1920, when the Education Department Budget was under the consideration of the General Department, the officiating Director of Public Instruction suggested making a provision of Rs. 3 lakhs; this was subsequently raised by the General Department to Rs. 3½ lakhs. The Committee's report was not submitted to Government until February 1921.

Deputy Collectors as Settlement Officers.

210. Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Department of Revenue be pleased to state when the Deputy Collector now working as Settlement Officer at Jessore was appointed—

(*i*) as Deputy Collector, and

(*ii*) as Settlement Officer of Jessore?

(*b*) Has this experiment of appointing a Deputy Collector as Settlement Officer in a district operation proved a success?

(*c*) Is it the intention of Government to consider the claims of Deputy Collectors, when Settlement Officers for the three new districts to be taken up next year are being selected?

(*d*) What will be the number of Settlement Officers in the financial year 1922-23?

(*e*) What are the names of Deputy Collectors of at least 12 years' standing who have worked for not less than 8 years after their appointment as Deputy Collectors in some recent district settlement operations?

(*f*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the year or years in which each of such Deputy Collectors was especially mentioned for good work in the annual administration reports of the Department?

(*g*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to furnish extracts of references, if any, to the work of these officers in the final reports of the districts in which they worked and in the annual reports submitted by Settlement Officers to the Director of Land Records?

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: (*a*) The Settlement Officer, Jessore, is not a Deputy Collector. Khan Bahadur Muhammad Abdel Momin was substantively appointed Magistrate and Collector on October 1st, 1918, and became Settlement Officer, Jessore.

(*b*) The Settlement operations in the Jessore district have been conducted satisfactorily.

(*c*) The question of the appointment of Settlement Officers for next year has not yet been considered.

(*d*) Probably seven.

(*e*) (1) Rai Gyanendra Nath Roy Bahadur, M.A., B.L.

(2) Mr. A. J. W. Harris.

(3) Rai Sahib Binay Bihary Mukharji, B.A.

(4) Khan Sahib A. K. Kaberuddin Ahmad.

(5) Babu Jiban Chandra Chatarji, M.A., B.L.

(6) Babu Phanibhusan Mitra, B.A.

(f) The Deputy Collectors were specially mentioned for good work in the annual administration reports of the Department in the years noted against their names:—

	Name of Officer.	Reports of Director of Land Records, Bengal	Reports of Director of Land Revenue, Eastern Bengal and Assam.	Reports of Director of Land Records, Bihar and Orissa.
1	Rai Gyanendra Nath Roy Bahadur, M.A., B.L.	1901-02	1906-07	.....
		1904-05		
		1911-12		
		1912-13		
		1913-14		
		1914-15		
2	Mr. A. J. W. Harris ...	1911-12	1906-07	.....
		1912-13		
		1913-14		
		1914-15		
3	Rai Sahib Bejoy Binary Mukharji, B.A.	1910-11	.....	1911-12
		1912-13		
		1913-14		
		1914-15		
		1915-16		
		1916-17		
		1917-18		
		1918-19		
4.	Khan Sahib A. K. Kasiruddin Ahmad	1911-12	.....	.....
		1912-13		
		1913-14		
		1914-15		
		1915-16		
		1916-17		
		1917-18		
5.	Babu Jiban Chandra Chatarji, M.A., B.L.	1914-15	.....	1911-12
6.	Babu Pramathesan Mitra, B.A.	1916-17	.....	.....

(*g*) Copies of the final settlement reports will be placed in the Council library.

The annual reports of Settlement Officers are not submitted to Government.

Subdivisional Officer of Kandi.

211. Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state the average travelling allowance drawn by the Subdivisional Officer of Kandi?

(*b*) For how many days in the year did he stop in villages within his jurisdiction?

(*c*) For how many days in the year did he leave and return to headquarters?

(*d*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that the Subdivisional Officer of Kandi attends his *ejlas* late in the day and carries on business up till 9, or at times to 11, in the night?

(*e*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware that the litigants have been put to great inconvenience by the late sitting of the court?

(*f*) Is it a fact that at times parties to cases have had to file petitions without court fees as none were available late in the night?

(*g*) Is it a fact that cases are transferred by the Subdivisional Officer late in the day, and the subordinate courts had to adjourn cases for want of time to the inconvenience of the parties?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) Rs 178-7 per month

(*b*) In 1919 (from 13th February, 1919 when he joined) 50 days

In 1920 41 days

In 1921 (up to June) 19 days

(*c*) In 1919 66 days

In 1920 111 days.

In 1921 61 days

(*d*) and (*e*) The Subdivisional Officer is punctual in his attendance in office. In 1919, pressure of work necessitated his working late. This was done with the consent and for the convenience of parties, and no complaints have come to the notice of Government.

(*f*) This happened in a few instances owing to the departure of the stamp vendors before 5 P.M. On his attention being drawn to it, the Subdivisional Officer arranged for the attendance of the vendors in turn to obviate the difficulty.

(*g*) No.

Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ: Will the Government be pleased to state whether the answer to (*d*) amounts to a denial of the allegation made.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: The answer means what it says and admits the allegation to the extent expressed.

Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ: With regard to the answer to (*f*) will the Government be pleased to state if it means a denial of the allegation?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: I cannot go beyond what I have already said. The answer is there and it speaks for itself.

Meetings and recommendations of the Standing Committees.

212. Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state

(*i*) how many meetings have been convened by the standing committees of this Council up to the 31st May last,

(*ii*) what recommendations have been submitted by the said committees to the Government of Bengal and the Government of India, respectively, and

(*iii*) what action the Government have been pleased to take on the said recommendations?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*i*) The number of meetings of standing committees up to 31st May last is as shown opposite their names:

Police	2
Judicial and Jails	1
Local Self-Government	3
Medical and Public Health	3
Education	1
Excise	1
Land Revenue	1

Standing committees attached to other departments did not meet.

(*ii*) and (*iii*) The functions and rules of procedure of standing committees are solely within the discretion of His Excellency the Governor, who has decided that their proceedings shall be confidential. Government are therefore unable to give the information asked for.

Resolution

(under the rules for the discussion of matters of general public interest).

Prevention of Cruelty to Animals.

Dr. HASSAN SUHRAWARDY: "This Council recommends to the Government that steps be taken immediately to appoint a Committee to consider the rules and regulations for the prevention of cruelty to animals in Calcutta."

It is well known that in spite of many officers of the Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals in Calcutta and Howrah, and in spite of many *gorakshini sabhas* and other humanitarian societies, cruelty to animals in and around Calcutta in broad daylight is very common. To reclaim the hard-hearted professional carters seems, to my mind, an uphill task which may be considered as an impossibility. Therefore, relief seems to me to lie in legislation only. We can pass stringent regulations to mitigate the sufferings of the dumb animals in Calcutta. There is a growing and a crying need for legislation and the idea has been put forward from time to time. The sight of overloaded carts slowly dragged by underfed bullocks and buffaloes jars our finer sentiments every day, indeed several times every day, as we pass by the warehouses in the Strand Road or across the Howrah Bridge. It seems curious that in a country like India, where cows are regarded as a deity, where compassion towards dumb animals is a part of the religious duty of many, where disputes over the slaughter of cows are settled by the sacrifice of human lives, yet, in this same country, the bullocks should be subjected to the slow torture of being killed by inches, by being underfed and overworked and allowed to steadily succumb under the bad treatment of the merciless carters. *Go-beren kora*, which literary means to beat like a bullock, is a phrase in Bengali, which has become synonymous with "to belabour and to beat one mercilessly." What a hard lot the bullocks and oxen have in Calcutta and all over the country! The lot of the buffaloes is even worse, for they have not got even that religious protection which might have been accorded to the bullocks. Their nostrils are pierced and a thick string passed through it like a seton. They are made to draw the clumsiest, the biggest and the heaviest springless carts. The quick percussion of *lathi* blows and the abuse of whips and the twisting of the tails are in its worse form practised on these poor amphibious animals with relentless cruelty, even during the hottest part of the day. We find that during the middle of the day, when the steamy heat of Calcutta has rendered the asphalt and tarmacadamised roads soft and pulpy, the poor draught animals are made to drag their overloaded carts urged on by the cruel whippings and *lathi* blows and kicks of the carters on the most

sensitive parts, and pulling of their tails. The already fully-loaded carts sink into the road, which incidentally is cut and damaged badly, and the resistence offered by the increased friction on their ponderous wheels makes traction almost impossible. The carters are, however, relentless and heartless and, irritated by the heat and discomfort of their position, they break their wrath by laying about indiscriminately over every part of the poor dumb animal at their mercy.

Many of us must have seen the animals actually drop down dazed under their yoke. The unfortunate amphibious buffaloes die by the dozen during every summer season under this callous treatment; and the sight of their carcasses on the Howrah bridge and the Strand and other roads, is by no means a rare or uncommon sight about the middle of the day during the hot months.

The introduction of electric power has saved the spleen and the skin of many *punkha coolies*, but the introduction of motor lorries and motor transports has not yet mitigated the sufferings of the poor dumb animals of India. Can we not legislate against working draught animals during the middle of the day? To prevent cruelties to animals a law was passed in Bengal, the Bengal Act of 1920, and one apprehends that this Act which has not so far been put into practice might, like many other Acts, be shelved indefinitely. Section 29 relates to rules and regulations which might be framed from time to time by the local Government and I hope that Government will take early steps to introduce rules and regulations to mitigate the sufferings of the dumb draught animals of Calcutta and Bengal as soon as possible and take the opinion of an Advisory Committee as to details.

SHAH SYED EMDADUL HAQ moved the following amendment: "That after the word 'Calcutta' at the end, the words 'and in the mufassal' be added."

He supported his motion in Bengali.

Rai Dr. HARIDHAN DUTT Bahadur: I am glad to find that Dr. Suhrawardy has brought this important question of the prevention of cruelty to animals in Calcutta before the Council. I do not know what the effect of the appointment of this committee will be, but, whatever result might accrue from this resolution, I am one of those who believe that one of the important points at the present moment is to find out whether any improvement is possible in the ways and methods of the Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals in Calcutta. I believe every one of my friends will agree with me that the work entrusted to this Society is very important. At the same time we all know that it is a notorious fact that instances of inhuman cruelty to animals are not rare and such cruelties are rampant all over the city. The Society has a pretty large number of inspectors. I am quite alive to the fact that the number of inspectors is not as large as may be necessary to cope with the number of cases arising all over the city. But we are entitled to know whether the inspectors, howsoever limited the

number may be, are doing any useful work and what amount of work they are doing. It is known to many of us that inhuman acts of cruelty in the shape of *pukha* are still practised by the *goealas*. During the last debate in this connection in the Corporation of Calcutta, we were surprised to hear that during the last three years not a single prosecution for *phuka* was instituted. I do not deny that it is extremely difficult to detect a crime like that, but, however difficult it may be, we are entitled to know what action has been taken in this respect. Then, Sir, cruelty is often practised on bulls and buffaloes. This is a horrible sight in the city. No doubt during the last few years improvement has been effected, but I leave it to the members of the Council to decide whether that has been satisfactory. About 4 or 5 years ago we decided the maximum load for carts. From 20 maunds it was reduced to 15 maunds. The other day I had occasion to get some bricks for my garden house at Dum Dum Junction. They had to be carried from the riverside a distance of about 1½ miles. The rule is for each cart to carry 150 bricks and the cart hire is fixed accordingly. One evening I went on inspection to my garden and I was surprised that every cart was loaded with 250 bricks. Naturally I inquired how that was possible and I was told that the carters were given four annas extra. A part of this extra, no doubt, went to those whose duty it was to prevent overloading. The result was that I had to pay more cart hire for my bricks and the bullocks had to carry more load. I believe the time has come when these things should be put a stop to.

Then there is the question about lame and unfit horses. What is our experience? Perhaps most of my friends here do not go out at dead of night. As a medical practitioner I have to do this sometimes. A large number of lame and unfit horses are yoked to carriages at night. Is there any arrangement to see to this? Perhaps I shall be told that the Society are undermanned, but undermanned or not, I do not think that the city of Calcutta or a civilized Government like that of the Government of Bengal will justify such inhuman treatment of dumb animals.

I may be permitted to refer to one of the important needs in connection with this. The want of adequate veterinary hospitals is keenly felt by us. The one at Belgachia cannot meet the needs of all parts of the province, and, I hope, Sir if a committee is appointed, it will consider the necessity of establishing other hospitals. Before I sit down, I ask the indulgence of the House to point out to the mover of the resolution that it would be better if he extends the scope of his resolution by adding the words "other matters connected with" to it. I do not know if he agrees, but if he does, then I would suggest that the resolution should run thus: "This Council recommends to the Government that steps be taken immediately to appoint a Committee to consider the rules and regulations and other matters connected with the prevention of cruelty to animals in Calcutta."

CHIEF SECRETARY to COVERNMENT (Mr. J. Donald): The intention of the motion moved by Dr. Suhrawardy amounts to a recommendation that we should bring into force the Bengal Cruelty to Animals Act, 1920, which was passed in the beginning of 1920. The present position is this. Section 13 of the Act provides for the establishment of weigh-bridges, section 14 for that of infirmaries, and section 15 for the appointment of veterinary inspectors and weigh-bridge officers. Unless, therefore, we have an adequate staff of inspectors and weigh-bridge officers, we cannot get very far nor introduce the Act. As regards infirmaries, there is at the present moment a veterinary hospital at Belgachia. There is also a certain number of weigh-bridges which are kept up by the Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals. They are five in number, but we want a few more, say three, to carry on the work properly. We must also have inspectors, and that means that we have got to get money to pay them. Our present difficulty is with regard to money. We have already a scheme prepared by the Veterinary Department which includes the appointment of inspectors and the establishment of additional weigh-bridges. The question is how are we to find money for this establishment. After what we have heard from Dr. Haridhan Dutt, I might suggest that the Calcutta Corporation should take the matter into consideration and give some assistance. When we see some prospect of funds to provide for the appointment of inspectors and the establishment of additional weigh-bridges, we can get a move on and bring the Act into force. It is our intention to place the scheme that has been prepared before the Standing Committee and if the scheme is approved and money found, we shall then appoint a committee for the purpose of framing rules and regulations under section 29 of the Act. That is the position at present. We have a scheme ready waiting for approval and the provision of funds. When approval is given and funds are in sight we shall get on to the next stage, and appoint a committee to draft rules.

The amendment moved by Shah Syed Emdadul Haq was then put and carried.

Dr. HASSAN SUHRAWARDY: Practically my suggestion has been accepted by Government. I have nothing further to say. The scheme will be placed before the Standing Committee, and, if funds permit, it will be put into operation. In view of this assurance, I beg to withdraw my motion.

The motion was then by leave of the Council withdrawn.

Rai Dr. HARIDHAN DUTT Bahadur: May I inquire if my amendment has been accepted by the Council?

The PRESIDENT (the Hon'ble Nawab Sir Syed Shams-ul-Huda): Your amendment cannot be allowed at this stage without notice.

The PRESIDENT: Gentlemen, the resolutions Nos. 42 to 49 deal with the same subject, and I propose to have them moved one after the other and then to have one discussion.

Chandpur Inquiry.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: "This Council recommends to the Government to appoint a committee, consisting of two official members and five elected members of the Council, to inquire into the incidents connected with the eviction of the tea garden coolies at Chandpur on the 20th of May last and to submit a report of the inquiry to the Government of Bengal, as soon as possible, for such action as the Government may be pleased to take on the said report."

I quite appreciate that anybody who moves for an inquiry into this matter takes upon himself the onus of making out a strong *prima facie* case as to why this particular procedure should be adopted with regard to this matter and what benefit is likely to be derived from it.

Without wasting any time in unnecessary preliminaries, I beg to draw the attention of the hon'ble House to the two most important aspects of the question, one of which is that the whole matter is admittedly one of very great public interest, and the other, that the fundamental facts regarding the affair out of which the most regrettable incident of the night of the 20th May is the central point have not been definitely and properly ascertained.

The two versions which we have now before us consist of

(1) The Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler's report which has been published by Government, and

(2) The statements of Babu Akhil Chandra Dutta, Mr. Andrews, the Most Reverend the Bishop of Assam, and other leading and respectable members of the public which have from time to time appeared in the daily papers.

It will be conceded by everybody that in order to arrive at the truth involved in this matter, what should be first done is to ascertain the facts without any bias and, as far as possible, from sources which are both direct and reliable.

It will be then necessary to draw proper inferences from those facts without fear or favour and keeping in view the safest principle that, in a matter like this, bias towards one view because it is the popular view or prejudice against the other because it is the official view or *vice versâ* will have to be equally and scrupulously avoided. It is not for me to say which version is more acceptable as I am claiming an inquiry now. I want that to be ascertained and not merely asserted. Sir, it may be said that after the report of the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler where is the room or necessity for a further inquiry? To that my reply is that it is deeply to be regretted that the report of the Hon'ble Sir Henry

Wheeler has failed to command that amount of public confidence in it as could be legitimately expected. So far as could be gathered from sources, including some of the leading daily Indian as well as Anglo-Indian newspapers, faults have been found with that report not only in its findings of fact but also its conclusions thereon. It is difficult to say now whether that is justifiable in our present state of the knowledge of the affair.

The value of such a report so well and ably written from a literary and forensic point of view has also been considerably reduced by some most unfortunate observations regarding the motives of those who happen to hold views which do not coincide with those of the Hon'ble Member. His observation that "the whole incident has been the subject of malicious exaggeration" has been contended by his opponents to be the best evidence of a practical admission on his part that he knew that his case was bad and his arguments were weak and so he had to resort to the use of harsh and undignified language and to the imputation of unfair motives to his opponents—weapons unworthy of a fair opponent particularly when he holds a high position. This is also so much unlike the writer of the report as his worst enemies will have to admit.

Sir, if there are exaggerations, they may be there on both sides. If there are indications of partisanship in the statements of facts, they may be there on both sides again. If the conclusions have been allowed to be fogged consciously or unconsciously, then the liability to that weakness which is the source of that misfortune cannot be the inherent disability either of the Government or of the opposite party. If careless overstatements of facts have been indulged in by some members of one party, the opposite party has also not behaved in such a way that it can claim immunity from the charge of manifesting a strong desire to minimise the incidents and whitewash the situation.

Then again, Sir, at the very commencement of the Government report it is claimed "many serious misrepresentations have been made"—that is, by the people. We have it again, in the answers to Dr. Moitra's question by the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler, distinctly stated that the version of Babu Akhil Chandra Dutt is inaccurate and in some instances distorted, and in others just the opposite of truth. On the admitted facts of the situation, therefore, there is no doubt that there is ample and legitimate room for a strict and impartial inquiry. In this inquiry which I propose to be held by a joint committee of officials and elected members of this Council there should be, on the one hand, a strong desire to exclude from consideration all that is exaggerated and sentimental as also, on the other, an equally strong anxiety not to accept any suggestion or circumstance which is alleged with the intention of minimising the incidents or rehabilitating the situation.

The points that require careful and impartial investigation are fortunately all broad points of facts—for it is in them that the real conflict lies in the two versions before us. The most noticeable amongst them and on the correct ascertainment of which the success of the inquiry depends may be stated to be the following, though I have no desire to be exhaustive even if I had the necessary power and the ability to be so.

The first point that occurs to my mind is to ascertain whether there was *any necessity to commandeer the Gurkha soldiers of the Eastern Bengal Rifles* for the purpose of evicting the coolies.

I think on this point there ought to be a full statement from Mr. De who sent for them in preference to the District Reserve Police on an appreciation (according to his own lights) of the difficulties of the situation. Mr. De is a responsible official of experience, he is also an Indian and has undoubtedly got the same desire as I have, if not a stronger one, to help our own wretched countrymen in their distress.

If that be so then the committee should have his full and direct statement about it. It will be for Mr. De to satisfy the committee by placing facts and circumstances to justify his conduct. These, however, must be facts and not mere opinions or *ipse dixits*. Then, again, it is admitted by his opponents that Mr. De was anxious to help the coolies home and his attitude at the beginning was friendly to them. Therefore, there must be very strong reasons based on facts which led Mr. De to commandeer Gurkha soldiers to evict them by use of force. We must in justice to him also have those reasons from him directly and that also free from editorial notes and observations. I asked the Government a question about any such statement of Mr. De being in the possession of the Government, but my question has been disallowed along with the rest of my questions on this subject on account of their length. This is no doubt very unfortunate.

The second important fact, to my mind, is to ascertain whether the interests of sanitation would have suffered if the coolies were evicted the next morning instead of at midnight. In this connection there is again a conflict of versions. One side says that the coolies were sleeping at the time while the other side asserts that they were not so. The real fact must definitely be ascertained and not left to anybody's opinion or conjecture.

The third important fact that requires correct ascertainment from direct and circumstantial evidence is whether bayonets were used. The Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler asserts that any allegation to that effect is "*wholly without foundation*." This is indeed a very strong and sweeping observation. There is no doubt that the deliberate statement of a high Government official like Sir Henry Wheeler is entitled to the greatest respect. But in this case he was no witness to the occurrence and those who might have assured him to that effect are very likely to be persons who were morally, if not physically, responsible

for the wounds howsoever caused. Then again this is a point which has got to be decided by the light of medical opinion. The evidence of the doctors and their notes made at the time have to be examined. The report speaks of sixteen cases of injured persons seen by the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler. In that list, No. 1 and No. 15 will appear to be wounds which could have been caused by bayonets in all probability —

1. A woman with a small wound in the right elbow about an inch deep. The joint was not injured. It was alleged that this was a bayonet wound.

15. A girl of about 8 years with a largish scab under the right eye. The eye was not hurt. It was said that this was a punctured wound with a bayonet: if so, it was miraculous that more injury was not done.

Anybody who has dealt with medical jurisprudence in his life on the question of wounds would at once see that these two wounds out of Sir Henry Wheeler's sixteen cases do not support the very sweeping assertion of Sir Henry Wheeler that the story of the use of the bayonets is wholly without foundation.

In connection with this very important matter the evidence of the doctors, viz., Dr. Jogesh Chandra Sur, Dr. Girin Nath Bose and Dr. Narendra Kumar Brahmachari, which appeared in the *Amrita Bazar Patrika* of the 9th June last, may also be of great use for the purpose of investigation as it is they who rendered earliest medical treatment to the sufferers. On all these materials and others available, a distinct or clear finding on this point is absolutely necessary and such a thing is nothing difficult to be had.

The fourth important point is the question of the putting out of the lights. It is claimed by one party that the lights were deliberately put out by the other. This may be an exaggeration and I earnestly hope, in the name of humanity, that it is so. The report says that the Hon'ble Mr. Sinha and Mr. Shallow were sent out to guard the Power House. Then the report stops rather abruptly and does not say who put out the lights. Inquiry has therefore to be made whether it is the coolies or the townspeople or the officers who put out the lights. Sir Henry Wheeler's *sudden refusal* to state further facts or to come to a finding about the putting out of the lights (and they were all electric lights that were suddenly put out and not oil lamps or gas lamps individually put out or broken down) is to my mind very disappointing and has well and truly laid the foundations for a requisition for making a searching inquiry into this matter. The adage says that "you can't sweep away a mist," much less, do I say, can you sweep away darkness and the cause of it. Here is, therefore, an important point on which investigation ought to be made, for, after all, it is this unholy darkness that was the cause of a lot of additional misery and suffering to the coolies and that also afforded additional facilities for

pell-mell and severe assaults which were admittedly so severe that Captain Shepherd (commanding the soldiers) had himself to order his men to desist from further beating and that, at least in one instance, the severity of the assault succeeded in evoking the active sympathy of Mr. De himself, who in the name of humanity had to put a stop to it.

In order to avoid being tedious, I give one more very important specific point on which investigation ought to be directed and it is this :—*was the conduct of the Government officials actually neutral* as it has been claimed in the report? In this connection again facts have to be inquired into, for mere assertion is of no use however high the authority may be from which it comes. It has been put on record in a diary of events published in the papers by some European gentlemen (Mr. Rope and others), who cannot possibly be charged with malice against the Government or with sympathy overflowing for the coolies, that the coolies were being sent away at the beginning by steamers from Chandpur and that on the 15th of May so many as 1,000 coolies were sent away by a steamer chartered by the Subdivisional Officer with the aid of private funds, that it was also arranged that 300 would be sent down every day and it was so done on the 16th and 17th. It was on the 16th or 17th, however, that one Mr. Macpherson of the Tea Association gave out that "the steamer company had been requested to stop giving special facilities to coolies with a view to stop the exodus." It is suggested that the order or request came from the Government to the steamer companies.

About this there is nothing said in the report. There is a very important point to decide, viz., the question of the neutrality claimed. So there ought to be an inquiry into the allegation. The *connected incident of Mr. Macpherson being allowed to interfere* with the coolies and their return home requires a very careful inquiry also. In connection with this question, it has to be considered also, the *absence of a generous rearguard act on* on the part of the Government even after the lamentable incident of the 20th May, for such a course of conduct on the part of the Government could have also to a considerable extent relieved the situation of its heart-rending effects. It has also to be seen if any attempt on the part of the Government to repatriate the destitute and helpless coolies, even after this painful incident, would have been an *economical sin* as has been claimed by Government. Assuming that it was an economical sin to help these wretched coolies in getting back to their homes, it still has to be ascertained whether *a multitude of such economical sins would not have been covered or washed away by one act of generous repatriation on the part of the Government*. For aught we know, the Government might have had good reasons for the attitude they took, but in fairness to themselves and in fairness to the public those reasons should be made known to the public so that the various speculations that had been made and are still being made about the motives of the Government may once for all be set at rest.

Other important points of facts that require to be correctly ascertained (to give a list of them which is only illustrative and not exhaustive) are—

(1) The total number of persons (males, females and children) who were injured—this particularly in view of Sir Henry Wheeler's observation "that statements indicate a general scuffle rather than particular assaults."

(2) The general nature of their injuries (slight or severe—rejecting Sir Henry Wheeler's rather extraordinary test that no injury is severe unless there is a bone broken or it is a bayonet wound).

(3) What overt and forceful opposition these coolies did offer before Gurkha sepoys were ordered to fall upon them, etc

(4) How is it no Hon'ble Member could come down to Chandpur before nine days had passed away?

On these and other important points there must be clear and distinct findings of facts on a careful and impartial inquiry. Witnesses will have to be examined, irrespective of their leanings on either side, and the truth sifted out from their evidence which may, in some instances, be either irresponsible exaggerations on the one hand, or deliberate concealment of facts on the other.

In conclusion, I think that regard being had to the deep and grave disquiet that had been felt by many many minds in this country over this most regrettable incident, and also in view of the undeniable fact that the *report of Sir Henry Wheeler instead of healing the wound caused on the public mind has actually inflamed it*, there ought to be held a public inquiry by this Council through a responsible committee to produce those ameliorative results which an impartial investigation made for honestly dealing out praise and blame can alone produce

Sir, in order not to allow sympathy of right-minded men to be alienated from the Government, it is urgently necessary that such an inquiry should be made at once Owing to an incident of this description and particularly owing to the pertinacity with which the misery which arose out of the situation was, in the result, actually prolonged by Government orders, all hopes of a new and responsible era due to the Reforms, are fast fading away from the minds of even those who are vigorously optimistic. I confess this with the deepest regret.

I, therefore, think that if the anxiety of the Government for the co-operation and good-will of the people is not a mere camouflage, as I do sincerely believe that it is not, then the Government ought to be the party, most anxious to support a resolution of this character. If the securing of *public confidence and not the upholding of official prestige* is the real objective of the Government then I cannot for one moment conceive how they can do anything but support my demand

for an inquiry—just, open and illuminating. Crime perpetrated by those who are responsible for the maintenance of law, order and right stands in a different category altogether. Its effect is far-reaching and very penetrating. It is an offence not only against man but against God Himself before whom the mightiest monarch or Government on earth must quail. The shrieks and wailings of the poor, wretched and unfortunate coolies may not be potent enough to reach the heart of the Government but they certainly have special facilities given to them to reach the throne of the Almighty and All-Powerful.

Let there be, therefore, an inquiry—a just, open and impartial inquiry to find out if there has been any such crime committed. If it is found on such inquiry that no such wrong was committed by any officer of the Government, high or low, connected with this heart-rending incident then let the country be thoroughly assured of it by distinct and correct statement of facts, and let all misconceptions be most scrupulously sought to be removed from the public mind without the least desire to echo the wrong or distorted and baseless or malicious views of any section of the community however strong and numerous it may be. If, on the contrary, facts do clearly indicate that such a wrong has been committed—then let that be openly atoned for by a frank admission of the actual facts and let steps be taken for correction of those who have committed that crime with a view to make its recurrence through them and others impossible.

It is in this way, and in this way alone, that a lasting disgrace (of any) upon the Government may be successfully prevented. I am sure an honest Government would have no hesitation to accept it.

Let us by making this just, open and impartial inquiry uphold the majesty of justice and there is no doubt that, as soon as that is done, all sympathy alienated and all confidence lost will come back to the Government in an inconceivably larger volume; and such a course of conduct will at once be a source of legitimate pride and enormous strength to the Government—ensuring a state of things which alone can and ought to be its goal.

I therefore move this resolution and I need hardly say that I legitimately expect every son of our motherland to support the resolution. I also fervently hope that any hon'ble member of this House who has kept an open mind and has an honest desire to know the real truth—to whatever nationality he may belong—will not hesitate for a moment in the name of justice to support this motion.

Mr. TARIT BHUSAN ROY: "This Council recommends to the Government that a fully representative committee of official and non-official members, not exceeding nine in number, and at least three of whom should be members of the local Legislative Council, be forthwith appointed by Government to inquire into the alleged oppression of, and violence to, the coolies at Chandpur in the month of May last

by military police, the circumstances under which the services of the said military police were requisitioned, and the causes which led to the grave situation in the Chittagong Division."

I may at once tell this House that I have proceeded to press this resolution not with the object of raking up old sores or for resuscitating the embers of a dying controversy. I have a far different object in view. It is because I feel, and honestly feel the necessity, the urgent necessity of restoring public confidence in the justice of the Bengal Government, that I have ventured to press my demand for the fullest inquiry. I am one of those who believes in the reforms and I can assure this House, if any assurance is at all needed, that no movement political or otherwise which is calculated to disorganise and paralyse trade and communications and lead to endless and needless suffering to the public can have the support of those who have the welfare of the people at heart. I do not make any secret of the fact that I have no faith in hypocrisy in public life. I believe in the efficacy of truth and justice as constituting the strongest bulwark of British Rule in India. While condemning incitement to violence and the dissemination of calculated falsehood by designing and unscrupulous busybodies for fomenting disturbances and troubles, I quite honestly feel that it is equally our duty to unite in a just and reasonable demand for the ascertainment and propagation of truth. The need for adopting such a course is never more pressing than on an occasion like this, when the public feeling has been stirred to its depth by the alleged outrages by military police at Chandpur. While criticism of Government, which is the outcome of malice or hatred should be deprecated by all thinking men, I venture to hope that Government will welcome well-meant legitimate criticism which aims at the pursuit of truth and the restoration of public confidence and tranquillity. The greatest genius who has shed lustre on the literature of England has said there is no sure foundation for an empire set on blood.

It is no use trying to soothe ourselves into the complacent belief that the alleged outrages perpetrated by the military police at Chandpur have faded from the memory of the people of Bengal. No one can pretend to ignore the fact that the people, and the masses in particular, are still smarting under a sense that a grave and unprovoked outrage has been committed upon the innocent and inoffensive coolies in the grip of hunger, destitution and disease. There cannot be any mistake about the fact that a deep-rooted feeling has been created in the minds of the people of many parts of Eastern Bengal that they are not safe from the attacks of military police who may be let loose upon them at any moment by an overzealous and panic-stricken local Executive on the slightest pretext or provocation. Has this feeling of insecurity and sullen resentment been dissipated by the publication of the report of the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler? It would be the rankest hypocrisy not to assert that the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler's report, which

obviously bears upon it the impress of haste, has failed to reassure the public mind in Eastern Bengal and to restore public confidence. I shall be about the last person to impute any motives to the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler. I shall refuse to entertain the charge of partiality against him. Let us hope that the insinuation that the Hon'ble Member was prompted by a desire to pervert the truth for shielding the local civilian entourage or that he countenanced or encouraged in any manner the employment of the military police in the eviction of the coolies is quite unjust and uncharitable. I believe I am echoing the public feeling when I say that the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler's report is not comprehensive and exhaustive. While fully appreciating the fact that he was animated by a genuine desire not to hide but to elicit the truth regarding the Chandpur atrocities, it is our painful duty to give expression to the view that the report is lacking in important details and it is believed, and rightly I think, that it does not fully represent that what actually transpired. I will give some instances.

It is admitted that there were about 1,500 coolies at Chandpur when the Bengal Government intervened and set its face against the policy of repatriating them at Government expense. The initial action of the local officials at the instance of Mr. K. C. De in repatriating some coolies prior to the 17th of May has at the same time been ratified and justly ratified evidently on the ground of humanity and in the interest of public health. We are not told whether in reversing the policy of repatriation at public expense the local Government at all consulted the interests of public health leaving alone the ground of humanity.

The Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler has told us quite frankly in his report that at a conference of local residents called by Mr. K. C. De on the 19th May last, it was decided that the coolies should be located on the football ground and that arrangements were put in hand to erect shelters, summon medical assistance and make sanitary arrangements—the Indian Tea Association having offered Rs. 2,000 for the erection of sheds. We have, however, no means of knowing whether any such arrangements were at all made or taken in hand before the military police were let loose at dead of night with the lights put out upon the coolies in the station yard. Our information is that neither Mr. K. C. De nor his subordinates had done anything at all in these directions.

We have it from the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler himself that at 11 P.M. on the 19th of May, the Hon'ble Mr. Sinha made at once for the steamer ghât accompanied by three other European gentlemen, one of them being Mr. Macpherson, the representative of the Tea Association. We are not told who the two others were. At any rate it is clear that this overzealous Tea representative kept company with the Hon'ble Mr. Sinha forgetting that he was not a member of the Executive Service. He was hustled by the coolies on the flat. If this was so he was himself to blame for meddling in a matter in which he ought not to have been permitted to interfere. In a *communiqué*, dated the

26th of May, the Government of Bengal had openly pledged themselves to a policy of neutrality in the dispute between the planters and the coolies. How was it then that the Hon'ble Mr. Sinha, the local sub-divisional officer, came to allow Mr. Macpherson, a private person and not an official in any sense of the term, to meddle with the coolies? The public impression is that Mr. Macpherson who had arrived "for investigating the situation"—I am quoting from the report—shewed an excess of zeal in the matter which it was certainly the duty of the local officers on the spot to repress and not to foster.

We have it also from the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler himself, that Mr. K. C. De had wired for assistance as soon as he found that the police on the spot was insufficient. Why is it that we are not told whether any, and if so what, attempts were made by him to summon reinforcements from his Divisional Police force?

Everyone knows the provisions of the Criminal Procedure Code in Chapter IX dealing with the powers of the Magistrate for dispersing an unlawful assembly. It is somewhat curious that none of these coolies who had been dispersed at dead of night, under cover of darkness by the employment of military police, appears to have been arrested or placed on trial. We have been told and told seriously, that Mr. De had decided, as soon as he heard during the day that reinforcements were being sent, to clear the station on their arrival. He could not do so during the day for want of men. He did so at night having realised the urgent necessity for it on sanitary grounds. We have no means of knowing at present whether Mr. K. C. De or any of his lieutenants, who had participated in, or been present in, this midnight raid, had, at any time or at all, during the whole of the fateful day on the 20th May last, taken any steps to convey to the poor coolies the message or the mandate that military police had been wired for and that they would on their arrival in the evening be set upon them and would use force unless they quietly and peacefully withdrew to the football ground near by. It is a well-known fact that action, under section 130 of the Criminal Procedure Code, is taken as a last resort in extreme and emergent cases where the assembly remains defiant after all the resources of the authorities to effect a peaceful dispersal have been exhausted.

No explanation has been offered regarding the culpable indifference of the local officials to ascertain the nature and extent of the injuries which the coolies had sustained as a consequence of the assault or to attend to these injuries at any time after they had been moved out by the military police during the night of the 20th of May last. This was done the next morning and not immediately after the occurrence. The country has the right to know upon whom does the responsibility for this gross and culpable dereliction of public duty rest.

It is not my purpose to go into the causes of the strikes and *hartals* which followed the tragedy of the 20th of May. The Hon'ble Sir Henry

Wheeler has himself said that the *hartal* was declared in protest against the events of the night of the 20th May and that the strikes were sympathetic.

Any careful student of the report will perhaps not fail to observe one remarkable feature in it. The Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler has taken particular care in giving prominence more to the statements made to him by witnesses than to his own independent opinions.

I do not wish to tire the patience of the House by referring to such other details on which no light has at all been thrown. All that I do say at present is this. The report of the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler is incomplete and is evidently based upon the uncross-examined testimony of witnesses. In justice alike to the local officials who have been made the target of criticism and condemnation and the Government, it is eminently desirable that the evil which now hangs over the unfortunate Chandpur episode should be lifted. Many unofficial statements, specially those made by the Bishop of Assam and Mr. Andrews, have seen the light of day. My demand for an inquiry is not belated. Everyone knows how long after was the inquiry in the Punjab started.

I venture to hope that the Government will not resist the demand for an inquiry by a representative committee even at this stage. The Government will have everything to gain and nothing to lose by an inquiry which, I feel sure, will not be burked. Let the impression go forth that the Government is no respecter of persons and that it is firm in its determination to mete out even-handed justice to all and to elicit the whole truth.

Much will depend upon the personnel of the committee which I have left to the Government to determine for obvious reasons. If my resolution is accepted, I am certain the Government will appoint such a committee which will be thoroughly representative in the true sense of the term and will inspire public confidence. It will, I think, be better if unprejudiced minds, free from the influence of locality or environment, are called upon to serve on such a committee.

Mr. F. A. LARMOUR: May I, before the mover moves the next resolution, ask for an explanation on the question as to what he means by "to devise means for effectively preventing any such outrage in future." Does he mean by "outrage" the conduct of the non-co-operating agitators before the coolies left the station? What *does* he mean by the word "outrage"?

The PRESIDENT: I cannot listen to you before he moves the resolution.

Mr. F. A. LARMOUR: But I find the motion is not clear on this point.

The PRESIDENT: The resolution has been admitted in this form.

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: "This Council recommends to the Government that a mixed committee, consisting of officials and non-officials, with a majority of non-officials, to be nominated by the Council, be appointed at an early date—

(*i*) to inquire into and report on the circumstances leading to, and immediately following, the employment of Gurkha soldiers upon the coolies at Chandpur;

(*ii*) to advise as to how the officers responsible for the said occurrence should be dealt with; and

(*iii*) to devise means for effectively preventing any such outrage in future.

The number of resolutions tabled this afternoon unmistakably show that the country has been stirred to its utmost depths by the incidents at Chandpur. I need not, in dealing with the subject, enter into the causes of the exodus of coolies from Assam. It might be due to economic causes, or, as alleged, to the machinations of designing people. If the latter, I have no language to denounce in measured terms the conduct of such mischievous and unscrupulous people in leading astray ignorant and gullible coolies from the secure anchorage of settled life to one of uncertainty and misery, which was a blunder worse than crime. If, on the other hand, it was the outcome of economic causes it was but the exercise of the individual liberty of the labourers against capitalism, to which no fair-minded man can object.

Turning to Chandpur, we find that the influx of coolies there began as early as 9th May, and with commendable zeal and promptitude the officials on the spot arranged for their repatriation, batch by batch, till the 17th when the smooth current of affairs was turned into a muddle by the unhappy intervention of the Provincial Government, which issued its fiat from the heights of Olympus—"thus far and no further." The concession was stopped, the hands of the local Executive were fettered, and sympathy and helpfulness were replaced by a heartless neutrality. The consequence was that stranded and destitute coolies increased in number, cholera and other infectious diseases broke out, and carried off a large number, and public health was menaced. In this connection, I should like to acknowledge our debt of gratitude to the services rendered by the department of public health, barring individual distemper, under the guidance of the popular Minister, as well as the splendid humanitarian work by the local people, the Marwari Samiti and the relief workers, not to speak of the yeoman services of the glorious band of volunteers and the Bishop of Assam—both medical and non-medical.

I have alluded to the policy of heartless neutrality. It is sad to reflect that this policy was followed by a heart-rending sequel, namely, the tragedy of Chandpur. The surging mass of coolies,

naturally anxious to return home, rushed to the railway station, to the ghât, and to the pontoon. Those who have seen the crowds on the occasion of the *Rath Jatra* or other festive occasions may remember the sight of the rush and tumult of innocent multitudes, breaking all barriers in their struggle to catch the train or the steamer, as the case may be. It is therefore a natural struggle to which people are accustomed. And to put down this struggling mass of humanity, our countrymen,—I deeply regret to say—Mr K. C. De, proud of the uniform of power and official authority, imported a band of unruly Gurkha military police and let them loose almost at the dead of night on sleeping, inoffensive, unresisting and unarmed men, women and children, without any provocation whatsoever. Could not the ordinary police be reinforced to keep the coolies within the proper bounds of discipline and order? Was it not inhuman and indiscreet to turn out the coolies at dead of night into an open, shelterless, and waterlogged playground—men, women, and children, screaming and crying in helplessness and despair? I am sure that the true Englishman, the enemy of slavery, the lover of freedom, and the protector of the weak and the oppressed, will be as much exasperated at the exhibition of this cruelty The Lord Bishop, who represents the Christian conscience of the British race, has declared that no necessity existed for the employment of extraordinary force at Chandpur, and that it was a confession of moral and spiritual impotence; and that it betokened an attitude of mind, which believes in force as an essential and efficient instrument for the accomplishment of the highest purposes of Government He concluded by saying that the Government failed in showing the Christian virtue of compassion. Such is the verdict of a true Englishman -aye, a Minister of the Church

As regards the alleged outrages, it is authoritatively stated that there have been about 100 victims to Gurkha excesses altogether, of whom about 50 were serious cases. That the Gurkhas began their assault like wild beasts is apparent from the admission of Mr De himself, who said that he had to pull off a Gurkha while inflicting excessive force. Captain Shepherd, in charge of the Gurkhas, spoke of seeing himself one or two severe blows and of ordering them to desist. This is official admission, and one can imagine what actually happened. Even Sir Henry Wheeler's report gives three cases of serious injury—to a girl, to a woman, and to a man I deeply regret the unsympathetic tone the report betrays and the light-hearted spirit in which some of the most serious injuries have been sought to be belittled. Sir Henry Wheeler is the right-hand man of His Excellency the Governor, and in this time of excitement and unrest he could not have rendered a greater disservice to the cause of reform and mutual good understanding between the rulers and the ruled. His Excellency himself might have thrown oil over troubled waters by words of compassion and sympathy towards those pitiable wretches,

who suffered at the hands of the Gurkhas. I regret that, in his zeal to uphold the official prestige and position, His Excellency—and I speak with the utmost respect of him—should have missed a golden opportunity when the deputation waited upon him. I have been and I am, a staunch advocate of law and order. I am no non-co-operator. I denounce the strikes though they occurred after the Gurkha outrage. These strikes brought untold miseries upon the coolies and the general public, and for this those who engineered them fully deserve the denunciation of the public. It cannot be denied that there is sullen discontent in the country, and that both the Government and the people should combine to remove the discontent by mutual co-operation and mutual trust. Lord Reading has said that the Government is anxious to ascertain the causes of discontent among the people. The root cause lies in the want of compassion, want of sympathy and tenderness as is illustrated in this dismal chapter of political history created at Chandpur.

With your permission, Sir, I wish to say one word with reference to what has fallen from Mr. Larmour. I believe he said ——

The PRESIDENT: Well, the words are there and members will judge for themselves.

Babu JATINDRA NATH BASU: "This Council recommends to the Government that such action be taken as regards the conduct of the local officials in the matter of the ejectment of the coolies and their families from the station at Chandpur on the 20th May, 1921, as will prevent the recurrence of similar incidents."

The resolution that stands in my name differs from the resolutions that have already been moved in that my resolution does not ask for an inquiry. I desire to submit to the House that the facts as they have already come out in the inquiries that have been made are so clear that they may be taken by Government as the basis of action without any further inquiry.

The main facts of the incident that took place on the 20th May are clear. A further enquiry may bring out details which can hardly be of any assistance in eliciting any further information as regards the broad features of the incident. What is it that has caused all this turmoil in the country and has made Chandpur a centre of disturbance? What happened for a few minutes only on the night of the 20th May in the railway station at Chandpur and the events that preceded the exodus of the coolies have been related by the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler in the *communiqué*. They are these: The coolies were arriving from Sylhet and Cachar at the railway station at Chandpur. They were being sent away to their homes, when difficulties were raised in the way of their leaving Chandpur. Consequently they began to accumulate at Chandpur. The local officials evidently felt that a difficulty had been created. On the 19th, the Commissioner of the Division sent for the leading men of the town with a view to organise means

for finding accommodation for the men who were accumulating there in large numbers. All were agreed—the local men, the local railway authorities as well as Government officials—that they should be housed somewhere; the football ground was decided upon, and the Indian Tea Association offered a generous contribution of Rs 2,000 and there were local subscriptions also, and it was intended to erect sheds to house these people. This was the scheme that was thought of on the 19th.

On the evening of the 19th, an incident happened. The coolies began to move in large crowds and rushed to the flats and steamers to seek a passage. We often find in big junction stations large crowds rushing to find accommodation in trains. It was not unusual that in their impatience to get away to their homes they should rush to the steamer. It is an ordinary incident of passenger traffic in this country. It so happened that one of the local officials who were on the flat attached to the steamer was roughly handled, or there was an attempt to handle him roughly. Then the events smoothed down. There was nothing further that night. That was in fact the only outrage against the coolies that was brought out. It is not shown what else actually happened or what else they were guilty of. The whole of the 20th was quiet. The Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler says that the townspeople gathered at the station and on the overbridge. It is not shown in the *communiqué* whether they incited the coolies to any violence or if any excesses were committed. Everything evidently remained quiet until about a quarter past eleven at night when Mr De with the military police and officials came. It is not shown that Mr De had sent for some of the local leaders or local people during the course of the day on the 20th and had told them that he desired that the coolies should be moved from the station immediately even though the accommodation that had been decided upon for them had not been put up. It is not shown on the face of the *communiqué* or on any other information that has so far been published that any communication was made to any of the coolies or to the local leaders. The attempt comes suddenly and at night when nobody expected it. So far as the coolies themselves were concerned the facts are that a very large proportion of them, as the Bishop of Assam says, were women, children and sick persons, and those that were adult men were half-starved and emaciated. Then the squad of military police came and the coolies were asked to move out. It is said in the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler's *communiqué* that these people held up their hands and said *Gandhi Maharaj ki jai*, and then the policemen began to strike the bundles and things of the coolies. It reminds one of a village dramatic party indulging in a mimic warfare. When that had no effect the policemen took up the firewood, and sticks that the coolies had, and began to beat the coolies.

We can easily imagine what sort of situation it was, when we know that the entire body of 2,000 persons was cleared out in 5 to 10

minutes, and also when we remember the fact that amongst them there were women, children and sick and infirm persons. The Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler has said in the *communiqué* that no extra force was used and only the necessary amount of force. These are the facts on which I base my resolution. If these are the facts that happened, a reasonable man can only come to the conclusion that things were done in a manner which is not in consonance with the spirit of our Government. It was done in a manner which was not creditable either to the Government or to the people. In Bengal, during troublous times, we have had the satisfaction that our Government acted in a way which was different from what Governments in remote parts of India did. Our Government had maintained humane principles in the conduct of public affairs, and their officers have carried out their duties with humanity and justice. But, having regard to the way in which these unarmed and unoffending coolies—a few only amongst whom were on the face of the *communique*, guilty merely of shouting *Gandhi Maharaj ki jai* were treated, it appears that a new chapter is opening in the history of the Bengal Government. I feel that it is the duty of this Council to say straight and plainly that we will have none of this so far as we are concerned. I say, therefore, that the officers who were responsible for the incident must be dealt with by the Government in a suitable manner and in such manner that any repetition of similar incidents should be impossible in Bengal—the premier province in India. It is indeed a slur alike on the intelligence and on the high reputation for sympathy which this Government has. With these words, I commend this resolution to the acceptance of this House.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: "This Council recommends to the Government, that a committee, consisting of seven members, five of whom shall be non-officials three members of the Council and two from the outside public—elected by the non-official members of the Council, be appointed to inquire into, and report, at an early date, about the circumstances in connection with the recent tea garden coolie situation at Chandpur, with special reference to the following:—

(*a*) the attitude of the Government towards repatriation and their alleged interference with the Steamer Company in connection with the conveyance of coolies;

(*b*) the events that happened at Chandpur on the 19th, 20th and 21st May, 1921, in this connection; and

(*c*) the circumstances in connection with the strikes in the Assam-Bengal Railway and the India General Navigation and Rivers Steam Navigation Companies (steamer service)."

As this matter refers to my own district, I hope this Council will kindly bear with me, if I cannot move this resolution in the same dispassionate and disinterested manner, in which it has been moved by my predecessors.

I move this resolution more in sorrow than in anger. My own district of Tippera has been humiliated to the dust, the most ordinary dictates of humanity have been violated, public feeling has been deeply wounded, and I stand before this great tribunal of the representatives of Bengal to demand truth, sympathy and justice. Some derelicts of humanity, the tea garden coolies from Assam, in the last stages of destitution and misery had taken shelter in the small subdivisional town of Chandpur in my own constituency; while it was the first instinct of humanity to give them proper protection and help them on, when even the local Government officials felt this simple call of the heart, the dictum was flashed forth from the top of the hills or from Calcutta, that Government was not to help towards the cost of repatriation of these poor people. The allegation has been freely made that not only did the Government not stop there, but they are reported to have advised the Steamship Company not to grant concession rates. With regard to this allegation, the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler says in his *communique* "I explained that the Government had never interfered and had no power to interfere and had no wish to interfere, that there had been some misunderstanding of a letter from the agents by the local steamer staff." As I said the other day, mistakes and misunderstandings are very vague terms. But we are left as much in the dark as ever. When the misunderstanding arose out of a letter, surely there was a letter and that letter must have been written after instructions from Government or any of its responsible officials. We want to know what that letter was, and what those instructions were, so that there may not be any ground for misunderstanding here, in this Council, at any rate.

A responsible gentleman and a great lover of truth the Rev. C. F. Andrews—has publicly stated that the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler had told him that he did not prohibit concession rates but only objected to free passages. This statement has not yet been denied. May I ask, was it any business of his or of any other Government member or official to say that the Steamer Company was not to grant free passages?

MEMBER in charge of POLITICAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): May I rise to offer an explanation which might avoid further misunderstanding? My statement was that free passages could not be given at the cost of Government. There was never any instruction communicated to the Steamer Company at any time as to concession rates or otherwise as between them and private parties.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: I am glad to hear this. Many other allegations have been made in the Press which have not been fully met. But as far as I have been able to read the situation, the whole trouble arose from the stoppage of the repatriation of the coolies after the 17th May, 1921. Up to that day, things were going on

smoothly. There was no trouble, no hint of any trouble. According to the statement of the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler, Mr. Macpherson of the Indian Tea Association arrived at Chandpur on the 17th May, and, according to the same statement, since the 17th, no coolies have been despatched from Chandpur at Government expense. Sir, I do not know whether these two events have any connection whatever, but the Rev. C. F. Andrews has publicly charged the Government for having taken the side of "the vested interests." I have carefully gone through the eighteen voluminous paragraphs of the Hon'ble Member's statement, but I do not find any categorical denial, except a general statement of the neutral attitude of the Government in industrial strikes, of this grave charge. If there is no vestige of truth in it, the Government ought to deny it categorically. We are anxious to know if Mr. Macpherson or any one else, either independently or on behalf of any tea garden or tea association approached any Government official not to help the coolies in repatriation and whether the attitude of the Government depended on any suggestion or request from any vested interest. Then again, we find that 450 coolies were sent away from Chandpur at Government expense on the 16th instant. We find it stated that Government received information of this only on the 17th and asked the Commissioner not to send any more coolies at Government expense. Sir, are we to understand that the local officials did not inform the Local Government on the 16th by telegram that they were sending coolies at Government expense? If Government knew of this on the 16th, then why did they permit the repatriation on the 17th at Government expense? If they permitted repatriation on 17th, why did their attitude change after the 17th? Things are shrouded in mystery and questions arise in the minds of all thinking men—questions which demand an answer. Then again, we find that Government does not hesitate to repatriate those fortunate coolies, who had reached such distant places as Naihati and Asansol on grounds of public health, but as soon as the case of the Chandpur coolies is brought forward, the Government says that it is bound to make a differentiation. Why is this differentiation made? Was not the continued presence of the coolies at Chandpur a source of grave danger to the public health at Chandpur? I myself spent three days there, before the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler went. I visited the coolie-camp. I saw the insanitary condition in which they had to be herded in corrugated tin godowns like sardines in a tin box. The sight beggared all description. I saw the Bishop of Assam, I saw Mr. and Mrs. Goring and I saw the selfless volunteers, risking their lives among the coolies. Anybody who had been only a couple of minutes in that camp—a veritable deathtrap—would have realised the immediate necessity of sending the coolies away and relieving the congestion. The presence of the coolies there was a source of grave danger to the public health. The local officials and even Dr. Batra

agreed with me that the danger was great. The Government has been congratulating itself that excellent medical and sanitary arrangements were made, but, may I ask, Sir, which is the most urgent medical arrangement? Prevention of disease or treatment of disease? If disease could be prevented, as it certainly could have been done by removing the coolies from Chandpur, was it not the first duty of the Minister in charge of Public Health to insist on prevention of disease by removing congestion? If you allow a large number of people to stay in conditions where they are bound to be infected, it is small consolation to say that arrangements had been made to treat them when they got the disease. As long as I was at Chandpur, I was taunted with this remark, "you speak of representative Government: you talk of your own representatives in charge of public health and in important posts of Government, where is your representative now? Is Darjeeling so far away from Chandpur, or does not the wail of the coolies reach the cool heights of the Himalayas, or is the atmosphere of Darjeeling still anti-reform?" What answer could I give? I looked at the dying and the suffering coolies and hung down my head in shame. Sir, we have come to co-operate with the Government. I ask the Government not to make it difficult or impossible for us to co-operate.

The position at Chandpur being so serious, on what grounds could Government differentiate between Chandpur and Narhati? It cannot be on the ground of expense, because, if I am not much mistaken, the expense of medical and sanitary arrangements and the cost of sending long official telegrams must have been considerable and would probably have been sufficient to pay for the passage of most of the coolies. If it is not on the score of expense, what can be the real cause? Is it because Chandpur is nearer to the tea gardens and it would have been easier to send these helpless coolies back to their gardens, or is it because the public opinion of Chandpur can be more easily flouted than that of Narhati, or is it because of some other subtle reason?

These and other pertinent questions have naturally arisen in our minds and we are still groping in the dark. These and some other very important questions—a series of 22 questions were sent by me for reply in this Council, but to my great sorrow and disappointment, the questions were rejected on the ground of their excessive length. Of course, the questions were numerous, they had to be numerous, because the Government *communiqués* had been very unsatisfactory, and the Chandpur affairs had been serious enough to demand elucidation. Even after my first rebuff, I was audacious enough to put some supplementary questions, but here again I was stopped on the ground that the Hon'ble Member was not to be cross-examined. I do not want to cross-examine anybody. I have studied the method adopted in the British Parliament and tried to follow the same procedure in order to elucidate the truth. Had all my questions been allowed to be

answered, there would have been no need of asking for a committee of inquiry. Only the other day, His Excellency the Governor was pleased to say that truth and dissemination of truth were, the most urgent matters needed for the country to-day. Sir, I welcome the suggestion and, therefore, I demand an inquiry committee to find out the truth. Truth must be first known, before it can be disseminated. I am not afraid of the truth, and I sincerely trust that nobody, not even the Government will shrink from the truth.

From the question of inquiring into the attitude of the Government we now come to the serious events that happened at Chandpur on the 19th and 20th. When I think that there were women and children among the people who were attacked on that memorable night, that wounds had been inflicted on the bodies of helpless women and children, I confess my heart bleeds and is too full of pain and humiliation to enable me to give vent to my feeling of righteous indignation. The Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler has dealt with the matter in some detail, but he has missed so many important points, points that cannot be lightly dismissed, that it is a wonder, he went to Chandpur at all, merely to give us a colourless report which might have been written from the calm atmosphere of Darjeeling. His report, instead of satisfying us, has raised many and various important issues, which must be answered. As for example, we want to know why the coolies, who had been so quiet before, all at once became "excited and noisy" and why they were frightened that they would be sent back to their gardens against their wish? We want to know what business brought Mr Macpherson from out of his bed at midnight into the receiving flat at Chandpur on the 19th May; we want to know, if he was called by any of the officials to go there. We want to know how it was possible to send back the coolies from the receiving flat with the help of the ordinary and armed Police of Chandpur and without the help of the Gurkhas on the night of the 19th. We want to know how it can be stated by Sir Henry Wheeler that the coolies could not be removed from the station yard during the daytime of the 20th for want of sufficient men? We want to know, what was the number of ordinary and armed Police at Chandpur on the 20th to find out why they could not remove the coolies during the daytime? Sir, I have seen the labourers of England, and I can assure you that if anybody had dared to deal with them in the way it was done at Chandpur, a whole army of military Police might have been ousted. Three thousand English labourers would have known how to deal with Military Police, trying to drive them at night in the way it was done here. But here, there were helpless human beings, many of whom, probably most, being women and children, almost in the last stages of destitution and misery, who were so cruelly driven out. The Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler said that there is evidence that the coolies were not sleeping. We want to know on whose evidence such

a statement could be made, whether the person giving the evidence had made certain that nobody was sleeping. We want to know whether the Government had conclusive medical proof, in order to declare that no bayonets might have been used. I do not like to tire the patience of the House, by going into all the questions that demand an authoritative answer.

My friend, Mr. S. N. Mullick, has detailed the questions

The Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler has kept strangely silent about them. We did not want to hear from him whether it required a tall man to hit a cooly on the head (who perchance was sitting or sleeping.) We did not want to hear a detailed description of Dr. Batra's doings. He does not belong to the department of the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler. Why did Sir Henry Wheeler go out of his way to defend him—what was the Hon'ble Minister doing?

It has been said that an inquiry will be useless now, as the coolies have all gone back to their homes. But I believe that the addresses of many of the wounded coolies have been kept at Chandpur. Moreover, there is a body of valuable and important evidence at Chandpur and elsewhere, which will be easily available and will certainly justify the appointment of the committee

Last of all, there are the Railway and the steamer strikes, causing a great deal of inconvenience to the people of East Bengal. Sir, to-day is the 46th day of the Railway strike. What has been done to alleviate the sufferings of the people? If I am not much mistaken, the Railway Company has part of its dividend guaranteed by Government, was it not the duty of Government to find out the causes of the strike and bring about a compromise? Only the other day, Messrs. Martin and Company's strike could be compromised by the appointment of a conciliation committee. It seems that the public opinion of Calcutta is too strong, but Eastern Bengal may suffer all along without the Government moving a finger in the matter In answer to a question of mine, the Hon'ble Mr Kerr was pleased to say that these strikes were caused by persons with deliberate motives and that these were not economic strikes, and Government could not intervene. When I put in a supplementary question as to whether Government had held any particular inquiry as to the causes of the strike, he said that no particular inquiry had been held. When I asked if the strikers had declared that the strike was not an economic one, he replied that no such declaration had been made. Then how can he say definitely what are the causes of the strike? In view of the great divergence of opinion about the causes of the strike, it is imperative that a committee of inquiry should be held.

The prestige of the Government demands that such an inquiry should be held, so that the truth and the whole truth may be found out. Then, there will be time enough to demand something more than a mere inquiry.

Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA: "This Council recommends to the Government that a committee of non-official Europeans and Indians be immediately appointed to inquire into, and report on, the alleged serious sufferings and grievances of the Assam coolies at Chandpur and Goalundo."

The resolution that stands in my name is practically the same as those of Babu Surendra Nath Mullick, Babu Tarit Bhusan Roy, Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur, Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri, and Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta. Some of them have already quoted chapter and verse in support of their resolutions. When it is seen that so many of the members of this Council honestly believe there is a strong case for a public inquiry it ought to be the bounden duty of the Government to accede to their requests. It is said that the incident of the 20th May at Chandpur is a cowardly outrage committed at the instance of the local officials by the Gurkhas on an unfortunate class of people who, deprived of food and shelter and other necessities of life, were there more dead than living; a class of people which included women, children and the infirm; a class of people many of whom were reduced to mere skeletons; a class of people many of whom were in the grip of death by starvation and disease—an outrage alleged to have been committed at dead of night with all lights put out, without sufficient notice or sufficient warning—an outrage alleged to have been committed in the immediate presence of the Divisional Commissioner, the District Magistrate and the Subdivisional Officer, all belonging to the heaven-born service which goes by the name of the Indian Civil Service and amongst whom were included, I am sorry to say, Indians of high rank, status and culture. The accounts which have been published in the papers and of which there has been so far no contradiction in most important particulars are such as would make the dead rise up in their graves. The facts that have not been challenged or contradicted are:—

1. Peremptory orders of the executive of Chandpur to the coolies to vacate the railway precincts at midnight.
2. The coolies included women, children and the infirm (more women than men).
3. Absolute darkness owing to the sudden failure of light.
4. A general assault on the coolies (which has been given out by the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler as nothing but a scuffle) in which no military police or any one in the Government employ was seriously injured but several coolies had signs of such injuries on their person.
5. No retaliation on the part of the coolies.

Our people have a right to know whether the officials can produce individuals who were attacked by these helpless people and seriously injured? But I am informed there are lots who will prove the reverse.

It is for this reason that we demand, with all the emphasis that we can command, the formation of a committee of representatives of rival interests which will make a sifting inquiry into the affair and, if adequately proved, apportion guilt to particular individuals for condign punishment. There are still some, in fact many, who have got faith in British justice and we, the Councillors of the Legislative Council, have practically demonstrated that we are in that category. But let us not be finally disillusioned about it. If the Government honestly mean to stand for the oppressed, if the Government really want their people to depend on their sincerity and good wishes, if the Government values justice more than prestige, it is their duty to make a public inquiry by persons who are in the confidence of both the Government and the people for their uprightness and honesty, love of justice and fair play. One word more. I find some divergence of opinion about the inclusion of official members in the committee proposed and the resolution that stands in my name wants only non-official members in the committee as it is my firm conviction that to include officials will put those officials themselves into an awkward and unenviable position as they will be between Scylla and Charybdis although they may discharge their duties with the utmost fairness and justice. But if the members find it necessary to include officials in the committee to give it a thoroughly representative character, I will certainly abide by their decision.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: "This Council recommends to the Government that a committee consisting of officials and non-officials, be appointed for a full inquiry into, after examination of necessary witnesses, and report upon, as early as possible, the circumstances in connection with the alleged attack by the Gurkhas on the coolies at Chandpur on the night of the 20th May last, and the subsequent treatment accorded by the officials to the coolies assembled at Chandpur, with further instructions, to ascertain the responsibility for the incidents, and to recommend the steps (if any) to be taken for punishing the offenders, and for dealing with the question of granting facilities for the repatriation of the coolies."

I am not going to read any complaint in detail about the whole question as to why we demanded an inquiry. The movers of the previous resolutions have said much on the subject and it will be no good repeating the same argument. The most important thing, however to which I would draw attention is this:—On the 30th May, Mr Andrews brought very grave and serious charges against Government. I can do no better than read it in his own words:—

My indictment of the Bengal Government, in the name of humanity, is this, that they have oppressed the poor where pity was needed; they have employed violence, where tenderness was required, they have brought down their Gurkha soldiers, where human nature itself was calling aloud for sympathy and compassion, they have forfeited the good name of a humane Government. And what is an

added injury, when this brutal outrage has been committed, they have called in their Director of Public Information to justify it to the public through the columns of the daily press.

It is a very grave indictment and we were anxiously awaiting the reply to these grave charges. I confess, however, I carefully went into the Report of the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler but I was not satisfied with his explanation. When I first heard of the brutal assault committed upon the coolies at dead of night, whether sleeping or awake, I felt ashamed of the conduct of my countryman, Mr. K. C. De.

The PRESIDENT: I do not think you are entitled to make remarks like that.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: I do not wish to make any strong remarks. What I was going to say is this that I was however much relieved when I saw a copy of Mr. De's letter addressed to the Government published in the Press in which he requested the Government that something should be done for the coolies and his request ran as follows:

It is needless for me to urge that for the sake of humanity as well as to protect the residents of the places situated on the route of the emigrants from possible violence and outbreaks of epidemic diseases, the State should bear the cost of repatriation of the destitute emigrants.

I request that Government may be pleased to approve and confirm the District Magistrate's action. The actual expense incurred by him will be reported as soon as possible.

Mr. De instituted an inquiry as to the truth or otherwise of their helplessness and he deputed the District Magistrate to inquire into the circumstances and he was satisfied that they were really helpless and destitute and he tried at first to get public help through my friend, Mr. Indu Bhushan Dutta, with a fund which was subscribed by the public. That was soon exhausted and he, with the Magistrate and the Subdivisional Officer, tried to help the coolies and send them to Goalundo at Government expense. That portion of the work was ratified by Government as will be seen in the report of the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler. When that action was justified, I submit there was further justification to do something more. There then arose the point of difference as to the question of repatriation. As to the feeding of the coolies and their medical treatment there was no difference and Government was prepared to do that. As Sir Henry Wheeler said in his report it was the coolies who deserved sympathy from the public and any help from the public that could be raised would be spent for a very laudable object and to that Government had not the slightest objection. So we think the repatriation of the coolies by Government should also have been taken up when the other things were taken up. But that was not done. On the 17th, Mr. Macpherson arrived and from that day repatriation was stopped by the local authorities. On the 19th, Mr. De went

there and he saw the conditions for himself and thought that something should be done for the coolies for their accommodation and medical treatment and for preventing the spread of epidemic diseases in the town. On the 19th also, there was that unfortunate incident regarding the rush to the steamer. On the 20th, the coolies were told that they should not rush to the steamer and attempts were being made to help them and they were told that they should leave the place at once. And what was done? At dead of night those coolies were attacked by Gurkhas! If up to the 16th or 17th they could be helped in every possible way, how was it that a change came on the 19th and 20th? If it was the duty of Government to see that they were properly fed and properly treated, I think that something more should have been done for their repatriation too. I expected, Sir, that something would be contributed by the Ministers and the Executive Councillors and even by Government towards helping them in that way but that was not done. We remember that in the beginning of this year when the question of the pay of the Ministers was brought before the Council, we were assured in this Council Chamber that the Ministers would each spend Rs. 16,000 a year in deference to the wishes of the people.

The PRESIDENT: I do not think that any question arises about the Ministers' promise.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: I am only justifying my attack on the Ministers. I say that our accusation is not against the local officials only but against the Government as a whole. Government ought to have done something more but it did not do so. We heard from the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler that it was necessary that the coolies should be removed. But as they did not move, some force had to be used, but we see, Sir, that it is not the whole truth. Babu Akhil Chandra Dutta, in his letter to the Press, said that he had a talk with Mr. De and Mr. De had to admit to him that there was no opposition by the coolies either before or after the attack. Babu Akhil Chandra Dutta was present though not at the station but at the town. Mr. Andrews went there on the 21st. On the 26th the Government *communique* was issued and, on the 28th or 29th, the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler went to Chandpur. Though there was public agitation, our popular Ministers did not think it necessary to do anything though we expected much from them. We expected that they would personally go there to see things for themselves but that was not done. No contribution was made by them, though, from the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler's report it would be seen that the coolies were suffering very much. But nothing was done by our popular Ministers. On the other hand, there was a brutal assault upon the coolies and, as a consequence, there was *hartal* and strikes. I think that a public inquiry is needed. The report of the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler is not enough and therefore I think that an

inquiry should be held by members of the Council. Too much importance of official prestige is a growing evil in our administration. We were assured that in the Reform Government there would be a change and that O'Dyerism would be impossible in India. Of course here it was only O'Dyerism in miniature. Again our Ministers did not do anything—at least in the public mind there is a great doubt whether they did anything at all.

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: I rise to a point of explanation, Sir. I challenge this statement which has been made by the hon'ble member and which he has been repeating again and again, that the Ministers have done nothing. He ought to have known that as soon as I heard from the Chairman of the Chandpur Municipality that there was a chance of the outbreak of cholera, I sent out Rs. 6,000 and nine doctors to look after the coolies and yet my hon'ble friend says that we did nothing as if by repetition he could convert a falsehood into truth.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: Yes, I read in the papers that something like that was done, but my contention was that more ought to have been done and that a contribution of Rs. 5,000 for the repatriation of the coolies ought to have been made. I said in the beginning that something was done for the medical treatment of the coolies and I also said that something in the way of repatriation ought to have been done too. That was not done though I must say that it was done at the beginning at Government expense but it was not done afterwards. Mr. Andrews was anxious to get a contribution of Rs. 5,000 from Government and I said that our Ministers could at least have contributed Rs. 1,000 each but they did not do that.

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: My hon'ble friend has again come back to the charge that we have not paid anything and that we should have done so. How does he know that we did not do anything? I for myself contributed Rs. 1,000 from my private purse towards the help of the coolies.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: I did not know it. However, our complaint is that an inquiry should be made into the whole circumstances and if, as a result of that inquiry, any official is found to be at fault, he should be punished; if the local officials were guilty they should be punished. If there was any remissness on the part of the head of Government some notice ought to be taken of that. I say there are things which require some explanation and these explanations ought to be given. A committee would submit a report after a thorough inquiry and upon that report if anything is to be done, it should be done.

With these few words, I beg to move my resolution.

The PRESIDENT: I understand Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta does not wish to press his amendment.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: As I have moved my resolution I do not think it necessary to move my amendment to this resolution.

The following amendment was then, by leave of the President, withdrawn:—

"That for the words 'officials' and 'non-officials' the following be substituted, viz., 'two officials and five non-officials, the non-officials being elected by the non-official members of Council'."

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: Sir, there are seven resolutions on the Chandpur incident besides the two resolutions which stand in my name, viz., about the employment of the Gurkha troops and laying on the table of the House all papers in connection with the Chandpur incident. So many resolutions on one and the same subject clearly show what the feeling of the country is as regards the Chandpur incident. We all feel for these stranded coolies because they are poor, because they are helpless, because they are ignorant and, may be, because they are deluded. We feel for them because the opinion is almost unanimous that these poor and helpless men have not received proper treatment at the hands of Government. That is, I think, the unanimous opinion, at least the opinion of by far the majority of the people of this country. But I would ask my friends in this Council what useful purpose would be served by appointing a committee consisting even of a majority of non-official members of this Council. We have already two reports: one, a non-official report of non-official gentlemen who examined witnesses on the spot at the time of the incident and, the other, the official report of the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler. The duty of the Committee would, I dare say, be to examine witnesses. Who are the principal witnesses? They are the coolies, for the outside public were not in the Chandpur station on the night of the 20th when this incident is alleged to have taken place. The coolies have now almost all gone to their native country. It is useless to go and examine the witnesses who have already been examined by the non-official committee. We all know that the Gurkhas were let loose upon poor, unarmed, helpless people consisting of men, women and children at dead of night. We all know that the local officials of Chandpur wanted to remove these coolies in the football ground in the dead of night under the blue canopy of heaven. What, however, will the committee do? All that can be done now is to examine some of the officials. Every officer is not like General Dyer who will make a clean confession of his deeds and misdeeds. We have already heard from the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler the interpretation put upon the phrase "moral impression" by that high local official, the Commissioner of the Chittagong Division. We have already got the official version of the incident in the report of the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler. So we have got before

us the official and the non-official version of the incident. What other version is needed. The committee, if appointed, will submit their report to Government in due course and, from our experience of reports of these committees, we think that nothing useful will be done or will come out of it. We may condemn the action of the local officials and even of Government. The public have already formed their opinion about the Chandpur incident. You all know what it is. It is therefore that I cannot support the resolutions about the appointment of a committee because of the utter uselessness of these committees. What did we gain even by the Hunter Committee which inquired about the Jallianwalla Bagh atrocities? We all however want that something should be done. It is therefore that I support the resolution of my friend Babu Jatindra Nath Basu that the guilty might be punished and there may not be any recurrence of such incidents in future. I want to say here one thing. The resolutions passed at the meetings of the Council are generally treated as pious wishes by Government. This is the defect of the present system of Government. This can only be remedied by the conferring of full responsible Government to obtain which we should try our best. That is the only remedy.

The PRESIDENT: Before I proceed further, I think it necessary to mention a matter to the Council. When Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur was speaking I heard him make some reference to His Excellency, but I could not exactly catch his words. I therefore asked the official reporter to place before me a report of that part of his speech. I find there that what he said was this:

> His Excellency might have thrown oil over troubled waters by words of compassion and sympathy towards these pitiable wretches who suffered at the hands of the Gurkhas. I regret that though I say it with the greatest deference—in his zeal to uphold the official prestige and position His Excellency should have missed a golden opportunity.

I need hardly point out that it is not open to the Council in any way to reflect on the conduct of the Governor, and I am extremely sorry that the remarks passed unchallenged.

I would also like to say that these resolutions about the Chandpur incident ask for a committee of inquiry and I do not think it is proper for members to assume that they know all the facts and the whole truth and treat every other version as untrue. I do not think they are entitled to assume that what they believe is the truth and that the version supplied by the other side is not the true version. If this is carried to an extreme, I shall have to check such outbursts.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: May I inquire, Sir, whether it is your ruling that we cannot say what we consider to be true or otherwise?

The PRESIDENT: I have already ruled and you cannot question my ruling

Mr. D. C. GHOSE: I confess I cannot understand the aim and object of these resolutions asking for a committee of inquiry regarding the coolie trouble at Chandpur What is it that the Committee are expected to do? Is it to bring daylight upon what happened at Chandpur? Well, the broad facts regarding the trouble at Chandpur are well known and, so far as I know, there is no mystery about anything that happened there Nor is there a conflict of any importance between the official and the popular version of the facts regarding Chandpur. Besides the subject has been discussed and re-discussed in the Press and on the platform and everything that could be said either on the official or the popular side has been said And so far as I know, there is no demand on the part of any considerable section of the public for an investigation into what happened at Chandpur That being the case, do not see what object we shall gain by setting up a committee of inquiry now Sir, as I have said, the facts regarding the trouble at Chandpur are fairly well known, though there is a definite cleavage of opinion with regard to at least one incident at Chandpur Sir, the popular voice has unanimously condemned, and I venture to think, rightly condemned, the action of Government in employing Gurkha soldiers for the purpose of moving the coolies from the station compound at midnight on the 20th May Sir, I cannot find any justification for that proceeding It is admitted in the official *communiqué* that force was used by the Gurkha soldiers in moving the coolies from the station compound and injuries were caused to several of the coolies in the process of their removal Now, Sir, the exact nature of the injuries is, I am afraid, in dispute though Mr Andrews has stated that he did not see any hurt or wound caused by the use of bayonets However, Sir, I do think that the employment of Gurkha soldiers was most ill-advised The coolies were not violent and there was no ground for any apprehension that any disorder would break out Therefore the employment of soldiers and the use of force was wholly uncalled for Nor was there the least justification for choosing the hour of midnight for the purpose of moving the coolies from the station compound Why was not the removal of coolies done in daytime? Why were not methods of persuasion tried for the purpose of moving the coolies? I am almost certain that, if such methods had been employed, the coolies would have responded and moved away from the station compound Surely, it was worth while trying such methods before resorting to force at the hour of midnight. Sir, I know that I shall be told that it is easy enough to be wise after the event But I am afraid that is no answer to my accusation, for I maintain that in times of trouble and excitement, not only mischief-makers and sedition-mongers, but also over-zealous law and order officers of Government have to be curbed and

controlled. I venture to think that Government should acknowledge that the employment of Gurkha soldiers at midnight on the 20th May for the purpose of moving the coolies from the station compound was a grave error of judgment. Why should a great and powerful Government, such as ours, be afraid of admitting an error? What is the good, what is the use of being great and powerful if they are so afraid? Shame is not in the confession of a mistake. Shame lies only in persistency in wilful wrong-doing. But, Sir, a hundred times more heinous than the employment of Gurkha soldiers was the action of the local non-co-operators in fomenting *hartals* and strikes of railway and steamer employees and thus causing the death from cholera of many coolies and untold miseries to those that survived. I have no hesitation in saying that those who used the poor unfortunate coolies as pawns and tools in a political warfare, committed an outrage upon humanity, and I am glad that some of the best minds in the Nationalist party have publicly condemned the action of the non-co-operators at Chandpur. Sir, I am sure everyone in this House endorses that condemnation. Sir, the question regarding the trouble at Chandpur resolves itself into this. The facts, at any rate, the broad facts, are well known. There is no mystery about them. There is difference of opinion, so far as I can see, between the official side on the one hand and the popular side on the other regarding, firstly, the employment of Gurkha soldiers for moving the coolies from the station compound and, secondly, the question of repatriation of coolies at Government expense. Now, Sir, with regard to both these matters, the Government and the public have expressed their views, and nothing can be gained by an inquiry of the kind that has been suggested. But if this House is bent upon having an inquiry of some kind or other, then I would suggest for its consideration the idea of having a comprehensive inquiry into the whole of the coolie episode, beginning from the tea gardens down to the villages where the coolies have now gone. Let us find out why the coolies left the gardens. Did they leave of their own accord or owing to the ill-treatment of the planters, or did they leave at the instigation of non-co-operators? Then it is worth while finding out whether, in case the coolies had left the gardens at the instigation of the non-co-operators, the latter had made any arrangements for enabling the coolies to return to their homes. Further it is worth inquiring into the effect, the net result of the strike of railway and steamer employees. Also it would be useful to know exactly the fate of the coolies now in their villages. These are matters upon which definite information would be exceedingly useful, and if the Government would see their way to institute a comprehensive inquiry of the kind that I have indicated, they would render a great public service.

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: I wish to make one personal explanation after what has fallen from the President. It was not my intention—in fact it was farthest from my mind—to make any

reflection on His Excellency the Governor. What I stated was merely a matter of comment and expression of a wish and nothing else.

Mr. R. M. WATSON-SMYTH: On behalf of the Bengal Chamber of Commerce I must oppose this resolution

I first of all wish to say definitely that, in my opinion, and in the opinion of those whom I represent, the action taken by Government in refusing to repatriate these coolies at public expense was the correct action to take, and was, in fact, the only action which a responsible Government could have taken. Looking at the matter entirely on general grounds, I am of opinion that had Government acceded to the demand, it would have created an intolerable precedent. The idea that political agitators can persuade men to break their contracts, and having marched them down to the nearest railway station, that demand that Government will then convey them to their homes at public expense, is preposterous

It is no province of mine to enter into any discussion as to the rights or wrongs of what happened at Chandpur in the month of May last I oppose the appointment of a committee of inquiry on three grounds

The first ground is that there is nothing now to inquire about. To any intelligent reader the facts are fairly well known They may perhaps have been somewhat minimized on the one side, and they certainly were most distorted and camouflaged by falsehood and invention on the other side, but, as I said, the intelligent reader has by now got the facts, and whether he agrees or not with what was done, whether he thinks that the action of the officials was necessary or unnecessary, he knows practically exactly what did happen, and no committee of inquiry can tell him any more than that.

My second ground for opposing the resolution is that no committee now appointed can carry out their work satisfactorily. The men who could give first-hand information, viz., the coolies themselves, are scattered all over India, from the north to the south, and it would be impossible to get hold of them. There remains only the men who were on the spot to be examined, and you cannot very well call any of them independent witnesses Further than that the Government officials on the one side, and the representatives of non-co-operation on the other, have already issued their versions to the world, not once, but several times, and it is no good sending a committee to examine them As I understand it, the whole trouble turns on the orders to clear the railway enclosures of these coolies in the middle of the night, which orders were carried out by military police Whether these orders were necessary or not, whether the time chosen to carry out these orders was opportune or not, and whether the physical force employed by these police was more than necessary, is not a matter with which I propose to deal. But after all not very great harm was done: no life was lost: a few cuts and bruises were exhibited, which may or may not have been

caused in the struggle, but all that pales into insignificance when we think that all the friendly efforts of both Indians and Europeans to get these men away quietly to their homes, were stopped by the steamer companies' employees being called out on strike by political leaders, thereby directly causing the death of several hundred coolies by cholera and other disease.

The last reason on which I oppose this resolution is that a committee will not do any good: whatever has happened has happened, and we all have our own opinions regarding it. But no committee of inquiry can undo the past, nor is there anything fresh to be brought to light, as nothing has been hidden by Government, or by any one else. But such a committee may do a great deal of harm, and it certainly tends to keep this unfortunate incident prominently before the public, and to continue a controversy on which we are never likely to agree, and which in the heat of argument is likely to cause much ill-feeling and anarchy in Chittagong. I therefore propose to vote against this resolution, and I trust that it will not be pressed, and if it is pressed to a division, that it will be defeated.

Maulvi A. K. FAZL-UL-HAQ: I am not ashamed to confess that I feel somewhat diffident in rising to speak on this resolution. My friend Babu Surendra Nath Mullick, has made an earnest appeal to us to support his resolution for a committee of inquiry. An appeal like that coming from a patriotic heart is certainly very touching, but I would ask him to remember that there are in this House members who are not in a position to see eye to eye with him in this particular matter. So far as this request for a committee of inquiry is concerned, I will say at once that having given this matter my most earnest consideration, I think this House ought not to agree to the acceptance of such a resolution. My reasons are practically what have been set forth by some of the previous speakers. I may, however, add one or two reasons of my own, and I would ask my friend, Babu Surendra Nath Mullick, to consider whether he would really be serving the public interest which he has so much at heart in pressing his resolution for a committee of inquiry. We all know that these committees, after they have finished their labours, send up a report which very generally does not meet with what is called public approval. The personnel of the committee is objected to, the procedure that is adopted by the committee is objected to, the conclusions arrived at by the committee, however earnest, however fair, however impartial, however supported by reasons, fail to carry conviction with what we call the public at large, unless they are of a particular type and of a particular character. Let us remember the fate of the recommendations of that historical committee, the Hunter Committee. That committee was appointed by Government in pursuance of a resolution passed at the Imperial Legislative Council, and what was the result of that committee? The committee had not had its sittings

for more than a few days when it was decided by a resolution of the National Congress that they would have nothing to do with the committee. I know something of the facts and I can say this much without breach of confidence that the feeling against that committee was so very strong that the members of the Congress Committee were given definite instructions not to examine persons who had given their evidence before the Hunter Committee. Now if an attitude like that is taken up by the people at large, is it possible for any committee, constituted by any careful selection, to carry on an investigation which will result in anything like success? Then, coming nearer home and to more recent events, what has been the fate of what is called the Committee of Inquiry into the Kalighat Tragedy? The Committee has submitted the report and I have seen in the papers nothing but denouncements.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: There was no committee in this matter. A judicial inquiry was only held.

Maulvi A. K. FAZL-UL-HAQ: I take it, Sir, that it was a sort of committee, just as there has been a committee over the incident at Chandpur, which has gone into this question. Now the position seems to be this. There has been a non-official committee in connection with the Chandpur incident they have examined witnesses and Sir Henry Wheeler went there and also examined certain witnesses. We have got the case for prosecution, we have got the case for defence. The whole matter is before the public, the press, and the members of this Council who have gone carefully into the matter and they are in a position to pronounce judgement. It is perfectly open to us to denounce or to condemn the action of Government if evidence justifies it. But what I respectfully beg to submit is that no useful purpose will be served by wasting time by going into it over and over again in order to ascertain facts about which there is no doubt. For these very simple reasons I oppose the appointment of a committee.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: The several resolutions which have just been moved fall into two categories. The majority, though differing from each other in points of detail, in the main request that an inquiry should be held, while the minority of one, is in a form which, as I understand it, merely wishes to place on record the views of those who hold that the official action taken in connection with the Chandpur incident was open in some respects to blame. I will refer to that resolution later, but will deal first with the more numerous resolutions which ask for a committee of inquiry.

There is one point about them, and about remarks which we have heard in Council to-day, to which I would invite the attention of the Council. Running through these resolutions and the speeches of those

who have moved them and others, we have a constant recurrence of such words and epithets as "alleged oppression," "violence and outrage," "conduct which requires to be punished," "alleged serious sufferings and grievances," "brutality," "cruelty" and "want of humanity." All these words have occurred frequently this afternoon. And do they not indicate that these resolutions, though in the guise of a request for an inquiry, really seek to justify through the medium of a committee conclusions which some members—some of whom may be put on the committee—have already formed? It is not a request so much for an inquiry as a request for condemnation.

Now, Sir, in order to fully understand this incident and to appreciate how it is that we have had some of the speeches to which we have listened this afternoon, it is necessary to study with some care the efforts which were made at the very outset in a certain section of the press, and in a certain section of the public, to create in this connection an atmosphere of suspicion electrical with the wildest allegations of the acts which were supposed to have taken place. That I can prove, and I propose to prove, by a few representative quotations showing the tactics which were adopted at the very beginning, while these tactics have been so far successful that a common idea prevails and it has been reflected in the debate this afternoon—that some awful mystery exists as regards this Chandpur incident, and that some appalling outrages and ghastly cruelties were perpetrated, which the Government, for motives best known to themselves, are now seeking to conceal. Let us see how this impression was created, remembering that the dates of the occurrence were the 19th and 20th May. We find in the *Servant* of the 21st May:—

> It is reported that some coolies in their attempt to board the steamer after the gangway had been removed fell into the river.

The *Amrita Bazar Patrika* (our own correspondent) of the 23rd May had the following:—

> Mr. Macpherson, it is reported, went so far as to kick some of the coolies overboard. This enraged the coolies a bit, desperate as they were, and they were about to retaliate.

The local leader of Chandpur, Babu Hardyal Nag, in a letter of the 29th May to the same paper (7th June), repeated the rumour that some of the coolies were thrown overboard and drowned. I saw him on the 31st, and asked him if he had any evidence of coolies being drowned or killed. He said "No." I asked him—"Why, then, were such reports communicated to the papers," and the only reply was—"I merely said it was rumoured."

On the 21st May we have the distinct statement of Babu Hardyal Nag that "the leaders ascertained the fact by clear and unimpeachable

evidence that the Gurkhas were ordered to beat the helpless and sleeping coolies. A most inhuman and merciless beating followed." The same gentleman, on the same day, writes in the *Amrita Bazar Patrika*:—

It is difficult to count and examine all the wounds Approximately the number is one hundred Many wounds are bayonet thrusts Cases of fracture of bones, and lacerated wounds are also considerable There are certain cases of broken limbs and contused wounds are numerous The assault was perfectly unprovoked . . The coolies say some of their young ones are missing . Dyerism is visible all round.

"On the 23rd, we have the Chittagong Bar Association chipping in with a condemnation of the "most inhuman and dastardly midnight attack on half-starved sleeping coolies . . . an act of monstrous barbarity."

The *Amrita Bazar Patrika* (our own correspondent) on the 23rd May gives out—

Then followed an incident which in brutality and cruelty may only be eclipsed by the Jallianwalla Bagh tragedy

On the 26th May the *Amrita Bazar Patrika* had the following quotation from the *Herald* correspondent:

Our reporter found a cooly woman crying and asked her its cause She said that when they were being driven away at night a Gurkha snatched her child from her arms and threw it into the river

On the 31st, the correspondent of the *Amrita Bazar Patrika* writes from Chittagong:

Strong rumour gained currency that Babu Charu Gopal Ghose chief transhipment clerk at Chandpur, had been shot dead At first the railway authorities offered to give facilities for travelling by special train to Chandpur to ascertain facts but the offer was withdrawn immediately This action of the railway authorities strengthened the public misgivings as to Charu Babu's fate

Then on the 25th, we have a bright article in the *Servant* entitled "Dyer and De," while on the 30th the same paper circulated a rumour that Abdul Majid, serang, had been kept under confinement and sent away. We have made some inquiries about this man and, so far as we can find out, he is on a visit to his friends

The *Servant* on the 31st reported a speaker as saying in a meeting at Wellington Square that "Gurkhas marched over sleeping coolies," while in the same issue it was reported as an item of news that "Babies have been kicked to death in the course of the Gurkha assault on sleeping coolies at Chandpur."

The papers nearest to the spot carried on the same campaign I will read an extract from the Tippera *Hitaishi* of the 25th May

When on Thursday night, as on other nights, the coolies attempted to board the steamer, obstructions were put in their way Then a great row occurred on the gangway. As a result some of the coolies fell down into the river Some people say that they were kicked into the river It is stated that some coolies were killed thus The reserved police which left from this place were, it is said ordered to fire, but they are said to have refused to open fire

While passing on to the incident of the 20th May, the same paper says—

Fourteen or fifteen coolies were said to be missing their children Many people feared that as a result of the outrage, their children have been killed and in order that the outrage might not be proved, they have been thrown into the river One does not easily feel inclined to believe in such cruel and demoniac affair as of children having been snatched away from the laps of their mothers and thrown into the river But everybody is talking of it A 60-year old women was so struck on the head that her skull broke and was driven inside A 10 or 12-year old girl has had her eye so pierced by a bayonet that as a result of the blow it passed through the skull and came out on the other side

The Noakhali *Samamlani* of the 30th May was responsible for the statement :

Nobody says that the coolies were shot The report is that the unfortunate people were killed by thrust of the bayonet The Magistrate has not said a word about this, and it may be inferred from this that he has suppressed its truth

Now Sir, I give these as typical instances (their number could easily be multiplied) substantiating my contention that in this matter there has been from the outset a deliberate attempt to convert what after all was an incident of minor disorder at an up-country station into a political weapon of far-reaching range No effort has been omitted, maliciously and deliberately, to distort the incident and to calumniate the officers of Government

What in fact actually occurred? We have a small up-country station at which, for reasons for which no officer of this Government was in any way responsible an unusual influx of coolies from Assam occurred They congregated at the station, cholera broke out amongst them, and they had no means of their own of getting away On the night of the 19th May, they attempted to rush the boats and successfully did so While attempts were being made to put a stop to the disorder, the subdivisional officer was nearly assaulted and had to take refuge on the flat, drawing up the gangway in order to keep off the mob On the next evening we have the same coolies congregated at the station, with more cases of cholera among them and the authorities, finding themselves powerless to move them, with the men at their disposal, sent for reinforcements The reinforcements arrived, and taking at most 20 men out of the 50, who had come by the steamer, the authorities proceeded to move the coolies out of the station premises The majority of the coolies about 3,000—went away of their own accord, but some refused to leave and force had to be used to them A small number—sixteen—were produced before me with marks of injuries upon them 10 days later Taking the best evidence we can get from Chandpur, the statement of the other side did not show more than 26 cases suffering from injuries of a moderate description.

That is, Sir, what actually occurred, and it is on this that a superstructure of scandalous libel has been erected, culminating in the

requests this afternoon that an elaborate inquiry should be held to judge between Government and its accusers. It will doubtless be asked what is the evidence on which I base my contentions. I will mention the main points. In the first place we have the evidence of Mr. De, Mr. Wares, Mr. Sinha, Captain Shephard and Mr. Purcell, to say nothing of others. If there is any truth in these exaggerated statements that have been put up, some of which have been echoed this afternoon, the only conclusion is that these five gentlemen have deliberately lied. There is no other conclusion possible. I have here the statements of these five gentlemen, and I had anticipated that one of the requests put forward would be for their publication, a request which I will be quite prepared to comply with if it comes from any quarter.

Secondly, the cardinal point which can be verified is the matter of wounds. When I was down there I asked to see these wounded people. I saw 16 only, and as I have already said, the charges of drowning and killing were specifically withdrawn. I asked where were the broken limbs, and they replied that they must ask the doctors. I asked whether the doctors had any one then in their charge suffering from broken limbs, and I was told "No." That was 10 days after this alleged occurrence, and I submit to any unprejudiced man that these facts are sufficient proof that serious injuries amounting to broken limbs never occurred.

Then as regards the constantly reiterated charge of the use of bayonets. An interesting point, which I mentioned in my report, is that those who made that charge, in their anxiety to substantiate the details, mixed up the bayonets of the ordinary armed police with those of the military police, and specified a type of bayonet to which they were most accustomed, but which in fact was nothing resembling the bayonet carried by the military police. It is well known that Mr. Andrews has admitted that at any rate he saw no bayonet wounds - in itself, I think, sufficient evidence that no bayonet was used. The two or three wounds which were shown to me and alleged to have been inflicted by bayonets could not possibly, to my mind have been so inflicted. That was also the opinion of Dr. Batra who was with me. That being so, are we not justified in contending that the charge which has been put forward by the other side is absolutely unreliable, while on our side, we have witnesses of repute who have been corroborated in the one main particular in which corroboration is possible.

Apart, from that, what evidence is to be produced in a fresh inquiry - a point which has already been dealt with by Mr. Watson-Smyth? Into the conditions in Assam we cannot go, although the various allegations as to incidents there have largely coloured the views taken by different people. As regards officials, as I have said, I have examined them and am quite prepared to produce their evidence. The coolies are scattered and are no longer to be found, and all that remains

is such tainted evidence as is produceable from the town of Chandpur. I say "tainted" deliberately on the basis of these newspaper accounts and statements of which I have quoted extracts, many of them having emanated from Babu Hardyal Nag who, before me, when asked about the curious permit system which he had initiated, said "I am the sole leader and I take the whole responsibility." If Babu Hardyal Nag is the sole leader in Chandpur, and we have had examples of the kind of thing which Babu Hardyal Nag is prepared to say, what kind of evidence are we likely to get from the town of Chandpur?

As various points of detail have been raised by speakers this afternoon, and as it has been alleged that these points have not been covered by my report, I will very briefly refer to the more important of them

The point has been raised why were the Gurkhas ever brought to Chandpur at all? Why was not Mr. De content with the local police? And it is alleged that it has not been stated what strength of the latter he had at his disposal As a matter of fact, before the military police came from Dacca, Mr De had 70 police at Chandpur, of whom 22 were armed, and I put it to the Council that a force of that magnitude is not sufficient to cope with a crowd of 3,000 coolies who had shown by their conduct on the 19th that they were liable to mob suggestion culminating in riotous behaviour It was on that account that Mr De asked for reinforcements and 50 men of the military police were sent from Dacca

The next point raised is as to the use of bayonets With that I have already dealt Another is the mystery with which Babu Surendra Nath Mullick has tried to surround the alleged putting out of the lights in the station at the time of the occurrence, his inference being that the lights were deliberately put out by the order of the Government officers What Mr De said before me was that "about this time the electric lights suddenly went out and flared up again and went on intermittently I thought that the townspeople might have interfered with them and so asked Mr Sinha to mount a sentry to guard the plant" Mr De, in conversation with me, described the electric lights as jumping up and down, as everyone must have seen electric lights occasionally do, and as the station master said these lights not infrequently did If the insinuation is correct, that this was due to the action of the Government officers, I say that Mr. De, Mr Sinha and Mr Wares have told culpable and disgraceful lies.

Another point raised, and I am not sorry to have to refer to it, is the misstatement that Government ordered the steamer companies to stop all concessions. We have been asked by Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta to produce the letter in which, he thinks, a matter of this kind must necessarily have been dealt with. As a fact the instructions were not conveyed by letter but verbally by Mr Donald. As is known, Messrs. Sinha and Wares commenced by sending off three batches

of coolies, partly at private and partly at Government expense, and they also entered into a formal agreement with the steamer companies that they would take 400 tickets a day. When we decided that it was not justifiable to repatriate these coolies at the cost of Government, Mr. Donald communicated that decision to the steamer companies, saying that concessions of free passages and special boats should not be given on the requisition of Government officers. The order went down to Chandpur to the local steamer agent, Mr. Rope, in a form which he admittedly misunderstood, and he gave Mr. Andrews to understand that it was the order of Government that no concession was to be given to anybody. When Mr. Andrews came to Darjeeling, I showed him all the papers and explained the circumstances to him. In fact he was actually sitting in my room when Mr. Donald's wire came from Calcutta. Mr. Andrews then expressed himself satisfied that there had been a misunderstanding and repeated that statement later in a public meeting.

Another point to which reference has been made this afternoon, and also in sections of the press, is the state of the ground to which it was sought to take the coolies. It has been represented to have been a water-logged area, and it has been cited as another instance of our inhumanity that the coolies should have been sent there.

What are the facts? I will read a letter from Babu Hardyal Nag who said—

Mr. De arrived here on the morning of the 19th May. The matter was discussed between me and the Commissioner. He asked me to bring the coolies to the town but I told him this could not be done without consulting the town leaders and accordingly an informal conference was held at the subdivisional officer's bungalow in which it was settled the Commissioner would provide accommodation for the coolies somewhere outside the town, and the local leaders would feed the coolies as long as they would be here.

Mr. Purcell, on the same incident, states:

The Commissioner decided to send for Hardyal Nag and we saw him in the sub divisional officer's house about 9 A.M. I was present. Mr. De suggested that the coolies be housed in the two empty schools in the town and he would arrange sanitary arrangements and water. Hardyal said he could not decide himself but must consult his friends, and another meeting was fixed for 10-30 or 11. I was not present then. I returned to the subdivisional officer's bungalow about 1 p.m. and asked the Commissioner the result of the meeting. He said it has been decided to encamp the coolies on the football ground and I had been asked to wire to the Agent for permission.

What does Mr. De say:—

I saw the station was very insanitary and cholera had broken out and spreading to the railway staff and was bound to spread to the town. Therefore I suggested moving the coolies into a camp. I suggested the Hussein Ali Jubilee school as being suitable at one end of the town. Akhil Babu came. All the local people objected to bringing the coolies into the town and suggested the football ground. I telegraphed to the Agent asking his permission and in the course of the day he agreed. In the course of the discussion the local people said several times that it would be very difficult to move the coolies, who would not leave the station for fear they would be sent back to the gardens.

Therefore there is the evidence of three witnesses, one including the redoubtable Babu Hardyal Nag, which shows conclusively that the objection to the coolies being taken into the town came from the townspeople, and that it was in agreement with them that the football field was selected as a suitable place. That evidence has also an interesting bearing on the insinuation, which we have heard several times this afternoon, that everything might have been well if only the townspeople had been asked to bring persuasion to bear upon the coolies. But here we have the townspeople admitting their difficulty in moving the coolies. It also has a bearing on the question that has been asked, "Were the coolies ever told where to go?" I say that it is evident that for two or three days preceding the actual incident there was nothing else talked about in Chandpur except where these coolies should go and how best they could do so.

The only other point to which I would allude in this connection is the question that has been asked, "Why did I bring into my report all the minor details about the quarrel with Dr Batra?" I brought them into my report because they were small details, and I should have brought them in all the more had they been smaller still. I thought it desirable, eminently desirable, that the public should be aware of the attitude adopted by these so-called local leaders, and how for the sake of personal jealousy and pride they were sacrificing the welfare of the coolies which they said they had so much at heart.

Well, Sir, I have now dealt as far as possible with the main facts and incidents of which mention has been made this afternoon, and I submit to the Council that this request for an inquiry is unjustifiable and unsustainable. It is not a case of our shrinking from the possible results of inquiry. We say that the facts have been fairly and squarely placed before the public, and we say that this request for an inquiry, whatever be the motives and intentions underlying it, can only result in exposing our officers to libellous attacks from the very persons whose actions have led to the disturbances on the 20th May. I ask the Council to try to picture what the present state of affairs in Chittagong is. At present there is serious disorder in parts of the Chittagong Division. We have there a small body of men doing their best to check it and to restore decent administration. Is the result of their efforts to be that they are the party which is to be put on their trial merely as the outcome of this incessant stream of libellous exaggeration which has been poured out by those who are responsible for these events?

There remains the resolution of Mr. Jatindra Nath Basu which, as I understand it, drops the question of inquiry, and so far I am glad to see that it is supported by several speakers this afternoon. It concentrates on opinions which we all of course are entitled to hold, and it would indeed be a wonderful thing if the members of the

Council here to-day had not formed fairly decided opinions one way or the other.

The PRESIDENT: Your time is up. But I think that you may go on as the matter under discussion is an important one. I give you fifteen minutes more.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: The incident itself naturally evokes the sympathy and pity of everyone. Given the picture of these unfortunate coolies stranded, and undergoing all these hardships and misfortunes, with the fell disease of cholera among them, naturally the sympathies of all are with them, and as I have maintained before, under the subtle influence of this campaign of misrepresentation, it was not unnatural that many people thought that the fault lay with Government and that things might have been done otherwise. On such questions there will always be differences of opinion, and not altogether illegitimate differences of opinion. Although I should like to feel that I could convince Babu Jatindra Nath Basu that his view of the facts is incorrect, yet I recognise at the same time that he has placed his view before us in a temperate and moderate speech, and I will therefore allude only to two fundamental matters of opinion which have attracted a considerable amount of attention.

The first is this: "Why did Government refuse to repatriate these coolies?" We have done our best to explain our position in our *communiqué*. In our view it was impossible for us to intervene in this labour dispute in a manner which would have constituted direct intervention on one side. The difficulty that has arisen in Chandpur is one which might easily arise elsewhere. There are many other parts of the province in which labour is employed that comes from outside. We know that nowadays disputes between employers and employed spring up with lightning rapidity. Is it to be the position of Government that if the employees in such cases proceed to the nearest railway station and say "Here we remain until we are taken home at public expense," that it should forthwith comply with the request. We consider that it would be impossible for us to assume that responsibility and that it would be grossly unfair to our successors if we did so. We were therefore content to do all that we thought justifiable in the name of humanity and public health. We took medical precautions, and these precautions (I say this especially in view of constant misrepresentations) were not taken by me but by the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea. The arrangements were made by him and all that could be done was done. In so far as that help was not fully utilised, it was solely due to the attitude of the non-co-operators in Chandpur.

Another point about which much has been said, and it is the only other to which I will allude, is one which, I know, has troubled the minds of various members of this Council, and that is "Why was

action taken at night?" I have also explained that in my report. I submit that there were reasonable grounds for the view taken by the local officers. They had had a serious disturbance the night before. There were serious inconveniences to passengers who were entitled to use the station at night. On that very night the passengers could only get to the trains by passing between lines of police. They had cholera springing up all round. They had the definite opinion of medical officers that it was necessary that the coolies should be removed from the station, and they feared the repetition on the 20th of the incidents of the 19th. It was on these grounds, Sir, that they decided, rather than to wait until the morning, to take action at once. Although I recognise that it is always possible to say afterwards that it would have been better to have waited till the next day, yet I submit to the Council, that on the merits of the case, the other view was not an unreasonable one.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: I rise to a point of order. The Hon'ble Member must not assume that Mr. De's view is a correct one.

The PRESIDENT: As the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler knows most of the facts, he is right in assuming it.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: I am afraid I do not appreciate the relevancy of the interruption. I put it to the Council that so far as is practically possible at this stage and date, the facts of this incident have been fairly and frankly laid before the public, and in so far as the request for an inquiry is concerned, there is no ground for it. Further as regards the conduct of the officers concerned, I put it to the Council that it has been explained and reasons for it given. While it is too much to expect that after what has happened in connection with this incident, opinion will be unanimous as to the action of the local officers, yet I submit that it has been straightforward, frank and reasonable, and based solely on their duty, as they saw it, of maintaining decent administration and order in the town of Chandpur.

Mr. A. D. GORDON: I must oppose the resolutions which are before the House that a committee should be appointed to inquire into the recent unfortunate occurrence at the Chandpur railway station in connection with the tea garden labourers, who were induced to leave their employment by political agitators.

We are indebted to the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler for the full report which has been published in the press on the circumstances connected with the affair, and in my opinion there is no reason or necessity for any further inquiry into the matter. I regret that Sir Henry Wheeler has been accused of being prejudiced, but nothing has been submitted

to substantiate that. The Hon'ble Member has dealt very thoroughly with the ejectment of the coolies from the railway station and, on careful perusal, his report clearly shows that far from any violence, the minimum force was used in moving the coolies. Cholera had broken out among them, and it was absolutely necessary in their own interests that they should be removed from the railway station to more suitable accommodation, and considering how the coolies, who had walked many miles, were deceived by the non-co-operation agitators having been told that steamers and trains would be waiting at Chandpur to take them to their homes one can easily imagine how reluctant they would be to leave the railway station, and what a difficult proposition was before the officials to effect their transfer. In the circumstances, I am of opinion that the officials and the police worked with wonderful tact.

Sir, if immediate steps are not taken to prevent political agitators interfering with labour, I am afraid there will be a repetition of the unfortunate events which occurred at Chandpur and if the resolutions before the House are accepted, a very dangerous precedent will be created. As I have already stated, it is evident from Sir Henry Wheeler's report that no violence was used at Chandpur, and it is obvious a committee cannot be appointed to inquire into every instance where Government or the police may have to take action in the public interest.

If a resolution had been before the House to appoint a committee to inquire as to what steps can be taken to protect labour against political agitators I am convinced it would have been welcomed by the Council, but a committee of inquiry, such as is now suggested, is neither necessary nor can it serve any useful purpose, and I therefore trust the resolutions will be rejected.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: Many of my colleagues have to-day pressed us that we should appoint a committee of inquiry. I do wish very much that I could support them. I am satisfied neither with the official report nor with the non-official report. The main facts are however very clear. I shall speak on them shortly after.

In the meantime I must say that, however much I may desire to support my friends for an inquiry, having regard to the present state of things in my country I will not, I cannot in any conscience put up with this state of turmoil and unrest for any length of time. This turmoil and strife continue rampant in all the countries of the world just now. India is no exception. The people of this country have suffered a great deal from strikes, political agitation, depreciation of the rupee and high prices. I, for my part, shall be no party to the continuance of this spirit of unrest that is upon the face of the land. I know very well that the political agitation of Mahatma Gandhi and other patriotic gentlemen will lead us to further political rights in the near future; but I cannot agree with all their methods. I cannot agree with

their policy of passive resistance, or with their doctorine of *charkas* as the best means of attaining salvation. There is a very strenuous fight before us. The first is the industrial fight: we have to compete with the European industrialists in their own methods. We must appreciate the fact that we are unable to defend ourselves against invaders, that there is a section of a community amongst ourselves who would like very much to impose their rule and religion upon us. I shall never for a moment agree that this spirit of unrest and continuous strife and irritation should remain in the land. I desire to work in peace for the salvation of my country, and we require peace to work it out, and we shall work it out in *Pax Britannica*.

This committee of inquiry will last, if appointed, for at least six months. It is possible that the non-co-operators as at Amritsar, will refuse to give any evidence before it. It is possible they will appoint a committee of their own consisting of leading Congressmen from all parts of the country to visit Chandpur and receive evidence. This will lead to a state of great agitation and unrest. It is well known to every one of us that these strikes have been the cause of acute suffering on the part of the people of Bengal and we do not wish them to suffer any more. Our sufferings have been too great already But saying all these I cannot ignore the fact that there has been great unwisdom displayed by the Government in dealing with the coolies On what ground can it be justified that the coolies had been turned out—men, women, children and sick persons—of the shelter afforded them at night in the station yard into the roadside fields by Gurkhas with kicks and cuffs? Whatever Sir Henry Wheeler may say, the public will never for a moment believe that no violence was used He says that the word "inhuman" should not be used, and I put it to everybody here—Europeans as well as Indians—to say whether it was at all human to act as the authorities did Could they not wait for six hours more and let the sun rise and then do what they intended to do? It was again the most unwise of acts not to transport the coolies at Government expense—at the country's expense. We would have sanctioned the expense without demur That would have prevented the coolies from dying of cholera by scores, and cholera would not have spread in the neighbourhood The Government allowed the agitation to gather in volume and let the fire spread and become a conflagration It was the most unwise of acts They should have at once transported the coolies to Asansol and, like the stolen knave of our cardplay, let it go to the Bihar Government, but, instead of that, they kept them there and let them die like so many rats and fleas. It was certainly a very inhuman act. I understand a lesson had to be taught to the coolies and the non-co-operators It is very easy to teach lessons to the weak. I know how lessons are taught to poor deluded boys who are arrested by scores, but you do not go near the strong and the powerful. I cannot but condemn this teaching of lessons.

I have given my reasons why I cannot support the resolutions about the appointment of a committee and why I think it better to accept and support the resolution of Babu Jatindra Nath Basu.

It is in our power, to be sure, to pass a vote of censure upon the Government and to make it impossible—certainly it is in our power—but we want peace and do not like to have any more quarrelling with the Government. So I shall be content only with supporting the resolution of Babu Jatindra Nath Basu.

Mr. F. A. LARMOUR: I move that the question be now put.

The PRESIDENT: There are such a large number of speakers that I do not think that I should put the question at this stage

Professor S. C. MUKHERJI: I beg to ask a question Is it possible to have an official copy of Sir Henry Wheeler's statement made this afternoon? Some of us wish to speak on his report, and we wish to take the statement and the supplementary report which has been placed before the House.

The PRESIDENT: I am afraid it may not be possible to do so

Adjournment.

The Council then adjourned till 3 P M on Monday, the 11th July, 1921.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Council assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act.

THE Council met in the Council Chamber in the Town Hall, Calcutta, on Monday, the 11th July, 1921, at 3 P.M.

Present:

The Hon'ble the President, the Hon'ble the four Members of the Executive Council, the Hon'ble the three Ministers, and 108 nominated and elected members

Oath of allegiance.

MR. C. F. BEADEL made an oath of his allegiance to the Crown

Starred questions

(to which oral answers were given).

Alleged breach of trust by the trustee to the estate of late Babu Shyama Charan Sarkar, of Mamjuani, in Nadia.

***XLVII. Mr. SYED ERFAN ALI:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state whether any reference has been made to Government by the Collector of Nadia recommending action under section 93 of the Civil Procedure Code regarding the breach of a "Public Trust" by the trustees created by the will of the late Babu Shyama Charan Sarkar, of Mamjuani, in the district of Nadia?

(*b*) If so, what action are the Government taking in the matter?

(*c*) If the Government are not taking any action, will they be pleased to state the reasons for not doing so?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of EDUCATION (the Hon'ble Mr. P. C. Mitter): (*a*) The answer is in the affirmative, except that the trust was created by the will of the late Babu Dina Nath Sarkar and not Shyama Charan Sarkar.

(*b*) and (*c*) Government have decided that the collector can institute the suit and that no sanction of Government is necessary. It is reported that the suit will be instituted shortly by the Collector.

Communal representatives on the Calcutta Municipality.

* **XLVIII. Mr. SYED ERFAN ALI:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state—

(*i*) what is the population within the Calcutta municipal area;

(*ii*) the number of Hindus, Mussalmans and Christians within the said area, and their respective proportion to the whole population,

(*iii*) the total number of employees (excluding menials) serving in the permanent staff of the Calcutta Municipality, stating their appointments, period of services, salaries and their sects;

(*iv*) the number of menials employed permanently, stating the date of their appointments, period of services, salaries and their sects,

(*v*) the amount of money spent annually in payment of wages of the Hindus, Mussalmans and Christians, and their proportion to each other, and

(*vi*) the total number of Commissioners of the Calcutta Municipality showing the number of Hindus, Mussalmans and Christians, elected and nominated.

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether the Chairman of the Calcutta Corporation had any hand in the recent selection of nominated Commissioners?

(*c*) If not, on whose recommendations were the nominations made?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea): (*a*) (*i*) The census figures are: 1911—861,501, 1921—881,402.

(*ii*) The figures are—1911—Hindus 594,471 or 69 per cent.; Muhammadans: 220,647 or 25 per cent., Christians 36,510 or 4 per cent., 1921—Figures are not yet available.

(*iii*) A copy* of the annual list of officers and establishment of the Corporation is laid on the library table. Information as to the religious sects of the employees is not available and Government do not propose to call for it.

(*iv*) and (*v*) The information is not available and could not be furnished without undue labour and expenditure.

(*vi*) The total is 50. The details are as follows:—Elected, 25 viz., 23 Hindus and 2 Jews. Appointed by the Chamber of Commerce, 4;

* Not printed in these proceedings.

Calcutta Trades Association, 4 (all Christians); Port Commissioners, 2 (1 Hindu and 1 Christian); Government, 15 (5 Hindus, 3 Muhammadans, 6 Chirstians and 1 Parsee).

(*b*) The answer is in the negative

(*c*) Nominations were not called for

Cotton growing in Bengal.

*** XLIX. Rai LALIT MOHAN SINCH ROY Bahadur:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries aware that *Buri-Kapas* (a kind of cotton found in the Santhal Parganas) is capable of improvement, the experiment of which was started by Mr Oldham, when he was Director of Agriculture, but subsequently the project fell through on account of his transfer?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state—

(*i*) whether it is in the contemplation of the Government to chemically test the soil of the districts of Bengal to ascertain its suitability for the growing of cotton, and

(*ii*) whether the Government are ready to provide facilities for the growing of cotton?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of ACRICULTURE and INDUSTRIES (the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur) : (*a*) The member is referred to page 5 of the Agricultural Department bulletin No 1 of 1921 on cotton, a copy of which is laid on the library table

(*b*) (*i*) Soils from different parts of Bengal are being analysed in the ordinary course of routine The chemical constituents of the soil have comparatively little influence on the growth of cotton, and the climate and physical texture of the soil are far more important factors.

(*ii*) Instructions have been issued to agricultural officers to advise intending growers to cultivate cotton as single bushes or hedges on raised lands close to their houses Cotton-seeds have been supplied where wanted

Expenditure on the Department of Industries.

***L. Rai LALIT MOHAN SINCH ROY Bahadur:** Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state the actual monthly expenses incurred, item by item for the Department of Industries?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: A statement of the expenses for the year 1920-21 is given below :—

Months.		Salaries			Establishments			Allowances			Contingencies		
		Rs.	A.	P.	Rs.	A.	P.	Rs.	A.	P.	Rs.	A.	P.
1920.													
April	...	2,500	0	0	2,11[illegible]	7	1	76[illegible]	4	6	[illegible]192	10	9
May	...	2,500	0	0	2,088	15	7	547	13	5	3,896	0	5
June	...	2,500	0	0	2,[illegible]20	6	1[illegible]	284	7	[illegible]	3,989	13	9
July	...	2,500	0	0	3,977	15	10	[illegible]34	4	[illegible]	6,302	3	3
August	...	4,00[illegible]	15	8	3,023	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	4		5,30[illegible]	0	6
September	...	4,[illegible]	0	0	4,28[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	4	[illegible]	7	7
October	...	4,000	0	0	[illegible]981	[illegible]	4	[illegible]	[illegible]	0	5,66[illegible]	1	5
November	...	5,050	0	0	6,[illegible]88	7	1	[illegible]	[illegible]	3	4,486	14	10
December	...	5,49[illegible]	0	0	6,925	1[illegible]	8	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	8,083	0	7
1921													
January	...	7,5[illegible]	0	0	9,1[illegible]	[illegible]	4	1,44[illegible]	12	[illegible]	[illegible]6,456	8	11
February	...	7,3[illegible]	0	0	9,780	7	11	2,184	14	[illegible]	16,[illegible]	[illegible]	0
March	...	8,069	5	7	10,385	9	10	2,64[illegible]	[illegible]	8	[illegible]3,634	9	4

Partition schemes and expenditure thereon.

* **LI. Babu DEVENDRA LAL KHAN:** (a) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department be pleased to state

(i) the probable expenditure that will have to be incurred in effecting the completion of the scheme of partition,

(ii) the amount of money that has hitherto been spent in this connection, and

(iii) the actual progress of work that has been made?

(b) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the administrative reasons that led Government to the adoption of the scheme of partition?

MEMBER in charge of POLITICAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (a) (i) The estimated cost of land, buildings and

works in connection with the partition of the Midnapore district is Rs. 27,11,826. This is for the complete equipment of the district; it will be possible to start the district without the completion of all these works.

(*ii*) The amount of money actually paid out by the 15th of March last was in round figures Rs. 8,26,000 and bills for work done amounting to Rs. 1,47,000 were due. The amount spent was, therefore, Rs. 9,73,000. Further, the work being in progress contracts for large sums are in force, the cost of terminating which would amount to several lakhs of rupees.

(*iii*) The buildings at Jhargram will be ready shortly. Most of the principal buildings at Hijli are expected to be completed by the middle of next November.

(*b*) The reasons are stated in the published Government resolutions No. 6072 P. of the 7th July, 1913, and No. 1155 P. of the 26th January, 1915.

Unstarred questions

(answers to which were laid on the table).

Pirojpur Municipality and its income and expenditure.

213. Maulvi AZAHARUDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state

(*i*) whether there is or are any village or villages, besides the headquarters under the Pirojpur Municipality in the district of Bakarganj,

(*ii*) if so, what is the population of each such village, and how much does the municipality receive from them as tax,

(*iii*) how much does the municipality receive from the headquarters, and

(*iv*) what benefits have the villagers outside headquarters received from the municipality during the last ten years?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state separately the total income of the said municipality from the headquarters, and from the villages, and the expenditure for the headquarters and for the villages, during the last ten years, giving a brief list of income and expenditure for every year?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) (*i*) Yes; there are 24 villages.

(*ii*) A statement (No. I) is laid on the table.

(*iii*) Rs. 4,440 on the average.

(*iv*) The municipality incurs on the average an annual expenditure of Rs. 3,600 on the following heads, the benefit of which is enjoyed equally by the town and the village population

(*1*) Establishment and printing, Provident Fund contribution, etc.—Rs 1,941.

(*2*) Charitable dispensary and vaccination Rs 1,234

(*3*) Veterinary, Education, Contribution to Pasteur Institute, etc —Rs 425

An annual expenditure of Rs 1,473 on the average, is incurred by the municipality in the maintenance of 80 light posts, twenty of which are in the village area There are 12 municipal roads in the village area which are maintained by the municipality at a cost of Rs 375 per annum During the last ten years three reserved tanks were excavated in the village area out of the municipal fund and they are being maintained by the municipality

An indirect benefit which the villages derive from being included within the municipality is the exemption from road and public work cesses and from the chaukidari tax

(*b*) A statement (No II) is laid on the table Separate figures for expenditure for the headquarters and the villages are not available

Statement I referred to in the reply to unstarred question No 21 (ii)

Statement showing the population of villages comprised in the Perojpur Municipality and the average annual income derived from them from taxation for the last ten years

Number	Name of village	Population	Average income from tax
			Rs
1	Perojpur	681	161
2	Masunpur	557	168
3	Krishnagore	513	152
4	Bhankata	97	31
5	Shikarpur	788	246
6	Rajganj Hat	241	165
7	Khumaria	326	67
8	Satrajitpur	13	3
9	Muktarkati	253	73
10	Jhatekati	987	311
11	Alankati	592	148
12	Brahmankati	692	144
13	Banbari	411	95
14	Bairkati	776	517
15	Raichech	193	145
16	Mulgram	438	109

Number	Name of village			Population.	Average income from tax.
					Rs.
17	Odharkati ...	...	...	882	208
18	Kumarkhali ...	...	...	609	152
19	Chhota Khaishakhali	...	...	176	43
20	Bara Khaisha Khali	..	...	495	143
21	Narakhali ...	...	...	692	169
22	Lakhakati ...		...	532	142
23	Char Lakhakati	.	.	224	37
24	Hularhat ...	..	...	256	96
			Total ...	11,350	3,520

Statement II referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 213 (b).

Statement showing the income from the headquarters and the villages included in the Pirojpur Municipality for the last ten years.

YEAR	INCOME FROM THE HEADQUARTERS: Income from taxation			Other heads of receipts			Total.			Income from villages from taxation			Total income of the municipality		
	Rs.	A.	P.	Rs.	A.	P.	Rs.	A.	P.	Rs.	A.	P.	Rs.	A.	P.
1911-12	4,03[illegible]	5	6	2,082	[illegible]	0	6,119	9	[illegible]	3,271	7	[illegible]	9,391	6	9
1912-13	4,20[illegible]	7	[illegible]	5,137	7	1	9,346	14	1	3,417	3	6	12,764	1	7
1913-14	4,[illegible]	2	3	[illegible]	15	[illegible]	7,[illegible]44	0	0	3,[illegible]48	2	0	11,292	2	0
1914-15	4,[illegible]	8	6	[illegible]	12	[illegible]	6,760	5	3	3,329	11	6	10,090	0	9
1915-16	4,4[illegible]	12	6	4,[illegible]08	[illegible]	6	9,228	[illegible]	0	3,810	10	3	13,038	10	3
1916-17	[illegible]	1	3	2,[illegible]	17	[illegible]	[illegible]	15	9	3,24[illegible]	4	3	10,937	2	0
1917-18	4,[illegible]	15	[illegible]	[illegible]	1	10	7,1[illegible]	10	1	3,[illegible]63	3	6	10,791	13	7
1918-19	4,593	2	9	[illegible]	7	9	8,099	10	0	3,682	7	0	11,782	1	0
1919-20	4,[illegible]	1[illegible]	3	3,1[illegible]	13	9	7,[illegible]	15	[illegible]	3,[illegible]84	5	9	11,316	2	9
1920-21	4,8[illegible]	2	3	2,8[illegible]	1[illegible]	[illegible]	7,698	1	8	3,549	1	6	11,247	12	2

Hill journey of Mr. K. McLean, officiating fibre expert.

214. Babu BHABENDRA CHANDRA RAY: (a) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state whether it is a fact that Mr. K. McLean, the officiating Fibre Expert, went to Kalimpong immediately after taking over charge of the fibre expert's office at Dacca?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state the number of days Mr. McLean has been in the hills during the last two months?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state the nature and urgency of the work that is being done by him in the hills in preference to the jute work in the plains?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Yes

(*b*) Thirty days

(*c*) The officers of the Indian Agricultural service holding appointments in Bengal are allowed a recess in the hills for a month in each year provided that they defray their own travelling expenses and that no expenditure of any kind is imposed on Government. Mr. McLean carried on his ordinary work from the hills, and the rest of his work was in charge of his staff at Dacca. He was given permission to enjoy this recess as he was in indifferent health at the time.

Supply of kataktara "aus" paddy seeds of Chinsura Farm through Messrs. Sutton & Sons.

215. Babu BHABENDRA CHANDRA RAY: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the Deputy Director of Agriculture, Western Circle, sold the kataktara *aus* paddy seeds produced in the Chinsura Farm to Messrs. Sutton & Sons at Rs. 4-8 per maund, and that these seeds were supplied at his instance by Messrs. Sutton & Sons to private parties, who paid for the same seeds at Rs. 6 per maund?

(*b*) If so, what was the idea underlying this roundabout transaction?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) The answer is in the negative.

(*b*) This question does not arise.

District boards expenditure on tanks.

216. Babu BROJENDRA KISHOR RAY CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to make a statement showing

(*a*) the new tanks excavated,

(*b*) old tanks re-excavated, and

(*c*) the amount spent thereon

by the different district boards in the presidency in 1920-21?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: A statement is laid on the table.

Statement of tanks excavated and re-excavated and the amount spent by district boards during the year 1920-21, referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 216.

	Names of District Boards.	Number of new tanks excavated.	Amount spent.	Number of old tanks re-excavated.	Amount spent.	REMARKS.
			Rs. A. P.		Rs. A. P.	
1	Burdwan	Nil	..	6	5,387 0 0	Rs. 54,269 were spent on sinking 107 wells.
2	Birbhum	Nil		2	1,224 8 0	
3.	Bankura	Nil	..	Nil		
4	Midnapore	Nil		17*	[illegible],564 0 0	* Five only were completed during the year at a cost of Rs. 7,086.
5	Hooghly	Nil		2	4,4[illegible] 15 9	
6	Howrah	5	5,177 0 0	Nil		
7	24-Parganas	18	24,7[illegible] 0 0	9	4,[illegible] 0 0	
8	Nadia	Nil	..	Nil	..	
9.	Murshidabad	1	[illegible]21 5 0	1	[illegible] 10 11	
10	Jessore	14	11,[illegible]59 0 0	5	1[illegible] 0 0	Rs. [illegible] were spent on sinking and repairing wells.
11	Khulna	19	15,412 0 0	3	[illegible] 0 0	
12	Dacca	[illegible]	10,377 0 0†	5	..	† For both excavation and re-excavation.
13	Mymensingh	3	1,[illegible] 4 [illegible]	Nil		
14	Faridpur	20	[illegible] 12 [illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	
15	Bakarganj	12	15,[illegible] 0 0‡	1		‡ For both excavation and re-excavation.
16	Chittagong	Nil		[illegible]	[illegible] 0 0	Eight wells were also sunk.
17	Tippera	4	[illegible] 0 0	33	[illegible] 9 11	
18	Noakhali	Nil		Nil		
19	Rajshahi	Nil		Nil		Rs. [illegible] were spent on sinking 24 masonry wells and 2 ring wells.
20	Dinajpur	Nil		Nil		
21.	Jalpaiguri	Nil		Nil		
22	Rangpur	Nil		Nil		
23	Bogra	Nil		Nil		The district water supply scheme includes mainly the sinking of wells.
24	Pabna	1	[illegible] 0 0§	1	..	§ For both excavation and re-excavation.
25	Malda	1	[illegible] 0 0	Nil		

Decrease of population in Murshidabad district.

217. Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ: (a) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state the total decrease, as well as the decrease per thousand within the last ten years in the population of the district of Murshidabad?

(*b*) Has the Hon'ble the Minister ascertained the causes of this decrease?

(*c*) Has the Hon'ble the Minister been informed that the following causes, among others, are responsible for the reduction on the population of the district, viz.:—

(*i*) the extreme poverty of the tenantry;

(*ii*) the silting up of the Bhagirathi, the Bhairab and the Jellangi;

(*iii*) the heavy rate of interest charged by the *mahajans*, which impoverishes the tenantry;

(*iv*) the realization of *abwabs* by some of the landlords,

(*v*) the heavy costs of litigation, and

(*vi*) the want of pure drinking water and the presence of filthy tanks and of jungles?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) According to the recent census figures the population has decreased from 1,372,274 to 1,244,207, or by 93 per thousand

(*b*) and (*c*) The causes of the decline will be dealt with by the Census Superintendent in his Census Report, and I am not in a position to anticipate his conclusions

Monthly return of cases disposed of and adverse remarks thereon.

218. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to say whether the Government are considering the desirability, in consultation with the High Court, of abrogating the rule which requires the submission of statistical returns by Subordinate Judges and Munsifs to District Judges at the end of each month?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state whether adverse remarks regarding the quantity of work done by a Munsif or a Subordinate Judge passed by the District Judge on the quarterly returns which are submitted to the High Court are communicated to the officer concerned?

MEMBER in charge of JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-Rahim): (*a*) No such proposal is under consideration

(*b*) Adverse remarks such as are referred to in the question are communicated, when considered necessary, by the District Judges themselves to the officers concerned, when explanations are required they are again dealt with by the High Court.

Number of cases disposed of forming a criterion of ability.

219. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to say whether it is a fact that the number of cases which a Munsif or a subordinate judge can dispose of, quite irrespective of quality, is taken as the criterion of his ability at the time of promoting him to a listed post?

(*b*) If so are the Government considering the desirability, in consultation with the High Court, of abrogating any such rule?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware of the fact that the tendency of disposing of cases quickly causes constant friction and unpleasantness between the Bench and the Bar in the mufassal?

MEMBER in charge of APPOINTMENT DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (*a*) and (*b*) The quality of an officer's work is the main consideration. As between officers doing work of equal merit, consistent and unexplained deficiency in quality is an element necessarily taken into account.

(*c*) The question is too general to permit of reply.

Members of the Calcutta Corporation and safeguard of the unrepresented interest.

220. Maulvi FAZLAL KARIM: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state the number of elected and nominated members of the Calcutta Corporation from different communities during the last three terms of office and in the present term?

(*b*) Has the principle of safeguarding the interests of communities not adequately represented by election in local self-governing bodies been observed in the case of the present nomination? If not, why not?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) A statement is laid on the table.

(*b*) Appointments by Government to the Calcutta Corporation have not hitherto been made according to definite principles such as are observed in the case of appointments to mufassal municipalities. I propose to rectify this state of things. It is proposed to make provision in the Calcutta Municipal Bill, which I hope to introduce this year, for the reservation of a fixed number of seats for the Muhammadans in accordance with these principles. It may be pointed out in this connection that though 46 candidates appeared at the last general election of the Corporation, there was not a single Muhammadan candidate.

Statement of elected and nominated Commissioners, Calcutta Corporation, from different communities from 1912, referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 220.

		Hindus	Muhammadans	Christians (Europeans)	Jews or Armenians	Parsis	Total
1912 ...	Elected ...	20 (a)	1	10	4 (c)	..	35
	Nominated	4	4	6	...	1	15
1915 ...	Elected ...	22 (a)	...	10	3	.	35
	Nominated	3	5	6	...	1	15
1918 ...	Elected ...	20 (a)	1	12	2	...	35
	Nominated	5	4	5	..	1	15
1921 ..	Elected ...	24 (a)	...	9	2		35
	Nominated	5	3	6 (b)	.	1	15

(a) Includes Rajadhiswar Law, C.I.E., nominated Hindu Port Commissioner.
(b) Includes Revd. B. A. Nag.
(c) Includes one Armenian.

Charges on police court buildings in Calcutta.

221. Rai Dr. HARIDHAN DUTT Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing year by year

(i) recurring, and

(ii) non-recurring charges,

incurred in the Calcutta police courts, between 1913 and 1920

(1) in the shape of additions, and alterations, repairs, electric fittings, telephonic installations, sanitary plumbing works, in the Jorabagan, Kyd Street, Bankshall Street and juvenile courts buildings in Calcutta,

(2) in the shape of furniture and equipment of these courts, and

(3) any other item?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: A statement as regards the juvenile court is laid on the table. For the statement in respect of the other police courts, the member is referred to the answer to his unstarred question No. 24 (*b*) (2) (*i*), (*ii*) and (*iii*) given on 4th July, 1921.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 221.

Juvenile Court.

			Recurring charges. (i). (1).	Non-recurring charges (ii) (2)	Any other item (i) and (ii). (3).
			Rs	Rs.	Rs.
1913-14	...	...	Nil	Nil	Nil
1914-15	...	...	54	6,503	Nil
1915-16	...	...	154	Nil	Nil
1916-17	...	...	58	Nil	Nil
1917-18	...	...	84	Nil	Nil
1918-19	...	...	59	Nil	Nil
1919-20	...	...	84	Nil	Nil
1920-21	..	...	132	Nil	Nil

Expenditure on furniture and equipment is non-recurring while expenditure for additions and alterations is recurring

Tannin manufacture.

222. Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state whether an expert was deputed to investigate and experiment on tannin-producing barks and report on the feasibility or otherwise of manufacturing tannin from forest products on commercial lines?

(*b*) If so, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether the expert has completed his labours and what has been the final result of his investigation and experiment?

(*c*) Is any systematic investigation going on at present to make proper use of forest product in Bengal?

(*d*) Are medicinal plants obtainable in Bengal forests comprised in the programme of investigation and experiment?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Mr. J. A. Pilgrim, Tannin Expert to the Government of India, was placed on deputation under the Government of Bengal for the purpose of investigating the possibilities of the manufacture of tannin extracts from the mangroves in the Sunderbans.

(*b*) Mr. Pilgrim has concluded his investigations, the result of which have been embodied in his report, a copy* of which is placed on the library table. Further investigation in the matter is being carried on by the research chemist, Calcutta research tannery.

(*c*) No.

(*d*) No.

* Not printed in these proceedings.

Demonstration farms.

223. Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state the policy or principle on which divisional, district and mufassal (rural) agricultural demonstration farms are opened and worked?

(*b*) Is there a scheme before the Government for opening a divisional agricultural demonstration farm for the Presidency Division?

(*c*) Is it a fact that there is a proposal for opening a district demonstration farm at Baraset at considerable cost?

(*d*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that Baraset, is a particularly unhealthy place and is considered as unsuitable for the purpose?

(*e*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister considering the question of opening a divisional demonstration farm for the Presidency Division in a suitable, central, and healthy locality within the division which will have both the purpose of a divisional as well as of a district farm?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Under the present scheme each division will be eventually provided with a central experimental station and each district in the division will ultimately have its own demonstration and seed farms, which will be used to test under the conditions of that particular district, the results of the experiments which have been successfully carried out at the central experimental farm. The district farms will constitute a centre, on which the whole agricultural improvement of the district will be based. It will serve as a training centre and as a depôt for the supply of improved seeds, manures, etc. Steps will also be taken to establish private farms through the agencies of *khas mahal* estates, Court of Wards, zamindars, village union committees and agricultural associations for the propagation of pure seed and other demonstration work.

(*b*) The matter is being considered, but is in abeyance for lack of funds.

(*c*) Yes, but the proposal has not yet been finally accepted.

(*d*) Although Baraset is malarious, the site has been selected with the approval of a site committee, consisting of the Collector Vice-Chairman, District Board, Executive Engineer and Civil Surgeon.

(*e*) The matter is still under consideration, and a search for a suitable situation is being made.

Sugar from palm trees.

224. Maulvi RAFI UDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries aware that there is a large number of palm-trees in the districts of Jessore and Khulna?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of training the people, through experts, to utilize such trees for the manufacture of sugar?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) The member is referred to the reply to starred question No. XXXIV asked by Rai Lalit Mohan Singh Roy Bahadur at this Council meeting.

Water-supply in Calcutta.

225. Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to say what is the total amount of expense incurred by the Corporation of Calcutta in procuring the meters for measuring water and the total number of such meters, and what is the annual expense for repairing or replacing the meters, if any?

(*b*) What is the annual expense for the maintenance of the staff for the purpose of fixing, cleaning and reading the meters in Calcutta?

(*c*) What is the annual expense for the maintenance of the staff in the department of water works of the Corporation of Calcutta, except the staff employed at the Tala pumping station at Palta and at the workshop at Entally?

(*d*) What is the annual income derived from the rate-payers by the excess water-supply from the reading of meters?

(*e*) What is the estimated percentage of loss of filtered water due to leakage in pipes?

(*f*) Who is responsible for this loss?

(*g*) What steps are taken to put a stop to this loss?

(*h*) What should be the pressure of filtered water-supply which the Corporation of Calcutta is bound to keep and the time during which the supply is to be kept open under the Act?

(*i*) What is the normal pressure and what is the time during which the supply is kept open now?

(*j*) What is the cause of the scanty supply of unfiltered water for the last few weeks?

(*k*) If it is due to any defect, why was the defect not remedied beforehand?

(*l*) What steps are being taken against the officers in charge of this Department for this apparent neglect of duty?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) The total number of meters at present owned by the Corporation is 4,086. The cost of these meters is not recorded in any readily available form and it would take much time and labour to ascertain it. The present annual cost of repairing and replacing the meters is Rs. 38,272.

(*b*) Rs. 8,868.

(*c*) Rs. 3,47,210.

(*d*) The average annual income for the last three years is Rs. 12,945

(*e*) About 2·6 per cent.

(*f*) Such loss is unavoidable in any distribution system

(*g*) The loss by leakage is kept down as far as possible by regular inspection. Calcutta is divided into 262 waste water districts, in all of which the work of checking waste is carried on

(*h*) The Calcutta Municipal Act provides that a continuous supply should be maintained and the minimum pressure is fixed at 40 feet

(*i*) The average pressure of filtered water is 33·6 feet in the morning and 31·3 feet in the afternoon The pressure is maintained from 6 A M to 10 A M , and from 3 P M to 6 P M , but the afternoon supply has recently been extended to 7 P M

(*j*) The engines at both the unfiltered water pumping stations are old, and partial breakdowns are not infrequent On the 14th June three engines out of four at Mullick's Ghat pumping station broke down at the same time

(*k*) The defects cannot be remedied before they become apparent

(*l*) It is not admitted that there has been neglect of duty on the part of the offices of the Department

Muhammadan commissioners and voters in Calcutta municipal wards.

226. Maulvi YAKUINUDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self Government be pleased to state -

(*i*) the number of wards into which the Calcutta Municipality is divided,

(*ii*) the number of Muhammadan votes in each ward of the Municipality, and the number and denomination of votes in each ward of the Municipality,

(*iii*) the number of elected and nominated Muhammadan municipal commissioners in the Municipality during the last ten years

(*iv*) the number of elected and nominated Muhammadan municipal commissioners of the Municipality this year?

(*b*) What is the reason for the nomination of only three municipal commissioners on the present occasion?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) (*i*) Twenty-five

(*ii*) A statement is laid on the table showing for each ward the total number of voters and of votes and the number of Muhammadan voters It will be seen from the statement that the number of Muhammadan voters was 5,008 out of a total of 491,060 voters Statistics of the

distribution of Muhammadan votes by wards, and also of the number of votes and voters belonging to each religious community in each ward are not available.

(*iii*) A statement is laid on the table.

(*iv*) No Muhammadans stood for election: three were appointed by Government.

(*b*) The member is referred to the reply given to clause (*b*) of unstarred question No. 220 by Maulvi Fazlal Karim.

Statement showing for each ward of the Calcutta Municipality the number of votes and voters and the number of Muhammadan voters referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 226 (iii).

Ward	Total No of voters	Total No of votes	Total No of Muhammadan voters
1	3,705	6,721	54
2	1,968	4,909	12
3	2,752	5,668	108
4	2,063	4,255	57
5	4,329	10,681	77
6	3,042	7,139	104
7	7,767	19,769	680
8	2,986	6,770	829
9	2,964	7,655	377
10	1,828	4,866	277
11	1,974	4,397	51
12	1,949	6,429	47
13	1,933	4,978	489
14	1,682	3,789	436
15	697	2,803	165
16	392	2,786	16
17	170	1,458	9
18	112	308	26
19	1,052	2,405	179
20	830	1,493	358
21	1,317	3,676	286
22	2,407	5,440	76
23	1,048	2,888	49
24	404	968	110
25	939	2,015	136
Total ...	49,060	124,271	5,008

Statement showing the number of elected and nominated Muhammadan Commissioners of the Calcutta Municipality for the years 1911-12 to 1920-21, referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 226 (iii).

	Total.	Elected.	Nominated *
1911-12	5	2	3
1912-13	5	1	4
1913-14	5	1	4
1914-15	5	1	4
1915-16	5	...	5
1916-17	5	...	5
1917-18	5	...	5
1918-19	5	1	4
1919-20	5	1	4
1920-21	5	1	4

* By Government

Appointment of Muhammadans in Government service.

227. Maulvi A. K. FAZL-UL-HAQ: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to lay on the table all circulars issued by the departments regarding the increased appointments of Muhammadans in Government departments in all posts, ministerial as well as executive?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the names of departments which have not issued such circulars?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state whether the Government are considering the desirability of extending the orders regarding such circulars to departments which have not issued such circulars?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) Copies of Government letters No. 3386 A * of the 28th April, 1914, and No. 5159 A * of the 30th September, 1918, are laid on the library table. These refer to ministerial appointments only. No circulars of this nature have issued regarding executive services.

(*b*) and (*c*) Circulars of the above nature are issued, under orders of Government, by the Appointment Department, to all the departments concerned. Circulars issued by departments have been confined to detailed orders to secure that the policy laid down by Government in the circulars laid on the library table, is given effect to.

Working of hand-looms and their products.

228. Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state—

(i) the total number of hand-looms working in Bengal, the number of workers employed, and the estimated annual yields of the looms ten years ago, five years ago, and now;

* Not printed in these proceedings.

(*ii*) what steps have been taken during the last ten years, apart from the establishment of the Serampore Weaving Institute, for the development of the hand-loom industry, or that are now in contemplation;

(*iii*) whether any facilities exist for the supply of yarns to weavers and for the sale of the products of the hand-looms, and what are the facilities in the different districts of Bengal; and

(*iv*) whether it is a fact that two sale depôts have been established in Bankura, if so, with what result?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: (*i*) No information is available, except that in the census of 1911 the total number of persons employed on cotton spinning, sizing and weaving and their dependants in Bengal was returned at 459,000.

(*ii*) A weaving expert was attached to the Agricultural Department, whose duties were to tour in the weaving centres in the province to demonstrate and supply improved apparatus and to instruct the people in improved methods of weaving. The expert is now working under the Director of Industries. A system of peripatetic demonstrators (of whom the number at present is eight) for the instruction of weavers in outlying centres in the use of fly-shuttle looms in villages, and of advances to ex-students of the Weaving Institute at Serampore for starting weaving on improved lines, has been in operation for some time past.

During the war an impetus was given to the hand-loom industry in Bengal. At the instance of the Provincial Agricultural Association arrangements were made for the supply of model *charkas* in area in which there was difficulty about the manufacture of *charkas*. Arrangements were also made for the manufacture and supply in large quantities of *dosuti* for the Munitions Board from the hand-looms in Bengal. Mr. Hoogewerf, Principal, Serampore Weaving Institute, was placed on special duty to help the Director of Industries in organising the hand-loom industry.

Much attention has also been given in the past to the organisation of co-operative societies among weavers, notable amongst which are the societies in Bankura which are affiliated to the Bankura District Co-operative Industrial Union, Limited. The total number of weavers' societies in the province on the 30th June, 1920, was 113, against 101 on the same date in 1919. The question of the development of the weaving industry in Bengal is already engaging the attention of the Industries and Co-operative Departments. The former Department has designed an improved form of *charka*, which is now in the market.

(*iii*) Except the co-operative societies among weavers which arrange for the supply of yarn to their members and the sale of their finished

products, notable amongst which is the Bankura District Co-operative Industrial Union, Limited, there is no special organisation for the purpose.

(ii) Yes. They are reported to be working satisfactorily.

Heads of departments and other officers going up to the hills.

229. Babu BHABENDRA CHANDRA RAY: (a) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department be pleased to state how many heads of departments and other departmental officers went to Darjeeling, Kurseong and Kalimpong, or any other hill places during the current summer session and the number of days spent by each in the hills?

(b) Will the Hon'ble the Member also be pleased to state the number of days on which each of these officers were on tour in the hills last year for the corresponding period?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (a) and (b) A statement is laid on the table.

Statement showing the Officers who went to the hills between the 1st April and the 30th June in the years 1920 and 1921 and the duration of their stay there, referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 229.

	Designation of Officer	Number of days spent in the hills between the 1st April and the 30th June	Number of days spent in the hills between the 1st April and the 30th June
1.	Chief Secretary, Government of Bengal ...	26	71
2.	Under Secretary to Government, Political Department	38	63
3.	Member, Board of Revenue	34	49
4.	Secretary, ditto	Nil	49
5.	Secretary Local Self Government Department	50	4
6.	Deputy Secretary Education Department	47	64*
7.	Secretary Financial Department ...	44	71
8.	Under Secretary Financial Department ...	37	28
9.	Secretary, Revenue Department ...	29	70
10.	Secretary, Agriculture and Industries Department	45	The post did not exist
11.	Secretary, Judicial Department ...	Nil	8
12.	Secretary, Public Works Department ...	56	71
13.	Secretary, Public Works (Irrigation) Department	6	66

* As Director of Public Instruction.

	DESIGNATION OF OFFICER.	Number of days spent in the hills in 1921 between the 1st April and the 30th June	Number of days spent in the hills in 1920 between the 1st April and the 30th June.
14	Deputy Secretary, Public Works Department	Nil	68
15	Under-Secretary, ditto ...	Nil	25
16	Secretary, Legislative Department ...	Nil	62
17.	Assistant Secretary, Legislative Department	Nil	36
18.	Inspector-General of Police Bengal ...	32	20
19	Assistant Inspector General of Police ...	32	55
20.	Inspector General of Registration, Bengal ...	1	Nil
21.	Surgeon-General, Bengal	43	68
22	Inspector General of Prisons Bengal ...	60	72
23.	Director of Surveys	Nil	12
24	Chief Engineer, Public Health Department	17	15
25.	Director of Land Records	40	71
26	Assistant Director of Public Instruction ...	13	Nil
27.	Assistant Director of Public Instruction for Muhammadan Education	12	71
28	Director of Public Health	1	5
29	Director of Agriculture	25	5
30	Excise Commissioner, Bengal	11	59
31	Registrar, Co-operative Societies ..	54	36
32	Deputy Registrar, Co-operative Societies ...	19	Nil

Inquiry into incidents of recapture of escaped convicts from Rajshahi Jail.

230. Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: (*a*) In connection with the escape of prisoners from the Rajshahi Jail, will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department be pleased to state who conducted the inquiry into Part II, namely, the recapture of escaped convicts from Rajshahi Jail, as published in Government resolution No. 1245 Pl., dated the 17th May, 1921?

(*b*) Is it a fact that no non-official gentleman was associated in this part of the inquiry?

(*c*) Were any witnesses examined in the course of this part of the inquiry; if so, what is the number of witnesses—officials, non-officials and prisoners?

(*d*) Was any local inquiry made at Mohanganj by any official besides the district authorities?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) The Commissioner of the Rajshahi Division.

(*b*) Yes.

(*c*) Roughly thirty official witnesses (including warders and constables), ten non-official witnesses, and seventy-five prisoners were examined in the course of the inquiry into the recapture of the prisoners who escaped from the Rajshahi Jail. These statements were recorded partly by the Commissioner, partly by the District Magistrate and partly by certain police officers and certain deputy magistrates.

(*d*) No. Formal inquiries on the spot were made by the Deputy Superintendent of Police and by the District Magistrate.

Escaped prisoners of Rajshahi Jail passing through Kharkharia and Mohanganj.

231. Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: (*a*) In connection with the escape of prisoners from the Rajshahi Jail, will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the main body of prisoners which passed through Mohanganj on the 24th March, 1921, was the same that was previously encountered near Kharkharia by Messrs. Graham and MacDowell's party?

(*b*) Is it a fact that the body of prisoners encountered near Kharkharia by Messrs. Graham and MacDowell's party did not possess any firearms and that none were used by the prisoners when fired upon by the pursuers?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) The pursuing party lost touch with the main body of the convicts after the incident at Kharkharia, and it is not possible to say for certain whether they were the same as the convicts who were reported to be at Mohanganj.

(*b*) No firearms were used by the convicts who were encountered at Kharkharia.

Reconnaissance at Mohanganj by Mr. MacDowell's party in connection with the escaped convicts from Rajshahi Jail.

232. Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: (*a*) In connection with the escape of prisoners from the Rajshahi Jail, will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department be pleased to state whether during the midnight reconnaissance at Mohanganj by Mr. MacDowell's party, any inquiries were made from the local people?

(*b*) Is it a fact that the men ordered to enter into the house of Sohar Mulla at dead of night to arrest the supposed prisoners were armed with loaded rifles and were not in uniform?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) The police did not reveal their identity by making inquiries before attempting to surprise and arrest the men in the hut who were believed to be convicts. Subsequently, when other houses were searched, the police explained who they were and what their object was.

(*b*) The police had joined in the pursuit hurriedly and were not in complete uniform. Some of the police who surrounded the hut had loaded muskets, as the information then in the possession of the police was that the convicts had taken with them several jail muskets.

Shooting incidents at Mohanganj in connection with the escape of prisoners from the Rajshahi Jail.

233. Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: (*a*) In connection with the escape of prisoners from the Rajshahi Jail, will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department be pleased to state whether the Government are aware of the view entertained by a section of the public that the villager shot at Mohanganj by Mr. MacDowell subsequently succumbed to his injuries?

(*b*) Is it a fact that the man had received more than one gun wound?

(*c*) Was any attempt made to arrest the man after he was shot by Mr. MacDowell?

(*d*) Is it a fact that after the shooting, no attempt was made that night to ascertain whether the man shot at was an escaped prisoner or not?

(*e*) It is a fact that no further notice was taken of the wounded man during that night?

(*f*) Is it a fact that the same night a man was fired upon in the river at Mohanganj and repeated protests of a villager and his assertion that the man was not a prisoner were not heeded?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*), (*b*), (*c*), (*d*) and (*e*) The facts are as stated in paragraph 14 of the resolution of the 17th May. The question has confused two men, Taki and Nafar Khamaru. The villager of Mohanganj, by name Taki Pramanik, who subsequently succumbed to his injuries, was hit by a stray shot and not by Mr. MacDowell. He was not captured by the police nor did he reveal the fact that he had been wounded. He went to a neighbouring dispensary for treatment, but left during the night before his injuries, which were not in themselves serious, had been completely attended to. It was only after his death that the fact of his being wounded at Mohanganj was known to the authorities.

(*f*) This man, Nafar Khamaru, was fired on and slightly wounded by Mr. MacDowell in the belief that he was an escaping convict. Two recruits attempted unsuccessfully to arrest him, he crossed the river and continued to run away in spite of repeated warnings. Whereupon Mr. MacDowell fired at a range of 120 yards. Mr. MacDowell gave the wounded man stimulants and arranged for him to be sent to hospital in charge of a constable and two of his relatives. He was not told repeatedly that the man was a villager, the only persons present at the time being four or five police recruits.

House-searches and arrests at Mohanganj in connection with the escape of prisoners from Rajshahi Jail.

234. Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: (*a*) In connection with the escape of prisoners from the Rajshahi Jail, will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department be pleased to state whether it is a fact that during the course of the night several houses at Mohanganj were searched and their zenanas entered into by Mr. MacDowell's party in spite of the protests of the inmates that there were no prisoners concealed in the houses?

(*b*) Is it a fact that a large number of men were arrested at Mohanganj?

(*c*) Is it a fact that the local people protested that they were not escaped prisoners and that they were kept in police custody from midnight to 9 A.M. next morning?

(*d*) Is it a fact that none of the men arrested that night at Mohanganj was found to be an escaped prisoner?

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: (*a*) Houses were searched to ascertain whether any convicts were concealed there. The searches were carried out with care under the orders of the Superintendent of Police, who explained to the villagers what the object was. Zenanas were not entered.

(*b*) Twenty-four or twenty-five men were arrested.

(*c*) Certain villagers stated that some of the persons arrested were their own servants or persons known to them. But as the immediate duty of the police was to continue the pursuit of the convicts, further inquiries as to identification were not made by them during the night. The arrested persons remained under a guard till the next morning, when the District Magistrate arrived and released those whose identity was established.

(*d*) Two of the persons were escaped convicts.

Chandpur Inquiry.

The PRESIDENT: (the Hon'ble Nawab Sir Syed Shams-ul-Huda): The debate on the Chandpur resolutions will now be resumed.

Professor S. C. MUKHERJI: I beg to oppose the set of resolutions proposing the appointment of a committee and I also beg to oppose the resolution moved by Babu Jatindra Nath Basu. The main reason why I oppose the set of resolutions demanding an inquiry is, the scope of inquiry contemplated in these resolutions is too narrow and exclusive They do not go into the very root of the matter. An inquiry in order to be effective must be exhaustive What is really needed is to find out the genesis of this cooly exodus. How far was it economic? We should like to know the condition of the coolies in the tea gardens, the treatment they received at the hands of the tea planters. We should like to know how far it was political, the part played by the non-co-operators and how far these poor coolies were misled and deluded by the non-co-operators I would have whole-heartedly supported the appointment of a committee with such an object in view The kind of inquiry as contemplated in these resolutions can never be complete and satisfactory without first-hand evidence, *viz.*, the coolies and they are gone An inquiry is too late now I also oppose resolution No 45 which has been moved by my learned brother, Mr Jatindra Nath Basu, because I consider it to be a very unfair demand What does the resolution really mean? It means this, that the local officials should either be so punished or so severely censured for calling in the aid of the military police that such a thing should never again recur Is Sir Henry Wheeler prepared to give such a guarantee on behalf of Government after the defence he has put in in support of it? Supposing there is an exodus of 10,000 coolies again to-morrow, supposing there is excitement among the coolies, supposing there is display of violence I am quoting Sir Henry Wheeler's words -supposing the non-co-operators are again active in their propaganda. How is it possible for Government to give any such guarantee? Then, why should the local officials alone be dealt with or censured? Was not the conduct of the local officials in this Chandpur affair determined to a certain extent by the policy of non-repatriation adopted by the Government of Bengal? Is it not a fact that Mr K C De was actually repatriating coolies until ordered by the Government not to do so at the expense of Government If the local officials are to be censured, I do not see how the Government of Bengal can escape censure in this matter I think the request made by Mr. Jatindra Nath Basu in his resolution is most unfair and should not be complied with But while opposing the resolutions, I feel it is incumbent on the members of this Council to give an expression of their views on the Chandpur affair. It is simply essential that the Government should know what this Council has got to say in this matter. My observations

are based on Sir Henry Wheeler's report. I am decidedly of opinion that the Government has committed a series of deplorable blunders. The initial blunder was the adoption of the policy of non-repatriation by Government. In the Government *communique*, at page 11, this policy has been supported in the following words:

> The principle by which the policy of Government is determined is that in the case of labour disputes to which Government itself is not a party and of the merits of which this Government is not the judge, its attitude should be one of neutrality. It is not the duty of the Bengal Government to side with one party or another. To do so would be to intervene gratuitously in favour of one party to an industrial dispute and to create a most dangerous and unjustifiable precedent for the future.

Government absolutely failed to realise the situation. There was a grave crisis and an emergency measure was immediately needed. The Bishop of Assam and Mr. Andrews advocated repatriation in the name of humanity. Sir, it was not simply humanity but it was a case of pure necessity. Interests of public health demanded repatriation. The coolly situation at Chandpur was a grave menace to the public health of the entire town. In the face of such a grave emergency, the question of capital and labour was purely academic. It is a thousand pities that the Government of Bengal took shelter under such a plea, in support of non-repatriation. Then Government has raised the question of public funds. It is perfectly true the Government is the trusted custodian of public funds. Is it not equally true that the Government is the trusted custodian of the lives of the people? Which is a higher consideration, to save money or to save life? Sir Henry Wheeler has condemned the *hartal* at Chandpur and the strikes on the ground that the welfare of coolies had become a subsidiary issue with the local leaders (see page 11 of the *communique*). I fully agree with Sir Henry Wheeler. But the same charge can be brought with equal force against Government when it maintained the so-called principle of neutrality by adopting the policy of non-repatriation. Has Government after all succeeded in convincing the general public of its position of neutrality? I am afraid the net impression is that in this matter the Government sided with capital as against labour. Another deplorable blunder committed by Government was to send an official to inquire into the matter in which the conduct of officials was in question. At a moment of great excitement, at a time when popular feeling was running so high, when the feelings of the people were stirred to their depths and when the minds of the people were agitated and convulsed regarding the action of certain officials to send an official to inquire was a stroke of very bad statesmanship. There was a splendid opportunity of appointing a committee with a non-official majority. There were non-official members present at Darjeeling on the very day Sir Henry Wheeler left Darjeeling. The next blunder was to call in the aid of the military police. Nothing happened, I say emphatically, nothing happened on the 19th of May

which justified the calling in of Gurkha soldiers. What evidence is there in Sir Henry Wheeler's report to show that the local police was not sufficient to cope with the situation? Is there any evidence to show that the local police failed to maintain order on May 19th? Absolutely none. It was purely an assumption on Mr. K. C De's part that the police that he had at his disposal was insufficient. Sir Henry Wheeler said on Friday—this is how I find it reported in the *Statesman*—"Before the military police came Mr De had 70 police at Chandpur of whom 22 were armed," and he put it to the Council that "a force of that magnitude was not sufficient to deal with a crowd of 3,000 coolies who had shown by their attitude on the night of May 19th that they were liable to mob suggestions culminating in riotous behaviour. It was on that account that Mr De asked for reinforcement and 50 men of the military police were sent from Dacca."

Mr. De had 70 at his disposal, he got another 50. What material difference did 120 men make in relation to the total of 3,000 coolies? Where did the significance lay then? Not in the number of men brought but in their character. Mr De wanted a military force. Is it any wonder that the popular mind has been so much upset over this? The next blunder Mr De should have kept the military police in reserve until the emergency arose. Every effort should have been made to deal with the situation with the help of the local police and the military police should have been utilised in case of absolute necessity. The next blunder was to allow Mr Macpherson to be associated with the officials. Did he not represent capital? Is not the position of Government one of strict neutrality? The principle of neutrality was practically thrown to the winds and the position of Government was sadly compromised. We cannot therefore blame people very much if they have a lurking suspicion in their mind that Government was practically siding with the capitalists in this contest.

These are some of the blunders committed by Government and Government officials and have given a splendid handle to the non-co-operators. The non-co-operators have done immense mischief in the Chandpur affair and it is a pity that Government should help their cause by its blunders. I have made these criticisms in the friendliest possible spirit. My object is to co-operate with Government to the very utmost; but duty demands that the truth must be told however unpleasant it may be.

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: The recent Chandpur affair is still the burning topic of the day and justly so. It has stirred public feeling in an unprecedented way. My own division is the most affected and my own district of Chittagong has been the storm centre of all that has followed, and perhaps contributed most to the situation. One, therefore, finds it rather difficult to discuss the subject calmly and impartially. The facts have been fully referred to by several hon'ble members

In spite of differences and omissions pointed out in some important matters, the main features of the incident stand out boldly

The first is the exodus of a large number of coolies from Assam. Whether the exodus was due to non-co-operation interferences and misleading of the unsuspecting coolies or the wretched cooly life having reached the breaking point, owing to less than living wages and consequent semi-starvation and misery or to a combination of both the predisposing economic cause at once catching fire that turned up, it is now needless to dilate upon In this connection, we await the result of further inquiry now taken up by the supreme Government and the public The fact, however, remains that such a large number of coolies who had gone into jungles to eke out some sort of existence now fully destitute and helpless, and many women, children and sick, left the gardens, quite unmindful of the fate that awaited them on the way and at home.

The first congestion was at Karimganj, a subdivision of Assam It was a very difficult situation in all conscience They had to be fed at public cost from public subscriptions Some non-co-operation leaders went to Karimganj and apparently moved among and aided the coolies, it was a capital opportunity to capture their imagination as also for doing good to them The authorities knew and must have known what was going on at Karimganj It was certainly known that Chandpur which lay on the way to their destination and is a terminus station of the Assam Bengal Railway, would soon be a scene of their stranding.

With or without tickets and sometimes in company of one or other of the non-co-operation workers the coolies managed to reach Chandpur To proceed further was not possible, as the Steamer Company's arrangement was such that none could travel free and the destitute coolies had no price with them Even ordinarily, Chandpur would be too small for such a number of people The coolies now derelicts of humanity without food or clothes with a number of women and children got absolutely stranded They stayed squatting over the whole station compound The place was soon rendered extremely unclean and unsanitary and risky for ordinary railway traffic Cholera and other diseases broke out Whatever food could be got by buying or otherwise, the coolies used to cook anywhere and eat even by the side of the dying. The Civil Medical Officer of the Assam Bengal Railway, with staff, was in attendance, but he could not be equal to the task The station had to be cleared but the coolies did not move Civil authorities were approached for the purpose and they also failed To the credit of the local authorities, it must be said that they wanted co-operation of the local people, they asked for the use of two school premises then closed for the summer but unfortunately there was no response It is said that some people rather incited the coolies to be obstructive In such a situation the only way out of the difficulty lay in gradually sending off the coolies to Goalundo by steamer The Commissioner, Mr De,

accordingly pressed hard for their repatriation at State cost, and, in fact, the matter was so urgent that two or three batches were sent out in anticipation of sanction. Repatriation was refused by Government and Mr. Macpherson of the Tea Association is said to have been the first bearer of the said message. The latter for a time was overflowing with kindness for the coolies and promised Rs. 2,000 for raising a structure for their stay. Mr. De had in the circumstances to join hands with him and arranged to build such a structure on the railway football ground. The project had to be abandoned when Mr. Macpherson realised that his mission to induce the coolies to return to the gardens would not succeed. He left without paying a pice. On the night of the 19th May the coolies rushed on to the Goalundo steamer, and some unedifying scenes occurred. After that Mr. De brought in the Gurkha force and, after a few hours of their arrival, the coolies were forcibly evicted with more or less severe injuries caused upon their persons. Then the party of non-co-operators came out as public champions, and public attention was drawn to the coolies, and they have been now sent off.

These are the salient facts, and upon them various questions of construction, State policy and public rights arise. The position of the coolies, the duties and position of the local officials, and of the Government, the position of the non-co-operation party, and that of the public at large are all mixed up.

The first question I would ask is: Why was no provision made beforehand at Chandpur to meet the situation that was certain to arise thereafter the arrival of the coolies? The official version is that the non-co-operators had the coolies under them, and were operating with them. There is not much affection lost between Government and the said party, which has never concealed its views regarding Government. Can the Government plead that they had no information of what was taking place at Karimganj, or that it was not their duty to take any steps beforehand to meet the expected situation at Chandpur? To plead the latter is to confess utter incompetency and to say the former will be something too much for the public to accept.

This omission accounts perhaps for the spectacle of local authorities requesting co-operation of people of known contrary views and courting a sure refusal.

The second point is the refusal of Government to repatriate the coolies. To my mind this is the vital point both as regards the principle underlying the refusal, and the after effects of the refusal.

Not only unanimous public opinion, but strong urging by the local authorities must have made it abundantly clear to Government that there was no other alternative but to repatriate the coolies at Government expense, or to let them suffer and die like flies at Chandpur, endangering public health, safety and sanitation of Chandpur and East Bengal closely connected with Chandpur by railway and steamer. The duty of the

State to render medical aid seems to have been recognised to some extent at least, thanks to the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea, but the duty to repatriate was not. The proposal would cost about Rs. 10,000, and how many ten thousands have since been lost over this matter? The refusal was on a philosophical ground of non-interference in disputes between Labour and Capital. So our Government can grow philosophical sometimes when it suits their purpose, and throw practical wisdom to the winds! The State has to preserve society and it is to avoid evils flowing from stranding of persons that repatriation is made. The dictates of humanity also demanded it. We of the nether world can hardly appreciate why the policy of giving medical aid was recognised and that of repatriation refused by the same Government. The coolies at Chandpur were no longer tea garden coolies. They had already left the gardens several hundred miles behind. They had come into another Province. Strikers or no strikers, time and distance had completely breached their position as employees. Nor were they indentured coolies. Unlike strikers, they were determined not to return to the tea gardens on any condition whatsoever. Is it not insincerity of language to say that the dispute between Labour and Capital continued at Chandpur even?

The Muhajarins who had left India for avowed political reasons could be repatriated. The very Chandpur coolies could be repatriated from Nadiati and Asansol, but the Empire would be at stake to get them out from Chandpur. If some people ascribed the refusal to some grand feelings in some high quarters towards the capitalists of Assam can you complain much? One cannot forget that the miserable lot of humanity at Chandpur was necessary for exploitation or development of Assam jungles by some privileged classes. If this has pleased any one it is the non-co-operator friends of Government. They have got another handle to prove that the people have got no voice in the Government and the Reforms Council Government is only a show. Surely it is time that this should be mended.

The next point is the indenting of the Gurkhas and using them to forcibly eject the coolies. I shall not refer to any personal act of any one. I shall discuss the matter on principle. In short-sightedness and injudiciousness it was only next to the refusal to repatriate the coolies. In view of State policy and humanity, one cannot but strongly condemn this measure. Eastern Bengal people since the days of partition have had several and various experiences of Gurkha postings and each time with regrettable consequences to them and to the lasting evil name to Government. These Gurkhas—rather some Assamese going by that name—do not or feign not to understand the language or anything of the people they are picketed upon. They seem to be a class of people not far removed from certain animals meant only to carry out understood or misunderstood orders of their superiors. Friend or foe is all alike and they seem to find pleasure in annoying and inconveniencing everyone on every occasion without rhyme or reason. Their very sight is irritating. They

are looked upon as instruments of oppression and repression. Was it advisable to get such a force to evict the destitute coolies at Chandpur? I do not forget for a moment the trying circumstances of the local officials at Chandpur. The difficult situation created by non-co-operation in the locality and Government's refusal to repatriate the coolies was certainly a little too much for them. Here were the large number of destitute coolies including women and children ill and dying, absolutely stranded at the station—their way out was closed and doubly secured by the misunderstanding of the Government instructions by the Steamer Company. They themselves could not realise why they were being debarred while others had already been sent off free. Despair, anxiety and exasperation due to unequal treatment *plus* the tempting steamer close by induced them to make a rush into the steamer and with what results you have heard. The station had to be cleared but the coolies had no place to go. One may therefore feel for the local officials, still, that is no justification though it may be a palliation. The Hon'ble Sir Henry's halting explanation that 70 police force including 20 armed ones was not sufficient is a little difficult to accept.

Before I have done I would like to refer to the steamer and railway strikes that followed in the wake of the Chandpur affair and which has subjected a whole division to unspeakable misery and inconvenience. My poor district has practically been bottled up and has been passing as it were through a nightmare for about a month and a half. Trade has been dislocated, traffic closed, locomotion stopped. Even a son cannot go to attend the death-bed of his mother at home. Prices have gone up a hundredfold. Localities have been kept in darkness for want of oil-supply. Violence, intimidation expressed and by anonymous letter have been resorted to. Respectable gentlemen do not even dare to sit downstairs. Non-strikers and their sympathisers are treated to things I cannot mention here with decency. Attempts to settle the strikes by some gentlemen did not succeed and normal times are not yet in sight. The callers of the strikes did so, taking advantage of the situation at Chandpur created by the refusal of Government not to repatriate the coolies. They are certainly responsible for the dark situation now obtaining in Chittagong and bringing misery to the people and more so the large number of the railway employees and ultimate ruin to their families. They all belong to the middle classes and there is no other opening for them. One cannot read with indifference such passages in the Press that hundreds of dismissed, helpless, railway employees with their families have got stranded at Gauhati or a pathetic appeal to newcomers to desist from taking the bread from the mouth of the old people now out on strike and the like. Whether the appeal is proper or will be attended to is a different matter. It shows however the miserable plight to which a number of railway employees have been reduced and who is responsible for all this? I confess to a sense of regard to sincere non-co-operators and fully appreciate their ideals and realise the service they have done in

bringing about an all-round civic consciousness in the country. I do not see eye to eye with their *modus operandi*. The prominent leaders have plainly spoken out about the Chittagong strikes and that is a relief. In fact the playing with the railway employees as pawns or toys for ulterior purposes, which has brought about such a miserable situation, cannot be too much condemned. I am told the Chittagong leaders who first opposed the strike succumbed to pressure. The member having reached the time-limit had to resume his seat.

Babu NITYA DHON MUKHERJEE: I move that the question be now put.

The motion being put, a division was taken with the result that the motion for closure was declared lost.

Mr. H. S. SUHRAWARDY: At the risk of being misjudged and misunderstood, at the risk of making no new friends and losing all my old ones, I beg to oppose all the resolutions that ask for a committee. I congratulate the hon'ble members who have brought in all these various resolutions in the first flush of their generous impulse. When the whole of Bengal, perhaps the whole of India, was thrilled with flaming details of what had occurred at Chandpur and accounts were pouring in of the barbarities and inhumanities practised there, it was right that we should too bear a portion of the burden of our country and rush to take part in personal knowledge and experience. But since then the atmosphere has been considerably cleared. The exaggerated reports of the death and destruction retailed to us for the purpose of breeding in us righteous indignation against an unrighteous government have dwindled down to stories of bruises and wounds. I ask you, Sir, who were those who were responsible for those false rumours, and why were they spread, and in justice I appeal to the members when they sit in judgment upon all but themselves not to forget those who, by a campaign of the most abominable lies, deliberately sought to create an unholy discontent throughout the land for all discontent which is based on calumny and lies as godless and unholy. And if these reports had passed unchallenged and with what an orgy of crimes and excesses would we not have been regaled, with what wrath would we not have risen to tear asunder the fabric of government. I have no faith in those who could stoop to such callous lies to serve their aims, I have no faith in those who could continue to defile judicial inquiries with judicious falsehoods, who could teach and instruct and distort and intimidate for their own ends, who with impossible stories have taken in public-spirited though extremely gullible men, whom no amount of disillusion will cure of their godly simplicity. An inquiry at this stage will be valueless firstly, it will be tainted, secondly, what guarantee is there that it will not be boycotted lest the truth be discovered, thirdly, the real evidence must have disappeared, and the best evidence is now widely scattered on the road to Madras, Gorakhpore, or the Central

Provinces, dead or alive. And what will be the nature or extent of the inquiry? If really our hearts bleed at the miseries that the coolies have sustained and are still undergoing, if really we are anxious that justice should be done between party and party, and our hearts, I say, are rent asunder as we consider their pitiable situation, then why these one-sided resolutions? We must go right back and we must come down to the present. We must inquire as to the cause of this tremendous exodus—whether the stories of six pice a day retailed by hefty coolies whom the privations of the trek had not sufficed to wear down are true or whether the statement that the tea gardens were paying enormous losses rather than lose their labour power has foundation in fact; whether agitators and others who play fast and loose with the great name of Mahatma Gandhi did not feed them with false hopes and extravagant stories, it may be, I am ready to admit without the knowledge of the Central Body, or whether it was really an economic dispute. We must inquire what precautions these gentlemen had taken to receive the beguiled coolies, what conveniences they had arranged for them, or whether they had left them to shift for themselves and find an easy way out of their troubles in death, disease and starvation. We must inquire what was the condition of the coolies when they arrived at Chandpur, why they were ejected from the station and all the circumstances connected with that unhappy incident. And the inquiry must not stop here, although all the members seem to concentrate their attention on this one occurrence. We must inquire, if inquiry be necessary in view of the declared fact that the strike was political and was inaugurated for the purpose of bringing the Government down to its knees—to quote the exact words, why the strike took place and what were its results. On whom should the blame for the death of these 300 coolies and more lie? On Government for refusing to help repatriation by money, or on the strikers for stopping provision and medicine, when these were the most necessary, and for refusing to transport the coolies when facilities were available. In the midst of a frenzy at an incident that did not occasion any loss of life, why do we choose to ignore that merciless conduct, so lightly undertaken, that spelt death and destruction to so many hapless people. And then we must proceed further and see how many have succumbed to that callous apathy which caste breeds and which dries up the well of human affection and sympathy. Such a comprehensive inquiry will take us far afield and will embrace at least six provinces. And again, what need for an inquiry or a committee? We know the facts, all the facts, and we can draw our own conclusions. It matters little if there are differences in detail, but the broad facts are before us. Even adopting Sir Henry Wheeler's report, we can draw our own conclusions, and the conclusions that we come to is that there is much in it that we condemn. It can be alleged there were medical reasons why the coolies should be segregated and why they should be spread over a wider surface, that it was essential it should be done at night to prevent

conflict with the non-co-operators who had fed the coolies with hopes as to finding a train, that, in view of the fact that there were more than 5,000 coolies, the damage occasioned was surprisingly little. It may even be alleged that the officer concerned may have made a mistake, an error of judgment, in moving the sick, the weakly, the women and children, at dead of night and in flickering darkness, out of a shed on to an open ground, sodden and soft, an error of judgment, which in the light of the fact that the atmosphere was electrical and no bones were broken or lives lost, may be condoned. We condemn the conduct as inhuman and heartless. We require no inquiry to convince us of the fact, the whole Council and the whole country thinks alike. And the Gurkhas—their very name raises our hostility. Fed by reports of their savagery, of their exploits in distant climes, where to cut off the noses of Germans was their hobby, and the collection of German ears their pastime—we do not love them. We would discard them, have nothing to do with them where they can be brought into contact with the civilian population except under the severest necessity or in the case of an armed revolt. Then what need is there for an inquiry? Are we out to do justice? All the resolutions, all the speeches of those gentlemen who press for an inquiry have prejudged the situation, have condemned the incidents at Chandpur in the strongest terms and no amount of specious arguments and tender expressions of solicitude that we wish to hold an inquiry for the purpose of rehabilitating the Government in the love and confidence of the people can conceal their views. Do we want a trial where the judges have made up their minds? How do we stand then ourselves at the bar of justice? Are we not deliberately trying to turn the enquiry into judicial farce? Are we not sinning where before we have condemned others for sinning? Why even Babu Surendra Nath Mullick coolly and calmly and deliberately tells us prejudges that the story regarding bayonet wounds must have been true, and that Sir Henry Wheeler must have been misinformed by those who were themselves responsible for the wounds, forgetting the high authority of Mr. Andrews who can never be accused of bearing any affection for the Government where coolies are concerned. And why does he forget that those who spread the rumours are those who were responsible for the miseries and the death of the coolies, those who found an opportunity to divert the attention and the odium of the country from their monstrous crimes to the Government and flooded the country with lurid falsehoods. I say that it will be a disgrace to our sense of justice, a disgrace to our sense of proportion, if we allow ourselves to be led to seek an inquiry where the judges have already prejudged the guilt. If for one moment I thought that a committee of inquiry would appease or give satisfaction to the country I would have been in favour of it. But new forces have risen, new developments are taking place with startling rapidity. We should be committing a fatal mistake, if we sanctioned the committee, we should be impliedly approving of the conduct of those who, beguiled

by the exaggerated stories of the incident, have overwhelmed the whol country in a catastrophe. We should be approving of a conduct that th whole country, non-co-operator or otherwise, condemns. For who wil speak of the stranding of coolies at Karimganj, cut off from the worl and at the mercy of fate, sending wire after wire to relieve them fron their helpless situation, who will speak of the miseries that Easter Bengal is now passing through at the hands of. I was going to say non-co-operators, but I will not exalt them with that epithet, who wil speak of the privations that the people have to suffer, who will speak o the intimidation that they are subjected to, of the violence of the dutie kind they have to bear, and who will protest? To them the Chandpu incident lives merely as a precursor of dread times—a matter only re called by their untold sufferings. I, therefore, Sir, do not advocate a committee of inquiry, let the smouldering embers slumber to extinction What new fires are now raging in Eastern Bengal before which tha puny conflagration was as the light of a glow-worm in the sun. There is still one other attitude of the Government that we have failed to appre ciate and regard with disapproval. This is the first opportunity tha Government has had to gather our opinion on the subject of repatriation and it is right that it should know it. Government may tell us that i it were to repatriate the coolies it would give a fresh incentive to a fur ther and a greater exodus, it would be taking sides in this labour or poli tico-labour dispute and that it was the duty of those who were responsible for the exodus to have arranged for their removal. But let not Gov ernment ignore the sentiment, an overwhelming sentiment, in favour of their repatriation. If we choose to forget, when we picture them miseries at Chandpur, that they have ceased to be Assam tea coolies, but are merely a struggling, helpless mass of miserable Indian people, why should not Government be prevailed upon to revise its opinion, saying always that the Government of India does not choose to bear the burden which is rightly hers? And if, after this, we claim money for sanita tion, education and the like, and Government tells us that it is thus that the money has been dissipated, we shall bow to fate, but we shall have had the satisfaction of having done one good act, and curtailed the miseries of thousands. Then why, once more I ask, do we claim an enquiry? Is there any amongst us who doubts what constitutes the guilt and who is the guilty party? Is there one amongst us whose mind is not made up and who is inclined to give the benefit of the doubt to the Government? And I am betraying no secret of the lobby when I say that there is none such, if there is one such with us let him, Sir, vote for a committee. Therefore, Sir, believing, as I do, that the appointment of a committee will be futile, superfluous, impolitic and unfair, and voicing, I feel sure, the sentiment of this House that there is much in this incident be deplored and condemned, even on the report submitted to the country by Sir Henry Wheeler, I beg to support the resolution of Babu Jatindra Nath Basu.

Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: I beg to move that the question be now put.

The motion was then put and a division was taken with the result that the motion for closure was declared lost

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: From the trend of the discussion it is clear that we are all agreed that those who are responsible for this crime should be adequately punished so that such incidents might not occur again.

Now, Sir, if we only look through the reports, nay, if we only examine the Government version, it would be patent to every one in the House that, defend how much we may, and making the greatest allowance to the exigencies which the Government officials had to meet there, there can be no gainsaying that their action was overhasty, injudicious and relentless. The officials there have proved themselves utterly unfit to cope with anything extraordinary, they have proved themselves utterly unfit for and incapable of managing a serious situation which requires tactful treatment. In short, they lack the primary qualification of an administrator viz., tact. Sir, in the official report, a lame excuse has been made to the effect that for sanitary reasons the coolies had to be forcibly removed from the station platform. But did that sanitary reason first dawn into the brains of these eminent administrators in the dead of night? The coolies had been gathering at the station for days before their eviction. It required only about 20 armed men to remove the coolies, but before the arrival of the Gurkhas there were already at Chandpur on that day 28 armed policemen and 42 ordinary police. Were the officials so sleepy during daytime that this brilliant idea of sanitary reason never occurred to them then? Did the cool night breeze of the Padma waft it into their brains? And, Sir, did that idea at once become so imperious, an obsession I may say, that it must be realised then, the very night, without any appreciable time being left between the order of eviction and its realisation? And, Sir, no enquiry was made whether any sick persons or delicate women were amongst them. Twenty ferocious Gurkhas were let loose on them. Sir, it is heartless, it is brutal. We hear of misdeeds in Armenia. Do not the Turkish reports also allege that some loss of life had occurred, some hardships had been entailed because it was thought fit to remove the Armenians from a certain quarter. Sir, it is said that no bones were broken, no bayonet thrusts were made in that valiant raid of the Gurkhas led by the Commissioner himself. Very creditable to the Commissioner Sahib. Sir, gloze what we may, the indelible stigma remains. But, Sir, all our expostulations, even our humble requests to have the fair name of the British Raj rehabilitated by censuring the erring officers, have met with a lofty air of irritating self-complacency, an air of provocative defiance. We had all expected a reply from the Government Member evincing some amount of sympathy, but instead a justification has been sought to be made of

actions which to no conscience should be justified. I wonder how an exculpation of a midnight raid on a helpless crowd of destitute men, women and children can be attempted by a Government which, if not responsible to us, is undoubtedly responsible to the British Parliament. Sir, if such an unbending attitude of the Government be seriously maintained, then we shall have no other alternative left to us save pressing for the appointment of a committee to challenge the veracity of the conclusions arrived at by the Government.

And then, Sir, we must examine the Government reports and the spirit with which the inquiry was conducted. I shall quote only one sentence from the Wheeler Report. It runs as follows:—

A man with a small wound on the top of his head he said that this had been inflicted with a bayonet if so, the assailant must have been remarkably tall.

Sir, to the inquiring official it does not occur that the man might have been sitting or lying down when he was struck. He does not say whether it was really a bayonet wound or not, or might not have been caused by it. He ridicules the whole thing and in bantering tone leaves it off with a remark on the stature of the possible assailant. Sir, a spirit of distrust of everything detrimental to the fair name of the Government servants, pervades his inquiry. He seems to have made up his mind from before and goes there and makes this inquiry to uphold that fair name.

Sir, we all know how much this Chandpur incident has stirred up the feeling of the people in that part of the country. It cannot be denied that this has given a great impetus to the non-co-operation movement all over Bengal. Any fresh inquiry by a committee of this Council is sure to take up unpleasant memories over again. I know, Sir, that it is for this reason that many of us, if possible, would like to avoid such an inquiry. But this would depend on the attitude of the Government. We cannot allow the Government to shoulder the blame by defending an absolutely indefensible action of its officials, however high they may be placed. The blundering officials must be punished.

And, Sir, we feel it all the more keenly, and shame is all the more doubled when we consider that amongst the authors of this harrowing deed are included some of our own countrymen. What a painful blow it is to our national pride that some of our own kith and kin, placed in positions of great responsibility, have failed to rise equal to the situation. But still, Sir, the love for our own countrymen raised to high positions must not interfere with any strong expression of disapprobation. Neither our clannish spirit nor the bogey of official prestige should be allowed to stand in the way of our meting out proper deserts to their supreme tactlessness.

Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: Sir, the other day, *i.e.*, on Friday last, I came prepared to support Mr. Basu's resolution. But after having heard the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler on the side of the Government I have got to revise my ideas. For when it is apparent that the

Government has no open mind in this matter, when it insists that the local officials were in the right and further perseveres in thinking that it will be wrong to suppose that the local officials can tell anything but the truth and the whole truth, I think it is futile to press Mr Basu's resolution I have, therefore, come to think, Sir, that there is no other option but to support a committee.

Sir, the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler made much of the exaggerations appearing in a certain section of a press But is it very unnatural that ugly rumours and certain baseless exaggerations will gain currency with regard to such an unusual and serious affair before the publication of a Government report? Again if the newspaper reports and the non-official versions are totally false and misleading and are nothing but canards, is it proved thereby that the official reports and the Government versions give only the truth in the fullest measure and there can be no *suppressio veri* about them? Even if we admit what Sir Henry Wheeler says about exaggerations must we forget our school logic and take the official reports to be the gospel truth and perversions of the facts and too much colours where there are none? Take the events of the 19th May If the rumour of anybody getting drowned be untrue so also the statement of the Director of Information that the coolies on that night "assaulted" Mr Macpherson and Mr Sinha For Sir Henry Wheeler himself says in his report that Mr Macpherson was "threshed" and an "attempt" was made to strike Mr Sinha And how impartial is the official report in referring to others among the coolies? The youth of Chandpur who afterwards turned out to be the stretcher-bearers of the cholera-stricken coolies, if found moving about there must be taken to have been inciting them, while Mr Macpherson's presence seems to be open to no objection and cannot lead to any excitement and trouble

Then coming to the events of the 20th night, well let me admit it is a gross exaggeration to report that there were about 100 casualties let me admit further that the number of casualties was not larger than 30 as stated by the Director of Information but it is not a false statement to record, as the Director of Information did that "the local civil medical officer examined all the cases," when it is stated in the Government *communiqué*, that "Mr De sent a Sub-Assistant Surgeon next morning but he was given no facilities to see the injured" Is it no deliberate exaggeration to state, "It is denied that any were asleep," when it is perfectly well known that a large number among the coolies were women, children and diseased? How, again, to assess the truth of the statement, Sir, in view of the Associated Press telegram of the 21st instant, "That they did not make any attempt to board the steamer but slept peacefully?"

An aspersion it might surely be to allege that there were motives of retaliation in using the Gurkhas But was it a correct appreciation of facts to state that the local police was "insufficient" when admittedly

" the constables managed to keep back the coolies " on the night of th 19th?

Again it may be admitted, Sir, that the story of the Gurkhas walking over the bodies of the coolies is a myth, but where has appeared the truth of the " booted kicks " deposed to by so many of the coolies and th station staff? The story of the use of bayonets may be a fabrication in spite of the statements of the coolies but how to explain the punctured wounds? Are jokes sufficient to explain them away?

In such a state of things a committee of inquiry seems absolutel necessary, and I demand a committee of inquiry because untruths have got to be nailed whether they be exaggerations or understatements. demand a committee of inquiry, Sir because the public are loth to believe that force was at all necessary or justifiable to evict the coolies The country is not prepared to believe, Sir, without a due inquiry tha sanitary reasons became so pressing at midnight or that there was any reasonable ground of " fear " that the coolies would rush the steamer on the night of the 20th And, Sir, I believe in a committee of inquiry because more facts were elicited by the Hunter Committee than either the Home Member in the Imperial Council or the Chief Secretary of the Punjab was prepared to admit

Babu NIBARAN CHANDRA DAS GUPTA: I want to make one or two remarks though it is not very pleasant to get up at the end o the day, after several motions for " closure " have been moved to make a speech in this House but the importance of the subject and the intensity of the public feeling on it, necessitate an open and candid expression of opinion on the part of those who come here as representative of the people That is the only consideration that prompts me to address this House at this hour Sir, it strikes me that after all the speeches we have heard and all the reports we have read I don't mean only the newspaper reports the official reports and the non-official reports and all the stories that have reached us, there is the outstanding fact, which nobody can deny, that, on the night of the 20th May, some " inhuman " act was perpetrated by the military police at Chandpur I call the act " inhuman " not because the Gurkhas obeyed the orders of the authorities (because they are bound to do it) but because we know full well the conduct of these military police (we know to our regret how the military police behaved in the partition days at Bakarganj by breaking the head of a pleader who is now in the good graces of Government) We know full well what outrages were committed The difference between the civil police and military police composed not entirely of the Gurkhas but of lower class people of Assam is this— that the civil police are more human, whereas the military are not. So that is a point which we should never miss, but did the circumstances that transpired at Chandpur necessitate the employment of the military

police? We are not convinced that the circumstances were such. Throughout the 19th of May, of course, besides the attempt of the ignorant and illiterate coolies to board the steamer, rushing the gangway, we do not think that there was any attempt or act on the part of the coolies, showing that they were going to break the law or disturb the public tranquillity. Of course, if there was any attempt at assault upon the Subdivisional Officer or upon anybody, that had to be put down, but could not that be put down (and as a matter of fact it was put down) by the civil police? On the 20th of May, throughout the day there was no disturbance whatsoever. These poor coolies were putting up in the station-yard. We know full well, and gentlemen belonging to this House know full well, how these coolies live. It is said that they made the station-yard very insanitary, untidy and unclean. If that was so, throughout the day, was any attempt made to remove the coolies from the station-yard? It appears that no such attempt was ever made. Then again it was only after the arrival of the Gurkha military police at 8-30 P.M. that this idea took possession of the local officials. Of course, whether it was previously considered or not, whether there was a plan or preparation or not, we do not know. We know this much, that after the last train had left, when it was close upon 11 or 12 o'clock, when most of the coolies must have gone to sleep, or some of them might have been cooking their food or have been awake, Gurkhas were let loose upon them. There was absolutely nothing to discredit the story that some of the coolies were asleep, and who were those coolies? Some men, some women and some children, very weak people, deeply distressed people, who came all the way from Assam. They were very weak. Was it absolutely necessary to remove them from the station-yard at that hour of the night, and if so, should they have been removed to a field which was close to the station-yard, namely, the football ground? Would their location there remove the danger of cholera spreading towards the town? Further, were any arrangements made for the location of the coolies in the football ground? Was any shed put up? Nothing of the kind was done. Whatever view of the situation we may take, regarding which false accounts and false rumours have been spread, we cannot shut our eyes to the outstanding facts that there was absolutely no reason for setting the Gurkha military police upon the innocent, ignorant and half starved coolies at that hour of the night, and it is that feeling, and that sense of indignation which I intended to place on record by addressing this House on this subject. Then again it strikes me that, with regard to the question of inquiry, I am also of opinion that a committee of inquiry at this stage is absolutely useless and that it is no use whipping a dead horse. Not only that, we know what these committees will do, and many speakers have pointed out the difficulty in the way of a committee going fully into this question, but it seems to me that these are not only our views—views of moderate men. But this morning a nationalist paper

used these words with regard to the proposition for appointing a committee of inquiry. The *Servant* says:—

> No useful purpose could be served by an inquiry of the kind prayed for. It will merely be a waste of public money, while the excitement which is likely to be engendered would only serve to accentuate racial bitterness.

But that is no reason why this Council, representing the people of Bengal, should not have something to say with regard to the incident of the 20th of May. Of course, I am not very singular in my opinion. The other day the Lord Bishop of Calcutta, in the *Calcutta Diocesan Record*, said:—

> Under existing conditions a Government charged to maintain law and order may be compelled to employ force. I gravely doubt from the evidence which has been furnished whether such a necessity existed at Chandpur—but do we, as Christians realise that the employment of force is a confession of moral and spiritual impotence.

This is the view of the head of the English Church in this country. So, this is not only the Indian opinion but also the soundest European opinion with regard to this incident.

Then, Sir, there is one point which may admit of some inquiry, but I may be confronted with the remark that these matters relate to Assam. However so far as we are concerned, we have to ascertain by an inquiry, namely, what led the coolies to make this exodus. No doubt, Mr. Watson-Smyth has said that these non-co-operators or political agitators induced these poor coolies to break their contract and to run away. That is a very one-sided statement. Up-to-date we have got no names, no list of the agitators, or how they got access and worked in the tea gardens. So, that is a point which should be considered in the interests of the tea industry of Bengal, namely, the districts of Darjeeling, Jalpaiguri and Dooars wherefrom there has been no exodus. Nevertheless, it is not unlikely that the same thing may happen with regard to the tea districts in Bengal. That is a matter no doubt for inquiry.

Then with regard to the observations of Mr. Watson-Smyth, whatever his point and conclusions may be, we are prepared to accept his dictum, that whatever has happened has happened. Nevertheless, we must condemn the high-handedness, that act of inhumanity, and that unchristian act which was done on the night of the 20th of May in Chandpur. There are certain chapters in the history of a nation, which had better not be written. The incident of the 20th May constitutes materials in the history of Bengal which should be smirched with black ink or tarred with coal tar. We are prepared to forget everything but the consequences subsist.

With regard to the appointment of a committee, I have already expressed my opinion that I have no faith in such committees. Further, after such a lapse of time, such a committee would be useless.

There is one other point about which I have to make one or two remarks. It has been suggested—I do not know what amount of logic—

that this exodus was due to political agitators. These coolies came to Chandpur and by their stay at Chandpur, and by spreading cholera and so forth, rendered that little town so very insanitary that on sanitary grounds alone the Government came forward to alleviate the sufferings of the coolies. So far, so good. But why did not the Government of Bengal spend, say, Rs. 10,000 or Rs. 15,000 for repatriating these coolies? The answer is that Government should not interfere when the question is between Labour and Capital. Very well. You said at the very beginning that this was not a labour dispute. If it was not a labour issue, what was the difficulty of spending Rs. 10,000 or Rs. 15,000 and that for the sake of humanity? Well, the Government of Bengal can spend more than a lakh of rupees in defending a Sub-Inspector of Police against a libel which was published in one of the vernacular papers in Calcutta, but the Government of Bengal was not prepared to spend Rs. 10,000 for repatriating these coolies. On sanitary grounds also, repatriation was the best course to be adopted because if they could be removed at once, there would have been no danger with regard to the infection spreading throughout Chandpur or the district of Tippera. On no ground whatsoever, can we support the policy of the Government in folding its hands and in not spending a little amount of money for repatriating these coolies because the coolies, by their presence at Chandpur under those circumstances, created a situation which had to be met and eased by Government.

With these words and with the object of having on record the sense of this House I have to support the resolution which has been proposed by Babu Jatindra Nath Basu, and I think the resolution would have been much better if to that the resolution which is to be moved by my friend Babu Surendra Nath Ray would have been tagged, that is to say, the Government should be asked and requested not to employ the military police under circumstances like this in future, because that would avoid many difficulties, because that would go a great way towards what the Government want to do to make the British rule popular and stable in this country, and to bring to the people's minds that the Government is based upon righteousness, equity and justice. With these words, I beg to support the resolution which has been moved by my friend Babu Jatindra Nath Basu.

Babu FANINDRALAL DE: The unprovoked assault on the poor and suffering coolies at Chandpur at dead of night, on the 20th of May last, has once more demonstrated our utter helplessness against the caprices of the Executive officers. Even the most selfish and self-sufficient amongst us has felt the humiliation of the Gurkha blows at Chandpur. The facts are well known and need no repetition. It may be safely asserted that the tragedy could have been avoided. The obliging executive appears to have identified themselves too much with Mr. Macpherson of the Tea Planters Association and the interests which he represented and lost their head at the slightest provocation. The services of

of the military were requisitioned as usual on the pleas that it was the last resort, when all other devices for grappling effectively with the situation failed. Are we to understand that the extremity was reached at Chandpur, simply because the Railway station swarmed with the ghostlike apparitions of lean and haggard coolies? Are people not safe even when they are fast asleep at dead of night? Are not even the poor, aged and infirm, women and babies, the sick and the dying entitled to any humane consideration from the hands of the bureaucracy? We seek in vain for illumination on these points in the official report. The three thousand people could not leave the place the very moment they were expected to do so, they had among them men physically unfit to move a step without help and still it was declared an unlawful assembly. The Gurkhas were let loose by the civil authorities and they played the most inhuman part of the episode. On being interviewed by the local leaders, they had the amazing frankness to maintain that they wanted to create an impression and they ended the interview with the vulgar threat of letting the Gurkhas loose in the town. A thrill of indignation swept over the country.

MEMBER in charge of POLITICAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): The hon'ble member is doubtless aware that Mr. De has denied having made any such statement.

Babu FANINDRALAL DE: I beg to withdraw that statement.

Mere proclamations of racial equality and rights of citizenship mean nothing. It is the spirit in which they are carried into practice that affects the people. Unless these are mere idle professions the authorities should not try to whitewash the situation. The broad facts are quite clear, and there is no need of any inquiry by a committee or commission. What is needed is prompt action. A committee of inquiry will only postpone, if not shelve, the whole question. If necessary, we can discuss the matter in the light of the various reports that are available and come to a decision here and know as to what action is to be taken. Let the authors of the crime, whoever and whatever they may be, be brought forward and given suitable punishments. Prestige is not greater than justice. And we want nothing more or nothing less than even-handed justice. We further want that there should be no repetition of such atrocities in future.

Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: I desire to make a few observations with regard to the several resolutions moved. There is a similarity of thought in several resolutions asking for the formation of a committee to inquire into and report to Government so that Government may take such action as is necessary. One resolution aims at a suggestion for action being taken, without the appointment of a committee. What procedure is to be adopted? If I feel the pulse of the people correctly there is considerable desire on their part to have a

further inquiry by a competent committee. The people of this vast province are of opinion that the coolies at Chandpur have been maltreated and assaulted without any justification. This impression or, say, firm idea is not based upon sands. The whole country has got several versions of the affairs—official and non-official. They have outlined a picture in their minds about the midnight raid by Gurkhas, the wounded coolies weeping and crying,—the terrible Gurkhas like the messengers of Yama—the coolies being driven from the place of their shelter at dead of night, running to save their lives with babies in their arms, and this in the presence of Government high officials, the protectors of their life and liberty. The picture presents no exaggeration. This we gather from the dry and solid facts supplied in the official *communique*. These facts have also been supplied to the Council by the movers and by the Press. Can we throw the curtain over this tragic and heartless scene? We listen still to the voice of the people demanding justice to them. The coolies have gone away with a feeling that the benign Government, the protector of life and property of the Indians, have not shown them any mercy by giving concessions and allowances. The Indian subjects will understand the policy of Government, unless it is tinged with mercy. In the Council of administrators of the country, their policy ought to be shaped, moulded and formulated on the ethics of humanity. The basis, the broad basis of British Government, is justice. Any apprehension of the breach of this principle brings discredit to the administration. Whenever there is a wrong, or supposed wrong, the people look up to Government for help. If the policy of Government be not consonant with this popular view, which may be founded upon rumours or misapprehension of real facts and, if not tested by the logic of facts, it is open to severe criticism. The people have done so, a section of the Press has done so. Government have not listened to the voice of the people, for the voice of the people is the voice of God. The people have condemned the action of those men concerned in the Chandpur affair—a strong condemnation. Government have not yet taken any action on the facts, dry, firm and solid facts. As a representative of the people, I wanted to know the real facts, by asking Government to lay on the table the correspondence between the Government of Assam and the Bengal Government, the correspondence among the Planters' Association and different local Governments and the officials. It has declined the production of these papers. This is a proof of the weakness of the case of the officials concerned. If we want to impress upon the people, that the version of the *communique* is correct, then there ought to be an open and public inquiry by the representatives of the people and also by a few officials on behalf of Government. If the result of the inquiry of the committee shows that the picture is a true one, then those who are guilty must be punished, for the sake of "Justice," to quote the words of His Excellency the Viceroy of India, if not from a humanitarian point of view.

I am recommending the procedure of the appointment of a committee to secure the confidence of the people who loudly demand for it.

Mr. AJOY CHUNDER DUTT: I have listened with very great care to the numerous speeches that have been delivered in this House both yesterday and to-day and particularly to the very effective speech of the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler. I was much impressed by it but, I confess, I cannot say that I was convinced by his arguments; and this, for the simple reason that there are a number of broad, outstanding features in the Chandpur affair which cannot be explained away by mere statements made in the House, and can only be properly dealt with by a committee of inquiry. Besides this, the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler's statement in the House as also the statement that was published in the papers some weeks back are silent on many important points in reference to which findings are necessary.

Sir, a great deal has been said with reference to the mischief caused by non-co-operators in Chandpur. We are told that the non-co-operators went about the tea plantations and by fair words and false promises induced the unfortunate coolies to break their engagements with their employers. I need not deal with the numerous allegations against them, but I say, if half of these allegations are true, then the non-co-operators deserve the severest condemnation, and I for one shall certainly have no hesitation in openly condemning their conduct in reference to the Chandpur affair. But that is not the issue before us. The issue before us is whether Government, or the local authorities, acted rightly in employing Gurkha troops for the purpose of removing the coolies from the station precincts on the night of the 20th. That is the only broad issue. It has been suggested that an inquiry at this stage would serve no useful purpose as the coolies have gone home and cannot be brought back, and that therefore their evidence will not be available. I admit the force of that argument, but, at the same time, I think that it cannot be suggested that no evidence is available as to the nature of the wounds inflicted on the bodies of the unfortunate coolies. I understand that the evidence of the doctors who attended on them after the incident is available, and they are fully prepared to give their evidence before a committee of inquiry. However that may be, that is only one of the many issues. The nature of the injuries inflicted on the coolies raises only one issue, but there are other issues besides, which are of equal importance and should be dealt with by a committee of inquiry, if a committee of inquiry is decided upon. Let me shortly state some of the more important issues upon which we want a decision. The first issue is whether the circumstances at Chandpur were such as to warrant the employment of Gurkha police in order to remove the coolies at 11 o'clock at night on the 20th May. I leave aside the question of violence altogether—I only ask if the circumstances at Chandpur were such as to justify calling the assistance of the Gurkha military police. Now, in this connection, I should like to ask

you to remember what has been happening in England recently. India is not the only place where trouble exists. Even to-day the coal strike is going on in England, and in Ireland, well, there is almost open rebellion. The Government there have dealt with the situation with remarkable tact and self-restraint and I do not remember having read in any newspaper of that Government employing military force under conditions similar to those at Chandpur. It must be admitted that it was preposterous to allow the military police at dead of night to remove the coolies—men women and children—gathered on the railway premises. At most, the coolies may be charged with the guilty of trespass, if at all, and nothing more than trespass. In this circumstance the measures that were adopted appear to be arbitrary and iniquitous.

The local officers have been charged with high-handed excesses as regards the means they took to effect a clearance of the crowd from the railway premises. Now, a committee if appointed will sift the matter very thoroughly and many new facts will be brought to light. The utility of a committee also lies in the fact that it will give the local officials concerned a chance of defending themselves, by stating the actual circumstances under which they acted so that the public will be in a position to judge whether there was any justification for their conduct which has been so universally condemned. Therefore I plead for a committee so that they may be given an opportunity of justifying themselves. Several speakers have given their opinion that the conduct of the local officials concerned in this lamentable affair is unworthy of them and it is but right and proper that they should be allowed to make their own statements.

Now, Sir, there is another point upon which we want some information in reference to which the statement made by the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler in this House and that published in the papers here are both silent. And it is this. What was Mr. Macpherson doing at Chandpur during the days that he was there? We are told again and again that Government had adopted a policy of neutrality. But what was the attitude of the local officials in their dealings with that gentleman? It seems to me that Mr. Macpherson was trying to take back the coolies from Chandpur to the plantations and that the local officials were resisting him. I do not know how far the statements are true and I think it is only fair to give these officials a chance of clearing themselves, if they can, of this charge. I shall not take up more time of the Council with a recital of the numerous issues involved in the Chandpur affair but I may be permitted to say that the matter is one which requires to be thoroughly sifted, and I cannot understand why Government is so averse to the appointment of a committee, which alone can effect this purpose.

Mr. H. A. STARK: I move that the question be now put.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: I want a division.

Rai JOCENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: Mr. Stark is willing to withdraw his motion and let Mr. Mullick have the opportunity of making a speech.

The PRESIDENT: I am afraid I cannot allow that.

On the motion being put a division was taken with the result that the motion for closure was declared lost.

Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: After the lengthy debate that we have had over these resolutions, I have got scarcely anything to say but I should like to put in one or two words. We have all heard what the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler had to say in his report. We have also heard the other party I mean the non-co-operation party—and I don't think any good will result from the appointment of any committee of this nature.

Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: There is no non-co-operation party here.

Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: We have read in the papers what the other party had to say Then we have got almost all the facts before us, and further, in my opinion, a committee of inquiry would do no good whatever So, in the absence of any other resolution in the agenda, I support that of Babu Jatindra Nath Basu

However, I have one appeal to make to the Government officials I appeal to them to exert their utmost and see that such incidents do not occur again; the recurrence of such incidents would only make the people lose all faith in the justice of British rule We are the followers of the Sanatan Dharma and faith in kings is the part of our religion, and any incidents which will tend to strike at the root of such a faith cannot but be deplored by the people of this country

With these words, I beg to support the resolution of Babu Jatindra Nath Basu.

Maulvi YAKUINUDDIN AHMED: I rise to support the resolution of Babu Jatindra Nath Basu and oppose the other resolutions Of course the Chandpur affair, the attack on the night of the 20th May on the helpless and innocent people when they were sleeping to eject them—to evict them—from the railway premises sometimes at the point of bayonet and often by the butt-end of the guns by the military police is an outrage which no sane man can tolerate. I wish and I think it is the sense of the Council by the repeated closures that have been put and disregarded that we are ready, and we are all agreed, to speak something with regard to the outrage that was committed upon these helpless people. Innocent females with their little children were sleeping in the railway premises and they were going to be evicted unmercifully by the military police This is a spectacle which no civilised Government can tolerate, and I am sorry that the high officials are Indians. This is a matter of deep sorrow

to this Council, and this Council, as the representative of the Province, cannot overlook that high-handed action on the part of these Indian officials. That is the sense of this Council which I wish to impress upon you, and I think that is the message which we are to convey to the people and to the whole country. This, I think, is quite sufficient instead of instituting a committee of inquiry now. What would the committee of inquiry do? They are certainly not to go to Gorakhpur to see who the coolies were, who were assaulted, who were bayoneted, or who were beaten with the butt-end of the guns, the coolies have left the scene.

It is said that the electric light was put out. I think it is very unjust on the part of the people to surmise that the light was put out in order to commit that outrage. It may be that it was train time when there was electric light, and as soon as the train was gone, the light was put out. The non-co-operators may say that it was for the purpose of committing the outrage that the light was put out. This is a very uncharitable way of judging things.

Therefore, the outrage is the only subject for consideration before this House, and those officials who were connected with it are to be brought to book if need be. It lies with the Government as well as with this Council to devise ways and means as to how to bring those officials to book.

With these words I support the resolution of Babu Jatindra Nath Basu.

Munshi MAKRAMALI addressed the Council in Bengali in support of the resolutions.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: In reply to what has been said by the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler in opposing my resolution I, first of all, beg to draw the attention of the House to two observations made by him which I do consider to be highly objectionable from the point of view of those members who have moved these resolutions or others connected with them.

These observations are firstly, that "the speeches of members supporting the resolution (for inquiry) indicate that in their request for an inquiry in which some of these members would sit they wanted to put in the opinion of these members and it was evident that it was not a request for an inquiry but a desire to express their condemnation," and secondly, "it would be evident from the extracts from the Indian papers quoted by the Hon'ble Member that a deliberate attempt was made to use it as a weapon to calumniate the Government and that this superstructure of libellous misrepresentation had culminated in a demand for inquiry." I would stop and ask the House to consider if this is not a direct attack upon the honesty of purpose which led those members of the Council who drew attention to the fact or had the audacity, according to the Hon'ble Member, to question his report and point out

that it had failed to command that confidence which was expected of it I ask the House to consider whether observations of this character which Sir Henry Wheeler thinks are the keystones on which he has built with great pride his wall of opposition to my resolution are at all justifiable by an Hon'ble Member. The attitude of Sir Henry Wheeler from the very beginning is one of special pleading. For reasons obvious to everybody—and I need hardly dilate on that—he had lost all balance of judgment in this matter. Maledictions have been the very basis of his report and, I think, I should have been surprised if the Hon'ble Member could have cast off that lamentable frame of mind and could have found his way to be more dignified or less malignant even in his observations in this House. Suffice it for myself and my friends, who have supported me, to say that I emphatically repudiate the sinister insinuations contained in those observations.

As regards the specific items for clearing up of which I demand a committee of inquiry, out of the whole lot of them to which I have definitely referred, and others which I have suggested without elaborating, I find that Sir Henry Wheeler has taken up only three of them in his reply. First of all he has dealt with the question of bayonet wounds. He has said that he saw 16 wounded persons and made inquiries from the medical men who attended them, and his opinion is that none of those wounds were bayonet wounds. In reply to that I beg to draw the attention of the House to the statements of some of these doctors which appeared in the newspaper of 19th June. I hope they will remove the misconception of my young friend, Mr. Suhrawardy, as well as of elderly friends like Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur. The first is of Dr. Jogesh Chandra Sur, who is the gentleman who, along with others, examined many coolies, the number of whom was over 50 and 60 the next morning, and his statement is this: "I found punctured wounds on most of them probably caused by pointed weapons such as bayonets. The punctures were deep and the bleeding was profuse. The limbs and some parts of the body were in most cases covered with blood. Some wounds were bleeding even at the time of my examination." And this examination had taken place twelve hours after. After this are we to accept the *ipse dixit* of Sir Henry Wheeler based on the hearsay evidence of sub-assistant surgeons?

As regards the 15th of Sir Henry Wheeler's cases, *viz.*, that of the girl of 8 years with a wound just below the right eye, the said doctor's opinion is that it was a deep punctured wound caused probably by the end of a bayonet. As regards these punctured wounds his further statement is that these wounds could not have been caused by any other than a pointed weapon and, he adds, that some pointed weapon must have been used. This gentleman is an M.B. of the Calcutta University and he and his assistants attended to 50 or 60 cases of wounds not to speak of the minor cases which required no special medical attention. I also beg to point out to the House that his statement contains in many

instances the name, age, sex, residence and the name of the tea garden from which they came. In this connection, I also beg to refer next to the statement of Dr. Gurunath Bose, a medical practitioner of over 20 years' standing at Chandpur, who attended to some eight or ten coolies on the next morning between 7 and 9. He says, "I remember that a female cooly had a contused wound on the left parietal region," *i.e.*, the left side of the head. He further says "I found punctured wounds on the person of three or four coolies, one of them being Gulna who was present there." He said he also found another female who had a punctured wound just above the left eyebrow. He further said that these fractured wounds were caused by a pointed weapon. There is also the statement of Norendra Kumar Brahmachari who is a B.Sc. with honours in Physiology and had appeared in the first M.B. Examination of the Calcutta University. Amongst other injuries of which he had given detailed description he found many instances of fractures, sprains and punctured wounds. In his statement he spoke of (1) Sonkeli of the Bakuldhara garden who had a simple fracture of the radius bone (*i.e.*, arm); (2) of Jugna Baluchera garden who had two fractures, one on the right ulna (hand) and the other on the right tibula (leg) bones which he says could have been caused by a *lathi* or the butt-end of a gun. He speaks also of one Monghe, a female coolie, of the Baluchera garden who had congestion of blood at several places all over her body, probably caused by innumerable *lathi* blows.

On the face of such materials available is any man justified in saying, as Sir Henry Wheeler has said, that no bayonets were used, none of the wounds was severe and that there were sufficient proofs that serious injuries had never occurred? On these facts I beg to draw the attention of the House to the question raised by me as to whether there is or not ample room and necessity for an inquiry into the fact of bayonets having been used. In this connection I may, in passing, draw the attention of the House to the attitude of my hon'ble friend, Mr. Watson-Smyth. He exclaimed in the course of his speech to support the burking of the proposed inquiry "What was done?" "After all there was no great harm done and *nobody was killed!*" In his anxiety to oppose the inquiry and shut out the light he has out-Heroded Herod himself by laying down that there was nothing serious in the matter as no life was lost. I thank him very much for his great and kind appreciation of the value of the life of a native, and I also thank him, on behalf of the coolies maimed and pierced, for his implied promise to take notice in future of any such incident in which coolies may be maimed or pierced to actual death and that by the dozens.

The next point that Sir Henry Wheeler has dealt with is the *question of calling in the Gurkhas*. He has said that there were only 70 policemen under the control of Mr. De of whom 22 only were armed. I am surprised at this statement for I am sure that at Chittagong alone there is a very large number of Reserve Police Constables not to speak

of a similar number in Comilla itself This fact, I again say, requires an inquiry. Then Sir Henry Wheeler suggests that those 50 Gurkhas armed with bayonets were called in (I quote his language) *to cope with* the coolies. To cope with the coolies is to my mind a ridiculous and a preposterous expression. Assuming that there were 3,000 coolies or least half of whom, if not more, were women and children, and to quote the words of that noble-hearted Englishman, the Most Reverend the Bishop of Assam who himself carried the cholera-stricken coolies and whose yet nobler wife tried by her devoted nursing to keep them away from death—he, that strong son of God and servant of Christ, has said "the coolies of whom many were well, many more sick, many more quite emaciated"—this formidable army of 3,000 coolies, men women and children, sick and emaciated, frail and miserable, was no doubt a very redoubtable set of people to cope with It is a shame to conceive an idea of this description and to bring down Gurkha soldiers to give them a charge at midnight I am sure, Sir, that since the days of Balaclava and Lord Raglan, and the famous charge of the Light Brigade, there has never been, in the history of the British arms, such a brilliant charge as that of the Gurkha Brigade on these valiant coolies Sir, it has been said by Sir Henry Wheeler in his own report that only two companies of Gurkha soldiers, each consisting of eight to ten were employed for the purpose of making this charge and his distinct statement is that the rest did not take part In this circumstance, I would leave it to this hon'ble House to imagine for themselves if any case has been made out for calling in the Gurkhas, or, if it has been proved to their satisfaction that in the districts of Chittagong and Comilla, there were not more than 22 armed police constables available It is admitted after all on the question of the forceful opposition rendered by the coolies that the Gurkhas snatched their *lathis* away and hit them and their bundles with their own *lathis* It is further admitted by the Hon'ble Member that the whole of the opposition of these forceful and formidable coolies was completely overcome in the course of a few minutes by 16 to 20 Gurkhas *What a tremendous opposition to cope with?* The question that now arises with greater force after the reply of the Hon'ble Member, is whether this plea of the alleged insufficiency of the local armed police was true or whether the Gurkha soldiers were deliberately called in for quick and intensified action Regard being had to the heart-felt appreciation of the glorious victory achieved by the valiant Gurkhas over their redoubtable cooly opponents (men, women, children and their luggage), I should not be surprised if a supplementary budget be placed in the next Council for erecting a Victory Memorial at———

At this stage, the member reached the time-limit

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: May I be permitted to finish this sentence?

The PRESIDENT: I cannot allow you to do so.

At this stage as Babu Jatindra Nath Basu who was called upon to reply was absent, the President called upon the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler to speak.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: May I rise to a point of order? Is the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler entitled to speak again?

The PRESIDENT: Yes, under rule 41

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: Have I not the right of reply?

The PRESIDENT: I have treated all the motions except No. 45, as amendments to No. 42. Therefore, the Rai Bahadur has no right of reply. The movers of Nos. 42 and 45 had the right of reply.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: I do not propose to follow Babu Surendra Nath Mullick into the personal attacks on myself which he has seen fit to introduce in his speech. I will only refer to the two remarks in particular to which he has taken such grave exception, namely, firstly, that I should have said that the general tone of the speeches delivered in this Chamber indicated rather a desire for condemnation than a wish for an inquiry. It is true that I made that remark, and I maintain that it was justified. In fact it has been admitted by more than one speaker that there has been an inquiry, that we know sufficiently well what happened, and as one speaker has even said, that there is nobody in this Council who is not agreed that the officials were all in the wrong. In the face of all that I maintain that I was merely speaking with accuracy.

Secondly, Babu Surendra Nath Mullick has complained that I should have said that the campaign of exaggeration which was started in connection with this incident has culminated in this request for an inquiry. But, on Friday, I gave lengthy details to the Council of what exaggerations and misrepresentations had actually been put about, and I supported my contention with quotations of chapter and verse. We have seen the effect of that campaign reflected in many of the speeches that we have heard during these two days, namely, that it is argued that there must have been *some* basis for these appalling charges that have been made. Nay, further, Babu Surendra Nath Mullick in spite of all that has been explained, would still apparently repeat that many of them were true. In that sense, I again maintain that the campaign of calumny, which was started in so many quarters the moment this incident occurred, has met with success in so far as it has misled the minds of many.

I have already dealt with this matter at length. I have endeavoured to picture the atmosphere which was created immediately after the occurrence; and I have endeavoured to state in clear language what seemed to me to be a fair and simple account of what really happened,

bringing it down from the realms of rhetoric and oratory to a plain statement of fact. I have dealt with most of the leading points that were brought forward. I have endeavoured to explain why the military police were brought in on the night of the 20th, namely, for the reason that looking to the size of the crowd of coolies the authorities had to deal with, and looking to their behaviour on the night of the 19th, it was apprehended (and not unreasonably) by the local officers that they had not sufficient men to undertake definite action against the crowd in order to move them from the station premises. We have been told by Professor Mukherji that there was no evidence that the police on the 19th failed to preserve order, but surely when you have the subdivisional officer having to run in the face of an unruly crowd armed with *lathis*, to take refuge in a flat and to draw up the gangway in order to ensure his protection, it can scarcely be said that what an ordinary man would call peace and order prevailed.

Then, again, I have dealt with the matter why action was taken at night instead of being deferred till the next morning—a matter which, I am quite aware, has been viewed with some concern by many. But perhaps, I failed on Friday to emphasise a point which is worth remembering, and that is the somewhat peculiar train arrangements that obtain at Chandpur. The two boats that come from Narainganj and Goalundo come in in the evening somewhere in the neighbourhood of 9 o'clock, after which two trains are despatched—one to Chittagong, leaving at 21-35 hours, and the other to Assam, leaving at about 20-40. From the other direction a slow train comes in just a little after midnight, and the Chittagong mail and the Assam mail at about 4 o'clock in the morning. The traffic of the station is, therefore, conducted during the night. The boats which bring in the mails from Narainganj and Goalundo at about 9 o'clock have to wait there all night to take away the mail at 5 o'clock the next morning. The risk, therefore, of disorder at the station and of the rushing of the boats, which had actually occurred on the previous night, existed during the night hours and not during the day, and it was largely in the fear of a repetition of the incidents of the 19th that the authorities decided, in the course of the 20th that, as soon as the forces at their disposal were sufficient, it was essential that they should move the coolies away from the station.

I have dealt further with the story of the water-logged football ground and also with the legend of the lights. I have dealt at much length—and that apparently to little purpose—with the question of the wounds. We are still again told by Babu Surendra Nath Mullick that the wounds were numerous and serious, despite the evidence I have given that the first story of hundreds of wounds, etc., came down at my inspection to the production of 16 men bearing injuries of the character which I have described in my report. I admit that there were statements on the other side. If you believe half the things that have appeared in the newspapers, if you believe one-tenth of the things that have been

alleged in speeches, you will believe that men were killed others drowned, and babies trampled upon. I can only quote the evidence in support of my view and press that, when I made an inspection ten days after the incident, at a time when it was known that I desired to see anybody who had been wounded, not more than sixteen injuries could be shown to me and the stories of drowning and killing were abandoned. It has particularly aroused the anger of Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray that I should describe that it was difficult for a small statured Gurkha to inflict with a bayonet a small superficial wound on the top of the head of a fairly tall man, and he has asked whether I considered the possibility that the man was sitting or lying on the ground. I did consider that contingency, but the wound was about half an inch deep and an inch long, had there been a lunge with a bayonet at the head of a man on the ground one would rather have expected to have found the skull split. The same applies to the case of the abrasion on the eye of a girl of about eight years, unless these "rough and brutal" Gurkhas can handle their bayonets with the dexterity of a surgeon using a lancet in an operation, it is not possible that they could have driven a bayonet into this child's eye, and for her to have appeared before me after ten days with the wound practically cured and the eye clear and intact. It is noticeable that in the report of the non-official committee which has appeared in the newspapers to-day only three specific cases of bayonet wounds are alleged.

So much for the points with which I have dealt before and as there are a few points which, I find, I did not mention, I will run over them, lest it be said that I have no answer available.

I have been asked why Government *changed* its policy about repatriation? It has been argued that Mr. De, Mr. Wares and Mr. Sinha must have acted originally with our authority in repatriating the first batch of coolies, and it is therefore surmised that some change came over us, which, it is argued, must have been due to the malign influence of Mr. Macpherson. May I repeat that Mr. De and the local officials *did* act at first entirely on their own authority, and that we never heard of the action they had taken until it was an accomplished fact, as soon as we did hear we issued orders to the effect that we were unable to accede to a policy of repatriation at the cost of Government.

Another point in that connection on which stress has been laid is why was Mr. Macpherson allowed to go to Chandpur? It seems to me to be rather overlooked that there were two sides to the question. Assuming that it was a labour dispute, there was the case of the employer and there was the case of the employed. Mr. Macpherson was representing the case of the employers, and I can see nothing strange in that, on behalf of those whom he represented, he should want to go to Chandpur himself to see what was happening. He went there neither under the direction nor with the sanction of Government, because whatever view may be held in some quarters as to our directions to the steamer company

in the matter of the issue of free passages, we really cannot prevent a European going to Sealdah and taking a ticket for Chandpur if he wishes to do so.

Further, it has been asked why was Mr. Macpherson at the station on the evening of the 19th? Since I returned from Darjeeling, I had the advantage of seeing Mr. Macpherson—a gentleman whom I had never seen before. He told me that when the row broke out at the station Mr. Rope came to the Subdivisional Officer's bungalow and asked for assistance. He along with two other gentlemen went merely as public-spirited citizens to help in restoring order. That is the simple explanation of his presence on that night. He was there for the laudable purpose of trying to help in restoring order at a place where trouble and disorder were in progress.

The last point, although I have already alluded to it in my original report, is why was nothing done to help the wounded on the night of the 20th? The reason was, as given in my report, that the authorities were not aware that injuries of a serious kind had been inflicted, and neither were medical facilities available at night. Next morning they did what they could in sending to inquire about the wounded, but every obstacle was placed by the non-co-operation party in the way of their attending to the wounded or giving any help in the matter.

I think that sums up the main detailed points which have been touched upon in the course of this debate. But I would like to invite the attention of the Council to certain rather sweeping general propositions to which various speakers have sought to commit us in the consideration of this matter. They seem to me to be propositions which go rather far, and which, when stated in cold blood, might have somewhat far-reaching consequences. Apparently I quite recognise that the majority of the Council is against me in this matter, but apparently it is held that if in the course of a labour dispute any body of men go to a railway station and say they will remain there until they are taken to their homes, it is the duty of the Government to pay their fares. That seems to me to be a curious proposition. It has been also argued that if the same body of men decline to move, no action is to be taken to make them do so. Now, this has been argued about Chandpur. Chandpur is a long way from Calcutta and in a part of the province which, in some quarters, possibly, is regarded as somewhat backward. But supposing the same thing took place at Howrah. Howrah is an airy well ventilated place, much better probably than the habitations of many of the outside labourers who work in Calcutta: suppose a large number of labourers were to go down to Howrah and squat there.

[At this stage the Hon'ble Member reached the time-limit.]

The PRESIDENT: I allow you to go on.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: Is Sir Henry Wheeler to be allowed to go on?

The PRESIDENT: I have allowed him to go on

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: Thank you, Sir.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: Suppose everybody who wanted to go to his railway carriage had to walk between lines of police to get there. We can easily imagine what sort of outcry would be raised, and the tenure of office of the Commissioner of Police, or whatever official could not manage to move those men away, would be decidedly precarious.

The next proposition is apparently that if officials charged with responsibility for the peace and good order of the district attempt to move such men, they are to be stigmatised as criminals and demands are to be made in this Council for what has been described as their "condign punishment." Is that the proposition that is to be known to all in this province as finding favour in the eyes of this Council?

We have had other curious theories propounded. As I have already mentioned, we have it laid down that in a dispute between labour and capital, although the labourers may be under influences of various undesirable kinds, yet on the side of the employer nobody is to approach them: they are merely to be let alone. Then we are told that if the conduct of an official is called in question it shows a "lack of statesmanship" for an inquiry to be made by the officials to whom he is responsible. Indeed, if we are to meet the wishes of Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray, it is intolerable that any attempt should be made on the part of an official to defend that conduct. I am told that my report, which merely pretended to be a straightforward and simple statement of fact, far from allaying public anxiety has inflamed the public mind. I hesitate to believe that a plain statement of fact would have that result even in this province.

I again urge upon the Council that they should endeavour to view this matter in a reasonable aspect free from the prejudices and misrepresentations that have sprung up around it. I further ask them to endeavour to look at it partly from the point of view of the officials. It is no pleasant task for any man to have to restore law and order in his district. It is not a pleasant task for any man to be asked to deal with the situation that arose in Chandpur. We believe and we have given reasons for our belief, that our officials endeavoured to deal with the situation in a reasonable manner, and in doing so they took a certain amount of responsibility for the acts they did. Officials, like other people, can be divided into three kinds. There is a minority of sufficient strength of mind and character to be willing to take responsibility under any circumstances; there is a minority of sufficient weakness of character and lack of strength of mind to take responsibility under no circumstances; and there is the majority which, assisted and supported by a sense of discipline and the fine traditions of public service, and relying on fair and reasonable treatment at the hands of those who have to judge them,

will in an emergency take responsibility upon themselves. But there can be nothing more destructive to the morale of that majority if they are to act in fear of being stigmatised as criminals, as has been the case more than once in the course of this debate.

The PRESIDENT: I think, first of all, I ought to say that there has been only one speaker on the Government side and, therefore, I thought it my duty to give the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler all the opportunity he wanted to place the views of the Government before the House. I now come to the question of votes. What I propose to do is this: resolution No. 45 is different from the rest. I will therefore deal with Nos. 42, 43, 44, 46, 47 and 48 together. These involve three main points and it would be desirable and convenient to divide them into these three points which would be put to the Council separately one by one. The first point is whether there should be a committee. The next is what should the constitution of that committee be, and the third point is the terms of reference to the committee.

I now put the first point to vote:—

"This council recommends to the Government that a committee be appointed to inquire into the Chandpur affair."

Those who are in favour of the appointment of a committee will say "Aye" those who are against it will say "No."

A division was then taken with the following result:—

AYES.

Addy, Babu Amulya Dhone.
Ahmed, Maulvi Azaharuddin.
Ahmed, Maulvi Rafi Uddin.
Ahmed, Munshi Jafar.
Aley, Shaikh Mahboob.
Arhamuddin, Maulvi Khandakar.
Bhattacharji, Babu Hem Chandra.
Charmakar, Babu Rasik Chandra.
Chaudhuri, Babu Kishori Mohan.
Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Hafizar Rahman.
Chaudhuri, Rai Harendranath.
Chaudhuri, Sir Ashutosh.
De, Babu Fanindralal.
Dutt, Rai Bahadur Dr. Haridhan.
Dutta, Babu Annada Charan.
Dutta, Babu Indu Bhushan.
Janah, Babu Sarat Chandra.
Karim, Maulvi Fazlal.
Khan, Maulvi Md. Rafiqua Uddin.
Khan, Mr. Razaur Rahman.
Makramali, Munshi.
Mitra, Rai Bahadur Mahendra Chandra.
Mukharji, Babu Satish Chandra.
Mukhopadhaya, Babu Sarat Chandra.
Mullick, Babu Surendra Nath.
Nakey, Mirza Muhammad Ali.
Nasker, Babu Hem Chandra.
Pahlowan, Maulvi Md. Abdul Jubbar.
Pal, Rai Bahadur Radha Charan.
Ray, Babu Bhabendra Chandra.
Ray, Babu Surendra Nath.
Ray, Kumar Shib Shekhareswar.
Ray Chaudhuri, Mr. Krishna Chandra.
Roy, Babu Jogendra Nath.
Roy, Babu Nalini Nath.
Roy, Mr. Tarit Bhusan.
Roy Chaudhuri, Babu Sailaja Nath.
Sarkar, Babu Rishindra Nath.
Sinha, Babu Surendra Narayan.
Suhrawardy, Dr. A.

NOES.

Ahmed, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Wasimuddin.
Ahmed, Maulvi Yakuinuddin.
Azam, Khan Bahadur Khwaja Mahamed.
Banerjea, the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath.
Bartan, Mr. H.
Beadel, Mr. C. F.
Birley, Mr. L.
Bompas, Mr. C. N.

Bose, Mr. S. M.
Chaudhari, Babu Tankanath.
Chaudhuri, Maulvi Shah Muhammad.
Chaudhuri, the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali, Khan Bahadur.
Cochran, Mr. A.
Currie Mr. W. C.
Das, Babu Bhishmadev.
Das, Rai Bahadur Amar Nath.
Das Gupta, Babu Nibaran Chandra.
Dey, Mr. C. C.
Donald, Mr. J.
Faroqui, K. G. M.
Chatak, Rai Sahib Nilmani.
Ghose, Mr. D. C.
Ghose, Rai Bahadur Jogendra Chunder.
Gupta, Mr. N. B.
Haq Maulvi A. K. Fazl-ul.
Hopkyns, Mr. W. S.
Hornell, Mr. W. W.
Huq, Maulvi Ekramul.
James, Mr. R. H. L. Langford.
Kerr, the Hon'ble Mr. J. H
Khan, Babu Davendra Lal.
Lang, Mr. J.
Larmour, Mr. F. A.
Lees, Mr. D. N.
Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan, the Hon'ble.
Marr, Mr. A.
McKenzie, Mr. D. P.
Mitter, the Hon'ble Mr. P. C.
Mukherjee, Babu Nitya Dhan.
Mukherji, Professor S. C.
O'Kinealy Lt.-Col. Frederick.
O'Malley, Mr. L. S. S.
Payne, Mr. C. F.
Raheem, Mr. Abdur.
Rahim, the Hon'ble Sir Abdur.
Ray Chaudhury, Raja Manmatha Nath.
Roy, Maharaja Bahadur Kshaunish Chandra.
Roy, Mr. J. E.
Roy, Raja Manilall Singh.
Stark, Mr. H. A.
Suhrawardy Dr. Hassan.
Suhrawardy, Mr. H. S.
Watson-Smyth, Mr R. M.
Wheeler, the Hon'ble Sir Henry.
Wordsworth, Mr. W. C.

The Ayes being 40 and the Noes 55, the motion was lost

The PRESIDENT: The first motion being lost, the other connected motions also fail. I will now put No. 45 which runs as follows

"This Council recommends to the Government that such action be taken as regards the conduct of the local officials in the matter of the evacument of the coolies and their families from the station at Chandpur on the 20th May, 1921, as will prevent the recurrence of similar incidents."

The motion was agreed to

Scarcity in Khulna.

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: "This Council recommends to the Government that they be pleased to take the necessary steps for supplementing the efforts of the Local Relief Committees with a view to mitigating the distress caused by the prevailing scarcity in Khulna."

Sir, the resolution which I have moved is a non-political and non-controversial one. It is a resolution which voices the demand of the people for co-operation in the noble work of relieving the distress of starving humanity and I feel sure the Government in both branches of diarchy will come forward with outstretched hands of sympathy, fellow-feeling and co-operation with my countrymen. That there is an acute distress is admitted on all hands. Leaders of public opinion, representatives of the people, men who have no bias against the Government, men who are profoundly moderate in their views and expressions, men living and moving with the people in destitution and hailing from the

heart of the districts have borne testimony to the distress that is prevailing there and have demanded larger and more active co-operation for the alleviation of the misery. Men like Sir P. C. Roy, Rai Amrita Lal Bahadur—President and Vice President of the District and Local Board—active co-operators in public welfare assembled in public meetings and in public appeals have emphasised the need of a more liberal policy in dealing with the Khulna distress. I hold in my hand a statement which shows that an area covering about nearly 550 square miles in Khulna consisting of 300 villages is very badly affected. This area lies within the jurisdiction of the police-stations Bigacha, Ashapur, Shamsagar Magura in the Satkhira subdivision. The population of the affected area is nearly 400,000, of which 200,000 are badly affected. The devastating cyclone in the month of October 1919 was mainly responsible for the famine. It altogether ruined the country. Moreover the cyclone was attended with tidal waves which, overflowing embankments, entered the fields and deposited large layers of salt on the soil. The failure of crops in 1920 was due to insufficient rainfall. The people made three successive attempts for growing crops, but were baffled in their endeavours to produce them on account of the deposit of salt. Seedlings failed to germinate. The result was that the famine, which set in 1919, increased in 1920. I am informed that there were deaths from starvation in the village of Gopura within the police-station of Kaliganj which were known to the district authorities. Relief was given at the time by the District Board and Government. Since 1920 the distress is gradually growing in intensity and acuteness, and a vigorous policy of relief and succour is urgently needed. The public have organised relief committees and have been granting relief to the extent of Rs. 20,000 or more. I understand from the reports received from local centres that they are not able to supply more than one seer of rice to each individual for a week and which amounts to about a little more than a chittack per diem. The result is that those unfortunate people have to go without rice for half a week. The District Board has made a free distribution of 180 maunds of rice and sold 84 maunds at Rs. 2 per maund and Government, I am told, has advanced a *takavi* loan of Rs. 20,000 at the rate of Rs. 10 to each man. This loan, as I understand, is being issued to those who have agricultural lands, but those who are landless are left to starve and to die. Even this loan which is given for the purpose of cultivation is defrayed to the purchase of rice to satisfy the grievances of hunger. I believe, therefore, that an advance has been or will be made but this sum is quite inadequate and will not help those who are not in possession of land. Some very heart-rending description is coming from the people ministering to the wants of the distressed. It is stated that they are so poor and impoverished that they are unable to cover nudity, that they are living on dried fruits and leaves and the disease concomitant to starvation are carrying many helpless people to their untimely graves.

I now turn to the official version as published in the *communiqué*. It has been admitted that there was a failure of crops in 1919-20, but it makes the amazing statement that, but for fruits, milk and fish, there would have been starvation. Surely, Sir, Khulna is an enviable place to live in. With delicious food, live fish and cream milk it affords a great temptation to the people in other parts of the presidency. It is a delightful place to live in as the elysium of Bengal. Our country is called *Sonar Bangla*. We have not seen it in our life time. It is a sort of mythology to us, but it seems that according to description given in the *communique*, all the glories of the *Sonar Bangla* are still retained in some central place in the province. We are told however that no fruits worth the name can be had in the affected areas and cocoanut trees, the fruits of which supply nourishment to the people, cannot be had in the affected parts. There may be a few date trees, but people cannot live on date fruits. There is plenty of fish and some of the fish preserved are zamindari properties and it is not available to the public at large. As regards milk there are very few cows in the affected areas. Agriculturists have sold their cows to buy rice and no milk can be had for the poor people. If milk can be had for the asking as the Collector has put it, may I ask how is it that the Collector himself purchased a thousand bottles of Horlick's Milk for the preservation of children? To add to the misery of the people, milch cows were washed away by the cyclone of 1919. I would therefore respectfully submit this Sir, for the consideration of Government and, I am sure, that help will be forthcoming to render more liberal *taluvi* loan for the purchase of cattle and seed, secondly, gratuitous distribution of food and cloth in co-operation with local charities, thirdly, medical relief in which, I am sure, our popular Minister in charge of Public Health is foremost, fourthly, the construction of huts for shelter of the homeless, and fifthly, embankments to shut out salt water. In conclusion, I desire to say that here is a work of mercy and humanity in which the people are clamouring for Government co-operation. We have got responsible government partly conducted by the representatives of the people and partly by the bureaucracy. I do not know whether the famine is a transferred subject and whether it is administered by our Ministers or by a Member of the bureaucracy. I am not sure in whose hands this subject is and if it is a reserved subject and is in the hands of the Hon'ble Member who is not the elect of the people, I am sure, Members of Government, to whichever department of administration they may belong to, are all animated with a single-minded desire to serve the people, to alleviate their distress and to promote their well-being. Co-operation should be our watchword.

Maulvi A. K. FAZL-UL HAQ: I rise to say a few words in support of this resolution. I have been to some parts of the district and I have personally seen the distress that is prevailing there in many parts of

the affected areas. It is true that relief measures have been started by organisation in the district and some relief is being given by Government, but with all that, the relief that is being given is quite inadequate. There are two ways to my mind in which Government may help the people of this district. First, by giving some grant from provincial revenues and, if that is not possible or if sufficient money be not forthcoming, Government may organize relief measures in a large scale just as was done during the cyclone of 1919. Sir, something ought to be done. The distress is really very acute and the efforts of private charity should be supplemented by grants, if possible, from provincial revenues.

With these few words, I beg to support this resolution.

Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: It is no doubt a happy sign of the times that a representative of the metropolis has been pleased to move for the relief of the Khulna distress—a mufassal misfortune. It is also a matter of satisfaction to me that Khulna has after all attracted the attention of the representatives and of the Government of Bengal.

One of my very first questions, Sir, in this Council, asked at the meeting of the 7th February last, was as to the districts in which there has been a partial failure of crops. My object was, of course, to elicit information about Khulna and to know how far the Government was aware of the true state of things in the interior of this province. But although the Government was pleased to name five districts only in which it was admitted there has been a partial failure of the rice crops, yet the name of Khulna was not even mentioned in the said reply. I failed in my object then, but now the Government naively admits in its *communique* that in the Khulna district the crops have failed not for this year only, but for two years.

Then again, Sir, in connection with my motion for the reduction of the Survey Settlement expenses this year, while I pleaded for the exclusion of Khulna I again endeavoured to draw the attention of the Government to this state of things in Khulna, but in vain, not one responsive echo did I hear, on the contrary my suggestion was criticised by a European member as a zamindar motion.

Now, however, the distress has become acute and come to a head, has attracted public attention and enlisted public sympathy in and outside the Council. The cry for relief has gone forth and it is estimated that about 200,000 people are in the throes of a famine.

In such circumstances what has the Government done, and what does it propose to do now with regard to the immediate future? All that it has done up to date towards relief is summed up in the *communiqué* thus:—

> The Commissioner of the Presidency Division in the latter part of April allotted Rs. 20,000 to Khulna District for the distribution of Agriculturists Loans. The Collector has asked for a further allotment of Rs. 20,000 and this has been given to him by Government.

The *communiqué*, however, does not say in what shape relief will be given by this latter sum and if it is also to be distributed as *takavi* loan. It is also silent on a very material point, viz., what does it propose to do with regard to the immediate future to enable these distressed people to keep their bodies and souls together in the coming months till the next harvest. After minimising the gravity of the situation, the Government of Bengal thinks it fit to leave the matter to private charity. To all further questions and appeals it has got one answer "See the *communiqué*."

But how has this *communiqué* been received? How far has it been able to allay the public anxiety and satisfy the public demand for help? Well, the Khulna Peoples' Association maintains in spite of it that there is starvation going on in the affected area and that the issue of such a *communiqué* will greatly hamper the works of relief? And if such were the views of the Khulna Peoples' Association with regard to the *communiqué*, Sir P. C. Roy referring to it is reported to have said he did not believe before that so many falsehoods could be crowded within the limits of a single document."

As regards the intensity and extensity of the prevailing distress reported in his appeal to the public, but in a way denied or at least unacknowledged by the Government *communiqué*, he is further reported to have said that "he had passed all his life in the chemical laboratory and measured things by chemical balance and made his calculations accurate to the fourth place of decimal. Was it to be expected of him that he would make a statement without fully knowing the matter."

After this only one question is possible. Is the country, or are its representatives in the Council, going to disbelieve Sir P. C. Roy, its scientist, its pride, one of its most accurate observers and sincerest workers? If not, should we be satisfied with the meagre help that has been given by the Government and its uncertain attitude about the future? If not, we can only insist upon a correct appreciation and recognition of the famine condition which is bound to grow in volume and intensity in course of every coming month and upon organisation of adequate relief measures till the next harvest.

With these words, I beg to support the resolution that has just been very ably moved by Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur.

Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ: I rise to support the motion. It is not necessary to make a long speech at this stage. We know that when there is distress in any Christian country in Europe other countries come to their help, but unfortunately we have no prospect of help from outside, and so in order to relieve the distress of our own men the slender means of our countrymen are taxed. It is meet and proper that Government should also liberally help in the matter.

Babu JOGENDRA NATH ROY: I have much pleasure in associating myself with the resolution before the Council. The famine in Khulna has assumed alarming proportions and independent inquiries made personally and through a co-worker by that eminent scientist Sir Prafulla Chandra Roy go to show how people are suffering. Sir Prafulla Chandra has even challenged the truth of the *communiqué* issued by the Government of Bengal. But we, in this Council, need not concern ourselves with that controversy. We take it that both the Government and Sir Prafulla Chandra want to alleviate the sufferings of the people in the famine-stricken area. The District Magistrate has admitted that private help is useful. It is to me a matter of surprise that this matter was not taken up more earnestly earlier. The grant made by the Government seems inadequate. And I hope Government will take further necessary steps to mitigate the distress caused by the prevailing famine in parts of the Khulna district.

Babu SAILAJA NATH ROY CHAUDHURI: I beg to support the resolution moved by Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur. I come from a place where the distress prevails and has been prevailing for more than a year. It is not a question whether the facts are exaggerated or suppressed. It is now a question of humanity. The high prices of all the necessaries of life made the people almost helpless. The last cyclone with a tidal wave and successive failure of crops for the last two years have only intensified their misery. I am thankful to the Government for the steps they have already taken. It has been stated in reply to my question that about 2,500 people have been reduced to abject poverty. The number is not insignificant, and what I want to press upon the attention of Government is that a sum of Rs. 20,000 can hardly provide the needs of 2,500 people. More money is needed to feed them till the next harvest. Arrangements must also have to be made for agricultural loans without which, I am afraid, they would not be able to grow their paddy. Then there is a scarcity of cloth to which mention has been made in the Government *communique*. Government admits that there is need of private charity. What I would ask the Government to do is to do their duty independently of private charity. Let the State save the people from starvation leaving their comforts to the generous public. With these words I commend the resolution to the acceptance of the House.

Adjournment.

The Council was then adjourned till 3 P.M., on Tuesday, the 12th July, 1921, at the Town Hall, Calcutta.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Council assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act.

THE Council met in the Council Chamber in the Town Hall, Calcutta, on Tuesday, the 12th July, 1921, at 3 P.M.

Present:

The Hon'ble the President, the Hon'ble the four Members of the Executive Council, the Hon'ble the three Ministers, and 97 nominated and elected members.

The PRESIDENT (the Hon'ble Nawab Sir Syed Shams-ul-Huda): Before proceeding to the business of the day, I wish to read to you a letter which I have received from His Excellency

"It has been brought to my notice that owing to the resignation by Mr. Rhodes of his seat in the Legislative Council, the Standing Committee attached to the Commerce and Marine Department is now without a representative of European commercial interests. I have accordingly decided to appoint Mr. W. C. Currie to the Committee in succession to Mr. Rhodes, and I shall be obliged if you will be so good as to communicate this appointment to the Legislative Council."

The discussion on the resolution relating to the scarcity in Khulna was resumed.

Scarcity in Khulna.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: I support this resolution but I am afraid it is of an indefinite kind. The Government may very well say "we shall make every endeavour." But as there is no better one, I must support this resolution. I am, with regard to this resolution, in a very unfortunate position. I happen to be one of the zamindars of the locality affected by this famine or distress. My name has been dragged in public meetings and newspapers in this connection. So, I stand as an accused. For the last two years, there has been a partial failure of crops in that part of the country. I own there only 60 mouzas. Fortunately, most of them are in *Patni*. This year I did not realise about Rs. 30,000, indeed the whole of my rental from that zamindari, but I had to pay the Government revenue from my own pocket and the road cess still remains to be paid. This is the lot of most zamindars of Khulna this year.

There has been no famine but a great distress. The able-bodied men are not badly off because they earn a good living by cutting wood in the Sunderbans forest; old men, women and children are certainly in want

because there has been a failure of the crops. We are thankful to the generous public who have helped us and are trying to help us but we, zamindars, can only do what lies in our power. From one mouza of mine alone about Rs. 300 has been asked by the tenants as an advance. Now you can just imagine what a large amount of money I shall have to advance. Where is the money to come from? What am I to do? But the philanthropists should remember that this is the time of stress. Money, if at all advanced, should be advanced within a week because crops failed last year. Tenants want money for meeting the expenses of cultivation and unless they get the advance within a week they would not be able to cultivate their lands. I am fully conscious of that fact and I hope those gentlemen who wish to help us and the Government should bear this fact in mind, that whatever they do must be done promptly, say, within a fortnight at the most. I have told you our difficulties. I keenly feel the humiliation of zamindars that other people should come forward and say "we are holding public meetings to help your tenants." Really I am not at all pleased but what is to be done?

There is another matter in this connection which I must mention. The land on both sides of the river Kapatakhi has been subject to chronic failures of crops. On the banks of this river, celebrated in the poems of our greatest Bengali poet Michael Madhusudhan Dutt, are many historical places. There is Pratapnagar founded by, and named after, Pratapaditya and there is another village Kalyanpur, named after his son Kalyan, both within my zamindari. These historical places were once lands overflowing with milk and honey. The crops never failed there because Kapatakhi had sweet water, but the upper reaches of it have dried up. Now Kapatakhi has become a salt water river. What I say is that an advance of Rs. 20,000 or so this year or the next will not help us, unless we can make sweet water flow in Kapatakhi as in the past years, the case is a hopeless one. The upper reaches of the Bhairab, of which Kapatakhi is a branch, should be cleared and the beds of Bhairab and Kapatakhi should be dredged, and should be so dredged that Kapatakhi might again have sweet water. The word Kapatakhi means the river with clear and limpid water like the eyes of a pigeon. I do hope that it will again be the same beautiful river as described by Michael Madhusudhan Dutt with clear and limpid water. I therefore press upon Government to take this matter up not only in its present aspect but also to look to the future.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: I am extremely sorry to find that a representative zamindar should oppose a resolution of this kind.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: Who opposed it? I did not.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: I beg his pardon. I could not hear him distinctly. I thought he had opposed it. It seems strange that it should be necessary to have to move a resolution in this Council

to open the eyes of Government to the necessity of relieving distress. The primary duty of the Government is to protect life and property, and I cannot understand why the Government should take such a callous attitude where the life of even a single person may be in danger of being jeopardised on account of the distress, now prevailing in Khulna. I have not a personal knowledge of the place but it is not necessary to have a personal knowledge in view of the statements made by Sir P. C. Roy—than whom I do not know a better lover of the country. I cannot understand the attitude taken up by the District Magistrate of Khulna in this matter. I confess, Sir, that when I read the description of the distressed area of Khulna in the Government *communique*, when I read that there were plenty of fruits to be had and that the fish were dying to be caught, so to say, and milk could be had for the mere asking, I opened my eyes in wonder and thought whether the promised land of the Bible had arrived at last, and whether the land flowing with milk and honey had appeared in Khulna; and I felt tempted to become a tenant of my friend Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur. I cannot understand why the District Magistrate should have taken the trouble of describing the condition of this district in such glowing terms. Was his prestige at stake that he had to belittle the distress and announce to the world that all was well with his district? What sort of prestige is this that runs roughshod over truth, for the truth of his statements has been seriously challenged and severely condemned by a great lover of truth like Sir P. C. Roy? The whole country knows whose statement to believe, Sir P. C. Roy's or that of the author of the official statement? Where is that prestige of the District Magistrate now, which he was probably so anxious to show to an admiring world? How long shall we have to go on telling the Government that the days of false prestige are no more? Facts have to be faced bravely and manfully. It does nobody any good to shrink from the truth, with the Reforms, let us kill the old fetish of false prestige.

It is not as if the Government had no notice of the distress that was going to occur in Khulna. My revered friend and leader, Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri, asked some questions on the 1st of April regarding the failure of the rice crops in Khulna and suggesting the desirability of taking relief measures. How did Government meet his question? Did it meet it in the right spirit of making suitable arrangements for a difficult situation? The reply to Kishori Babu's question was of the same stereotyped nature. The Government admitted that there had been a failure of crops in certain areas but that the average outturn for the whole district was 92 per cent. Average returns, printed in statistical reports, look very pretty, but they do not save the lives of the people, whose crops have failed. I ask this Council in all seriousness, are questions and answers in this Council to be at eternal loggerheads—questions being regarded as attempts made by members to find fault with the Government and replies being given as a sort of counter stroke?

I ask the Government to put more heart in the administration. The heart of the people is in the right place. Let the Government have the heart to recognise it and all will be well. I believe that there is a large amount of money in the famine fund and that most of it was put in the famine insurance fund, believing that there would be no necessity for utilising it during the current year, but in view of the great distress, which no doubt prevails in this district, may I suggest to the Government that some part of this fund may, at least now, be utilised for this noble and benevolent purpose?

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: I rise to support the resolution. My excuse for asking a question, which was answered on the 1st April, was that I had some knowledge of the mufassal life and I know what failure of crops for two years means. In my district, some years ago, we had similar difficulties and we saw that Government had got a peculiar idea of the difference between privation and starvation. In that idea Government is rather slow to accept the famine condition and declare famine at once. It was for this reason that I put a question and my friend Mr. Lang took me to task for giving him the trouble because in reply, I was told that the needful could be done by the District Board. Now I see that there is great distress there, though the Magistrate reports no doubt that there is abundance of fruit, fish and milk. How that could be accepted by Government, I do not know. The Calcutta market might have been benefited though we poor consumers could not avail ourselves of the existence of any abundance in the Khulna district. At least I could not believe that there could be any such abundance there. Even if it be the case, that is not within the reach of all. It is admitted by the Magistrate that there is real distress and the public are asked to help the local relief committees. The Collector has asked for a further allotment. There was an allotment of Rs. 20,000 for granting agricultural loans. The Government of Bengal hoped that by these means the real needs of the affected area would be supplied but subsequently it was stated that private charity was required to supplement the official action. The Government of Bengal consider that the appeal for help will meet with a generous response. Sir P. C. Roy has stated somewhere that the help which has been given from outside in response to his appeal will not be sufficient to relieve adequately the people in the affected area. I cannot understand why Government should not come forward for the relief of the distressed, when Dr. Roy and others have called for subscriptions. The object of the fund is not only to give relief when famine is declared but to do something for its prevention in future years. When there is distress, why should Government think that granting of agricultural loans is enough? It does not reach the needy. It is a pity that Government should accept such a report from the District Officer and base their *communiqué* upon it. Now Sir P. C. Roy brings forward

charge that there is starvation and the Government *communiqué* is full of misstatements. I think that there should be a thorough inquiry whether Sir P. C Roy is exaggerating or speaking lies or whether the District Magistrate reported the matter without making a full inquiry. This is the situation There is money in the famine fund. It is now a local question, being no longer in the hands of the Government of India We have got money and in the beginning of the year we were told that there was no need for it and, therefore, the money should go to the insurance fund. This year even in the supplementary budget we do not see any proposal for any Government help being provided This is a state of things which is very deplorable and it does not speak well of the Government attitude. I hope that the necessary action would be taken without any delay and a substantial sum spent out of the famine fund now in our hands

Babu NIRODE BEHARY MULLICK: As a pleader practising in Khulna, I believe I can speak with some amount of first-hand information and knowledge on the resolution now before the House The broad facts with regard to Khulna famine are first, that an area of about 60 square miles has been affected and, secondly, the number of people affected by the famine will be, at a rough computation, somewhere between two and three lakhs Now the difficulty arises in this way We, on behalf of the people, assert that the famine stricken people have not got sufficient food to eat and sufficient clothes to wear Government, on the other hand while acknowledging that they have not got sufficient clothes to wear, maintain that they have sufficient food to eat, and in support of this contention Government say that in the affected locality they have fish, fruits and milk in abundance Now let me dissect this precious argument piece by piece First, let me take the case of fish It may be known to the Government that, owing to steamer communication, most of the fish comes to Calcutta, and that the places where fish abound are generally taken lease of every year by rich persons and rich traders, but supposing for the sake of argument that in the affected locality there is plenty of fish and fruits and in this case fruits are only dates of which only a small quantity can be taken— what difference does it make in the position Now, supposing that the people have taken to fish and fruits in exclusion of rice what will be the effect? They will continue to die of cholera and other diseases instead of famine The result would be that the portfolio of the Reserved Government will be transferred to a Minister under the popular Government Whether this change in the Government will gladden the hearts of the mal-governed, I cannot say

Now, let me take the case of milk In order to have milk, one must have a cow. In these days of scarcity, a person who has a cow selling at Rs. 30 or Rs 40, cannot be described as famine-stricken When we say that two lakhs of people are famine-stricken we surely

mean those who have no cows, but it may be that out of the two lakhs one or two persons may be in well-to-do circumstances and possess cows. In places like villages when a person in well-to-do circumstances has a cow, he generally gives the milk free and not for any price; if at all, it is only for two or three pice. Here is the explanation of how milk can be had for the mere asking.

Sir, I believe that the Khulna situation ought to have attracted a greater attention and sympathy at the hands of the Bengal Government. Khulna, I believe, belongs to Bengal, and I further take it that the people of the province ought to be the first consideration of the Government. Are we to believe that the Government, which generously took the responsibility of repatriating the coolies belonging to other provinces, cannot do justice to the people of the province, the custodian of whose purse they are? I, for one, have no faith in this kind of generosity at the cost of justice.

Sir, I believe I shall be failing in my duty if I do not claim to plead for the Collector of Khulna, who has been the target of unnecessary and ill-informed criticism. It is he who first constituted the Relief Committee, who visited the localities several times, who placed a special launch at the disposal of workers for relief at the time when the non co-operators called for unhappy and foolish strikes which caused not only unnecessary deaths at Chandpur but also gave additional trouble to the famine-stricken people of Khulna, but I feel certain that, in the circumstances, no argument could be put forward on behalf of the Government to the effect that a sum of Rs. 20,000, for the purpose of charity, is sufficient to meet the case of two lakhs of famine-stricken people.

With these words, I support the resolution.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: I must say that I am very glad to be able to support this resolution. The demand made in it is very modest and asks Government that the efforts of the local Relief Committee might be supplemented. We have been trying to raise funds for Khulna and we have been successful to a certain extent, but still, as the area over which this scarcity prevails is about (not as the Government figure shows 25 square miles) 66 square miles or so or even more, I think that there is enough room for us to approach the Government to help us in this hour of our distress. I had the honour of being present at a meeting where two gentlemen, who had been helping the people of the locality as well as Sir P. C. Roy, described to us, the state of affairs in the Satkhira subdivision in the north-western part of the district. We heard from him that there was very great scarcity.

There was another kind of trouble, so far as the young women are concerned. They could not get *saris* to cover themselves. This is the

state of hardship they are labouring under and regard being had to the high prices prevailing everywhere the community cannot meet all the cost, hence the necessity for helping them. I think that we shall be justified in approaching the Government and we do approach the Government humbly to help us in this matter.

I would only say this that I cannot believe the official version that there is enough of fruits, fish in abundance, and milk for the mere asking. The District Magistrate thinks that milk can be had for the mere asking. He forgets that it is for himself only and not for others. He has made a wrong inference altogether. He wanted it for his tea or something else and he got it——

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of REVENUE (LAND REVENUE) (the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan): May I rise to a point of order?

The PRESIDENT: I cannot say that he is out of order. He does not mean any attack personally against the District Magistrate.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: Sir, I am very sorry that I have hit upon the official mind of my esteemed countryman, the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja. I did not know that his power of imagination was so large that he would take offence to that degree.

The PRESIDENT: I do not think you need dwell on it.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: So far as my observations regarding the District Magistrate are concerned, I do not like to carry them further. One thing more which I wish to impress upon the Council is this—that these are the opportunities for the Government to associate themselves with the needs of the people and thus to make itself more popular.

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: The object of this resolution, as I understand it, is to draw the attention of the Government to the present prevailing scarcity in certain portions of the district of Khulna and the resolution, as worded, makes a recommendation to Government to supplement the efforts of the local Relief Committees with a view to mitigate the distress caused by the prevailing scarcity in Khulna. With this nobody can have the slightest objection, for the Government itself has admitted in the *communiqué* that partial scarcity does prevail in certain parts of Khulna. The mover of the resolution put down the area affected to be 550 square miles. Babu Nirode Behary Mullick, who comes from those parts, has taken the figure that we have put in the *communiqué*, namely, about 60 square miles, whereas, Babu Surendra Nath Mullick has said that although Government have stated 25 square miles which is not correct,

according to his information it is 66 square miles. That being so, I take it that, even according to Babu Surendra Nath Mullick, the area affected is not in any case larger than 66 square miles. Of course it is not with the question of area that we are concerned. What I take it is that the Council, as a whole, wishes to draw the attention of Government to the prevailing state of things in the affected portion of the Khulna district.

It is a welcome sign of the times that whereas it has always been the duty of Government to alleviate the distress of those suffering from famine and scarcity, that this Council should be alive to its responsibility in this direction, and from that point of view a discussion of this nature is welcome, but unfortunately, in every discussion nowadays in this Council, if there is a loop-hole in the Government *communique* or if there is an opportunity to raise the cudgels against the local officials, there are certain members in this Council who do not lose that opportunity to do so. With their mentality I have no quarrel, for I am thankful I am not of that mentality. I have been of course described as having become a dry-boned official. Well, Sir, one of the prime duties whether it be of a Government official or a member of the Council, one of the prime duties of a man, with any sense of responsibility, is not to prejudge a thing and not to denounce any particular Government official without hearing both sides of the question. The Rai Bahadur who introduced this resolution has mentioned in his speech that he has been informed - I hope he will correct me because when a discussion of this kind stands over for a day one is rather apt to forget several stages of the discussion of the previous day - or according to his information or information received by him, of cases of deaths from starvation. Now this may or may not be the truth. So far as official information goes - and I do not include in it the poor Collector who has come in for a great deal of abuse - this is not so. I shall read out extracts from the report of the Divisional Commissioner, who is present here, and we do not find in it this fact admitted. If, however, some of the members of the Council who have taken so much interest in the Khulna famine were to draw the attention of Government or the local officials to such cases, I should be much obliged to such members for any such authentic information. Now, as regards the resolution and as regards what has already been done, I shall be as brief as possible. In the first place, I should like to point out that whilst Government do not deny that there is partial scarcity in the district of Khulna, and whilst it is possible that where this partial scarcity prevails, there may be certain local areas where it might be of greater acuteness than in other parts, Government deprecate, and deprecate strongly, any attempt to spread alarmist reports for the reason that just now in front of us we have the rainy season; not only that but the information before Government goes to show that relief operations are well in hand, and that whatever requirements are necessary to cope with the situation are being met, partly by advances

from Government, partly by contributions from Government, and partly from the admirable efforts that have been made locally, especially by Sir P. C Roy. There has been the usual attempt to cry down the idea that Khulna is a land flowing with plenty of milk and honey; well, I hope that Khulna may soon flow again with its habitual plentiful milk and honey and that the partial scarcity that prevails there now may disappear when this year's crop is gathered, which I trust will be a bumper one. But what I feel about the discussion that has taken place on this resolution is this: Only that portion of the Government *communique*, which contains an extract from the report of the Collector in which he has had the hardihood to say that vegetable, fish and milk are to be had in plenty, only that portion of the *communique* seems to have received the attention of our critics here and one speaker went the length of saying that the attitude of Government had been an apathetic one and that to-night's debate would open their eyes. He, further, with his usual eloquence, stigmatised the report of the District Magistrate, and said that he (the Collector) must have mentioned this fact because he might have thought that his prestige was at stake. When local officers are attacked in season and out of season in this way, they may find it impossible to carry on the work of their districts; but I am perfectly certain that Mr Fawcus when he made this statement in his letter did so with the very best of motives, not with the motive described or ascribed to him by several of the members of this Council, particularly by the member on my left who seems to be smiling, but the Collector must have done so with the object to allay unnecessary alarm on the one hand and at the same time, to point out that, if in Khulna there were not to a certain extent the facilities of procuring these commodities of life, the condition then would have been more serious in the affected areas. I shall, before I mention what relief Government have given for this purpose, read out to you extracts from a letter, received by Government, dated the 4th July last, containing a fairly exhaustive report of inspection by the Commissioner of the Presidency Division. Mr Lang says in that report:

> I spent the last three days walking in some of the most severely affected unions in the Khulna district, namely, Ahmadia Pratapnagar and Jalalpur. I had the advantage of the company of the volunteer workers of the Khulna Sevasram who deserve credit for their selfless efforts in dispensing relief. They took me across the country from village to village trudging through mud and water and showed me cases which they deemed to be most pitiful. I saw no signs of starvation and to the best of my belief no loss of condition by reason of lack of food. I noticed a great want of clothes, and help in this direction is being properly afforded.

Mr Lang goes on to say, "I observed" and this portion of his report has, I find, been corroborated by Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur—

> I observed that there was an almost total absence of male adults among those in distress. They were almost all old women and women with children, many of

whose husbands have gone for a period to the reserved forests to cut wood who would perhaps return with their earnings after an interval.

I draw attention to this.

As it seems to me that the fact of fish, fruit and vegetable being found in plenty is like a red rag to some of the members here who have accused the Government of want of sympathy, and when the District Magistrate has been attacked so much for his mentioning that fact, I think it to be right and proper for me to read out what Mr. Lang says on that point:—

At present relief is being distributed by local volunteer agents according to lists already prepared. The measure of relief is at present only one-fourth a seer of rice a day which is of course quite inadequate if the recipients have nothing to supplement it, but that supplement they must, I think, have been taking- be it fish, fruit or vegetable

So here we have two officials who consider not that the relief was adequate, but mention that had it not been for fish, fruit or vegetable in the locality, the condition would have been worse. I would like the Council to consider this question of fish, fruit, vegetable and milk, or whatever it may be in that light, not in the light that Government put it in the *communique* simply to belittle the state of affairs there, but to put before the public that whilst scarcity did prevail, it would have been worse if these commodities were not available locally

Now, before I mention what action Government have taken, I think it only right and proper, as I do not find Sir P. C. Roy present here, nor have I had the pleasure of meeting him and discussing with him as to the exact words he said in the different meetings, that I cannot believe that Sir P. C. Roy, however much he may have been moved by the state of affairs prevailing in that portion of his native district, could have made some of the observations that have been ascribed to him by at least one local newspaper, because the prime motive of that newspaper was to enact a comedy of errors and to try to cry down my Hon'ble friend, Sir Surendra Nath, as it was thought that famine relief was under him; and this newspaper thought that it would be a good opportunity to fling this new accusation against Sir Surendra Nath. Well, so much for the accusation.

Now for the facts so far as they relate to monetary relief. In the *communique* it has been mentioned that Rs. 40,000 has been given for the purpose of agricultural loans. I understand that Rs. 20,000 of that amount has already been distributed, and the other Rs. 20,000 is in the course of distribution. Apart from that, Rs. 1,000 has been given for the distribution of cloth. After that we have received a letter from the Commissioner of the Presidency Division in which he says—

I have the honour to report that as the result of a meeting of the District Board Relief Committee last night the District Board have asked me to undertake to recoup their expenditure hereafter on gratuitous relief to the extent of Rs. 5,000.

In other words, the District Board asked Government to give them Rs. 5,000 for gratuitous relief. We have acceded to the request of the District Board and this amount has been paid. I may assure the Council that Government are fully alive to the situation, and we have the position, so far as our information goes, well in hand. We have also suspended the collection of Rs. 25,000 which was due this year for repayment of agriculturists loans issued after the cyclone. I shall welcome very much if some of the members of the Council, who have shown so much sympathy for the suffering in the Khulna district, will start a relief fund to which I, in my private capacity, will be delighted to contribute my humble mite. Further, if things do not improve, I propose myself to visit the area, and what is more, if the local officers recommend that more money is needed, Government will certainly not decline. What, however, I should like the members of the Council to bear in mind is this. There is a distinct difference not merely a technical one—between famine and scarcity. My friend from Rajshahi would seem to put famine and scarcity in the same category, but I am afraid I cannot go to that length without further investigation; but, considering all that we have done in this matter, I do not think that any member of the Council might apprehend that Government is likely to be callous over a matter of this nature. It is the prime duty of Government to relieve distress or suffering, especially of this nature, which is the basis of this resolution. I may assure you, Sir, and through you the members of this Council, that as I have already said, if necessary, I shall myself go and inspect the locality; I am here for that. When it is within my portfolio, it is my prime duty to do so. It might be asked why I have not yet done so. It is simply this: I do not want the people of the locality among whom there must be quite a number of professional beggars flocking in number, and at the same time there might be a general idea abroad that Government have declared famine. I shall do all that is necessary, and, what is more, to give further assurance to the Council, I have much pleasure in accepting this resolution.

Mr. J. LANG: As I have considerable experience of the affected areas, I rise to supplement the remarks of the Hon'ble Member. He has already quoted from my report, in which I have said that I have seen no signs of starvation or no signs of loss of condition from lack of food. I speak with considerable experience of famine as it fell to me to organize relief in the Rajputana Famine, and again in the Central India Famine. More recently there has been distress in my division which was of a greater magnitude than the distress at present in Khulna. But as no similar exaggerated reports regarding its acuteness were in circulation, probably no member of the Council, except those who belong to the district of Murshidabad, has ever heard of the famine in Murshidabad in 1919.

I know something of the history of Khulna. During the famine of 1897, when Khulna suffered exceedingly, the people were slow to go to

relief. The famine was carried through, so far as the distribution of gratuitous relief was concerned, at the extraordinary low rate of half a seer of rice a week distributed per head. I mention this, because the mover of the resolution said last night that the present rate of ration was absurdly low. So also I thought when I wrote my report which the Revenue Member has just quoted.'

But on reading what the present Home Member (Sir William Vincent) had recorded when he was District Officer of Khulna, I find that throughout the famine of 1897, the measure of gratuitous relief was half a seer of rice for adults, and a quarter of a seer for children per week, and that ration is only intelligible on the assumption that there were other kinds of supplementary food. We have heard much to-day and yesterday of Khulna as the land that is always flowing with milk and honey. The land veritably does flow with milk and honey. There are reserved forests where honey is abundant, and the adult males who have left their families at home have gone to the forests to gather it. We have heard much of milk and, incidentally, I may take exception to the remark made by a member of this Council that the Collector was only thinking of the milk that was given to him. I may tell this Council that I have travelled for some years in the Sunderbans and it has never been the practice to ask for fresh milk but always to depend on tinned milk procured from Calcutta.

I have with me the tour diary of the Collector in which he refers to this question of milk. He says:—

> I checked the list of recipients of charity—one does not wish to discourage the giving of charity in any way, but considering the fact that two of the recipients of relief were milking their cows—this charity, commendable as it is, cannot be held to be essential for preventing starvation.

We have heard much about fish and in the course of my trudging from village to village it is a fact that I constantly met children catching various kinds of fish in the pools and *jheels* which make excellent sustenance. It struck me at the time that the village of Pratapnagar which is the worst affected part in Khulna, was much in the same condition as Britain was during the war when people had to give up eating meat and resort to fish only. Now the people are giving up rice and are resorting to fish, the well-to-do people seem to think that the poorer people must on this account be dying of starvation. We also hear of people dying of starvation because they were emaciated. It is the experience that we have gained after years of famine relief which enables us to recognize at a glance, who is suffering from famine and who is emaciated on other grounds. If we inquire into the condition of the parents we find that the so-called "famine-stricken" are syphilitic or the adults have been suffering from other diseases and we generally find a satisfactory explanation other than famine as to why certain people in search of relief have an emaciated appearance.

I do not wish to rely entirely on what the District Officer says. One of our acrimonious critics after the cyclone, a local missionary, wrote the week before last as follows:—

I went to visit the villages where, it was said, the people were in great distress. We visited some eight villages in the course of two days, going on foot on an average of 3 to 4 miles each of the five times we were out. During that time we entered many houses and saw things for ourselves. After careful examination we both came to the conclusion that famine conditions did not prevail, although undoubtedly some were very poor. We were much impressed with the good physical condition of the people both old and young. The chief want was *sorts* for the women and water.

Sir P. C. Roy has said that the Government *communiqué* is filled with a pack of lies and he claims to be accurate by reason of his practice in calculating weights to a nicety in his chemical business. I feel confident that if Sir P. C. Roy had spent his efforts on comparing the weights of the people of his own village between March and June last, he would have found that it would have taken much of his time and his skill to detect any difference.

The member for Sukea's Street remarked last night that this resolution was quite non-political. This morning I have read a speech from a non-co-operator from Khulna, in which he calls upon his hearers to "arise and turn out the British because the famine is due," he says, "to British oppression. This famine is due to the British sucking policy." I have no objection to the resolution as it stands, because it is merely one of these votes of confidence in the government which it is the fashion now to pass in the form of what I should call a "carry on" resolution, the effect of which is that Government should carry on the work which they are attempting and intending to do.

The legal members of the assembly are well aware what an obligation is imposed on Magistrates by the provisions of the Criminal Procedure Code which they have no other alternative but to obey. The same is the position of the revenue officers in regard to the Famine Code. The Famine Code, which is a sort of Bible to all revenue officers in times of distress, has been so abridged that everybody who is employed on revenue work can carry it in his pocket. I wish to point out to the members of this Council that we are now merely carrying out the dictates of the Code which the resolution repeats and that we have no other alternative but to obey them. The Code says:

It is upon the District Officer that the Government relies to give the first warning as to impending famine, to estimate its probable extent, and to suggest the measures which must be taken in order to combat it.

There must always be a great element of certainty in estimating the distress which is to be relieved.

The Code further says:—

When it is anticipated that there will be famine, the District Officer must watch carefully for signs for confirming this view.

The first danger signal is the unusual wandering of paupers.

I may mention in this connection that every thana officer is called upon to submit a daily report and therein to report any aimless wandering of paupers. I have seen the daily reports for the last 35 days and I have not seen a single report in which it is stated that there is any unusual wandering of paupers.

The second signal is the restlessness shown in an increase of crime which is a sign which requires careful examination. There has not been an increase of crime in the affected areas of Khulna. The Code lays down :—

One of the earliest means of ascertaining whether relief is necessary is the opening of test works Action in this respect, however, in advance of actual needs involves great risk of extravagance and demoralisation The District Officer must, therefore, be very careful not to be led away by false rumours and he must remember that his personal supervision at this stage is of cardinal importance

We took action as early as in March before we heard anything from the members of this Council, and the test works under the District Board were opened at our request by way of experiment. No unusual distress has, however, been indicated, as people do not come from a great distance and on these works we have found small boys, earning four annas a day.

In 1897, during the great famine, it was observed that almost all the zamindars were absentee landlords and were generally indifferent to the welfare of their tenants. I mean that the zamindars in general knew nothing of their tenants and the tenants knew nothing of the zamindars. I was therefore very pleased to find that one of the zamindars took part in this debate. I may tell this Council that when I went down to his village, perhaps the most distressed in the area, his was the name that was mentioned by the tenants, as having done nothing to help them.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: I deny it.

Mr. J. LANG: He is not the gentleman I am referring to. In all the big famines we have learnt a new lesson. The Orissa famine taught us that the prime necessity is to save life; the Bihar Famine of 1873-74 taught us the lesson to prevent extravagance.

At this stage the member reached the time-limit.

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: In the first place I desire to thank the Hon'ble Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan for accepting the resolution. I believe it was a foregone conclusion that this resolution would be accepted by him, and it is therefore useless for me at this stage to traverse the various points which have been touched upon in his long speech. I want however to refer to one or two points. He seems to think that the mentality of the members of the Council has undergone

such a transformation that they do not see anything good in the Government or in Government officials. I may retort by saying that the mentality of those who are now within the charmed circle of the bureaucracy has undergone such a dramatic change. Notwithstanding the fact that he was one of us before he was translated to that charmed circle, he seems to think that anything that comes by way of criticism from the people is always against Government. For my part, I am surprised, so far as my resolution is concerned, that we should have evoked such a remark from the Hon'ble Maharaja Bahadur. Before he was a member of the bureaucracy and when he was a representative of the people returned by the suffrage of the people, he was quite a different person. I remember the admirable stand he made in connection with the Calcutta Improvement Bill and other measures. I had the honour of being associated with him as his colleague for nearly fourteen years. But what a glorious transformation has been effected in him by his entrance into the charmed circle of the bureaucracy.

There are one or two points on which it is necessary for me to touch. He has said that I am wrong in stating that about 500 or 550 square miles were affected. If I am wrong, I must have the candour to admit that that was the information supplied to me. I have always corrected my observations by saying that it was the information which I got. If I am wrong I must candidly admit it.

Then, it has been stated that there were no deaths from starvation: I hold in my hand the information which I received from very reliable persons—persons whose veracity and honesty can be relied upon and who occupy high positions in life and, what is more important, are in the confidence of Government. I am told that in the Gabura village, somewhere in the Kaliganj area, there were deaths from starvation last year and the fact was known to the District Officer. That is the statement I made on the information that was supplied to me, and if it is not correct I should like to have a categorical denial of that statement. The famine appeared in 1919—call it scarcity or by any other name. It has been growing in intensity and acuteness since that year, and in 1920 it began to grow and this year it is much more alarming still.

As regards fish, fruit and milk, my friend the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur has made an elaborate defence. It is quite natural—for my Hon'ble friend spoke as the mouthpiece of the bureaucracy; I am not in that charmed circle, nor do I know what I would have done if I happened to be there; perhaps one is constrained to support what the Government officials said; that is the mentality of the bureaucracy—I hope I have passed that age. (Cries of "No," "No.")

I think it will be admitted by even the most sun-dried bureaucrat—if I might use that expression—that if fish, fruit and milk are so plenty in such a place and still if there be a famine there it easily passes the comprehension of any human being how the two conditions may be

reconciled to each other. Well, I do not know about that, but my friend, Mr. Nirode Behary Mullick, has said about two or three lakhs of people, are actually suffering. I do not know what information the Maharaja Bahadur has got. I do not know whether there is plenty of fruits or whether there is plenty of ripe mangoes or whether there is plenty of mango-fish, but as far as I know there is plenty of salt-water crabs which, if taken, will bring within 24 hours acute dysentery. If there is an abundance of such eatable fruits and fish, I do not know how there can be acute distress among two to three lakhs of people. I trust the Maharaja Bahadur has got his statistics; but it appears that he gave us a florid description about the fish, fruits and milk which can be got at the mere asking, without statistical authority.

Then, it has been stated that Government is doing its best. I have never said in my speech that Government is not doing anything. It may have been something like this—I have not got the exact words used by the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur but they may have been somewhat like this—"There seems to be an impression that Government as not doing anything—"

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: May I rise to offer an explanation? I never said that but I said that if any member chose to offer any help he was quite welcome.

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: There is an impression that the people are accusing Government that it is not doing anything. Responsible people both on the platform and in the press, and in some of the letters in public print, have stated that what the Government is doing is not adequate and that is how the public opinion is voiced in this Council by some of us. I am glad to say—whatever the Maharaja Bahadur might say—the Government has to a certain extent been more active than it otherwise would have been because of the pressure of public opinion. The Maharajadhiraja Bahadur thinks that the people should not complain but simply sit quiet and Government will do everything; but that is not my experience.

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: I never said that.

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: Then I want to refer to one part of the speech of Mr. Lang. I must say this that the District Officer, the Collector—so far as I could gather from those who have supplied me with information—is spoken of very highly, and although he has submitted that picture, I do not know under what circumstances he drew such a picture as has now been torn to pieces by public criticism—they say that the Collector has no doubt tried his best but he cannot do anything more without money. I began my speech by saying that it was a non-political, non-controversial matter, yet it is strange to

find that because somebody in this vast Presidency has said that the British are sucking the life-blood of the people, a responsible official like Mr. Lang should take it up seriously and make it an occasion for a tirade against us who voice the sober, the moderate views of the public. That is not the way to meet the moderate section of the community. You should ignore the fact that there may be some people who may, in season and out of season, fling mud at the Government for the sake of itself. We offer you, we stretch out to you, our hand of co-operation in the utmost spirit of mutual trust and confidence and you ought to grasp it with cordiality and sincerity, and not hurl upon us invectives because some irresponsible person amongst the vast millions of people has made the remark, odious, it may be.

The motion was then put and agreed to.

The PRESIDENT: Before we take up the next resolution, I ought to mention that we have made very little progress up to this time as we have only done about 45 items out of 137. If we go on at this rate it will take us a month more or at least three weeks to finish the business before us. I would therefore appeal to members that they should make their speeches shorter and fewer. Then only shall we be able to finish a portion of the business that lies before us.

I now call upon Mr. H. S. Suhrawardy to move Resolution No. 51.

Partition of Midnapore.

Mr. HUSEYN SHAHEED SUHRAWARDY moved "that the partition of Midnapore be annulled."

I beg to move that a seemingly settled fact be unsettled. It is not in any spirit of light-heartedness that I have embarked upon this venture, it is not with any desire to speak in this most unsuitable of halls, where speaking is a torture, listening a bore and the lobby a relief, a hall expressly designed, it might appear, to hinder prolific members from speaking and to breed a distaste for the Reforms and the Reformed Council, a hall which is a disgrace to the taste of the Government, at any rate to the imagination of one of its departments; it is not with any desire to create out of this platform an opportunity for a speech that I am moving this resolution;—but because I feel that I am responding to a clear call of duty. Since the last budget debate, I have taken the trouble once more to convince myself of the wishes of the people of Midnapore, both of the richer and the poorer subdivisions; I have asked those who could speak intelligently for themselves and for others; I have spoken to those whose calling brings them into contact with myriads of their fellow-beings of all classes; and such of them who understand what the partition implies, who could judge and weigh,—have proclaimed against the partition. I have failed in the midst of my searches to discover that solitary specimen on the banks of the Rupnarayan who

wailed his woes into the ears of Maulvi Nasim Ali, the member from the 24-Parganas, and I have come away convinced of the earnest desire of the people of Midnapore to live together as the entity which the district implies, and I challenge the Government to contradict me I say with confidence that if there are any here who say otherwise, they say what they know nothing of. The days of dumb millions and the days of a sympathetic Government to interpret their dumbness are over I am not of those who believe that the mandate of a constituency is the sole guide to the representative, but allied with justice and reasonableness, it should be irresistible before the Council and the Government It has been considered that this is the desire—the vociferous desire of a section with vested interests. I am not aware which is that section in Midnapore district that thinks otherwise The section which is against the partition embraces the total population of the district of Midnapore And, after all, are vested interests so very baneful? A people has a vested interest in its entity, a Government has a vested interest in its existence, the people of the district town of Midnapore have a vested interest in their life, the district of Midnapore has a vested interest in its prosperity. The argument that the old Councils sanctioned it holds no water. In the old Councils any measure, not supported by Government, was doomed to failure, and the fact that the old Councils passed it conveys nothing, nay, may even convey that it was not by popular acquiescence. It is a notorious fact that the non-official members of the Councils were against it, and resolutions for annulment were introduced only to be withdrawn in the face of overwhelming odds

What then are the evils that call for special relief, what is it that tempts the Government to go against the expressed wishes of a people, to move with the certainty of laying waste what little is left of its one-time prosperity? The usual arguments; but express the weakness of the Government position, and the strength of the Government high-handedness. If a District Magistrate cannot manage a district helped by an additional magistrate, numerous deputy magistrates, and sub-deputy magistrates, after the greater portion of his duties have been taken away from him, after he has ceased to be the Chairman of the District Board, the Registrar of the District, and even the Lord High Executioner, and the additional burdens are insignificant compared to those that have been taken away from him, then it is time that we revised our estimate of the capacity of Indian Civil Servants, and our notion of getting commensurate return for our money. For we are not inclined, Sir, let me tell it plainly, to keep underworked officials with increasing pay and diminishing responsibilities, and shall resist to the uttermost any attempts to provide soft billets. It is said that the headquarters are inaccessible from the outlying parts, that a litigant or a person seeking remedy has the whole world to negotiate before he can stand at the threshhold of the great gods who dispense justice, but as to how a new headquarters, five miles away from the old, can lighten the

journey or lessen the distances, remains a mystery; in fact, the district has been so quaintly partitioned that persons from certain subdivisions coming to Hijli will have to pass through the old headquarters. Perhaps the contiguity of the two places is due to the natural desire to indulge in the usual social amenities that help to soften the rigours of the life of an officer in the mufassal, to afford greater facilities for the exchange of compliments and the establishment of amicable relations. It is said that the needs of the district are many. The creation of an expensive headquarters, the reduplication of a District Board with its staff, of superior Police officials with their staff, of Judicial officers, Registration officers with their staff and all the usual paraphernalia of a tape-obsessed bureaucracy will tend more to aggravate than remedy the grievance. Perhaps the Government thinks, though I fear that I may be doing it an injustice, that too much money is being spent on wells and tanks and charitable dispensaries and subsidising doctors by the District Board, and that too little is being spent on the administration of the province, and the present system is therefore a failure as a business proposition. And now we come to the final line of defence of the Government, the sum of money already spent, already being spent, and already forcibly sanctioned. I go back to the pre-budget days, for the budget has not altered the state of affairs, and it will be immoral on the part of Government now to come forward, and taking shelter behind the certification of His Excellency, maintain that things have become more serious as more money has been spent on the partition scheme since the last budget; I say advisedly that it will be immoral and unfair, because it was done against the wishes of this Council, in a matter which the members still consider to be *sub-judice*, in a matter in which the Government should have proceeded slowly and cautiously and, in view of the opinion of the House expressed at the last debate, Government should have kept in mind the possible reversal of its policy. Instead, would you believe it, Sir, would the members of the Council believe such conduct on the part of a sympathetic Government that is anxious to meet the wishes of the people, the Government has hastened the scheme, and is feverishly and lavishly pushing on the work and incurring further obligation so that it can present us with a *fait accompli*? I presume to voice the indignation of the House at such conduct and characterise such methods as unfair and ungenerous. As to the sums of money that had been spent before the last budget this Council gave expression to its opinion after due deliberation, and after paying careful attention to the speech of the Hon'ble Member. If the people or the representatives of the people choose to cast aside Rs. 8 lakhs—though I do not for a moment admit that we need have cast it aside and could not have got return for the money that had already been spent—in preference to riding roughshod over the sentiment of a people, in preference to profiting—a very doubtful profiting indeed—by the blood and tears of the helpless people of a district—for, as sure as I stand here to voice the opinion of

the district, the partition would mean the uprooting of the lives of thousands and tens of thousands, and the final blow to a community, that was showing after years of neglect signs of resuscitation—then what right had the Government to step in and on the score of a business proposition—a very doubtful business proposition, as I have shown and will show—flaunt the opinion and the recommendations of the people who are more in touch and are more in sympathy with those whom they represent? Our opinion was not snatched in a moment of extremist fervour, no great political issue underlay that proposition, it was not perverse, it was given after due deliberation and a very general discussion. What then was the great issue at stake that would have been compromised if the adverse vote of the Council had been accepted, what difficult or impossible situation would have arisen? I ask the Government what prompted it to consider that it would not have been able to carry on the administration without it, what need was there for certification, and I protest strongly against the action of the Government in having thus advised His Excellency in a matter in which the Government could easily have acceded to our wishes

Much less than half the money needed has been spent, Rs. 10 lakhs out of Rs. 27, barring the indefinite obligations that have beeen undertaken in the face of the opinion of the Council Rupees 27 lakhs is a large sum, and though that is the estimate for the time being, we have known estimates to soar with soaring chimneys Let not a hard-headed hard-hearted Government cease to ignore sentiment, cease to justify this action which spells untold misery to many as a business proposition. And even apart from sentiment which must ever form the basis of a just administration, I am ready to justify my position as a business proposition. We are not prepared to throw away Rs 17 lakhs more where we have already thrown away Rs 10 lakhs, we are not prepared to justify the purchase of an expensive outfit to match a beautiful pair of slippers. We are not prepared to spend money on a new district staff, we are not prepared to undertake that recurring expenditure that will be necessarily incurred if the district is partitioned and which can be better spent on more beneficent schemes. If we were to capitalise this recurring expenditure the money that has been already spent would fade into insignificance. I feel certain that the buildings can be disposed of at an advantage unless, as the rumour goes, the land is sinking; and then there will be an end to the business proposition of Sir Henry Wheeler. Let those speculators who have relied on the firm and unbending attitude of the Government and have bought up the land there in hopes of fleecing those whom the vagaries of a Government—scarcely the exigencies of the adminstration—will force to settle round the new headquarters feel that there is many a slip between the cup and the lip.

I hope I have sufficiently shown to the Council that the position of the Government is indefensible, and we stand on our rights; and we

laim that if to-day, after due deliberation, we are of opinion that the partition of Midnapore should be annulled; if to-day we are of opinion that we are not willing to disrupt the lives of the people of Midnapore; f we are of opinion that the people of Midnapore themselves may be llowed some voice in their destinies; if we are of opinion that the partition would serve to impoverish the people;—then we claim that it is ue to us and due to the Reforms and due to the people, that our voice nd our recomendations should carry the greatest possible weight with he Government and not be brushed aside as a mere act of piety, that is ot winged enough to rise to the judgment-seat of the great Arbiter of estinies.

Babu SARAT CHANDRA MUKHOPADHAYA: I beg to support he resolution. It is now three months and over, since this Council disllowed a provision in the Provincial Budget Estimates for a considerble sum of money that would have been required as the initial expense f the partition of the district of Midnapore. That question having ormed the subject of a motion, I beg emphatically to protest against he expenditure of public money on an undertaking against which quite large volume of public opinion has arrayed itself ever since its inception. I have been professionally connected with Tamluk, one of the rincipal subdivisions of the district of Midnapore, which has done me he honour of electing me as its humble representative in this Council. o my mind, the whole controversy with its attendant recriminations, he trident voice of the Demos condemning the partition in no measured erms on the one hand, and the authoritative dictum of the Powers that e on the other, resolves itself into opposite angles of vision, the eople declaring the absence of the necessity for dismemberment on rounds of economy, and Government pressing for it on grounds of dministrative efficiency We should be guilty of gross misrepresenation if we grudged district officers the credit of bearing the great urden of responsible work they have to bear already, but with the hole retinue of additional, joint, assistant, deputy and sub-deputy agistrates to help him, he should be greatly pitied if he is not conderably relieved of his burden. The administration of district board ffairs has passed from his hand. The municipalities have been rather o long in existence to be kept any longer in leading strings, and their otal independence will be some amount of relief to him

It would be ungenerous of us were we to shut our eyes to the change f conditions in recent years, to the multifarious nature of the responible avocations which take up the time and engage the attention of istrict officers. The quality of the work is the same in all districts, rge or small, but it is the quantity that varies according to the tract f country he has to administer. The pressure, where heavy, may be ore advantageously relieved by increasing the number of assistants to e recruited from the ranks of new Indian Civil Service officers whom

every year sends forth, than by the unpopular and extravagantly expensive process of partition, especially at this time of greatest economic stringency. Even if the Provincial Exchequer were full, it would be quite in keeping with the wise traditions of English administrative policy to devote part of the capital cost to works of public utility, to the betterment of the existing institutions, and, so far as possible, meliorate the condition of the people. The district has been a prey to the devastating freaks of Nature, the treacherous rivers making the lives of the poor peasantry miserable, and bringing the proprietors of the soil, the landholders, to the verge of ruin. The absence of the means of draining a very large portion of the Tamluk subdivision, namely, the Kasijorah pargana, has made the lives of the people of more than hundred villages extremely miserable, their paddy lands lying submerged for over eight months during the year and, for want of drinking water and medical help, cholera, influenza, malarial fever and small-pox carrying away the lives of thousands of the unfortunate villagers every year. If a small portion of the money budgeted for the partition of the district be spent for drainage of the large tract, the lives and properties of the unfortunate villagers may be saved. The absence of the means of communication throws people out of touch with their neighbours. The absence of quite an adequate number of educational institutions is making the days of enlightenment a thing of the distant future.

If, of money, there is enough and to spare, I would fervently join with my countrymen in appealing to Government, in the language of the poet to—

> "Call your poor to regale with you,
> All the lowly, the destitute;
> Make their neighbourhood health-fuller,
> Give your gold to the Hospital;
> Let the weary be comforted,
> Let the needy be banquetted;"

and not to think of spending money on what may yet wait, as it has waited, for a good number of years, according to the showing of the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler. We do not require to be told that "the district and subdivisional boundaries are not sacrosanct," and that sentiment should not be allowed to stand in the way of carrying out schemes dictated by administrative exigency. I support whole-heartedly the motion of our learned friend Mr. Suhrawardy, because we are not led in this matter by motives other than disinterested, and beg to commend it to the good sense and wisdom of this Council.

Babu SARAT CHANDRA JANAH: The resolution that is now before the House has been fully discussed from all possible points of view during the voting of grants in connection with the last Budget. Without, therefore, going into details, I would simply summarise the

main points against the proposed partition and try to .....er the arguments advanced in its favour from the side of the Government.

The main arguments for the partition are:—

(*1*) The area and the population of the District is very large for one district officer.

(*2*) By a partition greater increase of administrative efficiency would be secured.

(*3*) That a considerable amount of money has already been spent.

(*4*) That the Government of India sanctioned the partition of the District as far back as 1913.

With regard to the first point my answer is—there are at least three other districts in Bengal with an area and population equal to that of Midnapore, namely, Mymensingh, Bakarganj, and the 24-Parganas. Of the total area of about 5,000 square miles in Midnapore, 1,500 square miles are covered with jungles. The old district with its headquarters at Midnapore would consist of 2,688 square miles with a population of 2,088,477, but out of this area, if the jungle land is excluded, the total area would be 1,100 square miles only, which is too small an area for an independent district with a large set of officers as at present. The new district of Hijli, which is sought to be carved out of the old district, would also be considerable impoverished. Then again the other districts of Bengal, which entail more or less the same amount of administrative work cannot be partitioned.

Secondly, it is contended that for greater efficiency in the administrative work smaller areas are suitable but what is efficient administration? Does it not mean an administration under which the educational, industrial, agricultural, economic and sanitary conditions of the people advance rapidly and efficiently? But this can never be possible simply by dividing up bigger districts into smaller ones, unless money is available directly for those objects. The people would in no way be the better off by having a double and treble set of District officers instead of one.

Then with regard to the third point. If it is found on a mature and deliberate consideration that the step taken for the partition of the district was erroneous, it is far better not to spend money on the project any more. The real point is not that so much money has already been spent—though a large amount can yet be recovered by selling off the lands and buildings—but that whether money ought to be spent on a project which is found to be of no advantage to the people. Is it prudent for us to waste more money because we have wasted a good deal already? Hence, if we find that the partition is a wasteful, unproductive and unnecessary step and that the people would not in any way be benefitted by it, we cannot spend money on it.

Coming to the fourth point, It is said that the Government of Ind sanctioned the partition. But it did so on the recommendation of th Government of Bengal. Hence, if is no ground for partition at all and, if it is put forward as an additional ground, it is really an argu ment in a circle. If the foundations for the recommendations of th Government of Bengal be examined and found to be untenable, th sanction of the Government of India or of the Home Government has n intrinsic force in itself.

Let me now place before the House my reasons against the part tion:—

(*1*) The first and the foremost is that the people do not want i It has been suggested in certain quarters, that the agitation again the partition has been engineered by interested parties, namely, th zamindars, the pleaders and the doctors, but this is absolutely witho any foundation as the people of the district have ventilated their grie ance from the platform and through the press, and also by numero petitions and memorials, and I do most emphatically repudiate an such unfounded insinuation, and I may tell this Council that durin the time when the voting of grants in connection with the last Budge came up before the House, I was unavoidably absent for a few days, an the voting of grants for partition of the district of Midnapore came u before the House during my absence. I had to explain the circum stances of my absence publicly - so high is popular sentiment about th matter.

(*2*) Secondly, there is no need for partition at all, and for the follow ing reasons: —

(*i*) The District Officer's work has been much lightened by th appointment of an Additional District Magistrate.

(*ii*) The District Officer has been relieved of his duties as Chai man of the District Board and of the Municipality.

(*iii*) The District Magistrate is no longer at the head of the Regi tration Department of the District.

(*iv*) Under the existing arrangement his connection with the Excis Police, Cess and Revenue Departments is only nominal.

(*v*) For the last century and a half of British connection, durin the early part of which a considerable amount of spade-wor (such as Surveys, Decennial and Permanent Settlement) ha to be undertaken and carried out, one single District Offic was found to be quite sufficient to cope with the work o administration. In those days there were no railways, n well laid-out *pucca* and *kutcha* roads or canals and other con venient means of communications from one part of the di trict to the other.

(*vi*) In spite of its big area the district has progressed well. Literacy in Midnapore is 9 per cent. whereas in smaller districts, such as, Rangpur, Malda, Rajshahi, Pabna, it varies from 4 to 5 per cent. The average death-rate is lower than Bankura, Hooghly, Khulna, Dinajpur, Nadia and other districts. The economic condition of the people of the district compares favourably with other districts; a comparison of the crime statements would show that the number of crimes in Midnapore is not greater than smaller districts and the number of serious crimes is less than that of many other districts. Midnapore is a purely agricultural district without any mill population.

(*3*) The cost of partition would be about 40 lakhs of rupees, with an additional recurring expense of about 2 lakhs of rupees. This the province is not in a position to bear at present. It is an unnecessary and unproductive scheme.

(*4*) The old town is in a decaying condition. It would still more deteriorate if the district is partitioned. The old District Board and the Municipality would be impoverished to such an extent that it would be difficult for them to meet the cost of up-keep of the existing establishments.

Thus I have summarised my reasons against the partition and, with these words, I press this motion for the acceptance of the House.

Babu DEVENDRA LAL KHAN: I rise to accord my whole-hearted support to the resolution. The question of partition of Midnapore has been for a long time before the public and at this late hour of the day, I believe, I shall not have to give a detailed account of the various reasons against such a proposal as the partition of Midnapore. It is quite well known to every one of this House that this proposal has been, on occasions more than one, most ruthlessly attacked by the general public of the district and denounced in the press. Only the other day, this House at the time of "demands for grants" unanimously rejected the demand of a sum of money for effecting this scheme of partition. Sir, the peoples' indignation has many times been given expression to by holding public demonstrations which must have given proof positive to the Government—if any such proof was at all necessary—that they view such action of the Government with unqualified disapproval. Before entering into a discussion of the arguments, I would take this opportunity to bring once again home to the authorities the feelings and opinion of the people of my district in urging upon the Government the necessity of giving up the scheme, nothing short of which will pacify the people. There is time yet for the Government to realise the gravity of the situation that this scheme, if given effect to,

will create, and the disastrous consequences that such unwisdom will naturally breed.

Sir, it is said that Midnapore is one of the two biggest districts of Bengal. So far as the geographical area is concerned, I admit, it is true. Government in its zeal for carrying out its policy often and anon puts forth the arguments that the vast extent of the district stands in the way of its "efficient administration." The hollowness of this argument stands exposed to you when you will learn that barring the large tracts of waste lands and jungles that mostly abound in north Midnapore, for administrative purposes the district does not represent a size that involves greater difficulties than what is felt in some other districts of our province. As for the arduousness of the task of the District Magistrate—well, during the long course of time in the past it has never been complained of until the idea of partition caught the brains of our Government in recent times. Moreover, the institution of the system of non-official chairmanship of district boards has relieved the District Magistrate very much of his duties and responsibilities that were formerly attached to him. Over and above, the assistance of and Indian Civil Service subordinate called Additional or Joint or Assistant Magistrate has gone a great way to lighten his burden of the more important functions that he had to do formerly himself alone. So the question of efficiency will not suffer any the more now.

Then, Sir, those who have any knowledge of the internal condition of the district will at once admit hat the partition will render the people of the district as a whole and especially the people of north Midnapore—the constituency that I have the honour to represent here—poorer in their resources, weaker in their corporate strength and, what more, backward in moral and material progress. Sir, I will very briefly relate my reasons here.

The subdivisions of Contai and Tamluk are navigable parts of the district and, as such the riverway forms the chief communication there, whereas the Sadar and Ghatal subdivisions have quite a large number of metalled roads which are the only means of communication to the people of that part of the district. Now the district board has to maintain them at an enormous cost. The result of this partition would be, either the district board with its limited resources will be under the necessity of abandoning some of the roads which in its turn will cause serious inconvenience to the people concerned, or to maintain them at a huge cost—an additional burden to which the poor people I am sure will succumb. Then again, Sir, the Government nowadays advances the frivolous pretext that already so many rupees have been spent in constructing new buildings at Kharagpur; if now the scheme is given up so much of public money will go for nothing. To this argument I would firstly say—why did not this sense of economy and consideration for public money dawn upon you so long, though we have been from the very beginning harping on this very same string? And secondly, there is time

yet to save good money from being squandered after bad. Sir, I understand that a sum of twenty lakhs of rupees will be necessary for the purpose, besides the recurring expenditure from year to year. We have begun with a deficit of two and a half crores of rupees so it will not be prudent for us to spend this large sum now on this scheme.

Sir, before resuming my seat I would request this Council, and through it the Government, to accept this resolution which embodies the voice of the people against a painful grievance of my district. Though it principally concerns the district of Midnapore, but looked at from a broader point of view it is a question of the whole province.

With these few words, I whole-heartedly support the resolution and hope the Council will unanimously accept it

Maharaja KSHAUNISH CHANDRA ROY Bahadur: I beg to move that the question be now put.

The PRESIDENT: I think that the Government Member should be given an opportunity to reply before the closure is put.

CHIEF SECRETARY to GOVERNMENT (Mr. J. Donald): I propose to accede to the suggestion which you have put forward and be brief This question of the partition of Midnapore has been talked about so often—we have had many discussions and we have had the old arguments repeated to-day—that I do not propose to go deeply into the arguments and repeat what has been said on previous occasions It was only three months ago that we discussed this question It is a very old question—it dates back to the year 1836 The present proposals had their origin in 1913, and, although many attempts were made to partition the district, financial considerations stood in the way and nothing was done The question was taken up by the District Administration Committee in 1914 and thoroughly examined by them Thereafter Lord Carmichael himself went and examined the question on the spot and came to the conclusion that it would be impossible to introduce a satisfactory system of local self-government unless the district was divided into two districts of manageable size. Subsequently in 1915, on two occasions, the scheme was supported by the late Legislative Council, and, as members are aware, very considerable progress has been made in buildings since then. I need say little on the merits of the question for the partition of this district as the matter has already been put before the Council so often It is essential in the interests of good administration and specially of efficient local self-government. Under modern conditions of administration the work of the district cannot be carried on efficiently with the ordinary staff of a district, The area is too large. We have made temporary arrangements at present —an additional District Magistrate, additional police, etc., but these are merely a makeshift and no satisfactory solution of the difficulty But apart from the merits of the question, the Council must give heed to the

commitment which we have already incurred. It was pointed out in March last that a sum of about Rs. 8,53,000 had already been spent on buildings and that further expenditure had been incurred to the extent of Rs. 1,47,000; so practically Rs. 10 lakhs have already been spent. It has been stated that the cost of this partition will amount to Rs. 27 lakhs but this is for a fully equipped district—a first class district up to date with all essential buildings. The estimate of works in progress however is calculated to cost about Rs. 19 lakhs and when we have these buildings we shall be able to start the new district. As I have already said, we had spent Rs. 10 lakhs up to the end of March—we have already incurred further expenditure since then, and we have entered into contracts to carry on the work which will practically take up the whole of the amount that was put in the budget this year.

His Excellency, in addressing the Council on the 7th April last, pointed this out to this Council, and when the views of the Council were placed before him, and His Excellency decided that the demand for the construction of these buildings in connection with the partition of the Midnapore district was essential to the discharge of his responsibility and gave a certificate accordingly, I think the discussion on the subject might well have ended there. His Excellency told you then that we would be out of pocket to the extent of nearly Rs. 13 lakhs with a number of unfinished buildings on our hands which could not be put to any use. That sum of Rs. 13 lakhs has now been considerably increased. We have work in hand to the full extent of the provision in the budget for the current year. The work too, as I have said, has advanced considerably. The buildings at Jhargram are approaching completion, and it is hoped that it will be possible to open the subdivision about the beginning of the cold weather. The same is the case with Hijli—the principal buildings are getting on, the Treasury and Collectorate buildings are practically complete, the Police reserve lines far advanced, while the residences of the various officials are well in progress.

I put it to the Council that when the work has advanced to this stage when the scheme initiated in 1913, endorsed on two occasions by the Legislative Council, and finally certified by His Excellency as essential—when so much progress has been made and everything is in train for the opening of a new district and a new subdivision in the beginning of the next cold weather—it is out of the question now to withdraw and to abandon the scheme. I would ask the Council therefore to reject the resolution.

The PRESIDENT: I think I should give Mr. Nasim Ali a chance of speaking on this resolution.

Mr. HUSEYN SHAHEED SUHRAWARDY: Will he speak as a Government member on behalf of Government?

MEMBER in charge of POLITICAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): Mr. Donald has already replied on behalf of Government.

Mr. SYED NASIM ALI: I think I ought to say something on this resolution because the mover has particularly referred to me. The resolution has been moved by a barrister, who does not reside in the district, supported by a zamindar and again by two other lawyers. That is how the matter stands.

Now, the only argument that has been advanced in support of the resolution is this, that the wishes of the people are that the district should not be partitioned. Who are these people? By the "people" do we mean a set of gentlemen sitting one fine morning in the house of another gentleman and passing certain resolutions and publishing them in the newspapers? By the "people" do we mean a certain section of the people of the town of Midnapore who have certain vested interests at stake and who want that this resolution should be carried? Will the mover let me know, in his reply, who were the representatives of the Panskura thana in that meeting in which that resolution was passed? Will the mover let me know who were the representatives of the Ghatal subdivision in that august meting where it was declared that this partition should be annulled? Will the mover let me know who were the representatives of the Tamluk subdivision who wanted that this partition should be annulled? Is it not a fact that the real people were not represented in these meetings, the proceedings of which were published recently in the newspapers a few days ago? I know how these things are managed, and we all know whether even the wishes of the people have been at all consulted in this matter. Now, one member has said that it is not those persons who have interests at stake who want that this partition should be annulled, but it is a very curious thing that nobody has ever said in his arguments that if the partition be effected whether the people will gain or lose. Has any member suggested before the House that, if this partition be effected, it would not really benefit the people?

Mr. HUSEYN SHAHEED SUHRAWARDY: I tried my best to impress on the Council that the people would considerably lose if the partition were effected. If the gentleman was not present in the Council at that time, it was not my fault.

Mr. SYED NASIM ALI: My friend has interrupted me and has stated that people would lose. But in what respect and how? Does the mover suggest that if this partition be effected, then the co-operative system would not really be as prevalent in the district as it is now? Has the mover suggested that if really this partition be not annulled, then the agriculture and industries of the district will not develop? On the other hand I think, and I have got some authority to say, that it is the agriculturists who would really benefit if the district be partitioned, and if

proper opportunities are availed of for spreading the principle of co-operation amongst the agriculturists and also for the development of other industries. Now one member has suggested that the annulment of the partition is necessary because we find that in comparison with other districts the number of deaths, crimes and the amount of illiteracy is very small in Midnapore. It reminds me, Sir, of the argument of a certain layman who put a certain question to a logician. His argument was—well, without reading logic this man can argue very well, and so what is the good of reading logic at all. The logician answered that if, without reading logic he had done so much, then by reading logic he would do still better. Because the number of deaths and crimes is very small and the district has got certain advantages, that is no argument why further steps should not be taken for the development of that district and, if sufficient facilities are given, the number of deaths and crimes will dwindle down still more. Then one of the arguments advanced was that there are other big districts in the province and when they have not been partitioned why do you partition the Midnapore district? Now that is an argument which carries no weight. If once we decide that for efficiency of administration and for development of agriculture and industries, the partition of a particular district is necessary and simply because that cannot be done for shortage of funds in connection with other districts, therefore, the partition of this particular district must be stopped this is an argument which I fail to appreciate at all. It has been argued that a man from the borders of Midnapore has only supported it, but I think that that man from the borders of Midnapore has often been in some of the remotest villages of the Midnapore district, but the mover, except alighting from the train, taking a gharry and going to the Midnapore town, has never stepped his shoes in the mufassal of the district. It is also evident that if this district be partitioned, then the lawyers and the zamindars would be inconvenienced. There cannot be the slightest doubt about it. It also reminds me of the history of the partition of the Hooghly and Howrah districts. We all know that Hooghly was the main district and that the District Judge's and other offices were all located in that district. The people of Howrah moved for the transfer of these offices to Howrah and some gentlemen from Hooghly opposed it and we all know why they did it. Subsequently the people of Howrah succeeded, and I do not think that anybody has ever suggested that there has been any loss to the people of Howrah on account of this partition or that the people of Howrah have ever said that they have lost anything. It is only after the partition is effected that the people at large begin to realise the fruits of it. The whole argument is based upon sentiment and self-interest. It is also evident that some language has been used which would go to show that the gentlemen who want this annulment have nothing in view except that the old state of things must continue and that the old town must remain as it is. The argument put forward by the mover tends to show that he cares more for his own town than for

the poor mufassalities who live in the distant villages. His whole argument is that, if the district be partitioned, the municipality would be uncared for and therefore somebody would suffer, and that is where the shoe pinches.

With theses words, I oppose the resolution.

Maharaja KSHAUNISH CHANDRA ROY Bahadur: I beg to move that the question be now put.

Mr. HUSEYN SHAHEED SUHRAWARDY: I submit I have got a right of reply.

The PRESIDENT: You will have no right of reply if the closure is carried.

The motion that the question be now put was then put and lost

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: I have great pleasure in supporting this resolution It will be in the recollection of many members of the House that when the budget estimates came before us, I moved an amendment to the effect that the expenditure for the partition of Midnapore be not voted That resolution was carried by a fairly large majority of the members of this House I am sorry to say that His Excellency was pleased to——

The PRESIDENT: I do not think you need refer to the action taken by His Excellency.

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: Very well, I shall not I think that that item of expenditure has been restored Now, what are the facts. I understand that after restoring this item, they are now very busy working with the scheme for the partition of Midnapore. The works are now very much more in progress. I fully realise the fact that a very large amount, nearly Rs 10 lakhs, has been spent to effect this partition, viz., in the erection of new buildings. We have very great doubts whether we would get those advantages which the officials think would accrue from the partition My friend, the mover of the resolution, has already told you that the headquarters of the two districts are only six miles apart, that is, you can go from the headquarters of one district to another district within 15 minutes How will the people be benefited thereby? Of what advantage will the partition be to them? The people who come from the interior of the district could as well go another six miles to reach the headquarters. Now let us see the cost The cost would be another District Magistrate, another District Judge, another District Superintendent of Police, at least a couple of Deputy Superintendents of Police, a Jailer, a Civil Surgeon, and a Jail which means that the partition would cost about Rs 2 lakhs per annum Well, I would say that instead of spending this two lakhs in having

a separate set of officials, why do not you spend a lakh of rupees in having a good Technical College at Midnapore? Why do not you open a medical school at Midnapore? Why do not you make the present college at Midnapore, which only teaches up to the F.A. standard, a college reading up to the B.A. standard? Now you can do all these things with the two lakhs of rupees which you want to spend in this partition scheme. This is, I think, one of the grounds on which my friends ought to support the present resolution.

Then my hon'ble friend, Mr. Donald, has told you that this partition scheme has been under consideration since the year 1836. I did not know that—he has also told you that the scheme had matured in the year 1913, when Lord Carmichael was the Governor of Bengal. Since the year 1836, that is, close upon a century, if this partition scheme could remain in abeyance, and it was only a few years ago that Lord Carmichael went to the spot and thought that something should be done, I think the present Government could have stayed their hands for another year or two. We know full well that the province is now very much in need of money. We have not got any money to spare and to add, at this time, another recurring expenditure of Rs. 2 lakhs is, I think, impolitic. Well, I am told that when the proposal for partition was published in the press, there were eight petitions from the people to the Government. What has my friend Mr. Nasim Ali to say to this? And then there is another fact that Mr. Nasim Ali who has opposed this resolution, is not a resident of Midnapore. So he has no right to oppose the resolution with that vehemence which a resident of the place can do. Well, I may tell you that I have got my relations who hold large landed properties in the district of Midnapore and I have never heard any complaints from them that this district ought to be partitioned and that they are put to any sort of inconvenience because the district is not partitioned. For, these reasons, I beg to support the resolution of my friend Mr. Suhrawardy.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: I do not propose to take up much time of the House. I rise to support the resolution. This House, only a few months ago by a large majority, accepted the proposition that the partition of Midnapore was not necessary. The question arose no doubt at the time of the budget debate, but incidentally we had to consider whether the people concerned liked it, or whether any necessity for the partition on administrative grounds was made out and whether the cost was not prohibitive. On these three grounds, I think, we came to the conclusion that neither of the grounds in favour of partition was made out and it was not at all advisable to incur so heavy an expenditure over the partition for which there is no demand from the people concerned; and by a large majority we refused the provision made in the budget. His Excellency certified that a certain portion of the expenditure is necessary for completing the half-done

works If that question had come before the House—that for completion of some works some amount was necessary, that would have been allowed even by this House. Because some of the houses have been built at some expense, is it a ground——

The PRESIDENT: You are practically criticising the speech of His Excellency which you are not entitled to do.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: I am not going to say anything about His Excellency's speech A certain amount was granted and certified, simply, as far as I remember, for completing the works undertaken To that, of course, we have no objection and I do not say anything against it The houses that have been built may be utilised for other purposes as has been done in the case of Dacca buildings Some schools might be opened there But simply because we spent a few lakhs, that is no reason why we should spend a good deal more and why there should be a duplication of officers and a consequent heavy expenditure. Now, because the work could not be stopped, a question has arisen here for a final opinion of this House whether the partition should be proceeded with or given up for good We already thought over all the questions involved and we have also heard the objection of Mr Nasim Ali and I think no new case has been made out for going against our deliberate opinion after a full discussion at the time Mr Nasim Ali now says that no representative of the people came forward to oppose the partition, but at least we have not also heard that a portion of the people are really in favour of partition We have not seen the proceedings of any meeting held by the people of Midnapore that the partition should be proceeded with or that it should not be abandoned In that case by that argument we cannot come to the conclusion that the people concerned really liked that the partition should be proceeded with I think therefore that as we held then, though incidentally, and as no fresh reasons have been put forward for changing our opinion, we should come to the same conclusion and should uphold our expression of opinion that the partition is not necessary This is not the time, when we are faced with a heavy deficit, for undertaking a thing which would cost us a good deal and for which it would be necessary to incur an annual recurring expenditure amounting to Rs 2 lakhs

Under these circumstances, I think that we should support this resolution.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: This matter should not be lightly disposed of The Government have taken a very strong attitude in regard to it His Excellency the Governor has vetoed our resolution about it Now the question is this If we support the resolution of Mr. Suhrawardy we must be prepared to give sufficient reasons, such reasons as may seem to His Excellency to be good

Sir, it is said that since 1836 the proposal for the partition of Midnapore has been afoot. True, Midnapore is a very large district and it may well be divided if there is money to do so. Now, it is said it came up again some ten years ago. It was then proposed to have the headquarters of the new district at Contai. That is a proposition which one could understand. That would be a division of the district. Then Mr. Kerr opposed, the partition. Now, Sir, to have another district only five miles from Midnapore can you call it a *bonâ fide* partition. People think that it is not in the interests of the people that this is being done. If it were in the interests of the people, we might have gone to Contai, but you shall not go there. Five miles are within the suburbs of Midnapore town. What reason can there be for having another district in the suburbs of the same town? Sir, there is a proverb in our country that the woman who loves the child more than the mother is a witch. All the people of Midnapore have protested against this partition of placing the headquarters five miles from Midnapore. Why should other people, who have no interests in the district, come forward and say "let us have partition?" Why should men, officers—English officers for the matter of that, go against the wishes of the people. There is absolutely no reason whatsoever for it, and the time has come that at least in these matters the Government should remember that this is after all a foreign Government and that it should never go against the wishes of the people. Now it is said that we had spent Rs 10 lakhs. The entire expenditure would be Rs 27 lakhs. If there are good reasons for having a district town within five miles of Midnapore, we would have said "let there be a partition." But if that division is absolutely untenable and unreasonable, if Rs 10 lakhs have been spent, and unwisely spent, should another Rs 17 lakhs be spent again? Then it has been said that it is clear that another Rs 2 lakhs would be the annual expenditure. Why should this expenditure be incurred at all? Are we in anyway in a sound financial position? When we ask for drinking water, when we ask for medical relief, we say there is no money; but for the pleasure, and for the luxury of partition, there is Rs. 17 lakhs at once and Rs. 2 lakhs a year recurring. We shall never support such a procedure. Let the Government show the necessity, let the Government meet these arguments of ours and then let them veto our resolution.

Dr. A. SUHRAWARDY: I had no desire to intervene in this debate but, if I rise to-day to speak, I do so, because I have discovered in this Council an hon'ble gentleman, who has thought it fit to play the part of "the woman who loves a child more than its mother," to quote the proverb just cited by Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur. The hon'ble member has thought it fit to question the representative character of the speakers in support of the resolution. First, of all he has questioned the representative character of the mover of the resolution.

For his benefit, let me quote his own speech as to who the mover of the resolution is. In his previous speech, he said:—

I thought that the gentleman who has been returned from the Burdwan Division, South, Mr Zahid (sic) Suhrawardy, would have said something on this matter because he is a representative of the rural Muhammadans of Midnapore Babu Sarat Chandra Janah . . . represents only one portion of the district Whereas in Midnapore if a Muhammadan wanted to be returned, he has got to secure votes from the entire district, and it is the Muhammadan candidate who can really tell the House what the difficulties are, even of informing the voters of their right to vote and the date thereof

Well, it is that Muhammadan representative, Mr Shaheed Suhrawardy, who is the mover of this resolution, and that is his authority for representing the views of the people of Midnapore He is nobody, he is not competent to speak on behalf of the people of Midnapore but the hon'ble gentleman, hailing from the banks of the Rupnarayan, who had to beat a hasty retreat from Midnapore, whom the voters of Midnapore knew not, who would like to play the Blue Beard here also and have Midnapore cut asunder, for having repulsed his overtures, is the fittest person to speak on behalf of Midnapore. I quote his own words:—

I was a candidate for election for the Burdwan South Muhammadan area, which comprises the districts of Howrah, Hooghly and Midnapore I tried my best to inform my voters that I would stand as a candidate, and when I tried to find out means of communication, I found it was impossible to inform my voters that an election would take place and that they had the right to vote

But in spite of that Mr Shaheed Suhrawardy experienced no difficulty and he has been returned by an overwhelming majority of votes by the Muhammadans of South Burdwan Division comprising the districts of Howrah, Hooghly and Midnapore, and if Midnapore knows not the hon'ble Maulvi it is not the fault of want of communication The fault is the other way about.

Then there is the Kumar of Narajole who represents the subdivisions of Sadar and Ghatal He is not a nominated member He is an elected representative of the people of Ghatal and Sadar He is not fit, he is not qualified to speak on behalf of the people of Midnapore because he happens to have considerable landed properties and is a zamindar, but the hon'ble Maulvi, who owns not a single inch of land in the wide and vast district of Midnapore is the fit and proper person qualified to speak on its behalf.

There is Babu Sarat Chandra Mukhopadhaya, the member for Tamluk and Contai, who is also the Chairman of the Municipality of Tamluk. He is not a representative of the people of Midnapore but the hon'ble Maulvi, hailing from the banks of the Rupnarayan, who could not get himself elected by the people of Midnapore is qualified to speak on their behalf.

Babu Sarat Chandra Janah, also the representative of the people of Contai and Tamluk has spoken on behalf of the people of Midnapore and he is not qualified because he is a lawyer, but the Maulvi from outside the district is qualified to speak.

Then I might also place my own views before the House. But I fear to tread where the hon'ble Maulvi has rushed in I do not represent Midnapore on the Legislative Council. I am the representative of Dacca. I am, however, encouraged by the example of the hon'ble Maulvi and I am reminded that, I happen to be the Chairman of the District Board of Midnapore. I have taken the trouble to ascertain the views of the elected representatives of the people on the District Board I have also consulted the members of the Local Boards and all of them, without a single exception, have expressed themselves unanimously in favour of the annulment of the partition of Midnapore But, I daresay, they are not qualified to speak on behalf of the people of Midnapore but the hon'ble Maulvi is the person who must speak on behalf of Midnapore I thought when the hon'ble Maulvi spoke on the last occasion he did so because he was smarting under the refusal of the Muhammadans of Midnapore to elect him as their representative I should have thought that he had been cured of his rancour by this time He has, however, returned to the charge and has surpassed his previous performance It is not to be wondered at For to-day he has the additional stimulus and incentive of having been mentioned in despatches by His Excellency the Governor However, I should not be hard upon him I may, for his enlightenment, tell him with reference to the difficulties of communication which he had referred to in his last speech, and also the House that in Midnapore there are three motor services running from Belda to Contai, Chandrakona to Ghatal and Panchkura to Tamluk The unhappy litigant from Bagnan who would have liked to engage the hon'ble Maulvi might have motored down from Ghatal to Midnapore town, without attempting the impossible task of diverting the course of the Rupnaravan or pumping it dry by the establishment of the headquarters of a new district at Hijli I do not wish to dwell at length on this point. Maulvi Nasim Ali, and those of his ilk, got their reply on the last occasion in the "Ayes have it" and I daresay to-day again Maulvi Nasim Ali will have his reply in the "Ayes have it"

I will not waste the time of the Council further—only one word more before I sit down Whatever arguments might have been advanced in favour of the partition of the district of Midnapore, all these arguments have disappeared, to my mind, because these arguments apply *a fortiori* to the district of Mymensingh, a much heavier and larger district When His Excellency, out of deference to the wishes of the Council, has given up, if I am not mistaken, the scheme of the partition of Mymensingh, all reasons have disappeared on the ground of difficulty of administration. Only one argument remains, namely, the

argument of expenditure. So much money has been poured into the dry and stony soil of Hijli, so much treasure has been sunk, so many lakhs and lakhs, are we now to abandon this scheme? Well, Sir, so long as I remember the unsettling of the settled fact, so long as I remember that money and treasure lavishly poured out by the Government of Eastern Bengal and Assam for the creation of a capital at Dacca did not stand in the way of the annulment of its partition, so long this argument will not appeal to me, nor to the people of Midnapore. So long as we remember that the settled fact of Lord Morley could be unsettled by Lord Crewe, so long as we remember that what Lord Curzon did, Lord Hardinge could undo, we might still continue to hope that what may be done by the Earl of Ronaldshay may be undone by the Earl of Lytton.

The success of our efforts depends upon the intensity and volume of the agitation. The resolution might be negatived, but we will move it again and again till we have annulled the partition of Midnapore like the partition of Eastern Bengal and Assam.

With these words, I beg to support the resolution moved by the hon'ble Muhammadan member for Midnapore.

Mr. HUSEYN SHAHEED SUHRAWARDY: I thank you for giving me the opportunity to reply to the charges that have been levelled against me by Maulvi Nasim Ali. I presume I shall have to acknowledge the authority of Maulvi Nasim Ali when he says that he has authority to speak on behalf of the people of Midnapore because he has been nominated as a representative by His Excellency, but the people and the Council do not acknowledge his authority or set much store by the futile arguments that he put forward in his speech. He has no atom of right to speak on behalf of the people of Midnapore. He has said that a barrister, a zamindar and two lawyers have spoken for the people of Midnapore. The people of Midnapore were foolish enough to return such men. If he had been returned, he would have been satisfied with the acumen of the people of Midnapore and with their good sense in returning lawyers to the Council. How little Maulvi Nasim Ali knows of the facts of the case when he says that the only argument that has been advanced is that it is against the wishes of the people of Midnapore. It is not my fault if he is unable to comprehend the other arguments, it is not my fault if he chooses to be absent when speeches are being delivered. Can he not imagine what a large amount of money will be spent year by year in providing, as I have said, "soft billets"? Can he not picture to himself the capital and recurring expenditure that will have to be incurred over the partition of the district? How little he knows of the people of Midnapore when he says that it is only one gentleman sitting with other gentlemen who pass resolutions and forward them for the edification of the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler, how

little he knows of the situation when he confines the protest to a meeting, which has only been recently held that is since he began to take interest in the affairs of Midnapore. In the Government resolution No. 6072 PD., of the 7th July, 1913, Political Department, in which the Government of Bengal put forward its arguments for the people of Midnapore you will find eight memorials attached to it. In the report the Government do acknowledge that there is no dissentient voice against the partition, and here is a gentleman who comes to speak, I believe, on behalf of the people of Midnapore, and denounces its representatives who say exactly the reverse. One last word which I wish to say is this: that if the Council passes, with an overwhelming vote, the resolution that the partition of Midnapore be annulled, I ask the Government not to treat it as lightly as they treated the budget resolution.

The motion was then put and carried.

Withdrawal of Resolution.

Mr. K. C. M. FAROQUI: I beg leave to withdraw the resolution standing in my name.

The following resolution was then, with the leave of the Council, withdrawn:—

"This Council recommends to Government that the mainland portion of the district of Noakhali be transferred to the district of Tippera, and the island portion to the district of Chittagong."

Indian Cavalry for Bengal.

Babu NALINI NATH ROY: "This Council recommends to the Government to urge on the Government of India the necessity of making provision for a cavalry unit, like the one-time Bengal Light Horse, in the territorial army of Bengal, if such provision has not already been made."

On reading the resolution over, the first thought that will arise in the minds of many members of this Council will be, that it is premature: why not wait and see what the Central Government is going to do? Why rush into moving resolutions before the necessity for them has arisen?

I would have liked very much to postpone moving such a resolution at such a moment, had I not reason to believe that it is not only not premature, but this is the critical moment to take action. Not only do I not think that the resolution is being moved a moment too soon, but I am afraid I may have been already late and should have taken action during the first session of this Council. In fact I have to move it now on the principle of "better late than never."

That this resolution has not been moved a whit too soon will appear rather clearly to those who know what a settled fact means in our days, when once a thing is allowed to settle down, and not given a thorough shaking up, at the moment of dispensing, we know to our cost what it means to resettle it. We have, before now, allowed many measures to become settled facts though not making our existence felt at the proper time, and I think if this resolution is not moved now we will be doing the same thing again. This scheme of the territorial army is on the anvil, has not yet seen the light of day, there is time yet for revision and readjustment. For the information of members who are not acquainted with the subject, I should state the Indian Defence Force Act, which was a war measure, was repealed by two Acts passed last year—The Indian Territorial Forces Act for Indians, and the Auxiliary Forces Act for the Europeans. Under section 13 of the Indian Territorial Force Act, the Government of India drafted rules for the formation of Indian units and circulated them for the expression of opinion amongst the public. These rules with the recommendation are being finally considered by the Government of India and the Military authorities. An expression of opinion by this Council for the desirability of a mounted unit will have its weight with those who are framing the schemes of territorial forces.

I do not know whether to the incubus of a settled fact, we may not then have to fight against the spirit of prestige? Added to the problems of settled fact and prestige, we must have regard to another factor. However great may be the differences between the activities of an individual and a Government they are both of them subject to the limitations imposed on by time. This matter of the territorial army is engaging the attention of Government at the present time, the multifariousness of its duties may not allow it to attend to it again in a hurry. I should also mention the fact that matters connected with the army not only require the attention of the Central Government, but have to run the gauntlet of how many departments of the Home Government. So to the principle of "better late than never," there is the probability that the subject of my resolution can claim the support of the other principles of "now or never." I should also say that in recording our voice in a matter which far transcends in importance all other matters in nation-building we should not be afraid of being too early but of being too late. We should never hesitate to speak out as early as we can possibly do. So I think that I am not at all too early but rather this is the psychological moment for me.

That the leaders of the non-co-operation movement, by trying to wreck the present system of the Government before providing for the defence of the country, both external and internal, are acting foolishly will not require much eloquence to prove to this Council. Then the necessary corollary of this proposition that we can not afford to act

in an equally foolish manner requires no proving. We have demanded for some time and have got a substantial measure of self-government. We do not think that this measure of self-government which we have got is premature; and there are many of us, myself included, who do not doubt that we are fit for an even larger measure of it. What is self-government? Councils and Assemblies, statutes and regulations in themselves no more constitute self-government than a body suffering from paralysis of its limbs constitutes health. We cannot legislate a foreign foe out of the country, nor can we quell a riot with the entire contents of the record rooms of a legislature. Without the ability of self-defence, self-government is a meaningless obsession. If it is so the subject of my resolution, if I may be permitted to say so, requires no proof, but is a necessary chapter of the proposition that ability of self-defence must precede the ability to self-government. Whatever other people may do or say, that we, the members of this Council, cannot ignore the intimate connection between self-defence and self-government, forms my principle plea. If we have got a substantial measure of self-government, a substantial measure of the work of self-defence must be taken up. If it is said that there is the regular army for the purpose, my reply is that not only have we got to fill in the ranks of the regular army in all its departments, but of the volunteer forces as well. That the volunteer army is a big factor in the defence of the country as well as in the preservation of internal peace, need not be urged upon. Equally with a large measure of self-government and equally with the regular army we must fill in the ranks of the volunteer forces. Not only that, along with progressive realisation of responsible self-government, we must press our claims to an even higher share in the work of defence of the realm and preservation of peace. One of the glorious achievements of the British nation has been the restoration of internal peace and defence of the country against invaders. I would say, a yet more glorious work remains to be performed to make us fit to do this by ourselves; if not entirely but still progressingly. Let us be given the liberty to defend ourselves where we can be trusted to do so. I need not dwell on the oft-repeated expressions that it is the natural right of man, gift of God, etc. I will say again, whatever short-sighted people may do or say, that the ability to self-defend must precede the ability of self-government cannot but be ignored by the members of this Council. This is my principal argument.

As regards subsidiary points the first is that it will prove very helpful in the preservation of peace in a locality where no possible measures for the purpose should be neglected. The city of Calcutta, the second city of the Empire, has got a very large industrial population; this city is the centre of an industrial area extending from 25 to 30 miles in some directions. The difference between the indigenous and the large imported population from up-country is great not only in habits and customs but in physical strength and rowdiness of character. There

are large bodies of Pathans and other fierce people scattered all over this area where the difference between elements composing the population is relatively homogeneous, the danger to peace and security is small. But where this difference is great, where the two sets of the population are alien in character and habits of life, where the one set of the population is timid and weak and the other set fierce and turbulent, and risk to peace and property is great in such areas sudden widespread and violent disturbances should always be provided against In this connection, I shall observe that this force will not only be a useful addition to the police force of the country, but force of a character which is much needed in the country Some of us will not have Gurkhas and hillmen to interfere with us in the preservation of peace; but how to replace them? I have spoken before about unreliable elements which I should enlarge and shew in another aspect Not only is a heterogeneous conglomeration liable to sudden and violent disruption as in cases of racial and religious outbreaks, but the attempt at stopping such disturbances by an agency, which is alien in character and habits, is bound to miscarry and is more or less otherwise unfortunate Events like the recent one which was discussed so much will occur and recur I do not wish to rake up old sores but we can not afford to ignore them as pieces of history from which to learn how to stop unfortunate events occurring frequently in failure so long as an agency, very foreign in character and sympathies is employed in quelling riots or the likelihood of one, these events will recur with mathematical exactness The alien agency must be replaced by one more native I do not blame anyone Not only will a Gurkha fail to do justice to a situation in Bengal but a Bengali force will fail to deal with the sort of justice that is inevitably required in Nepal or Afghanistan A Bengali Cavalry unit will fit in with this state of things It will be able to cover a wide range and to arrive at the danger zone at a time which may make all the difference between loss of life and property, and what is of more importance, of honour and preservation thereof I should point out, at this stage, that whether Calcutta is the second city of the Empire or the third or the fourth in importance in the difficulty of the problem of maintenance of the public peace against sudden outbreaks of lawlessness, it yields to no other city of the Empire. I think this will be readily admitted by those who have any remembrance of the history of the Calcutta riot and the grave under-current of racial and religious differences of its population I should also sound the note of warning, in the light of the newly awakened labour unrest, that the future may not be pregnant with peace and amity, but may usher in hard days against which we should make full preparations It may be said that there are the police armed and unarmed—the military and auxiliary forces to perform this duty for us, but what we want is to see some of our own men doing this We want to see our own men—Bengali citizen soldiers coming out to protect

us. It may be said that this opportunity is being given to us in the shape of an infantry regiment, but is it too early in the day to ask for a cavalry unit in the light of local necessities?

The second subsidiary point, I will urge, is about the ever-growing Police Bill. This effective supplementary force will be available to the country at a very cheap rate. I may say practically without cost, as this will be the volunteer force almost wholly providing its own necessities, the cost will be practically borne by the men themselves. A mounted body of troops is a costly item, and in these days of scarcity of revenue this aspect of the case cannot be lightly regarded by the custodians of the public purse.

A third subsidiary advantage of having such a cavalry unit remains to be mentioned. From a reading of history, as well as from conditions existing all over the world, we find that defence of the realm is considered as a sort of special duty of the wealthy and leisured class. That those who have a larger stake in the country should claim a special share in its defence and preservation of internal peace, does not appear to me unnatural. I think the Rajas and Maharajas, the Nawabs and Rai Bahadurs will demand this cavalry unit of mine almost as a birthright. Although I am myself a democrat, I must acknowledge that it has not yet been the proved privilege of the entire nobility and gentry of Bengal to appreciate the merits of democracy. For this reason this cavalry unit will strike their fancy, will appeal to the imagination of the scions of the nobility and gentry of the land in a way which cannot be achieved and which nothing else can do. If such an opportunity is not provided for them they may not come forward in as large numbers to serve in the defence of the country as when some recognition of their special claim in this department is shown. So, in consideration of the historical claim of this class of the population, something should be done for them.

In conclusion, I beg to say that many of us have read and some have actually witnessed a scene of widespread rioting and lawlessness, of houses being plundered, carriages overturned and their occupants, including respectable women and children, burnt alive in the heart of the city, the Bengali inhabitants of which are being protected by Sikhs and Gurkhas, by the Calcutta Light Horse and the Calcutta Scottish. This is certainly a defence and effective defence too; but what I would beg to point out is, that it is not self-defence.

It is not defence of the race, by the race. Is it premature to expect and try the experiment of having a Bengali cavalry unit to defend the hearths and homes, the lives and honour of the women and children of their own race?

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: I beg to support the resolution.

Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: I beg to support this resolution whole-heartedly. A nation in order to live must be fit to defend

its hearth and home. We have heard at great length the necessity of forming a cavalry unit. If I remember aright, our venerable leader, Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea, one day told us in his speech when we were trying to recruit for the Bengali regiment that in the early 'eighties he had offered himself—he volunteered himself—for service in the army, but he was refused entrance into the army then. Now, during the war the Bengalis have proved that they can fight, the blame that was attached to them that they could not fight has been now washed off. At this late hour I do not like to detain the Council longer. I only submit that every man ought to be able to defend his own home.

With these words, I beg to support the resolution.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: I beg to support the resolution. The Bengalis for a very long time have had no army of their own. It is thrown to our face that when we get self-government, we shall not be able to protect ourselves. It is an undoubted fact. The British Government—the British in this country have taught us many lessons—lessons of Western culture, lessons of political freedom and lessons of nationality, which, it must be said, we had not before. But one lesson we have not yet learnt, the lesson of defending ourselves. Sir, we read in the *Ain-i-Akbari* that at the time of Akbar, the Kayastha zamindars of Bengal supplied the Empire, with 3,00,000 of infantry, 70,000 cavalry, and the corresponding artillery and ships. Those were days when the Moghuls taught the zamindars of Bengal to supply them with an army. It is a fact that Sher Shah conquered the Moghuls with a Bengali army. It is a fact that the English conquered India partly with Bengali pykes and soldiers. It is a fact that the soldiers of the Bishnupur Rajas fought successfully against the Mahrattas. What has become of the martial races? You cannot now find a single man even to be a proper constable from the ranks of the Bengalis: you have to go up-country for them. This is the state of things. We must give our people a training. The time is surely coming when we shall get self-government but self-government without an army is an impossibility. When the British teach us self-government, they should also teach us lessons of military service. Unfortunately the terms of service in the Military Branch are such that the well-to-do tenantry of Bengal will not go into it. Now my friend here proposes that there should be a cavalry unit like the one-time Bengal Light Horse, that is to say, a cavalry unit consisting of the scions of the aristocracy of the land. There are many among them who spend their time only in hunting and pleasure-seeking. They would be very glad to come forward to form themselves into a cavalry unit like the Bengal Light Horse, and I do hope that they will have the patriotism to come at once and not mind the expenditure. Let them show an example and others will follow. We shall have a territorial army in the near future. Let the aristocracy of the land

who are the vanguard of the nation—like the zamindars of Akbar's time—come forward and form one cavalry unit at least for self-defence. We know very well the dangers that are around us; I need not go fully into them. We are in the midst of very great dangers. Therefore, it is time that we should be able to protect ourselves, and the only thing, and the only way, in which it can be done is for the great zamindars to come forward and enlist themselves in a body in a light cavalry which should at least be one thousand strong.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: I am afraid, Sir, that in spite of your exhortation that speeches should be curtailed there has so far been little indication of greater brevity; rather a tendency is manifest in the opposite direction. I will therefore deal, as shortly as possible, with the merits of this particular proposal.

The resolution itself is an echo of an interesting experiment which was initiated during the war. It was in 1917 that the idea of a volunteer Indian cavalry unit in Bengal was put forward, and it was greatly helped by Colonel Pugh. After a somewhat lengthy discussion, it became an accomplished fact, and some 200 applications for membership were received. Training started in February 1918, and continued very nearly for a year, till January 1919. During that time about 125 troopers went through the camp, and at the end 74 of them were fully trained. The corps experienced various vicissitudes in its career, but it was well spoken of by those who saw the men at work, and there was not the slightest doubt that it did enlist the keen enthusiasm of a fair number of young men, who worked hard to make themselves fit for the purpose for which they enlisted. The Bengal Government throughout gave all the assistance in its power to the scheme, and recommended it to the favourable consideration of the Government of India. The present resolution, as I understand it, would like to see that unit made permanent in the territorial force for Bengal.

Now, as is fairly common knowledge, a future territorial scheme for India has been approved, and though its details have not yet been authoritatively given out, the *Pioneer* of the 25th June had an article which, I take it, was a fairly accurate forecast. The whole subject of military expenditure, I may scarcely remind the Council, is in the hands of the Army Department, which has full control and also finds the funds. Now, taking this forecast as accurate, it would seem that what is contemplated, apart from University Corps, is six territorial infantry units for the whole of India, of which one is to be allotted to Bengal. There is no mention in this forecast, be it intelligent or otherwise, of a cavalry unit in any province; and it would seem therefore likely that the intention of the Army authorities is to see first what success is achieved in the matter of infantry regiments before going further. Without any derogation of this Presidency, it is of course obvious that, geographically, there are other provinces in India better

suited to the use of cavalry than Bengal. Well, if that is the intention of the authorities, and if, as we know, the whole question of military expenditure rests with them, we, as Government, cannot do more in this connection than lay the result of this discussion before the Government of India, leaving the matter in their hands. What the outcome may be, it is not for us to say, though I am bound to warn the Council that there are reasons for apprehending that it may not be favourable. As we all know, there is at the present moment a committee sitting in Simla to consider the possibilities of reduction in military expenditure, and as is also fairly common knowledge, regular cavalry units in the Indian as in the British Army are being reduced in number; also as is well known, a cavalry unit is more expensive than an infantry regiment. Bearing these three facts in mind the prospects of this resolution being accepted by the Government of India are not hopeful. But, as I have said, we will willingly communicate it to the Government of India leaving the decision with them.

Babu NALINI NATH ROY: As this resolution is merely a recommendation for a cavalry unit, we want that the recommendation be sent that the Bengal Council are willing to have a cavalry unit. That is all that I want.

The motion was put and agreed to.

Withdrawal of Resolutions.

Maulvi AZAHARUDDIN AHMED being absent, the following motions were deemed to have been withdrawn:

Maulvi AZAHARUDDIN AHMED: "This Council recommends to the Government that immediate steps be taken to provide a steamer service from Barisal to Bagerhat *via* Petojpur town."

Maulvi AZAHARUDDIN AHMED: "This Council recommends to the Government that instructions be issued authorising the Muhammadan Marriage Registrar, and not the Sub-Registrars, to register the *Kabinnama* of Muhammadan marriages."

Adjournment.

The Council was adjourned till 3 P. M., on Wednesday, the 13th July, 1921, at the Town Hall, Calcutta.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Council assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act.

THE Council met in the Council Chamber in the Town Hall, Calcutta, on Wednesday, the 13th July, 1921, at 3 P.M.

Present:

The Hon'ble the President, the Hon'ble the three Members of the Executive Council, the Hon'ble the three Ministers, and 91 nominated and elected members.

Starred Questions

(to which oral answers were given).

Government tobacco farm at Burirhat.

*LII. **Babu JOGESH CHANDRA SARKAR:** Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Agriculture and Industries be pleased to state whether there is any proposal to extend the Government tobacco farm at Burirhat, and also to undertake the manufacture of cigars on a commercial scale?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of AGRICULTURE and INDUSTRIES (the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur): It is not proposed to extend the Burirhat tobacco farm at present, or to manufacture cigars on a commercial scale.

The object of the Department is to improve the yield and quality of tobacco grown in the tract by means of experiments and demonstrations with better varieties, manures, etc., and to carry out experiments with a view to improving the methods of curing and fermenting the leaf. A small class is being trained in the method of rolling cheroots, and these men when trained will be available for any private firm which may wish to take up cigar manufacture. It is also under the contemplation of Government to start a pioneer factory for the manufacture of cigars and cigarettes as a cottage industry.

Accounts and Audit Reports of the Calcutta University.

*LIII. **Babu JATINDRA NATH BASU:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to say whether the accounts of the Calcutta University are regularly audited by any agency on behalf of the Government, and, if so, are any reports submitted to Government in respect of such audit?

(*b*) Do the Government forward such audit reports with their remarks, if any, to the University?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state up to what year such audit reports have been so forwarded to the University?

(*d*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state when such audit reports for the last three years were sent to the University, when replies, if any, from the University were received, and what action, if any, was taken by the University on those reports?

(*e*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to lay on the table the last three audit reports?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of EDUCATION (the Hon'ble Mr. P. C. Mitter: (*a*) The member is referred to the reply given at this Council on the 8th instant to Babu Hem Chandra Nasker as answer to (*b*) of unstarred question No. 188.

(*b*) Yes.

(*c*) It appears from the papers which have been received from the Calcutta University and the Accountant-General, Bengal, that the latest year for which an audit report is available is for 1918-19.

(*d*) No audit reports for 1919-20 or 1920-21 appear to have been sent to the University. It appears that the Government of India sent to the Calcutta University the audit reports for 1917-18 and 1918-19, with letters issued respectively in November, 1919, and December, 1920. The University of Calcutta do not appear to have replied to these communications.

(*e*) The audit reports for the years 1916-17, 1917-18 and 1918-19 are laid on the library table.

Decline in the population of Murshidabad.

*LIV. **Babu SURENDRA NARAYAN SINHA:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state what is the figure of the recent census of 1921 that represents a decline in the population of the district of Murshidabad as compared to the figure of the census before last, *i.e.*, of 1911?

(*b*) Does the figure correspond and tally with the figures as reported in the vital statistics of the district?

(*c*) What are the total number of deaths of the district during the last ten years from—

(*i*) cholera,
(*ii*) influenza,
(*iii*) small-pox,
(*iv*) malarial fever, and
(*v*) other diseases?

(*d*) What is the proportion of deaths between males and females?

(*e*) Is it a fact that the people living further away inland from the river Bhagirathi are more immune from cholera than the people who live in near proximity to the river?

(*f*) Is the population in the jurisdiction of every thana in the district decreasing every year? Or are there any exceptions where deaths are normal and births exceed deaths? If so, what are the names of such thanas?

(*g*) Has the attention of the Hon'ble the Minister been drawn to the point that if the present state of deaths exceeding births continues to prevail, the district of Murshidabad will become depopulated within another 100 years or before it?

(*h*) Has the attention of the Hon'ble the Minister been drawn to the fact that the district of Murshidabad is on the way to decay and decline?

(*i*) If so, what steps, if any, are the Government taking to protect Murshidabad?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea): (*a*) According to the recent census figures, the population of the district of Murshidabad is 12,44,207. According to the census of 1911, the population of the district was 13,72,274. There has been therefore a decrease in the population by 1,28,067.

(*b*) The answer is in the negative. It has to be remembered that the figures of migration have to be taken into account in making a comparison between the census figures and the returns of births and deaths. For instance, the persons born in the district but enumerated outside it in 1911 numbered 78,696.

(*c*) and (*d*) A statement (No. 1) is laid on the table. Influenza figures were not shown separately in the returns of vital statistics, but those available for the year 1919-20 have been included in the statement.

(*e*) Except in Berhampur which possesses water-works, the incidence of cholera in the riparian and non-riparian towns of the district is practically the same.

(*f*) The member is referred to the statement (No. 2) which is laid on the table.

(*g*) and (*h*) I am not so pessimistic as to think that the population will be extinct within 100 years, and think that it is not safe to make such a deduction on the results of a single census. I may point out that the population in the Murshidabad district increased by 6·6 per cent between 1891 and 1901, and by 3 per cent. between 1910 and 1911.

(*i*) I have invited the District Board to hold a conference attended by leading men of the district to formulate a programme for the improvement of public health conditions and especially schemes of water-supply and anti-malarial operations.

STATEMENT I

Showing the total deaths from different diseases in the Murshidabad district during the year 1911 to 1920, referred to in the reply to starred questions Nos. LIV (c) and (d).

YEAR	FEVER			CHOLERA			SMALL POX			OTHER CAUSES			INFLUENZA	Proportion of deaths between males and females.	
	Male	Female.	Total	Male	Female	Total	Male	Female	Total	Male	Female.	Total	Total		
1911 ...	18,168	17,662	35,830	1,265	1,218	2,483	71	120	191	4,500	3,795	8,295	...	24	23
1912 ...	20,049	19,762	39,811	999	857	1,856	22	17	39	4,401	3,827	8,228	...	26	25
1913 ...	20,540	19,773	40,313	1,827	1,760	3,587	23	11	34	4,141	3,595	7,736	...	27	26
1914 ...	26,778	27,400	54,178	3,192	2,769	5,961	210	166	376	4,683	4,067	8,750	...	1	1
1915 ...	25,415	25,162	50,577	1,253	1,023	2,276	517	528	1,045	3,765	3,368	7,133	...	1	1
1916 ...	18,809	17,402	36,211	697	603	1,300	145	130	275	3,655	3,225	6,880	..	12	11
1917 ...	18,635	18,212	36,847	817	816	1,633	59	65	124	4,144	3,567	7,711	...	24	23
1918 ...	34,722	32,971	67,693	1,868	1,794	3,662	6	10	16	4,261	3,634	7,895	...	41	39
1919 ...	25,812	24,987	50,799	3,144	2,839	5,983	125	90	215	3,175	2,786	5,961	16 (August to Dec.)	33	32
1920 ...	21,346	21,136	42,482	263	257	518	584	528	1,112	3,624	3,180	6,804	178	27	25

STATEMENT II

Showing the total number of births and deaths in each thana of the M[illegible]shidabad district during each of the previous ten years (1911—19[illegible]) referred to in the reply to starred question No. LIV (f).

	Names of Thanas	1911. Births	1911. Deaths	1911. Decrease in population.	1912 Births	1912 Deaths	1912 Decrease in population	1913 Births	1913 Deaths	1913 [illegible]
1	Jallangi or Damkol	5,024	3,868		4,967	4,229	..	4,[illegible]	4,447	
2	Ramnagar	3,79[illegible]	2,924		4,[illegible]17	3,368		3,937	3,130	
3.	Sujaganj . .	1,308	1,452	174	1,450	1,304		1,398	1,3[illegible]7	
4.	Barwan or Beldanga	5,390	4,177	.	5,213	3,959		5,17[illegible]	4,677	
5	Daulatbazar . .	1,567	1,320		1,678	1,[illegible]75		1,477	[illegible]43[illegible]	
6	Hariharpara	2,351	2,018		2,363	2,[illegible]		2,130	2,522	39
7	Nawada	[illegible]	[illegible]02[illegible]		2,319	2,020		2,[illegible]74	2,3[illegible]	.
8.	Nabagram	2,180	1,646		2,297	1,674		2,126	1,647	
9	Sagardighi	1,715	1,412		1,721	1,802	81	1,506	1,249	
10	Murshidabad*	419	494	75	417	455	38	438	42[illegible]	.
11	Jiaganj*	381	527	146	403	492	98	418	4[illegible]3	..
12	Bhagwangola	2,588	2,055		2,687	2,141		2,83[illegible]	[illegible]033	.
13	Bharatpur .	4,635	3,99[illegible]	.	4,464	3,856	..	4,38[illegible]	3,868	
14	Gokarna	1,201	686	...	1,171	746	..	1,172	849	
15	Kandi	977	672		962	65[illegible]		965	839	.
16.	Khargram .	3,027	1,879		3,034	1,880	...	2,853	2,360	.
17	Burwan ..	3,167	2,173		3,331	2,611	...	3,301	3,001	...
18	Shamshirganj ..	4,345	3,968	.	3,787	4,029	242	3,816	4,414	59[illegible]
19.	Suti*	3,143	2,918	.	2,839	3,191	352	2,580	2,915	33[illegible]
20	Raghunathganj* .	2,876	2,147	...	2,857	3,181	..	2,925	1,878	
21	Lalgola* ..	2,781	2,314	...	2,895	2,361	...	2,921	2,332	.
22	Mirzapur ..	1,941	1,604	..	2,030	2,014	...	1,798	1,874	76

* Riverian thanas on the [illegible]

	Names of Thanas.	1914. Births.	Deaths.	Decrease in population.	1915. Births.	Deaths.	Decrease in population.	1916. Births.	Deaths.	…ase in population.
1	Dallangi or Damkol	4,664	6,401	1,737	3,[illegible]	5,[illegible]	[illegible]	4,[illegible]	4,[illegible]	14[illegible]
2	Raninagar ...	3,882	4,609	727	2,[illegible]	3,807	[illegible]	3,[illegible]	3,13[illegible]	
3	Sujaganj	1,382	1,836	454	1,[illegible]	1,[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	1,344	121
4	Burwan or Beldanga	5,017	[illegible]	1,4[illegible]	4,7[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	3,[illegible]	
5	Daulatbazar	1,5[illegible]	1,92[illegible]	[illegible]	1,[illegible]	1,[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	1,[illegible]	[illegible]
6	[illegible]chargara	2,215	3,[illegible]	8[illegible]	1,[illegible]	2,[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	76
7	Nawala ...	2,045	[illegible]	1,492	1,[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	1,6[illegible]	[illegible]
8	Nabagram ..	2,287	2,[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	
9	Sagardighi	1,7[illegible]	1,91[illegible]	14[illegible]	1,[illegible]	1,[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	1,[illegible]	
	Murshidabad*	3[illegible]	[illegible]	187	[illegible]	40[illegible]	1[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	41
	Jiaganj* ..	3[illegible]	539	14[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	
12	Bhagwangola .	2,79[illegible]	3,139	341	2,1[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	1,74[illegible]	
13	Bharatpur	4,1[illegible]	[illegible]	1,1[illegible]	3,7[illegible]	4,4[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	2,[illegible]	
14	Gokarna	1,148	1,[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]
15	Kandi	1,[illegible]	9[illegible]		[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	
16	Khargram	2,9[illegible]	2,[illegible]		2,3[illegible]	3,[illegible]		[illegible]	[illegible]	
17	Burwan	3,03[illegible]	3,[illegible]	[illegible]	2,[illegible]	3,[illegible]	[illegible]	2,[illegible]	2,[illegible]	
18	Shamshirganj ...	3,567	4,[illegible]	1,[illegible]	3,[illegible]	4,41[illegible]	[illegible]	3,[illegible]	[illegible]	
19	Suti*	2,420	3,[illegible]	1,[illegible]	2,[illegible]	2,[illegible]	[illegible]	2,[illegible]	2,[illegible]	
20	Raghunathganj* ...	2,616	2,[illegible]		2,344	2,[illegible]		2,[illegible]	1,[illegible]	
21	Lalgola*	2,666	3,422	[illegible]	2,[illegible]	2,[illegible]	[illegible]	2,[illegible]	2,470	3[illegible]
22	Mirzapur	1,[illegible]	2,[illegible]	612	1,[illegible]	2,41[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	1,[illegible]	

Names of Thanas.	1917.			1918.			1919.			1920.		
	Births.	Deaths.	Decrease in population.	Births.	Deaths.	Decrease in population.	Births.	Deaths.	Decrease in population.	Births.	Deaths.	Decrease in population.
1. Jallangi or Damkol	4,335	4,898	563	4,134	7,410	3,275	3,192	5,228	2,036	4,071	4,442	371
2. Raninagar	3,503	3,619	116	3,226	4,893	1,667	2,721	3,127	406	3,110	3,115	5
3. Sujaganj	1,533	1,504		1,149	2,651	1,502	1,025	1,630	605	1,183	1,604	421
4. Burwan or Beldanga	5,638	4,494	.	4,522	7,184	2,662	3,739	4,704	965	4,679	4,313	
5. Daulatbazar	1,360	1,769	409	1,221	2,450	1,229	1,014	1,498	394	1,161	1,340	177
6. Hariharpara	2,216	2,280	64	1,803	1,975	2,172	1,448	2,208	760	1,748	2,375	627
7. Nawada	2,125	1,895		1,635	3,490	1,855	1,549	2,043	494	1,820	2,109	289
8. Nabagram	2,433	1,546		1,975	2,649	674	1,296	3,176	1,020	1,740	2,104	36[illegible]
9. Sagardighi	1,901	1,307		1,449	1,926	477	985	2,982	1,997	1,283	1,429	146
10. Murshidabad*	546	567	21	348	962	614	340	607	267	382	494	112
11. Jiaganj*	290	295	5	215	439	224	214	386	172	206	251	45
12. Bhagwangola	2,934	2,539		2,455	3,677	1,222	2,064	3,538	1,474	2,394	2,[illegible]	..
13. Bharatpur	4,461	2,639		4,081	7,021	2,940	2,838	5,907	3,029	3,656	3,965	309
14. Gokarna	1,315	901		880	2,071	1,191	564	1,473	909	750	1,062	312
15. Kandi	1,060	572	.	884	1,244	360	609	1,242	633	793	1,012	219
16. Khargram	3,054	2,001		2,783	4,203	1,420	1,728	4,413	2,685	2,078	2,900	822
17. Burwan	3,069	2,085		2,908	3,976	1,068	2,083	4,360	2,277	2,710	3,428	718
18. Shamshirganj	4,361	2,874	.	3,568	4,071	503	3,250	2,969		3,459	2,[illegible]49	.
19. Suti*	2,994	2,014		2,631	3,394	763	2,378	2,493	115	2,233	2,338	
20. Raghunathganj*	2,955	1,884		2,561	3,054	493	1,900	2,544	644	2,521	1,932	
21. Lalgola*	2,853	2,356	.	2,127	2,895	768	1,874	3,085	1,211	2,611	2,385	..
22. Mirzapur	2,240	1,443		1,781	3,492	1,711	1,048	3,018	1,970	1,513	1,860	367

* Riparian thanas on the river Bhagirathi

Unstarred Questions

(answers to which were laid on the table).

Ferry toll levied at Ranagram ghat in Kandi subdivision.

235. Babu SURENDRA NARAYAN SINHA: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works be pleased to state whether he is aware that the District Board of Murshidabad have been levying a ferry toll at Ranagram ghat, in the Kandi subdivision of the Murshidabad district, and that they have been collecting this toll for some time past from the people in the dry season when the river-bed is completely dry?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of PUBLIC WORKS (the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur): (a) Yes.

(b) Yes, they collect toll only from those who use the temporary bridge in the dry season.

Transfer of registration officers.

236. Maulvi SHAH ABDUR RAUF: (a) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Education be pleased to state

(i) what is generally the maximum period of time for which Government officers are allowed to remain in the same station,

(ii) on what principle is the general transfer of the officers guided, and

(iii) is it a fact that officers in the Registration Department are generally allowed to remain in the same station for a much longer period, *e.g.*, for eight years, than officers in the other departments?

(b) Are the Government considering the advisability of making the rules relating to the transfer of the officers in the Registration Department, the same as those of other departments?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: (a) (i) No maximum period is fixed as the time-limit was abolished by Government order No. 3984, dated the 24th July, 1912, of which a copy is laid on the table.

(ii) As in other departments, the transfer of registering officers is guided by the interests of the public service and the capacity of the officer to cope with the work entrusted to him.

(iii) It is true that some officers in the Registration Department have been allowed to remain at one station for several years. Many reasons have contributed to this fact, the most important of them is that some of these officers, who entered the service under the old commission system, erected offices and quarters at their own cost. The

transfer of such an officer would mean not only loss and harassment to him but also considerable expenditure to Government in erecting a suitable office. In some cases the transfer of such officers has been objected to by the District Registrars, District Officers, and Commissioners of Divisions, on public grounds. The number of officers who have been one station for eight years or more is 20 out of 478.

(*b*) The answer is in the negative.

Copy of the Government order referred to in the answer to unstarred question No. 236 (a) (i).

No. 3983, dated Calcutta, the 24th July, 1912.

From—J. H. KERR, ESQ., C.I.E., I.C.S., Secretary to the Government of Bengal, General Department,

To—The Inspector-General of Registration, Bengal.

I am directed to address you on the subject of the transfer of officers of the Registration Department. Under the orders contained in the Bengal Government letter No. 1654T.-G., dated the 12th October 1908, Sub-Registrars are ordinarily liable to transfer after being four years in one station and District Sub-Registrars after five years. No similar rules were in force in Eastern Bengal and Assam.

2. The Governor in Council has come to the conclusion that the Bengal rules are unduly rigid, and that it is advisable to leave more discretion in the matter to District Registrars and the head of the department. At the same time experience has shown that mischief not infrequently occurs from Sub-Registrars being left too long in one place, and becoming involved in local intrigues and politics. His Excellency in Council desires, therefore, that special attention should be paid to the matter during inspection of Sub-Registry offices and that inquiries should be made when facts are brought to the notice of an Inspecting Officer indicating the desirability of transferring a Sub-Registrar who has been for considerable time in one place. The Bengal rules on the subject will accordingly be cancelled, and the note annexed should be inserted in the Inspection Report Form. The term "Inspecting Officer" includes the Inspector-General, the Inspectors of the department and District Registrars, but not District Sub-Registrars, unless such officers are specially required by the District Registrars to make inquiries in such matters.

3. Except in urgent cases and under the special orders of Government, District Registrars should always be consulted in regard to proposed transfers affecting their districts. Their views should be submitted together with your proposals to the orders of Government.

Note to be inserted in paragraph B at the end of the Inspection Report Form, mentioned in paragraph 2 of the Government order No. 3983 of the 24th July, 1912, referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 236 (a) (i).

B.—(Any special or confidential remark in favour of or against Sub-Registrar to be inserted here.) If, during the visit of the Inspecting Officer, anything has been brought to his notice, which leads him to believe that the relations of the Sub-Registrar with the local public or other circumstance make it desirable that he should be transferred, the fact should be stated here with the reasons. It is not intended that inquiries on this subject should be of an inquisitorial nature, the object being

simply to bring to the notice of the authorities any reasons which may be found for leaving an officer who has been for a considerable time in one place. As a rule, no action need be taken on anonymous complaints.

Tea garden coolies at Chandpur.

237. Mr. RAZAUR RAHMAN KHAN: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Political Department be pleased to lay on the table the correspondence that has passed between the Government and the local authorities at Chandpur and others regarding the repatriation of the coolies at Chandpur?

(*b*) What is the average cost of repatriating a coolie from Chandpur?

(*c*) What is the number of coolies that have been repatriated at Government expense, and the cost thereof?

(*d*) What is the number of coolies awaiting repatriation at Chandpur at present?

(*e*) Will the Government also be pleased to state the expenses incurred by them in affording medical aid to and the distribution of food amongst the stranded coolies at Chandpur?

(*f*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to lay on the table a tabular statement showing the following details:—

(*i*) the names of the tea gardens affected by the coolie strike,

(*ii*) the managing agents of the above,

(*iii*) the number of coolies (men, women and children separately) employed at each garden,

(*iv*) the number of those (men, women and children separately) that have left employment owing to the migration of the coolies from the gardens,

(*v*) the percentage of those that have migrated to the total number employed,

(*vi*) the scale of pay given at the different gardens to the coolies (men, women and children separately),

(*vii*) the causes attributed to the strike by the planters, and

(*viii*) the causes attributed to the strike by the coolies?

MEMBER in charge of POLITICAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (*a*) Government are not prepared to lay any correspondence on the table.

(*b*) Owing to the widely varying destinations of the coolies no average figure can be quoted.

(*c*) The following is the information on record (the figures may be taken as approximate):—

From Chandpur to Goalundo	146
From Goalundo to Naihati	1,850
From Naihati to Asansol	1,463
From Asansol onwards	498

These figures include children. The cost incurred for fares in anticipation of Government sanction was Rs. 9,180-2.

(*d*) Exact figures are not available, but the number is confined to a few sick under treatment.

(*e*) Up to date, accounts show the figure for medical aid to be Rs. 3,858-7, but all bills have not yet been presented for payment. In addition to this are the salary and travelling allowance bills of the Government and District Board officers employed there. No expenditure was incurred for food distribution at Chandpur.

(*f*) The Government of Bengal is unable to give the information asked for. The gardens are in Assam and the question is one for the Government of that province.

Number of patients treated in charitable dispensaries and Government grant.

238. Babu BROJENDRA KISHOR RAY CHAUDHURI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to make a statement showing the average number of patients treated in the charitable dispensaries and hospitals in the Presidency during the triennial period 1912-13 to 1914-15 and also during the last triennial period?

(*b*) What has been the average cost of medicines for these two triennial periods per patient in these hospitals and dispensaries?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether the Government have any approximate idea of the rise in prices of medicines during the last triennial period over those of the triennial period 1912-13 to 1914-15?

(*d*) If the answer is in the affirmative, has this rise in prices of medicines been taken into consideration in making grants for medicines to the charitable hospitals and dispensaries in the Presidency?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) The average numbers were 62,69,654 in the triennium 1914-16, and 70,84,588 in the triennium 1917-19.

(*b*) Government regret that owing to the variety of classes of hospitals and dispensaries and to the varying periods for which patients were under treatment, no average figure can be given which would be reliable.

(*c*) The price of medicines has risen greatly, but there are 457 different kinds of medicine on the list, and there have been fluctuations of prices, so that it would involve an undue expenditure of time and labour to work out statistics.

(*d*) Separate allotments are made for medicines in Government institutions, but no separate grants are made on this account to other hospitals and dispensaries.

Water-works scheme for the Comilla municipality.

239. Mr. K. C. M. FAROQUI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to e what action has been taken to expedite the water-works of the illa municipality?

(*b*) When is it estimated that the scheme will materialise and the k is likely to be taken up?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) The work reparing plans and estimates for this scheme has been expedited as h as possible, but the staff of the Chief Engineer, Public Health artment, has been very busy during the past two months on a ber of schemes

(*b*) The scheme will be ready for despatch to the local authority in ut four or five weeks' time If it is submitted to Government at once final sanction, construction should be commenced before the end of year

Pay of compounders.

240. Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the ister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government aware t there is considerable discontent among the compounders employed lasses I, II and III dispensaries with regard to

(*i*) the recently revised scale of pay sanctioned for them, viz., Rs 20 1 30, and

(*ii*) the manner of its application,

they regard the former as inadequate, and the latter as unsatisfac- y?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that the present method of dication of the revised scale of pay of the compounders has placed senior compounders in practically the same position as the com- nders junior in service?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of introducing ule to the effect that the revised scale of pay may be calculated from beginning of the service of each compounder?

(*d*) Is it a fact that the pay of the compounders in the Eastern gal Railway has recently been increased to Rs 30 2 40 in the ior grade and to Rs 45 5 65 in the senior grade?

(*e*) Are the Government considering the advisability of raising the of the compounders in classes I, II and III dispensaries to the same le? If not, why not?

(*f*) Is it the intention of Government to take steps to give the com- nders a better training with a view to qualify them to practise as dical practitioners in rural areas?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) The answer is in the affirmative.

(*b*) and (*c*) Government have decided that all compounders employed under Government in class I and class II hospitals and dispensaries will be permitted to count their previous services towards increment of pay under the revised scale.

(*d*) The answer is in the affirmative, except that the scale in the higher grade has been fixed at Rs. 45—4—65 and not Rs. 45—5—65.

(*e*) The question will be taken into consideration as regards compounders in class I and II dispensaries. As for class III, Government have been advised that they have no power to fix the rates of pay of the compounders employed under local bodies, and the orders fixing the pay of these officers will be cancelled.

(*f*) The answer is in the negative. Compounders cannot be trained to become medical practitioners except by going through the ordinary medical curriculum.

Stoppage of subsidy to Jessore-Jhenida Railway.

241. Maulvi RAFI UDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government aware that the District Board, Jessore, is contemplating adopting a resolution for the stoppage of its subsidy to the Jessore-Jhenida Railway?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that the result of this will be that the line will have to be stopped?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Minister aware that this has caused a panic among the people of the Jhenida, Sadar and Magura subdivisions?

(*d*) Are the Government considering the desirability of ascertaining the real facts and of taking steps for the continuance of the railway?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*), (*b*) and (*c*) Government have no information.

(*d*) An inquiry will be made from the District Board.

Appeals in certain districts.

242. Maulvi RAFI UDDIN AHMED: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Judicial Department be pleased to state—

(*i*) in which of the districts in Bengal the system of postponing civil appeals *sine die* and hearing them *de die in diem* is prevalent; and

(*ii*) the names of the Judges who introduced the system in those districts?

MEMBER in charge of JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM): (*i*) and (*ii*) Inquiry has been made, but the information required is not available.

Supply of drinking water to villagers in Bankura.

243. Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: (*a*) Has the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government got any information as to the number of inhabited villages in the district of Bankura which have not any or a very insufficient local supply of satisfactory drinking water for men and cattle?

(*b*) If not, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state whether any such statistics are being gathered or will be gathered during the present settlement operations?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) The answer is in the negative.

(*b*) The Director of Land Records reports that registers, with maps to illustrate them, are being prepared for every village in the district of Bankura, showing the sources of water-supply, their adequacy and condition.

Birth-rate and death-rate in insanitary police-stations in Vishnupur.

244. Babu RISHINDRA NATH SARKAR: (*a*) Has the attention of the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government been drawn to the fact that the death-rate exceeds the birth-rate, during the last 20 years, in the jurisdiction of some of the police-stations, particularly that of Indas and Patrasire, within the Vishnupur subdivision of the district of Bankura?

(*b*) If so, what are the causes for this decline, and what steps are being taken to prevent the abnormal death-rate?

(*c*) Is it a fact that large tracts of land within the jurisdiction of the police-stations of Indas and Patrasire have become water-logged?

(*d*) If so, what are the causes, and what steps are being taken to properly drain the area?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (*a*) A statement showing the birth-rate and death-rate in each thana of the Vishnupur subdivision for the last 20 years is laid on the table.

(*b*) An analysis of the results of the census from 1901 to 1911 will be found in paragraph 203 (page 85) of Part I of the Census Report for Bengal, Bihar and Orissa and Sikkim. The results of the census of 1921 will be dealt with in due course by the Census Superintendent in his census report. As regards the public health measures being taken in this subdivision, the member is referred to the reply given in answer to unstarred question No. 2 at the meeting held on 28th February, 1921.

(*c*) and (*d*) The following account is given in the District Gazetteer :—

Malarial fevers are found chiefly in the eastern thanas of Indas and Kotalpur, which adjoin the district of Burdwan. In these tracts the soil is alluvial, the country is flat and badly drained and there are numerous filthy tanks, some of which were originally excavated from motives of piety but have been neglected owing to the difficulties incidental to divided ownership while others are used for the purpose of irrigation in seasons of drought. Anopheles mosquitoes, which transmit malaria breed in the stagnant water of many of these tanks and also in the rice-fields which are likewise responsible for the propagation of malaria.

The District Board has been invited to hold a conference with the leading men of the district to formulate schemes of water-supply and anti-malarial operations.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 244 (a)

Names of [illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]
1 Vishnupur	[illegible]	[illegible]		[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	
2 Jaypur*															
3 Jayrampur*															
4 Sonamukhi	[illegible]	[illegible]		[illegible]	[illegible]		[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]		[illegible]	[illegible]	
5 Indas	[illegible]	[illegible]		[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]		[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]
6 Kotalpur	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]		[illegible]	[illegible]	
7 Sirohanpur*															

Names of [illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]
1 Vishnupur	[illegible]	[illegible]		[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]		[illegible]	[illegible]	
2 Jaypur*															
3 Jayrampur*															
4 Sonamukhi	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]		[illegible]	[illegible]	
5 Indas	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]		[illegible]	[illegible]	
6 Kotalpur	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]		[illegible]	[illegible]	
7 Sirohanpur*															

* These police stations were created in the year [illegible]

insanitary condition of Serampore "khal."

245. Babu SATISH CHANDRA MUKHERJI: (a) Is the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government aware that there is a Government property called Serampore *khal*, situated in the town of Serampore, in the district of Hooghly, which is in an extremely insanitary condition and is injuriously affecting the health of the major portion of Serampore town?

(b) If so, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to say whether the Government are considering the desirability of taking early steps to remedy the insanitary condition of the said *khal*?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: (a) It is reported that the portion of the *khal* situated within the town is considered insanitary.

(b) The Director of Public Health has been asked to inquire into the matter.

Statement referred to in the answer given by the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan in regard to part (iv) of unstarred question No. 146 asked by Rai Sahib Nilmani Ghatak at the meeting of the Council held on the 1st April 1921.

	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]
	Fa[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]
		[illegible]	1,[illegible]
		[illegible]	2,[illegible]
		[illegible]	
		Total	[illegible]
2	Mat[illegible]	[illegible]	1,[illegible]
		[illegible]	
3	Four [illegible] Srimat [illegible]	[illegible]	1,703 (a)
		[illegible]	

(a) [illegible] twelve annas shares of the estate. There were [illegible]

Resolutions

(under the rules for the discussion of matters of general public interest).

Board of Education.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: "This Council recommends to the Government that the recommendations of the University Commission as to the formation of a Board of Education for the superintendence of secondary schools be carried out without delay, and the management of all secondary schools, Government, aided and unaided, be placed under their charge, and an adequate grant be made by the Government and placed at the disposal of such Board for carrying on the above schools, and that, if necessary, legislation be undertaken for carrying out the above object."

The matter before you is very important. I should have liked to let things go on as now in matters of education but I am afraid, indeed very much afraid, to take it out of the hands of the English educationists. But the Government has placed it in our hands and we must take the responsibility. We shall exercise that responsibility with care and discretion so that the ideals of Western culture which have made us what we are may not be impaired. Sir, we speak much of national education. I do not understand what it means. I do not recognise two standards in education. There are not two kinds of Mathematics or two kinds of Science, or two kinds of Psychology. They are the same in all countries and among all nations. Of course there are two kinds of Education, the one progressive and the other are not progressive and stagnant. There is the modern Chemistry and there is the ancient Alchemy. There are the glories of modern Astronomy and the mists of ancient Astrology. I prefer the former. I shall be no party to going back. Therefore, Sir, I do not recognise two standards of education. There is only one standard and that is what leads to the domain of truth and to progress and that is what is meant by education. For that there are no two standards. The only question is that of control. But in saying all this I must also say that the cry of national education has become very clamorous so much so that we at first gave way to it. Our boys and young men are being taken away from our schools to so-called national institutions and they are ruining their young lives in a false sense of patriotism. I know thousands of young men, patriots and generous, who wasted their young lives over educational folly in 1906. The old cry has again been raised this year with disastrous results. Therefore, Sir, we must make our education national, i.e., under the control of the nation, and have it supported by the Government. My proposal before you is to make secondary education national, that is to say, to have it controlled by the representatives of the people. They shall decide what education is needed and how to impart it to their children. If that is done our schools will be the only national

schools, and others can never be recognised by anybody as national in any sense of the term. That is my idea. Therefore, I propose to make secondary education for the present national, and I propose a National Board to take charge of it. The University Commission have recommended it. I do not quite agree with all its recommendations. I would propose that this Board should consist of fifty men representing all the districts and all sections of the community—Hindus, Muhammadans, Christians, Anglo-Indians and the depressed classes, but I would have half the number elected by the graduates of this country. They know the benefits of Western education. They should control our system of education. I should also have one-eighth of the members Englishmen nominated by the Government. I would further have half of the higher inspecting staff English educationists. This is my proposal. You need not take it, the Government need not accept it. The Government should certainly frame the constitution. I leave it to them. All that I desire is that it should be made representative and national, and I would recommend that the Minister in charge should have the constitution approved by this Council. The main idea should never be forgotten that it should be a National Board of Education. Sir, money also should be placed in the hands of this Board to carry on the schools, Government, aided or unaided. I am not now speaking of the intermediate colleges nor am I considering or contemplating the abolition of the Matriculation Examination. Those are beside the question. First let us have the Board and a National Board and let them decide.

Sir, there is another matter. This resolution before you was drafted by some of the Secretaries of the Teachers' Association and placed in my hands. Sir, the lot of teachers in Government, aided and unaided schools is very miserable. Graduates though they are in no way inferior to any one of us here, but those to whom we entrust the education of our children work all their lives sometimes on less than Rs. 40 a month, and that without a pension in their miserable old age. Sir, "passing rich on forty pounds a year" is a thing no longer possible. The present state of things cannot continue any longer and must be remedied. The teachers of schools, aided and unaided, must be taken in hand and that at once. Their salaries should be made adequate and graded, and they should be provided with a pension in their old age. Sir, that is the idea. The details should be settled by the Board when formed. I would leave the details and the constitution of the Board to be settled, in the first instance, by the Government and the Minister in charge of Education. I do not think, Sir, that this resolution if carried would require legislation to give effect to it. I do not think it necessary. So far as the Government schools are concerned or the Government aided schools are concerned, they cannot but place themselves under the Board, and according to my proposal every unaided school should receive grants and if they do receive grants they would be only too glad to place themselves under the Board. Therefore, we can do without any legislation,

but if legislation is at all necessary, let us have it by all means. Sir this idea of a Board for secondary schools is not mine. It is the outcome of the deliberation of the University Commission. The Commission say:

> Most of the high English schools are under-equipped and are conducted by underpaid and for the most part an untrained staff.

It is admitted on all hands that this state of things must be remedied.

Next comes the question of finance. It is not generally appreciated that out of the profits of the secondary schools the colleges and the University are mainly maintained. The difficulty will be with these colleges and the University. We cannot ignore that fact. The University authorities wrote to the Government of India some time ago to appoint a committee for examining the financial situation. The Government of India ignored it. The matter was brought unofficially to the notice of the Secretary of State, who asked for an explanation. The Government did nothing, but washed its hands of this University and threw the burden upon us. Not content with that they provided us with a white elephant, namely, the Dacca University, which is considered by my Muhammadan friends as a special gift for them, though for what reasons I do not know, for they have very few Muhammadan students there.

The PRESIDENT (the Hon'ble Nawab Sir Syed Shams-ul-Huda): That does not arise in the present question. It will only lengthen the debate if you raise such a point.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: I will not lengthen the debate. I was only going to say that they have got very few students there.

Sir, it is therefore of the utmost importance to this Council that the Education Minister should at once appoint a committee to consider the financial situation. We cannot, we shall not, and we will not in any way do anything by which the efficiency of the University and of our colleges may be imparted. All schemes requiring money for education should wait till we know whether we can maintain our colleges and the University. No further expenditure should be incurred before that. This matter of a Board for secondary education, however, does not depend upon that question. That has been recommended by the University Commission. So let us have this Board. All that we desire is that we shall make a beginning of national education. We shall make this Board thoroughly representative and national.

With these words, I place this resolution for the consideration of this Council. I must say I do so with great trepidation of heart. I do not know where this revolutionary change would lead us to. But we cannot help it. This responsibility has been thrown upon us and we must accept it.

The PRESIDENT: Before I call upon Babu Surendra Nath Mullick to speak, may I suggest that his amendment take the following form: that after the words "secondary schools" the words "general and vocational" be added and after the words "without delay" the words "that the said Board be so constituted as to be representative of the various interests concerned, etc., etc." be added

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: There is this difference. The Rai Bahadur's resolution suggests the formation of a Board on the lines of the University Commissions while Babu Surendra Nath Mullick's report is of a different character. That is the difficulty.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: But I do not base my resolution on the recommendations of the University Commission.

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: In that case I shall have no objection to the suggested alteration in the amendment.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: I may say at once that I entirely agree with the principle of the Rai Bahadur's resolution. My amendment is in fact meant to render possible the speedier carrying out the resolution. As to the merits of the proposal, there can be no two opinions. In 1918 the Calcutta University Commission proposed the establishment of such a Board: there were then only 700 schools in Bengal, the number has since gone up to 900. Vocational education was then not so much in demand, but now on all sides there is a persistent cry for it. If secondary education is to be properly attended to, there must be a new central authority which will make it its sole business to look after it. The University Commission report says:

> The feeling springs from a conviction or it might be truer to say from an instinct that education should not be controlled in all its vital issues by a bureaucracy however competent and disinterested, acting in name of the Government. State action and State supervision are necessary as factors in educational policy, but they leave a wide margin for the exercise of free initiative even at the cost of what may seem to be waste of energy and some disregard of the intellectual standards accepted as authoritative by the expert opinion of the time.

What is the existing system? Schools are now under the divided jurisdiction of the University and the Department of Public Instruction. The inspection of the schools is done by the Department, the University has no agency of its own for the purpose. Grants in aid are also given, if at all, by the Department and not by the University, which has no funds to spare for the purpose. What the University does is to grant or to withhold recognition on the basis of the reports of the Government inspectors. Cases of conflict between the two authorities are not rare or inconceivable. The University also holds the Matriculation Examination. This of course is a very important business from the

University point of view, because it brings considerable profit to the University. The University makes a profit out of the Matriculation in two ways: first, out of the examination fees two-thirds of its total, about Rs. 1,60,000, and then, out of the registration fees, Rs. 40,000 at Rs. 2, which the University realises from the students on their passing the Matriculation. Can there be any doubt that the University by following such commercial methods can end only in lowering standards and adulterating the whole system of secondary education? The results of the Matriculation Examination show this. Almost 95 per cent. of candidates are passed, most of them in the first division, less in the second, and almost none in the third. It comes to this, therefore, that a boy cannot pass in the third division unless he has made a special application for that distinction. The University maintains its connection with the schools and will continue to be anxious to maintain its connection with schools, mainly because of the grist which schools bring to the post-graduate mills. It has absolutely no desire to improve the quality or the standard. Recently it has advertised its intention to take up vocational education, but if you look at the matter closely, you will find that there is not much in it. Sir, it is certain that if our schools are to be improved, and if secondary education is to be bettered and properly looked after, the sooner they are rescued from the paralysing clutches of the University, the better. The University Commission had remarked at page 31 of Volume IV of their Report that to transfer the control of schools to the Department of Public Instruction would be "a reactionary measure, a menace to educational freedom," but whether that would be so or not, this much is certain that to place them under the jurisdiction of the University would be most undesirable and a positive mistake. Let us by all means have a new central authority on a democratic basis, which will be representative of public opinion and which will take due note of the various needs and requirements of the community in the matter of secondary education. Let us have by all means a clean, healthy body, where business will be transacted with honesty and impartiality, which will inspire public confidence, which will work with the sole aim and object of improving standards and bettering the quality of education, and which will not convert the Matriculation Examination into only a money-grinding machine. Let us have a body which will really look after and promote vocational education and would really enable our young men to earn their livelihood in a respectable and independent way.

Sir, it is because I am anxious that this much-needed reform should come about as soon as possible, that I have ventured to bring forward my amendment. May I just explain in a few words my reasons? In the first place, you will observe that the amendment omits all reference to the Calcutta University Commission. This does not mean I am

opposed to their recommendations; in fact, I am prepared to go very much further than they have done. But you will find that under the proposals of the Commission the Secondary Board is to include not merely schools, but also intermediate colleges, which are at present under the University. That would certainly be a very desirable thing, but as the Commission point out, if their scheme regarding intermediate colleges is to be given effect to, it will require an expenditure of a huge sum of money somewhere to the tune of a capital expenditure of Rs 60 lakhs and a recurring expenditure of 15 lakhs a year. Let us hope the Government of India will give us funds by giving us the tax on jute, but, Sir, I am anxious that something should be done at once for putting secondary education on a proper basis and I am not prepared to wait till it is possible for us to have sufficient funds to include intermediate colleges as well under the new authority. Let us make a start with the schools; we can bring in the intermediate colleges later, when possible. This will also mean a less violent wrench from the University during the transitional period. As we all know, as matters stand at present the University exercises some sort of control over the intermediate colleges, but so far as schools are concerned, its connection with them is little more than that of the milkman to the cow. Let us see what is the present machinery. The University does not possess any agency of its own for inspection of the schools. It has to rely on the reports of the Government inspecting staff. Those reports come to the Syndicate for final orders. The Syndicate consists of sixteen or seventeen members in name, but as Sir Rash Behary Ghose once said in speaking of the Calcutta University Syndicate, the singular number would be more appropriate than the plural. Sir, it is because I am anxious that our schools should be rescued at the earliest moment from the grasp of the dead hand which is now on their throats that I want the Secondary Board to be established at once, without waiting for the time when we may find it possible to carry out the recommendations of the Commission in their entirety for including intermediate colleges also within the scope of this new organization. And that is why I have deleted the reference to the Commission. That is also the reason why I have left out all reference to the question of the Government making a grant to the Board. Such a grant would be certainly required if intermediate colleges were to come under the Board at once; money will also be necessary for the schools, but not quite to that extent. The income which the Board will derive from the examination fees will in itself be enough to make a start with, and the Board will also get the whole of the inspecting agency which the Department has now to maintain for secondary schools on behalf of the University. I hope it will be clear now that my amendment has been framed with the sole object of helping in a speedier carrying out of the Rai Bahadur's resolution, not in any way to whittle it down or take away any of its essential features.

In my amendment I have added a few words about the constitution of the new Board. I hope there will be no objection to this. In this matter, I should really go much further than the Commission. I have not gone into details, but left it elastic, just because I want absolute freedom to be left to us in settling the constitution later. I say whatever the constitution which may be ultimately decided on, it should have on it a full and fair representation of Muslim opinion and important minority interests, and also of the new and growing needs of the community for vocational education.

Sir, I have been asked by some of my friends as to what would be the financial position of the University so far as the post-graduate work is concerned if the Matriculation Examination fees are taken away from it. To that my answer is that with the present grant of Rs. 1,28,000 and with another adequate compensation for loss of fees, which we legitimately expect from the Hon'ble Minister of Education, the University ought to be able to carry on its post-graduate work if it finds its way to stop unnecessary and unjustifiable expenditure.

Then, again, my friends are anxious to know what should be the programme of the Board so far as school curricula are concerned. I need hardly tell them that this is a matter of detail which ought to be left to the Board. The University and the Board will be able to settle it very easily only if they choose to co-operate with each other.

In conclusion, I beg to say that for no reason whatsoever should we postpone this reform. The University Commission have said so in explicit terms. There is no need for wasting precious time for the Calcutta University Act as the Commission in Volume IV, Page 11 have said (I beg to quote the same):

> There would be no objection to the establishment of the Board as soon as the University of Dacca is founded but before the reconstruction of the University of Calcutta is taken in hand. Indeed so far as Calcutta is concerned, there would be many advantages in thus approaching the problem.

This authoritative pronouncement must be accepted as a complete settler and no less a distinguished educationist than the Hon'ble the Vice-Chancellor of the Calcutta University is one of the authors of this pronouncement.

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: The present resolution is not a new resolution before the Bengal Legislative Council, but it is an old resolution in a new garb. It was in the year 1913 that I gave notice of a resolution in the Council for the establishment of a Board of Education for the purpose of administering the primary and secondary education of this province. At a conference in which the then Member in charge of the Education Department, Mr. Lyon, the Education Secretary, Mr. Samman, and the Director of Public Instruction, Mr. Hornell, and myself were present, it was decided that I should, as a first step,

move for an advisory and not an administrative Board. I had to submit to their advice. I received a letter, however, from Government a few days afterwards that my resolution, though so modified, would be opposed. Out of sheer disgust I had to withdraw it at the time.

In September, 1917, I however moved a resolution in the Council for the appointment of an advisory Board, *i.e.*, of a Board consisting of official and non-official members, for the purpose of advising Government in matters connected with primary and secondary education in the Presidency. It was a very modest proposal, but the Council rejected it at the time. On the one hand there was opposition from my Moslem friends, who feared that Moslem interests might not be effectively represented on such a Board, and on the other hand there was opposition from Government, who thought that the resolution was vague and impracticable. Since 1917 much water has flowed under the Hooghly bridge, and the angle of vision has materially changed. The Calcutta University Commission was appointed and after the most exhaustive study of educational conditions in Bengal that has been ever undertaken, they made their recommendations. One of such recommendations on which they laid the utmost emphasis was the establishment of a Board for the control and supervision of secondary education, lower and higher. And what were the powers with which they proposed to vest this new authority? Not merely advisory but with full executive powers subject to practically no check by the Government. It was felt that if University reform was to be a reality it must be based on a sound basis of secondary education, and if secondary education was to be bettered the only way of achieving that purpose was by a new organization which would make that its sole and exclusive concern. The arrangement which the Calcutta University Commission found, under which the University and the Department of Public Instruction claimed divided jurisdiction over schools with possibilities of constant friction between them was condemned in unequivocal terms. The alternative of entrusting the care of secondary education either to the University or to the Department of Public Instruction wholly was also considered and rejected. As regards the University, it was clear that secondary education did not come within the legitimate scope of its jurisdiction besides, the University would have enough to do with its own proper work. And as regards the Department of Public Instruction, the Commission made no secret of their conviction that to transfer secondary education to the Department would be regarded as a reactionary measure and as a menace to educational freedom. The Commission was emphatic that if secondary education was to be rescued from the condition of anæmia from which it was suffering, the first step that had to be taken and taken at once, was to set up a Board for the purpose, "in whose expert knowledge, judgment and impartiality confidence may be reposed." So keen indeed were they on the establishment of such a Board that they declared (page 44 of

Volume IV) that "there would be no objection to the establishmer of the Board as soon as the University of Dacca is founded, but befor the reconstruction of the University of Calcutta is taken in hand." And I venture to think, Sir, that the Commission were absolutely righ in the view they took, both as to the necessity of a Secondary Boar and as to the urgency of setting it up even before the reconstructio of Calcutta University is taken up.

Conditions have materially changed since the Report of the Com mission was published, and they serve merely to emphasise the desira bility of moving in the matter at once. The existing system canno be suffered to continue any longer without serious prejudice to th cause of secondary ducation. The University has so far done nothin to improve secondary education in Bengal. Of late the policy of th University towards schools has rather been a commercial policy. Th University has of late been trying to gain popularity by preparin schemes of vocational and scientific studies.

Sir, in a matter like this which affects vital issues, we ought no to take risks. we do not want that the cause of ordinary vocationa education should be taken up by the University.

The University ought to have higher ends in view. I have no objec tion if the University were to open a Technological College and con fer degrees on higher Technology. It ought to rest itself satisfie with the higher education of the province.

There can be no question that the only way to put the present stat of things on a better footing lies in the direction indicated by the Calcutta University Commission. Let a Secondary Board be set up a once, and the control of all secondary schools in Bengal transferred to it For this I have been fighting for the last nine years. Do not wai for the establishment of the new Intermediate Colleges proposed b the Commission when they come, if they come at all they may b easily placed then under the Board. Let the Board set to work wit the schools let it take up vocational education seriously and honestly along with general education, and I am sure all will be well. Le not financial considerations deter us. The new Board will raise enoug money from examination fees, and it will also get the advantage of th inspecting staffs maintained by the Department. More money will b required no doubt, but if you do your work properly, there will be n difficulty about it. As to the constitution of the Board, I agree tha it should be thoroughly representative and I want Muhammadan inter ests to be fully and adequately represented on it along with others.

I therefore fully support Babu Surendra Nath Mullick's amend ment. I believe there is no difference in substance between Ra Bahadur J. C. Ghose's resolution and the amendment. If you accep the amendment, the objects which the Rai Bahadur has in view will b all the sooner realised.

There is just one warning I should give. In deciding this question, let us not be led away by false issues, but let us decide the question on its own merits. We want secondary education, we want more of it and of better quality. How is that best attained? If you are convinced that a Secondary Board is the only right remedy, I say, you are bound to vote for it. As to how the taking away of schools from the jurisdiction of the University will affect their finances, that is a different matter and may be considered separately. None of us are anxious to kill the University. But, unfortunately, both the Government and the University have so far failed to do much to further the cause of secondary education in the province. Grants in aid to secondary schools, curriculum of studies in those schools, text-books in those schools, female education, industrial or vocational education of the province, consideration of the grievances of the educational staff are some of the most important questions which require a permanent Board for their consideration. The Government, if I am right, do not contribute even 20 per cent. of the entire cost of secondary education of the province, whereas the University, which is itself in a state of bankruptcy, can contribute nothing. The people of the province contribute about 80 per cent. of the cost of secondary education and they have absolutely no voice in the educational affairs of the country. It is time that such a state of things should be mended and that at once.

The PRESIDENT: Before the discussion proceeds further I wish to state to the Council that Babu Surendra Nath Mullick has accepted the suggestion I made as regards the amendment proposed by him.

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: I do not agree.

The PRESIDENT: The amendment is there. I only formulated it in a convenient form.

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: There is a substantial difference. It is not a question of verbal alteration as you thought and indicated. There are some substantial points of difference, but my point is that if Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur wants to amend his resolution in a form acceptable to me, I do not object. So far as verbal alterations are concerned, I do not object, but if he does not agree to amend.

The PRESIDENT: He has agreed to amend his resolution in accordance with the amendment proposed by Babu Surendra Nath Mullick.

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: If he wants to amend it in a form not acceptable to me, I do not agree. I do not agree to any amendment at this stage of the Rai Bahadur's original resolution. Of course, it rests with Babu Surendra Nath Mullick to withdraw his amendment, but if the Rai Bahadur wants to amend his resolution, he can do so only with my consent.

The PRESIDENT: What is the difference between the amendment that stands in the paper and that suggested by me?

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: The difference is that the Rai Bahadur is not willing to delete the words "the management of all secondary schools, Government, aided and unaided." His idea, as I understand him, is that all the schools will be made over bodily to the Board, Government bearing every piece of the expense, but the Board will pay the salaries of the staff. First of all that will lead to an unconstitutional position. The Minister is responsible to the Council, and if the Minister for the time being makes over the spending of the money to a Board constituted for three or five years, then if anything goes wrong the Council will have no control over the Board for these years. The succeeding Minister also will have no control over the Board. For the officers transferred to the Board certain allowances will have to be paid by the Board, which allowances again the Government will have to provide for in the education budget. If any buildings has to be erected then the Public Works Department will charge 2½ per cent and this charge also will have to be provided for in the budget. The arrangement suggested by the Rai Bahadur will lead to endless complications. The Rai Bahadur is perhaps not aware of these difficulties. I do not object to superintendence being exercised by the Board in the same way as is done by the Calcutta University but as he means by "management" the actual appointment, dismissal etc., of the officers, I cannot accept his idea. The absolute financial control that he wants for the Board must rest with this Council and this Council alone. I further submit that if the Rai Bahadur amends his resolution he must do it with my approval. If he does not do so, then let the original resolution stand. If Babu Surendra Nath Mullick wishes to withdraw his amendment, he is at liberty to do so. I may tell you I have absolutely no objection to any verbal alteration. I believe you were under the impression that only verbal alterations were intended and not any alterations of substance.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: I rise to a point of order. The matter is one between me, the mover of the amendment and yourself. What has the Minister to do with it?

The PRESIDENT: I shall consider the difference between the two.

Mr. H. A. STARK: If there is one thing which we supremely desire it is that we should get a move on in education—education elastic in its contents, sound in its methods, and well designed in its organization. Since the Calcutta University was established its achievements have been remarkable. I suppose unrivalled in the history of education progress in any country of the world. Within sixty-five years the University has given us of its graduates men who have adorned every single one of the learned professions, and at this moment it has the unique

satisfaction of having provided an Indian province with an Indian Governor. But great and remarkable as have been its achievements, I think many of us are prepared to say that these would have been still greater had the work of consolidation and expansion progressed uniformly. For years there has been very great dissatisfaction, a dissatisfaction which has become more and more acute since the new regulations of the University came into force in 1910, at least so far as regards the Matriculation Examination. The truth is that there has long been need for relief in the office of the Director of Public Instruction as well as in the office of the University. Most of us in this Chamber have personal knowledge of the University, its organization of examinations, and its methods of control and inspection. It seems to me quite unnecessary to dilate on these points. For years we have recognised that the control and supervision of secondary schools is too large a matter to be overtaken by any Director of Public Instruction alone or by the University alone; and it was with a sense of relief that we read in the report of the Calcutta University Commission the recommendation for the creation of a Board of Education, which would relieve the Director of Public Instruction as well as the University of a duty which they are not able to perform — not because they have not the ability or the will to do it, but because the work exceeds the potentialities of both. I notice with satisfaction that in his motion, Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur has used the words "secondary schools." The recommendation of the Calcutta University Commission referred not only to high schools, which are secondary schools, but also to second grade colleges, which in the Commission report are called intermediate colleges; and the recommendation is that both types of institutions should be transferred to the Board of Secondary and Intermediate Education. Inasmuch as the Calcutta University is still working on the lines of 1910, I do not feel that the time is ripe for passing over the management and control of second grade colleges to this Board. I think that for the present we should be content to commit to the Board only our high schools. That would be a wise course both for the sake of experimentation and also from a regard to the state of our finances. While I consider that it would be quite possible for the Board to relieve the University and the Director of Public Instruction of the control and management of the high schools, I do not think that for some few years we shall have the finances to go beyond that; and if we limit ourselves to a strict interpretation of "secondary schools" as in the motion, we may feel that we are in a position to urge the creation of a Board of Secondary Education. The evils of the present system are intense. In the first place, all the education imparted in our high schools is dominated mercilessly by the curricula and syllabuses of the Matriculation Examination, devised by an authority which is in detachment from high schools. These schools are inspected by the officers of the Education Department. That Department gives them their grants-in-aid. Its educational officers send in to the Syndicate inspection

reports, which are the only channels through which any information regarding the schools ever reaches the Syndicate. But it is the Syndicate which grants the schools "recognition." I give my personal knowledge and experience to the Council, when I say that there have been occasions when an inspector has urged the Syndicate not to grant recognition to a school, but in the face of his advice they had taken a contrary course and granted recognition to the school, much to the detriment of the disciplinary control which the Department finds it already so difficult to maintain over schools. Obviously, the "recognition" of the school by the University is to school authorities of far greater importance than any inspection by any officer; for unless the school receives "recognition," its first four classes can hardly be formed. No boys will enter the top classes of a school if they know that that particular school cannot send up boys for the Matriculation Examination. The school authorities are therefore ready to surrender everything for the sake of "recognition." With them the University counts for everything and the Education Department for next to nothing.

For years we have been accustomed to hear that the Matriculation Examination results have been astounding from a regard to the thousands who pass it. I do not mind openly declaring that there have been occasions when in giving an appointment to a junior teacher of a high school, I have deliberately, and without the least compunction, given the appointment to a man who had passed the Entrance Examination in the third division, in preference to a man who had passed the Matriculation Examination in the first division. I am perfectly satisfied that a third division man of the old regime is ordinarily better than most men who have passed in the first division under the present regime. There is again very great dissatisfaction with not only the quality of studies, but also with the grouping of subjects, with the minimum pass marks, and things of that kind. The present Matriculation Examination is regarded as a discredit to the University.

No man can serve two masters. Our schools and school committees have been trying to serve two masters. But they have not been able to serve the University on the one, and the Education Department on the other side. They must be rescued from the position in which they are placed; and the only way by which we can do this is by putting them under a Board of Education. The Board of Education that I am thinking of is not an assemblage of graduates; but what I am thinking of is a body of men selected in the fashion outlined in the Commission's report. In the recommendations of the Commission every provision has been made to secure the best interests of all classes and communities, and then the highest interests of true education have been safeguarded. I feel that we need not go beyond that, because the Board will have on it representatives of this Council, representatives of the Calcutta and Dacca Universities, a fair balancing between

Muhammadan and Hindu interests; and the proportion of Anglo-Indian and European interests as well. What is more, the Board as designed by the University Commission brings that Board into relationship with the Minister for Education; and thus we get a Board composed of members, harmonising various interests, and retaining contact with the people, the Government, the Universities and this Council.

I therefore very strongly recommend that the resolution before us be accepted by this House as a resolution which is going to do what we have been so long wishing to do—to set free the high schools from that which has injured secondary education in its contents, in its methods, and in its organisation.

The PRESIDENT: I think that it is time that I should intimate to the Council that I have been asked to add the word "communities" after the word "interests" in Babu Surendra Nath Mullick's amendment, "That the said Board be so constituted as to be representative of the various interests and communities concerned" The Government Member has no objection to this alteration being made. The mover of the resolution, Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur, also has no objection.

The amendment that the word "communities" be added to Babu Surendra Nath Mullick's motion was then put to vote and carried.

Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: Sir, I rise to support the resolution as amended The resolution is divisible into several portions first, with regard to the formation of a Board of Education for the superintendence of secondary education, second, with regard to the management being placed in the hands of the Board; and the third being the suggestions as to the finance

We, in the old Council in the year 1917, had a long discussion on the subject of the appointment of a Board of this kind The University Commission has come forward with certain suggestions, and when I first read the report of the Commission, I understood that the report is a programme of action Has that been done? Has any action been taken yet, although it is stated in clear terms that it is a programme of action? Now, the resolution suggests that action ought to be taken and that a Board should be so constituted as to represent the views of the University Commission. We are told that the education pyramid is a very strong one, but I must say that it has a very narrow basis when secondary education is neglected I speak not by reference to the University Commissioners' report, but from my practical experience, and I consider that it is high time for action to be taken and a Board appointed. The report of the Commission draws a marked distinction between University education and school education. It lays down that Government defrays 33 per cent. of the cost for college education and says that a less proportion of cost is found for school education. If the recommendations of the University Commission be taken into

account, then I certainly suggest to the Council that the appointment of a Board is highly necessary, exclusively directing its attention to school education. I was surprised to read in the report of the University Commission that the number of students in the schools was less than the number in the colleges, and why is it so? Because this sort of education has been greatly neglected and the education as far as it goes appears to have been in bondage to routine and no freedom is allowed. If we look to the iron rules which prevail in the so-called educational institutions, we find that the number of students in schools is a very limited one, and the old story is repeated from day to day that the schools are not equipped properly and, therefore, there are no rooms for educational purposes. There goes a rule that the building should be in a proper condition or in a prescribed condition laid down by the Inspectors of Schools and the result is that the number of students appears to be less. There are many schools in the muffasal which are going to die on account, as I say, of these iron rules framed by the present educational authorities, and if we move them, they are not led away by our appeal. I hope and trust that if the Board of Education be established, they will be in a position to understand the real state of things, which discloses one fact that these rules ought to be abrogated and fresh rules formulated for the purpose of the development of secondary education. I speak this from my own limited experience, that there is a large number of Inspectors, Additional Inspectors, Assistant Inspectors visiting these schools, but for what purpose? Promulgating only the efficacy of the rules which have been formulated by the present educational authorities. I consider that if these rules had been in force or operation, for some time, the result will be that secondary education will be neglected. Therefore, Sir, I welcome the resolution. I welcome it for various reasons, because the Board, consisting of the representatives of the people, will continue to be a popular institution and the people will be in a position to inform the Board of the grievances of the students, the teachers, and those who are in management of these institutions. You will remember, Sir, that when the Local Self-Government Act came into operation, it was necessary for Government to issue a notification in the year 1895 giving definitions of the words "schools," "public schools" and "private schools". The difficulty was appreciated and Government came forward to define these words. With what result? Private schools are not flourishing and so the schools under public management, I am sorry to say, are on the same level. The District Boards are not in a position to help these institutions, because of their limited means. Government also are not in a position to help these schools and consequently it is necessary that some sort of scheme has to be formulated by the Board for the purpose of the prosperity of these institutions.

As regards grants from Government it is highly necessary that the financial position ought to be clear. I do not appreciate any remark

that the position of the University will be affected. I have nothing to do with it. I am pleading the cause of these mufassal schools and I wish Government to be in a position to solve this problem. Whether the finances of the University will be affected or not by such a procedure is another problem and the University will have to solve it. Sir, I do not like to take up your time further, but I do emphatically say that action ought to be taken and a Board constituted without a moment's delay.

Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: The whole country is now dissatisfied with the form in which secondary education is being carried on in this province. There has been a great desire amongst all classes of people that secondary education should be improved. Every year we find that students, not in hundreds, not in thousands, but in tens of thousands are passing the Matriculation Examination; but after passing the Matriculation Examination, we do not know what our boys will do. So, Sir, the time has come when we should try to see that our boys get proper education—education that would enable them to cope successfully with the battle of life that stands before them. The Board, on the lines suggested by the hon'ble mover of the resolution, would do immense good to the country. There has been a demand for national education, and if secondary education is placed under the control of such a Board, this demand would be fulfilled to a great extent. By national education, Sir, I understand an education which would enable the people of the country to form themselves into a nation. Much has been said on this subject by the previous speakers and I do not want to detain the House longer. I only suggest that this kind of Board should be constituted as early as possible for the good of the country.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: I rise to support the proposal for the formation of a Board of Secondary Education. It is high time that such a Board be constituted as has been suggested. I should like to accept the amendment, but at the same time there ought to be something to ensure the financial grant from Government. It is necessary no doubt that the vocational element should also be included in it and the Board should be so constituted that it may be representative of the various interests and communities concerned, so that there may not be any grievance at all. At present, we understand, that a major portion of the fees realised from the examinees goes to the Department of Post-graduate studies under the University. It has been elicited, in reply to the question put by my friend Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta, that though last year there were many applications for financial help from Government from the authorities of secondary schools, that could not be given for want of funds. If there be any income from the schools, why should it go to other departments? If there is any necessity for financial help to the Post-graduate Department, that ought to be arranged otherwise. A Board composed of the representatives of the various interests and communities should be formed, and the interests of secondary education

ought to be looked into properly. At present there is a dual control—the control of University on the one side and of Government through Inspectors of Schools on the other. Such dual control, I do not think, has done any special good to the cause of secondary education. Anyhow, it is high time that we take the management of the schools from the hands of the University and place it under the control of the representatives of the people concerned whose interests ought to be looked into first. It is not necessary to say much, but I would like to emphasize that if such a Board is to be formed, there should be some provision for financial help from Government. I do not mean to say that if an adequate grant is made to this Board, the control of the Minister or the control of this Council would cease. Certainly the Minister would be responsible for the success of the movement, and this Council shall have control over the proceedings of the Board, but any help which is necessary must be provided for. Without such help I do not think the Board would be of any use. I support the resolution.

Maulvi YAKUINUDDIN AHMED: I beg to support this resolution, but with some reservation. I beg to submit to the Council that if it is intended to belittle the Calcutta University by the establishment of this Board of Education, it is a wrong move, and it is a wrong move in the wrong direction with regard to the education in our country. This Calcutta University has produced a Sir J. C. Bose, a Sir P. C. Roy, Right Hon'ble Amir Ali and a Sir Ashutosh Mukharji and other brilliant stars in the firmament of the Calcutta University, and I beg to submit that by the establishment of this Board we are not intending to belittle the importance of the University. One of the speakers has suggested that the intermediate colleges also should come under the control of this Board of Education; this I certainly will object to. If the intermediate colleges are taken away few colleges would remain for the Calcutta University to control and direct the course of education imparted therein. The function of the University would be gone if that be our object. I beg to submit that we should consider these recommendations very cautiously. Formerly even vernacular scholarship examinations were held by the Educational authorities in each Division. When the boys turned out after passing those vernacular scholarship examinations were very brilliant boys, and they came to the Calcutta University and became famous scholars of the University; but subsequently such a salutary influence has been taken away and an examination for scholarship only has been instituted, competed for by a few boys and each school passes its own boys. That is a standard of education which destroys the education as a whole of the province. Is that the object of the Board of Education? Under the Calcutta University—the matriculation students flock in thousands from the whole province, even from Ceylon and Assam and other places and offer themselves for examination under the Calcutta University—this universality of the standard of education as a test of education should not be ignored:

and if the Board of Education now to be formed mean to take away this important educative value of the Calcutta University, I certainly would object to it, and the Council should also do so in my opinion.

Lately, there was an attempt on the part of the Educational authorities to ask the boys to pass the school final examination instead of passing the Matriculation Examination. Now, the school final examination is a test which is no test at all, just as the vernacular scholarship examination which has been done away with; and the boys of each school pass their own examinations under their own teachers. The educative value of such a method is no doubt extremely small. Therefore, I submit that this Board of Education should be constituted in such a way that the universality of the test of education of the province be not impaired, that the Board of Education should look to the education of the boys of the whole province, and that a universal examination should take place under its direction which would give the best boys a chance of distinguishing themselves in the country.

With these words, I beg to support the resolution, but with the above reservation.

Rai HARENDRANATH CHAUDHURI: As one intimately in touch with secondary education and responsible for the management of a High English School and hence knowing the difficulties under which such a school with limited resources has got to work, I beg to support the resolution moved by Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur I prefer the resolution to the amendment proposed by Babu Surendra Nath Mullick, as the resolution is more comprehensive It proposes not only that the Board of Secondary Education should control the secondary schools, but it also recommends that the management should vest in the Board and that adequate grants be made by Government and placed at the disposal of such a Board for carrying on the schools so transferred.

Under the present arrangement, Sir, the authorities who set up the ideal have not got to look to the resources of the secondary schools; those who call the tune do not think about paying the piper. What generally happens, therefore, is that observance of rules and conditions is insisted upon regardless of the resources of the secondary schools and therefore, under the present arrangement, more attention is given to paraphernalia than to the advancement of secondary education. Such an arrangement should not go on, and, therefore, when Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur asks for a modification of this arrangement, I cannot but support him.

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: I do not wish to take up much time of the Council, but I want to know one or two points in connection with this resolution.

In the first place, I observe from the resolution, as drafted or rather as moved by Raj Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur, that it is to give effect to the recommendations of the Calcutta University Commission.

Well, as I understand the recommendation of the Commission, they recommend a Board of Education for the control not only of secondary schools, but also of intermediate colleges teaching up to the I.A. standard. Am I to understand that this Board when constituted would control the teaching up to the matriculation standard? If so, it is a diviation from the recommendation of the Sadler Commission. To my mind it seems that it would be better to leave the matter in the hands of Government to see what they did before the Council took any action on the basis of the recommendation of the Sadler Commission instead of committing ourselves entirely at this stage either to the resolution or to the recommendation. Personally, I have no objection to the Board of Secondary Education controlling secondary education

Another point which should be cleared up—and I believe the Hon'ble Minister would like to clear up this point—is this: At present the income from the matriculation examination amounts to Rs 3,00,000. I believe that this amount helps the University in conducting the Post-graduate Department. Well, Government contributes Rs 1,20,000 for the maintenance of the University: this is, I understand, quite inadequate for the purpose, and, to a certain extent, the fees derived from the matriculation examination are utilised for the maintenance of the Post-graduate Department. Am I to understand that, if this is taken away from the University, the Government will recoup the loss which the University will sustain? If it is intended that the Post-graduate teaching is to be abolished altogether, that is a different thing A decision on this point may be arrived at by the Council having regard to the fact that the Calcutta University is now under the control of the local government But if the Post-graduate Department is to continue, as it should, money must be found for it, it is all a question of money, and I do not know how this will be met by the Hon'ble Minister That is the point which confronts me, and I hope that more light will be thrown by the Hon'ble Minister on the subject.

Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ: I rise to support the amendment moved by Babu Sarendra Nath Mullick There cannot be any question that the Calcutta University has become too cumbrous and it is necessary that a separate Board should be formed with a view to take up secondary and vocational education. But with respect to its constitution it is necessary that this Council should give its attention, and I am thankful to Babu Surendra Nath Mullick as well as to Babu Surendra Nath Ray and the other speakers, who have said in their speeches that it is absolutely necessary that this Board should represent the Muhammadans fully and the other minorities and, as Mr. H. A. Stark has pointed out, it should also have a fair representation of the Anglo-Indian community also. In this province we have different communities and various communities are minorities, and it is necessary that their interests should be particularly looked to. There are the depressed classes, the Indian

Christian community. To my mind, in places where some communities are in great minority they should have a better representation than they are entitled to by their number.

One thing strikes me in the amendment. The amendment places both the general and vocational education under the control of the Board. The question arises whether this Board should be under the guidance of one particular Minister, the Minister for Education, or the Minister for Technical Education as well. But this is a matter which entirely concerns the Government departments, and there is no doubt that a settlement will be arrived at and both the departments of Government will be able to carry on the work of administration and superintendence in the best possible manner. As to the necessity for the formation of that Board the previous speakers have said enough and all I can say is this: that at the present moment it seems to be absolutely necessary that our people should have an education which would enable them not only to secure a place of distinction but should also enable them to take to various other means of livelihood which would allow them to live happy and prosperous.

Professor S. C. MUKHERJI: Both the resolution and the amendment provoke a few pertinent questions and one finds it a bit difficult to make up one's mind without satisfactory answers to these questions. I am sure the Minister of Education will be able to clear a number of points.

The first question that I should like to ask is this: Is not the recommendation for the establishment of a Board for Secondary Education a deviation from the recommendations made by the Calcutta University Commission? Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur in his resolution says that a Board of Education for the superintendence of secondary schools is a recommendation of the Calcutta University Commission. Babu Surendra Nath Mullick is careful; he has not stated any such thing in his amendment. I wish the representative of the Calcutta University were more accurate in the wording of his resolution. So far as I have been able to follow the report of the Calcutta University Commission, there is nowhere any recommendation for the establishment of a Board for secondary schools. A very minute and close examination of the report makes it perfectly clear that according to the Calcutta University Commission the secondary schools and the intermediate classes which are now known as intermediate colleges must form one organic and integral whole and must be regarded as a 'self-contained unit. What is proposed here is a bifurcation of this unit. Well, it is for this Legislative Council to decide whether it wants to deviate absolutely from the recommendation made by the Calcutta University Commission. Of course, if there is sufficient justification for it, by all means let us go ahead, but let us go ahead with our eyes wide open.

The next question that I should like to ask is this: Is co-ordination possible if the proposed Board of secondary schools is going to take the

secondary education of the province into consideration, and going to reform it by introducing vocational courses of study? Will there be an organic co-ordination between the reformed secondary schools and the present intermediate colleges as they are in vogue in the country? In order to maintain an organic unity, and to follow the recommendations of the Calcutta University Commission, it seems to me it is incumbent and absolutely necessary that the two should *go pari passu* and simultaneous reforms are absolutely necessary—but I do not wish to dogmatize on the point. These are things on which different views can be held. I simply wish to draw the attention of the Hon'ble Minister and the members of this Council as to what exactly the recommendations of the Commission are.

I am very glad that my friend Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur has just referred to the financial aspect of the question, so far as the Calcutta University is concerned, in relation to its Post-graduate Department. Though Babu Surendra Nath Mullick has described the relationship to be that of the milkman and the cow, still I am thankful to him for the sympathetic attitude that he has taken in this matter, because in spite of this alleged commercial relationship, Babu Surendra Nath Mullick thinks that there is every reason to support the Post-graduate machinery. Whether we stigmatize it as a commercial relationship or not, the fact is—and let us face it fair and square—that the present Post-graduate Department notwithstanding all its faults, notwithstanding the charges that have been levelled against it in the public press, notwithstanding the limitations that have been referred to—the fact is that it is supported to a very great extent by the income which is received from the fees of the matriculation examination. There is a great deal of force in the public criticism, namely, why should the income or a substantial part of the income from the matriculation examination fees go towards the maintenance of the Post-graduate Department? Only this must be said that the Government have recognised this department, and therefore the Hon'ble Minister in charge of Education is honour bound to support that institution also. I cannot imagine that the Hon'ble Minister of Education, in his anxiety to see the secondary schools reformed, is prepared to see the Post-graduate Department altogether wrecked or continuing its existence in a most mutilated, mangled and maimed form. I do not think this is at all the desire of the Minister. I hope the Minister, in his reply, will give us an assurance in the matter as to how far he is prepared to compensate the loss which will be sustained by the University in this connection.

The question of control of funds is a very delicate question. Supposing the entire control of funds goes to the Board of Education, I do not see where the Minister comes in; I do not know what voice he will have in the management, in the control, in the supervision of the secondary schools and what *locus standi* he will have. This is a question

which I simply refer to for the Minister to answer, and I hope he will clear the point.

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: The question has been debated at great length. It is undoubtedly a question of great importance. Although the question is one of great importance, at the present moment it is a question of academic interest. I say it is a question of academic interest for the present because so long as we do not legislate we cannot take away, from the control of the Calcutta University, the examination of the matriculation students or the right to lay down the curriculum for them. If I legislate, I shall have to come before this Council. From that point of view, perhaps, the members of this Council will appreciate that, at this stage, it is hardly necessary to go into any questions of detail. The members of this House will have their say when the legislation is introduced, if it is introduced at all, and they will have the full opportunity of laying down what the provisions of that legislation should be with regard to matters of detail. I am making this preliminary remark because many members have made various suggestions as to what precisely the constitution of the Board should be, as to what the powers of the Board should be, and so on. I feel I shall be taking up the time of this Council uselessly if I enter into an examination of these points of detail.

There is another preliminary observation which, I think, I ought to make at this stage. What will be the effect of the resolution or the amendment if either of them be accepted by the Government or passed by this Council in spite of the views of the Government? The effect simply will be this—that it will be a recommendation to the Government to introduce legislation. I do not propose to enter into the important constitutional question, as to how far recommendations relating to legislation are binding on the Government, but I may say, in a matter like this, I am willing to act according to the desire of the majority of the Council. Therefore, whatever the constitutional position may be, if the majority of the members of this House desire that certain general principles should be adopted, I am willing to accept those general principles; but I feel it will not be right on my part to accept the details at this stage. It is not right that the members of this Council should be deprived of an opportunity of giving proper consideration to various details and often details are important, specially those relating to the constitution of the Board; details as to the power of the Board and so on. Therefore, if an attempt be made to impose details on the Government at this stage, I am bound to oppose such attempt.

As regards the general position, the underlying principle both of the resolution and of the amendment is that a Board for secondary education should be established in Bengal. With regard to this suggestion there are one or two important points which I should like to place before the Council. I believe that every member of this Council is aware that

under the recommendations of the Calcutta University Commission the formation of an Intermediate Board was suggested and not a Secondary Board. Perhaps the mover was led into an error by some members of the teachers' conference to which he referred. But as the mover has himself said that he did not intend an Intermediate Board it is hardly necessary for me to go into the matter any further; but it has an importance of its own. The Calcutta University Commission sat for months, went through valuable evidence, and made certain recommendations. Will it be right for the members of this Council to deviate from those recommendations unless a good cause exists for a departure from their recommendations? Now, we all know that the Calcutta University Commission also stated that it will be necessary to spend large sums of money to bifurcate the present system, to establish intermediate colleges as institutions separate from University Colleges, and to start an Intermediate Board as an institution separate from the Calcutta University. Take alone the Presidency College, it will cost over Rs 20 lakhs in capital expenditure and perhaps Rs. 2 lakhs in recurring expense, if we are to separate the intermediate from the post-intermediate section. Taking the colleges in Calcutta, perhaps the capital expense will be somewhere near Rs 50 lakhs and the recurring expense will be about Rs 8 to 10 lakhs The Calcutta University Commission, at page 262, Volume V, of their report say that as regards the recurring expense it would seem to be unsafe to assume that the full system could be worked at a less cost to the State than about Rs. 15 to Rs 20 lakhs—that is with regard to the intermediate colleges alone But since then expenses have gone up and the figure mentioned is only for the recurring expense As regards the capital expense, the total for the whole province would come up to at least Rs 70 to 80 lakhs Therefore, if any question of deviation from the recommendation of the Calcutta University Commission arises the most important point will be the question of finance. The members of this Council are all aware that on account of the unjust treatment meted out to this province in the matter of financial adjustment, we have a deficit of over Rs. 2 crores and we are met with the difficulty that if we have to give effect to the recommendation of the Calcutta University Commission's report, as undoubtedly we ought to do if we can, we have not the money. As regards raising funds by taxation we have to remember that before the Minister for Education can touch a single rupee of the extra taxation, the vast deficit of Rs. 2 crores will have to be met out of this extra taxation. Speaking for myself—and on another occasion I expressed my views on the matter. I am not prepared to admit that our province should be taxed merely because some people blundered over the financial readjustment of this province. Therefore, unless the Government of India or the Secretary of State come to our rescue in the matter of financial readjustment, an early acceptance of the recommendations of the Calcutta University Commission is perhaps not to be thought of, however, regretfully I may have to say this. But, fortunately, we do

not know yet what the decision of the Government of India or the Secretary of State on this question will be. Let us hope that the decision will be favourable, and if the decision be favourable then this Council ought to consider whether we should deviate from the recommendations of the Calcutta University Commission. But as we do not yet know what that decision will be, the present discussion will serve the useful purpose of throwing much light on the subject. Then again the decision of the Government of India or the Secretary of State may be adverse to us. In that case the question will arise, whether or not the establishment of a Secondary Board will be helpful to the improvement of education in this province. Even if the decision of the Secretary of State be favourable to us the question may still have to be considered for we cannot change the present system of education in a day. We will have to proceed step by step and stage by stage, and even if we have better financial resources, it may be a wise thing for the Council to advise me later on to start a Secondary Board and to add on to it the functions of an Intermediate Board, as each college is equipped for such purpose. The picture that presents itself to my mind is something like this: even if we have financial stability, we might begin by starting a Secondary Board with power to control intermediate colleges. It must take at least two to three years to build and equip an institution and it will probably take a few years to start a number of intermediate colleges all over the province. In short, there must be a stage of transition, and as we go on, we may be able to bring in more and more intermediate colleges under the Board. But at the present moment, it is not possible for me, as I do not know what the financial position will be, to state definitely whether we should have an Intermediate Board or a Secondary Board. But, as regards the principle of the thing, I do not propose to oppose it. Whether we have the money, or whether we do not get the money, I feel that there are certain advantages if we have a Secondary Board as a beginning. The first advantage is that, under the present constitution of the Calcutta University, it has to deal with over 900 high schools and with various matters of details with regard to these high schools; and one executive Council, namely, the Syndicate, deals not only with these 900 high schools but also with a large number of intermediate and other colleges. Not merely that, it has to look after the Post-graduate affairs of the University; it had also to look after the law colleges and various other activities of the Calcutta University and their activities are so many. It is not fair to burden one executive body with so much responsibility. From that point of view alone I welcome the suggestion.

Certain important questions were put to me by Professor Mukherji and Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur. It is right and proper that I should express my views with regard to these questions, but I must tell the Council that my views must be of a very provisional nature, because much will depend on our financial resources.

The first point put to me by Professor Mukherji is: Was it not the recommendation of the Calcutta University Commission to start intermediate colleges? I have answered that point. The second point is: Is co-ordination possible between the Calcutta University and the Intermediate Board? My provisional view is that it would be fatal to have a Secondary Board unless we have co-ordination. But the members of this Council will have every opportunity to see that such co-ordination be established, because in my view nothing can be done without legislation. Then the next question, and it is a question of great importance, that was put to me is: What will be the financial position of the Calcutta University? There again my provisional view is—and I hope and trust that the members of this Council will agree with that view—that it must be farthest from the desire of anybody present here to destroy the Calcutta University. It ought to be the duty of the members of this Council and of the Government to see that the Calcutta University be not neglected. But the amount of help and the nature of the activities which should legitimately appertain to the Calcutta University, are matters for further consideration by the Council and the Government. I am not prepared at this stage to lay down as to whether the activities of the Calcutta University with regard to the Post-graduate courses of studies should be limited or expanded or that they should remain as they are. I had not the opportunity till recently to go into the matter. I propose to examine the question on its own merits and to do what ought to be done in my judgment on the merits of this question and with due regard to the resources of the Government. But is it necessary to give assurance at this stage? The matter will come before the Council. Therefore, in giving this provisional assurance, I repeat again that I do so with the utmost caution. I do not propose to take up the time of the Council any longer as I understand the mover of the resolution has agreed to amend the resolution in the following form:

"This Council recommends to the Government that the formation of a Board of Education for the superintendence of secondary schools be carried without delay."

I am willing to leave this amended resolution to the free vote of the non-official members, because from the point of view of the Government this question will become important when the question of legislation will come and that we cannot decide till we know where we stand financially.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: The great difference between me, and the Hon'ble Mr. P. C. Mitter and Babu Surendra Nath Mullick is whether funds should be placed at the disposal of the Board. There is no other difference.

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: Is it necessary for the Rai Bahadur to speak after he has agreed to the change in the resolution?

The PRESIDENT: I do not think I have permitted the change yet. After the Rai Bahadur had spoken I shall put it to the House.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: This question is a very material one. I do not wish for a moment to cripple the resources of the University; nor do I wish that the funds derived from the matriculation schools should go to the Government. What I desire is that if the funds be taken out of the hands of the University they should be placed at the disposal of the Board. That is a matter of detail and a very important detail upon which we have differed Therefore, I could not accept the amendment and I was at first very reluctant to agree to the proposal of the Hon'ble Mr. Mitter, but the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea told me that I should agree to accept the proposal of the formation of the Board for secondary education for the present.

Mr. D. C. GHOSE: May I rise to a point of order? Is the Rai Bahadur in order in referring to negotiations that have taken place with regard to the amendment of his resolution?

The Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: I think I am quite in order. (A voice: A member cannot himself decide whether he is in order.) The question of funds or of the constitution or any other detail must have to be settled hereafter We cannot force it upon the Government just now and the Hon'ble Mr. P. C. Mitter was right in saying that there must be legislation. Therefore, I have no other alternative but to accept the Government suggestion that we should be satisfied only with the formation of a Board of Education and that we should be at liberty to raise this question of funds or any other question of detail hereafter. As the matter is of very great difficulty, I do not wish to press upon the Government just now, and I would therefore beg leave to strike out the last three lines from my resolution

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: The resolution in its amended form reads as follows:—

"This Council recommends to the Government that the formation of a Board of Education for the superintendence of secondary schools be carried out without delay."

I have nothing further to add to what I have already said. I will leave the original motion in the above amended form and the amendment of Mr. Mullick to the free vote of the non-official members of this Council.

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: I understand the Hon'ble Minister has accepted the amendment of Mr. Mullick.

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER: I have left it to the free vote of the non-official members.

The PRESIDENT: The acceptance of a motion by the Government Member is not sufficient. I shall have to see how far we can accept it.

The mover of the original resolution now wants to amend his motion in the form suggesed by the Hon'ble Mr. Mitter and I ask the House whether such permission can be given.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: Then I beg leave to speak on this matter.

The PRESIDENT: I do not think you can speak again.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: I ask for a division.

Mr. D. C. GHOSE: Is the Rai Bahadur entitled to ask for a division after having withdrawn his original resolution?

The PRESIDENT: He does not withdraw the whole but only a part of it. I do not like to give him permission to do so without ascertaining the sense of the Council. He has moved his resolution in the form in which it appears in the agenda paper. The Council has now the control of the motion and I want to ask the members if they would allow him to amend his motion in the form suggested by the Hon'ble Mr. Mitter. The question before the Council is whether the motion having been moved in a particular form, if the member wants to make an alteration at the last stage, he should be allowed to do so.

Leave was then given to the motion being amended in the following form:—

"This Council recommends to the Government that the formation of a Board of Education for the superintendence of secondary schools, general and vocational, be carried out without delay and that the said Board be so constituted as to be representative of the various interests and communities concerned, with a non-official majority and that, if necessary, legislation be undertaken for carrying out the above objects."

The amended resolution was then put and agreed to.

Mainamati Survey School.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: "This Council recommends to the Government that brick-built houses be erected in place of the existing *kutcha* houses, attached to the Mainamati Survey School near Comilla, at an early date."

Though the resolution, at first sight, seems to concern itself with a local or a parochial matter, I think I ought to tell the Council at once that the matter is of provincial importance, because this is the only Government Survey School in the Province that teaches higher

survey. The survey schools at Dacca, Rangpur, Pabna and Rajshahi only teach up to the lower standard. As the work of this school may not be known to many members of the Council, and as its importance may not therefore be properly judged, I hope the Council will permit me to give, in as few words as I can, a short description of this school. In view of the importance of survey and settlement work in the province, it was thought desirable to establish a high grade survey school and the site was selected at Mainamati, near the town of Comilla. The place is a very healthy one, and the school has been a great success from the beginning.

The school was established in 1913, as an experiment, as a temporary measure. The cost of the construction of houses—school-house, quarters, boarding-houses, etc., was about Rs. 40,000, the first mistake was made in having *kutcha* houses with thatched roof and *tarzi* walls. I suppose, as the school was then regarded as a temporary one, the Government had no other alternative than to have temporary houses. I have not much quarrel with this mistake. But what I cannot understand is that even when the school was made permanent in September 1917, no scheme for having permanent *pucca* buildings seems to have been taken up. There cannot be any justification for this omission or remissness, because, even as early as 1914, the school house and the Principal's bungalow were burnt down as a result of incendiarism. This meant a loss of nearly Rs. 15,000 to the Government and even then nobody seems to have seriously thought about having brick-built houses. A patched-up repair and construction of *kutcha* houses were effected. The gods seem to have smiled at this penny-building and on the 17th April, 1918, nearly six months after the school had been declared permanent, a storm arose and blew down the Hindu Boarding House at dead of night, when nearly twenty-eight boarders were asleep. It was a miracle that saved the poor students from an untimely grave, one would have thought, that this second warning would have opened the eyes of the Government to the necessity of having good houses for the school, which had been declared a permanent one. Red-tapeism is slow to move—I am glad to notice that in this Council, white tapes are now being introduced in place of red tapes. I hope this means that the days of red-tapeism are fast coming to a close. Even then, the Government fixed up a *kutcha* house in place of the blown-up shed. Here again, the Government sustained a loss of nearly Rs. 5,000. The gods smiled again at this second folly of the Government and only a month ago—on 2nd of June 1921 at 3 o'clock in the afternoon when the school was sitting and the students, teachers, clerks, practically the whole complement of the school were inside the house, down came a thunder-storm, there was a lightning stroke and the whole school house was reduced to ashes in the twinkling of an eye. The students and teachers ran about for their very lives in the blinding thunderstorm and it is a wonder that no lives were lost. All the records—all the papers have been destroyed by

the fire, so much so, that the Principal has been obliged to advertise in the papers requesting the applicants for admission to send fresh applications as all the applications have been burnt to ashes. Now I ask, can a school, an important and only school of its kind in the whole province, be run at such risk? There is a common saying that once bit twice shy, but here there have been three bites already and it is time the Government became shy of the *kutcha* jerry-built houses. The question of expenses cannot be of much consequence, because as a result of these *kutcha* houses Government have been spending a large amount of money every year on minor repairs. There is a very large amount spent in major repairs also. The Government should not adopt the policy of being penny wise and pound foolish. If I am not much mistaken the original *kutcha* houses were designed only for three years. Nearly three times three years are passing and yet we are going on with patchwork. Surely, there should be a permanent habitation for a permanent useful school like this. The matter is of great importance, it cannot brook any delay. I hope the Government will not hesitate to take up the work at once, even if they have to bring a supplementary budget for the purpose.

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: I accept the resolution as moved by Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta. The Survey School at Mainamati is doing good work and it is the intention of Government to provide it with permanent buildings. A scheme for the construction of such buildings was submitted to Government last year, but unfortunately it was found impossible to provide funds for it in the current year's budget. The matter has now become one of urgency owing to the destruction of the main building last month by fire. It obviously would be a waste of money to erect new temporary buildings and I shall do my best to obtain money for the construction of permanent buildings at the earliest possible date.

The motion was then put and agreed to.

Accommodation for mufassal members.

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: "This Council recommends to the Government that they may be pleased to provide accommodation for members of this Council who have to come from the mufassal and who are in need of such accommodation."

It is at the request of some of my mufassal friends that I have brought forward this resolution before this Council. You are probably aware that we have now a very large number of mufassal members, both Hindus and Muhammandans, who have to attend meetings of the Council which are more frequent now than they were in the previous councils, and most of them have no place to go to or where they can find accommodation. Though Calcutta is a very large place still there are only a limited number of places where these members of Council can go and live. You cannot

get good hotels; you cannot get restaurants; you cannot get good houses; you cannot get good rooms. Calcutta is not like Bombay, a city of hotels. I was told by one of the members of this Council that a very large number of mufassal members had to take shelter in a *musafirkhana* kindly lent to them by a Muhammadan member of this Council. Of course you can go and live in such a place for a few days, but if you continue to be the guest of one person it looks rather odd. I know that members of the Legislative Assembly are provided with accommodation by the Government of India both at Delhi and at Simla. They have got a number of hotels where they can have rooms and even a suite of rooms if they want them and I was told the other day by a friend of mine, who is a member of the Legislative Assembly, that Government is going to provide accommodation also at Simla. I know that all this accommodation means additional expenditure. But the members of this Council who want accommodation will only be too glad to pay rent for the rooms they occupy for the days they remain there as the members of the Legislative Assembly do. I do not want Government to construct houses and spend large sums of money for the accommodation of members. All I want is that they should rent houses, one for the Hindus and the other for the Muhammadans and accommodate them there. They will make their own arrangements as regards food. It may be in the recollection of some of the old members of this Council that one of our members, Mr. Irwin, openly said one day in the Council in the presence of Lord Ronaldshay that he could not find any accommodation at Dacca even in the Dak bungalow and he had to pass the whole night probably under the blue canopy of heaven. That being the case it is necessary that Government could do something for providing accommodation in Calcutta for the mufassal members of this Council.

With these remarks, I beg to move this resolution.

The PRESIDENT: This motion and the next motion seem to be identical except that Babu Surendra Nath Ray speaks of the mufassal members only, as to which resolution No. 60 is silent. But I do not think that Babu Nibaran Chandra Das Gupta intends to propose accommodation for Calcutta members. Both the resolutions are therefore practically identical and I will therefore ask Babu Nibaran Chandra Das Gupta to speak on resolution No. 59.

The resolution of Babu Nibaran Chandra Das Gupta was as follows:

"This Council recommends to the Government that a suitable house or houses be constructed or rented for the lodgment of members of the Legislative Council, both Hindus and Muhammadans."

Babu NIBARAN CHANDRA DAS GUPTA: I am in entire accord with the view you have taken about the identity of the resolutions Nos. 59 and 60 on the Agenda, and I bow to your ruling. I am glad that the resolution has been moved by my friend Babu Surendra Nath Ray, because, as a mufassal member, it does not look well that I should say much upon

this question because it affects me personally—I am more in the position of a witness than in the position of a debator. You can fully imagine to what difficulties and inconveniences we are put—when we come from the mufassal. We are driven from pillar to post and from post to pillar in securing accommodation. You, Gentlemen, members of this Council, are fully aware of these difficulties and I do not think I should take the time of the Council by expatiating on the numerous inconveniences to which we are subjected for want of proper accommodation and lodgment.

With these words, I beg to support the resolution moved by Babu Surendra Nath Ray.

MEMBER in charge of LEGISLATIVE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): I quite realise the difficulties which have been voiced in the Council this afternoon and which have given grounds for the resolution which has just been ventilated, but while I am exceedingly sorry that those who come down here to render public service by attending meetings of the Council should be put to inconvenience, yet I cannot think that, in view of various other demands that are at present pressing upon our somewhat straitened purse, it is wise for this Council to commit Government to further expenditure of this kind. It is difficult to estimate what expenditure precisely would be involved, since, for one thing, it is very difficult to foresee how many members would wish to avail themselves of these facilities, assuming that they were given. So far as I can make out, there are about seventy or eighty members who would probably come under the general description mentioned in this resolution, but of course it does not follow that all those would care to reside in Government accommodation, even if it were available. Further, it is obvious that the members would not form a homogeneous body. There would be Hindu members and Muhammadan members and Christian members, differing among themselves in their mode of living. It would not be an easy thing to construct one building which would conveniently bring them together under one roof. But if we were to construct separate buildings the expenditure would obviously increase, and the difficulties of providing accommodation would become still greater. Clearly also, if we are to provide accommodation, it would only be occupied for a portion of the year, and for a considerable part of the year it would stand empty.

The precedents for action of this kind, so far as we are concerned here in Bengal, are very slight. It is true that when we had Council meetings at Dacca, in view of the difficulties which were represented by certain gentlemen, we did do what we could to accommodate them there. But that was only rendered possible by the fact that at Dacca there were existing buildings. Those buildings being empty, it was a perfectly reasonable thing that we should try and help the members of this Council, and we did so. The only other precedents, so far as we know, are those of Delhi and Simla. Neither, I take it, would be argued in this Council to

be analogous in any way to Calcutta. After all, we pride ourselves on Calcutta as being the first city in India, and we differ from Simla in this respect that, while accommodation *can* be had here without Government help, in Simla, but for the action of Government, accommodation for so many members would have been impossible. In the same way, at Raisena in Delhi, only Government could undertake the housing of the members. In Calcutta we are quite aware that difficulties as regards house accommodation exist, and at the present moment they are particularly acute, though we hope that with the extension of building which is going on these difficulties may become less in time. There are, no doubt, difficulties, and a certain amount of inconvenience must be felt by those who cannot find accommodation at a reasonable price. But the case is certainly not like Simla and Delhi where accommodation is not available at all. In Calcutta there is trouble and inconvenience, but accommodation *can* be found, and it is not the case that we find members of this Council sleeping on the maidan.

That is the position as it strikes Government. The cost of any scheme of building is obviously great. We asked the Public Works Department if they could give any estimate, and they said that accommodation for eighty members would cost about Rs. 18,00,000. That estimate is unreliable in so far as we do not know the exact number and description of those who would occupy any building, but this much is certain that it would cost money, and in our present financial situation it would be unwise to embark upon such a costly enterprise. We see a huge outlay looming in the very near future when we have to construct a new Council Chamber, and from the remarks which have been made in criticism of our existing accommodation, that scheme, I take it, will meet with the approbation of every one, but it is bound to be an expensive scheme directly connected with this Council. That being so, I would hesitate before embarking upon yet another scheme involving a large outlay. We give allowances to members of Council which are meant to meet their expenses in Calcutta. If it can be shown that their reasonable expenses are not covered by these allowances, then by all means let the matter be re-examined with a view to their being enhanced, but for the present I should be reluctant to go further.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: I oppose the motion on grounds of propriety and of expense. Only the other day we refused to provide a residence for the Chief Justice and to-day we come before the House with a demand for a house for ourselves. We are given decent allowances and accommodation is not wanting here. So, Sir, I do not find any necessity for providing a special residence for the members of this Council. I oppose the resolution.

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: From this afternoon's discussion I realise the position which I felt when the question of the time of sitting of the Council was first raised in this House. I have now come

to realise that the mufassal members are perhaps the fifth or sixth wheel of this Council. We know that our precious time is wasted—we may consider it precious but it has no meaning absolutely to the Calcutta people here. The Rajas, Rajas' sons, the Maharajas, the zamindars, big barristers and High Court Judges on pension, or otherwise, I do not know, have got their palatial buildings and permanent houses here. It is for their sake that we are compelled to sit till seven in the evening and waste the best hours of morning having come from hundreds and hundreds of miles away. But now you will not provide us with accommodation and just as my friend Babu Nibaran Chandra Das Gupta has described, you compel us to move from pillar to post and from post to pillar, and perhaps it is to the interest of some persons that these mufassal members who make their position uncomfortable would soon go away for want of suitable accommodation here At the time of fixing the hours of the Council meeting it was noticed that these mufassal members usually absented themselves from the latter part of the meetings. Who knows that this was not one of the reasons for fixing the hours of the meeting in the afternoon. So sometimes, Sir, the wish is the farther to the argument, and so it appears that because you wish that my fellow members like Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta and others should not be present at the Council meeting and waste your valuable time and prevent you from doing something which you would like to do, therefore, the more these people are driven off from Calcutta the better It has been said sometimes that the mufassal lawyers should be driven off from the precincts of the Calcutta High Court, and perhaps the time has come when they should be driven away from the Council precincts as well. We have no place to leave in and what is the good of coming here and showing that we are so many M. L. C's Now, Sir, you will at once realise that unless a man settles down and has a room to study, what is the good of only coming here and talking rubbish which has been described by some of the local papers as useless Therefore, it is necessary that we should have some accommodation Not that we want it gratis My friend Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray is perhaps under the idea that we want it gratis. If we get proper accommodation we will pay for it. As circumstances stand, I have to beg for accommodation of several of my friends. No doubt some of them offered me accommodation but it would have been simply to inconvenience them. And what is the result? The result is one day I stop at one place, another day at another place, and consequently the notice of meeting of the Judicial Committee for the day before yesterday did not reach me in time for me to attend it. If you really want work from us you ought to see to our convenience. Certainly we are not very big people—we are poor men compared with the people of Calcutta. Our earnings have been stopped and the pittance of Rs. 10 only for days on which we attend the Council—I know there is sometimes objection to paying for the intervening Saturdays and Sundays—is hardly sufficient

to meet our expenses. This is the way in which we are treated and if this is not shabby treatment, I do not know what it is. We do not get any pay. I appeal to you to consider whether that is sufficient even for the purpose of paying our conveyance charges if we have got to come and attend the Council from some distance. It costs me Rs. 2-2-0 to come to the Council in a taxi-cab.

The PRESIDENT: The question before the House is for providing accommodation for the members. We are not concerned with the question of the payment of taxi hire.

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: I abide by your decision. It will certainly be proper for Government to give us some accommodation and the accommodation will not be required by all the people because some of them have got houses here, only twenty-five or thirty people will want accommodation and will gladly pay rent for the same.

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: I must say that I fully sympathise with the difficulties which my mufassal friends have to face in coming and living in Calcutta for a week or eight or ten days at a stretch. I know from my personal knowledge that many of them do not find any suitable accommodation and even some of them have to hover round to get accommodation, and I think, therefore, that the resolution requires a more sympathetic consideration from Government, but at the same time I quite agree with the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler that it is not possible to embark on such a huge expenditure of 14 or 20 lakhs of rupees. I think the matter might be examined further and that some arrangements may be made by which temporary accommodation may be secured for the mufassal members during their stay in Calcutta. Of course, I do not make any concrete proposal here, but one suggestion occurred to me and that is this, that Government may perhaps help those members who require accommodation by inquiring and finding out whether accommodation is available in various Hindu and Muhammadan boarding houses and hostels. I think if such arrangements are made by Government, it will be very easy for them on their arrival in Calcutta to get ready accommodation to live, otherwise I know they will be, as they are now, put to considerable difficulties. I must say that, although my friend Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray said that we have disallowed the Chief Justice's residence and therefore the mufassal members who come here at the sacrifice of their profession, time and income should not be provided with accommodation, that does not hold good at all. The Kumar Sahib may not feel any difficulty—I know he had no difficulty in getting accommodation in Calcutta, but there are members who have considerable difficulty in getting suitable accommodation. I think, therefore, that this resolution may be accepted in this way that inquiries may be made, so that Government may be in a position to find out suitable accommodation for those members who need it. I am sure the number

will not be very large, but those who are not in a position to get ready accommodation will be greatly helped. I know there are lots of boarding houses in Calcutta and it will not be very difficult to reserve rooms for the accommodation of mufassal members at these places. I am inclined to think at the same time that the allowance of Rs. 10 per diem is a very miserable pittance. I think I may say this, that it hardly covers the cost of gharry-hire of members. Of course, it does not effect the Calcutta members and they are not entitled to it.

The PRESIDENT: The question of increasing the daily allowance of members is not before the House.

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: That has been referred to by the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler, and I think that matter ought to be taken into consideration.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: It is impossible for us to build houses at 3 or 4 lakhs of rupees. We have got no money. Therefore the only course left to us—and that is the course recommended by the mover—is that we should rent houses. It should be clearly understood, as the mover has said, and so far as I am aware—I have spoken to most of the members—the members will pay reasonable rent. If that be so, there can be no objection to Government simply acting as an intermediary for getting houses on rent. On this footing alone this resolution should be supported and I understand the mover wants nothing more. He made it clear in his opening speech. I wish he had made it still more clear. We do not wish to add to the burdens of Government any more. We know our primary needs are not met and we cannot allow fresh burdens to be imposed upon Government.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: I must say that I sympathise with those gentlemen who have asked for this concession. I am perfectly sure that unless these gentlemen had been put to the greatest difficulty they would not have brought this matter before the Council. Naturally everybody is anxious not to bring such matters before the Council or the public, but now they have found it almost impossible to get over all this trouble and inconvenience about getting accommodation and that is the reason why they have brought it to the notice of the Council. Sir Henry Wheeler has said that Government will have to incur an expenditure of about Rs. 14 lakhs if accommodation is to be provided for the members. I venture to think that it need not be so. I think there will be no difficulty at all if we rent three of four houses in the Indian quarter of the town at Rs. 5,000 or Rs. 6,000 a year. It is quite possible to get three or four houses of this description which will accommodate these gentlemen. These gentlemen are willing to pay Rs. 10 or Rs. 20 a month per each room they will occupy, and so the whole amount will be practically realized. The only question is whether the Government is prepared

to take that little amount of trouble which is necessary to see to the convenience of the mufassal members. A very small expenditure is required from the public exchequer. I therefore think that I ought to support this resolution.

So far as Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray's observations are concerned, that when we have not voted a house for the Chief Justice, we must not provide accommodation for the mufassal members, I think he did not quite follow the discussion on that resolution. He does not seem to know why that was not allowed. The particular reason for which I moved that resolution was that it was not desirable that the Chief Justice should have a residence provided by the Government of Bengal. There was considerable force in that. All that those gentlemen ask for is that they may be provided with accommodation for which they are willing to pay. We all know the difficulty the European gentlemen may not know it—in getting accommodation here. I asked one of my friends where he was living as I wanted to go and see him. He said that he had been unable to get a suitable house and that the house he was living in was a wretched place for any one to go. I said that it did not matter—it was our birthright to live in wretched places. I went there and found that the place was indeed a wretched one and some European members will not put even their dogs or horses there. But what could the gentleman do, he could not secure a suitable house. These gentlemen come here for a few days, and they cannot be expected to get a house of even a modest size for Rs. 120 or Rs. 150 a month. Within half a mile of the tram line we cannot get a house worth living in for less than Rs. 150 a month. That is the difficulty, and I feel it. I am therefore strongly of opinion that something should be done for these gentlemen. It is not necessary that a large amount should be spent. After deducting the rent realized from the members it will come if at all to about Rs. 5,000 or Rs. 6,000 a year. I think it will be quite easy to provide accommodation in this way.

Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: I beg to support this resolution. When I came down to Calcutta to attend this meeting I had a mind not to support this resolution, but as luck would have it, I have been put to the greatest difficulty possible in finding out accommodation for myself. I have taken a room in the Arjya Nibas building and I have to pay a rent of Rs. 5 a day and I have to get my food cooked on the roof of the house, and yesterday, while I was taking my food, God was kind enough to pour a good shower and I was fully drenched. I would not have supported this resolution only for the inconvenience of one member, but the thing is many of us find difficulty in getting good accomodation. I have been trying to get a house, but no house can be had unless one takes a lease for a year at least. I would not say more about these things. My friend (Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur) says that no house is available on account of the Rent Act. If a house like the

Samavaya Mansions could be rented, we would be glad to pay rent at Rs. 3 or Rs. 4 per diem per room for the period we occupy the same, and if some such arrangement could be made, it would relieve us a great deal. With these words, I beg to support this resolution.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: Sir, with your permission may I make a suggestion?

The PRESIDENT: It would be better if you make your observations after I have finished with the list. There are some more speakers on the list.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: It might shorten the discussion if I made my suggestion now. The matter is not one which can conveniently be discussed in Council. The best thing would be if we discussed things at a round table conversation with those Council members who have experienced difficulties. We can then see what precisely their difficulties are, and whether there is any way of meeting them, and I am quite ready to deal with the question in that way.

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: After the observations which have been made by the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler, I beg to withdraw my resolution.

The resolution was then, by leave of the Council, withdrawn.

Control of fairs and "melas."

Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: "This Council recommend to the Government that early steps be taken to undertake necessary legislation to ensure proper control of fairs and *melas*, and also for the prevention of the outbreak of cholera and other epidemics in the Presidency of Bengal."

In moving the resolution I may be permitted to begin by saying that fairs and festivals, religious or otherwise, are old and useful institutions and these had and have their use in more sense than one. Relaxation from a day's labour and a little bit of enjoyment and merry-making are only its outward features. We can make these institutions more useful. In fact, one can, with great advantage, make use of these gatherings as centres for spreading ideas of sanitation, agricultural needs and improvements and all other works of public utility. Up till now, regulation of these fairs and festivals, and sanitary arrangements, which, as a matter of necessity, ought to form the first item of work in these festivals, has all along been practically left to chance, with the result that inadequate sanitary arrangements (and in many cases no such arrangements are made) provided for such gatherings frequently cause serious outbreak of epidemics.

I think it will not be out of place to mention that in Bengal as it is, at a rough estimate 1,100 fairs and festivals are yearly held in different parts of the country, and they are distributed as follows:—

(1)	Burdwan district	... 78
(2)	Birbhum district	... 17
(3)	Bankura district	129
(4)	Midnapore district	34
(5)	Hooghly district	50
(6)	Serampore Subdivision	7
(7)	Howrah district	17
(8)	24-Parganas district	139
(9)	Murshidabad district	70
(10)	Nadia district	55
(11)	Jessore district	54
(12)	Khulna district	18
(13)	Rajshahi district	2
(14)	Jalpaiguri district	7
(15)	Darjeeling district	5
(16)	Malda district	13
(17)	Dinajpur district	40
(18)	Rangpur district	40
(19)	Bogra district	34
(20)	Pabna district	83
(21)	Dacca district	62
(22)	Faridpur district	31
(23)	Mymensingh district	36
(24)	Bakarganj district	40
(25)	Tippera district	17
(26)	Noakhali district	6
(27)	Chittagong district	16

If further inquiries are made, perhaps it will be found that the number of fairs and festivals in Bengal is larger than what I have given and these fairs and festivals are visited by, approximately speaking, no less than 60 lakhs of persons. This figure will speak for the significance of the gathering. I contend that legislative measures for the regulation of these fairs and festivals and gatherings in places of pilgrimage are not only very necessary but has been long overdue, and I do not think that we have been a gainer for it.

The places of pilgrimage require to be classified, and it is to be noted that there are permanent centres of pilgrimage, such as Tarkeswar, Kalighat, Tribeni, Navadwip, Chandranath, Tarapit, and many other places of sanctity; while temporary centres of pilgrimage are of a sufficiently large number. Besides, there are many auspicious days for bathing in a year and, on these days, thousands of people—men, women and children—gather together on the banks of the Ganges and other rivers to

have a dip; and the rivers are held sacred by them, the Ganga-Sagar *mela* being the most important of its kind.

It requires no argument on my part to prove that gatherings of heterogeneous crowds in all the fairs and festivals, for want of a proper system to regulate these small, large, and huge gatherings, are always responsible for the outbreak and spread of epidemics, especially cholera. We will be failing in our duty if we do not undertake to improve the situation. Suitable accommodation for pilgrims and visitors during their stay, hospitals for the sick, isolation camps for infectious diseases, supply of pure drinking water and unadulterated and wholesome food and sufficient conservancy and latrine arrangements are the essential requirements for regulating all fairs and festivals.

It may be argued that sanitary improvement in permanent centres of pilgrimage can be effected without recourse to legislative measures. I am of different opinion and I prefer to have a comprehensive piece of legislation for the regulation of all kinds of fairs and festivals and for all temporary and permanent centres of pilgrimage. Of course, I am not unaware of the fact that fairs and festivals are of different kinds and character. In framing any legislation, no doubt, this fact also has to be taken into consideration. We are also to bear in mind the huge gatherings on definite dates every year in places of pilgrimage and sanctity like Tribeni (Hooghly), Ganga-Sagar, Tarkeswar, Navadwip, Ghosepara, Nangalbund, Nekmaro and numerous other places all over Bengal.

I may refer also to resolution No. 205, dated the 7th November, 1877: "It must be remembered that fairs generally entail overcrowding and are often associated with privation and fatigue to travellers coming from a distance, circumstances which are favourable to disease. When cholera threatens, or is actually present in the part of the province where any fair is about to be held, the inhabitants of all districts from which the people generally congregate should be warned of the great risk they incur. If the disease is severe or threatens to be so, then the fair should be actually prohibited."

The Puri Lodging-House Act and sections 100 and 115 of the Local Self-Government Act of 1885 have recognised the necessity. But the provisions of neither of the Acts are adequate for the proper control of fairs and festivals, and, in practice, the limited power given, is rarely applied. As regards fairs within municipal areas, well, there is practically no control. At the present time, hundreds of fairs and festivals are held in various parts of Bengal without sanitary supervision or control of any sort. As a result, cholera and other epidemics are continually being spread all over the country.

Legislation should proceed by placing responsibility for the control of fairs and gatherings on responsible local authorities and the proprietors who are benefited by the income derived therefrom. They are to be made responsibe for fairs, festivals and gatherings within their

respective areas. A fair wholly within municipal area ought to be controlled by the municipality, which will reimburse itself for the necessary expenditure by levying a special fee.

Fairs and festivals within limits of union committees ought to be controlled by them, as provided for in section 26 of the Village Local Self-Government Act and those outside municipalities and union committees can be placed under the management of some responsible authority. But in cases of *melas* of more than local interest, it is advisable either to empower the District Magistrate to control them, as is now done in the cases of large fairs in other parts of India, or to create special authorities for this purpose composed of representatives of the special interests involved. It is not for me to dictate details. The importance of the matter is its best recommendation and I have do doubt that this Council will look into the grave issues involved and do an act of bare justice to the people by according me an unanimous support.

Although we find that there are two sections in the Bengal Local Self-Government Act sections 100 and 115 dealing with these matters, section 115 had been repealed by a subsequent Act. Section 26 of the Village Self-Government Act only states that arrangements may be made for sanitation and conservancy purposes and also for fairs and *melas*. Under another section of that Act power is given to frame rules, but what I wish to impress upon the members is that though I do not know whether the rules have been framed or not, it is necessary that when the rules are framed they should be on as comprehensive lines as the Puri Lodging-House Act. Although the district seems to be a network of union committees, still we find that in many places union committees have not been formed and consequently the Act is not in operation. In municipal areas the same argument applies *mutatis mutandis*. Therefore it is necessary that an Act should be enacted. Now it is necessary to provide for good drinking water, to give lodgings to the pilgrims, to have latrine accommodation. All these things are to be provided, and unless we have a comprehensive Act for the purpose, the mere fact that there is an allusion in one of the sections of the Village Self-Government Act is not, in my humble opinion, sufficient for the purpose. Although so early as 1877 Government issued a notification to the effect that the people concerned should themselves look after sanitation, I suppose that nothing has been done. There are many people, Sir, who derive benefits great benefits from these fairs, but they do nothing. I do not want to mention their names. But there are young men, we find, who go to the fairs, offering voluntary service and do something for the people who congregate there. I do not wish to take any more time of the Council, but I emphasise the fact that legislation is necessary.

Maharaja KSHAUNISH CHANDRA ROY Bahadur: I rise to a point of order. Is there a quorum in the House?

The PRESIDENT: I think there is. I counted only five minutes ago.

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: The House includes the whole building. (Cries of "No," "No.")

The PRESIDENT: There are more than 25 at the moment in the Chamber.

Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: I sympathise with the motives of the mover of the resolution. Under the present system the District Officers look to the sanitation of every fair, and I do not think that there is any necessity for making any stringent law. Sir, in the district of Dinajpur, there are many big fairs, and I am one of the proprietors of the famous Nekmurd fair I do not think that there is any necessity of pressing for any more stringent rules as regards the making of sanitary arrangements for fairs.

Adjournment.

At this stage, as there was no quorum, the Council was adjourned till 3 o'clock the next day

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Council assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act.

THE Council met in the Council Chamber in the Town Hall, Calcutta, on Thursday, the 14th July, 1921, at 3 P.M.

Present:

The Hon'ble the President, the Hon'ble the four Members of the Executive Council, the Hon'ble the three Ministers, and 87 nominated and elected members.

Control of fairs and "melas."

The PRESIDENT: (the Hon'ble Nawab Sir Syed Shams-ul-Huda): Order! Order! The discussion on Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur's resolution regarding the control of fairs and *melas* will be resumed.

Raja MANILOLL SINGH ROY: There are fairs the proprietors of which are private persons, and for the better sanitation of these fairs they may be held responsible. The local bodies may not be burdened with any expenditure on that account.

With these few words, I beg to support the resolution.

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea): I am sure I speak the sense of this House when I say that we have listened with the utmost attention and interest to the admirable speech of the hon'ble mover of this resolution. I think I said some time back in referring to one of his resolutions, that he is an enthusiast on the subject of public health. Well, a deliberative assembly like this, always gains by the presence of an enthusiast, if only he is reasonable and moderate. I think my friend belongs to this category. I may say at once that I have great pleasure in accepting this resolution. I have not heard a single note of dissent in connection with it. My friend has discussed the subject in all its bearings, most exhaustively, both as regards details and principles. He has given us a list of the various places in which *melas* and fairs are held, covering, I believe, the whole of Bengal. He has tried to point out the inadequacy of the arrangements that prevail in connection with *melas* and fairs. He has referred to the Puri Lodging-House Act, but that, I think, does not apply to Bengal. Then he has alluded to certain provisions in the Village Self-Government Act and has observed that they are insufficient. Well, be that as it may,

Government is entirely at one in thinking that the time has come for legislation in this respect. These fairs are growing, they are increasing in size, volume and number. It is necessary that there should be definite principles to regulate and control them. Their control cannot be wholly left to the discretion of local bodies however earnest and however capable they may be. Therefore, legislation by Government, it appears to my mind, has become absolutely necessary. Legislation was suggested by Dr. Bentley some time ago At a conference of Divisional Commissioners held in 1919, his recommendations were accepted, and provisions were introduced into the Public Health Bill. That Bill has been circulated among the District Boards and now that this resolution has been brought forward, the matter will be expedited. Therefore, I hope, to be able to act on this resolution as soon as we are placed in possession of the necessary information. I do not think I need detain the House any longer I have great pleasure in accepting the resolution.

Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: I thank the Hon'ble Minister for accepting my resolution Practical experience suggested me to come to this Council and urge upon it the acceptance of this resolution No one has thought more on the subject than I have done, and, therefore, when I got an opportunity I did not miss it.

The motion was put and agreed to.

Ayurvedic Medicine.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: "This Council recommends to the Government that a committee consisting of one official and one non-official member of this Council, one distinguished allopathic physician, one distinguished allopathic surgeon and two distinguished kavirajes, with the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Medical Department as President, be formed to consider and report, after taking such evidence as may be thought necessary, as to what practical steps may be taken for the restoration and development of the Ayurvedic system of treatment, with special attention to the question of the teaching of the Ayurvedic system, with necessary modification, under proper supervision and control"

It is not a new question that is raised to-day in this Council. The question as to what value should be attached to the system of Ayurvedic medicine was discussed, as far as I remember, on the last occasion in March, 1918, in connection with a proposal made by my friend, Babu Surendra Nath Ray, in this Council for granting subsidies to the Astanga Ayurvedic Vidyalaya established in this city by Kaviraj Jamini Bhusan Ray. This system is well suited to the Indian climate and to the people of the country - it is an admitted fact. The only difficulty that was felt then was that there was an objection as to whether it could be

treated as a scientific system, and my friend, Dr. Nilratan Sarkar opposed it then on the ground that a preliminary inquiry was necessary. He said:

Our ancestors did not stop at these instincts, they advanced to empirical recipes based upon extensive observations and generalisations. These empiricisms are the empiricisms of a pre-scientific era. Then, they further proceeded by methodical observation to inductions and classifications mixed of course with inevitable errors and superstitions, and next there came an era of hypothesis and speculation embodied in comprehensive *sutras*, that is enunciations each of which covers with formal precision a vast assemblage of observed facts. Thus a stage of provisional science was reached. This is all that I can claim for the splendid system of therapeutics that was brought into existence by our ancestors, but no more.

Dr. Sarkar went on to say:

But the provisional science of the Ayurvedic school has done yeoman service in the past in helping to cultivate the medical and therapeutical resources of India in Indian climate and under Indian environments, that is to say in relation to the diseases that prevailed in India in former times. Thus a system of therapeutics was built up and it is my hope that this precious heirloom of ours will not be allowed to be lost under the pressing obsequiousness of the obstinate scepticism of the West on the one side and the credulity of the East on the other.

He suggested that much of the truth that is contained in these systems will be incorporated in the curriculum of our students and that to do that a good deal of preliminary research work will have to be done to separate a large mass of dross from the pure gold that is there.

This question also arose recently in the Imperial Council: the proposal was that in every province there should be Ayurvedic and Unani schools and colleges established. It was opposed by Major-General Edwards. He thought that, as an independent system, it cannot be recognised, but the allopathic system might take advantage of this ancient system, and that State aid should not be given to these institutions independent of the method followed in the Western system. Sir William Vincent was very sympathetic to this proposal and he was prepared to forward, for the consideration of the Local Governments, the proceedings of the Council, but as the mover of the resolution pressed for the acceptance of the resolution and for an executive order, it could not be accepted. Sir William Vincent observed that the facilities of medical treatment in this country are very inadequate, and that we should do all we can to increase them. The theoretical objections against this system of medicine should not avail where practical experience has shown that it is capable of healing our ailments.

That the provision for medical aid is very inadequate is well known to us and efforts have been made now and then for pressing upon Government that more medical schools and colleges should be established. Here is a system of medicine which is well suited to the Indians. It has been in existence from a very ancient period and it has been appreciated by more than 90 per cent. of the people of India. So it is very desirable that this system should be encouraged. A difficulty was felt

viz., that some preliminary investigation was necessary as to how the system could be improved and what addition could be made to this ancient system. With the object of having this investigation I brought forward this proposal for the establishment of a committee consisting of expert members of the different systems having special knowledge of them—the Kavirajes, the Allopathic physicians, the Homoeopathic physicians and others of the various different systems—for the purpose of considering as to what practical steps should be taken for the restoration and development of the Ayurvedic system. I am much thankful to Government for the recent introduction of the rules published in June last empowering District Boards to open dispensaries and hospitals following this system or any system other than Allopathic. I believe my resolution has been lightened by the introduction of these rules. It is already admitted that this system is suited to us and encouragement may accordingly be given to it. I know full well that the Minister in charge of the Medical Department is well aware of the benefits that can be derived from this system, and he is very keen about its further development. As the District Boards have been authorised to recognise these institutions and to grant facilities and subsidies to them, it is but a necessary corollary that a special committee should be formed to see what improvement can be introduced in this ancient system.

I think I need not make any further remarks and I hope that Government will be kind enough to accept my resolution and that a committee will be formed consisting of members as suggested by me.

DR. HASSAN SUHRAWARDY moved, by way of amendment, "that after the word 'Kavirajes' the words 'and two distinguished Hakims' be added and that for the words 'the Ayurvedic system' the words 'the Ayurvedic and Tibbi or Unani systems' be substituted."

After what has been said by our esteemed friend, Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri, the cause of reviving indigenous systems of medicine or at least to make a scientific inquiry into their methods, is hardly in need of additional support. I however desire to put the special claims of the Unani or Tibbi system of medicine before the Council. The sphere of useful influence of this system, extended from the pillars of Hercules to the great walls of China, through a much wider and larger area than any Eastern system ever enjoyed. This, however, is not the occasion to recount the exploits of the Professors of the Academy at Baghdad and of the centres of learning at Cordova, Saville or Granada, who held aloft the torch of Science and civilisation during the middle ages when the rest of Europe was in darkness. Sir, in medical literature the names of the Saracenic Surgeon Al Rhazes and the Physician Avecinna are as great as those of Galen and Hippocrates of the Greeks. Though shorn of their pristine glory, though bereft of State patronage, yet the Tibbi or Unani system of medicine has even in modern times held its own, not only in India but beyond. The rich and the poor, alike the princes as well as

the people of India, have recognised their efficacy. Many a poor sufferer has got relief under this system after having knocked in vain for recovery at the doors of other systems of the noble art of healing for months and years!

There is much to be said in support of reviving and modernising this system. The proverbial nugget of gold may get hidden under a heap of rubbish, which, in the course of time, gathers over most things. Many remarkable recoveries under the Tibbi system have been known to many of us. The effective treatment of different diseases by the hakims of the Houses of Haziq-ul-Mulk of Delhi and of Lucknow under this system is too well known to require repetition. Many a wonderful story of most remarkable cures and recoveries by the well-known hakims like the late Gholam Nabi Khan, Syed Quasim Ali and Hakim Sajjad are narrated in this city by old inhabitants. When we turn to modern times, I am sure that the personal experience of such great authorities as a past Member of the Executive Council and a Minister of the present Government of Bengal will bear out the marvellous effects of the hakimi treatment of the late Hakim Abdul Hamid of Patna of Shafaul Mulk Hakim Abdur Rashid Khan, Khan Bahadur, and of Hakim Shahpur of Calcutta. These men are alive and can at the present moment demonstrate the effects of the Unani system of medicine. It is a great pity that the Tibbi system of medicine is allowed to die out for want of State aid and encouragement.

I therefore beg to support the resolution of Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri to take steps for the restoration and development of the Ayurvedic system of treatment in a scientific way, but I would like to add that Hakims of repute might also be associated in the proposed Committee and the Unani system gets its just and adequate share. As to the personnel of the committee I would like to leave it in the hands of the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Medical Department.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: It is very difficult to oppose a resolution dictated by motives of patriotism. We have heard much of the history of the Kaviraji and the Unani systems, but I fear the history of these medicines is very little known. Is it known to many of us here that the Susruta and the Charaka, the basis of our Kaviraji system were taken to Babylon and to Baghdad, and thence to Greece, to Macedon, Athens and Rome? Is it known that the Unani system is to a great extent based upon the Ayurvedic system and the European system is also based upon these two systems? The difference is this. The modern European system is scientific and the ancient system empiric. As I told you the day before yesterday the difference between them is as the difference between the glories of astronomy and the mysteries of astrology. What is meant by saying "scientific"?—"scientific" in connection with a system which is wholly empiric? Does my freind Mr. Suhrawardy know that in Constantinople the Muhammadan Government there have the European system and not the Unani system?

Is it known that Japan—progressive Japan—has adopted the European scientific system and not the old Chinese, Japanese or the Indian system? Let us not go back to the old days. I belong to the party of progress. Our motto is "Advance India." There is no going back: this must be clearly understood—and understanding this, you may do anything you like.

Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: These systems of medicine—the Ayurvedic and the Unani systems—are of very long standing and it is a pity that these two systems of medicine may die away from India. The European medicines are often found to be too strong for the Indians. We all know that when European medicines fail in giving relief to the sufferers from old diseases one generally has to take recourse to the Ayurvedic or Unani systems of medicine. Our friend Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur says that we should always try to make an advance in everything; but advance does not mean that we should do away with everything that we have got, even everything that is good and desirable. An advance cannot be made by doing away with our best traditions. I would like to say one thing in this connection. We know that there are various indigenous drugs which are of greater—if I am not allowed to use the word greater I may say of equal- efficacy as the European drugs, and these should not be allowed to die away. We find nowadays that quinine is administered as the remedy for malaria, but from our experience we know that there are other equally efficacious drugs such as *Votabij*. I do not know the jaw-breaking Italian name of that plant. We have found that in many cases it has done immense good to the patients. If we could develop the indigenous drugs or, if we could have a garden where these plants could be grown, the country would gain much. It is a question which I hope will receive sympathetic treatment at the hands of the Government. We are importing many drugs from other countries and there is no reason why we should kill our own drugs.

With these words, I support the resolution.

Rai Dr. HARIDHAN DUTT Bahadur: I rise to say a few words about this resolution. I do so with a certain amount of diffidence for what I may say to this Council on this occasion is capable of being misunderstood. I happen to be a votary of the school which is known as the Allopathic system of medicine and that is the reason why my remarks about other systems are, I fear, capable of being misunderstood. But whatever that may be, on this occasion, I feel it my duty to frankly say what is uppermost in my mind.

My friend Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri, the mover of the resolution has framed it in such a manner that it becomes impossible for us to understand what he intends to do. Before I say what I actually feel about the

systems of Ayurvedic and Unani, I would like to point out to the mover of the resolution certain things which arise in my mind in connection with the wording of the resolution. My friend, I fear, has made a hotch-potch resolution. He has put in in the same cauldron Ayurvedic and Unani and over and above that my friend Dr. Suhrawardy has added the Tibbi system. What would the result be, supposing a committee is formed. The committee is asked by this resolution to take practical steps for the restoration and development of the Ayurvedic system of treatment and, I understand, that Dr. Suhrawardy's amendment would have the Tibbi system as well. Situated as we are in this country, where we have several systems of treatment prevalent all the country over, what would be the result of an attempt to restore a particular system and to develop it. I believe the days are past for any particular system to be developed or restored. Those who have eyes will see that all the world over there is a movement for keeping what is true and scientific and for weeding out what is not true and what is not relied upon. When I was a student of the Medical College, the Professor who taught us Materia Medica used to begin his lecture by congratulating us for belonging to the country which has given birth to Charaka and Susruta, the two eminent physicians. I have not been able to forget it and I have up to this time carried my veneration for these two illustrious persons. I am proud that I am a countryman of these eminent men, who took their birth several centuries ago and evolved a system which has become the wonder of the world. Whatever that may be, would that justify us in these days of modern science and of improvement all the world over in sticking to our own old things and not introducing the searchlight of modern science? I do not know anything about the Unani system, but we have some knowledge about the teachings of Ayurveda. Undoubtedly the Ayurveda is based upon a system which has much to be proud of and which can teach even at this time very great things. But it does not follow that whatever has been said or taught by Charaka and Susruta must be accepted as gospel truth in these days. What we hold is that whatever attitude my countrymen may take, whatever attitude the Government may take about a particular system, that is not the important thing. The important thing before us is that whatever is good in these different systems must be taken out and combined in one system, and that system should be the system of treatment in this country as well as elsewhere. So in my mind the aim should be not the restoration of a particular system or fostering one at the expense of another, but the taking out of what is good, what is true, what is healthy and what is really to the benefit of the people and then build up a system which will be the standard of the whole world. There is a prevailing idea that in science there is no difference as to caste, creed and colour. Ayurveda may belong to the Hindus, Unani may belong to the Muhammadans, but when we, men of science, combine together to find out the truth we should forget that one system belongs to the Hindus and that the other belongs to the Muhammadans. So, if there is any attempt

made by this Council or by the Government, my idea is that we shall make an attempt to find out what is good in these different systems and to bring them all together and combine into one for the good of humanity, instead of adopting a resolution like this with a direction to restore and to develop a particular system.

My friend Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri also desires that special attention should be paid to the question of teaching the Ayurvedic system. I really do not know what my friend wants us to do. Does he want that this Government should establish Ayurvedic colleges in this city? If he wants that, let him find the funds and establish such colleges. I, for myself, would like such colleges to foster and prosper, but in these days to ask the Government to spend any money on any particular restricted system would be unjustifiable.

I think I have given an indication of the attitude which I myself and some of the medical men in this city will take up in this connection. Before I sit down I would ask my friends to remember that we will never take up an attitude of antagonism against Kaviraji or Unani systems for we do realise and once more I admit—that we owe much to those systems and we have found that these systems have much to teach us. But once again, I say let those things which are good in those systems be taken out of them and be combined in the modern science so that modern science enriched by these additions will make further progress. Let every possible encouragement be given to the happy combination of all different systems aiming towards amelioration of human sufferings.

Dr. HASSAN SUHRAWARDY: May I rise to offer an explanation?

The PRESIDENT: If you have any explanation to offer you may do so, but you cannot be allowed to debate.

Dr. HASSAN SUHRAWARDY: The explanation is that Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur characterised the Unani system as being an empirical system——

The PRESIDENT: That is not a personal explanation and I cannot allow you to go on.

Dr. HASSAN SUHRAWARDY: May I explain that the Unani system is not based on the Ayurvedic but on the Greek system——

The PRESIDENT: I am afraid all this is out of order.

Dr. HASSAN SUHRAWARDY: May I explain that the Unani system is in vogue in Constantinople?

The PRESIDENT: That is an argument in answer to that of another member and not an explanation.

Babu SATISH CHANDRA MUKHARJI: I beg to support the resolution which has been moved by my friend Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri. The Ayurvedic system has many things to commend itself to the intelligentia of the country. Nowadays with the study of the Ayurvedic system the study of scientific improvements is required. It therefore behoves the Government to see that this indigenous system is rather improved. I hope that the Government will see its way to accept the resolution.

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri has already mentioned that a resolution was brought by me in this Council some time ago with reference to this very question. It was during the budget debate of 1918-19 that I brought forward a resolution that a sum of Rs. 9,000 recurring and Rs 9,000 non-recurring be granted to the Ashtanga Ayurvedic College of Calcutta That resolution was however opposed by the leading Indian Allopathic physician of this city—Sir Nilratan Sircar, it was also opposed on behalf of the Government by the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler, so the resolution was lost. Now that we have a large number of Bengali members in this Council who have got faith in the Ayurvedic system of medicine, I am glad that Kishori Babu has thought it proper to bring forward this resolution at this time Moreover we have got a gentleman in charge of the Medical Department (Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea) who has been trying his level best to improve the School of Tropical Medicine which has been established in Calcutta I think the principal object why the School of Tropical Medicines has been opened in Calcutta is to resuscitate the vegetable drugs of Bengal. What is the use of spending large sums of money in the School of Tropical Medicines, if we do not revive the system of medicine which was in vogue in Bengal for generations? Of course we have got faith in the Allopathic system of medicine, but that is no reason why we should lose faith in the Ayurvedic system of medicine It has been said that it is now an old system and that we should not spend our money on such systems of medicine We find that the Government spends money on antiquarian researches and in the preservation of ancient monuments Is it not the duty of Government to spend money on a system of medicine which has done so much of good to the country and which is the only system which has been in vogue for centuries? Well, if that be the case, I do not really understand how there should be any opposition on the part of the Indian members of this Council to this resolution I admit that the resolution is a little bit cumbrous; but I think that the Minister in charge of the Medical Department will see his way to accept the resolution in a modified form if possible There is the School of Tropical Medicines which can be liberalised by opening out some Chairs for expert Kavirajes who with some scientific education and with some knowledge of Chemistry and of European drugs will be of material help in teaching the students of this school. For these reasons, I support the resolution.

Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: I beg to support this resolution. The resolution in itself is elastic and I found it difficult to follow its object, but on reading it through I understand that the primary object is that practical steps should be taken for the restoration and development of the Ayurvedic system. This matter was the subject of consideration by the members of the old Council; and my friend, Babu Surendra Nath Ray, came forward to snatch some money from Government in the shape of a grant to the Ashtanga Ayurvedic College. My friend, Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri, does not say so in plain words, but practically his aim is that Government ought to come forward with some contributions. But as he does not specifically say so, I need not trouble the Council with regard to that, nor is it the time now for asking for grants: that time is now over. I belong to that school of thought which likes to develop old scientific modes of treatment. The Ayurvedic system of medicine was in vogue in our country for years and years; and even the educated men of this country have often had recourse to that system. There can be no denial of that fact; and, if anybody comes forward to condemn that system, I must say that he is wrong because he will ask for the development of such a system later on. The old system, the Hindu system of Pathology, and Surgery has gone away. Is it not necessary, therefore, that steps should be taken for the resuscitation of this system? Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri wishes that a committee be formed for the purpose of investigating all these things and that a report be submitted as to what practical steps should be taken for the purpose. I think this object is a laudable one and that the Council ought to support it. In the old Council when this question was brought forward there was a strong opposition made by Sir Nilratan Sarkar who belongs to another school of thought, and my friend to my left (Rai Dr. Haridhan Dutt Bahadur) has come forward in the same way and said that modern science should be accepted, but I may tell him that modern science is based on the old system. If I am allowed to make an inquiry on the subject, I can enlighten my friend that modern surgery has often recourse to many drugs which were in vogue in old days. My friend comes forward to say that there should be one system and that system ought to be the modern one. But what is science? Science is the essence of human knowledge and when the science of the Ayurvedic system was in vogue for centuries, can it be denied that that science was not the essence of human knowledge? I need not take up the time of the Council any further; but I strongly submit that this resolution demands the best consideration of this Council.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: After a strenuous fight for the last few days, I thought that this resolution might come in by way of a little relaxation and that it would not be found to be objectionable. What I find is that the resolution and the amendment are in the nature

of what Government might call—representations of the different communal interests. I find that while one member has proposed something which is of doubtful utility, another member has proposed something else as a counterblast to the other. I am told that there are merits in some of the systems and there are excellent medicines for some particular diseases. That is of course, a different matter, but at this stage to say: "Let us go back to the wilderness" is what I do not approve of. What should be done is to absorb all that is good in these different systems in one scientific method. The School of Tropical Medicines is there, that has to be looked after by the Government and funds have to be provided for it. It is for that School to take in what is best from all these different systems and to make use of that and not by departments and compartments, but the proper idea is not to take up investigations in Ayurvedy or some other system. There are Indian medicines which are already taken in the British Pharmacopœia. I believe *Makaradhwaja* has been taken for a long time and there are others, such as *Chalmoogra*, etc. I am sure that the School of Tropical Medicines will at least put all these in one scientific form and combine them into one for the good of all humanity.

As regards the observations of my friend, Babu Tankanath Chaudhuri I am sorry to have to contradict him in one particular matter. He has said that the European medicines are too strong for Bengalis and that they are not, therefore, liked by them. But my opinion is that the strongest European medicine is nowadays very much liked by the Bengalis and it used to produce so great a revenue to the Government that owing to the temporary lull in its use, on account of the non-co-operation movement, even the strongest heart of our venerable Minister was found to quail the other day. I can therefore say that the strongest European medicine is very much liked by the Bengali. I do not know what others think of it but that is my idea. (Laughter.)

My esteemed friend Rai Dr. Haridhan Dutt Bahadur has spoken of eclecticism in the matter of scientific study. That is indeed a very good idea. But I may say that the Allopathists again have great prejudice against other systems. They never go into other questions on account of what is called the "slave mentality." I am sure that this School of Tropical Medicines will come to our rescue in this particular matter. As I have said, whatever is good in the systems of Ayurvedy and Unani might be absorbed in one scientific method and I think that it is the best way to go about it.

Maulvi YAKUINUDDIN AHMED: I think that the resolution that has been moved by Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri and amended by Dr. Suhrawardy is worthy of the consideration of this House. We do not wish to oppose it as the Unani, Tibbi, and the Ayurvedic systems of medicine are the emblems of enlightenment and civilization. I do not wish that the members of this Council would like to be so enlightened as to regard with contempt their own medicines and their own

ns of treatment. I think that in this Reformed Council there are emen who depend not only upon European medicine, but upon vedic and Unani medicine as well. It is meet and proper that resolution should be viewed with consideration. It should not be ed aside as a thing which is worthy of contempt, because Govern- do not like to accept this resolution. We should think that Unani cine, the medicine which is in vogue from the ancient time—a time Europe was immersed in darkness, which is holding its own, Alchemia" of the Arabs having developed into Chemistry the very lation of Allopathy, even now in India, is not a system which d be brushed aside. As regards the Ayurvedic medicine, it is ng its own even now. Government has honoured its votaries— Ayurvedic Kavirajes having conferred the title of Mahamaho- yayas upon some of them The title of Shams-ul-Ulama also has conferred upon Hakims Therefore, I do not blame Government it has viewed with contempt such systems of medicine as my le friends here are viewing it It is, I think, these systems which d be encouraged by our countrymen We shall belie our educa- and our enlightenment, if we view with contempt such systems of cine.

he resolution does not say that all the money which Government bestow upon this system of medicine should be given, but that ouragement should be given to these systems of medicine—the ni and the Kaviraji. It is not you, Gentlemen, who are going to ide the money; it is the country which will do so, if it is thought sable. Therefore, I say that you, Gentlemen, when you shall ider this resolution, you should consider it seriously as the system h is your own system—Unani and the Kaviraji and which has l many diseases where Allopathic medicine has failed I think culous cures have been effected by such systems of medicine Are not going to encourage such systems? Are you not going to hold torch which enlightened centuries ago and which is holding its wn still? Are you going to extinguish it by your contemptuous ment of that resolution? I feel that the resolution both for the ni and the Kaviraji deserves your serious consideration.

Babu NITYA DHON MUKHERJEE: When I was listening to the te, I quite forgot that I was in the Legislative Chamber in this ince, but that I was listening to the deliberations of a municipal d in which every motion that is put forward is, as a rule, opposed another motion. Sir, Ayurvedic system of medicine has been ked in India for the last 3,000 years according to a great medical ority. I think, if anybody has got a right to speak with authority his resolution it is the professional doctors of whom there are only here Dr. Suhrawardy and Dr Haridhan Dutt. The former ed an amendment to the main resolution while the latter opposed While my friend Dr. S. N Mullick——

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: Sir, I am not a doctor.

Babu NITYA DHON MUKHERJEE: I mean "Mr. S. N. Mullick."

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: Sir, I am only Babu Surendra Nath Mullick, not Mr. S. N. Mullick.

Babu NITYA DHON MUKHERJEE: My friend Babu Surendra Nath Mullick anticipated the judgment of the Committee proposed to be formed. Babu Surendra Nath Ray and Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur supported the motion while another Rai Bahadur opposed it, and I am sorry that I cannot agree with the latter.

Sir, it is an admitted fact that Rajas and Maharajas not only of the old school but with modern European education do employ Kavirajes in their own family as family physicians in addition to European doctors. My hon'ble friend the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan who has got the best European education still entertains more than one Kaviraj in his family. Sir, Dr. Haridhan Dutt said that he felt very proud when in his college days his professor eulogised the nation which could produce men like Charaka and Susruta and yet he is sorry that this resolution has been brought before this Council.

As regards the Unani system about which Dr. Suhrawardy has moved an amendment, we, Hindus, have no personal knowledge. Our Muhammadan friends are the best judges about it. We Hindus, use Unani medicines only for some particular purposes, which I need not mention before the Council.

With these words, I support the original resolution of Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri.

Mr. HUSEYN SHAHEED SUHRAWARDY: I, too, fail to appreciate the levity with which the resolution and the amendment have been treated in the Council. I would not have intervened at all in the debate if it had not been for the fact that some hon'ble members, with very little knowledge of the Unani system, have tried to belittle it. We know that the Unani system has not only conferred great benefits on suffering humanity but it was the precursor of the modern Allopathic system of medicine. Those who know will agree with me that practically all the medicines in the British Pharmacopœia have been taken from the Unani system of medicine. Babu Surendra Nath Mullick has rightly said that these two systems of Medicine—the Kaviraji and Unani—ought to be fostered and incorporated in the British Pharmacopœia. But this cannot be done without a thorough investigation into the two systems in order to recover some of our lost knowledge.

With these words, I support the resolution and the amendment.

Maulvi EKRAMUL HUQ: I was surprised to hear that a certain hon'ble member, who has no knowledge of the Tibbi or Unani system,

thought fit to condemn that system and said that it should not be introduced here in Bengal as the system was of no use. It has also been said that the system is empirical in its origin, but if the hon'ble member who has said that only knew what the system was he would never have to come to that opinion. Each medicine under the Unani system has a separate quality and there is a big book which deals with these medicines giving their names and the diseases they cure. This system is a rational one and the book which contains all these informations is called *Makhzan-ı-Adwia* and is to be found in every Muhammadan household

It is further alleged that this system is based on the Ayurvedic system. I do not think so By this, I do not say that the Ayurvedic system is not of very great antiquity and is not one of the best systems which should be encouraged in Bengal I would only point out that the very name of the system indicates that it was taken from the Greeks and developed by the Saracens and the drugs are prepared from shrubs and vegetables.

It is further alleged that in Turkey only the Allopathic system is in vogue. It is true, but this is also true that the Unani system obtains largely in the metropolis of the Sultan of Turkey It is also alleged that this system has not found favour with the inhabitants of India That is not so At Lucknow, Hooghly and Murshidabad and other places this system is still prevailing and schools have been founded which keep Hakims and they distrubute medicines to the people It must be within the knowledge of any person that even now big Hakims of Lucknow and Delhi are frequently invited by Rajas and Maharajas from distant places and even by some high Government officials for their treatment That is the case even now though no arrangements have ever been made for the development of this science

This system has its votaries in India among the aristocrats; and without going further afield, I may mention that the Burdwan Estate maintains and engages Hakims even now This shows that the people of the country have faith in the system and it would be right, if along with the recommendation made in the original resolution, the amendment made by Dr. Suhrawardy is also favourably considered

Raja MANILOLL SINGH ROY: Sir, I move that the question be now put

The PRESIDENT: I have come to the end of the list and I would now ask the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea to reply.

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: Before I deal with the observations and the conflicting views which we have heard in the Council Chamber regarding the different systems of medicine, it seems to me that I should clear my ground. There is, in the first place, the resolution moved by my hon'ble friend Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri. To that an amendment has been proposed by Dr. Suhrawardy.

My hon'ble friend, the mover of the amendment, suggests an enlargement of the personnel and of the scope of the committee to be appointed. He recommends that persons should be appointed acquainted with the Unani system of medicine and that the committee should inquire into and report upon the steps to be taken for the restoration and development of the Unani system. Therefore, Sir, we have two distinct resolutions—one relating to the Ayurvedic and the other to the Tibbi or Unani system. It seems to me that it would be more convenient if, instead of having one committee dealing with considerations so divergent and it may be conflicting, we should have two committees—one for the Ayurvedic and the other for the Unani system. I trust that this suggestion will commend itself to the mover of the resolution as well as of the amendment and will meet with the acceptance of this House.

Sir, the next observation which I desire to make with regard to the resolution and this also applies partly to the amendment is one which relates to the personnel of the committee. Sir, it has been suggested that I should be placed in charge of the committee. Sir, I am deeply thankful to the mover of the resolution for doing me the great and signal honour of asking me to preside over the deliberations of this committee. But I confess, Sir, that I am perfectly innocent of all knowledge regarding all systems of medicine, Allopathic, Homeopathic, Unani or Ayurvedic. It seems to me, therefore, that I labour under a very serious disqualification, and while I am thankful to my friend for thus honouring me, I feel compelled to tell him that I am not fit for it, and that I must decline the honour. Not only that but it also seems to me that my hon'ble friend would best serve the object which we have in view if, instead of indicating the personnel of the committee he were to leave the matter to the Government which might be trusted to appoint a committee whose personnel will commend itself to the acceptance and the judgment of this House. I hope my hon'ble friend will accept my suggestion.

I may say at once that the Government accepts the proposition that a committee should be appointed for the purpose mentioned in the resolution as regards the Ayurvedic system of medicine and also to appoint a separate committee as regards the Unani system of medicine.

Sir, we must bear in mind that both these systems are ancient and one of them is indigenous to the soil. India claims to be the home of the Ayurvedic system. It indeed claims to be the home of the Science and Art of medicine. It is the cradle of that Art and from India the Ayurvedic system and the principles which underly it travelled to the West and from there it travelled back to the East. Like the Sun it travelled from East to West and this system had among its disciples no less a man than Hippocrates, and from Greece it travelled to the great centres of Muhammadan learning and civilization. As Dr. Suhrawardy

has observed the great Moslem Universities of Cardova and Seville held aloft the torch of civilization in the middle ages while Europe was sunk in almost primitive darkness. About ten years ago, I had an opportunity of visiting the Khoda Buksh Library at Patna and there I saw some surgical instruments treasured up in that library which once belonged to the University of Seville. They reminded me of the past glories of the Moslem world. They reminded me also of the reflected glories of my own ancestors because the Ayurvedic system of medicine was imported from India into Greece and from Greece it travelled northwards and westwards and was incorporated into the Unani system. Sir, having regard to the fact that the Ayurvedic system is indigenous to the soil and that the Unani system has been practised here for centuries, I think it is the clear duty of a Government which represents both Hindus and Muhammadans that they should appoint a committee for suggesting practical steps for the restoration and development of these two systems. I say it is the first duty of a Government to do this—a Government which is interested in the preservation of all systems and cultures, Hindu and Muhammadan, of which it is the repository and the custodian.

Secondly, Sir, there is another side of the question which should not be ignored. We have only one qualified doctor for 42,000 people. Furthermore, 90 per cent. of the people do not avail themselves of the Allopathic or Homeopathic system of treatment but take to the ancient systems of India—the Ayurvedic and the Unani systems. That being so, it would be beneficial to the people if these two systems were restored, developed and improved.

Sir, we have heard a great deal about contending systems. We have been told that knowledge is to be accepted from whatever quarter it comes. I accept this view. And I am perfectly sure that these committees will go thoroughly into these two systems and make practical suggestions for their restoration and further development, and if they find as a result of their labours that nothing could be done then the whole thing would be dropped and we shall know whether we should place any further credence in these two ancient systems of medicine. There would be a finality and the trouble would be at an end. Therefore, Sir, looking at the matter from this point of view, I think that a committee is necessary.

Sir, it has been said by one of the speakers that Government should not spend any money on this project. Sir, Government is going to appoint these two committees, and when they set to work, they would require paper and pencil and ink and these have got to be provided by the Government. Government will spend nothing more for the present. Therefore, so far as the menace of expenditure is concerned—and it is a terrible menace to this House as I know from personal experience—so far as the menace of expenditure is concerned it is non-existent.

Mr. D. C. GHOSE: It is a cold douche at the end.

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: No, it is not a cold douche.

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: Will it only be a paper committee?

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: Of course not. But the committee must have paper to write on. (Laughter.)

As I was saying, if money is needed, it would be necessary for me to lay the whole matter before you and ask you to give me the money to spend. It is you and not the Government who are the final authority in matters of finance. When the report of the committee comes before Government I will lay it before you and ask you to provide the funds, if expenditure should be necessary.

Then, Sir, we have also heard remarks about the School of Tropical Medicine. The School of Tropical Medicine is not intended merely to examine the quality of indigenous drugs. Its purposes are much wider, it embraces the whole range of tropical diseases. I am sure that within the next ten years when it will have made its researches, when it will have extended the bounds of human knowledge in the matter of tropical diseases and their cure, history will record in glowing terms the efforts of those who have been associated with the genesis of this great institution. I need not detain the Council much longer. I need say only this that we as a Government are neither Homeopaths nor Allopaths nor upholders of the Ayurvedic system or the Unani system: we are advocates of truth, of the healing art in all its phases and in all its aspects. That is the motto of Government. We extend a generous consideration to all arts and all systems and are sympathetically inclined to try all systems in order that the great community entrusted to our care may grow in health and strength and that the needs of medical relief may be fully met. I hope and trust my friend will accept my suggestion.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: I accept the suggestion and the modifications that have been proposed by the Hon'ble Minister.

The PRESIDENT: Gentlemen, the mover of the resolution as well as the mover of the amendment and the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea all desire that this motion should be split into two parts and there should be some modifications made in it. As the motion has already been moved in a particular form, I take it that I have no power to make any alterations without the leave of the House. I therefore put it to the House that the resolutions may be permitted to be amended in the following form:—

"This Council recommends to the Government that a committee be formed to consider and report, after taking such evidence as may be thought necessary, as to what practical steps may be taken for the

restoration and development of the Ayurvedic system of treatment, with special attention to the question of the teaching of the Ayurvedic system, with necessary modification, under proper supervision and control."

"This Council recommends to the Government that a committee be formed to consider and report, after taking such evidence as may be thought necessary, as to what practical steps may be taken for the restoration and development of the Unani system of treatment, with special attention to the question of the teaching of the Unani system with necessary modification, under proper supervision and control."

Leave was given to amend the motions.

The motions were then put in the amended form and agreed to.

Mohanganj Hât incidents.

The PRESIDENT: I wish, before the next motion is moved, to tell the House that there is a judicial inquiry pending in connection with the incidents of the escape of prisoners from the Rajshahi Jail. This particular motion does not refer to that exactly, but to the incident at Mohanganj. I would ask Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray, the mover of the resolution, strictly to confine himself to that matter and not to go beyond it.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: "This Council recommends to the Government that an inquiry be made, by a committee of officials and non-officials, into the unfortunate incidents at Mohanganj Hât, in connection with the escape of prisoners from the Rajshahi Jail."

In moving this resolution, I am fully conscious of the responsibility I am undertaking. There has been already a Government inquiry on the subject and a Government resolution on the matter has also been published. But there is also no blinking of the fact that the said inquiry and resolution in certain important aspects have given no satisfaction to the public. They feel that the inquiry has not been a fair one——

The PRESIDENT: What inquiry are you referring to?

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: The inquiry at Mohanganj. They feel, that the inquiry at Mohanganj has not been a fair one, that witnesses who could give material evidence have not been examined. They even go to the length of suspecting that the inquiry has hidden more than what it has disclosed. Rightly or wrongly there is a feeling abroad that wherever the conduct of high officers are involved, the inquiry fails in the proper apportionment of guilt and an effort for white-washing it is made. I know that the feeling is not always justifiable, but I feel also that it is the duty of the Government always to keep itself above suspicion. No opportunity even for such

a remark should be given. No doubt, Sir, there can be no stopping of wagging tongues but neither should food for such suspicion be supplied by the Government. An absolutely baseless suspicion dies of itself. But here, in connection with the incidents at Mohanganj, the suspicion is not absolutely baseless. To begin with, Sir, the inquiry into the first part of the subject matter of the Government resolution *viz.*, the causes leading to the escape of prisoners from the Jail, was conducted by the Inspector-General of Prisons with whom were associated two non-official gentlemen.

The PRESIDENT: Here you are again referring to the escape of prisoners from the jail.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: I am only referring to the report already published.

The PRESIDENT: It may be that the report is published, but the matter is under judicial inquiry and I will not allow a single word to be said on the subject.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: But coming to the second part of the resolution which deals with incidents in connection with the recapture of escaped convicts, we find that the inquiry was conducted by the Divisional Commissioner alone, unaided by any non-officials. And, Sir, so far as the incidents at Mohanganj are concerned, they were not even inquired into by the Commissioner himself. Only a Deputy Superintendent of Police was deputed to make the inquiry. Now, Sir, the fact of the association of non-officials in one part of the inquiry and its want in the other part dealing with much more serious allegations, has naturally led people to think that the Government perhaps was not confident of its own grounds and had therefore shirked an association of non-official gentlemen, which might have disclosed facts unpleasant to the Government. And, further, the people naturally hesitate to attach much value to an inquiry by a subordinate officer into the conduct of his superiors. Thus, Sir, in this case, the Government itself has fed the suspicion. Here the people have a right to think that the Government did not take the public into its confidence.

Sir, on Tuesday last, we had a learned discourse by one of the Hon'ble Members of the Government on the mentality of some of the non-official members of the House——

The PRESIDENT: I do not think you need go back to the debate that took place the other day.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: May I not explain our position?

The PRESIDENT: I have no objection to that.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: I am only referring to that, and I have every confidence that the balance will be held strictly even by the chair.

The PRESIDENT: You need not remind me of that. I know my duty.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: Our misfortune often is not to see eye to eye with the august personages occupying the central benches. To avoid a similar homily to-day, permit me, Sir, to say at once that I have not the least intention to minimise the conspicuous energy, resource and activity - to quote the words of the Government resolution—displayed by the district authorities. Their prompt action was highly commendable. The district officers were almost taken by surprise, but they were not non-plussed. With the slender force that they could get together at that time, they took up the pursuit of that large body of criminals with very commendable alacrity. They had always kept the convicts on the move and had compelled them to disperse. People do not know what would have happened otherwise. Their devotedness and the pains they took are worthy of nothing but praise.

But, Sir, the reports of the incidents at Mohanganj tell a different tale. Here, as the reports go, without the least warning the houses of innocent villagers were raided in the dead of night by armed men, and indiscriminate firing was indulged in, as a result of which five innocent men were, more or less, seriously wounded and no notice was taken of the wounded persons one of whom subsequently succumbed to his injuries. The zenanas were insulted and about twenty-five simple villagers were arrested on suspicion and kept under police guard the whole night. Sir, in spite of the sweet words in the Government resolution, there is no denying the fact that the reconnaissance that was said to have been made before Shaheb Mulla's house was raided, was no worth the name even. For, Sir, can anybody call it a reconnaissance when not a single villager was asked a question and the principal object of it, the information whether the men inside the house were really the escaped prisoners or not, had not been elicited? Then, Sir, with what impunity the Criminal Procedure Code and Police Regulations were brushed aside! Without any previous warning, without calling upon the master of the house to allow a peaceful search, in the dead of night, while the inmates are all asleep, it was thought fit by the officer-in-charge to let loose a number of half-trained men with loaded guns, to raid the house! It appears in the Government resolution that the force was especially instructed by the officer not to use fire-arms. Then, Sir, why were they allowed to carry loaded guns during the raid? Was it a commendable error of judgment on the part of the officer to opportunely forget that in all such cases the fire-arms have got a most unhappy knack of going off? It is said that the first shot was fired by a Gurkha recruit who knows no other language save his own patois. The Report says that he mistook

another word for a command to fire. I do not blame the poor Gurkha. I blame the gallant officer who gave dangerous weapons to such raw and undisciplined recruits who cannot understand the words of command even and employed them in a night raid in a Bengal village. Sir, was not this itself a rash and negligent act, fit to be severely censured by the higher authorities? Sir, instead of employing such uncontrollable men, the officer could have employed some men of the regular Reserve Force who were in the party. And then again what happened? Not the unexpected or unforeseen to a man with common sense which a police officer is supposed to have. The Gurkha had fired, others took it to be the fire of escaped convicts and so they also began firing. Raw and undisciplined as they were, they went out of control altogether and even fired at villagers who came to inquire, and most probably the officer commanding caught the contagion and took an active part, and everybody for an escaped convict and when he found his challenge unanswered even by a frightened villager swimming across the river he was shot at by the gallant officer, it is said, in spite of protestation by a few villagers. And Sir, if the intention of the officer is to be judged by his actions it was not so much the recapture of the escaped convicts, as to shoot them down for it is admitted by the Government that no further notice of the wounded man was taken by the officer.

MEMBER in charge of POLICE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): It is not admitted by Government.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: But Sir, in reply to a question put by me I think the reply was given by Government the other day that no notice of the wounded men was taken by the officer that very night. I am seeking for the reply and I will show it.

Now, Sir, it seems that he thought his business ended with the shooting of a supposed convict, the rest was left to fate.

Sir, the Government has expressed a regret for the Mohanganj incident, but is a mere expression of regret enough recompense when the servants of the Government themselves have not merely committed an error of judgment, the modern panacea for all official delinquencies, but, if the reports are true, a positively illegal act—a crime. Sir, I am convinced that the Government inquiry into the conduct of the officers at Mohanganj is not worth the name. The whole matter has been practically left to the underlings of the Police and they have got up a story suiting their own purpose and have patted themselves on they backs with the Commissioner as a mere figurehead. It is deplorable that such things should ever come out with the hall-mark of a Government resolution and the Government should be led to pour applause when castigation is merited. Sir, the other day, an Hon'ble Member of the Government lustily enunciated the principle underlying the relationship between the Government and its officers. He said that they can only be enlivened with a due sense of discipline and responsibility when they can be

assured of Government support, assured with the knowledge that the Government should always be at their back. Sir, the Hon'ble Member is a worthy officer, so worthy that he may indentify himself with the Government, and like Louis XIV cry out *L'etat c'est moi*—I am the State—and magnanimously issue *carte blanches* to all his officers. But we are now living in democratic days. All hon'ble officials should do well if they remember that that game of the seventeenth century can be played no longer. It would be much better if the hon'ble officials would remind their subordinates that they all, high and low, are servants of the people, and with that knowledge alone a better sense of service, a higher tone of discipline and responsibility can be attained.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: The Chandpur affair has unfortunately placed the Mohanganj affair in a shade, otherwise we would have heard a great deal more about this terrible event in which shots were fired at random and innocent people killed. I already discussed the Mohanganj affair in the course of my speech on police reorganisation: but the matter is so serious and has been so lightly dealt with in the Government resolution, that we have sometimes to wonder whether official mentality is ever likely to change at all. Reforms or no reforms, it seems to be the same attitude of patting the officials on the back and minimising events that are serious in all conscience. During the last few days, we have heard in this Council Hon'ble Members of the Government strongly criticising the action of those audacious members of the Council who have the effrontery to find fault with the Government or its officials. I can assure you, Sir, that it is not a pleasant task, nay, it is one of the most thankless tasks imaginable, to have to get up and say unpalatable things. But, if we have to justify our presence here, if we have any regard for the duty that has been imposed upon us, we must speak out the truth, however unpalatable, we must bring to the notice of the Government the opinion of the public, as we read it. If we fail in this, we should be failing in our duty both to the Government and to the people. The Government ought to remember that their open critics are their best friends. There is no justification in thinking that it is the nature of some members eternally to go "against the Government"—there is no justification in thinking that fearless criticism is due to any but the most honest motives, and I do not know that there is any Government in the world who has the right to stigmatise or cow down honest criticism. Why do we criticise the Government at all? Because we want to prevent the Government from creating serious discontent in the country. What is this Mohanganj affair? Government have published a resolution based on the report of the Commissioner of the Rajshahi Division, who, as stated in the reply to a question put by Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray, never went to Mohanganj to inquire into the matter at all. As against this report, we have a report signed by five non-official gentlemen, who held the inquiry on the spot. Is it any wonder that the people look askance at the Government report? Is it any wonder that we come

to this Council to demand a further and a fuller enquiry, so that the truth and the whole truth may be found out? Government should not fight shy of an open inquiry. It will surely tend to allay the prevailing discontent. The main facts of the Mohanganj affair are simple enough and have been well stated by the Kumar, but many important details are still so much shrouded in darkness that they demand the light of an open inquiry.

I have carefully read the official report: but we do not know what was the the total number of the force that found itself obliged to proceed to arrest 40 men, who were reported to look like coolies. We do not know why the house was not kept surrounded till day-light when it would have been ever so much easier to arrest these men. Then we find it stated—"They received information that the convicts armed with four or five guns had looted Mohanganj Hat and were resting there in an exhausted state."

We want to know who supplied this information, so that we can judge whether it was trustworthy or whether the informant was merely moonstruck in the moonlit night when the memorable march to Mohanganj took place. We find it stated in the official report that Mr. Bell had specially ordered that there was to be no firing and yet a recruit let off his rifle. Then again, we find it stated "others, under the impression that they were being attacked, fired also and, in the confusion and noise, the orders of the officers to 'cease fire' were not heard." Of all the unsatisfactory descriptions of the whole affair this is the most unsatisfactory and we are seriously asked to be satisfied with this. The Commissioner's report on this matter is more curious still. He says "It cannot be ascertained who fired the first shot but it seems fairly probable that it was a Gurkha recruit who understood no language but his own patois." I do not know what to say to a statement like this seriously offered to the public. The recruit had been four months in the Sardah Training School—Is it conceivable that in course of these four months a recruit had not even learned to understand the ordinary words of orders issued by their superiors? It was not as if the Gurkha was asked to carry on a discussion or a dissertation with the officers—he was there to carry out orders and surely four months' time in a training school was enough to teach him this simple and elementary order! If the Sardah School could not do this for him, the sooner the affairs of the school are overhauled the better.

It appears that the Commissioner was not sure whether this explanation would be acceptable to the public, so we find there another explanation—*viz.*, "or he may have fired out of pure excitement." Sir, I must honestly confess, I do not understand these excitements, which have a tendency to play fast and loose with people's lives. Is human life to be held so cheap in India that such flimsy excuses can be seriously suggested in an official document?

As if this were not enough the Commissioner goes on to state—"It is impossible to decide now who fired the actual shots and it does not seem profitable to inquire." *Not profitable to inquire?* Is this the attitude that Government is going to take up—five innocent men are wounded and one villager has died as a result of gunshot wounds—and yet it is not profitable to inquire who is responsible for this atrocious action? It is sentiments like these that bring the Government into discredit and disrepute. If a thing like this had happened in England, would any official have dared to take up this attitude? How does the Government treat the matter? Government not only endorses the opinion of the Commissioner that "all concerned in the pursuit and recapture, both officers and men gave their best, worked indefatigably and showed marked courage and endurance," but the praise allotted to the officers and men is too fulsome for words. Mutual admiration seems the order of the day, but in a case, where the public are not yet satisfied, this praise is, to put it mildly, most curious and uncalled for. It has been often asserted in this Council that adverse criticism of the officials tends to destroy discipline and quality of work, but I say it in all seriousness that fulsome praise in season and out of season and invariable support on all occasions tends to destroy the *morale* of any service and utterly destroys true prestige and public confidence.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: Sir, I beg to support this resolution. When we read of the break through of the convicts from the Rajshahi Jail it reminded

The PRESIDENT: You are not entitled to go into the question of the incident at the Rajshahi Jail. I have already ruled to that effect and you must confine yourself to the Mohanganj incidents. The matter of the Rajshahi Jail is under a judicial inquiry and you cannot express any opinion on it.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: I am not expressing any opinion on it.

The PRESIDENT: You are.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: You have not yet heard me.

The PRESIDENT: Go on.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: When I heard of the break through of the prisoners from the Rajshahi Jail, it reminded me of certain chapters of the early period of the mutiny.

The PRESIDENT: You are out of order. You may say what you like about the Mohanganj incidents.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: The Mohanganj incident was an outcome of the escape of the Rajshahi prisoners. Government had to be maintained and peace and order had to be restored. In that process, excesses were committed, but the excesses were too great. Murders, looting and other outrages were committed. Such things always happen when such events, such occurrences as the break through of the prisoners take place. What I say is this. In such a position when the people consider that they have been ill-treated, it is the duty of Government to appoint a committee, an impartial committee, to find out what were the causes and circumstances which led to it and what were the excesses and whether these great excesses should be punished or not. Sir, the Mohanganj matter stands on a different footing from that of the Chandpur business. There I was satisfied with the practical vote of censure and did not want further agitation. In this matter there is no possibility of any public ebullition of agitation. The events of the past have been practically forgotten, but in the interests of justice and to satisfy the public that things were right there should be a committee of inquiry and, if things were not right, men who have offended, men who have maltreated, these people would certainly have to be dealt with. In order to assure the public, Government should at once fall in with the mover and appoint an impartial committee.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: This resolution, like the one we had before us not long ago, requests Government to undertake a further inquiry into an incident in which an inquiry has already been held, and regarding which the conclusions arrived at have already been made public in a resolution which runs to six and a half pages in print. When such a recommendation is made therefore I think that we are entitled to expect something more than the vague generalities which have been hurled at our heads, all calculated to create prejudice against the action of Government and its conduct in relation to its officers. I put it to the Council that it is not sufficient to come here and say there are suspicions that a fair inquiry has not been made, that material witnesses have not been examined and that more has been hidden than disclosed, to embroider that theme with many adjectives and heroics, and then to end—"Of course we do not know that these suspicions are justified," and yet to urge those suspicions as the basis of a fresh investigation.

Apart from details, with which I will deal later, the only two general reasons which have been given by Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray why we should have an inquiry are—firstly, that the previous one was held by the Commissioner alone, and, secondly, that Government have not taken the public into their confidence. When Government has published, as I have said, a lengthy resolution giving every detail of interest in connection with this incident, is it fair to say that they have not taken

the public into their confidence? More especially when we have freely and frankly admitted that a mistake was made and have given details in this Council of the compensation paid to the families of the injured persons. As to the fact that the Commissioner held an inquiry alone, the Kumar Sahib is as well aware as I am that the Commissioner is the head of his division, and it is strictly in accord with official practice that, when the conduct of his officers is impugned, he should deal with the matter and report to Government.

This incident arose out of the escape on the 24th of March of 669 convicts from the Rajshahi Jail, and the fact that 669 more or less desperate men were wandering over the district was clearly a source of considerable danger to the peaceful inhabitants of the locality. One would have expected, therefore, to have heard some recognition of the efforts that were made by the men who did their best to round these convicts up. When the escape was known two courses were obviously open to the local officials They might have assumed a kind of "Bo-peep" attitude—let them alone and they will come home dragging their chains behind them—and trust to luck that sooner or later these men would be rounded up in one corner or another; or they might have assumed the responsibility of taking action The officials, fortunately, at once took every action in their power, they gathered up men, wherever they could be found, put them into motor-cars and dashed them off in pursuit of these convicts. I should have have been better pleased to have heard that the younger members of the Rajshahi Bar accompanied the party which went out in pursuit, instead of staying behind incubating committees of inquiry and resolutions of censure

Now, Sir, as you have ruled that the details of the pursuit are under judicial inquiry and cannot therefore be dealt with here, the discussion being confined to the incident which occurred at Mohanganj, I can only say so much, that two parties went in pursuit, one from Rajshahi itself, and one, at the instance of Mr Reid the Collector, from Sardah, consisting mainly of recruits from the Police School After various incidents which depleted the first party, either in the pursuit of small detachments or in guarding men who had been arrested, the two forces met at Mohanganj at about 11-30 P.M. At that time the party from Rajshahi had been marching, since afternoon, without food, and without clothing, as they had practically doubled out of their barracks as they were and had covered a distance of some sixteen miles. These raw recruits who, as we have been told this afternoon, had only been about 18 weeks under training, had come a distance of about twenty-six miles; this, in an afternoon of the latter part of March. Is it to be wondered at that some of them were exhausted, and is it to be wondered at if excitement prevailed among them? These parties met in a village about four miles from Mohanganj at 11-30 at night. They heard from passers-by that the convicts had passed through Mohanganj—as it is admitted they had—and had looted the bazars and were now resting there. We

have been asked where that rumour came from? I admit that no individual informant is mentioned in the papers, but how do these rumours get about, except in a general way as gathered from passers-by? In any case this party, exhausted as it was, pressed on. It was a moonlight night; they found the road strewn with convicts' clothing and prison utensils, all evidence to show that the convicts had gone that way. When they came up to Mohanganj, they sent forward an Indian non-commissioned officer to reconnoitre. He came back and said that there were 40 suspicious looking people asleep in a shed, and admittedly these people were not Bengali villagers. It was concluded that they were convicts, while also on the previous information, it was believed that the convicts were armed with four or five guns. Admittedly they had one gun; four or five was an exaggeration. The pursuing party surrounded this house, a scuffle ensued when they went inside, the villagers took them for dacoits—not an unnatural mistake at 1-30 at night—whereas the police took for convicts what were really up-country labourers, and a struggle ensued. One of the raw recruits, in spite of distinct instructions which had been given, let off his gun, others followed suit and there was general confusion. Before the officers could order 'cease fire' nine shots were fired. Four men sustained slight injuries, and one villager who had come out to see what was going on was unfortunately shot and killed. That was the only fatal accident. At that time the people were running about in all directions. The police were still under the impression that they were on the heels of the convicts, and when they found men hiding in ditches and behind trees, certain of them were arrested, the total being twenty-four or twenty-five. Mr. MacDowell, the Superintendent of Police of the district, challenged one man who was found in a ditch and receiving no answer pursued him towards the river. The man swam across the river. Mr. MacDowell who is a fluent Bengali scholar, told him to stop and said that he would not be injured if he did so. The man would not stop and got to the other side, whereupon Mr. MacDowell fired and hit him. This man has since recovered. The party then left the twenty-four or twenty-five men they had arrested on the road side and pressed on, and it has been made a cause of complaint against them that they did not there and then stop in the village and sort them out. Another charge made against them is that they did not wait till the morning before surrounding the house. The reason why they did not wait till morning before surrounding the house was that they were keen on the recapture of the convicts, and they did not want to run any risk of losing them. The sorting out of these men was left to the District Magistrate who came up next morning. But the pursuing party went on without rest that night in order to catch these convicts. I put it to the Council that, in according a considerable meed of praise to these officers and recruits who undertook this arduous task in the interests of the peace of the Rajshahi district, Government

is not open to the charge of having delivered itself of fulsome and nauseating adulation. It seems to me that these men performed an extraordinarily plucky act under circumstances of considerable difficulty.

Now, that is a simple statement of the facts, which, indeed, has already been given in our resolution. My evidence of it rests on the statements of Mr. MacDowell, the Superintendent of Police of the District, Mr. Bell, the Assistant Principal of the Sardah Police Training College, who was with the party, Inspector Linford, Inspector Khan Sahib Wali Muhammad, a subedar, 7 recruits, 8 villagers and 4 convicts, and, as I said in the matter of the Chandpur case, if anybody wishes to see that evidence, I am perfectly willing to place it on the library table.

Now, Sir, in so far as the report of the non-official committee of inquiry (and indeed anything we have heard to-day) does not differ materially in any statement of what occurred from what I have just related, I put it to the Council that there is not sufficient reason for reopening this matter, regarding which witnesses have already been examined and their statements recorded. The case comes down, as it did in the Chandpur incident, to differences of opinion as to the conclusions which may be drawn regarding certain aspects of the affair, and I will take one by one these points so far as they have been related this afternoon.

It has been said by Kumar Sib Shekhareswar Ray that no notice was taken of the wounded men, and he had even gone so far as to have said that Government had admitted this. Sir, I read the answer which we gave the day before yesterday regarding the man who was shot by Mr. MacDowell? It ran

> Mr. MacDowell gave the wounded man stimulants and arranged for him to be sent to hospital in charge of a constable and two of his relatives.

I have here, in the statements of convicts, villagers and officers, constant references to the action taken to despatch the wounded men to hospital. The man who was killed did not appear before any officer, he went of his own accord to hospital, and our information is that his injuries were not serious and if properly treated he might have recovered. But he would not stay in hospital, and blood poisoning apparently ensued, and he died. But in so far as the wounded people came under the notice of Government officers, arrangements were made to send them to hospital, and why should it be suspected otherwise? Is it likely that people of the standing of the Superintendent of Police and District Magistrate would wantonly and brutally leave the wounded people on the roadside when it was easy enough to send them to the hospital?

Another allegation that has been made is that the zenanas were insulted. I can only read Mr. Reid's account of the search which runs as follows:

> As regards the search of various houses, the Superintendent of Police informs me that he had the whole village carefully searched. The reason was that after the

attempt to surround the men in Shaher Mulla's hut, men (whom the police had every reason to believe were convicts) had fled in all directions, but the searches were done under orders and with care. If voices of women were heard they were left alone.

There was no chasing of women, nor were insulting remarks made to them. The Superintendent of Police took care to explain to the villagers what the police were there for. This is the Superintendent's statement. He was present. I saw Shaher Mulla's house yesterday. It contains a large number of separate ghars and rooms and there must have been great confusion after the first attempt to arrest the coolies. Maina Beewa told me her story. Some sepoys tried to get into the room in which she went, but desisted when she shut the door in their faces. All the inmates told me no damage was done by the police.

He remarks later as regards this aged Indian lady whom he personally saw :—

She may have been frightened but no harm was offered or done to her. From her statement to me I am satisfied she was treated neither *[illegible]* nor *improperly* (these being the words used by the non-official committee).

I submit that the account of the District Magistrate is based on reasonable evidence and should be accepted as true.

Another point urged by Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray was that innocent men were arrested. I have explained to the Council the circumstances under which twenty-four or twenty-five men were arrested. That is not in dispute. But it is not correct to say that no convicts were found, as two convicts were arrested in the village. But on the main point that the men who were arrested were subsequently released there is substantial agreement. The investigation took place in the morning when there was time to undertake it.

Then we are asked why was the force allowed to carry arms? I put it to the Council that when you go out to arrest a body of 669 convicts who are, as a class, dangerous people, it is wise to take armed men if they are at your disposal.

Then again we are asked why was not the regular police employed? The reason was that the small body of police taken from Rajshahi had all been detailed off either in charge of men who were arrested or had fallen back exhausted. Mr. MacDowell himself collapsed at about 6 o'clock that same evening, although he pluckily went on. The only men he had with him at the actual occurrence came from Sardah.

The incident of Mr. MacDowell's firing has been criticised by Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray, and the allegation was that it was Mr. MacDowell's intention to shoot the man down. I have given the facts to the Council that, after repeated warnings, the man did not stop, and Mr. MacDowell who was under the impression that he was a convict fired.

These are the main criticisms mentiontd by Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray, and I again repeat that they do not indicate any serious divergence from the incidents as we have related them, but are confined

practically to conclusions which may be drawn from, and criticisms which may be advanced against, particular actions of particular officers.

I pass to the points mentioned by Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta. He asks first, what was the total force at Mohangganj? The total force at Mohanganj were the three companies of Sardah recruits who had started at 3-30 P.M. from the school, less such as had fallen out owing to exhaustion or for any other reason. From Mr. MacDowell's statement it seems that the number was about 250.

The next point taken was as to the failure of Mr. MacDowell to wait before surrounding the house till daybreak. With that I have already dealt. The third point was as to who supplied the information as to the convicts being at Mohanganj, and that, too, I have already mentioned. His fourth criticism was that our resolution gave a most unsatisfactory picture of the whole affair. I am sorry that we have failed in word painting, but the facts are simple, as I have told the Council. Confusion occurred at night under misapprehensions on both sides, firing took place against orders, and some men were hurt. Personally I prefer a simple version to mere picturesque writing.

Then we are asked could not the firing have been stopped? The evidence is that the officer in charge of the police had previously directed that firing was not to be resorted to, and as soon as it broke out he did his best to put an end to it. The fact that only nine shots were fired shows that he got the men under control in a short space of time.

As regards the allegation that the theory of excitement is a flimsy excuse, I leave it to the Council to judge from the facts as I have related them.

As to the point who fired the first shot, much play has been made by Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta with the Commissioner's remark that further inquiry could not profitably be made. But surely it is obvious that all that was meant was that, given the facts as I have stated them, it was impossible to ascertain in the confusion of the night who first let off his gun.

Those are the points taken by Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta, and I have now noticed all criticisms in detail. I again remind the Council that the statements which I have given have practically not been challenged in any substantial point of fact. I have given the evidence upon which they rest, and since they cover the main issues which could be brought before any fresh inquiry, I submit that any further inquiry is unnecessary and uncalled for.

Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: We have heard what the mover of the resolution has said, we have also heard the reply of Government; but one thing strikes me. When the representatives of the people coming from the district of Rajshahi ask for a further inquiry, I do not see there can be any harm if such an inquiry is made. I hope that a new and fresh inquiry, if made, would endorse the official report.

When the people of the Rajshahi district are anxious for a fresh inquiry I do not see any reason why Government should not accede to their request The Government can ill-afford to lose the confidence of the people In these troublous times it is very necessary that the people should have their faith unshaken in the Government

With these remarks, I beg to support the resolution

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: I wish to say only a few words with reference to this resolution I fully agree with what the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler has said that there was a misapprehension on both sides, but it cannot be denied that there was a huge blunder on the part of the Government officials. It was not a case of comedy of errors but it was a case tragedy of errors What I would simply suggest is that when the non-official members of the Council ask for a committee, I think Government should not refuse it, because I may tell the House, and especially the official members of the House, that if it had not been for the Chandpur incident this incident of Mohanganj Hat would have spread discontent throughout the length and breadth of the land, the Chandpur incident overshadowed this incident What the people want is that "let there be an inquiry" They do not want anything further But what the Government thinks is that, because they have come to certain conclusions on the evidence before it there is no reason why there should be a review of its decision But I do not think that is the right way of looking at the question If the people want an inquiry let there be one Government will not lose anything by such an inquiry

With these words I beg to support the resolution

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: I have nothing much to add but I repeat again that the inquiry into the conduct of the Superintendent of Police was made by the Deputy Superintendent of Police, and as such this inquiry cannot give satisfaction to the public But on this report the Superintendent of Police has been lauded in the Government resolution I know that the Government admits the mistake But how? I will read a sentence from the Commissioner's report about Mr MacDowell The Commissioner says

> I am of opinion that the firing at Mohanganj was an almost inevitable result of the situation I do not think that any blame attaches to the responsible officers for the sudden outburst of firing

Then he says:—

> As to Mr MacDowell's shot at the man who swam across the river I think that in the circumstances he was justified in firing

Then the Government resolution says:

> So far as the district authorities are concerned, they displayed conspicuous energy resource and activity and thanks are particularly due, amongst others to Mr. MacDowell."

Is this not fulsome praise?

I also know that some compensation has been paid to some of the villagers, but, Sir, no censure appears to have been passed on the officials who were responsible for the mistakes. The appointment of a committee is required to inquire into the conduct of the officials and whether any excesses were committed under their orders. There are some material differences between the official report and the report made by some eminent men of Rajshahi. I will read some extracts. About insulting the zenana in the house of Shaher Mullah, it states:—

> Some of the armed men noticed this backdoor through which they entered the inner apartments and chased Musammat Moina Bibi, the mother of Shaher Mulla, an aged lady, who had come out of her room to ascertain what was happening. She ran back into her room and shut the door. The armed men made use of some insulting remarks, held out threats and tried to force open the door.

Then, Sir, about the shooting of Toki Pramanik, I find that the following is given in this report:

> A group of three persons, namely, Toki Pramanik, who was a brother-in-law of Shaher Mulla, along with Momin Mridha and Pacha Mridha were proceeding towards Shaher Mulla's house. While they were very near it some armed men who were taken by three men as dacoits shouted out "*dhar*, *dhar*" and all the three ran away. Momin Mridha and Pacha Mridha ran into a *khodakhana* (private mosque) near by while Toki Pramanik jumped into the river Baralai which is a short distance west of Shaher Mulla's house.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: I am sorry to interrupt the speaker. If he reads the answer given to a question on the subject yesterday he will see that he is mistaken. Toki was a villager who was hit by a stray shot and not by Mr. MacDowell.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: The official report says that the man was not shot by Mr. MacDowell, but the non-official report is to the effect that Toki Pramanik was shot by a Sahib if not by Mr. MacDowell. It is therefore to clear up the mystery that I want a committee of inquiry. Let the position be cleared and let the guilt be duly apportioned. The report continues:

> This was no protection to poor Toki who according to Momin Mridha was shot by a sahib. He was wounded in three places about the knee, higher up in the thigh and on the right side of the back.

In the official report it is stated that there was only one shot, but here we see that there were three shots fired on him. The non-official report says:

> Two shots were received by him while he was in water and one after he had reached the opposite bank of the river.

In the official report it is stated that notice of the man was taken the very night, but this is not so. The reply to my question says that so far as Toki is concerned he was not captured by the police, nor did he reveal

the fact that he had been wounded. It is further stated therein that it is only after his death that the fact of his being wounded at Mohanganj was known to the authorities. With due respect I say from personal knowledge, that it is not so. Government officials knew before his death that Toki was shot. The non-official committee say that "thereafter the policemen took no further notice of him but left him to his fate."

Now I come to the other point. I mean the official report in which it is stated that only one man was shot in the river, but the non-official report is to the effect that two men were shot. The non-official report says:

"Another man named Natar Kamaru, a boatman by profession, was also similarly chased. He also jumped into the river with a view to save himself from the attack of people whom he took to be dacoits. While Natar Khamaru was swimming across the river Babu Sri Kanta Sarkar whose evidence we have recorded was forcibly taken to the river bank where a number of armed men stood in battle array under the lead of the Superintendent of Police himself. Babu Sri Kanta Sarkar states that notwithstanding repeated assertion on his part that Natar was one of his men the order to fire was given by the Superintendent of Police and the shots let loose at four different places."

In the official report it is stated that Mr. MacDowell is not at all to blame for this. This also ought to be cleared up by the proposed committee of inquiry.

Some statement has been made about the compensation that has been paid. Of course some compensation has been paid to the widow of Toki, but it is only Rs. 1,000, the price of an Indian life is only Rs. 1,000! While Mrs. Sherwood who was only assaulted by the mob at Amritsar got a huge sum. However, that is another story. No compensation has been paid to the mother of Shaher Mulla, no compensation has been paid to the men whose houses were raided or to the people who were arrested by the police by mistake and detained the whole night till next morning.

A reference has been made to the statements made by certain officials which might throw further light on the subject. The Hon'ble Member says that the statements could be placed at our disposal if desired. It is very kind of him to say so now. Certainly the notice of the resolution was given about a month back and it would have been much more kind of him if he had communicated the news to me a little earlier so that I might have dealt with them, but that is not the way of the Hon'ble Member.

I do not like to detain the House any more. There are material discrepancies between the official report and that of the non-officials. So I think a committee of inquiry should be appointed.

The motion was put and agreed to.

The PRESIDENT: The next motion is in the name of Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri, but that deals with a matter which is now under judicial inquiry. Therefore, it cannot be discussed, and I pass it over.

It was as follows:—

"This Council recommends to the Government that a committee, consisting of officials and non-officials, be appointed to inquire into and report upon the action taken by the local authorities in connection with the escape and recapture of the convicts of the Rajshahi Jail."

I now call upon Raja Manmatha Nath Ray Choudhury to move the resolution which stands in his name.

Vocational training.

Raja MANMATHA NATH RAY CHOUDHURY: "This Council recommends to the Government to select every year from each district of Bengal and send out, at their cost, to different foreign Universities, at least a dozen deserving graduates or under-graduates of the Universities of Calcutta and Dacca for a three years' course of technical, industrial and agricultural training under such conditions as Government may deem proper."

I think I shall not be guilty of exaggeration if I say that the question of vocational training in this country at the present moment transcends all other public questions, in weight and importance. A silent revolution, or call it an unrest, stares us in the face. If we take a correct bearing of the situation we shall find it to be too serious to be made light of, particularly in relation to its economic and educational aspects, as they are based, not so much as is often supposed, upon petty jealousy roused by foreign competition or foreign enterprises, or upon a real feeling of aversion for cultural training, on western lines, as upon an unyielding determination to work out the material salvation of the country with the help of Science.

Sir, I am led to believe that exceptional economic conditions have created the present exceptional situation, and, if we are to restore the lost equilibrium, these abnormal conditions shall have to be dealt with very carefully and seriously in the light of true statesmanship. There is absolutely no denying the fact that our people can no longer stand upon services or professions. Hardly is there a man in Bengal to-day who does not feel that the material salvation of the country lies in the revival of her trade, commerce, her arts and industries. Hardly is there a man in Bengal to-day, who does not sincerely deplore the backwardness of our people in the matter of technical, industrial and agricultural education. The feeling has gone abroad, and it is irresistible, that the three R's if no technical and industrial training has gone along with them, are apt to produce a fourth R of "Rascaldom," for which the Government are alleged to be providing an excellent foundation by their apathy and indifference with regard to technical and agricultural education of our people. This is a very serious allegation and I think,

Sir, that it is clearly the duty of Government to meet that charge, not by a simple denial, or by promises; but, in my opinion, by quickly sympathising, in a practical way, with legitimate aspirations of the people in the matter.

I am afraid, Sir, that it will be an uphill task for Government to recapture the imagination of those of our people, who have been led away from the Government, if I may say so, unless the powers that be are prepared to take vigorous steps to train the hands of our people in the various useful arts and industries and in all the up-to date agricultural and scientific works; for, it is apparent that our people have realised that the political freedom which has been promised them will be meaningless, without commercial or economic freedom. True it is, that our country is primarily an agricultural country; but, there is no denying the fact that ever-increasing population and demands of life have by far exceeded the producing capacity of our land and I think it is essential that new openings for material prosperity should be made for them. It is also an undeniable historical truth that, in the medieval days, India was a great trading country; her commercial civilization, her legendary wealth, the industrial genius of her people, and her great mercantile cities were the wonders of Europe. Europe has no doubt beaten India in the race and beaten her very badly too; but following in the wake of an industrial awakening, the Indians of to-day have resolved within themselves to retrieve India's lost glories and wipe off, if possible, from her fair brow the stain of that defeat and her present distress. I think it will be a serious mistake on the part of Government to forget that our people are out to win economic freedom for their country. They are really anxious to have the vast resources of their country developed by their own men and, if possible, also by their own money. They are no longer willing to supply to the merchant princes of the world mere labourers; they want to have their own trained men for their own purposes as well as to supply to the world, if need be, their own mechanics, their own engineers and other scientific workers. I think that if the Government is to win back the people who have been torn away, they must fulfil these ambitions.

Sir, I may, with your permission, say that our Universities, on the other hand, have grown unpopular. This is not only because our people are averse to cultural training on Western lines, but it is also because there are no sister universities in our province for technical, industrial and agricultural education of our youths. It may be that the abuses which have been hurled against our Universities, from all directions, might not have been always based upon sober and cogent reasons. It may be, that they might not have been always merited, but there is absolutely no doubt that our people can no longer be satisfied with the present system of education unless it is supplemented by industrial, technical and agricultural training, so that cultural and vocational training may go hand in hand to prevent *dark despair* succeeding *brown study*, as

is often the case, in India. We stand upon the verge of a new era and at this turning point of our national life our people have realised that their material salvation lies in the revival of India's trade and commerce. They will not rest till uptodate scientific education in all its branches, is brought to their door, so that they may, in the fullness of time, stand on their own legs and hold their own against any nation on the face of the globe. This is a legitimate aspiration which Government is in duty bound to fulfil. If Government were in a position to spare all the money required for the establishment of Universities for technical, industrial and agricultural education in Bengal, I would have unhesitatingly recommended Government to start them at once with well equipped feeder institutions scattered all over the Presidency, but having regard to the financial position of Government, it would be idle to expect that such a measure could be given effect to. Failing that, it is incumbent on Government to provide funds for scholarships to enable an adequate number of our young men to go abroad for technical, industrial and agricultural education. I think this should be immediately done, for, what I find is that our people are gradually coming to think that nothing is going to be done. It has already transpired that the Government of India have notified the Bengal Government to the effect that the State scholarships for Europe, which were hitherto given by the Government of India, will no longer be available to the people of Bengal. It is now the duty of the Government of Bengal to award such scholarships.

Sir, it may be said, that my resolution is a bit too ambitious and a little too expensive, but what I am afraid of is that the impatient idealist will not be satisfied even with what I have asked for, he will ask for much more; for he lives in an Utopian situation of his own and is apt to cry for the moon. But I am confident that if the Government be pleased to give effect to my resolution it will go a great way to make the Universities in Bengal more popular and at the same time satisfy the legitimate aspirations of the people, for, there is still a very large section of our people who feel that what Western countries have taken a century to create, Bengal, and for the matter of that, India cannot achieve in a day. They believe in slow progress but want it to be steady, they do not want a revolution but they want the Government to keep pace with the tide of evolution. In their name, Sir, I appeal to the Government to accept my resolution and I hope and trust that I do not appeal in vain.

Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur: The country is fast awakening to the need for technical and industrial education and a resolution like the one just moved by my hon'ble friend, the Raja Sahib of Santosh, is sure to get our whole-hearted support.

As to sending our young graduates abroad for agricultural training, I think it would be better to get special experts from foreign countries,

if necessary, to improve the efficiency of the existing agricultural Institutions at Pusa, Sabour and other places. There is nothing to prevent the growth of first-rate agricultural colleges in India.

But the case is different with industrial and technical institutions. It will be long before we can hope to complete with similar institutions in foreign countries. Again, in view of the fact that graduates are now quite numerous, I prefer to send only graduates except in special circumstances. I strongly support the general principle of this resolution.

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: I am sorry I have to oppose this resolution. The reason is that we should ask the Government to help us in sending boys to foreign countries for technical, industrial and agricultural training when there is a lack of funds or lack of sympathy on the part of parents to send their children to foreign countries for such education or when there is no organisation in the country for sending boys to foreign countries for such education. It is well known that nowadays parents who can well afford to do it have been sending their boys to the different Universities of foreign countries, not by dozens but by hundreds, and I think that at the present time there are in the Engineering Colleges and other Technical Institutes in Scotland, England and America about one thousand students who are getting their technical training. Students have also been going to Japan because education is much cheaper there than in Europe or in America. My friend, Rajа Manmatha Nath Ray Choudhury, must be aware of the existence of the Association for the advancement of Scientific and Industrial education of Indians. He will probably be surprised to hear that under the aegis of that association, no less than 400 boys have been sent, during the last 15 or 16 years, to Europe, to America, and to Japan, and most of them have gone to these countries for the purpose of obtaining technical education, and, by technical education, I mean agricultural education also. It was only last year that we sent 40 students and we are going to send 100 students this year. Well, that association owes its existence to my esteemed friend Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur. He is not only the Secretary but he is the life and soul of that association and I am its poor Treasurer. I may tell you that that organisation has the support of all the zamindars of the province. The Hon'ble Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan is one of its patrons and, in fact, all the noblemen of Bengal contribute a regular monthly subscription in aid of that association. With that money we were in a position to send about 400 students to the foreign Universities. I have forgotten to mention one matter. Messrs. Mackinnon, Mackenzie and Company also allow a certain reduction in the passage money to our boys—I think our are boys are permitted to pay only half the rate and we are deeply grateful to Messrs. Mackinnon, Mackenzie and Company for their kindness. So the Council will see that there is already an organisation here in Calcutta.

Formerly the Government used to pay a grant of Rs. 5,000 annually but the grant was reduced to Rs. 2,500 at the time of the war and now we are not getting anything.

Let us see what the cost of the scheme of my friend Raja Manmatha Nath Ray Choudhury would be. It would cost, I think, about Rs. 60,000 to Rs. 70,000 per annum. Each boy would cost about Rs. 300 per month or Rs. 4,000 per annum and 12 boys will cost about Rs. 48,000 to Rs. 50,000 annually in scholarships besides there is their passage money. So the scheme would cost at least Rs. 60,000. Instead of spending this sum we might reorganise the Sibpur Engineering College and have a good technical institute along with the Sibpur Engineering College.

Raja MANMATHA NATH RAY CHOUDHURY: Is the member in order in advocating the cause of the Sibpur Engineering College and of the Scientific Association

The PRESIDENT: I think it has a relevancy.

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: I think that if the money which my friend wants to spend in sending out boys to foreign countries were spent on improving the Sibpur Engineering College it would be a permanent gain to the country. For these reasons, I cannot support the resolution.

Babu NIBARAN CHANDRA DAS GUPTA: I have very great pleasure in supporting this resolution. I am extremely sorry that my friend, Babu Surendra Nath Ray, has taken upon himself the rôle of the zealous custodian of public funds The motion has my heartiest approval and support We can no longer afford to be " frogs and toads in a well." If we are to keep ourselves abreast of the other people of the world, in their onward march towards Progress and Civilisation, we must look abroad The example of Japan should be an eye-opener to us. The Japanese are an " oriental people " and yet in spite of the saying that the " East never moves," they have moved and are moving at a very rapid " pace." Even China—the immobile, conservative and ancient China—has moved and created the bugbear of the " yellow peril " to the Westerners. Only " India is sleeping." There is no knowing how long India shall remain in this stage of hybernation! Let it not be said, that free countries only, like Japan and China, can keep pace with the " onward march " and not a dependency like India. Why? We are, it is said, on the high road towards "Swaraj." If so, why should we lag behind? Is it not a fact, that Japan owes her wonderful position in world-politics by sending out her young hopefuls, in hundreds and in thousands, to Europe and America to learn and assimilate all that is best in Western culture, by sitting at the feet of Western savants and experts? Her wonderful progress in every department of science and art, is due to this readiness and effort to learn without losing an iota of her own

culture; Japan made every item of western science and art her own. She, at State-expense, continued and still continues to send young men to Europe and America to learn all that is worth learning there. Why shoud not we do so? There is no other way for speedy progress. We are not for abandoning all that is best in our ancient civilisation and culture. The process is not one of denationalisation, rather it is demanded by our highest and noblest spirit of nationalism. Here, I must pay my highest compliments to Rai Jogendra Chunder Ghose Bahadur, who has been for years doing his utmost through gloom and sunshine, through hopes and despair, through good report and ill report, to give shape to this idea, by sending dozens of young men to Europe, Japan, and America. It has been said that those young men on their return do not find sufficient opportunity for utilising their knowledge, garnered in foreign lands. This, I think, may be partially true, on account of our abject poverty and the indifference of our capitalists and Government, in not starting or supporting commercial and industrial concerns, wherein these young men can have scope for utilising their talents and knowledge. The movement of my friend, the Rai Bahadur, is not yet what it should have been by this time for want of funds. The Government is doing very little in this direction. Let the Government show its sincerity in elevating the people, by taking immediate steps for giving effect to this idea. Mere protection from foreign invasion and maintenance of internal peace and order in the country will not do, we want to join the great race of nations for economic and industrial prizes. The means suggested in the resolution had been put to practical tests, by the States of the Far East, which have not been found "wanting" but, on the contrary, they have been found eminently successful in the amelioration of the condition of those countries. Why should we not then adopt them? Cannot we save money enough by curtailing our enormous expenditure on frontier defences, the police, and for the maintenance of a top-heavy administration for this useful purpose? Where there is a will, there is a way. Let our Government show its least inclination to follow in the wake of Japan and China in this matter, and money will be forthcoming in abundance. We feel every day that our efforts towards giving pure literary education to our young men have been futile, our cleverness in mastering the abstract science useless, and our unpardonable vanity for our ancient culture, the bane of our progress. We want to give a new bias to our national mind towards the practical sciences and arts. The cry for vocational education has become insistent and how can we inaugurate a system of such education, without training a number of young men who should be the pioneers in this holy war of national regeneration? Agriculture, industry, technology and every practical art in this country are in their primitive stages far behind the Western systems. How can we expect to stop foreign exploitation and our sure death and ruin without taking to newer methods? The struggle for existence has become very keen. We can no longer sit idle with

folded hands and watch the game in which the whole world is engaged and has been taking part. If the Government has been "popularised" let the people, first of all, live and then, and not till then, we can allow others to let live.

Babu AMULYA DHONE ADDY: I have much pleasure in supporting the resolution which has been ably moved by Raja Manmatha Nath Ray Choudhury and I am really sorry to find that this resolution has been opposed by our esteemed friend Babu Surendra Nath Ray. Our friend appears to be very jealous of the Association of which he is the worthy Treasurer and he has stated to us that last year 40 students had been sent up by the Association for the advancement of Scientific Training to foreign countries and this year 100 students are likely to be sent up. He proposes that there should be a number of industrial schools and colleges in India. I have not the slightest objection to that, on the contrary I am going to move a resolution that there should be industrial schools and colleges throughout Bengal. But in connection with this item, I would draw your attention to page 309 of the Report of the Indian Industrial Commission to the fact that in the case of Japan, notwithstanding the existence of a number of industrial schools and colleges, the Government of Japan send up a large number of students to America and other parts of the world for industrial education. As it appears from the report itself "With the provision for higher education that Japan has made in her own country yet she has continued to send a large number of students abroad. The Japanese Year Book for the year 1917, shows that there were 2,213 students staying abroad in foreign countries - the bulk of them in the United States of America." So it appears to us that notwithstanding the fact that there is a number of industrial schools and colleges in Japan the Government of Japan send up a very large number of students to America for industrial education. We all complain of the high prices of clothes and other necessaries of life. What is the reason? The reason is the want of industrial education. We are under the painful necessity of exporting a heavy quantity of cotton to foreign countries and depend on Manchester for the supply of our clothes. We export crores of rupees worth of hides and have to depend on America for leather. That is the reason why I suggest from time to time that we should have a number of commercial schools and colleges in Bengal. We cannot expect to do that unless we have a sufficient number of professors to teach these subjects and that is the reason why we should send a number of students to foreign countries for training in industrial subjects, so that they may come back and teach these subjects to the students of Bengal. It further appears from page 309 of the Report of the Industrial Commission that three years ago the Government of India instituted several scholarships, not exceeding 10 in number, to enable Indians to proceed to Europe and America for special training. So it appears

that the Government of India have already taken the necessary steps but I am afraid that this is not adequate. The Government of Bengal used to make a contribution of Rs 5,000 per annum to the said association; but I am sorry to find that, notwithstanding the fact that this association has been doing good work, the contribution has been withdrawn. The Government of India have recently increased the number of technical scholarships to 30 and have revised the rules regulating the grant of such scholarships, but I beg to submit that these scholarships are too few in number to meet the requirements of the situation

With these remarks, I beg to support this resolution

Babu NALINI NATH ROY: I beg to move that the question be now put.

The motion that the question be now put was put.

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of ACRICULTURE and INDUSTRIES (the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur): I was going to reply to this resolution The position is this that I was going to accept this resolution in a modified form and, unless it is put before the Council, I do not know how it can be decided by the Council

The PRESIDENT: The motion that the question be now put has already been put I am sorry I put it to the House before the Government Member had replied which is not what I generally do At the same time, I must say, that there is no absolute right on the part of the Government Members, when a closure is moved, to insist that they should be heard before the motion is put to vote They can speak at an early stage of the proceedings. Having put this motion already to the House, I am afraid, I cannot allow the Hon'ble Member to speak before the result is known

The motion that the question be now put was agreed to.

The resolution was then put and agreed to

Size, etc. of bullock and buffalo carts.

Dr. HASSAN SUHRAWARDY: "This Council recommends to the Government that the size of bullock and buffalo carts and the maximum load allowed to be carried on them be reduced"

In connection with resolution No. 40, I have already submitted my proposals for legislation for mitigating the hardships on dumb animals; and I do not propose to take up the time of the Council by repeating my arguments. I know that we have got a number of weigh-bridges in Calcutta, namely, the Howrah bridge at the junction of the Strand Road and Harrison Road and other places where bullocks and buffalo carts are weighed, and the utility of these weigh-bridges cannot be questioned; but it has its limitations. Those carts only that have

to pass over these bridges are brought to the weigh-bridge for purposes of weighment; but those that have not to pass over these bridges escape weighment and there are no means of ascertaining whether the maximum limit is exceeded in their cases. Then, again, some of the cartmen whose carts have to pass over the weigh-bridge can escape the vigilance of the Officers of the Society for the Prevention of Cruelty to Animals and they escape with impunity. The second point is that some of these cartmen escape the notice of the officers of the Society by some judicious action on their part, that is, giving some gratuity. Therefore, the weigh-bridge is not always a sure method of preventing over-loading. The establishment, maintenance and recurring expenses of weigh-bridges will also be large. Therefore, I put it to the House that by reducing the size of the bullock and buffalo carts we can prevent over-loading, as the capacity of these carts will hold a definite amount of load. Of course, I know, such things as pig-iron are very heavy, and in their case the carts can be overloaded, but the general merchandise takes a good deal of space and has a certain amount of weight; and the bigger the cart the more the liability there is for abuse, that is the reason why I have put forward this resolution.

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: I think that if I were to explain the matter, my friend would probably see his way to modify his resolution or eventually to withdraw it. I think I am in a position to offer a *modus vivendi*. In the first place, I desire to point out to my friend that his resolution, as worded at present, covers not only Calcutta but the whole of the rural area. My friend will recognise that the application of this principle to the rural areas is a matter of very great difficulty, and I do not think that the Government or the Council would be justified in accepting the resolution in regard to the rural areas, without consulting the authorities in those areas, without further investigation and inquiry. I think, therefore, that my friend should confine his resolution to Calcutta only. I understand that he is willing to do so. If the scope of the resolution be thus limited, I desire to send it to the Corporation for its opinion and then to await the result of its decision before taking any action in the matter. I need hardly say that I have the deepest sympathy with the object of this resolution, though I remember having heard one of my friends opposite remarking that the expression of sympathy on the part of the Government Members was sometimes suspicious. I hope there is no element of suspicion with regard to this matter as it is coupled with a practical step, viz., a reference to the Corporation. If my friend agrees to modify his resolution, I am prepared to adopt this course.

Dr. HASSAN SUHRAWARDY: In view of the assurance given by the Hon'ble the Minister, I beg leave to withdraw the resolution.

The resolution was then, by leave of the Council, withdrawn.

Calcutta Electric License.

Babu JATINDRA NATH BASU: "This Council recommends to the Government that the amendment applied for by the Calcutta Electric Supply Corporation, Limited, in the Calcutta Electric Lighting License of 1907, for altering the periods after which the option of purchase can be exercised from 10 years to 20 years be not allowed."

The Calcutta Electric system is run by the Calcutta Electric Supply Corporation which is a joint stock concern having its head office in London. It has not got a local board of directors and no local body to control its working. It carries on its work under a license granted to it by the Government under the Electricity Act. Under that Act, the Government is authorised to grant licenses to local authorities and to other persons to supply electrical energy and to lay down pipe lines within specified areas under the conditions laid down in the license. In pursuance of the authority given to Government, it granted a license to the Calcutta Electric Supply Corporation in 1907. In that license it was provided that it should end in 1918, and if the option of purchasing was not then exercised the period would be extended by another 10 years.

The Electric Supply Corporation now wants that instead of the period of 10 years, they should be granted an extension for 20 years, that is to say, that the extension should commence from 1918 and end in 1938, after which, if the option of purchase is not exercised, the period should be extended to another 20 years and so on.

Sir, there is a strong public feeling in Calcutta and its neighbourhood that the public are not served by the Electric Supply Corporation in the way they should be served. The convenience of the public is not properly attended to. The board of directors is in London and cannot be approached and there is no authority in Calcutta who can deal with complaints from the public. The ground upon which the Electric Supply Corporation has asked for an extension of the periods of option is that they want to lay out more capital by raising money on debentures in order to extend and improve their system so that they may be in a position to lower their rates. But it should be remembered that when they obtained their license in 1907, they agreed that the period during which they should work should be up to 1918 only. They had then a large amount of capital to lay out and yet they agreed that the period should not extend beyond 1918. Sir, in this respect, I submit, they have got no grievance. As regards capital expenditure there is a provision in the Act under which, if the option of purchase is exercised, they get the full value of their money. The present period does not terminate till 1928, and the option of purchase can be intimated to them two years before that. So there is a long time still for the termination of the present license and there is no reason why the license should be revised now.

The PRESIDENT: Gentlemen, before I call upon the other members to speak on the resolution, I think it right to point out that if the debate is not finished to-day the motion will lapse.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: I beg to support this motion and, in doing so, I may point out to the House that the whole question was referred to the Calcutta Corporation for their consideration and the amount of literature on this subject is, as will be seen—I hold the volume in my hand—rather bulky. The Corporation gave its best consideration to the question and came to the decision that this extension should not be given. Indeed, there is no reason why this indulgence should be shown to the Calcutta Electric Supply Corporation. The reason that they gave is that it would be beneficial to the consumers. But I think that this apparent sympathy for the consumers should not be taken at its face value. Last year the Corporation paid a dividend of 20 per cent. and yet they put a 15 per cent. surcharge tax upon the consumers, on the ground that the price of coal has gone up, and it is this Company who now want an extension for the benefit of the consumers! Nothing could be more absurd or ridiculous and, therefore, we are bound to oppose it. Then reserve capital amounts to about £5,60,000, and yet they say that they cannot raise money unless the period is extended. There is no reason why this indulgence should be given to this Company. The question should also be considered from various other points of view, but there is no time for it now. If we give an extension to this Company, we may never be able to buy up the concern in future or to introduce a healthy system of rivalry with some other company, and they will go on putting surcharge and other additional taxes. It is practically a monopoly company. Regard being had to all this, we must be careful about granting them the extension asked for. We do not know what may happen within the next 10 or 15 years. It is quite possible that an Indian company might be formed within that time. Then why should we, by our conduct at the present moment, make it impossible for an Indian concern to take up the contract in future? For these reasons I support the resolution. It is an important matter. The Coporation gave its best consideration to this question and, they are also opposed to an extension. I do not think there would be any hesitation on the part of the House to accept the resolution.

Rai Dr. HARIDHAN DUTT Bahadur: I rise to give my whole-hearted support to this resolution. Only yesterday, the Corporation passed a similar resolution and it was carried with the consent of the whole House without any opposition. As a citizen of Calcutta, I have enjoyed the benefits of the electric power. Electricity is no longer a matter of luxury but of necessity, and I think in the interests of the people of Calcutta, this question should be very carefully considered. My friend

has already pointed out that the existing contract will not expire before 1928, and the citizens of Calcutta are reluctant to grant a renewal of the license of the Electric Supply Corporation They are anxiously expecting for a lowering of the rate. It was lowered once, but, as Babu Surendra Nath Mullick pointed out, a surcharge of 15 per cent. was put on the consumers. This company has been earning a very good dividend year after year, and I cannot understand why such a prosperous Company should put a surcharge tax upon the consumers. It is not a Company which deserves indulgence It has been said that they cannot borrow money unless the time is extended from ten to twenty years. Whether it is possible or not I cannot say as I am not a financier. But whatever that may be, the prevailing opinion is that the Corporation of Calcutta should try to seek out a rival company. Perhaps it may not be possible but that is the opinion It has been suggested that Calcutta might be divided into two parts to be served by two rival companies. It has also been suggested that lines may be laid near important streets so that the municipality may take up the work All this should be very carefully considered. With these words, I support the resolution.

Adjournment.

The usual time for adjournment having been reached, the Council was adjourned to the next day at 3 P. M., without question being put.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Council assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act.

THE Council met in the Council Chamber in the Town Hall, Calcutta, on Friday, the 15th July, 1921, at 3 P.M.

Present:

The Hon'ble the President, the Hon'ble the four Members of the Executive Council, the Hon'ble the three Ministers, and 91 nominated and elected members.

Unstarred Questions

(answers to which were laid on the table).

Alleged expenditure by the District Board of Jessore by distributing medals to school-boys in celebration of the Allies' victory.

246. Babu NALINI NATH ROY: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the District Board of Jessore has spent an amount of Rs. 6,000 in purchasing medals for distribution among the school students of the district in order to signalise the victory of the Allies in the last war?

(*b*) If the answer is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state—

(*i*) whether previous sanction of the members of the Board was obtained for the purpose, or whether it was done on the initiative of the Chairman himself;

(*ii*) the names of the schools which received such medals and the number of medals in the case of each school; and

(*iii*) whether it is not a fact that the said Board has been recently granted a certain sum of money as a loan by the Government?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea): (*a*) At the suggestion of the Government of India commemorative medals were presented to pupils of educational institutions to celebrate the conclusion of peace. The District Board of Jessore indented for 45,000 medals at a cost of Rs. 4,524.

(*b*) (*i*) The Chairman of the District Board reports that as the indent had to be submitted urgently there was no time beforehand to consult the members of the Board to a meeting.

(*ii*) It is reported that the medals were distributed to the students of both boys and girls' primary schools and *muktabs* in the District Board area through the sub-inspectors of schools. Details have not been supplied.

(*iii*) The Board has recently received a loan from Government for the Arul *bil* drainage scheme.

Number of serious and petty cases tried by Calcutta Police Courts.

*247. **Rai Dr. HARIDHAN DUTT Bahadur:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to lay on the table—

(*i*) a statement showing, year by year, the total number of "serious" cases sent up for trial by each thana in the town of Calcutta, between 1917 and 1920; and

(*ii*) a statement showing, year by year, the total number of "petty" cases sent up for trial by each outpost, in the town of Calcutta between 1917 and 1920?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department also be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing, year by year, the total number of—

(*i*) "serious" cases,

(*ii*) "petty" cases,

disposed of in the Bankshall Street and Jorabagan Police Courts, in Calcutta, between 1914 and 1920?

MEMBER in charge of POLICE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (*a*) and (*b*) Statements are laid on the table.

Statement No. I showing, year by year, the total number of "Serious" cases sent up for trial by each thana in the town of Calcutta between 1917 and 1920, referred to in the reply to unstarred questions Nos. 247 (a) and (b).

Sectional letter.	Name of Section			Number of "serious" cases in—			
				1917.	1918.	1919.	1920.
A	Shampukur	...	...	78	147	150	156
B	Jorabagan	...	...	149	125	153	231
C	Burtalla	...	...	79	109	135	143
D	Burrabazar	...	...	266	300	463	474

Sectional letter.	Name of Section.	Number of "serious" cases sent up in—			
		1917.	1918.	1919.	1920.
E	Jorasanko	119	225	250	293
F	Sukea Street	153	188	235	281
G	Hare Street	195	204	333	311
H	Bowbazar	197	167	232	292
I	Muchipara	176	179	282	288
J	Taltalla	237	227	258	279
K	Park Street	308	361	455	555
L	Hastings	67	62	68	85
	1st Division, Port Police ...	40	41	38	66
	2nd Ditto	104	114	119	190
	3rd Ditto	96	88	154	193
	GRAND TOTAL ...	2,264	2,537	3,325	3,827

Statement No. 2, showing, year by year, the total number of "Petty" cases sent up for trial by each outpost in the Town of Calcutta between 1917 and 1920 referred to in the reply to unstarred questions Nos. 247 (a) and (b).

Section		Sub-section		Number of petty cases sent up in—				Remarks.
Letter	Name	Figure	Name	1917.	1918.	1919.	1920.	
A	Shampukur	I	Baghazar ...		3,918	5,756	6,259	In 1917 there was no outpost
		II	Kumartuli ...	6,517	2,611	1,967	2,782	
			Total	6,517	6,529	7,723	7,041	
B	Jorabagan	III	Kumartuli ...	5,446	3,034	3,637	3,887	
		IV	Pathuriaghata	5,429	4,892	4,697	3,690	
			Total ...	10,875	7,926	8,334	7,577	
C	Burtalla ...	V	.....	2,121	815	1,848	1,863	There is no outpost in this section.
		VI	... ...	...	..	...	...	
			Total ..	2,121	815	1,848	1,863	
D	Burrabazar ..	VII	Rambagan	...	1,614	2,439	3,863	Rambagan outpost was not in existence in 1917, all cases were reported at Colootola outpost.
		VIII	Colootola ...	8,898	7,480	6,780	4,176	
			Total ...	8,898	9,094	9,219	7,758	

SECTION.		SUB-SECTION.		NUMBER OF PETTY CASES SENT UP IN—				REMARKS.
Letter.	Name.	Figure.	Name.	1917	1918	1919	1920	
...	Jorasanko ...	IX	Rambagan ...	1,574	1,530	1,878	1,744	
		X	Colootola ...	3,760	2,627	1,683	1,998	
			Total ...	5,334	4,157	3,561	3,742	
...	Sukea Street	XI	Upper Circular Road.	1,818	1,152	1,127	1,494	
		XII	(Thana)	2,101	1,249	1,226	1,611	
			Total	3,[illegible]	[illegible]401	2,763	[illegible]	
...	Hare Street	XIII	Pollock Street	4,493	3,126	2,458	[illegible]	
		XIV	Waterloo Street	2,758	1,85[illegible]	3,15[illegible]	4,116	
			Total	[illegible]	4,8[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	
	[illegible]	XV	Princep Lane	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	
		XVI	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	1,4[illegible]	[illegible]	
			Total	[illegible]	4,[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	
	M[illegible]	XVII	[illegible]	2,64[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	
		XVIII	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	
			Total	4,[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	4,[illegible]	
	[illegible]	XIX	[illegible] Street	4,49[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	
		XX	Talta [illegible] Street	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	
			Total	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	
...	[illegible] Street	XXI	[illegible] Road	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	
		XXII	Hungerford Street	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	
			Total	[illegible]	1,[illegible]13	[illegible]	[illegible]	
...	Hastings	XXIII						
		XXIV		[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]
			Total	3,[illegible]24	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	
	1st Division, Port Police.	...	1st Division, Port Police	3,149	883	971	1,4[illegible]	[illegible]
	2nd Division, Port Police	...	2nd Division, Port Police	[illegible]	3,00[illegible]	[illegible]	2,43[illegible]	[illegible]
	3rd Division, Port Police	...	3rd Division, Port Police	4[illegible]	943	[illegible]	381	
			Dock Police	43[illegible]	417	[illegible]	[illegible]	
			GRAND TOTAL	72,334	[illegible]	[illegible]	[illegible]	

Statement No. 3 showing, year by year, the total number of serious cases and petty cases disposed of in the Police Courts in Calcutta between 1914 and 1920, referred to in the reply to unstarred questions Nos. 247(a) and (b).

Serious cases.

Year.	Central Court (Bankshall Street).	Northern Division Jorabagan Court.	Southern Division Kyd Street Court.	Total.
1914	4,913	2,151	2,288	9,352
1915	4,417	2,065	5,301	11,783
1916	4,556	3,876	.....	8,432
1917	4,831	6,512	.....	11,343
1918	3,651	5,630	.....	9,281
1919	5,464	5,938	.....	11,402
1920	4,167	3,663	.....	7,830

Petty cases.

1914	21,000	24,000	25,000	70,000
1915	15,000	25,000	24,000	64,000
1916	40,000	26,000	.....	66,000
1917	41,000	32,000	.....	73,000
1918	35,000	26,000	.....	61,000
1919	49,000	31,000	.....	80,000
1920	50,000	33,000	.....	83,000

NOTE.—The petty cases are given approximately in round numbers.

Mileage of railway, navigable rivers and roads in districts of Bengal.

248. Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works be pleased to state—

(*1*) the mileage of railway in each district of Bengal?

(*2*) the area of each district;

(*3*) the names of districts which have rivers navigable throughout the year;

(*4*) the names of districts which have no such rivers;

(*5*) the mileage of roads maintained in each district by the Public Works Department;

(*6*) the mileage of metalled roads in each district;

(*7*) the mileage of unmetalled roads in each district under district boards and local boards;

(*8*) the income of each district board;

(*9*) the amount spent on repairs of roads by each district board;

(*10*) the average expenditure per mile on repairs and maintenance of *kutcha* roads in every district;

(*11*) the average expenditure per mile on *pucca* roads in every district; and

(*12*) the volume of trade borne by river, rail, and road in each district?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of PUBLIC WORKS (the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur): (*1*) and (*2*) A statement is laid on the table.

(*3*) and (*4*) Detailed information regarding the capacity for navigation in all the channels of each district is not maintained by the Government. It is, however, known that, excepting Darjeeling, all districts in Bengal possess channels navigable to a greater or less degree.

(*5*), (*6*), (*7*), (*8*) and (*9*) The statement referred to above furnishes the required information.

(*10*) and (*11*) Government have no information. It may be obtained by direct communication with the authorities concerned.

(*12*) There are no statistics regarding the interdistrict trade of Bengal except those of the Calcutta trade block. A statement showing the principal staples imported into, and exported from, Calcutta, for the year 1920-21, is laid on the library table.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred questions Nos. 248 (1) and (2).

Name of District.	Area of each district.	Mileage of Railways: E I R	E B R	B N R	A B R	E I, P, K, B, D, A K and K F Rys.	K D R and its extensions.	D H R and its extensions.	H A, H S and H B Lt. Rys.	B P R and its extensions.	Total.	Mileage of roads maintained by Public Works Department, metalled and unmetalled.	Mileage of metalled roads in each District (including District Board and Local Board roads).*	Mileage of unmetalled roads in each district under District Boards and Local Boards.	Income of each District Board (excluding opening balance) during 1919-20.	Amount spent by each District Board on repairs to communications (1919-20). (a).
	Sq. miles.														Rs.	Rs.
Burdwan	2,691	243		45·164		41·41				4·31	325·468	117·00	447·00	1,263·50	7,76,036	2,92,109
Birbhum	1,753	161				17·9					178·900		232·00	613·00	2,86,726	65,696
Bankura	2,621			45·413		46·4					92·213	58·37	308·37	676·00	3,72,809	32,210
Midnapore	5,186			167·397							167·397	112·75	542·25	1,149·50	6,62,844	2,24,792
Hooghly	1,188	112	..						27·25	36·27	174·520	45·80	136·44	1,214·63	3,17,649	1,09,893
Howrah	510	8	...	38·600					26·37		72·970	25·26	79·50	724·98	2,17,061	83,854
24-Parganas { Proper	4,844	7	181·07			26·4			12·24		212·65	4·06	313·06	1,996·66	6,38,462	1,97,769
24-Parganas { Calcutta	32											14·00	14·00	...	...	...
Nadia	2,790	4	204·39				...				209·29		112·62	1,605·70	3,06,398	89,184
Murshidabad	2,141	122	50·00								172·00	...	62·50	1,489·10	2,87,076	86,018
Jessore	2,925		69·90			[illegible]					106·65	...	172·52	1,744·08	3,70,282	72,814
Khulna	4,767		33·34								33·36		96·00	2,214·00	3,96,719	1,14,695
Dacca	2,738		57·72		41						93·22	31·25	29·85	739·70	5,75,065	96,676
Mymensingh	6,249		109·38		101						210·39		71·00	3,037·70	8,51,043	1,80,331
Faridpur	2,607		46·83								46·83		23·00	626·40	3,86,867	1,09,377
Bakarganj	4,890							...					24·90	1,166·40	6,22,737	1,29,224

Chittagong ...	2,492		·4			45·?0	45·26	14·62	1,232·37	4,00,861	1,06,099
Noakhali ...	1,894		·75			38·00	13·90	5·55	793·00	4,56,767	1,00,483
Tippera ...	2,512	..	·139			139·?0	61·43	18·67	887·00	3,79,483	86,369
Chittagong Hill Tracts	[illegible]					..	181·30	0·80	..	...	...
Rajshahi ...	2,61?	58·35				58·35	..	57·30	1,246·70	4,9?,?78	77,781
Dinajpur ...	3,946	90·94		..		90·94	14·83	38·50	1,399·87	3,85,008	73,091
Jalpaiguri ...	2,?19	78·83		115·89		194·72	153·30	137·17	698·50	3,67,921	74,077
Rangpur ...	3,479	170·19		36·55		206·74	..	20·00	2,967·00	6,21,940	1,12,863
Bogra	1,359	82·00		..		82·00	1·46	14·07	857·50	2,30,055	82,419
Pabna	1,8??	59·83				59·83	..	31·00	903·50	?,71,283	39,889
Malda ...	[illegible]	...	76·27			76·27		33·60	592·36	2,06,232	49,749
Darjeeling ...	1,164	...			107·41	107·41	354·33	202·75	401·25*	...	...
Sikkim ...	..	..			...		187·00	31·00		..	...
Cooch Behar (Native State) ...	[illegible]	[illegible]		2·76		21·4?		..	...	..	..
Hill Tippera ...	[illegible]				...	..	..				...

(a) No figure available showing amount spent on roads alone.
* Under District Road Committee.

Babu TANKANATH CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Public Works be pleased to state whether Government are willing to help such District Boards as cannot properly maintain their roads for want of funds?

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: I should require a fresh notice because unless I see the papers I am not in a position to reply just now.

Additional staff to meet increased work under Reforms.

249. Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to state whether the ministerial staff of the Secretariat has been increased on account of the extra work involved by the enlarged Reformed Council, the appointments of Ministers, and additional members and officers?

(*b*) Have Government taken into consideration the fact that the recent numerous resolutions and questions in the Council have abnormally increased the work of the ministerial officers of the Secretariat?

MEMBER in charge of APPOINTMENT DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (*a*) Yes; the increase is as follows:—

Revenue Department.—One post Upper Division; two posts Lower Division; one typist.

Finance and Commerce Department.—Six stenographers. [These are not employed in the Finance Department solely, but are under that Department administratively.]

Legislative Department.—Two typists.

(*b*) Government are aware that the number of resolutions and questions in the Council affects considerably the work of all those who have to deal with them.

Supplementary Grants.

The PRESIDENT (the Hon'ble Nawab Sir Syed Shams-ul-Huda): Gentlemen, I ought to tell the Council that I have received the following telegram from His Excellency:

"15th and 18th have been allotted for Government business and the Council may be prorogued at any time on the conclusion of Government business to be transacted."

So there will be no more non-official business and all the motions standing on the list fall through and fresh notice will have to be given for the next session.

5.—Land Revenue.

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of REVENUE (LAND REVENUE) (the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan) moved "that a sum of Rs. 12,200 be granted for expenditure under the head '5.—Land Revenue' on account of the following items:—

(*i*) Revision of pay of the establishment under Land Acquisition Collectors, Calcutta, Rs. 3,100;

(*ii*) Additional contingent grant for the office of the Land Acquisition Collectors, Calcutta, Rs. 1,750;

(*iii*) Additional clerks for the Dacca Collectorate, Rs. 3,185.

(*iv*) Additional clerks for the Faridpur Collectorate, Rs. 4,165."

The first item was included by the Land Acquisition Collector in his budget estimates but was omitted by the Accountant-General as a case of pure omission. The amount has been provided, as already we have to pay *ad-interim* allowance to some staff there, and it has become necessary to revise the pay of the establishment under the Land Acquisition Collector. I may point out that of these Rs. 3,100 and Rs. 1,750 only a part of the cost is really borne by Government because the greater portion is paid by the Improvement Trust and the cost is apportioned at the end of the year. In the last two years the portion of the Calcutta Improvement Trust's share has been 65·5 and 67 per cent. and therefore it will be seen that the amount is a very small one and as we have to give *ad-interim* allowance it is proposed to revise the establishment.

Turning to the question of the Dacca Collectorate additional clerks, the Collector of Dacca submitted proposals for increasing the staff of the district office by 14 clerks and in the three subdivisions by 6 clerks. The Commissioner examined the proposals and found that they were in order and forwarded them to Government. They have been scrutinised both by the Revenue and Finance Departments with the result that the necessity of appointing 13 additional clerks has been admitted. The proposals were received too late for their inclusion in the Budget this year, but as the staff is urgently required, the Council are asked to vote the sum required for employing the additional clerks from 1st August till the end of the year. I may say, in this connection, that as it is likely that the increment of pay of clerks generally will be brought up hereafter, I propose, if the money is voted, to take the advice of the Standing Committee before communicating sanction to the employment of the staff to the Commissioner.

As regards the amount which we require for the Faridpur staff, the position is this. So far back as August, 1920, Mr. J. N. Roy, the District Officer of Faridpur, asked for 23 additional clerks. The letter in which he made this request has received the attention of Government. In this letter he has dealt with the district office and the three subdivisional offices of Madaripur, Goalundo and Gopalganj. He has described the work done

by the present staff in each department of the District office, the Collectorate English office, the Vernacular Department, Accounts Department, Treasury, Tauzi, Collectorate Record-room, Nazarat, Income-Tax, Forms, Magistrate's English Office and Vernacular office. Similarly, he has discussed the needs of the three subdivisional offices. He has shown that there has been a large increase in the work, and has based his demands on a comparison with the standards laid down by the Ministerial Officers' Salaries Committee in 1908-09, which are the standards accepted by Government. The Collector's proposal were examined by the Commissioner and being approved by him were forwarded to Government. They were examined by the Revenue Department in detail, with the result that the necessity of appointing 17 additional clerks had to be admitted. The case was then sent to the Finance Department which agreed that the additional staff was required. The examination of the case in the Revenue and Finance Departments took several months and consequently we were not able to make any provision in the Budget when it was presented in March last. As the present staff is overworked and relief is urgently required, the Council are now requested to grant the money required for the additional clerks from August to the end of the year.

Here again, of course, I would say that having regard to whatever decision is come to by the Ministerial Officers' Salaries Committee, I propose, before giving effect to it, to have it further examined by the Standing Committee of the Revenue Department, if the grant is made by this Council.

The PRESIDENT: Before I pass on to the next item I ought to tell the Council that His Excellency the Governor has allotted only one day for all items from Nos. 1 to 77 and these must be finished in the course of the day. If they are not, then I must put them to the vote without further debate in accordance with the rules.

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA moved "that the demand for the revision of pay of the establishment under Land Acquisition Collectors, Calcutta, be reduced by Rs. 1,500."

I submit that before full effect is given to the recommendations embodied in the Report of the Salaries Committee no revision of pay of establishment should be made piecemeal. My second point is that it has not been made out why such a large amount as Rs. 3,100 should be required for additional payment by way of revision of pay. So far as I understand it is only some sort of *ad-interim* allowance that is being paid to ministerial officers, pending final adjustment and revision of pay. That being so, I beg to submit that there is no necessity for making an allotment, especially in a supplementary budget. On these grounds I am of opinion that the demand should not have been made.

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: I have already explained that this amount is necessary to revise the pay of the establishment of the Land Acquisition Collectors'

office. I may point out to Annada Babu that the Ministerial Officers' Salaries Committee did not discuss the Land Acquisition Collectors' staff as it is temporary, and, as I have said, the major portion of this amount at the end of the year is met from contributions by the Calcutta Improvement Trust. Under these circumstances, whether the Council wish to reduce this small amount or wish that the *ad-interim* allowance which is now being given to this establishment should continue is a matter for them to decide. I have already mentioned the facts of the case and I leave it to the good sense of the Council. I may say that the Improvement Trust has agreed to bear their portion of the cost.

The motion was then put and lost.

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA moved "that the additional contingent demand for the office of the Land Acquisition Collectors, Calcutta, be reduced by Rs 1,000."

All the arguments which I put forward in support of the first motion apply with greater force to this amendment. There are additional grounds, namely, that there is no question of revision of pay. It is a question of payment of contingent grant. Under this generic term of contingent grant many small items come in, and it does not appear from the speech of the Hon'ble Member in charge why all on a sudden in the middle of the year there should be a necessity of paying a big amount close upon Rs. 2,000 by way of contingent grant to the Land Acquisition Collectors' Department. In any case this amount, representing as I take it only 33 per cent., which is the share of Government, really represents a big amount for contingencies and all those things. On these grounds I press on the Council that this should be reduced.

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: The position regarding the contingent charges is this: that over Rs. 6,000 was demanded by the Land Acquisition Department and the Accountant-General reduced it to about Rs 4,000. In our Department we have given Rs 1,750, which, as it is, will not suffice; but in view of the present financial position that was the minimum amount that we could put down. If that amount is to be further reduced we might not give anything at all.

The motion was then put and lost.

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: As I find that my friend Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri has got a similar amendment, I should like to withdraw my next motion.

The motion was, by leave of the Council, withdrawn.

It was as follows:—

"That the demand for additional clerks of the Dacca Collectorate be reduced by Rs. 2,000."

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI moved "that the demand for additional clerks of the Dacca Collectorate be reduced by half."

The difficulty we felt in giving notice of this amendment was that we were not supplied with papers. We now hear that the matter was not brought before the Standing Committee, and it is to be considered whether before consulting the Standing Committee, it should be passed by this Council. If there be any necessity, and if that necessity meets with the approval of the Standing Committee, then we can pass it. As that has not been done, I think we should reduce the amount demanded by half, and it should be considered sufficient for the present.

Babu NITYA DHON MUKHERJEE: We have gone through the list of amendments, made by various members. One thing that strikes a superficial observer who does not like to enter into details is that Babu Annada Charan Dutta has not left any room for either the Hon'ble Members or the Hon'ble Ministers to be sorry, because it will be found that he has opposed all motions for demands that have been made either by the Hon'ble Members or Ministers. After some discussions over these questions he has now begun to withdraw them. Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri, who has already spoken on two questions, admits that he does not possess all facts and figures that are necessary for the discussion on these subjects, but still he opposes the demands. This practice of general opposition of demands and subsequent withdrawal has commenced since the beginning of this Council We do not know, however, who is to blame.

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: The objection that has been raised so far is that this matter was not put before the Standing Committee. Regarding that I want to make it quite clear that the principle which governs Standing Committees is really this First of all it must be borne in mind that the Standing Committee's recommendations can only be advisory. Secondly, the principle of having Standing Committees is really not merely to take their advice in matters relating to expenditure. Of course, if there are large items involving considerable expenditure, the Member in charge would do well to consult them. I did not think it necessary at the time when this was brought up that the matter should be considered by the Standing Committee for the reason, which I have already explained, that I thought that if the grant was sanctioned by the Council, I would bring the matter before the Standing Committee when the question of granting increment of salaries to other Departments was considered by this Council, and until that time I intended to hold it over, and if the Standing Committee agreed, and in view of whatever attitude this Council took as regards the increment of salaries of Government officers in general, I should then take action. For these reasons, I did not think the matter to be of such importance as to be brought before the Standing Committee.

The motion was then put and lost.

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: In view of the decision of the Council on amendment No. 5, I do not think I can press amendment No. 6.

The motion was then withdrawn.

It was as follows:—

"That the demand for additional clerks of the Dacca Collectorate be refused."

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA moved "that the demand for additional clerks for the Dacca Collectorate be refused."

I have got only one thing to say after what has fallen from the Hon'ble Member, about the Standing Committee. If this matter had been referred to the Standing Committee, I am sure the Hon'ble Member's case would have been much stronger and we would have almost nothing to say against it. Five months of the year will have already gone by without this additional staff and I would suggest that in view of the great deficit in this year's budget, the district authorities might try to manage the rest of the year without the staff. Next year, he may come up again, when the matter may be considered.

In view of this, I hope the Council will refuse the grant.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY moved "that the demand for additional clerks for the Dacca Collectorate be refused."

I oppose this demand on principle. I think we should grant supplementary demands only in case of absolute necessity. In this case, Sir, we have already granted Rs. 2,00,000 for temporary establishments. If any additional establishment is required during the year, it ought to be provided from the grant for temporary establishments. I thought that it included these additional demands. If it is absolutely necessary to appoint additional clerks, they should, I think, be provided out of this grant of Rs. 2,00,000.

Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur: I beg to oppose the amendments moved by my hon'ble friends and the Kumar Sahib of Rajshahi. I am sorry to find them very keen in refusing the grant of Rs. 3,185 for an additional staff of clerks for the Dacca Collectorate, notwithstanding the urgent need of such a staff which the Hon'ble the Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan has just explained in detail. My friends should understand that unless the staff is efficient, it is sure the work will suffer. I can speak from personal knowledge that the work has considerably increased since the East Bengal Ministerial Officers' Salaries Committee fixed the establishment more than a decade ago (1907). We should not contest this. The Revenue Department have carefully examined the proposal of the Collector of Dacca approved by the Commissioner.

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: I have nothing further to add. I explained when I asked for this money why it was necessary. I have said that it has been examined by the Commissioner, by the Revenue and the Finance Departments. We have only sanctioned what we have thought necessary. It is not a temporary staff, it is a permanent staff. The staff is urgently necessary and it has been delayed considerably. The question is whether we are going to allow the work in the Collectorate to suffer. It is a matter for the good administration of the Collector's offices and as such I hope it will be granted by the Council.

The amendment was then put and a division was taken with the following result:—

AYES.

Barma, Rai Sahib Panchanan.
Chaudhuri, Babu Kishori Mohan
Chaudhuri, Babu Tankanath.
Chaudhuri, Rai Harendranath.
Das Gupta, Babu Nibaran Chandra.
Dutt, Rai Bahadur Dr. Haridhan.
Dutta, Babu Annada Charan.
Dutta, Babu Indu Bhushan.
Huq, Maulvi Ekramul.
Makramali, Munshi.
Mitra, Rai Bahadur Mahendra Chandra.
Mukhopadhaya, Babu Sarat Chandra.
Nasker, Babu Hem Chandra.
Pal, Rai Bahadur Radha Charan.
Raikat, Mr. Prasanna Deb.
Ray, Babu Surendra Nath.
Ray, Kumar Shib Shekhareswar.
Ray Choudhury, Raja Manmatha Nath.
Roy, Raja Manilall Singh.
Roy Chaudhuri, Babu Sailaja Nath.

NOES.

Afzal, Nawabzada K. M. Khan Bahadur.
Ahmed, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Wasimuddin.
Ahmad, Maulvi Azaharuddin.
Ahmed, Maulvi Rafi Uddin.
Ahmed, Maulvi Yakuinuddin.
Ahmed, Munshi Jafar.
Ali, Mr. Syad Nasim.
Ali, Munshi Ayub.
Arhamuddin, Maulvi Khandakar.
Azam, Khan Bahadur Khwaja Mahamed.
Banarjea, the Hon'ble Sir Surandra Nath.
Barton, Mr. H.
Baudet, Mr. C. F.
Birley, Mr L.
Bompas, Mr. C H.
Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Hafizar Rahman.
Chaudhuri, the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali, Khan Bahadur.
Das, Babu Shishmadev.
Das, Mr. S. R.
Das, Rai Bahadur Amar Nath.
Dey, Mr. C. C.
Donald, Mr. J.
Ghose, Rai Bahadur Jogendra Chunder.
Gordon, Mr. A. D.
Gupta, Mr. N. B.
Haq, Maulvi A. K. Fazl-ul.
Hopkyns, Mr. W. S.
Hussain, Maulvi Mahammed Madassur.
Karim, Maulvi Abdul.
Karim, Maulvi Fazlel.
Kerr, the Hon'ble Mr. J. H.
Khan, Babu Devendra Lal.
Khan, Maulvi Hamid-ud-din.
Khan, Maulvi Md. Rafique Uddin.
Lang, Mr. J.
Lees, Mr. D. H.
Maharajadhiraja Bahadur af Burdwan, the Hon'ble.
Makramali, Munshi.
Marr, Mr. A.
Mitter, the Hon'ble Mr. P. C.
Moitra, Dr. Jatindra Nath.
Mukherjee, Babu Nitya Dhon.
O'Kinealy Lt.-Col. Frederick.
Payne, Mr. C. F.
Rahim, the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-.
Roy, Babu Jogendra Nath.
Ray, Babu Nalini Nath.
Ray, Rai Bahadur Lalit Mohan Singh.
Stark, Mr. N. A.
Wheeler, the Hon'ble Sir Henry.
Wordsworth, Mr. W. C.

The Ayes being 20, and the Noes 51, the motion was lost.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: Sir, my amendment is covered by amendments Nos. 10 and 11. In that case would it not be convenient to have the two other amendments moved first?

The PRESIDENT: No, it cannot be allowed, but you may withdraw your motion if you like.

The motion No. 9 which stood in the name of Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri was then, by leave withdrawn. It was as follows:—"That the demand for additional clerks for the Faridpur Collectorate be reduced by half."

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA moved "that the demand for additional clerks for the Faridpur Collectorate be refused."

I beg to oppose this grant on the same ground on which I opposed the previous grant, viz., that this item was not placed before the Standing Committee. I do not see any use of having a Standing Committee, if supplementary estimates like this, are not placed before it. This staff will form part of the permanent staff and yet the matter was not placed before the Standing Committee and their opinion was not taken. Sir, we have been able to do without this staff for the last four months and I think that we can do without them for the next eight months. Next year, if the question is brought before the Council for a permanent addition to the staff, we shall be glad to consider the question. In view of all this, I oppose that grant.

The PRESIDENT: Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray's motion is identical so he may now speak on this motion.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: I only beg to support this amendment.

Dr. JATINDRA NATH MOITRA: I beg to oppose the amendment. I have personal knowledge of the facts. The clerks in the Faridpur Collectorate are overworked and the provision for additional hands will not only give them some relief, but will also enable them to work with more efficiency. With these words, I beg to oppose this motion.

The Hon'ble the MAHARAJADHIRAJA BAHADUR of BURDWAN: Sir, my great offence seems to have been that I did not consult the Standing Committee. I have already explained my position regarding that. I may point out that in asking for this additional grant we are not really adding to the permanent establishment at the recommendation of the Collector. We are doing it on a principle accepted by the Government itself. It is laid down that a clerk can do a certain amount of work—it is so laid down by the Salaries Committee of 1908 and 1909—and it is on the basis of that which was accepted by the Government that these additional clerks have been asked for. For these reasons and also for the reasons as mentioned by Dr. Moitra who knows the conditions intimately that we have asked for these additional clerks—both for the sake of efficien and for the better working of the Collectorate. I ask, Sir, that the amount be granted.

The motion was put and lost.

The original motion for the grant was then put and agreed to.

22.—General Administration.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER moved "that a sum of Rs. 8,000 be granted for expenditure under the head '22.—General Administration' on account of the following item: 'Repairs of the S. L. *Stella*, Rs. 8,000.'"

The Council may remember that in connection with the budget we voted a sum of Rs. 25,000 for a new boiler for this boat. Unfortunately on the 13th of March last this launch had a collision in the river. It was damaged and it cost Rs. 7,250 to repair it. The expenditure was obviously urgent, and the money was taken from the Rs. 25,000 that had been voted for the new boiler which, of course, is as necessary now as it was then, and in fact on the latest figures we learn that the boiler will cost Rs. 750 more than what we previously estimated. These two items make up the sum for which I now ask for the vote of the Council.

The motion was put and agreed to.

MEMBER in charge of LEGISLATIVE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): Sir, before I move my motion, with your permission, I would substitute in it the figure Rs. 10,900 for the figure Rs. 15,400.

The PRESIDENT: Yes, you may do so.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: moved "that a sum of Rs 10,900 be transferred from 'non-voted' to 'voted' under the head '22.- General Administration Legislative Council' to provide for the pay and acting allowance of the officiating Secretary, Legislative Department."

This is rather a matter of transfer than of new expenditure. Mr. Tindall, who is the permanent Secretary of the Council, and whose pay, he being a member of the Indian Civil Service, appears under the non-voted head, has been on deputation to Simla, where he is at present, for training in the Legislative Department -an excellent system by which the Imperial Legislative Department takes officers from different provinces and gives them the wider experience that can be gained there. In Mr. Tindall's absence, Mr. Hutchison is acting for him, and provision has to be made for his pay and acting allowance which come under the voted head. The original sum was calculated up to the end of the year, but I fully anticipate, and the intention is, that Mr. Tindall will return in the beginning of the cold weather, and even allowing a slight margin for delay there is no need to make provision for the last three months of the year. Consequently the sum asked for is slightly less than that put down on the agenda paper.

The motion was then put and agreed to.

24.—Administration of Justice.

MEMBER in charge of JUDICIAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur Rahim) moved "that a sum of Rs. 35,630 be granted for expenditure under the head '24—Administration of Justice,' on account of the following items:—

Additional grant for boat-hire required by the District Judge of Tippera, Rs. 4,555.

Revision of pay of the 3rd and 4th Presidency Magistrates, Rs. 2,675.

Establishment of a special Court for the trial of traffic cases, Rs. 22,400.

Appointment of an additional Magistrate to try munitions cases, Rs. 6,000."

As regards the first item, Sir, the facts are that this year the District Judge has been unable to obtain boats for the same monthly hire as last year and on that account he has got to pay something more in addition this year. Last year the cost on account of hire was Rs 1,926 and this year it is expected to come up to Rs 2,711 It is owing to the increased pay demanded by the boatmen due to the increased cost of living that there has been this increase in the charge for the boats That accounts for a part of the additional sum demanded under this head Then a larger number of boats is required this year. According to the calculations, there are 110 process-serving peons for whom 124 boats are required, that is to say, one boat to every three peons on an average. The cost on account of increase in the rates and in the number of boats amounts to Rs 4,555 in excess of that of the last year The District Judge's report makes it clear that, unless additional boats are forthcoming, the processes cannot be satisfactorily served, and that he cannot get boats this year at the old rates.

The next item is the revision of pay of the 3rd and 4th Presidency Magistrates. Both the incumbents of these posts belong to the Bengal Civil Service. This House may be aware that lately the pay of that Service has been increased and incremental rates have been established. These two Presidency Magistrates are men of some standing in the Service, and at present, according to the incremental rates of pay to which they would be entitled under the new scale, they would be actually losing for acting as Presidency Magistrates here, that is to say, they get a fixed pay as Presidency Magistrates, but according to the incremental scale, their pay in the regular service would be higher. They are also entitled to ordinary duty allowances which are allowed to the officers of this class deputed to Calcutta Altogether the demand amounts to Rs. 2,675.

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: May I ask what is the fixed pay of the Presidency Magistrates?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: The Third Presidency Magistrate gets Rs. 750 and the Fourth Presidency Magistrate Rs. 650, but according to their grade pay, the former is entitled to Rs. 850 and the latter to Rs. 700. To this both the incumbents of these posts will be entitled to add the duty allowances. These allowances have been fixed in view of the local circumstances as well as with reference to the posts. During Mr. Keays' absence the officiating allowance from the 1st of May to the middle of October comes to Rs. 2,400 and their salary under the new scale would be Rs. 2,600.

I now come to the third item regarding the establishment of a special court for the trial of traffic cases. This Council knows very well that there has been a great deal of trouble as regards road traffic in Calcutta. For some time past there have been many complaints as to the way in which the traffic cases are being dealt with; and you know only the other day there was a Taxi-cab Strike in Calcutta with the result that a committee was appointed, with Mr. Beadel as Chairman, to inquire into the grievances of the taxi-cab drivers and to suggest proper measures for the regulation of traffic in the city. That Committee has now sent in their report and they unanimously recommended, among other matters, that a special court of a Stipendiary Magistrate be established in order to deal with traffic cases. The Committee was a representative one and their report on this head is to this effect. They say—

> We are of opinion that a leading defect of the present system of control in Calcutta is the absence of any proper machinery for securing the expeditious and effective disposal of prosecutions. We understand that Government has already under consideration a proposal that a permanently sitting court presided over by a stipendiary magistrate, should be instituted for the trial solely of offences against regulations concerned with Calcutta traffic. We consider this a most salutary proposal and desire to urge that it should be given effect to at the earliest possible date. The new court should be generously staffed and centrally situated the presiding officer should be fully experienced in motoring matters, and should have attached to him a bench of honorary magistrates, similarly experienced, sitting in the same building. If this important departure is adequately developed, the following benefits, not present hitherto, should be secured —
>
> Offences will be commonly tried at a date when both witnesses and accused are in a position to remember the facts and discipline will be induced by prompt punishment.

Rai LALIT MOHAN SINGH ROY Bahadur: Is that the recommendation of the Committee?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: I am reading from the Report of the Committee. Owing to the congestion of cases, summonses are made returnable sometimes two or three months from the date of the complaint. This is certainly not desirable. These especially are cases which ought to be promptly brought before the Court and dealt with. Then, at present there is a very great discrepancy in the punishments that are inflicted, for instance, one Honorary Magistrate inflicts a fine of Rs. 5 for a particular offence, while another Magistrate imposes a fine

of Rs. 29 for a similar offence. This state of things, if possible, ought to be avoided. The Committee say—

The growth of something approaching a common standard of punishment for similar offences will be encouraged and the present marked unwillingness of the public to protect their own interests by instituting cases or appearing as witness in cases, owing to the loss of private time involved, will be *pro tanto* reduced. It should also follow that this central court profiting by the fuller and prompter evidence placed before it, will function more commonly than courts have hitherto done in the matter of exercising the powers of cancelling or suspending the licenses which the law gives it, and in taking effective notice of instances of police misconduct

As regards the expenditure this is how it is made up

We have calculated the rent of the house to be taken for the purpose at Rs. 600 per mensem; clerks, Rs. 7,200; staff, Rs. 3,156; rates and taxes, furniture and fittings including fans, Rs. 2,500; contingencies, Rs. 1,000; and Rs. 500 for the menial staff. This makes up Rs. 16,356. Then the pay of the Magistrate has been put down as Rs. 500 a month.

The fourth item relates to the appointment of an Additional Magistrate. As the House knows, Mr. Swinhoe, the Chief Presidency Magistrate, is now engaged in trying the munitions cases, and he has very little time therefore at his disposal to try the ordinary cases of that court, with the result that arrears are increasing. That is why we require an Additional Magistrate for at least six months. Mr. Swinhoe has to devote five days in the week to these big cases and I may inform the House that there is already considerable complaint as regards the arrears in the Police Court. The cases there are not always as quickly dealt with as they ought to be. In this very House a question was asked the other day on this point, and there can be no denying the fact that cases in that court should be more expeditiously disposed of. The High Court, the Chief Presidency Magistrate, and the Police Commissioner all have complained of delay. So I do not think it would be safe to allow any further accumulation of arrears in that court.

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA moved "that the demand for the boat-hire for the District Judge, Tippera, be reduced by Rs. 1,555."

You will note that the amount asked for, viz., Rs. 4,555, is by way of an additional grant for boat-hire for the process-serving peons in the office of the District Judge of Tippera. I have some personal experience of Tippera. One fact that is outstanding this year is that the number of cases have been reduced or will be reduced a great deal due to what influence it is not profitable now to inquire; but the fact remains that there will not be so much necessity for utilising the boats for the number of processes to be served will be much less. At the same time, the learned District Judge himself has, as we have been told, demanded that some additional amount is necessary; therefore, I have proposed that Rs. 1,555 only be reduced from that amount.

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: I really do not understand what ground the mover of the amendment has for saying that the number of cases has gone down. This is not so. The District Judge who ought to know about these matters very well says that he will not be able to have the processes served unless a larger number of boats are available I think this ought to satisfy the House. I will, however read from his letter in this connection: the District Judge says—

I have the honour to state that boats are not available for employment at the rate of monthly hire for which they were engaged last year and that at Sadar and Brahmanbaria the number of boats should be increased for the proper service of processes. I submit a statement . . .

He submits a statement and goes on to say that—

There are 410 process-serving peons employed in the district and 124 boats now required will approximately provide only one boat to every three peons on an average. For the proper service of processes the number of boats is absolutely necessary and the expenditure involved in the employment of these boats at the rates shown in the statement is also unavoidable.

The motion was put and lost.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: I beg leave to withdraw my motion.

The following motion was then withdrawn:—

"That the demand for the boat-hire for the District Judge, Tippera, be refused."

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: In view of the statement made by the Hon'ble Member that this sum is required only for boat-hire in connection with the service of processes, I beg leave to withdraw the motion.

The following motion was then withdrawn:—

"That the demand for the boat-hire for the District Judge, Tippera, be refused.

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: I do not press my amendment.

The following motion was then withdrawn:—

"That the demand for the revision of pay for the 3rd and 4th Presidency Magistrates be refused."

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA moved "that the demand for the revision of pay of the 3rd and 4th Presidency Magistrates be refused."

It seems to me that the pay already sanctioned for these 2 posts, namely, Rs. 750 and Rs. 650, is already high enough. The increase of pay, granted to the Deputy Magistrates of Bengal lately, has been so great that the salaries of these two Bengal Civil Service officers are now higher than the pay fixed for these two important officers. I do not understand why members of the Bengal Civil Service should be brought

to Calcutta to work in these two posts; what strikes me as most peculiar is that these gentlemen who are serving in the mufassal on their usual pay, should be paid a large amount of money as duty allowance, as soon as they come to Calcutta. This item of duty allowance seems to be rather absurd. Is it to be thought that without this duty allowance they will not discharge their duties? Why is this amount to be allowed then? The present rate of pay for these two Presidency Magistrates seems to be quite enough. If these two members of the Bengal Civil Service are taken away from Calcutta, two new men either from the Bar or from the lower grade of the same Service might be appointed on the same pay as has been fixed for these posts. If I am not mistaken, the 5th Presidency Magistrate gets less than Rs. 650. I do not see any reason, why the 3rd and the 4th Presidency Magstrates should not work on their present pay.

With these few words, I beg to commend my motion to the acceptance of the House.

Rai Dr. HARIDHAN DUTT Bahadur: I rise to give my support to the amendment and to oppose the original motion. From what little knowledge I have of the working of the Police Courts I have not been able to make up my mind to support any increase of pay for the posts of the 3rd and 4th Presidency Magistrates. As to the present incumbents of these two appointments I have absolutely nothing to say against them, but from the information given by the Hon'ble Member it transpires that these two gentlemen are in receipt of quite an adequate pay, viz., Rs. 750 and Rs. 650. Over and above that, there is this solicitude to pay them an extra allowance of Rs. 200 and Rs. 150 per mensem and for this sanction is sought to the amount of Rs. 2,675 in the budget. These are certainly not cases which have been taken into consideration on account of high prices all over the country. If so, there is more reason why the pay of those who draw Rs. 100 or Rs. 50 a month should be increased rather than that of those drawing Rs. 750 or Rs. 800 a month. In these hard days there is a cry everywhere for increase of pay, and our sympathy must first be devoted to those who earn small pay. I fail to understand why any extra sympathy should be shown to these two gentlemen who are tolerably well paid. That is one of the reasons why I want to oppose the grant.

There is another reason and that is this: Are these two gentlemen belonging to the Provincial Civil Service cadre to be given an extra allowance because they have come to Calcutta? I think I am right in saying that members of this service consider themselves fortunate if they are posted to Calcutta, and I fail to understand why, because they have been brought to Calcutta some extra allowance has to be paid to them. I am quite prepared to meet any contradiction when I say that these officers, if they are brought from the mufassal to take up important appointments in Calcutta, thank their stars and the authorities for the same.

In fact, a good many in the Bengal Civil Service cadre will be delighted to come to Calcutta even on less pay. But what happens in the present cases is, that when these officers have been transplanted from the mufassal to a city like Calcutta which has so many advantages as against the mufassal, they are given extra allowances. These two gentlemen no doubt are quite reliable officers and perhaps very worthy representatives of the Bengal Civil Service, but if they are asked to revert to their old appointments, two other gentlemen from the same cadre may easily be got who will be delighted to come to the Calcutta Police Court and who will do their work equally efficiently on the pay they are drawing in the mufassal. So I do not see any necessity of wasting, so to speak, this Rs. 2,675.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: I must say that I oppose the amendment of Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta by which he wants to refuse this demand. My esteemed friend, Dr. Haridhan Dutt, has said that he has a little knowledge of the Police Courts from which he thinks that these gentlemen are well paid. I may tell the House that I have a greater knowledge of those courts and I do not think that these gentlemen are well paid. To acknowledge the importance of the work that these gentlemen do and to say that Rs. 750 or Rs. 650 is quite sufficient for them, is not showing an appreciation of what the Doctor himself admits as very worthy officers. That sort of appreciation means very little. In Calcutta they have to pay a house rent of about Rs. 150 or Rs. 200; and then what is left to them out of their pay? My friend says that they get Rs. 750 and Rs. 650 and so they must be well off.

May I ask my friend - he will pardon me - whether he or I will consider that pay to be sufficient? If not, why should these two poor gentlemen not get more - because they are in the Government service? That is no reason. They are very hard-worked officials, both of them. They are gentlemen - bhadrologs of our class; they have some sort of dignity to maintain; they have got to educate their children. It cannot be expected that a Presidency Magistrate will go to the court on foot or in the tram; so he must keep a ghatry, and this alone will take away about Rs. 100 from his pay. After these payments what is left to him? Only a dry appreciation that they are very worthy individuals! Do you think that Rs. 750, less Rs. 200, less Rs. 100, is quite sufficient for them? I think this is not economy. Do not take away the heart from these men who have to work very hard in a position of trust and responsibility. That is not proper. I do not think I can at all support this idea. Therefore, I think, that the grant asked for by the Hon'ble Member is one which we should not object to.

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: We are generally in sympathy with the mover of the amendment for the reason that we are all advocates of economy on principle, and I have listened with very great

attention and, in fact, I tired to get more information by communicating with the mover. What I understand is this: It is proposed by the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-Rahim that as the Secretary of State has sanctioned a time-scale these officers as a matter of right are entitled to the increase of pay, but as that pay was not provided in the budget of the Calcutta Police Court we are now asked to sanction the supplementary grant

As far as I have been able to follow or to understand my esteemed friend, the mover, what he suggests is that if they are to get this increase of pay according to the grade in which they are now placed as a matter of right then they should go back to the mufassal and officers young and lower paid should come here and fill up the posts, so that it might save expenditure. I want to understand the point further with reference to this proposition. Does he think that the new recruits who will hail from the mufassal will remain content with the pay for ever? Won't they ask for an increase of their emoluments a few years after? Is it proper that they should again be sent back to the mufassal and a new group of officers brought in their place? In this way endless difficulties will arise

I do not think that looking from the standpoint that economy must be accompanied by efficiency this step is practicable; therefore, having regard to the fact that the increase asked for is what they are justly entitled to, namely, a sum amounting to Rs 2,675 for only 7 months, I do not think that it will be quite just and fair to withhold this increase the result of which will be that they will want to go back to their old places and the consequence will be dislocation of business in the Calcutta Police Courts On that ground I am not inclined to support the amendment proposed by my hon'ble friend.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: May I be permitted, before I speak, to ask a question of the Hon'ble Member in charge whether, in a matter like this, a reference was made to the Government of India, and if so, what was the result?

The PRESIDENT: The Hon'ble Member may, if he likes, in his reply, deal with your question.

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: Yes. The proposal has been sanctioned by the Government of India

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: It appears that there is a certain amount of misapprehension in regard to this matter. It is not a question of reduction of salary of some officers, as many of us think it to be. The question before us is this: there are certain posts which carry a fixed salary; are we prepared to increase the amount of salary for some particular officers holding those appointments? If the question is put in that form, is any other answer to it possible than the negative? Why should the salary of a post be increased? A thousand

rupees salary for a Deputy Magistrate is, I should think, very enviabl I have got my sons in the Provincial Civil Service, and I know the consider such salaries very enviable.

As regards their coming to Calcutta, I think any Deputy Magistra would like to forego Rs. 100 to come to Calcutta. Why should w increase the salary of these posts? It is, I am afraid, beyond my unde standing.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: I rise to support th amendment. I cannot understand why the value of these posts Presidency Magistrates which are posts on fixed salary should be raise and why men who would be willing to serve on a fixed salary should n be brought from the mufassal for appointment to these posts. If tho who are now holding these appointments think that they would dra higher pay by reverting to the general line, let them go back to th mufassal and men on smaller pay be brought in their place. That is th reason for which I support the amendment and I do not think that an increase should be allowed to them.

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: I must say that the hon'b member who would refuse the grant have not really realised the situatio

These are two magistrates drawn from the Bengal Civil Servic They are men of experience and have been brought to Calcutta becau they were considered to be particularly fit to hold charge of the ver onerous duties of Presidency Magistrates They have been dischargin these duties very satisfactorily and as regards that I do not think a bett testimony could be available than what has been given by Babu Surendr Nath Mullick who has a very large experience of Police Court work Calcutta Now what is the suggestion? The suggestion is that in th place of these gentlemen who have been so efficiently discharging the duties two comparatively young officers on a smaller salary or perha some inexperienced barrister should be brought I hope that a pr position of this sort should not be entertained by the Council for moment.

I am a barrister myself belonging to the profession of law and hav always tried to uphold the interest of the profession, but when I a asked to displace these two experienced magistrates by some youn barristers, I must strongly protest against the proposal.

I have considerable experience of the work in the Calcutta Polic Court as for three years I was a Presidency Magistrate when the Polic Court had only two stipendiary magistrates, and I can personally testif to the heavy and responsible nature of the work which a Presidenc Magistrate has to do.

I think it is altogether preposterous to propose that magistrates wh have acquired much valuable experience and have been doing the wor

so well should be turned out and untried men brought in either from the Service or from the profession.

Rai Dr. HARIDHAN DUTT Bahadur: May I inquire who said that untried men would be brought in?

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: That will be the result if this proposal is carried out. Further it is very doubtful if you can get proper men from the profession on that pay.

As regards the suggestion that there are Deputy Magistrates who would be willing to come to Calcutta on less than their grade pay, well I would not have such men. Everybody knows that in Calcutta he will have to pay a very heavy house rent and other expenses in Calcutta are also heavier than in the mufassal. Why should anybody come here on less than the pay that he is getting in the mufassal? If a Magistrate getting Rs. 500 or Rs. 600 were to come here, he will have to pay a house rent of say Rs. 150 or Rs. 200, unless he happens to have a house of his own where he can live for nothing. Surely the Council would not confine the Government to such men.

I submit that this amendment is unreasonable and should be rejected.

A division was then taken with the following result:

AYES.

Ahmed, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Wasimuddin.
Ahmad, Maulvi Azaharuddin.
Ahmad, Munshi Jafar.
Ali, Munshi Amir.
Ali, Munshi Ayub.
Arhamuddin, Maulvi Khandakar
Sarma, Rai Sahib Panchanan.
Bhattacharji, Babu Ham Chandra.
Charmakar, Babu Rank Chandra.
Chaudhuri, Babu Kishori Mohan
Chaudhuri, Babu Tankanath.
Chaudhuri, Maulvi Shah Muhammad
Das, Babu Shishmadev.
Dutt, Rai Bahadur Dr. Haridhan.
Dutta, Babu Annada Charan.
Dutta, Babu Indu Bhushan.
Ghose, Rai Bahadur Jogendra Chunder.
Haq, Shah Syed Emdadul.
Karim, Maulvi Abdul.
Makramali, Munshi.
Mitra, Rai Bahadur Mahendra Chandra.
Mukhopadhyaya, Babu Sarat Chandra.
Mullick, Babu Nirode Behary.
Ray Babu Surendra Nath.
Ray, Kumar Shib Shekhareswar.
Roy, Rai Bahadur Lalit Mohan Singh.
Sarkar, Babu Jogesh Chandra.

NOES.

Addy, Babu Amulya Dhone.
Afzal, Nawabzada K. M. Khan Bahadur.
Ahmed, Maulvi Rafi Uddin.
Ali, Mr. Syed Nasim.
Azam, Khan Bahadur Khwaja Mahamed.
Banerjea, the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath.
Barton, Mr. H.
Beadel, Mr. C. F.
Birley, Mr. L.
Bompas, Mr. C. H.
Bose, Mr. S. M.
Chaudhuri, the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali, Khan Bahadur.
Das, Mr. S. R.
Das, Rai Bahadur Amar Nath.
Dey, Mr. G. C.
Donald, Mr. J.
Farequi, Mr. K. C. M.
Chatak, Rai Sahib Nilmani
Gordon, Mr. A. D.
Gupta, Mr. N. S.
Hopkyns, Mr. W. S.
Kerr, the Hon'ble Mr. J. N.
Khan, Babu Devendra Lal.
Khan, Maulvi Hamid-ud-din.
Khan, Maulvi Md. Rafique Uddin.
Lang, Mr. J.
Lees, Mr. D. N.
Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan, the Hon'ble.
Marr, Mr. A.
McKenzie, Mr. D. P.
Mitter, the Hon'ble Mr. P. C.
Moitra, Dr. Jatindra Nath.

Mukherjee, Babu Nitya Dhon.	Rahim, the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-.
Mullick, Babu Surendra Nath.	Ray Chaudhuri, Mr. Krishna Chandra.
Nasker, Babu Hem Chandra.	Roy, Maharaja Bahadur Kshaunish Chandra.
O'Kinealy, Lt.-Col. Frederick.	Ray, Raja Manilell Singh.
O'Malley, Mr. L. S. S.	Suhrawardy, Dr. Hassan.
Pal, Rai Bahadur Radha Charan.	Wheeler, the Hon'ble Sir Henry.
Payne, Mr. C. F.	Wordsworth, Mr. W. C.

The Ayes being 27, and the Noes 46, the motion was lost.

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur moved "that the demand for the establishment of a special court for the trial of traffic cases be reduced to Rs. 12,000."

Before I enter into the merits of my motion, I should like to bring to the notice of the Government and specially the Hon'ble Member in charge who has moved for the supplementary grant, the inconvenient or rather the unfortunate position in which the non-official members are placed. These items asking for supplementary grants were circulated to us about six or seven days ago; and we have been expecting all the time to get some explanatory note or some information on which this application for supplementary grant has been made. To our great regret, although following the cue given by Sir Henry Wheeler that some information might always be available, I myself called, before the Council hours, at the office to get any information which I could possibly get. I was told that no information was available except two printed slips with regard to the items for the Chittagong Port and the Education grants which were handed over to me. I asked for similar information with regard to the items in respect of which I gave notice, but I was told that no information had been given for circulation to the members. This is the position in which we are placed. Just a few minutes ago, I had an opportunity of meeting the Hon'ble Member and I asked him for certain information and he has given me certain facts and figures. I submit that it would have been a great advantage to us if this information were given to us beforehand, so that we might have had an opportunity if necessary, of conferring with the Hon'ble Member and of discussing the matter. But we were deprived of that opportunity. In the Montagu-Chelmsford Report it is stated that there will be conferences and larger associations between the Government Members and the non-official members, and if this is the association of the non-officials with the Government Members I do not know how business will be conducted. The result is that the Government Members are deluged with half a dozen motions, some opposing the grants or some asking for reductions and thus the valuable time of the Council is wasted.

Turning to my motion, I know that the committee appointed to consider the grievances of the taxi-drivers have recommended that there should be a special court to try traffic cases. There are motions opposing the grant altogether, but my motion is that the grant be reduced to Rs. 12,000. The figures which have been given by the Hon'ble

Member in charge show that the amount will come up to about Rs. 23,000. I think, however, that if the matter were discussed at a conference, the Hon'ble Member might be induced to consider whether this sum was not susceptible of reduction. I do not think that a house rent of Rs. 600 and Rs. 200 for rents and taxes are at all necessary. I think that a ground-floor flat can easily be rented at a lower rate instead of paying such a large sum for a separate house. This is a matter which might very conveniently be discussed with the Hon'ble Member in charge.

Then, there is an item for clerical establishment. There is another item also for the police staff necessary for this court, which will amount to about Rs. 6,000. I do not think that such a large amount is necessary. The Magistrate's pay is put at Rs. 6,000 annually. I submit the Magistrate's salary might be a little lower as it would have to be increased later on. Having regard to these facts I think that to start with we can very well reduce the grant to Rs. 12,000 per annum.

We understand that it is intended to demolish the Bankshall Street building and to rebuild a house there for the accommodation of the Courts. There is another court—the Juvenile Court—at the Lower Circular Road. Some of us have to attend that court. This court has got ample quarters. There is a magnificent first floor room which is occupied by the Sergeant in charge. The poor Magistrates have to sit on the ground floor. I think by some arrangement that building could be utilised for the traffic cases or a smaller room in a ground-floor flat might be rented for the traffic court. With these observations I beg to move the resolution.

The PRESIDENT: Motion No. 20 and the four motions that follow, viz., 21 to 24 refer to the special court for traffic cases and I think that it will be convenient if they be taken up together.

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: May I point out that Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur's motion is for a reduction of the grant, while the other four motions ask for the refusal of the grant altogether. That indeed makes some difference.

The PRESIDENT: Yes. This is so, but still I think the whole matter might be conveniently discussed together. That will save time. I am only considering that question now.

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY moved "that the demand for the establishment of a special court for the trial of traffic cases be refused."

It will be seen that by making a grant of Rs. 22,400 you will have to make a grant of another sum of Rs. 6,080 (amendment No. 40), namely, for the police staff for the special stipendiary magistrate; so that you will have to make a grant of not Rs. 22,400, but of the sum of Rs. 28,480. I know that, as a matter of fact, it is necessary to have another police court room where these cases should be tried, because th-

present building cannot accommodate all these courts. I also know that the traffic cases are postponed time after time, and many cases are postponed for an indefinite length of time, and that the parties are put to very great botheration and trouble. It is therefore necessary that there ought to be at least another stipendiary magistrate for the trial of these police cases. But we also know that this year we are very much short of funds. Is it therefore meet and proper that we should be made liable to spend in addition the sum of Rs. 28,480, or nearly Rs. 30,000? If we could afford to wait for such a length of time, we could also afford to wait for another six or seven months more. That is my ground for opposing the grant altogether.

The PRESIDENT: The three motions that follow are identical, and I would therefore ask the movers to speak on this motion.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: I beg to support the amendment moved by Babu Surendra Nath Ray that the grant be refused. I am sure that the Hon'ble Member in charge has considered the matter very carefully, but I would ask him to consider whether it is not possible to spare us from an addition to the expenditure which is already heavy, and the new expenditure will amount to about Rs. 30,000 for the remaining 8 months of the year. I understand that this expenditure is necessary, because the honorary magistrates are not very careful in awarding punishments. When the matter has been considered in various quarters, it is unavoidable that there should be some difference of opinion. But I submit that it can be tolerated for some time more. Some specific instructions can be issued to the magistrates as to how they should award punishments. I simply ask you to consider this question from this point of view and if possible to save us from this additional expenditure. In this view I support the amendment.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: I beg to support the amendment of Babu Surendra Nath Ray, on the following grounds: first, if I am not mistaken, Government have not yet passed any resolution on the recommendations of the Taxi-Cab Committee and, as the Government resolution is not yet published, it seems to me to be premature to take any action on those recommendations. The second ground is this. It has been said that the recent taxi strike is one of the reasons for the establishment of such a court. As far as I can judge, it seems to me that the taxi strike was not due to any miscarriage of justice but to the alleged extremely high-handed behaviour on the part of the traffic police. The third ground is that the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-Rahim has been pleased to observe that the judgments of the honorary magistrates are not always uniform as they impose different amounts of fines for the same offence and that these judgments do not always give satisfaction. I do not see that this is any reflection on the work of the honorary magistrates; I think that there are very able gentlemen in this city of Calcutta, who can

discharge these duties very satisfactorily and, if the records of these cases are kept, I do not see why a comparative study of these cases should not be productive of more even-handed justice. As no complaint of miscarriage of justice has been made by the High Court, I do not see any reason why we should be in a hurry to establish this court. This is a matter which can surely wait till the beginning of the next year, when the Government will have enough time to consider the report of the Taxi-Cab Committee.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: I wish to make my position very clear. My position is that eight millions of the people of this country are suffering from want of water, and when we asked for drinking water, I was told that there was no money for the purpose. The position now, therefore, is that we should oppose every proposal for additional expenditure unless it is absolutely necessary and it is on that ground that I opposed the first resolution and on that ground also I oppose this. I go further and say that the people must make some sacrifice, if necessary, in order that their poorer brethren in the mufassal may not suffer. You want to spend Rs. 28,000 for the establishment of a court to try traffic cases. I say it can wait and that the work of this court can be done by honorary magistrates. You must remember the fact that every pice that is spent on matters like these is taken away from the poor people of this country. For these reasons, I think the demand should not be granted.

Mr. C. F. BEADEL: I regret that on the first occasion on which I have the honour to address this Council, I should be in opposition to my friend, Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur, with whom I have done a certain amount of work and of whose qualities I have a very high opinion. I do not think that the Rai Bahadur has given sufficient attention to this question of a special stipendiary court. Of course, we cannot have a special court unless money is provided to start it. As the Hon'ble Member in charge has told the House, I had the honour of being the Chairman of the Taxi-Cab Committee; and I would remind the House that it was practically a non-official committee—certainly there was only one official and all the others were non-officials. This question of a special stipendiary court was one of the items in the questionaire and this questionaire was sent to all people who were considered to have any special knowledge or any special interest in the question of the improvement of the taxi-cab service. I would like to tell the House that, of all the items in the questionaire, this about the special stipendiary court was the only one that met with no sort of dissent. One and all—and I include honorary magistrates—were in favour of such a court, and not only a court but a really commodious court with a proper staff attached to it, so that the extraordinary delays which had taken place in the past in connection with the trial of traffic or taxi-drivers' cases—they are usually the drivers' cases which should be obviated—and also that there should be some sort

of conveniences such as waiting-rooms for witnesses who have to give evidence. We had evidence to show that it was very difficult to get anybody to attend the Police Court. Of course, it must be understood that it was in no way intended, when this recommendation was put forward by the Taxi-Cab Committee, to cast any aspersions whatsoever on the honorary magistrates. They had done their work extremely well. But on the evidence produced, it was clear to the Committee that by appointing a stipendiary magistrate of good experience and a proper staff under him, the litigants would receive quicker and more uniform justice. The Hon'ble Member in charge has already pointed out one or two cases in which the fines levied were not uniform for practically the same offence. All these matters were carefully considered by the committee. Of course it is always difficult to speak in favour of a proposal which entails any expenditure of money—we all know that the Government is none too well off—but there is always some way of finding ways and means, and I have no doubt that if the House accepts the proposal, as I hope it will, it being extremely necessary in the interests of the traffic of Calcutta that some improvement should be made in the trial of taxi-drivers' cases, then Government will find the means, perhaps, by an increased tax on motor cars and I am sure that this House would not object to luxuries being taxed more than they are at present.

With these few words, I beg to oppose the amendment of Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur, and, if I am allowed to do so, the subsequent ones also.

Babu NITYA DHON MUKHERJEE: We have heard the speeches of several members from the beginning of this debate and we have heard the history of this proposed court for the trial of traffic cases, and not only the history of the proposed court but also the history of many other courts where some of our members have to attend now and then. Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur is very sorry that the trying Magistrate in the Juvenile Court has to sit on the ground floor. Then we have heard Babu Surendra Nath Ray whose suggestion seems, after reading the amendment, to be a refusal of the grant, but after hearing him it appears that it is practically a temporary postponement of the same. He thinks that the proposal can wait for six or seven months. Some of my friends have suggested that the honorary magistrates might be instructed to decide the cases in a particular way, but people outside will take that view as an interference on the part of the executive over the judiciary, and that would, therefore, be an offence in the eye of the public and the public will not allow that. We have heard also the speech of Mr. Beadel, who was the President of this Taxi-Cab Committee, and he supported the motion for the grant. But I have my own grounds for supporting this amendment for refusal. It is said that trials by honorary magistrates are defective in certain cases, as these cases are often postponed, and also because they inflict sentences

which are not always uniform. For instance, they impose fines of Rs. 5 or of Rs. 40 for the same offence. But the remedy lies in the selection of honorary magistrates, and I think that something may be done in that direction. I know that there are retired deputy magistrates who even sometimes move about the precincts of the Presidency Magistrates' courts on the plea of seeing their old friends for want of any other occupation, and these gentlemen might be appointed as honorary magistrates to try these cases. They are passing their days in retirement and in sorrow as nobody calls them "huzur" and they have no power to inflict any punishment. If you give them a Chair, it will be seen that they are quite competent to do this sort of work as they have got sufficient experience in this matter. They need some sort of occupation. Of course, there is another aspect and that is that, if you establish a special court, it will bring more money, but you can get this money without spending a single farthing. I suggest, therefore, that, as an experimental measure, retired deputy magistrates be appointed as honorary magistrates to try these traffic cases and, I am sure, they will be only too glad to be appointed honorary magistrates and they will conduct the cases to the entire satisfaction of the authorities. As regards postponement, I need not dilate any further as I have already stated both aspects of this question.

With these few words, I support the amendment.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: I do think that a special court for the trial of traffic cases is necessary and should be immediately established. It is no good particularly for me to say that it is not necessary. Anybody who knows this court will say that it is urgently necessary to have a special court. Our great difficulty, as Sir Abd-ur-Rahim has pointed out, is that in the Police Court you cannot get people to come and give evidence. If people are asked to come and dance attendance in the Police Court, you cannot expect them to do so, especially when they are respectable people. This is a very good reason, as Mr. Beadel has pointed out, as to why this court should be established, but, at the same time, I think that Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur's amendment is quite reasonable. I am inclined to think that Rs. 300 for the police staff is quite enough and Rs. 600 for the magistrate. In the Presidency Magistrates' courts, I think the police are rather overstaffed. They are seen loitering about, smoking cigarettes and creating noise which has to be stopped by the presiding magistrate. If you pay Rs. 300 for the police staff, Rs. 600 to the magistrate and Rs. 200 for other expenditure, I think you would pay enough. I do not think that we should give such a large sum as is asked for. Because when a thing is recognised as important it is no reason why we should ask for a very large sum. There is no reason in that. I therefore think that the suggestion of my hon'ble friend—Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur's amendment—is quite a reasonable one and I hope that it may be

accepted by the House because this is an amendment which ought to be supported.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: As concerned with the Police who control the traffic of Calcutta, I would like to say a word emphasising this proposal from their point of view. As Mr. Beadel has said, this is a question to which much importance was attached by the Committee presided over by him, which went fully into the matter, and it is one which looms large in all recent discussions for the improvement of traffic regulation in Calcutta. It will be within the recollection of the Council that last cold weather we heard a great deal about the defects in managing the traffic of this city. Less has been heard on the subject recently, probably because in the hot weather the traffic is appreciably less, but next cold weather we are bound to hear more about it, and if we have the congestion in the city which is likely to result from the Royal Visit, the traffic problem will loom very large indeed.. It is therefore of prime importance to do everything in our power now to put our house in order in time.

With regard to the observations of Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta, I think he has misunderstood some of the grievances of the taxi drivers for which they went on strike. One of their complaints was that, owing to the present arrangements for the hearing of their cases they had to attend court from day to day at the cost of harassment and loss of money. So it is not only to our advantage but to that of the drivers also to ensure the more prompt and efficient disposal of cases.

Rai Dr. HARIDHAN DUTT Bahadur: When I sent in my name as an intending speaker in this connection there was absolutely no information before us. But subsequently from what has fallen from some of the previous speakers I have been able to gather some particulars regarding the proposed establishment of the special court. Sir, it should not be supposed that because I am standing here I am going to oppose the proposal. On the other hand I do realise that there is a necessity for a special court for dealing with traffic cases in Calcutta. But, although I am one of those who would like to have a special court for this particular purpose, I am disposed to think that the consideration of this question at this time is rather premature. When the budget was passed, only a short time ago, there was no demand for an expenditure in this connection. I placed a question before this Council asking the authorities for information about this matter and I was told that the matter was under consideration. This was only in April last. Subsequently, I put a series of questions with a view to bringing before this Council in a very short time a proposal for the reorganization of the Police Courts in Calcutta. I do not know whether my scheme of reorganization will meet with the approval of this House. But I am quite hopeful that it will receive due consideration at the hands of the members. Sir, the question of police administration in Calcutta has always been considered an important matter,

and I find from reading the proceedings of previous Legislative Councils that this matter received due consideration at the hands of our predecessors, and I am sure if a proper scheme is placed before the House, it will again receive due consideration. I have asked for certain information for the purpose of preparing my scheme and it will be based mainly upon the question as to how many police courts we should have in Calcutta. I need not go into the details of that scheme at present, but one thing that must arise is whether we should have one special court for dealing with traffic cases or several courts in different parts of Calcutta. Various other questions will also come up in that connection. I do not want to tire the patience of the House at this stage. Before I sit down I would like to mention one point in connection with our debate. We suffer much for want of information which, if forthcoming, will very often save our time. Only the other day we adopted a system of standing committees and I was anxiously expecting that the standing committee connected with the Judicial Department will be able to place before us all informations regarding the Police Courts in Calcutta, thus helping us to come to a right decision. But I have been disappointed. I do not know whether the standing committees are still living or dead. We have got this grievance against them, and if the standing committees do not give us necessary informations it is better not to have standing committees at all.

Mr. KRISHNA CHANDRA RAY CHAUDHURI: I oppose this motion. I speak from personal experience that traffic cases are very badly managed in Calcutta Police Courts. I was myself prosecuted for allowing my coachman to break traffic rules and I had to come away from the Court because the honorary magistrate did not turn up on the appointed day. I was also a witness in a motor prosecution case and I found that the honorary magistrate who was trying the case had no experience of motor cars and could not intelligently follow the proceedings. I hope that in selecting a traffic magistrate knowledge of driving ought to be taken into consideration and an owner-driver should be preferred. As regard drivers of bullock-carts and hackney carriages I know that when they are prosecuted they have to dance attendance in the Court from day to day owing to the vagaries of honorary magistrates who try their cases and as a result there is considerable loss in their earnings.

Mr. HUSEYN SHAHEED SUHRAWARDY: To me it appears that a budget demand by the Government ought not to be lightly opposed unless there is some difference in principle between the members of the House and the Government. I am in full accord with the principle which has prompted Government to set up a traffic court and, therefore, I beg to oppose both the motion that refuses the grant and the motion of Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur who wants to reduce

the grant. Sir, I do not wish to decry that admirable body of persons known as honorary magistrates who spend a considerable amount of time in relieving the pressure of work. But it is well known that apart from the fact that such magistrates cannot be very regular in their attendance, litigants prefer their cases to be tried by stipendiary magistrates for various reasons which I need not mention. I, however, dare to express an opinion which most members of the House here possess, namely, that when Government is on the look out for a magistrate to try traffic cases it should take particular care to have an owner-driver and one who is conversant with the traffic of Calcutta. Only such a person will be able to see what particular precautions should be taken in particular areas and in traffic of a particular kind.

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: Should he be a barrister owner-driver?

Mr. TARIT BHUSAN ROY: Is a member in order to question another member in the House?

The PRESIDENT: A member is quite in order to do so, please see section 13 of our rules. But he must do so through the President. I did not hear the Rai Bahadur. Would he repeat his question?

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: I wanted to know whether the magistrate should be a lawyer owner-driver.

The PRESIDENT: That question does not arise.

Mr. HUSEYN SHAHEED SUHRAWARDY: If my hon'ble friend the Rai Bahadur is particularly anxious to know, I may tell him that, in my opinion, he must be so, because he should have some knowledge of law and be experienced in balancing evidence. Therefore, my recommendation to the Government is that when it is choosing a magistrate, it should choose a person who will be able to dispense proper justice from personal knowledge and experience.

Rai MAHENDRA CHANDRA MITRA Bahadur: I was one of those unfortunate men who was a member of the Standing Committee. The Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-Rahim asked my advice and that of my hon'ble friend Babu Annada Charan Dutta. We came to the conclusion that it was necessary to have a special court for the disposal of traffic cases. One of my hon'ble friends here has asked the Council whether the members of the Standing Committee are alive. I think, Sir, I am alive. My idea was at that time, and I still retain that idea, that in Calcutta, a very important city, once the capital of the British Empire, we ought to have a court dealing with traffic cases. Sir, I have a great respect for the honorary magistrates both here and in the mufassal. We know the difficulties which compel them to postpone cases day after day. These postponements depend on various circumstances.

As regards the deliberations of the Standing Committee I must say that the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-Rahim patiently listened to our arguments and helped us with his suggestions. But Sir, we were not aware that such a large sum as Rs. 22,000 should be allotted for this purpose. Sir, in this Council, I have always stood up for economy as also for efficiency. Therefore, in my opinion, if economy is to be practised this sum should be cut down a little. I think that this sum of Rs. 22,000 should be reduced, whether this suggestion be accepted or not.

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: I may say that I am willing to accept a lower figure. What has been asked is for the entire 12 months. But I am prepared to accept Rs. 14,400 for the rest of the official year. It is not necessary for me to say much in reply having regard to what has been said by Mr. Beadel, Chairman of the Taxi-Cab Committee, by Rai M C Mitra Bahadur and by Mr K C. Ray Chaudhuri who was also a member of the Taxi-Cab Committee. I must make it clear to the House that, in anything that I have said, I had not the slightest intention to cast a slur on honorary magistrates. I know the value of the work they do and the Government fully appreciate their devotion to duty. They are men of position and education and perform their duties at considerable sacrifice of their valuable time. I do not mean for one moment to suggest that they are not quite competent magistrates. What I mean to say is, and I think every one, who knows anything of the work of the Police Court, will bear me out in this that you cannot expect any individual honorary magistrate to attend court from day to day and sit there from half past ten or 11 till 5 o'clock. In the nature of things you have to call upon different magistrates from time to time to deal with the cases allotted to them with the result that you cannot expect continuity of knowledge or experience in any class of cases. Their ideas of nature of evidence must vary with the ratio of experience of each man; and if one thing is desirable in the administration of criminal justice, especially in the trial of traffic cases, it is this, that here should not be too gross a discrepancy in the punishments that are awarded for similar offences. For instance, nothing would dissatisfy a taxi-driver so much as if we were to find that he has been fined Rs. 30 for an offence for which another fellow taxi-driver of his has been let off with a fine of Rs. 5. Further, it is very necessary that traffic cases ought to be heard and disposed of as promptly as possible. As to the state of things existing at present my information is from very reliable sources—from the Presidency Magistrates, from the Commissioner of Police, and from the members of the Taxi-Cab Committee—that these cases have to be postponed from time to time before they are disposed of. Surely this is not a desirable state of things and should not be allowed to continue in a town like Calcutta.

As regards what fell from Mr. Chaudhuri that the magistrate who is to preside in a court like this, should know something about motor

driving so that he will be able fully to grasp the nature of a case wher a man is charged with violating traffic regulations, I am in entir sympathy with this suggestion and this is what the Government i contemplating to do. We will try to find a magistrate who has a know ledge of the city and knows something of motor driving. I do not think Sir, that it is necessary for me to add anything more excepting this. Thi question, has been considered by a very competent committee appointe to inquire especially into the condition of taxicab traffic in Calcutta The committee has unanimously reported in favour of the establishmen of a court like this Are the members of the House who have ha no opportunity of studying the question, of hearing evidence, of investi gating the defects in the present regulations, why these taxi driver have been creating so much trouble and whether there is anything a the bottom of their grievances, going to disregard the recommendation of the committee? Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur and other speaker complained that they had not been given sufficient information. It wa for that very reason that the standing committees were instituted We cannot possibly go and talk to every member of the Council abou each item of demand. This would be an impracticable proposal. Th members of the Judicial Standing Committee were fully taken into conf dence and all the facts were placed before them, as Rai Mahendra Chan dra Mitra Bahadur has told the House The proposition was entirel approved by the committee that a traffic court should be established Then if any member wanted any information from me I was always avail able and would have gladly given him every information. It is really a frivolous complaint of the member that he did not have any informa tion. Just now I gave him all the information he sought from me.

I submit that this demand ought to be allowed

The PRESIDENT: There are two classes of motions before th House—one by Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur in which he asks tha the demand be reduced to Rs 12,000——

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: I have reduced my demand t Rs. 14,400.

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: I accept it.

The PRESIDENT: You desire to modify your motion in a parti cular way, but that must be done with the permission of the House.

Permission was then granted by the Council to Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur to make the alteration suggested.

The PRESIDENT: It seems to me that the more logical course would be first to put the motions which say that the whole amount

should be reduced. If there is no objection, I shall do that. I am told the other movers withdraw all their motions and accept the Rai Bahadur's motion as amended.

All other motions were then, by leave of the Council, withdrawn.

Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur's amended motion that the demand be reduced to Rs. 14,400 was then put and agreed to.

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA withdrew the following motion standing in his name:—

"That the demand for the appointment of an additional magistrate to try munitions cases be refused."

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA moved "that the demand for the appointment of an additional magistrate to try munitions cases be refused."

It has been said by the Hon'ble Member that the Chief Presidency Magistrate is trying the munitions cases and that an additional magistrate is required to try ordinary cases. In view of the fact that this Council has granted an increase of pay to some of the Presidency Magistrates, I think, we ought to see that they do more work for this increase in their pay. I do not think the munitions cases will last long; we had better wait till the end of the year, and if the work suffers, then we shall certainly consider, if this is necessary.

With these few words, I beg to move that this demand be refused.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: I beg to support the motion. I have a similar motion standing in my name.

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: As regards the appointment of an additional magistrate, this is only to give temporary relief to the Calcutta Police Court owing to Mr. Swinhoe, the Chief Presidency Magistrate, being engaged in the hearing of the munitions cases. One does not exactly know how long that case will last but our estimate is that it may last for six months, and that is why we have asked for an additional magistrate for six months.

Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta says that this Council has granted increase of pay to the third and the fourth Presidency Magistrates and therefore they should be able to cope with the extra work. The time of these magistrates is now fully occupied and because an increase of pay has been granted to them that is no reason that they should be asked to do another magistrate's work in addition to their own. I submit that the suggestion does not deserve serious attention of the House.

The motion was then put and a division taken with the following result:—

AYES.

Ahmad, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Wasimuddin.
Ahmed, Maulvi Azaharuddin.
Ahmed, Munshi Jafar.
Ali, Munshi Amir.
Arhamuddin, Maulvi Khandakar.
Chaudhuri, Babu Kisheri Mohan.
Chaudhuri, Maulvi Shah Muhammad.
Das Cupta, Babu Nibaran Chandra.
Dutta, Babu Annada Charan.
Dutta, Babu Indu Bhushan.
Ghose, Rai Bahadur Jagendra Chunder.
Haq, Shah Syed Emdadul.
Makramali, Munshi.
Mukhopadhaya, Babu Sarat Chandra.
Ray, Kumar Shib Shekhareswar.

NOES.

Addy, Babu Amulya Dhone.
Afzal, Nawabzada K. M. Khan Bahadur.
Ali, Mr. Syed Nasim.
Azam, Khan Bahadur Khwaja Mohamed.
Banerjea, the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath.
Birley, Mr L.
Bompas, Mr. C H.
Bose, Mr. S. M.
Chaudhuri, the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali, Khan Bahadur.
Das, Babu Shishmadev.
Das, Mr. S. R.
Das, Rai Bahadur Amar Nath.
Day, Mr. C. C.
Donald, Mr. J.
Farequi, Mr. K. C. M.
Gupta, Mr. N. S.
Hopkyns, Mr. W. S.
Karim, Maulvi Fazlal.
Kerr, the Hon'ble Mr. J. H.
Khan, Babu Devendra Lal.
Khan, Maulvi Md. Rafique Uddin.
Lang, Mr. J.
Lees, Mr. D. H.
Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan, the Hon'ble.
Marr, Mr. A.
McKenzie, Mr. D. P.
Mitra, Rai Bahadur Mahendra Chandra.
Mitter, the Hon'ble Mr. P. C.
Moitra, Dr. Jotindra Nath.
Morgan, Mr. C.
Mukherjee, Babu Nitya Dhon.
Mullick, Babu Surendra Nath.
Nakey, Mirza Muhammad Ali.
O'Kinealy Lt.-Col. Frederick.
O'Malley, Mr. L. S. S.
Pal, Rai Bahadur Radha Charan.
Payne, Mr. C. F.
Rahim, the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-
Ray Chaudhuri, Mr. Krishna Chandra.
Roy, Maharaja Bahadur Kshaunish Chandra
Roy, Rai Bahadur Lalit Mohan Singh.
Roy, Raja Manilall Singh.
Suhrawardy, Dr. Hassan.
Suhrawardy, Mr. Huseyn Shaheed.
Swan, Mr. J. A. L.
Wheeler, the Hon'ble Sir Henry.
Wordsworth, Mr. W. C.

The Ayes being 15 and the Noes 47, the motion was lost

The original demand, with the deduction already made, was then put and agreed to.

25.—Jails and Convict Settlements.

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM moved "that a sum of Rs. 22,000 be granted for expenditure under the head '25.—Jails and convict settlements' on account of the following items:—

Revision of pay of jail warders, Rs. 18,000
Appointment of a special guard for political prisoners, Rs. 4,000.'

As regards the pay of the jail warders, they are an ill-paid body of men. The Jails Committee went round taking evidence all over India and other places and came to the emphatic conclusion that the jail warders of Bengal were not adequately paid. They are badly paid but hard worked officers having to perform strenuous duties. They are paid even less than the police constables with the result that resignations are frequent and it is becoming more and more difficult to recruit jail warders

They were granted some increase not long ago but they are not satisfied with that. In November last in this Council a question was put suggesting that their pay ought to be increased and that they should be placed on the same footing as the police constables who discharge similar duties. Government agrees with that view. It is an absolutely necessary measure, and I expect that the members of this House will have no objection to it.

As regards the appointment of what is called "a special guard for political prisoners," that description is rather misleading What has really happened is this. The Jails Committee reported that the convict settlement in the Andamans should be done away with as far as possible, and the Government of India have accepted that proposal and have ordered that the political prisoners from Bengal should be sent back to Bengal and confined in the jails here. Their number fortunately is not very large but it would mean an increase in the number of political prisoners by 13. At present there are 14 political prisoners altogether. Another recommendation of the Jails Committee has been that these prisoners should not be kept with the ordinary criminals, and that is a view which both the Government of India and this Government have accepted, and I take it that it will meet with the ready acceptance of the members of this Council. We have, therefore, made arrangements for the separate accommodation of all the political prisoners We propose to provide accommodation for them in what used to be the European ward, a building originally intended for European prisoners, but which is now available and would accommodate all these 27 political prisoners in the Alipore Jail. It is a two-storied building containing a number of separate cells and situated quite separate from the ordinary prisoners' wards For this purpose we require additional warders, to guard the passages and we require three guards for each of the three shifts altogether 9 warders. We also require one additional man for leave reserve and two head warders The members of this House must not think that this special guard is meant by way of punishment for the political prisoners The idea is simply to keep them quite separate from ordinary criminals and it is for that purpose alone that we require additional staff I trust the House will agree to this

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: After what has fallen from the Hon'ble Member in charge I think I shall be justified in withdrawing my amendments.

The following amendments were then withdrawn :

"That the demand for appointment of a special guard for political prisoners be reduced by Rs. 2,000."

"That the demand for appointment of a special guard for political prisoners be refused."

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA moved "that the demands for the appointment of a special guard for political prisoners be refused."

In this matter, I do not think the Council is satisfied that thi special guard is necessary even after what the Hon'ble Member has said The political prisoners, Sir, if I am not much mistaken, are the mos well-behaved among the convicts, and it is hardly necessary to go t this expense of having extra men. With these words, I beg to oppos the demand.

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: I am not quite clear whic way to vote on this question, and I rise to speak specially with refer ence to certain observations that have fallen from the Hon'ble Si Abd-ur-Rahim.

Sir, my complaint—legitimate grievance—is that we are not i possession of facts to enable us to submit well considered proposals b way of amendment to those emanating from the Government and we ar told by the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-Rahim, for whom I have got the highes respect, whose calm and judicious frame of mind, and invariable courtes have endeared him to all of us—but I must say that I confess with dee regret that being within the charmed circle of the bureaucracy h seems to have forgotton himself—that we could have got all the informa tion from the standing committee I have not the good fortune o being a member of the standing committee in connection with jails I am informed that all the proceedings of the Committee are strictl confidential, and that the members are not permitted to give out any thing to any other member of this House as to what transpired in th meeting. Further with regard to this particular item, I am told tha this matter never came before the standing committee. Sir Abd-ur Rahim has said that he cannot talk to every member and cannot explai things to every one of them, which is an impossible task, and furthe he has said that we have met from day to day in this Council Hall an we might have asked the Hon'ble Member for any information tha we wanted. With reference to that I say that if the Hon'ble Membe is in such a frame of mind that he cannot talk to any member, th sooner he is relieved of his responsibility the better, because it is hi duty to talk with the members of the Council and exchange views wit them. And if he thinks he cannot take that trouble, the sooner h is relieved of his responsibility the better.

Then, Sir, he has said that we meet here from day to day and we ca go and ask the Hon'ble Member for any information that we want What will be the position of the House if every member goes one b one to the Hon'ble Member and asks him all sorts of questions? Wil you not, Sir, sitting there with an iron rod as President of the Council call the members to order? And as soon as the meeting is over, th Hon'ble Member will find his way downstairs and get into his car, an are the members expected to run after his car? I do not think that h is justified in characterising our legitimate points of objection as friv olous and I submit he has done an injustice to us. We want to ac

in concert with him, but here, how are we treated? This is why people misjudge and misunderstand the Government.

I understand Babu Annada Charan Dutta, although he was not present at the meeting of the standing committee, is now satisfied from the information given by the Hon'ble Member that the demand is necessary. For my part I do not know whether this is necessary or unnecessary, so I am not in a position to vote either way.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: As usual Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur has not been able to make up his mind and still he has made an eloquent and a long speech. But as this matter is so small, I do not think we need quarrel about it. Let the Government have it is my humble opinion.

The Hon'ble Sir ABD-UR-RAHIM: I must say that I am surprised to see Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur so much incensed at some remarks which I made in connection with a previous motion. With reference to that motion it was complained that the members of the Council had not been taken into confidence. I explained that the matter had been considered by the standing committee and that the report of the Taxi-Cab Committee was also there, and, therefore, I thought that the members were not justified in making that observation. But if Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur has taken it amiss, I am sorry. I certainly did not cast any personal reflection on anybody and had no idea that he was so thin-skinned. I thought that a man like him, connected with so many public bodies, would have some sense of humour. However that may be, as regards this item, I do not think I have heard anything which really demands an answer beyond what I have already said. I think Babu Indu Bhushan Dutta did not quite understand me. His argument is that the political prisoners are very well-behaved persons, and so why should there be any special guard for them. I explained that it was not meant to provide special guard for them by way of punishment—in that respect the language of the agenda paper was rather inaccurate. What I pointed out was that in order to keep these prisoners in a separate ward, it had become necessary to increase the existing strength of warders, with a view to providing sentries at the several passages leading to the cells in the new building which has been made available for the accommodation of these men. So I submit, Sir, the demand is in order, and I trust there will be no objection to it.

The motion was then put and lost.

28.—Police.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: With your permission, I am reducing the second item in this motion, and I beg to move

" that a sum of Rs. 15,238 be granted for expenditure under the head '26.—Police' on account of the following items:—

Police staff for the Court of an additional Presidency Magistrate Rs. 6,300.

Police staff required for the special stipendiary Magistrate for the trial of traffic cases, Rs. 4,158.

Rents, rates and taxes of the premises hired for the Motor Vehicles and Hackney Carriage Department, Rs. 4,780."

The first two items in this list of three are connected with the proposals which have just been discussed, namely, to set up a temporary court for another Presidency Magistrate and a special court for the trial of traffic cases in Calcutta. It is obvious that if these courts are to be created—and the Council has approved of their creation—they must have the ordinary court staff for the general supervision of arrangements and the prosecution of cases, and it is for that that provision is made in the first two items. The staff contemplated for the Additional Presidency Magistrate is one court inspector, one European sergeant and four constables. The staff proposed for the traffic court, as reduced by me, is one sub-inspector, one assistant sub-inspector and four constables. I have docked the provision for a second prosecuting sub-inspector.

The third item is also connected with the report of the Taxi-Committee. One of their proposals was that the existing arrangements for the inspection of *ticca* gharries and taxis should be improved. At present, at Fenwick Bazar, vehicles of all kinds are assembled together. The place is disgracefully overcrowded, and there is no proper supervision, with the result that complaints are frequent—analogous to the complaints about court work—that the drivers are kept hanging about while their vehicles and horses are passed, and lose money unnecessarily in the process. It is to remedy this that we seek to carry through this improvement. It is proposed to hire premises at 47, Beniapukur Street. I have seen the house, which comprises a large compound and buildings in a more or less good condition. With certain improvements, for which provision will be asked in motion No. 65, the house and compound can be made a suitable place for the inspection of *ticca* gharries. They can then be taken away from Fenwick Bazar, leaving that for motor-cars only. By that means we hope to remove the grievances which have been voiced, and which have been endorsed by Mr. Beadel's committee.

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA moved " that the demand for police staff for the court of an additional Presidency Magistrate be reduced to Rs. 1,500."

We really cannot account for the fact why the police grants are always going up. They cry is ' still they come.' I have been told by some one that the number of police officers in the subordinate rank, that is to

say, the constables, is not too many, but here in Calcutta, so many highly paid officers are not required. Is it not possible for some one of them to be present in the court of the additional Presidency Magistrate for an hour or so every day? If it is, I shall keep only one assistant sub-inspector with two constables who, I think, would be quite able to manage the ordinary work of this court. This is my reason for suggesting that only Rs. 1,500 should be allowed and I hope the Council will agree.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: I am afraid I cannot recommend this reduction to the Council. The provision, as I have explained, is merely consequential to the creation of a court, of which the Council has approved. It seems to me obvious that if we have a court, we must staff it with the ordinary attendants who are present in other courts. The requirements are as stated by Mr. Swinhoe; they are based on the practice in other courts, and consistently with that practice are not susceptible of reduction.

The motion was then put and lost.

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur moved "that the demand for police staff for the court of an additional Presidency Magistrate be reduced to Rs. 3,300."

I understand, if I am right, that one inspector, one sub-inspector and seven constables are required. I do not know the details of the traffic police but this is the detail I have obtained from the Hon'ble Member. I do not think that if this item be scrutinised, the House will find that an additional staff involving an expenditure of Rs. 6,300 a year is required. This will be a permanent staff later on, if the court of the additional Presidency Magistrate is also made a permanent one. The expenditure will naturally increase. Only a few minutes ago, I had been to the Municipal Magistrates' court to inquire what is the police establishment that we have to pay for, that is, the Corporation have to pay for the maintenance of order as well as the dignity of the court. I am informed that there are two courts on the two wings of the Town Hall building and each magistrate has got two constables attached to each court, without any sub-inspector, inspector, European sergeants and all that paraphernalia. It may be said that the municipal court might be a different thing from the traffic court. I admit that. The services of a European sergeant, an inspector, a sub-inspector are not required though I admit that a decent number of constables may be required, but I do not think that the expenditure would come to about Rs. 6,300. On this matter, without the details before us, I do not think that we would be able to place before the House, or before Government, any well-considered proposals as to the way in which reduction could be effected. Therefore, I have contented myself with moving that the grant be reduced from Rs. 6,300 to Rs. 3,300.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: I beg to support the motion moved by Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur. In the High Court, where there are so many courts, there are only chaprassis—4 chaprassis for each Judge. There are only one or two European sergeants for the whole court and I cannot conceive why something like Rs. 12,000 should be sanctioned for two additional Presidency Magistrates' courts. The courts may be side by side and one sergeant for two courts and a constable for each of these courts would, I think, be quite enough. I submit that Rs. 3,300 for this court and Rs. 3,000 for the other in the next proposal, that is Rs. 6,300 for a year ought to be quite enough. I, therefore, support Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur's amendment and I hope that my learned friend who is moving for the refusal of the whole grant will withdraw his motion and support this one.

Babu SURENDRA NATH MULLICK: I beg to support Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur's motion, but I do not know, Sir, if I may be permitted to say that Rs. 300 a month would be quite enough. For the purpose of prosecuting, instead of keeping a sub-inspector or an inspector on Rs. 300 a month, it would be better to get a junior pleader on Rs. 150 for prosecuting these cases and with the remaining Rs. 150, we can keep some head constables and constables. I know that the atmosphere of the High Court and the atmosphere of these courts are absolutely different. Here the police officers have got a good deal to do with the Punjabi chauffeurs. That is not exactly the same thing that the people in the High Court do. Therefore we ought to have two or three head constables and five or six constables. If you engage a junior pleader of some standing on Rs. 150 for three hours a day, it would be quite sufficient and the work also would be done better. If you spend Rs. 150 on police officers to keep guard at the court, then Rs. 300 a month or Rs. 3,600 a year would be quite sufficient.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: This amendment is very nearly the same as the one we have just been discussing, and I must oppose it for the same reasons, not even being convinced by Raj Radha Charan Pal Bahadur's lightning visit to an adjoining court. The establishment proposed is in accordance with practice, and it is that which is recommended by the Chief Presidency Magistrate, whom I am willing to accept as the best judge of what is needed. For these reasons I deprecate the acceptance of hasty suggestions for a change in procedure which is at present working satisfactorily elsewhere.

I admit one mistake which has been pointed out by Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur, in so far as the number of constables proposed is seven, and not four as mentioned by me. Four is the number in the second court. I mixed them up: the number here is seven, three constables being required in connection with the exhibits filed in court.

A division was then taken with the following result :—

AYES.

Ahmed, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Wasimuddin.
Ahmed, Munshi Jafar.
Ali, Munshi Amir.
Arhamuddin, Maulvi Khandakar.
Barma, Rai Sahib Panchanan.
Bose, Mr. S. M.
Chaudhuri, Babu Kisheri Mohan.
Chaudhuri, Maulvi Shah Muhammad.
Chaudhuri, Rai Harendranath.
Das, Babu Bhishmadev.
Das Gupta, Babu Nibaran Chandra.
Dutta, Babu Annada Charan.
Dutta, Babu Indu Bhushan.
Ghose, Rai Bahadur Jogendra Chunder.
Haq, Shah Syed Emdadul.
Karim, Maulvi Abdul.
Karim, Maulvi Fazlal.
Khan, Babu Devendra Lal.
Khan, Maulvi Md. Rafique Uddin.
Makramali, Munshi.
Mitra, Rai Bahadur Mahendra Chandra.
Moitra, Dr. Jatindra Nath.
Mullick, Babu Surendra Nath.
Nasker, Babu Ham Chandra.
Pahlewan, Maulvi Md. Abdul Jubbar.
Pal, Rai Bahadur Radha Charan.
Ray, Babu Bhabendra Chandra.
Ray, Babu Surendra Nath.
Ray, Kumar Shib Shekhareswar.
Ray, Babu Nalini Nath.
Ray, Rai Bahadur Lalit Mohan Singh.
Roy Chaudhuri, Babu Sailaja Nath.

NOES.

Addy, Babu Amulya Dhone.
Azam, Khan Bahadur Khwaja Mohamed.
Banerjea, the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath.
Birley, Mr. L.
Bompas, Mr. C. H.
Chaudhuri, the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali, Khan Bahadur.
Das, Mr. S. R.
Das, Rai Bahadur Amar Nath.
Dey, Mr. C. C.
Donald, Mr. J.
Farequi, Mr. K. C. M.
Gupta, Mr. N. S.
Hopkyns, Mr. W. S.
James, Mr. R. H. L. Langford.
Karr, the Hon'ble Mr. J. H.
Lang, Mr. J.
Lees, Mr. D. H.
Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan, the Hon'ble.
Marr, Mr. A.
McKenzie, Mr. D. P.
Mitter the Hon'ble Mr. P. C.
Mukherjee, Babu Nitya Dhon.
Nakey, Mirza Muhammad Ali.
O'Kinealy, Lt.-Col. Frederick.
O'Malley, Mr. L. S. S.
Payne, Mr. C. F.
Rahim, the Hon'ble Sir Abdur.
Roy, Maharaja Bahadur Kshaunish Chandra.
Roy, Raja Manilell Singh.
Suhrawardy, Dr. Hassan.
Suhrawardy, Mr. Huseyn Shaheed.
Swan, Mr. J. A. L.
Wheeler, the Hon'ble Sir Henry.
Wordsworth, Mr. W. C.

The Ayes being 32 and the Noes 34, the motion was lost.

The following motions were then withdrawn :—

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: "That the demand for police staff for the court of an additional Presidency Magistrate be refused."

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: "That the demand for Police staff for the court of an additional Presidency Magistrate be refused."

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: "That the demand for police staff for the court of an additional Presidency Magistrate be refused."

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur moved "that the demand for police staff required for the special stipendiary magistrate for the trial of traffic cases be refused."

The grant asked for, viz., Rs. 6,082 has been reduced to Rs. 4,158 by the Hon'ble Member. I am thankful for the reduction that has been made. I desire to point out that the traffic cases, we may say from our personal experience, are not cases in which confirmed criminals are brought forward for protracted trials. Traffic cases, as we all know, are concerned with *tucca* gharrywallas, motor car drivers and others, who break the traffic regulations and for that court, I understand, two sub-inspectors (now reduced to one), one assistant sub-inspector and four constables are required. I do not object to constables. What I say is this—that one assistant sub-inspector would be quite enough for preserving order and maintaining the authority of the stipendiary magistrate there. There is another court which is called the juvenile court and which to a certain extent, I may say, resembles the traffic court. I have also some experience of the traffic court where in a body, the offenders are brought up for trial and fined. They pay the fine and go away. I do not think, having regard to the police that is placed in the juvenile court, which is only a couple of constables and only one officer, who lives on the top flat and is not generally in attendance in the court except when required, and also in the municipal courts (the number of cases disposed of in these two courts is 400 per month and only two constables are there to maintain order) that we require such a number of sub-inspectors and assistant sub-inspectors. If I am wrong, I hope I would be corrected. For the remaining six or seven months, we require Rs. 4,158 and when the staff is made permanent, it will involve an annual expenditure of Rs. 8,000. I think, therefore, that this is the time when we should propose a reduction of the grant to Rs 3,000 for six months.

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: Everything that can be said upon this has been said before. I do hope that Babu Kishori Mohan Chaudhuri, Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray and Babu Surendra Nath Ray would withdraw their motions, so that we might go to a division at once.

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: I beg to withdraw the following motion that stands in my name:—

"That the demand for police staff for the special stipendiary magistrate for the trial of traffic cases be refused."

The motion was then withdrawn.

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: I beg to withdraw the following motion that stands in my name:—

"That the demand for the police staff required for the special stipendiary magistrate for the trial of traffic cases be refused."

The motion was then withdrawn.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: I beg to withdraw the following motion that stands in my name:—

"That the demand for police staff for the special stipendiary magistrate for the trial of traffic cases be refused."

The motion was then withdrawn.

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: I beg to withdraw the following motion that stands in my name:—

"That the demand for the police staff for the special stipendiary magistrate for the trial of traffic cases be refused."

The motion was then withdrawn.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: The motion of Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur is very similar to that which we have just discussed, and the staff now involved is less expensive than that of the proposed Additional Presidency Magistrate's court. It is obvious that if you have a court, there must be the usual staff to lay cases before the magistrate in the ordinary way. In this instance we are merely asking for one sub-inspector, to perform the duties of a prosecutor, and although it is true that the accused in traffic cases are not ordinarily confirmed criminals, yet such cases are numerous and occasionally may involve contradictions in the evidence which require supervision and elucidation by a prosecuting officer. It is an old complaint, that has often been made against the administration, that cases on behalf of the police are not properly put before the courts, and all we are asking for is one sub-inspector. The assistant sub-inspector—rather a new name for what in the old days were called writer head-constables—would be mainly concerned with office work, and it is surely also obvious that in so far as these cases are numerous, there will be a considerable amount of office work to do in handling the papers connected with them. Four constables are required for the maintenance of order in the court. I cannot therefore agree to the reduction proposed.

A division was then taken with the following result.

AYES.

Ahmed, Munshi Jafar.
Ali, Munshi Amir.
Arhamuddin, Maulvi Khandakar.
Sarma, Rai Sahib Panchanan.
Chaudhuri, Babu Kishori Mohan
Chaudhuri, Babu Tankanath.
Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Hafizar Rahman.
Chaudhuri, Rai Harendranath.
Das, Babu Bhishmadev.
Das Gupta, Babu Nibaran Chandra.
Dutta, Babu Annada Charan.
Dutta, Babu Indu Bhushan.
Ghose, Rai Bahadur Jogendra Chunder.
Haq, Shah Syed Emdadul.
Karim, Maulvi Fazlal.
Makramali, Munshi.
Mitra, Rai Bahadur Mahendra Chandra.
Mostra, Dr. Jatindra Nath.
Mullick, Babu Surendra Nath.
Rasker, Babu Hem Chandra.
Pahlawan, Maulvi Md. Abdul Jubbar.
Pal, Rai Bahadur Radha Charan.
Rakhit, Mr. Prasanna Deb.
Ray, Babu Shabendra Chandra.
Ray, Babu Surendra Nath.
Ray, Kumar Shib Shekhareswar.
Ray, Babu Nalini Nath.
Roy Chaudhuri, Babu Satisja Nath.

NOES.

Addy, Babu Amulya Dhone.
Ali, Mr. Syed Nasim.
Azam, Khan Bahadur Khwaja Mahamed.
Banerjea, the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath.
Birley, Mr. L.
Bompas, Mr. C. H.
Bose, Mr. S. M.
Chaudhuri, the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali, Khan Bahadur.
Das, Mr. S. R.
Das, Rai Bahadur Amar Nath.
Dey, Mr. C. C.
Donald, Mr. J.
Farequi, Mr. K. G. M.
Gupta, Mr. N. B.
Hopkyns, Mr. W. S.
James, Mr. R. H. L. Langford.
Kerr, the Hon'ble Mr. J. H.
Lang, Mr. J.
Lees, Mr. D. H.
Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan, the Hon'ble.
Marr, Mr. A.
MacKenzie, Mr. D. P.
Mitter, the Hon'ble Mr. P. C.
Mukherjee, Babu Nitya Dhon
Nakey, Mirza Muhammad Ali.
O'Kinealy, Lt.-Col. Frederick.
O'Malley, Mr. L. S. S.
Payne, Mr. C. F.
Rahim, the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-.
Ray, Maharaja Bahadur Kshaunish Chandra.
Ray, Raja Manilell Singh.
Suhrawardy, Dr. Hassan.
Swan, Mr. J. A. L.
Wheeler, the Hon'ble Sir Henry.
Wordsworth, Mr. W. C.

The Ayes being 28 and the Noes 35, the motion was lost.

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA moved "that the demand of Rs. 15,238 for expenditure under head '26—Police' be refused."

I oppose the demand on principle. When the standing committee was appointed for the Police Department, it was understood that any extra demand for expenditure on that department would come through it. I believe that we have no recommendation of the standing committee in this case for the expenditure.

Then again, a new committee will be soon appointed to go into the whole question of the police expenditure and till then, I think the sanctioned police force may be utilised for this work; and the expenditure asked for, at present, be held back. I, therefore, move that the whole demand be rejected.

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER: I have just explained in detail each item connected with this demand, and it follows from what I have said that I cannot endorse the proposal of the present amendment. The first argument which is advanced is that the demand was not laid before the standing committee, but it has been explained more than once that the standing committees were created for the consideration of large questions of policy and not of minor items of expenditure. As a matter of fact, two of these items in this demand have no independent origin; they are merely subsidiary consequences of the creation of these two courts.

The other general argument adduced is that we should wait till we have the result of the report of the Police Retrenchment Committee; but it was never contemplated, nor could it be accepted, that we were to hold up all expenditure on the police until we received the recommendations of that body.

The motion was put and lost.

The following original motion was then put and agreed to:—

"That a sum of Rs. 15,238 be granted for expenditure under the head '26.—Police' on account of the following items:—

Police staff for the court of an Additional Presidency Magistrate, Rs. 6,300.

Police staff required for the special stipendiary magistrate for the trial of traffic cases, Rs. 4,158.

Rents, rates and taxes of the premises hired for the Motor Vehicles and Hackney Carriages Department, Rs 4,780."

The Hon'ble Sir HENRY WHEELER moved "that a sum of Rs. 14,143 be transfered from the head '26.—Police' to the head '41.—Civil Works in charge of the Public Works Department, for payment of the additional cost decreed by the High Court in connection with the acquisition of premises, No 113, Upper Circular Road, for the Calcutta Police."

These premises were acquired in 1918 for the Sukea Street outpost. The original award of the Land Acquisition Judge was raised by the High Court by Rs. 14,143. We received notice of that in May, and obviously it had to be paid at once or interest would have accrued We accordingly cut the Calcutta Police Budget by that sum, and propose to transfer it to the Public Works head to which it will be properly debited.

The motion was put and agreed to.

27.—Ports and Pilotage.

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of FINANCE (the Hon'ble Mr. Kerr) moved "that a sum of Rs 10,000 be granted for expenditure under the head '27.—Ports and Pilotage' for expenditure on the Chittagong port which has been declared a minor port."

The reasons for this demand are stated in the memorandum which has already been circulated to the members In this connection I should like to say a few words with reference to the remark of Rai Radha Charan Pal Bahadur about the scanty information supplied to the members in regard to to-day's proceedings That is, I am afraid, unfortunately due to a departmental misunderstanding for which I must accept the responsibility. We, in the Finance Department, were under the impression that each department would circulate memoranda explaining its demands; some departments have done so, but other departments have not, because they thought that the Financial Department would do it for them. I regret that misunderstanding, and steps will be taken on future occasions to see that it does not occur again.

As regards this particular demand, I do not think that I need add anything to what has been stated in the memorandum.

The motion was put and agreed to.

31.—Education.

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of EDUCATION (the Hon'ble Mr. P. C. Mitter) moved "that a sum of Rs. 58,000 be granted for expenditure under the head '31.—Education' for the revision of the pay of the Bengal Educational Service."

As Kumar Shib Shekhareswar Ray and Babu Annada Charan Dutta who had given notices of amendments have agreed to withdraw their motions, I do not think I need say much on this motion.

The necessity of this demand has been explained in the memorandum that has been circulated to the members of the Council, and the reason is that through an oversight this sum was not included in the last budget, although sanction to the increase of pay of the members of the Bengal Educational Service was given by the higher authorities in October last. I do not think I need say anything further.

The following amendments were then withdrawn:—

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: "That the demand for revision of the pay of the Bengal Educational Service be refused."

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: "That the demand for revision of the pay of the Bengal Educational Service be refused."

The original motion was then put and agreed to.

The Hon'ble Mr. P. C. MITTER moved "that a sum of Rs. 4,00,000 be transferred from the head '47—Miscellaneous' to the head of '31—Education' for the reorganisation of the Subordinate Educational Service."

Although there is no motion of amendment to this demand, I think I should state very briefly to the House what this grant is for.

The Subordinate Educational Service is very ill-paid. A committee was appointed, presided over by Mr. Wordsworth and they submitted their report. I have examined the report of the Wordsworth Committee and have placed the views of my department before the Finance Department who are now examining the scheme. This lump sum grant, I hope, will enable my department to improve the pay and prospects of the Subordinate Educational Service during the year- probably from September next. There is already a provision for Rs. 3,50,000 in the current year's budget.

As a result of this reorganisation the Subordinate Educational Service as a whole will get an increase of about 90 per cent. on their present pay. It is not that the percentage of increase will be the same in every case: the increase in the case of officers drawing a low salary will be very much more than 100 per cent: with regard to the other officers the percentage will perhaps be 25 or 30. There is actually one person in Government service drawing rupees four a month and hundreds drawing rupees fifteen to twenty-five a month. I cannot go

into the details now as the scheme has not yet been passed by the Finance Department. However, I can assure the House that by the revision of pay proposed by me the prospects of the Subordinate Educational Service will be made satisfactory.

The motion was then put and agreed to.

32.—Medical.

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA moved "that a sum of Rs. 18,600 be granted for expenditure under the head '32—Medical' on account of the following items:—

Grants to mufassal hospitals and dispensaries, Rs. 15,000.

Revision of the pay of the demonstrators of the Medical College who are not in the cadre of assistant surgeons, Rs. 3,600."

In the first place, as regards the mufassal dispensaries, we have already provided Rs 15,000 and this is a further grant of Rs. 15,000. A part of the former grant has already been spent: out of this, Rs. 3,000 was given for medical aid at Chandpur.

These demonstrators of the Medical College who are not in the cadre of assistant surgeons were employed in 1915, and they were placed, with regard to their salaries, on the same footing with assistant surgeons. In 1919, the pay of the assistant surgeons was raised and they were placed in the grade of Rs 100-300, but the demonstrators remained where they were. In the meantime, in 1920, the scale of pay of the assistant surgeons was revised and further raised to Rs 200 rising to Rs 450 a month; but these poor demonstrators still remained where they were. The idea is to put them on the same footing with the Assistant Surgeons. They are four in number. Bengali gentlemen of considerable academic distinction all graduates of the Calcutta University. One of them is an M B who draws Rs 150, per mensem, and he has been drawing that pay since 1915. There are two other men who draws Rs. 120 a month and the last in the list is drawing Rs 110 a month. It is an act of belated justice that we propose doing to these deserving men. The House will not be doing the justice to which they are entitled unless this additional grant is sanctioned. The revised pay will be operative from 1st June last at a total cost of Rs 400 a month.

The House adjourned at 6-50 P M for a short interval

The Council re-assembled at 7-5 P M.

The PRESIDENT: Gentlemen, as I told you, His Excellency the Governor has allowed this day for the business of the Council up to item No. 77 of the revised List of Business. We only reached item No. 51 when the Council was adjourned and the debate was not finished. So I have to put all the motions without any debate to the Council according to the rules. I shall put the amendments first and then the motions.

The following amendment was then put and lost:—

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: "That the demand for the revision of pay of demonstrators of the Medical College, who are not in the cadre of assistant surgeons, be refused."

The original motion for the demand was then put and agreed to.

The following amendments were put and lost:—

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: "That the demand for the Arapanch drainage scheme be refused."

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: "That the demnad for the transfer of Rs. 80,000 from the head '33.—Public Health' to the head '42.—Waterways and Embankments—Public Works Department' be refused."

The following motion was then put and agreed to:—

33.—Public Health.

The Hon'ble Sir SURENDRA NATH BANERJEA: "To move that a sum of Rs 80,000 be transferred from the head '33.—Public Health' to the head '42.—Waterways and Embankments—Public Works Department,' for the following:—

Arapanch drainage scheme, Rs. 65,000.

Engineering surveys, Rs. 15,000."

The following motion was then put and agreed to:—

35.—Industries.

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of ACRICULTURE and INDUSTRIES (the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur): "That a sum of Rs. 1,06,200 be granted for expenditure under the head '35.—Industries' for payment of grants-in-aid to technical schools."

A division was taken on the following motion:—

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: "That the demand for the construction of a lecture hall and chaukidar's shed for the mining classes at Sitarampur be reduced to Rs. 7,000."

The result of the division was as follows:—

AYES.

Ahmed, Munshi Jafar.
Ali, Munshi Amir.
Chaudhuri, Khan Bahadur Maulvi Nazar Rahman.
Dutta, Babu Annada Charan.
Ghose, Rai Bahadur Jogendra Chunder.
Makramali, Munshi.
Moitra, Dr. Jatindra Nath.
Pahlewan, Maulvi Md. Abdul Jubbar.

NOES.

Addy, Babu Amulya Dhone.
Afzal, Nawabzada K. M. Khan Bahadur.
Ali, Mr. Syed Nasim.
Azam, Khan Bahadur Khwaja Mohamed.
Banerjea, the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath.
Birley, Mr. L.
Bompas, Mr. C. H.
Bose, Mr. S. M.
Chaudhuri, the Hon'ble the Nawab Saiyid Nawab Ali, Khan Bahadur.
Das, Babu Bhishmadev.
Das, Mr. S. R.
Das, Rai Bahadur Amar Nath.
Dey, Mr. C. C.
Donald, Mr. J.
Farequi, Mr. K. G. M.
Gupta, Mr. N. S.
Hopkyns, Mr. W. S.
James, Mr. R. H. L. Langford.
Karim, Maulvi Abdul.
Karim, Maulvi Fazlal.
Kerr, the Hon'ble Mr. J. H.
Khan, Babu Debendra Lal.
Lang, Mr. J.
Lees, Mr. D. N.
Maharajadhiraja Bahadur of Burdwan, the Hon'ble.
Marr, Mr. A.
McKenzie, Mr. D. P.
Mitra, Rai Bahadur Mahendra Chandra.
Mitter, the Hon'ble Mr. P. C.
Nakey, Mirza Muhammad Ali.
O'Kinealy, Lt.-Col. Frederick.
O'Malley, Mr. L. S. S.
Pal, Rai Bahadur Radha Charan.
Payne, Mr. C. F.
Rahim, the Hon'ble Sir Abd-ur-.
Ray, Kumar Shib Shekhareswar.
Roy, Maharaja Bahadur Kshaunish Chandra.
Roy, Raja Manilall Singh.
Suhrawardy, Dr. Hassan.
Suhrawardy, Mr. Huseyn Shaheed.
Wheeler, the Hon'ble Sir Henry.
Wordsworth, Mr. W. C.

The Ayes being 8 and the Noes 42 the motion was lost.

The following motions were put and lost :—

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: "That the demand for the construction of quarters for an Indian Assistant, attached to the mining lecture hall at Sitarampur, be reduced by Rs. 4,350."

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: "That the demand for the construction of quarters for an Indian Assistant, attached to the mining lecture hall at Sitarampur, be reduced to Rs. 7,000."

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: "That the demand for the erection of wooden partitions and fitting electric installations of lights and fans in the new office of the Director of Industries be reduced by half."

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: "That the demand for the erection of wooden partitions and fitting electric installations of lights and fans in the new office of the Director of Industries be reduced by Rs. 16,000."

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: "That the demand for the erection of wooden partitions and fitting electric installations of lights and fans in the new office of the Director of Industries be reduced to Rs. 20,000."

The following motion, being identical with the previous one, failed :—

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: "That the demand for the erection of wooden partitions and fitting electric installations of lights and fans in the new office of the Director of Industries be reduced to Rs. 20,000."

The following motion was put and agreed to :—

41.—Civil Works.

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: "To move that a sum of Rs. 50,333 be transferred from the

head '35.—Industries' to the head '41.—Civil Works in charge of Public Works Department,' on account of the following items:—

Construction of a lecture hall and chaukidar's shed for the mining classes at Sitarampur, Rs. 8,528.

Construction of quarters for an Indian Assistant, attached to the mining lecture hall at Sitarampur, Rs. 9,350.

Erection of wooden partitions and fitting electric installations of lights and fans in the new office of the Director of Industries, Rs. 32,455."

Rai JOGENDRA CHUNDER GHOSE Bahadur: May I be permitted to move that the Council do adjourn?

The PRESIDENT: I cannot allow you to do that.

Kumar SHIB SHEKHARESWAR RAY: We protest against this. (Cries of "Order," "Order.".)

The following motions were then put and lost:—

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: "That the demand for special repairs of Writers' Buildings, Block No. 2, be reduced by one-half."

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: "That the demand for special repairs of Writers' Buildings, Block No. 2, be refused."

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: "That the demand for alterations in and additions to the premises hired in Beniapukur Street for the Motor Vehicles and Hackney Carriage Department be reduced to Rs. 15,000."

Rai RADHA CHARAN PAL Bahadur: "That the demand for alterations in and additions to the premises hired in Beniapukur Street for the Motor Vehicles and Hackney Carriage Department be reduced to Rs. 20,000."

Babu KISHORI MOHAN CHAUDHURI: "That the demand for the alterations in and additions to the premises hired in Beniapukur Street for the Motor Vehicles and Hackney Carriage Department be refused."

The following two motions, being identical with the previous one, failed:—

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: "That the demand for alterations in and additions to the premises hired in Beniapukur Street for the Motor Vehicles and Hackney Carriage Department be refused."

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: "That the demand for alterations in and additions to the premises hired in Beniapukur Street for the Motor Vehicles and Hackney Carriage Department be refused."

The following motion was, by leave of the Council, withdrawn:—

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: "That the demand for the construction of a building for the Calcutta Technical School be refused."

The following motion was put and agreed to:—

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: "To move that a sum of Rs. 2,74,500 be granted for expenditure under the head '41.—Civil Works in charge of the Public Works Department' on account of the following items:—

Construction of buildings for the Agriculture Institute, Dacca, Rs. 1,00,000.

Special repairs to the 2nd floor of Block No. 2, Writers' Buildings, Rs. 14,000.

Alterations in and additions to the premises hired in Beniapukur Street for the Motor Vehicles and Hackney Carriage Department, Rs. 25,000.

Construction of building for the Calcutta Technical School, Rs. 1,25,000.

Improvement to the Malda Registration Record Room, Rs. 8,000.

Completion of the Rampal Registration Building, Rs. 2,500."

The following motions were, by leave of the Council, withdrawn:—

Babu INDU BHUSHAN DUTTA: "That the demand for transferring Rs. 1,10,800 from 'non-voted' to 'voted' under the head '41.—Civil Works—Public Works Department' for repairs to the Maidan Roads, Calcutta, be reduced to Rs. 30,000."

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: "That the demand for transferring Rs. 1,10,000 from 'non-voted' to 'voted' under the head '41.—Civil Works—Public Works Department' for repairs to the Maidan Roads, Calcutta, be reduced by one-half."

Babu ANNADA CHARAN DUTTA: "That the demand for transferring Rs. 1,10,000 from 'non-voted' to 'voted' under the head '41.—Civil Works—Public Works Department' for repairs to the Maidan Roads, Calcutta, be refused."

The following motion was then put and agreed to:—

The Hon'ble the Nawab SAIYID NAWAB ALI CHAUDHURI, Khan Bahadur: "To move that a sum of Rs. 1,10,000 be transferred from 'non-voted' to 'voted' under the head '41.—Civil Works in charge of Public Works Department' for repairs to the Maidan Roads, Calcutta."

The PRESIDENT: If the Council unanimously desire, I can take up motion No. 78 to-day. If, however, there be any objection, I cannot take it up now.

Babu SURENDRA NATH RAY: I object to its being taken up to-day.

Adjournment.

The Council was then adjourned to Monday, the 18th July, 1921, at 3 P.M. in the Town Hall, Calcutta.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Council assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act.

THE Council met in the Council Chamber in the Town Hall, Calcutta, on Monday, the 18th July, 1921, at 3 P.M.

Present:

The Hon'ble the President, the Hon'ble the four Members of the Executive Council, the Hon'ble the three Ministers, and 65 nominated and elected members.

Starred Question

(to which an oral answer was given).

Muhammadans and the rate-payers and Commissioners of the Calcutta Corporation.

*LV. **Maulvi YAKUINUDDIN AHMED:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Department of Local Self-Government be pleased to state the number of rate-payers and the number of voters in each ward of the Calcutta Municipality and the number of Muhammadan rate-payers and the number of Muhammadan voters in each ward of the said Municipality, describing the wards consecutively?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state the names of Muhammadan, non-Muhammadan and Christian Commissioners in the present year in each ward of the Calcutta Municipality by election and the names of the aforesaid Commissioners in the present year appointed by nomination?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble the Minister be pleased to state—

(*i*) the names of the elected Commissioners in each ward of the Calcutta Municipality for the last 12 years;

(*ii*) the names of the nominated Commissioners in the Calcutta Municipality during the last 12 years; and

(*iii*) why only three Muhammadan gentlemen have been nominated as Commissioners this year?

MINISTER in charge of DEPARTMENT of LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Surendra Nath Banerjea): (*a*) A statement (No. I)* is laid on the library table.

* Not printed in these proceedings.

(*b*) A statement (No. II)* is laid on the library table.

(*c*) (*i*) and (*ii*) A statement (No. III)* is laid on the library table.

(*iii*) The member is referred to the answer given to clause (*b*) of unstarred question No. 220.

Unstarred Questions

(answers to which were laid on the table).

Appointments for depressed classes to certain posts.

250. Babu BHISHMADEV DAS: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Appointment Department be pleased to say whether the Government are considering the desirability of reserving a certain percentage of the posts in the various departments for suitable candidates of the depressed classes, as has been done in the case of Muhammadans?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble the Member be pleased to state the number of duly qualified candidates of the depressed classes who applied for nomination to the posts of police sub-inspector, sub-registrar, deputy magistrate and sub-deputy magistrate during the last five years from the district of Faridpur, and how many of them were appointed?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble the Member aware of a feeling of discontent and lack of incentive amongst the depressed classes on account of the failure of their graduates and under-graduates in obtaining suitable Government employment?

MEMBER in charge of APPOINTMENT DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): (*a*) The member is referred to the answer given to the question asked by him on the 11th March last. The policy of Government is indicated therein, and they do not consider that any further action in the matter is necessary.

(*b*) So far as can be ascertained, during the past five years the candidates from the Namasudra community from Faridpur for the services named numbered as follows:—

Bengal Civil Service	5
Subordinate Civil Service	4
Police sub-inspectorship	22
Sub-registrarship	4

Only one of these secured an appointment of a Sub-registrarship in 1918.

(*c*) No.

* Not printed in these proceedings.

Expenditure on police launches.

251. Nawabzada K. M. AFZAL, Khan Bahadur: Will the Hon'ble the Member in charge of the Police Department be pleased to lay on the table a statement, district by district, showing the number of police launches in Bengal and the annual expenditure incurred for—

(*i*) staff; and

(*ii*) launches?

MEMBER in charge of POLICE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Henry Wheeler): A statement is laid on the table.

Statement referred to in the reply to unstarred question No. 251 showing district by district the number of police launches in Bengal and the annual expenditure incurred for (i) staff and (ii) launches.

District	Number of launches	Expenditure on. Staff.	Launches.	During the year	Remarks.
		Rs A P.	Rs A P.		
Calcutta	9	11,364 14 10	20,800 13 7	1919 20	Figures for 1920-21 are not available
24-Parganas—					
(i) For the Inspector-General of Police	1	4,616 3 6	15,473 14 4	1920 21	
(ii) For the Superintendent of Police	1	5,277 6 10	11,217 4 1	Do.	
Dacca ...	2	5,029 2 7	20,873 . 2	Do.	
Khulna	1	3,718 2 2	15,649 14 5	Do.	
Jessore	1	2,304 0 0	8,305 5 8	Do.	
Pabna	1	2,710 6 11	2,989 15 3	Do.	
Bakarganj					
(i) For the Deputy Inspector General of Police.	1	3,410 13 2	5,729 10 7	Do.	Used also by the Deputy Inspector-General of Police Dacca.
(ii) For the District Police	2	9,303 0 0	11,879 0 0	Do.	
Faridpur	1	3,602 8 6	14,180 4 5	Do.	
River Police	26	66,117 0 0	1,94,188 0 0	Do.	
Narayanganj	2*	8,919 0 0	68,047 0 0	Do.	
Total ...	47	1,11,172 10 6	3,21,707 4 6		

* These are two hired launches in place of two river police launches taken over by the Military Department during the war. A new launch to replace one of these hired vessels is under construction.

Supplementary grants.

The PRESIDENT (the Hon'ble Nawab Sir Syed Shams-ul-Huda): Order, Order! The Hon'ble Mr. Kerr.

47.—Miscellaneous.

MEMBER in charge of DEPARTMENT of FINANCE (the Hon'ble Mr. KERR) moved "that a sum of Rs. 7,50,000 be transferred from the lump provision of Rs. 45,61,000 under the head '47.—Miscellaneous' to the various major heads to which the charges are debitable to meet the cost of the revision of the pay of the menial establishment with effect from the 1st July, 1921."

This is the first occasion on which the Council has been asked to take action on the report of the committee which was appointed by Government to advise on the revision of the pay of the permanent ministerial officers and menials in Bengal. I am sure that the Council will agree with me that the committee's report is a monument of industry and thoroughness. There will no doubt be differences of opinion about details, but I think that every one will agree that the committee have tackled their difficult task in a most thorough and comprehensive manner. These remarks apply equally to the minute of dissent by Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur which, as the Council will observe, is almost as lengthy as the main report and deals with the problems placed before the committee in the same thorough and careful manner. To-day, I am asking the Council to consider only the case of the menial servants. These proposals are dealt with in Chapter III of the committee's report and in the corresponding portion of the minute of dissent. The proposals, placed before the Council now, have nothing to do with the ministerial officers. That is a much more complicated problem on which we shall have to get the opinions of a large number of officers before we can place our own proposals before the Council. We have already taken steps to secure these opinions and the scheme will be laid before the Council at a later date. So far as the menials are concerned, our proposals are contained in the somewhat lengthy memorandum which was placed in the hands of members of this Council a few days ago. I do not propose to go through the memorandum in detail. The most important menial establishments, both numerically and otherwise, are the establishment menials, the process-servers and the contingency menials. In the case of these people, we have made very liberal increases indeed. Before the war, they were getting from Rs. 6 to Rs. 10. During the war and since the war, various additions have been made to their pay and we now propose to put them on scales varying from Rs. 13 to Rs. 22. We have made the proposals of the committee and of Rai Mahendra Chandra Mitra Bahadur more liberal in one respect in that we have proposed the abolition of the C class districts (viz., the districts of Midnapore, Birbhum and Bankura), where the pay of the menials has always been on a lower scale than that of the menials in the rest of the province. The justification for this was that the rates of wages for ordinary labour are undoubtedly lower in those districts than in the rest of the province. On the other hand, prices in these districts are just as high as elsewhere, and we have thought that this would

be a convenient opportunity to do away with the complication of these C class districts. The total result of our proposals regarding the pay of these menials is an increase of 103 per cent. over pre-war rates. In the case of process-servers, the increase is 159 per cent. A document has been circulated among the members of the Council about process-servers asking that their pay should be fixed at Rs. 30 to Rs. 50 a month. The pay which we propose to give them ranges from Rs. 15 to Rs. 22 a month, and this, as I have said, constitutes an increase of 159 per cent. over pre war rates. I trust that the Council will agree that this is sufficient; at any rate I feel that this is as much as we can afford in our present financial situation, and to give more would be nothing else but extravagance. We propose to give the new rates of pay with effect from the 1st of July, that is to say we must make budget provision in the current year for eight months' pay at the new rates. The total average cost of our proposals is about Rs. 84,000 a month, so that we should require about Rs. 7 lakhs to meet the average cost of the scheme for eight months. But the average cost of schemes of this kind including time-scales is generally less than the actual cost on introduction, because a considerable number of men of the existing establishment are men with long service who will come near the top of the time-scale. It is on this account that we are asking for a sum of Rs. 7½ lakhs which will be provided out of the lump provision of Rs. 45,61,000 under the head "47 - Miscellaneous" in the budget. I trust that the Council will agree that the sum which we are asking for is reasonable and not excessive in the circumstances.

The motion was then put and agreed to

Prorogation.

The PRESIDENT: I am to remind members that the election to the special Police Committee will be held to-morrow, the polling to commence at 11-30 A.M.

I am also asked to announce that His Excellency the Governor declares the Council to be prorogued to the 29th August, 1921, at 3 P.M., at the Town Hall, Calcutta.

The members then dispersed.

B S Press—24-10-1921—1407J—2 006—F T